



Seth Sturm &lt;sethsturm@gmail.com&gt;

## One other thing

1 message

**Betty Rivard** <bettyrivard@yahoo.com>

Tue, Aug 17, 2021 at 7:27 PM

To: Seth Sturm &lt;sethsturm@gmail.com&gt;

Cc: "123goodforme@gmail.com" <123goodforme@gmail.com>, "claraleigh000@gmail.com" <claraleigh000@gmail.com>, "floydsayre40@gmail.com" <floydsayre40@gmail.com>, "ginnymoles@hotmail.com" <ginnymoles@hotmail.com>, "kathleen.curry@aol.com" <kathleen.curry@aol.com>, "krisolsen1980@gmail.com" <krisolsen1980@gmail.com>, "maryannclaytor@gmail.com" <maryannclaytor@gmail.com>, "slpoole401@gmail.com" <slpoole401@gmail.com>, "amg.ag0904@gmail.com" <amg.ag0904@gmail.com>, "andrewcobwebs@yahoo.com" <andrewcobwebs@yahoo.com>, "athenapurple@yahoo.com" <athenapurple@yahoo.com>, "awo53@frontier.com" <awo53@frontier.com>, "b03b13f@gmail.com" <b03b13f@gmail.com>, "c\_marujo@yahoo.com" <c\_marujo@yahoo.com>, "carrenac@gmail.com" <carrenac@gmail.com>, "cindy\_stemple@hotmail.com" <cindy\_stemple@hotmail.com>, "debbie\_bush\_2000@yahoo.com" <debbie\_bush\_2000@yahoo.com>, "dotson.elliott00@gmail.com" <dotson.elliott00@gmail.com>, "doyledan348@gmail.com" <doyledan348@gmail.com>, "dvnfan@gmail.com" <dvnfan@gmail.com>, "gncaseyww@gmail.com" <gncaseyww@gmail.com>, "hopewdc@aol.com" <hopewdc@aol.com>, "janebirdsong@gmail.com" <janebirdsong@gmail.com>, "jcw47.jcw@gmail.com" <jcw47.jcw@gmail.com>, "joseivanwv30@gmail.com" <joseivanwv30@gmail.com>, "kscottwv@yahoo.com" <kscottwv@yahoo.com>, "lindarstein47@gmail.com" <lindarstein47@gmail.com>, "margbeckwith1@gmail.com" <margbeckwith1@gmail.com>, "martinshaffer@gmail.com" <martinshaffer@gmail.com>, "mauryjohnson@yahoo.com" <mauryjohnson@yahoo.com>, "mlkeuroglian@aol.com" <mlkeuroglian@aol.com>, "nhilsbos@gmail.com" <nhilsbos@gmail.com>, "p.g.rumberg@gmail.com" <p.g.rumberg@gmail.com>, "pamgarr1510@gmail.com" <pamgarr1510@gmail.com>, "pamnixon@aol.com" <pamnixon@aol.com>, "patrickmaroney@aol.com" <patrickmaroney@aol.com>, "pburkhar@marshall.edu" <pburkhar@marshall.edu>, "pgay10@frontier.com" <pgay10@frontier.com>, "realterry@me.com" <realterry@me.com>, "robert.ofsa.wv@gmail.com" <robert.ofsa.wv@gmail.com>, "rsbenzinger@comcast.net" <rsbenzinger@comcast.net>, "rwilliamsmsir@gmail.com" <rwilliamsmsir@gmail.com>, "susancasewv@gmail.com" <susancasewv@gmail.com>, "tealturtle86@hotmail.com" <tealturtle86@hotmail.com>, "thorpdesign@gmail.com" <thorpdesign@gmail.com>, "waltauvil@gmail.com" <waltauvil@gmail.com>, "wv.sherlock@gmail.com" <wv.sherlock@gmail.com>, "wv.sunshinegals@gmail.com" <wv.sunshinegals@gmail.com>, "wvugrad1975bfa@gmail.com" <wvugrad1975bfa@gmail.com>, "yfarley@hotmail.com" <yfarley@hotmail.com>, "bobbaker64@aol.com" <bobbaker64@aol.com>

It may be too late to put it on the agenda, except maybe under new business, but I suggest that the AA committee develop some kind of process for dispute resolution on the kinds of things that are coming up here. Leaving this in just a couple of hands to disregard or not is not doing justice to those who want to have a voice and invest in a level playing field where each person's viewpoints are heard and considered.

Apparently part of the problem now is that we do not have this kind of process. So why not just develop one? This is one of those things that is within our collective control.

On Tuesday, August 17, 2021, 07:02:24 PM EDT, Seth Sturm <sethsturm@gmail.com> wrote:

On Tue, Aug 17, 2021 at 6:39 PM Seth Sturm <sethsturm@gmail.com> wrote:

Kristin, thank you for sharing. Please forgive me for bringing you into all of this. I've repeatedly tried to bury this with the leadership privately, but I've been completely ignored.

This all when I called Selina out for one particularly offensive habit she has. She has on more than one occasion, and to more than one person, drafted documents and passed them along to POC because she thinks it will look better coming from us. I only tried to point out that this behavior is offensive. POC are capable of thinking for themselves and we don't like to be spoken through.

Now, the war I am talking about is clear as day if you pay attention. Selina helped form the AAC and for the first month of our existence we were making demands of Belinda, calling for her resignation, going against her in the press. She

has filed grievances against Belinda using her offenses against marginalized people as her ammunition. She also didn't file it herself. She passed it along to other more marginalized people to file on her behalf. It's a pattern that has to stop.

These actions put every diversity Caucus at odds with WVDP leadership. The members of the Indigenous caucus have no other outlet in this party. We don't have the privilege of treating this committee as a tool to fight the establishment. We need the establishment to start paying attention to our specific needs.

Also, I think it's wildly inappropriate for Selina to speak so negatively of me behind my back. Same as it was inappropriate to try to single the Indigenous Caucus out last night when Mary Ann Claytor has asked for the same information and has even been harsh with you. It was wrong of Mary Thorp and Bob Baker to misrepresent the content of our resolution when pushing theirs.

What I see going on is nothing short of an attempt of character assassination. I'm an open book, Kristin. If you would like to speak with me one on one, just let me know. We will schedule a call. If you'd like to mediate a call between Selina and Mary and Me, I'm open to it. Communication is nonexistent between us.

I'm sorry to have laid this out at your feet. But if I'm such a topic of conversation, then it's only fair that you know the full story. This is about policy, not personality.

Thanks again for sharing, Kristin. I appreciate it more than you know.

Seth Sturm  
Co Chair Indigenous Caucus

On Tue, Aug 17, 2021 at 5:17 PM Kristin Loken <[lokenkk@gmail.com](mailto:lokenkk@gmail.com)> wrote:

Has it occurred to you two that some of the attacks you are receiving might not be from those inside our movement? I would not put it past Belinda to get others to pose as insiders to attack our leadership and divide our movement. You mustn't let this get you down.  
Kris

May love and happiness be in your life always,  
*Kristin Loken*  
PO Box 337  
Falling Waters, WV 25419  
304 274-1285

Never, never be afraid to do what's right, especially if the well-being of a person or animal is at stake. Society's punishments are small compared to the wounds we inflict on our soul when we look the other way. —MLK

On Aug 17, 2021, at 4:11 PM, Kristin Loken <[lokenkk@gmail.com](mailto:lokenkk@gmail.com)> wrote:

It's not easy being leaders of a reform movement - definitely not the way to make friends! But you should both know you have tremendous support, in fact, many many more supporters than detractors. And please totally discount anything from Betty Rivard or inspired by Betty. She is obviously just trying to pad her own ego, take over the direction of our movement without taking on any responsibility and without any idea (obviously) what needs to be done or how to do it. I think she might be a ringer, coming in to see how much she can wreck things.

I now see the IP Caucus Resolution at the bottom of Seth's message. I don't really know what he's talking about referring to "a document demanding concessions, a list of demands". I'll be glad to write something to Seth but I need to understand what they are complaining about. Meanwhile, I hope you two send him something to counteract what Betty is telling him and to provide some answer to their resolution. I'm sure Betty's intervention and misinformation is what happened with the Black women, too.

Just as I was writing the above, Mary Ann called me. She talked for at least a half an hour. What I heard is that she really doesn't feel listened to and that she's trying her best to rescue this reform movement so we can keep going forward. She is rebelling against what she sees as authoritarian leadership and might be on the brink of quitting altogether out of frustration. She said she's not calling for changes in leadership so much as changes in leadership style. She feels the AAC in particular but really the caucuses too need to be participatory in decision-making. Leadership needs to coordinate rather than direct. Leadership needs to listen to all views and then respond. I'm putting words in her mouth to some degree but this is how I'd interpret what she said.

I explained to her that this is something new for all of us, that we are all learning as we go, and that we hope to learn from mistakes so we can keep moving forward and continue working together. This is not an easy thing to do: you have all these people from difference backgrounds with different ideas, you have an entirely new structure to work with, and you are under attack from the WVDP leadership (and you have Betty Rivard who is trying to be as divisive as possible.) I think we were really fortunate to have gotten the people we did, especially those on the AAC, really outstanding people. But few or none have any experience doing what we are trying to do here. So it's super important to listen to each other, make sure everyone is encouraged to speak, and make decision-making as participatory as possible. It's important to identify mistakes (and we are bound to make them) so we can learn from them. I told Mary Ann that I would tell you two what we had discussed.

So after talking with Mary Ann, these would be my suggestions for the meeting tonight: encourage listening to everyone, encourage everyone to speak, and make decision-making as participatory as possible even if it means not getting through the whole agenda.

My thought is to see how the meeting goes tonight. If these same problems come up, then I suggest you have a special session among the members of the AAC and Selina to work out these problems.

I think it's kinda interesting that both Mary Ann and Seth stated that they did not ask for the resignations of leadership but really a change in style or practices. Whether they did or didn't, they sound like they are willing to work through differences to keep the ball moving forward. This reform is important to both of them. The only one that may not be true for is Betty Rivard.

Kris

May love and happiness be in your life always,  
*Kristin Loken*  
 PO Box 337  
 Falling Waters, WV 25419  
 304 274-1285

Never, never be afraid to do what's right, especially if the well-being of a person or animal is at stake. Society's punishments are small compared to the wounds we inflict on our soul when we look the other way. —MLK

On Aug 17, 2021, at 1:28 PM, Selina Vickers <[selina.vickers.wv@gmail.com](mailto:selina.vickers.wv@gmail.com)> wrote:

it's up to you....

But it's hard for Mary to respond as she gets attacked at every turn. She needs allies supporting her - hell, we all do.

Don't worry about it.

SV

On Tue, Aug 17, 2021 at 1:18 PM Kristin Loken <[lokenkk@gmail.com](mailto:lokenkk@gmail.com)> wrote:

Selina,

It's a bit hard for me to send this, even adapted, when I haven't seen the IP resolution.

It wasn't attached to what I got. But also I've already written to Seth saying I would like

to join the IP caucus as an ally. Their next meeting is in two weeks. I was planning to raise the kinds of information you mention (and more of my own) about Belinda in person at the meeting(s). Do you think that's waiting too long?

Reading your suggestion through, I think this might be much better coming from you. Here's what I would recommend:

It is unfortunate but I think true that the Chair of the WVDP, Belinda Biafore, has stood in the way of our efforts to reform the by-laws and increase participation and representativeness of minorities in the WVDP. She has withheld information, not adhered to the bylaws, broken parliamentary procedure, and repeatedly thrown roadblocks in the way of our work. You may not be aware but Chair Biafore never scheduled an Indigenous Peoples Caucus. Chair Biafore kicked diversity members out of a meeting on June 3rd for the specific purpose of preventing them from participating in discussion of a DRAFT affirmative action plan. You may also not be aware that Chair Biafore knew in June of 2020 that diversity caucuses needed to be formed. This was underscored by the DNC on February 12th, 2021 and set in stone in March 15, 2021 by the WVDP Executive Committee when new Bylaws were adopted. There was a Memorandum of Understanding that Chair Biafore signed where she knew she had 2 months to implement the new bylaws following their adoption, including the creation of caucuses and the AAC. On April 28th, Chair Biafore called a meeting of the Exec Comm for May 14th - one day before the deadline to have everything in place. At that time none of the caucuses or the AAC had been formed. Due to the actions of a member of the State Exec Comm, a letter was sent to the DNC alerting them of these problems and within less than an hour, Chair Biafore scheduled some caucus meetings (except for Latino, Indigenous Peoples, and Asian/Pacific Islanders) beginning 3 days from then, and then later scheduled elections for the caucuses that had met - none of which followed the new Bylaws. It took us 3 years to get to this point and it has been only through tremendous efforts by the people involved in this reform movement that we have been able to get as far as we have.

I haven't seen a "war" waged on Chair Biafore, but I have seen people hold Chair Biafore and others accountable for things such as what are described above. That is my expectation of them. And I hold myself and our reform movement to the same standards.

We are very pleased to have an Indigenous Peoples Caucus and hope it will grow in numbers in the future. Thank you for your efforts in this regard.

I suggest you send something like this to Seth directly.

Kris

May love and happiness be in your life always,

*Kristin Loken*

PO Box 337

Falling Waters, WV 25419

304 274-1285

Never, never be afraid to do what's right, especially if the well-being of a person or animal is at stake. Society's punishments are small compared to the wounds we inflict on our soul when we look the other way. —MLK

On Aug 17, 2021, at 12:23 PM, Selina Vickers  
<[selina.vickers.wv@gmail.com](mailto:selina.vickers.wv@gmail.com)> wrote:

Kristen,

have you thought about hitting reply all on that other email and saying something like below? [if you use this, cut and paste the info below into a response - DO NOT FORWARD THIS EMAIL]

---

Thank you for sending the resolution.

You may not be aware, but the Chair of the WVDP, Belinda Biafore, kicked diversity members out of a meeting on June 3rd for the specific purpose of preventing them from participating in discussion of the DRAFT affirmative action plan. You may also not be aware that Biafore knew in June of 2020 that diversity caucuses needed to be formed. This was underscored by the DNC on February 12th, 2021 and set in stone in March 15, 2021 by the WVDP Executive Committee when new Bylaws were adopted. There was a Memorandum of Understanding that Biafore signed where she knew she had 2 months to implement the new bylaws following their adoption, including the creation of caucuses and the AAC. On April 28th, Biafore called a meeting of the Exec Comm for May 14th - one day before the deadline to have everything in place. At that time none of the caucuses or the AAC had been formed. Due to a member of the State Exec Comm actions, a letter was sent to the DNC alerting them of this and within less than an hour, Biafore scheduled caucus meetings beginning 3 days from then, and then later scheduled caucus elections - none of which followed the new Bylaws. Biafore never scheduled an Indigenous Peoples Caucus.

I haven't seen a "war" waged on Biafore, but I have seen people hold Biafore and others accountable for things such as what are described above. That is my expectation of them. It is also my expectation that the AAC do the work that it was designed to do. I trust that you will do the same.

The other information that was shared in the senior caucus was that someone was sending aggressive emails to AAC members, calling people incompetent, calling people names. No names were mentioned. That behavior is not acceptable.

Also, Selina mentioned that someone was texting her in an aggressive manner while she was talking to us. That behavior is not acceptable. We need everyone focused on the plan and building the caucuses.

Thank you for the invitation to the Indigenous Caucus. Please include me on future emails and I will attend if possible.

Kristen Loken