

**ISO/IEC JTC 1  
Information Technology**

**Document Type:** National Body Contribution

**Document Title:** National Body of France Contribution on JTC 1 SWG-Directives – Recommendation on Work Method for Delft Meeting and General Comments on JTC 1 N 9439, Draft JTC 1 Supplement to the Directives

**Document Source:** National Body of France

**Reference:** This document is circulated to National Bodies for review and consideration. It will be discussed at the February 2009 JTC 1 SWG-D meeting in Delft, Netherlands under agenda item 6.

**Action ID:** ACT

**Due Date:**

**No. of Pages:** 10

**Draft -**  
**French National Body contribution to JTC 1 SWG-Directives -**  
**Recommendations on work method for Delft meeting and general comments on**  
**JTC 1 N 9439, the JTC 1 Supplement to the ISO/IEC Directives**

**1) Need for a systematic approach; proposal to use a cross-reference table**

The French National Body believes that a major task of the SWG-Directives meeting in Delft should be a systematic review of the draft Supplement (JTC 1 N 9439) in order to make sure that no element from current JTC1 Directives has been forgotten and that all the process elements from the current set of JTC 1 Directives are documented either with text from the ISO and IEC Directives or by text in the new supplement for JTC 1 or, possibly, by other textual elements (e.g. Standing Documents). In other words, all the current elements of procedures of JTC 1 have to be referenced somewhere, either pointing to the same process, or to a modified one, or, if this needed, to a list of deprecated processes.

To that purpose, the French National Body believes that a cross-reference is a good tool and should be made available during the meeting. Document JTC 1 7868 (May 2005, used in the 2007 meeting in Paris) has at one point provided such a cross-reference but was a very complex document. We propose a simpler approach, cross-referencing only chapter, annex or other main clauses titles and, to that purpose, we provide the table annexed to this contribution as a starting point of what we would like to see. We suggest that this cross-reference table be reviewed and completed during the meeting, perhaps with small groups in charge of reviewing various sections of the JTC 1 Directives.

*Notes relative to the table:*

- In blue, these are FNB comments or proposals (also noted in the other FNB contribution).
- Noted in green and gathered together in the right column: current elements of JTC 1 Directives, which have not been fully analysed by the FNB. All other NB comments (with maybe further analysis) will permit to identify where to insert corresponding information.:

1. Scope
2. Organization (except 2.3, 2.5 and 2.7.2)
- 4.5 Non-Permanent Organizational Entity Administration
- 4.6 Responsibility for the Archiving of Documents
- 6.4 Progress Control and Reporting
- 7.6 Meeting agenda, 7.7 Participation at Meetings, 7.8 Meeting Documents
- 7.10 Meeting Resolutions and Reports, 7.11 Electronic Teleconferencing
- 8 Document Types, Numbering and Distribution Requirements
- 9 Voting
- 10.1 Health and Safety Considerations; 10.4 Formal Descriptions; 10.5 Application Portability; 10.6 Standard International Units
- 12 Preparation and Adoption of International Standards - Normal Processing; , 12.2 General,
- 17 International Standardized profiles and Related Documents

**2. General comments on JTC 1 N 9439, JTC 1 Supplement to the ISO/IEC Directives**

### 2.1) Form and color

Providing drafts for review in revisable form as PDF is not adequate for quoting, comparing. For review purposes, a larger font size seems better. Please avoid yellow/orange colours, as it is difficult to read. What does blue or red text mean in JTC 1 N 9439? FNB recommends to experiment using boxes and shades to identify respectively areas specific to JTC 1 or excluded for JTC 1.

### 2.2) Clauses not applicable to JTC 1 or specific to JTC 1

There need to be a review of which ISO/IEC processes are not applicable to JTC 1, in order to precisely identify them and make them visible in the final Supplement document. For example, the ISO/IEC "PAS process" does not apply to JTC1; several others are noted in the other French contribution, but need to be confirmed by the SWG-Directives. It would be good to progress this work during the Delft meeting.

### 2.3) Text in Chapters or Annexes of JTC 1 Supplement or in JTC 1 Standing Documents (SDs)

In its second contribution, the FNB suggests placing some of the specific JTC 1 procedures into Annexes of the JTC 1 Supplement (e.g. the JTC 1 PAS Process), and placing some guidance documents into Standing documents (e.g. the Guidelines for API Standardization). But the distinction between process and guidance may sometimes be more difficult to make. In particular, should some policy elements be made stronger by keeping in Directives rather than in SD? Which ones?

Noting Nara Resolution 27, SDs do not need TMB/SMB approval. What are the criteria to decide what requires TBM/SMB approval?

Note for information:

- SD 1 Best Practices on Teleconferencing (already available)
- SD 2 Historical Background of JTC 1 (already available)
- SD 3 JTC 1 Planning Process (under development)

Cross-reference table for JTC 1 Directives (left: new Supplement   right: current JTC 1 Directives)	
in blue: FNB comments	in shaded green: analysis required (no review by FNB for correspondence in JTC 1 Supplement)
<b><u>Contents document JTC 1 N 9439 (JTC 1 Supplement to the ISO/IEC Directives)</u></b>	<b><u>Corresponding paragraphs from JTC1 N 8557 (JTC 1 Directives, 5th Edition, Version 3.0)</u></b>
Foreword.....6	
1 Organizational structure and responsibilities for the technical work 8	
1.1 Role of the technical management board .....8	
1.2 Advisory Groups to the technical management board.....8	
1.3 Joint technical work .....9	3.4 Coordination
1.4 Role of the Chief Executive Officer .....9	4.1 ITTF
1.5 Establishment of technical committees.....10	
1.6 Establishment of subcommittees.....12	2.5 Subcommittees
1.7 Participation in the work of technical committees and subcommittees 13	2.3.1.2 Membership of JTC1, 2.5.3 Membership of SCs, 3.1 and 3.2 Membership categories
1.8 Chairmen of technical committees and subcommittees .....14	5 Officers (except 5.6 Non-Permanent Organizational Entity Officers and 5.7 Project Editors)
1.9 Secretariats of technical committees and subcommittees .....15	4.2 JTC 1 Administration, 4.3 Subcommittee Administration
1.10 Editing committees .....17	5.7 Project Editors
1.11 Working groups .....18	4.4 Working Group Administration
1.12 Project teams .....21	
1.13 Groups having advisory functions within a committee .....21	
1.14 Ad hoc groups .....23	
1.15 Liaison between technical committees .....23	3.3 Liaison categories
1.16 Liaison between ISO and IEC .....24	3.3 Liaison categories
1.17 Liaison with other organizations.....24	3.3 Liaison categories
2 Development of International Standards .....28	
2.1 The project approach .....28	6.1 Overall Programme of Work, 6.3 Target Dates, 12.1 Stages of Technical Work
2.2 Preliminary stage.....34	12.3 Stage 0, Study Period Underway

2.3 Proposal stage .....35	6.2 Additions to the Programme of Work, 12.4 Stage 1,NP under Consideration, 12.5 Stage 2, WD under consideration
2.4 Preparatory stage .....36	
2.5 Committee stage.....38	12.6 Stage 3, CD under consideration
2.6 Enquiry stage .....41	
2.7 Approval stage .....43	12.7 Stage 4, FDIS under consideration
2.8 Publication stage .....44	12.8 Stage 5, IS Publication
2.9 Maintenance of standards .....44	15 Maintenance of International Standards
2.10 Technical corrigenda and amendments .....46	
2.11 Maintenance agencies .....51	2.7.3 Maintenance agencies (identical to ISO/IEC Directives)
2.12 Registration authorities .....51	2.7.2 Registration Authorities
2.13 Copyright .....51	10.2 Copyright, 10.3 Patents
2.14 Reference to patented items (see also Annex I).....51	
3 Development of other deliverables.....52	
3.1 Technical Specifications.....52	(no correspondence, not used)
3.2 Publicly Available Specifications (PAS) .....53 need new Annex with content of Chapter 14	14 Preparation and Adoption of International Standards - The PAS Transposition Process, Annex M The Transposition of Publicly Available Specifications into International Standards - A Management Guide
3.3 Technical Reports.....53	16 Preparation and Adoption of Technical Reports
4 Meetings .....55	7. Meetings
4.1 General .....55	7.1 General, 7.2 Meeting schedule
4.2 Procedure for calling a meeting .....55	7.3 Hosting a meeting, 7.5 Calling and cancelling a meeting
4.3 Languages at meetings .....56	7.9 Languages
4.4 Cancellation of meetings .....56	7.5 Calling and cancelling a meeting
5 Appeals.....61	11 Appeals
5.1 General .....61	
5.2 Appeal against a subcommittee decision.....62	
5.3 Appeal against a technical committee decision .....62	
5.4 Appeal against a technical management board decision.....62	
5.5 Progress of work during an appeal process .....63	
Annex A (normative) Guides.....64	Annex B JTC1 Standards development Stages
A.1 Introduction .....64	
A.2 Proposal stage .....64	

A.3 Preparatory stage .....	64	
A.4 Committee stage.....	64	
A.5 Enquiry stage .....	64	
A.6 Publication stage .....	65	
A.7 Withdrawal of a Guide.....	65	
Annex B (normative) ISO/IEC procedures for liaison and work allocation .	66	
B.1 Introduction .....	66	
B.2 General considerations .....	66	
B.3 Establishing new technical committees .....	66	
B.4 Coordinating and allocating work between ISO and IEC technical committees.	67	
Annex C (normative) Justification of proposals for the establishment of standards .	70	
C.1 General .....	70	
C.2 Definitions .....	70	
C.3 General principles.....	70	
C.4 Elements to be clarified when proposing a new field of technical activity (new committee).	71	
C.5 Elements to be clarified when proposing a new work item (new standard) .....	73	
C.6 Matrix.....	73	
C.7 Example of a proposal for a new field of technical activity .....	74	
C.8 Example of a proposal for a new work item .....	78	
C.9 Matrix for establishing the purpose of a proposal .....	80	
C.10 Example of a matrix for establishing the purpose of a proposal for a new field of technical activity.	81	

C.11 Example of a matrix for establishing the purpose of a proposal for a new work item.82	
Annex D (normative) Resources of secretariats and qualifications of secretaries.....83 <a href="#">See FNB comments</a>	Annex A Secretariat Resources and Operational Requirements
D.1 Definitions .....83	
D.2 Resources of a secretariat.....83	
D.3 Requirements of a secretary.....84	
Annex E (normative) General policy on the use of languages.....85 <a href="#">See FNB comments</a>	
E.1 Expressing and communicating ideas in an international environment .....85	
E.2 The use of languages in the technical work .....85	
E.3 International Standards .....85	
E.4 Other publications developed by technical committees.....86	
E.5 Documents for technical committee and subcommittee meetings.....86	
E.6 Documents prepared in languages other than English or French .....86	
E.7 Technical meetings .....87	
Annex F (normative) Options for development of a project .....89 <a href="#">See FNB comments</a>	
F.1 Simplified diagram of options.....89	
F.2 "Fast-track procedure".....90	13 Preparation and Adoption of International Standards - Fast-Track Processing

Annex G (normative) Maintenance agencies .....93 <a href="#">See FNB comments</a>	2.7.3 Maintenance agencies (identical to ISO/IEC Directives)
Annex H (normative) Registration authorities .....94 <a href="#">see FNB comment</a>	18 Appointment and Operation of Registration Authorities, Annex E Registration Definitions and Guidelines for Procedure Standards
Annex I (normative) Guidelines for Implementation of the Common Patent Policy for ITU-T/ITU-R/ISO/IEC .....97	
Annex AA (normative) Meeting Funding.....109 <a href="#">See FNB comments</a>	7.4 Funding Mechanisms
Annex AB (normative) Document Types, numbering and Distribution Requirements..112 <a href="#">See FNB comments</a>	
Annex AC (normative) Voting.....116 <a href="#">See FNB comments</a>	
	1. Scope
	2. Organization (except 2.3, 2.5 and 2.7.2)
	4.5 Non-Permanent Organizational Entity Administration
	4.6 Responsibility for the Archiving of Documents
	6.4 Progress Control and Reporting
	7.6 Meeting agenda, 7.7 Participation at Meetings, 7.8 Meeting Documents
	7.10 Meeting Resolutions and Reports, 7.11 Electronic Teleconferencing
	8 Document Types, Numbering and Distribution Requirements
	9 Voting
	10.1 Health and Safety Considerations
	10.4 Formal Descriptions, 10.5 Application Portability, 10.6 Standard International Units
	12 Preparation and Adoption of International Standards - Normal Processing, 12.2 General,
	17 International Standardized profiles and Related Documents



needed: SD on JTC1 Policy on Conformity Assessment See FNB comment on 2.12 and Annex H	Annex C JTC1 Policy on Conformity Assessment
needed: reference to on-line balloting system and SD for Forms ; see FNB comment	Annex E Registration Definitions and Guidelines for Procedure Standards
needed: SD for JTC1 Policy on Electronic Document Distribution Using the World Wide Web	Annex G Forms
include in same SD the annexes HA to HG	Annex H JTC1 Policy on Electronic Document Distribution Using the World Wide Web
	Annex HA Text Area for A4 and North American Paper Sizes
	Annex HB Examples of Valid File names
	Annex HC 8859-1 Character Set
	Annex HD Document Access Classification List
	Annex HE Table of Recommended Formats
	Annex HF Glossary of Terms
	Annex HG ISO/IEC JTC 1 Web Server Policy
needed: SD for JTC1 Policy on Interoperability (may create one SD for both Conformity Assessment and Interoperability)	Annex I JTC1 Policy on Interoperability
needed: SD n on Guidelines for API Standardization	Annex J Guidelines for API Standardization
needed: new annex for Collaborative Procedures for ITU-T and JTC 1 Co-operation; see FNB comment	Annex K Collaborative Procedures for ITU-T and JTC 1 Co-operation
No longer needed, remove. Same for LA, LB.	Annex L Rules for ISO/IEC JTC1 Workshop Mode of Operation
	Annex LA Checklist to estimate costs associated with hosting an ISO IWA Workshop
	Annex LB Guidance to Workshop Proposers
needed: new SD for The Transposition of Publicly Available Specifications into International Standards - A Management Guide ((in addition to new Annex for Chapter 14)	Annex M Annex M The Transposition of Publicly Available Specifications into International Standards - A Management Guide
include MA in new SD "PAS Management Guide"	Annex MA Points of Contact
needed: new Annex for The Normative Referencing of Specifications other than International Standards in JTC1 International Standards	Annex N The Normative Referencing of Specifications other than International Standards in JTC1 International Standards - Guidelines for JTC1 SCs
Needed: new annexe (+ update)	Annex O Ballot Periods

[illegible]