

**ISO/IEC JTC 1
Information Technology**

Document Type: National Body Contribution

Document Title: National Body of Canada Comments on JTC 1 N 9439, Draft JTC 1 Supplement to the ISO/IEC Directives

Document Source: National Body of Canada

Reference: This is document is circulated to National Bodies for review and consideration. It will be discussed at the February 2009 JTC 1 SWG-D meeting in Delft, Netherlands under agend item 6.

Action ID: ACT

Due Date:

No. of Pages: 11

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date:	Document:
-------	-----------

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB ¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of com ₂ ment	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted
CA -1			Ge	The numbering in the supplement is unacceptable. Current directives are numbered according ISO/IEC rules and make the extensive addition of JTC1 supplement material, which has no further numbering unusable.	Sub-numbering of JTC1 supplement material to permit cross-referencing and proper change management. We suggest either a paragraph numbering J1xxx, or an alternative J1.x.y subnumbering. This is a critical issue for Canada.	
CA -2				Cat C liaisons –	add a paragraph that guidance for selecting Cat A and cat C liaisons will be created in a JTC1 standing document.	
CA -3	Supplement 2.1.9	Page 33	Te	Old text for TR type 1 2 and 3 retained, even though JTC1 voted to adopt ISO/IEC TS and TR	Change bullet 3 of handling of a CD CD, TR → TS and add handling to change project to publish as a Technical Report.	
CA -4	Supplement 2.1.9	P34	Te	handling of a failed FDIS	Change to “DIS or FDIS”	
CA -5	Supplement 2.1.9	P34 bullet 3	Te	handling of a failed FDIS	change bullet 3 to say in disposition, return to subcommittee level in order to rework and publish as a TR. Add a bullet to say publish as a Technical specification.	
CA -6	Supplement 2.3.1	after bullet 4	Te	text that begins “in JTC1...” after bullet list is part of the list	make a bullet.	
CA -7	Supplement 2.3.1	after bullet 4	Te	The list ignores JTC1 fast track processes	Add new bullet, “In JTC1 Fast-track”	
CA -8	Supplement 2.6.3			Wording from JTC1 Directives 5.3, section 3.1.1, Recommending when to abstain missing	Reintroduce wording from directives sect 3.1.1 about when to abstain into supplement 2.6.3.	
CA -9	Supplement Annex AA		Ge	Six extra copies of Annex AA	Delete copies.	

1 **MB** = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date:	Document:
-------	-----------

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of com₂ ment	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted
CA -10	Supplement general		Ge	Many previously deleted portions of text in V5.3 (due to revisions of V5.2) have reappeared in this document. We document the ones that we find, but fear there may be more.	Perform a detailed review of all JTC1-added text to eradicate invalid text that was erroneously retained.	
CA -11	Supplement 2.9.3	Para 5,		missing stabilization from standardization categories.	add stabilization to confirmation, withdrawal,...	
CA -12	Supplement 2.9.3	Para 7,		Missing reference to 2.9.4 for stabilized standards	add reference to 2.9.4 for stabilized standards.	
CA -13	Supplement 2.9.3	Para 7,		Missing reference to 15.1 and 15.2 for stabilized standards	Fix references to 15.1 and 15.2.	
CA -14	Supplement 2.10.5.2 Directives V5.3 sect 5.8	Para 3	Te	missing references 15.4.xxx	fix references 15.4.xxx	
CA -15	Supplement 2.105.4		Te	FDIS missing from the list of documents to which an editing group may be used.	Add FDIS to the list of documents to which an editing group may be used	
CA -16	Directives 6.2		Te	Proposal stage – cannot find where NP form is referenced as needing to be completed	Integrate better instructions for completing NP and the form in Annex C	
CA -17	Directives 6.2.1.7		Te	References to Formal Descriptions missing – (old 6.2.1.7 – need to be included)	Include formal description process in section 2 and in new annex in special considerations.	
CA -18	Sect 4, old 7.11			Use of teleconferencing has changed. Needs revisiting in light of supplement. Reference the supplement.	Reference the supplement.	
CA -19	Supplement 3.3.3		Te	Table missing	Add the table mentioned in this section	
CA	Supplement sec			“Cancellation of meetings” contains all JTC1 material on	Create a new standing document on meetings, move	

¹ **MB** = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

² **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date:	Document:
-------	-----------

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of com₂ ment	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted
-20	4.4			meetings. This is 5 pages of material about many issues re meetings, not just cancellation, and needs significant work.	guidance to this SD and keep only imperative language and reference to SD.	
CA -21	Supplement 4.4 p58	para begins "A P member which has given..."	Te	references now obsolete 3.1.2	Delete paragraph	
CA -22	Supplement Annex AB Dir Section 8			Annex AB in supplement corresponds to sect 8 Document types and numbering, but there is no explanation or reference in the main document.	Place primary reference to Annex AB (or whatever it becomes) below table in 2.1.3.1 or in 2.1.3.3. Integrate annex AB to correct references. Wherever annex AB references the main body, place references from main body to Annex AB.	
CA -23	Suppl 2.1.3.3			reference to ISO supplement to directives is problematic in JTC1 supplement	Include JTC1 specific table.	
CA -24	suppl 2.1.3.3			reference to a nonexistence annex SI.	Provide annex or correct reference	
CA -25	Supplement F.2.4	BRM	Te	Connection from BRM to FDIS is missing	After the draft standard successfully completes BRM stage, it progresses to approval stage (2.7).	
CA -26	General		General	There is still no way to adjust fast track or PAS balloting periods based on complexity. A significant number of countries want some adjustment but are having difficulty determining a suitable measure. With the absence of any other measure, we want page count to be the guide.	Add words that for documents larger than 500 pages in size, the DIS ballot period for Fast Track and PAS is extended by 1 month for every 100 pages that the page count exceeds 500 pages, until a better method can be agreed upon.	
CA -27	General		Ge	Effective date of change. We are still grappling with the effective date of changes.	Add wording that all changes are effective as specified in the ballot itself. If no effectivity date is specified, then the effectivity is immediately after publication of the ballot results.	

1 **MB** = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date:	Document:
-------	-----------

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of com₂ ment	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted
CA -28			Ge	Liaison organizations. Much of the material on Liaison organizations is not explicitly directives and can be placed in a standing document.	Create a standing document for liaison documents and place only the mandatory material in the directives, plus references to the standing document. A proposed standing document is attached.	
CA -29	DirectiveSection 9 Voting		Te	Annex AC in supplement corresponds to sect 9 Voting, but there is no explanation or reference in the main document.	Primary references from supplement sections need reference to Annex AB paragraphs. Make annex the authoritative source and summarize or reference from following locations in the main document. 1.4 (multiple) 1.5.7 1.6.1 1.7.1 bullet 1.7.4 Bullet 2 2.1.5.4 Second additional paragraph 2.3.5 sub B 2.5.6 para 4 2.5.6 para 5 (juct) 2.5.10 JTC specific paragraph 7, 11 2.6.1 JTC specific paragraph 6 2.6.3 common last paragraph – this duplicates material in Annex 2.6.4 paragraph 1 (common) 2.6.4 sub C bullet 1 (common) 2.6.5 (common) 2.6.5. sub A 2.6.6 (common) 2.7.3	
CA -30	DirectiveSection 9 Voting, Annex AB			Many internal references are wrong.	Fix internal references	

1 **MB** = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date:	Document:
-------	-----------

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of com₂ ment	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted
CA-31	DirectiveSection 9 Voting, Annex AB	Second sentence on combined voting procedure		this is deleted text.	Remove text	
CA-32	DirectiveSection 9 Voting, Annex AB	Pl18, note on 50% rule	Te	this is deleted text erroneously carried forward	remove note	
CA-33	DirectiveSection 10 Special Considerations		Te	10.1 Health and safety not covered	include in sect 1.4 ask the JDMT to consider including in common directives Need a reference from main text, in section 2.3.4 Proposal Stage and 2.4.1 at end of JTC1-specific text	
CA-35	DirectiveSection 10 Special Considerations	Sect 10.4 Formal Descriptions	Te	10.4 Formal Description not covered	include in new annex, possibly called Special Considerations or something slightly more generic to also cover Archiving Need a reference from main text, in section 2.3.4 Proposal Stage and 2.4.1 at end of JTC1-specific text	
CA-36	DirectiveSection 10 Special Considerations	10.5 Application Portability	Te	10.5 Application Portability not covered	Include in new annex, possibly called Special Considerations or something slightly more generic to also cover Archiving Need a reference from main text, in section 2.3.4 Proposal Stage and 2.4.1 at end of JTC1-specific text	

1 **MB** = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date:	Document:
-------	-----------

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB ¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of com ₂ ment	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted
CA -37	DirectiveSect 10 Special Considerations	10.6 Standard International Units	Te	10.6 Standard International Units not covered	Include in new annex, possibly called Special Considerations or something slightly more generic to also cover Archiving Need a reference from main text, in section 2.3.4 Proposal Stage and 2.4.1 at end of JTC1-specific text	
CA -38	Directives Section 3.4 coordination		Te	Section 3.4 coordination , esp part 3.4.3 resolution of difficulties appear to be missing.	place complete text of 3.4.3 in B.4.3 or construct as B.4.4	
CA -39	Directives Section 4.6			Responsibility for the Archiving of Documents is missing	Place text from 4.6 into section 2.9 “Maintenance of Standards” or make an Annex and reference from 1.9 and 2.9. In any case, reference in 1.9 this item.	
CA -40	Directives Chapter 12			Chapter 12 there is no mention of double logo – inferred for all ISO/IEC docs	Add to section 2.2 or 2.8 and B.4.2.9 (las one to add JTC1 to dual committees)	
CA -41	Directives 12.1		Te	Clause that addresses FT submission where an SC has an open Npmissing	Address in Annex F	
CA -42	Directives 12.2.7		Te	12.2.7 Accelerated processing – missing from the supplement	include directly in 2.3.4	
CA -43	Directives 12.3		Te	12.3 Study period – missing from current supplement	Add to section 2.2.4	
CA -44	Directives 12.4		Te	12.4 Stage 1 – missing material	We doubt that this is mandatory and properly belongs as an annex, or possibly a standing document. Add to sect 2.3.4 a reference to new annex or SD.	
CA -45	Directives 12.5		Te	12.5 Stage 2, numbering of work products is not effectively covered in supplement. Sects 12.5.1.2/3 contain more relevant material	Add material from 12.5 (all sections) to section 2.4 (harmonize with directives sect 18 work)	

1 **MB** = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date:	Document:
-------	-----------

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB ¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of com₂ ment	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted
CA -46	Directives 13	Para 2	Te	Paragraph commencing “Prior to commencing...” is missing	add to F.2.1.1 add: SC’s are strongly encouraged to respond to pre-FT submissions with comments and observations in a timely manner	
CA -47	Supplement Annex A and B		Ed	Much of the material that should be common text is in black, not yellow colour. This makes it very difficult to determine if only JTC1 supplement material is in black colour in the rest of the document.	Perform a careful editorial review to ensure that all common directives material is in yellow.	
CA -48	Directives 13.4	Sub para 2	Te	The new text for the 30 day review period is not in the common text	Add material re contradiction review processing from 13.4 to Annex F and to 2.3.4 (as a reference to Annex F), include 60 day review period.	
CA -49	Directives 14		Te	Section 14 PAS processing is missing	Add section 14 as a new Annex. Integrate as much as possible with Annex F Reference it from the main text.	
CA -50	Directives 16.5		Te	Fast Track of Technical Reports is missing	Place material for fast track of technical reports in Annex F. Use most of the fast track process as is and only add the TR specific material where it differs.	
CA -51	Directives 17		Te	Section 17 – International Standardised Profiles and Related Docs is absent from the supplement.	Add as a separate annex (Special Considerations Annex or on its own) and referenced from 2.3.4, 2.4.1 at end of JTC1 specific additions	
CA -52	Suppl1.14	last paragraph before clause 1.15	Te	It is not clear that this paragraph only applies to Editing groups	Replace: “The following are examples of ad hoc groups: · Subgroup Rapporteur group; · Drafting group; · Editing group; · Ballot resolution group;	

1 **MB** = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date:	Document:
-------	-----------

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB ¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of com ₂ ment	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted
					<p>· Study group</p> <p>JTC 1 or SCs may establish editing groups to ensure the best possible editorial presentation of drafts in conformity with ISO/IEC Directives, Part 2. An editing group works under the responsibility of the Secretariat of JTC 1 or the SC that established it and provides direction to the Project Editor (see 5.7)."</p> <p>With</p> <p>"The following are examples of ad hoc groups:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> · Subgroup Rapporteur group; · Drafting group; · Editing group; · Ballot resolution group; · Study group <p>Note That in the case of "Editing Groups":</p> <p>JTC 1 or SCs may establish editing groups to ensure the best possible editorial presentation of drafts in conformity with ISO/IEC Directives, Part 2. An editing group works under the responsibility of the Secretariat of JTC 1 or the SC that established it and provides direction to the Project Editor (see 5.7)."</p>	
CA	Supplement		Te	JTC1 exception to work in English only, is not reflected in	Copy wording from current directives 7.9.1 to E.2,	

1 **MB** = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date:	Document:
-------	-----------

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of com₂ ment	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted
-53	Annex E			Annex E.	and 8.3.4, 8.3.5 to E.5	
CA -54	Supplement Annex F	Diagram	Te	Diagram does not accurately reflect JTC1 processes (PAS, TR, etc)	Create a JTC1-specific diagram, or make the current diagram reflect all processes	
CA -55	Supplement Annex AB	page 1.1.3 “Rules for numbering	Te	References to stages (CD/FCD...) outdated	Change to CD, DIS and FDIS	
CA -56	Supplement Annex AC	Voting para 2	Te	Paragraph is obsolete	Delete paragraph 2	
CA -57	Supplement Annex C	P 116 3 rd last paragraph sentence 1	Te	This is obsolete text	Delete sentence 1 of 3 rd last para	
CA -58	Supplement Annex C	P 117 para 2 of “Votes”	Te	Missing the new rules for number of participants	Add appropriate wording that 4 participants are required for 16 or fewer participating NB's and 5 if 17 or more.	
CA -59	Supplement Annex AC	P118 last paragraph	Te	sentence beginning “A P-member which has given appropriate...” is obsolete text.	Delete this sentence.	
CA -60	Supplement Annex AC	P118 last note	Te	sentence beginning “Note:” is obsolete text.	Delete this Note	
CA -61			Te	Accessibility not adequately covered	Include in new annex, possibly called Special Considerations or something slightly more generic to also cover Accessibility Need a reference from main text, in section 2.3.4 Proposal Stage and 2.4.1 at end of JTC1-specific text	
CA	Supplement	P119 Votes	Te	Reference to type 1, 2 and 3 TR's is obsolete	Delete reference to multiple types of TR's	

1 **MB** = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date:
Document:

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB ¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of com ₂ ment	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted
-62	Annex AC	on TR's				

1 **MB** = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.