



«Anti-Counterfeiting Tools»

ISO/PC 246

Date:

2010-08-19

Doc. Number:

N 050

Assistant:

Maxine BENACOM

Direct line: + 33 (0)1 41 62 83 06

maxine.benacom@afnor.org

Your contact:

Clément CHEVAUCHÉ

Direct line : + 33 (0)1 41 62 82 79

clement.chevauche@afnor.org

Japanese comments on ISO CD 12931

DOCUMENT TYPE

Comments

DOCUMENT SOURCE

Japanese Committee

COMMENTARIES

Japan has just become P Member of ISO/PC 246 and sent the following comments on project ISO 12931.

FOLLOW UP

For consideration at the next ISO/PC 246 meeting

BACKWARD POINTER

N045

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB ¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comment ²	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Proposed Editors Disposition
JP01	Introduction	Page iii, line 22	ed	The text reads as 'The ISO 12931 standard ...' Follow the style specified in the Directives, Part 2, 6.6.7.2.	Replace 'The ISO 12931 standard' with 'This International Standard'.	
JP02	General	All	te	As described in the Introduction, this International Standard is intended to be a guideline, and not a requirement standard applicable to certification of product, service, organisation or other entity. On the other hand, in the text of this draft, 'shall', 'should' and 'must' are used in parallel. There seems to be no clear criteria where to use each of these words. 'Shall' is used for requirement statements which should not appear in a guideline. Use of the term 'must' as an alternative for 'shall' is prohibited. See Directive Part 2, Annex H.	Eliminate 'shall', and also 'must' as an alternative for 'shall'. Replace each occurrence of 'shall' and 'must' with 'should', after verifying it to be appropriate.	
JP03	5.1	3rd paragraph	te	While this paragraph introduces concepts and terms of risk management, other texts of clause 5 do not mention risk management. The text has little value in this context.	Option 1: Delete the paragraph. Option 2: Add descriptions on risk management aspects using introduced terms of risk management to subclauses of clause 5.	
JP04	5.1	3rd paragraph,	te	The text reads as follows. Risk is a function of probability and severity factors. Risk analysis is the cycle of hazard identification, risk assessment, risk management and risk communication. Concepts and terms of risk management need to align with ISO 31000: 2009.	In case JP03 is accepted with Option 2, replace the text with the followings. Risk is a function of consequence and likelihood of events. Risk assessment is an overall process of risk identification, risk analysis and risk evaluation.	
JP05	5.3.2.2	1st sentence	ed	The term 'tampering resistance' should be 'tamper resistance', as used in the title of 5.3.2.2.	Replace 'tampering resistance' with 'tamper resistance'.	

1 **MB** = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial – For technical comments, please indicate whether your comment is a MAJOR or MINOR technical comment.

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 and 6 are compulsory.

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB ¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of com- ment ²	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Proposed Editors Disposition
JP06	5.3.3.4		te	It is unclear who is subject to the training. Is the training of manufacturer or authentication solution provider?	Clarify who is subject to the training.	
JP07	5.3.3.4		te	The text reads as 'Training will be required ...' This is an explanatory text. It should be stated as a recommendation.	Modify the text as follows. Training should be in place ...	
JP08	5.4.7		te	The title is as follows. Database communication security This would not be normal terminology.	Change the title as follows. Database access security or Database security	
JP09	7		ed	ISO 31000 is now an International Standard. 'FDIS' should be deleted. 'Risk Management' should be 'Risk management'.	ISO 31000, Risk management — Principles and guidelines	
JP10	7		ed	Bibliography should list correct titles. ISO 15408 Common Criteria (IT Systems) ISO /IEC 27002 on Information Technology Security (IT Systems)	ISO/IEC 15408-1, Information technology — Security techniques — Evaluation criteria for IT security — Part 1: Introduction and general model ISO/IEC 27002, Information technology — Security techniques — Code of practice for information security management Other titles need be corrected.	
JP11	2		Ed	ISO/IEC 15408-1,-2,-3 has already been published in version corresponded to CC version 3.1 in 2008 and 2009.	Replace from ISO/CEI 15408: CC version 3.1 dated September 2005. ISO/IEC 15408(all parts) Information technology — Security techniques — Evaluation criteria for IT security Delete ISO/IEC15408 from Bibliography in this case.	

¹ **MB** = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

² **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial – For technical comments, please indicate whether your comment is a MAJOR or MINOR technical comment.

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 and 6 are compulsory.

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB ¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of com- ment ²	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Proposed Editors Disposition
JP12	Figure			This figure needs the title and figure number. This is based on ISO/IEC Directives Part 2, 6.6.5.	Attach the title, for example, "Figure 1 Functional block diagram of a typical authentication solution" under this figure. And change the first sentence as follows. The typical authentication solution is shown in Figure 1.	
JP13	4.4	All paragraph	ed	ISO prohibits a hanging paragraph(no clause number) in ISO standard documents based on ISO/IEC Directives Part 2, 5.2.4. There are same problems in 5.3.2, 5.3.3, 5.4, 5.5, 5.5.1, 5.5.2, etc.	Rewrite as follows From 4.4, 4.4.1 Categorisation of technical tools, 4.4.2 Overt category , ... To 4,4 , 4.4.1 General, 4.4.2 Categorisation of technical tools, 4.4.3 Overt category , ...	
JP14	4.4	Table1		The site of table number and title is wrong based on ISO/IEC Directives Part 2, 6.6.6.	Move the table number and title from bottom of table to the top.	

1 **MB** = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by **)

2 **Type of comment:** **ge** = general **te** = technical **ed** = editorial – For technical comments, please indicate whether your comment is a MAJOR or MINOR technical comment.

NOTE Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 and 6 are compulsory.