

**ISO/IEC JTC 1
Information Technology**

Document Type: Procedural Documentation

Document Title: Letter Ballot on the JTC 1 Standing Document on Normative References

Document Source: JTC 1 Secretary

Reference: This document is circulated to JTC 1 National Bodies for a three-month approval ballot. JTC 1 National Bodies are instructed to submit their vote via the online balloting system by the due date indicated.

Action ID: VOTE

Due Date: 2010-02-02

No. of Pages: 9

1
2
3
4
5

6

10

15

20

25

30

34

Standing Document
The Normative Referencing of Specifications other than International Standards in JTC 1 International Standards - Guidelines for JTC 1 SCs

Contents

N1 Purpose and scope of this Guide1
N2 JTC 1 approach to referencing other specifications2
N3 Terms for normative references to other specifications3
N4 Principles for referencing of specifications3
 N4.1 Scope..... 3
 N4.2 Conformity Interoperability 3
 N4.3 Ballot of referencing specification..... 3
 N4.4 Required Elements 3
 N4.5 Material to be submitted for the ballot 4
 N4.6 Referencing Rules 4
 N4.7 Nested Referencing 4
N5 Description of the process for JTC 1 Subcommittee use4
 N5.1 Announcement of intent to make reference 4
 N5.2 Preparation of the Referencing Explanatory Report 4
 N5.3 Availability of the Referencing Explanatory Report 5
 N5.4 Ballot 5
 N5.5 Publication of the standard 5
 N5.6 Maintenance 5
 N5.7 Documentation requirements 5
N6 Evaluation of a proposed RS6
 N6.1 Introduction 6
 N6.2 Supplementary elements 6
 N6.3 Criteria 6
 N6.3.1 Co-operative stance6
N7 An Approved RS Originator Organization (ARO)7
 N7.1 Confirmation as an Approved RS Originator Organization (ARO) 7
 N7.2 Change of status for an Approved RS Originator Organization 8

35

36

37 In addition to ISO/IEC Directives, Part 2, 6.2.2 the following clauses apply:

38

39 1 Purpose and scope of this Guide

40

41 ISO/IEC JTC 1 has defined and implemented a policy that encourages and assists the
42 transposition of certain technical specifications from sources outside JTC 1 into international
43 standards. Such specifications can be transposed into International Standards developed via
44 the JTC 1 Fast Track process (see ISO/IEC Directives Part 1 , [Annex F.2](#)) or via the JTC 1
45 PAS Transposition process (see JTC 1 Supplement, [Annex F.3](#)).

46

47 JTC 1 also recognizes that there may be situations where it is appropriate to reference a
48 specification without transforming it into an International Standard. This situation may apply
49 in a number of cases.

50

51 This document covers the case when an International Standard (IS) is developed by a JTC 1
52 Subcommittee, using the five stage process as well as when International Standards are
53 proposed for adoption via the JTC 1 Fast-Track or JTC 1 PAS Transposition Process. It
54 describes the process requirements for all these cases, to be fulfilled by the JTC 1 SCs, the
55 Fast-Track and /or PAS Submitter (called hereafter the Submitter). Should requirements
56 differ between SCs and Fast-Track or PAS Fast-Track Submitters, this will be indicated.

57

58 JTC 1 re-emphasises its preference for transposition into international standards as the
59 approach to include material from outside ISO, IEC or ITU. However, if the referencing
60 approach is chosen, it is necessary to establish such references in international standards in
61 a consistent way which ensures the quality of international standards established by JTC 1 as
62 well as the proper treatment of IPR issues. Therefore, a process has to be defined by JTC 1
63 for the establishment of references to documents other than from ISO, IEC or ITU.

64

65 As no restrictions apply to making informative references (see ISO/IEC Directives, Part 2,
66 Clause 6.2.2), the scope of this document is limited to the normative referencing of a
67 specification other than from ISO, IEC or ITU in an International Standard.

68

69 JTC 1 SCs may, in the course of their work, find it appropriate to incorporate specifications
70 into an emerging IS by way of reference. The need for such action, the selection of the
71 appropriate specification, and the evaluation of the proposed Referenced Specification (RS)
72 itself are matters for the SC to determine. Any such SC decision will, however, be subject to
73 JTC 1 National Body evaluation during the respective ballot.

74

75 JTC 1 SCs are reminded that, in accordance to Resolution 28 of the 11th JTC 1 Plenary
76 Meeting, in Seoul, Korea, in 1999, "SCs and National Bodies are requested to pay particular
77 attention to mechanisms that could be utilized to reduce the burden of the process on officers
78 at the SC level. Examples can include reuse by one SC of a prior written statements
79 developed by another SC, or the use of appropriate statements from approved co-operative
80 agreements between JTC 1 and another organization."

81

82 These Guidelines provide insights to facilitate the SC consideration and subsequent
83 incorporation of an RS into a JTC 1 IS. Since the consideration of a proposed RS may well
84 involve more than purely technical considerations, it is deemed helpful to provide these
85 Guidelines. The SC is asked to use this document to facilitate the process. As to IPR issues
86 or organisational matters, it is expected that the SC will contact the appropriate bodies (e.g.
87 ITTF) to obtain the necessary information and that the SC will, if necessary, facilitate
88 discussion between ISO/IEC and the RS Originator.

89 2 JTC 1 approach to referencing other specifications

90 According to ISO/IEC Directives, Part 2, referencing sources other than ISO, IEC, or ITU is a
91 valid approach for making use of such specifications, provided that the provisions listed in
92 clause 6.2.2 of the ISO/IEC Directives, Part 2 are fulfilled.

JTC 1 supports this approach and it has to maintain the quality of its work and the integrity of the standards development process. Therefore, it is necessary to establish some referencing rules that complement those of ISO/IEC. Though rules and guidelines are important, JTC 1 wishes them to be as straightforward as possible. This also takes account of the fact that the initiative for establishing references usually comes from the standards developing community within JTC 1. Further, minimal additional burden should be put on the originator of a specification being referenced.

3 Terms for normative references to other specifications

The process of establishing normative references to documents other than from ISO, IEC or ITU is based on the ISO/IEC Directives and the JTC 1 Supplement with the addition of the following terms:

- The Submitter: The JTC 1 SC, Fast-Track or PAS Submitter developing the standard including such normative references.
- Referenced Specification (RS): A specification from a source other than ISO, IEC, or ITU is called a Referenced Specification (RS) if it meets certain criteria (see clause 6) and has been balloted and accepted together with the FDIS at the JTC 1 National Body level as suitable for normative referencing in the resulting international standard (IS). An RS may be a part of a larger specification.
- RS Originator: The originator of an RS or a proposed RS. i.
- Approved RS Originator Organization (ARO): An organization that has been approved as an RS originator for all of its standards (see clause 7).

4 Principles for referencing of specifications

4.1 Scope

An RS shall be within the JTC 1 scope.

4.2 Conformity Interoperability

All ISs containing normative references to other specifications have to follow the same requirements and rules concerning conformity and interoperability, as for other JTC 1 standards as defined in the JTC 1 Supplement.

4.3 Ballot of referencing specification

When the referencing specification (CD, DIS or FDIS) is submitted for ballot it shall either be accompanied by a Referencing Explanatory Report (RER) which has been generated by the Submitter wishing to incorporate the RS in a target IS or the Submitter will ensure that the organization creating the reference specification has previously met such organizational requirements so as to be listed as an Approved RS Originator (ARO).

4.4 Required Elements

The RER shall contain the following elements:

1. a justification for the referencing which shall also address the following aspects:
 - a) relationship of the proposed RS to existing or emerging international standards (and regional or other standards as appropriate) and when the RS is competing with or complementing an existing or emerging international standard, the rationale for the referencing;
 - b) the degree of market acceptance of the proposed RS; and

- 144 c) the rationale as to why the transposition of the proposed RS into an IS is
145 inappropriate or impractical,
146
147 2. statements that address the criteria as detailed in clause 6.
148
149 3. a copy of the normative referencing policy of the RS Originator (where one exists).
150

151 **4.5 Material to be submitted for the ballot**

152 The material submitted for ballot shall either include a copy of the proposed RS or a means
153 by which National Bodies may readily access the material (e.g., ISBN or URL) and meet the
154 availability requirements of 6.3.1 3rd bullet. If the referenced material has been made available
155 to JTC 1 member bodies previously as an N numbered document, it is acceptable, instead, to
156 refer to that document.

157 **4.6 Referencing Rules**

158 For actual referencing, the rules of the ISO/IEC Directives, Part 2, apply. In contrast to the
159 ISO/IEC rules, any reference shall be specific and indicate the publication date and/or version
160 number as appropriate.

161 **4.7 Nested Referencing**

162 If an RS, in turn, contains a normative reference to a specification other than an international
163 standard or ARO standard, the information required by an RER shall normally be provided for
164 each additional reference. The exception to this requirement is when the level of detail
165 involved would be so time-consuming to assemble, and difficult to interpret, that its collection
166 would be counterproductive. In this case, the Submitter shall explain the situation in a way
167 that will enable National Bodies to make an informed assessment of the references that are
168 being made. The responsible Submitter is expected to thoroughly process all nested
169 references.
170

171 **5 Description of the process for JTC 1 Subcommittee use**

172 **5.1 Announcement of intent to make reference**

173
174 The intention to make a normative reference to a specification other than an international
175 standard should be stated in the New Work Item Proposal (NP) if the requirement is known at
176 that time; otherwise, the intent should be communicated to JTC 1 National Bodies as soon as
177 consensus on the need is reached in the SC. Fast-Track or PAS Submitters need to state this
178 situation in their Explanatory Report accompanying their submission.

179 **5.2 Preparation of the Referencing Explanatory Report**

180
181 It is the obligation of the Submitter which develops a proposed IS containing normative
182 references to specifications other than international standards, to either provide for each
183 proposed RS a related RER or to ensure that the organization is an Approved Reference
184 Organization. The elements of this Report are described in clause 4.4 above. In order to avoid
185 any undue delay in the standard ratification process and to avoid the wasting of development
186 resources, the production of a RER or the confirmation of the organization as an Approved
187 RS Originator Organization should commence as soon as the standard developing
188 Subcommittee has determined the need to establish a normative reference.

189 **5.3 Availability of the Referencing Explanatory Report**

190
191 The RER, or confirmation of the organization as an ARO, shall be made available to JTC 1
192 and its National Bodies as early as possible and appropriate. The latest date for the
193 availability of the Report or ARO status is the submission of the first CD ballot; or the DIS

194 ballot for Fast-Track/PAS submissions. The RER/ARO confirmation shall also accompany any
195 subsequent CD, DIS and FDIS ballot.
196

197 **5.4 Ballot**

198
199 The material submitted for ballot (CD, DIS and FDIS) shall include the RER/ARO confirmation
200 together with a copy of the proposed RS or a means by which National Bodies may readily
201 access the material (e.g., ISBN or URL). If the Report or the proposed RS were provided
202 earlier, it is acceptable to give, instead, a reference to the earlier submission and a statement
203 verifying that no changes have occurred in the meantime.
204

205 In the case of a CD ballot, JTC 1 National Bodies are invited to independently submit their
206 comments on the RER/ARO confirmation by the time the CD ballot closes, for review by the
207 relevant SC.
208

209 Comments and votes are handled in the usual way. The RS Originator may be invited to
210 attend the appropriate part of any resolution meeting held.
211

212 **5.5 Publication of the standard**

213
214 No particular provisions regarding publication apply where an IS contains a reference to an
215 RS. The source of the RS may be different from that of an IS, and it is not required that the
216 text of the RS should be published, or distributed, with the referencing standard.
217

218 **5.6 Maintenance**

219
220 It is expected that JTC 1 will evaluate the consequences of any change to the RS subsequent
221 to its inclusion as a reference in a JTC 1 standard, for appropriate action (e.g. revision,
222 exclusion). At every maintenance interval the RER and all RSs shall be evaluated for their
223 continued availability and relevance. If required (see clause 3), new RERs may be generated
224 for RSs not presently covered by an RER or sourced from an ARO.
225

226 **5.7 Documentation requirements**

227
228 Further to the requirements in the ISO/IEC Directives, Part 2, all RSs to which a normative
229 reference is made should be identified in a subclause of clause 2 of the IS. This subclause
230 should start with the following text:
231

232 All references in this subclause were correct at the time of approval of this International
233 Standard. The provisions of the referenced specifications, as identified in this subclause, are
234 valid within the context of this IS. The reference to a specification within this IS does not give
235 it any further status within ISO/IEC; in particular, it does not give the referenced specification
236 the status of an International Standard.
237

238 **6 Evaluation of a proposed RS**

239 **6.1 Introduction**

240
241 JTC 1 has established criteria which serve as a basis for the judgment as to whether a
242 particular specification can be accepted as a normative reference in an international standard.
243 This judgment initially occurs at JTC 1 Subcommittee level when a decision to establish a
244 normative reference is made, and later at NB level during the CD or FDIS ballot.
245

246 Similarly for specifications submitted via Fast-Track or PAS the judgement will occur at NB
247 level during the DIS or FDIS ballot. The Fast-Track or PAS Submitter should thus be aware of
248 and exercise these criteria when incorporating normative references in its submission.
249

250 JTC 1 considers that the primary benefit of these criteria is guidance for consistent evaluation
251 rather than an absolute pass/fail mechanism. There is a wide variety of specifications
252 available for consideration as well as a wide variety of needs within the JTC 1 community. An
253 absolute pass/fail mechanism over such a wide variety of material is unlikely. What is needed
254 throughout this process is flexibility and good judgment on the part of all concerned. Rather
255 than provide quantitative measures to evaluate acceptability of a proposed RS on a pass/ fail
256 basis, the criteria set forth the key topics for consideration and measures for evaluating them
257 in terms of the scope, depth, and thoroughness with which the criteria topics have been
258 considered.
259

260 **6.2 Supplementary elements**

261
262 It is intended that the questions asked under each Criteria Category are to be viewed as
263 examples of ways in which the basic criteria sub-category might be evaluated. There may well
264 be other responses to unasked questions that best describe how well a given proposed RS
265 meets, for example, an acceptable level of "Quality". In general, the more complete the RER
266 and its accompanying documents, the easier it will be for JTC 1 National Bodies to evaluate
267 an international standard making a normative reference to an RS.
268
269

270 **6.3 Criteria**

271
272 The Submitter shall notify the RS Originator of the intent to reference the RS and provide the
273 RS Originator with a copy of the RER. The Submitter is encouraged to, where possible, work
274 with the RS Originator to ensure the accuracy of all elements of the RER. The RS Originator
275 shall be provided the opportunity, within a reasonable period of time, to object to the
276 reference to the RS. If the RS Originator notifies the Submitter that it objects to such a
277 reference the Submitter shall not include the reference to the RS.
278

279 The RER shall contain comprehensive statements covering the following categories and
280 topics:
281

- 282 • Ongoing maintenance:
283 If the RS Originator is not available to maintain the RS, who is responsible for maintenance
284 of the RS if and when the need arises?
285
- 286 • Changes
287 What is the flexibility of the RS Originator to apply changes to the RS if so requested during
288 the process of balloting the referencing standard?
289
- 290 • Availability of the referenced specification
291 What is the status of public availability of the RS on fair, reasonable and nondiscriminatory
292 terms and conditions? Standards that are Publicly Available to implementers, evaluators
293 and other interested parties for as long as the IS that references them is an active
294 document are those which:
 - 295 • May be obtained from the source organization by any person (with or without
296 payment) simply by quoting the reference given in the IS to the source organization
297 or typical supplier.
 - 298 • Are available in one of the official ISO or IEC languages from a publicly
299 accessible source.
 - 300 • Are available without contractual limitations relating to their evaluation (other
301 than limitations reasonably intended to restrict duplication and redistribution) and

302 without substantive contractual limits on implementation of the referenced material or
303 the IS as a condition of obtaining access to the referenced material.

304

305 • Intellectual property rights

306 It is the Submitter's responsibility to ensure that statements in response related to 'Patents'
307 and 'Copyrights' are provided in the RER. The Submitter is encouraged to work with the RS
308 Originator to ensure the accuracy of the statements on the items listed below.

309 • Patents:

310 What is the status of the RS Originator, or where appropriate, the policy governing the RS
311 meeting the ISO/IEC policy on patent matters?

312 • Copyrights:

313 What copyrights exist, and what copyrights is the RS Originator willing to grant, throughout
314 both the evaluation and the publication cycle?

315 • Trademark rights:

316 What trademarks apply to the RS and with what conditions?

317 • Quality

318 The Submitter shall establish that the proposed RS is of adequate quality, considering
319 topics such as the length of the time the specification has existed, whether products have
320 been implemented using it, whether conformance requirements are clear, and whether the
321 specification is readily and widely available.

322

323 **7 An Approved RS Originator Organization (ARO)**

324 **7.1 Confirmation as an Approved RS Originator Organization (ARO)**

325

326 On the occasion that a particular RS Originator has already been referenced by a prior
327 ISO/IEC JTC 1 IS (TR or TS) and documented in an RER, or in preparation for future
328 referencing in an IS (TR or TS), the SC or any National Body may nominate the RS Originator
329 to be confirmed as an ARO. In the absence of an objection from the candidate ARO, an ARO
330 Overview Submission, describing the RS Originator's cooperative stance: the ongoing
331 maintenance agreement, the application of changes, the availability of the referenced
332 specifications, the position of the RS Originator on intellectual property, patent rights,
333 copyrights, and trademark rights, and the overall qualification of all of its deliverables to meet
334 the criteria specified herein for RSs, shall be issued for a 3 month ballot by JTC 1 for approval
335 of that organization as an ARO. Upon ballot approval, the RS Originator shall be added to a
336 list of AROs in good standing. Such a list of Approved RS Originator Organizations will be
337 maintained by the JTC 1 Secretariat and published on the JTC 1 website.

338

339 A Submitter may reference an ARO as a previously submitted and Approved RS Originator
340 Organization.

341

342 **7.2 Change of status for an Approved RS Originator Organization**

343

344 An SC, or National Body or a Fast-Track/PAS Submitter shall notify JTC 1 if it becomes
345 aware that the content of an ARO's Overview Submission is no longer accurate. Furthermore,
346 prior to referencing an ARO in an FDIS or amended IS, the Submitter must confirm that all
347 content as contained in the documented Overview Submission is accurate and current.

348

349 Should an ARO's procedures vary in a non-essential manner from the RS ARO Overview on
350 file, the submitting SC or sponsoring NB, in cooperation with the ARO, shall provide an
351 updated ARO Overview, no later than submission of the FDIS/FDAM ballot to JTC 1. The JTC
352 1 Secretariat shall notify all other affected Submitters of a change in the ARO's RER for their
353 consideration. Should an ARO's policies change in a substantial manner (e.g., such that they
354 are no longer aligned with ISO/IEC Directives and Policies), the submitting SC or NB shall
355 request reconfirmation with JTC 1 of the organization's status as an ARO. Should
356 reconfirmation fail, the ARO shall be removed from the JTC 1 ARO listing and the affected

357 Submitters shall be notified to take necessary action to address all pending referenced
358 specifications from that ARO.
359
360