## Telecommunications and Information Exchange Between Systems ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 6

Document Number:	N14273
Date:	2010-04-28
Replaces:	
Document Type:	Disposition of Comments
Document Title:	Disposition of Comments on the text for PDAM ballot, Amendment 2 to ISO/IEC 9594-All parts
Document Source:	JTC 1/WG 8 Geneva meeting
Project Number:	
Document Status:	For your information.
Action ID:	FYI
Due Date:	
No. of Pages:	15

ISO/IEC JTC1/SC6 Secretariat Ms. Jooran Lee, KSA (on behalf of KATS)

Korea Technology Center #701-7 Yeoksam-dong, Gangnam-gu, Seoul, 135-513, Republic of Korea;

Telephone: +82 2 6009 4808; Facsimile: +82 2 6009 4819; Email: jooran@kisi.or.kr

Comments on ISO/IEC 9594 All parts PDAM2	Date: 2010-04-14	Document: JTC 1/SC6 N 14092

0	1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
#	NB 1	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note #	Com- ment type <sup>2</sup>	Comment (justification for change) by the NB	Proposed change by the NB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted

FR	Part 2	Ed	For consistency between names used for object-	Change the names as follows:	accepted
	Part 3		classes, attributes, matching rules, object		
	Part 7		identifiers, types and identifiers, it should be preferable:	(Part 2: 14.9 and Annex B)	
	Part 8		- to use names beginning with "pwd" for names	id-at-myPwdAttribute ->	
	Part 9		specific to password policy,	id-at-pwdAttribute	
			- to use names beginning with "userPwd" for names specific to the attribute userPwd	(Part 2: 14.9 and Annex B, Part 6: Annex A)	
				passwordHistory{} -> pwdHistory{}	
				(Part 2: 14.9.1 and Annex B, Part 8: 18.1.5.7 and Annex A.1)	
				PasswordHistory{} -> PwdHistory{}	
				(Part 2: 14.9.1 and Annex B)	
				recentlyExpiredPassword{} -> pwdRecentryExpired{}	
				(Part 2: 14.9.2 and Annex B, Part 8: 18.1.5.8 and Annex A.1)	
				passwordHistoryMatch{} ->	
				pwdHistoryMatch{}	
				(Part 2: 14.9.3 and Annex B, Part 8: 18.1.11 and Annex A.1)	
				recentlyExpiredPwdDuration -> pwdRecentlyExpiredDuration	
				(Part 2: 14.9, Part 8: 18.1.3, figure 11, 18.1.5.8, 18.1.6.14, Annex A.1, Part 9: 9.2.2)	

Con	nmen	ts on ISO/IE0	C 9594 All pa	arts PDA	M2	Date: 20	10-04-14	Document: JTC 1/SC6 N	14092
0	1	2	(3)	4	5			(6)	(7)
#	NB 1	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note #	Com- ment type <sup>2</sup>	Comment (justification for change) by	the NB	Pro	pposed change by the NB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted
							id-oa-recent	tlyExpiredPwdDuration ->	
							id-oa-pwdR	ecentlyExpiredDuration	
							(Part 8: 18.1	.6.14, Annex A.1)	
							gracesUsed	-> pwdGracesUsed	
							(Part 8: 18.1	.5.6, Annex B, Part 9: 9.2.2)	
							id-oa-graces	sUsed ->	
							id-oa-pwdG	racesUsed	
							(Part 8: 18.1	.5.6, Annex B)	
							pwdHistory	-> userPwdHistory	
								, Part 8: 18.1.5.7, 18.1.6.11, 3.1.11, Annex B, Part 9: 9.2.2)	
							id-oa-pwdHi	istory ->	
							id-oa-userP	wdHistory	
							(Part 8: 18.1	1.5.7, Annex B)	
							recentlyExp userPwdRe	iredPwd -> centlyExpired	
								.3, 18.1.5.1, 18.1.5.8, nnex B, Part 9: 9.2.2)	
							id-oa-recent	:lyExpiredPwd ->	
							id-oa-pwdR	ecentlyExpired	
							(Part 8: 18.1	.5.8, Annex B)	

modifyEntryPwdAllowed -> pwdModifyEntryAllowed

<sup>1</sup> NB = National body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the Secretariat editing unit are identified by \*\*)

Con	nmen	ts on ISO/IE0	C 9594 All pa	arts PDA	M2	Date: 2010-04-14 Document: <b>JTC 1/SC6 N 14092</b>			l 14092
0	1	2	(3)	4	5			(6)	(7)
#	NB 1	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note #	Com- ment type <sup>2</sup>	Comment (justification for change) by	the NB	Propos	sed change by the NB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted
							(Part 2: 14.9, Part 9: 9.2.2)	art 8: 18.1.6.1, Annex B,	
							I -	ntryPwdAllowrd ->	
							id-oa-pwdMod (Part 8: 18.1.6.	ifyEntryAllowed 1, Annex B)	
							changePwdAll pwdChangeAll		
							(Part 2: 14.9, Part 9: 9.2.2)	art 8: 18.1.6.2, Annex B,	
							_	PwdAllowed ->	
							id-oa-pwdChai (Part 8: 18.1.6.2		
							_	n -> pwdMinLength art 8: 18.1.6.5.1, Annex B,	

id-oa-minPwdLength -> id-oa-pwdMinLength (Part 8: 18.1.6.5.1, Annex B)

pwdHistoryMatch -> userPwdHistoryMatch

id-mr-pwdHistoryMatch ->

Annex B)

(Part 2: 14.9, Part 8: 18.1.5.7, 18.1.11,

	0	1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
;	#	NB 1	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note #	Com- ment type <sup>2</sup>	Comment (justification for change) by the NB	Proposed change by the NB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted

					id-mr-userPwdHistoryMatch (Part 2: Annex A, Part 8: 8.1.11, Annex B) insufficientPasswordQuality -> pwdInsufficientQuality (Part 3: 11.5.4, 11.6.3, 12.9, Annex A) passwordInHistory -> pwdInHistory	
					(Part 3: 11.5.4, 11.6.3, 12.9, Annex A)  noPasswordSlot -> pwdHistoryFull (Part 3: 11.5.4, 12.9, Annex A)  password -> userPwdClass (Part 7: 6.5 and Annex A)  Id-oc-password -> id-oc-userPwdClass (Part 7: 6.5 and Annex A)	
2	FR	Part 2 Clause 14.9.3	Ed	In the definition of the parameterized type passwordHistoryMatch, the object class name ATTRIBUTE used as governor shall be followed by ":"	Replace "," with ":" after ATTRIBUTE.	accepted
3	FR	Part 2 Annex B	Ed	The definition of pwdAdminSubentry is not the same as in 14.9	Replace the definition of pwdAdminSubentry with: pwdAdminSubentry OBJECT- CLASS ::= { KIND auxiliary MUST CONTAIN { pwdAttribute }	accepted

<sup>1</sup> NB = National body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the Secretariat editing unit are identified by \*\*)

Comments on ISO/IEC 9594 All parts PDAM2	Date: 2010-04-14	Document: JTC 1/SC6 N 14092
--	------------------	-----------------------------

0	1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
#	NB 1	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note #	Com- ment type <sup>2</sup>	Comment (justification for change) by the NB	Proposed change by the NB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted

					ID id-sc-pwdAdminSubentry }  Add after the list of attributes: id-at-pwdAttribute OBJECT IDENTIFIER ::= {id-at 84}	
4	FR	Part 2 Clause 11.5.2	Те	A new kind of specific area is needed for passwords.	` '	accepted
5	FR	Part 3 Clause 11.5.1	Те	The change password and administer password operations should optionally contain CommonResultSeq	In 11.5.1, replace:	accepted

<sup>1</sup> NB = National body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the Secretariat editing unit are identified by \*\*)

page 5 of 14

Comments on ISO/IEC 9594 All parts PDAM2	Date: 2010-04-14	Document: JTC 1/SC6 N 14092
--	------------------	-----------------------------

0	1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)	l
#	NB 1	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note #	Com- ment type <sup>2</sup>	Comment (justification for change) by the NB	Proposed change by the NB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted	

					{SEQUENCE { COMPONENTS OF CommonResultSeq}}}	
6	FR	Part 3 Clause11.6	Ed	This clause contains two subclauses 11.6.2	Renumber the subclauses 11.6.1 to 11.6.4.	accepted
7	FR	Part 3: Clause 12.7 l)	Ed	insufficientQuality should be pwdInsufficientQuality	Replace insufficientQuality with pwdInsufficientQuality	accepted
8	FR	Part 3 Clause 14.9	Те	The attribute <b>userPwdHistory</b> is not defined	Taking account the comment FR 1, replace the last sentence of the fourth paragraph with:  The attribute userPwdRecentlyExpired and the matching rule userPwdHistoryMatch are defined for the userPwd attribute using the UserPwd type.	accepted
9	FR	Part 5 Clause 12.2.3	Те	Add a note after 12.2.3 about chaining of new operations.	Add a note to the end of 12.2.3:  NOTE – This latter extension rule requires that any new operation that might be chained must have its argument defined as a sequence type where the first component shall be the name of the object to which the operation is addressed.	accepted
10	FR	Part 5 Clause 13.1.1	Те	The paragraph b) should be updated for password policy.	Replace b) with:  b) the bind security level(s) for which conformance is claimed (none, simple, strong – and if simple, then whether without password, with password or with protected-password); and whether the DUA can generate signed arguments or validate signed results;	accepted
11	FR	Part 5 Clause 13.2.1	Те	The paragraphs e) and f) should be updated for password policy	Replace e) and f) with:  If conformance is claimed to the application-context specified by	accepted

<sup>1</sup> NB = National body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the Secretariat editing unit are identified by \*\*)

page 6 of 14

Comments on ISO/IEC 9594 All parts PDAM2		AM2	Date: 2010-	10-04-14 Document: <b>JTC 1/SC6 N 14092</b>		l 14092			
0	1	2	(3)	4	5			(6)	(7)
#	NB 1	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note #	Com- ment type <sup>2</sup>	Comment (justification for change) by	y the NB	Prop	posed change by the NB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted
							associate the bind conform simple, s if simp password protected supporte whether originate in 22.1 ISO/IEC identity- and whe result at 22.2 of 1 9594-4. f) If conform applicati director associate the bind conform simple, s if simp password protected DSA	yAccessAC and/or and with the dap-ip protocol, security level(s) for which ance is claimed (none, strong, SPKM, SASL – and le, then whether without all, with password or the userPwd is a defor password policy); the DSA can perform or authentication as defined of ITU-T Rec. X.518   9594-4 and if so, whether based or signature-based; whether the DSA can perform athentication as defined in TU-T Rec. X.518   ISO/IEC ormance is claimed to the on-context specified by ySystemAC and/or and with the dsp-ip protocol, security level(s) for which ance is claimed (none, strong, SPKM, SASL – and le, then whether without d, with password, or with d password); whether the can perform originator action as defined in 22.1 of	

ITU-T Rec. X.518 | ISO/IEC 9594-4 and if so, whether identity-based or signature-based; and whether the

can

DSA

perform

result

Comments on ISO/IEC 9594 All parts PDAM2	Date: 2010-04-14	Document: JTC 1/SC6 N 14092
--	------------------	-----------------------------

0	1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
#	NB 1	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note #	Com- ment type <sup>2</sup>	Comment (justification for change) by the NB	Proposed change by the NB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted

_	1	, ,	•	1		,
					authentication as defined in 22.2 of ITU-T Rec. X.518   ISO/IEC 9594-4.	
					<u> </u>	
12	FR	Part 6	Ed	Errors in the following definitions:	Replace with:	accepted
		Annex A		id-at-pwdAttributeType OBJECT	id-at-pwdAttribute OBJECT	
				IDENTIFIER ::= {id-at 84}	IDENTIFIER ::= {id-at 84}	
					, ,	
				id-at-userPwd OBJECT IDENTIFIER ::= {id-at 85}	id-at-userPwd OBJECT IDENTIFIER ::=	
				IDENTIFIER ::= {IU-at 85}	OBSECT IDENTIFIER ::=   {id-at 85} X.509 Part 8	
10		D 0		"administrative demain" about dibe replaced	,	
13	FR	Part 8	Те	"administrative domain" should be replaced		accepted
		Clause 18.1.3		with "specific password administrative	1. 0.	
				area".	All entries in the same specific	
					password administrative area shall	
					use the same password attribute	
14	FR	Part 8	Ed	Typo in the title (Lzngth instead of Length)	The correct title should be:	accepted
		Clause			Minimum Password Length Attribute	
		18.1.6.5.1				
15	FR	Part 8	Te	The character sets are not explicitly	Possible definitions:	The current definition
		Clause		defined	UppercaseCharacters ::=	of the pwdAlphabet is
		18.1.6.5.3			PrintableString(FROM("A""Z"))	not correct because it
					LowercaseCharacters ::=	is limited to some
					PrintableString(FROM("a""z"))	subsets of
					NumericCharacters ::=	UTF8String. It should
					PrintableString(FROM("0""9"))	be better to replace
					OtherPrintableCharacters ::=	the character sets with
					PrintableString(ALL	a list of subsets of
					EXCEPT(UpperCaseCharacters	UTF8String.
					LowerCaseCharacters	Replace the first
					NumericCharacters))	sentence of 18.1.6.5.3
						with:
						This specifies the sets
						of characters that
						shall be used in
						creating the

<sup>1</sup> NB = National body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the Secretariat editing unit are identified by \*\*)

0	1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
#	NB 1	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note #	Com- ment type <sup>2</sup>	Comment (justification for change) by the NB	Proposed change by the NB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted
							password. The password shall contain at list one character from each UTF8String.
							pwdAlphabet ATTRIBUTE ::= { WITH SYNTAX SEQUENCE OF UTF8String SINGLE VALUE TRUE USAGE directoryOperation ID id-oa- pwdAlphabet }
16	FR	Part 8 Annex A.1		Ed	The character after passwordHistoryMatch should be { not ( pwdHistoryMatch MATCHING-RULE ::= passwordHistoryMatch(userPwd, id-mr-pwdHistoryMatch)	Replace the definition with: pwdHistoryMatch MATCHING-RULE ::= passwordHistoryMatch{userPwd, id-mr-pwdHistoryMatch}	
17	FR	Part 8 Annex L		Ed	The algorithms are hashing algorithms not encryption algorithms	Replace the title of Annex L with: Examples of password hashing algorithms  Replace clause L.1 with: L.1 Null hashing method The null algorithm defined in Annex F is used when no hashing is to take place.	accepted

<sup>1</sup> NB = National body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the Secretariat editing unit are identified by \*\*)

Comments on ISO/IEC 9594 All parts PDAM2	Date: 2010-04-14	Document: JTC 1/SC6 N 14092
--	------------------	-----------------------------

0	1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
#	NB 1	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note #	Com- ment type <sup>2</sup>	Comment (justification for change) by the NB	Proposed change by the NB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted
						Replace the first paragraph of clause L.2 with:  The hashed password is an octet string of 16 octets which is the MD5 digest of the concatenation of the clear password and the salt which is a bit string, parameter of the algorithm. This hashing method is defined by the following object:  Replace the first paragraph of clause L.3 with:  The hashed password is an octet string of 20 octets with is the SHA-1 digest of the concatenation of the clear password and the salt which is a bit string, parameter of the algorithm. This hashing method is defined by the following object:	
18	FR	Part 8 Annex L			It is not specified if this annex is normative or informative. Since this annex defines new object identifiers, it should be normative	Add after the title: (This annex forms an integral part of this Recommendation   International Standard)	accepted
19	FR	Part 8 Clause 18.1.5 Annex A.1 Part 9 Clause 9.2.2		Те	The <b>pwdFailureDuration</b> attribute defined in 18.1.6.8 holds the number of seconds that the password cannot be used to authenticate after the first failed bind or compare attempt. It seems that time of last failure should stored in some operational attribute.	Add a new operational attribute pwdFailureTime to record the time of last failure:  18.1.5.6 Password Failure Time attribute The pwdFailureTime operational attribute specifies the time of the last failed or compare attempt on the password attribute. This attribute is only significant if the pwdFails operational attribute contains a non	accepted

<sup>1</sup> NB = National body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the Secretariat editing unit are identified by \*\*)

Comments on 130/12C 3334 Am parts FDAM2   Date, 2010-04-14   Document, 31C 1/3CON 14032	Comments on ISO/IEC 9594 All parts PDAM2	Date: 2010-04-14	Document: JTC 1/SC6 N 14092
---	--	------------------	-----------------------------

0	1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
#	NB 1	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note #	Com- ment type <sup>2</sup>	Comment (justification for change) by the NB	Proposed change by the NB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted

					zero value pwdFailureTime ATTRIBUTE ::= { WITH SYNTAX GeneralizedTime EQUALITY MATCHING RULE generalizedTimeMatch ORDERING MATCHING RULE generalizedTimeOrderingMatch SINGLE VALUE TRUE USAGE dSAOperation ID id-oa-pwdFailureTime }  Renumber 18.1.5.6 and 18.1.5.7 as 18.1.5.7 and 18.1.5.8.  Add this new attribute and the following object identifier to Annex A.1 id-oa-pwdFailureTime OBJECT IDENTIFIER ::= {id-oa-26} Renumber the following object identifiers.  In Part 9, 9.2.2, add pwdFailureTime after pwdFails (see FR 19)	
20	FR	Part 8: Annex B	Те	The object identifier id-mr-encPwdHistoryMatch is not used but the id-mr-pwdHistoryMatch is not defined	Replace: id-mr-encPwdHistoryMatch	accepted
21	FR	Part 8: Clause 18.1.5.6	Ed	graces attribute should be <b>pwdGraces</b> attribute	Replace graces with pwdGraces.	accepted
22	FR	Part 9: Clause 9.2.2	Ed	The attributes pwdBindFails and pwdCompareFails do not exists.	Replace pwdBindFails and pwdCompareFails with pwdFails	accepted
23	SCC		Ed	Please remove the chinese characters from		accepted

<sup>1</sup> NB = National body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the Secretariat editing unit are identified by \*\*)

page 11 of 14

0	1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
#	NB 1	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note #	Com- ment type <sup>2</sup>	Comment (justification for change) by the NB	Proposed change by the NB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted

				th	he Table of Contents.	
24		Part 2: 28.6.1	te		All DSA-DSA binds should be identical.	Change:  dSAOperationalBindingManageme ntBind OPERATION ::= directoryBind  to: dSAOperationalBindingManageme ntBind OPERATION ::= dsaBind
25	ITU-T SG17	Part 2: 7.4.1	te	e A	All DSA-DSA binds should be identical.	Change:  dSAShadowBind OPERATION ::= directoryBind  to: dSAShadowBind OPERATION ::= dsaBind
26	ITU-T SG17	Part 4: 11.1	te		Password Policy has no relevance for DSA- DSA bindings.	

<sup>1</sup> NB = National body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the Secretariat editing unit are identified by \*\*)

Comments on ISO/IEC 9594 All parts PDAM2	Date: 2010-04-14	Document: JTC 1/SC6 N 14092

0	1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
#	NB 1	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note #	Com- ment type <sup>2</sup>	Comment (justification for change) by the NB	Proposed change by the NB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted

27	ITU-T	All parts	ge	It should be further analyzed what are the	DsaCredentials ::= CHOICE {   simple [0] DsaSimpleCredentials,   strong [1] StrongCredentials,   externalProcedure [2]  EXTERNAL,   spkm [3] SpkmCredentials,   sasl [4] SaslCredentials,   }  DsaSimpleCredentials ::=   SEQUENCE {   name [0] DistinguishedName,   validity [1] SET {   time1 [0] CHOICE {     utc UTCTime,     gt GeneralizedTime}  OPTIONAL,   time2 [1] CHOICE {     utc UTCTime,     gt GeneralizedTime}  OPTIONAL,   random1 [2] BIT STRING  OPTIONAL,   random2 [3] BIT STRING  OPTIONAL,   password [2] CHOICE {     unprotected OCTET STRING,     protected HASH{OCTET}  STRING}} OPTIONAL,   }  DsaBindResult ::=   DsaBindArgument	To be solved during the
- '	SG17	7 iii parto	ge	procedures when binding to DSA not		next meeting

<sup>1</sup> NB = National body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the Secretariat editing unit are identified by \*\*)

Comments on ISO/IEC 9594 All parts PDAM2					OAM2	Date: 2010-04-14 Document: <b>JTC 1/SC6 N 14092</b>		
0	1	2	(3)	4	5		(6)	(7)
#	NB 1	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note #	Com- ment type <sup>2</sup>	Comment (justification for change) by	the NB	Proposed change by the NB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted
					holding the password.			Two options:  - The DUA sends information received from the first DSA to the second one - The first DSA
								sends Bind request information to the second DSA