

**ISO/IEC JTC 1
Information Technology**

Document Type: National Body Contribution

Document Title: National Body of France Comments on JTC 1 N 9480, DIN Contribution on Normative Referencing

Document Source: National Body of France

Reference: This is document is circulated to National Bodies for review and consideration. It will be discussed at the February 2009 JTC 1 SWG-D meeting in Delft, Netherlands under agend item 9.

Action ID: ACT

Due Date:

No. of Pages: 9

Draft -

French National Body contribution to JTC 1 SWG-Directives -

Comments on JTC 1 N 9480, DIN contribution on Normative Referencing.

The French National Body supports this contribution, aiming at unifying this JTC 1 process for all sources of International Standards, and proposes two amendments to it:

1) For Fast-Track (and PAS Fast-Track) Submitters to be able to use this process, they need the capacity to propose to JTC 1 that an organisation be accepted as ARO.

2) The language may be streamlined, as proposed below.

Annex N The Normative Referencing of Specifications other than
International Standards in JTC 1 International Standards - Guidelines for
JTC 1 SCs

N1 Purpose and scope of this Guide ISO/IEC JTC 1 has defined and implemented a policy that encourages and assists the transposition of certain technical specifications from sources outside JTC 1 into international standards. Annex M "The Transposition of Publicly Available Specifications (PAS) into International Standards -A Management Guide" describes in detail this transposition process.

JTC 1 also recognises that there may be situations where it is appropriate to reference a specification without performing the transposition process as described in Annex M. This situation may apply in a number of cases. ~~JTC 1 assumes that the procedures and conditions for referencing depend on the process and the kind of international standard (IS) in which the reference will be established.~~

~~One of the cases is described in this document, namely where an International Standard (IS) is developed by a JTC 1 Subcommittee, using the five stage process. Other cases will be considered later.~~

FNB proposal: Reword, do not remove paragraph above - as follows: This document covers the case when an International Standard (IS) is developed by a JTC 1 Subcommittee, using the five stage process as well as when International Standards are proposed for adoption via the JTC 1 Fast-Track or JTC 1 PAS Process. It therefore describes the process requirements for all these cases, to be fulfilled by the JTC 1 SCs, the Fast-Track and /or PAS Fast-Track submitter (called hereafter the Submitter). Should requirements differ between SCs and Fast-Track or PAS Fast-Track submitters, this will be indicated. JTC 1 re-emphasises its preference for transposition into international standards as the approach to include material from outside JTC 1. However, if the referencing

approach is chosen, it is necessary to establish such references in international standards in a consistent way which ensures the quality of international standards established by JTC 1 as well as the proper treatment of IPR issues. Therefore, a process has to be defined by JTC 1 for the establishment of references to documents other than from ISO, IEC or ITU.

~~As no restrictions apply to making informative references (see ISO/IEC Directives Part 2), the scope of this document is limited to the normative referencing of a specification other than from ISO, IEC or ITU in an international standard.~~

JTC 1 SCs may, in the course of their work, find it appropriate to incorporate specifications into an emerging IS by way of reference. The need for such action, the selection of the appropriate specification, and the evaluation of the proposed Referenced Specification (RS) itself are matters for the SC to determine. Any such SC decision will, however, be subject to JTC 1 National Body evaluation during the respective ballot.

JTC 1 SCs are reminded that, in accordance to Resolution 28 of the 11th JTC 1 Plenary Meeting in Seoul, Korea in 1999, "SCs and National Bodies are requested to pay particular attention to mechanisms that could be utilized to reduce the burden of the process on officers at the SC level. Examples can include reuse by on SC of prior written statements developed by another SC, or the use of appropriate statements from approved co-operative agreements between JTC 1 and another organization." ~~As no restrictions apply to making informative references (see ISO/IEC Directives Part 2), the scope of this document is limited to the normative referencing of a specification other than from ISO, IEC or ITU in an international standard.~~

These Guidelines provide insights to facilitate the SC consideration and subsequent incorporation of an RS into a JTC 1 IS. Since the consideration of a proposed RS may well involve more than purely technical considerations, it is deemed helpful to provide these Guidelines. The SC is asked to use this document to facilitate the process. As to IPR issues or organisational matters, it is expected that the SC will contact the appropriate bodies (e.g.

ITTF) to obtain the necessary information and that the SC will, if necessary, facilitate discussion between ISO/IEC and the RS Originator.

~~*FNB proposal: remove following paragraph (in light of modified paragraph above):* International Standards that are to be adopted via the JTC 1 Fast Track or JTC 1 PAS process need to fulfill the same criteria as International Standards being developed by SCs via the 5-stage process. Therefore the FT and/or PAS submitter needs to ensure that normative references in their specifications are compliant to these rules when submitting their specifications for the DIS/FDIS ballot. Wherever appropriate this document will describe specific process requirements for such submissions.~~

N2 JTC 1 approach to referencing other specifications According to ISO/IEC Directives, Part 2, referencing sources other than ISO, IEC, or ITU is a

valid approach for making use of such specifications, provided JTC 1 deems it appropriate.

While JTC 1 supports this approach, it has to maintain the quality of its work and the integrity of the standards development process. Therefore, it is necessary to establish some referencing rules that complement those of ISO/IEC. Though rules and guidelines are important, JTC 1 wishes them to be as straightforward as possible. This also takes account of the fact that the initiative for establishing references usually comes from the standards developing community within JTC 1. Further, minimal additional burden should be put on the originator of a specification being referenced.

N3 Terms for normative references to other specifications The process of establishing normative references to documents other than from ISO, IEC or ITU is based on the ISO/IEC Directives and the JTC 1 Directives with the addition of the following terms:

- the Submitter The JTC 1 SC, Fast-Track or PAS Submitter developing the standard including such normative references.
- Referenced Specification (RS) A specification from a source other than ISO, IEC, or ITU is called a Referenced Specification (RS) if it meets certain criteria (see N6) and has been balloted and accepted together with the FDIS at the JTC 1 National Body level as suitable for normative referencing in the resulting international standard (IS). An RS may be a part of a larger specification.
- RS Originator The originator of an RS or a proposed RS is called an RS Originator.

In N7 there is a procedure whereby an organization may be designated as an approved RS Originator for all of its standards in order to simplify RS processing by SCs, Fast-Track and PAS Submitters. Submitters.

• Approved RS Originator Organization (ARO) ***N4 Principles for referencing of specifications*** N4.1 An RS shall be within the JTC 1 scope.

N4.2 Concerning conformity and interoperability, all ISs regardless of their source containing normative references to other specifications have to follow the same requirements and rules as for other JTC 1 standards as defined in the JTC 1 Directives.

N4.3 When the referencing specification (CD, DIS or FDIS) is submitted for ballot it shall either be accompanied by a Referencing Explanatory Report (RER) which has been generated by the Submitter SC or the Fast-Track/PAS submitter wishing to incorporate the RS in a target IS or the Submitter SC or Fast-Track/PAS submitter will ensure that the organization creating the reference specification has previously met such organizational requirements so as to be listed as an Approved RS Originator Organization (ARO).

N4.4 The RER shall contain the following elements: N4.4.1 a justification for the referencing which shall also address the following aspects: • relationship of the

proposed RS to existing or emerging international standards (and regional or other standards as appropriate) and when the RS is competing with or complementing an existing or emerging international standard, the rationale for the referencing;

- the degree of market acceptance of the proposed RS; and
- the rationale as to why the transposition of the proposed RS into an IS is inappropriate or impractical, N4.4.2 statements that address the criteria as detailed in N6.

N4.4.3 a copy of the normative referencing policy of the RS Originator (where one exists).

N4.5 The material submitted for ballot shall either include a copy of the proposed RS or a means by which National Bodies may readily access the material (e.g., ISBN or URL) and meet the availability requirements of N6.3.1.3. If the referenced material has been made available to JTC 1 member bodies previously as an N numbered document, it is acceptable, instead, to refer to this document.

N4.6 For actual referencing, the rules of the ISO/IEC Directives apply. In particular, any reference shall be specific and indicate the publication date and/or version number as appropriate.

N4.7 If an RS, in turn, contains a normative reference to a specification other than an international standard or ARO standard, the information required by an RER shall normally be provided for each additional reference. The exception to this requirement is when the level of detail involved would be so time-consuming to assemble, and difficult to interpret, that its collection would be counterproductive. In this case, the **Submitter SC or the Fast-Track/PAS submitter** shall explain the situation in a way that will enable National Bodies to make an informed assessment of the references that are being made. The responsible **Submitter SC or the Fast-Track/PAS submitter** is expected to thoroughly process all nested references.

N5 Description of the process for JTC 1 Subcommittee use N5.1

Announcement of intent to make reference The intention to make a normative reference to a specification other than an international standard should be stated in the New Work Item Proposal (NP) if the requirement is known at that time; otherwise, the intent should be communicated to JTC 1 National Bodies as soon as consensus on the need is reached in the SC. **Fast-Track or PAS submitters need to explain-state this situation in their Explanatory Report accompanying their submission.**

N5.2 Preparation of the Referencing Explanatory Report It is the obligation of the ~~JTC 1 Subcommittee~~ **Submitter** which develops **an a proposed** IS containing normative references to specifications other than international standards, to either provide for each proposed RS a related RER or to ensure that the organization creating the reference specification has previously met such organizational requirements so as to be listed as an Approved Reference

Organization. The elements of this Report are described in clause 4.4 above. In order to avoid any undue delay in the standard ratification process and to avoid the wasting of development resources, the production of a RER or the confirmation of the organization as an Approved RS Originator Organization should commence as soon as the standard developing Subcommittee has determined the need to establish a normative reference.

N5.3 Availability of the Referencing Explanatory Report The RER, or confirmation of the organization as an ARO, shall be made available to JTC 1 and its National Bodies as early as possible and appropriate. The latest date for the availability of the Report or ARO status is the submission of the first CD **respectively the DIS ballot for Fast-Track/PAS submissions**. The RER/ARO confirmation shall also accompany any subsequent CD, **DIS** and FDIS ballot.

N5.4 Ballot The material submitted for ballot (CD, **DIS** and FDIS) shall include the RER/ARO confirmation together with a copy of the proposed RS. If the Report or the proposed RS have already been provided earlier, it is acceptable to give, instead, a reference to the earlier submission and a statement verifying that no changes have occurred in the meantime.

In the case of a CD ballot, JTC 1 National Bodies are invited to independently submit their comments on the RER/ARO confirmation by the time the CD ballot closes, for review by the relevant SC.

Comments and votes are handled in the usual way. The RS Originator may be invited to attend the appropriate part of any resolution meeting held.

N5.5 Publication of the standard No particular provisions regarding publication apply where an IS contains a reference to an RS. The source of the RS may be different from that of an IS, and it is not required that the text of the RS should be published, or distributed, with the referencing standard.

N5.6 Maintenance It is expected that JTC 1 will evaluate the consequences of any change to the RS subsequent to its inclusion as a reference in a JTC 1 standard, for appropriate action (e.g. revision, exclusion). At every maintenance interval the RER and all RSs shall be evaluated for their continued availability and relevance. If required (see N3), new RERs may be generated for RSs not presently covered by an RER or sourced from an ARO.

N5.7 Documentation requirements Further to the requirements in the ISO/IEC Directives, Part 2, all RSs to which a normative reference is made, should be identified in a subclause of clause 2 of the IS. This subclause should start with the following text: All references in this subclause were correct at the time of approval of this International Standard. The provisions of the referenced specifications, as identified in this subclause, are valid within the context of this IS. The reference to a specification within this IS does not give it any further status within ISO/IEC; in particular, it does not give the referenced specification the status of an International Standard.

N6 Evaluation of a proposed RS N6.1 Introduction JTC 1 has established criteria which serve as a basis for the judgment as to whether a particular

specification can be accepted as a normative reference in an international standard.

This judgment initially occurs at JTC 1 Subcommittee level when a decision to establish a normative reference is made, and later at NB level during the CD or FDIS ballot. ~~Similarly for specifications coming from a Fast-Track or PAS submitter the originator needs to evaluate normative references in its specification following the same criteria, NB's will evaluate this at the DIS and FDIS level.~~

Similarly for specifications submitted via Fast-Track or PAS Fast-Track the judgement will occur at NB level during the DIS or FDIS ballot. The Fast-Track or PAS Submitter should thus be aware of and exercise these criteria when incorporating normative references in its submission.

JTC 1 considers that the primary benefit of these criteria is guidance for consistent evaluation rather than an absolute pass/fail mechanism. There is a wide variety of specifications available for consideration as well as a wide variety of needs within the JTC 1 community. An absolute pass/fail mechanism over such a wide variety of material is unlikely. What is needed throughout this process is flexibility and good judgment on the part of all concerned. Rather than provide quantitative measures to evaluate acceptability of a proposed RS on a pass/ fail basis, the criteria set forth the key topics for consideration and measures for evaluating them in terms of the scope, depth, and thoroughness with which the criteria topics have been considered.

N6.2 Supplementary elements It is intended that the questions asked under each Criteria Category are to be viewed as examples of ways in which the basic criteria sub-category might be evaluated. There may well be other responses to unasked questions that best describe how well a given proposed RS meets, for example, an acceptable level of "Quality". In general, the more complete the RER and its accompanying documents, the easier it will be for JTC 1 National Bodies to evaluate an international standard making a normative reference to an RS.

N6.3 Criteria N6.3.1 Co-operative stance The Submitter ~~SC respectively the Fast-Track/PAS submitter~~ shall notify the RS Originator of the intent to reference the RS and provide the RS Originator with a copy of the RER. The Submitter ~~SC respectively the Fast-Track/PAS submitter~~ is encouraged to, where possible, work with the RS Originator to ensure the accuracy of all elements of the RER. The RS Originator shall be provided the opportunity, within a reasonable period of time, to object to the reference to the RS. If the RS Originator notifies the Submitter ~~SC respectively the Fast-Track/PAS submitter~~ that it objects to such a reference the Submitter ~~SC respectively the Fast-Track/PAS submitter~~ must not include the reference to the RS.

The RER There shall be contain comprehensive statements covering the following categories and topics: N6.3.1.1 Ongoing maintenance: If the RS

Originator is not available to maintain the RS, who is responsible for maintenance of the RS if and when the need arises? N6.3.1.2 Changes What is the flexibility of the RS Originator to apply changes to the RS if so requested during the process of balloting the referencing standard? N6.3.1.3 Availability of the referenced specification What is the status of public availability of the RS on fair, reasonable and nondiscriminatory terms and conditions? Standards that are Publicly Available to implementers, evaluators and other interested parties for as long as the IS that references them is an active document are those which: • May be obtained from the source organization by any person (with or without payment) simply by quoting the reference number given in the IS to the source organization or typical supplier.

- Are available in one of the official ISO or IEC languages from a publicly accessible source.
- Are available without contractual limitations relating to its evaluation (other than limitations reasonably intended to restrict duplication and redistribution) and without substantive contractual limits on implementation of the referenced material or the IS as a condition of obtaining access to the referenced material.

N6.3.2 Intellectual property rights It is the **Submitter SC's** responsibility ~~of the SC or the Fast-Track/PAS submitter~~ to ensure that statements in response to N6.3.2.1 - N6.3.2.3 are provided in the RER. The **Submitter SC** ~~or the Fast-Track/PAS submitter~~ is encouraged to work with the RS Originator to ensure the accuracy of the statements on the items listed below.

N6.3.2.1 Patents: What is the status of the RS Originator, or where appropriate, the policy governing the RS meeting the ISO/IEC policy on patent matters?

N6.3.2.2 Copyrights: What copyrights exist, and what copyrights is the RS Originator willing to grant, throughout both the evaluation and the publication cycle?

N6.3.2.3 Trademark rights: What trademarks apply to the RS and with what conditions?

N6.3.3 Quality The **Submitter SC** ~~or the Fast-Track/PAS submitter~~ shall establish that the proposed RS is of adequate quality, considering topics such as the length of the time the specification has existed, whether products have been implemented using it, whether conformance requirements are clear, and whether the specification is readily and widely available.

N7 An Approved RS Originator Organization (ARO) N7.1

Confirmation as an Approved RS Originator Organization (ARO) On the occasion that a particular RS Originator has already been referenced by a prior ISO/IEC JTC 1 IS (or TR) and documented in an RER, or in preparation for future referencing in an IS (or TR), the SC or any National Body may nominate the RS Originator to be confirmed as an ARO. In the absence of an objection from the candidate ARO, an ARO Overview Submission, describing the RS Originator's cooperative stance: the ongoing maintenance agreement, the application of changes, the availability of the referenced specifications, the position of the RS Originator on intellectual property, patent rights, copyrights, and trademark rights, and the overall qualification of all of its deliverables to meet the criteria specified herein for RSs, shall be issued for a 3 month ballot by JTC 1 for approval of that

organization as an ARO. Upon ballot approval, the RS Originator shall be added to a list of AROs in good standing. Such a list of Approved RS Originator Organizations will be maintained by the JTC 1 Secretariat and published on the JTC 1 website.

A Submitter ~~SC or Fast-Track/PAS submitter~~ may reference an ARO as a previously submitted and Approved RS Originator Organization.

N7.2 Change of status for an Approved RS Originator Organization An SC, or National Body or an Fast-Track/PAS submitter shall notify JTC 1 if it becomes aware that the content of an ARO's Overview Submission is no longer accurate. Furthermore, prior to referencing an ARO in an FDIS or amended IS, the Submitter ~~SC or Fast-Track/PAS submitter~~ must confirm that all content as contained in the documented Overview Submission is accurate and current.

Should an ARO's procedures vary in a non-essential manner from the RS ARO Overview on file, the submitting SC or sponsoring NB, in cooperation with the ARO, shall provide an updated ARO Overview, no later than submission of the FDIS/FDAM ballot to JTC 1. The JTC 1 Secretariat is to notify all other affected Submitters ~~SC and Fast-Track/PAS submitter~~ of a change in the ARO's RER for their consideration. On the occasion that an ARO's policies change in a substantial manner (e.g., such that they are no longer aligned with ISO/IEC Directives and Policies), the submitting SC or NB shall request reconfirmation with JTC 1 of the organization's status as an ARO. Should reconfirmation fail, the ARO will be removed from the JTC 1 ARO listing and the affected Submitters ~~SCs and Fast-Track/PAS submitter~~ shall be notified to take necessary action to address all pending referenced specifications from that ARO and the ARO will be removed from the JTC 1 approved listing.