Telecommunications and Information Exchange Between Systems

ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 6

Document Number:	N13957
Date:	2009-05-19
Replaces:	
Document Type:	Summary of Voting/Table of Replies
Document Title:	Summary of Voting on ISO/IEC FDIS 9594-5, "Information technology -- Open Systems Interconnection -- The Directory: Protocol specifications -- Part 5:"
Document Source:	ISO/ITTF
Project Number:	
Document Status:	For your information.
Action ID:	FYI
Due Date:	
No. of Pages:	6
ISO/IEC JTC1/SC6 Secretariat Ms. Jooran Lee, KSA (on behalf of KATS) Korea Technology Center #701-7 Yeoksam-dong, Gangnam-gu, Seoul, 135-513, Republic of Korea ; Telephone: +82 2 6009 4808 ; Facsimile: +82 2 6009 4819 ; Email : jooran@kisi.or.kr	

Ballot Information

Reference	ISO/IEC FDIS 9594-5 (Ed 6)	**Committee**	ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 6
Edition number	6		
English title	Information technology -- Open Systems Interconnection -- The Directory: Protocol specifications -- Part 5:		
French title	Technologies de l'information -- Interconnexion de systèmes ouverts (OSI) -- L'annuaire: Spécifications du protocole -- Partie 5:		
Start date	2009-03-05	**End date**	2009-05-05
Opened by ISO/CS on	2009-03-05 10:08:27	**Closed by ISO/CS on**	2009-05-07 00:04:44
Status	Closed		
Voting stage	Approval	**Version number**	1
Note			

Result of voting

P-Members voting: 21 in favour out of 21 = 100 % (requirement >= 66.66%)

(P-Members having abstained are not counted in this vote.)

Member bodies voting: 0 negative votes out of 22 = 0 % (requirement <= 25%)

Approved

Votes by members					
Country	Member	Status	Approval	Disapproval	Abstention
Algeria	IANOR	P-Member			X
Australia	SA	P-Member			X
Azerbaijan	AZSTAND	P-Member			
Belgium	NBN	P-Member			X
Canada	SCC	P-Member	X		
China	SAC	P-Member	X		
Côte-d'Ivoire	CODINORM	P-Member			X
Czech Republic	UNMZ	P-Member	X		
Denmark	DS	P-Member			X
Ecuador	INEN	P-Member			
Finland	SFS	P-Member			X
France	AFNOR	P-Member	X *		
Germany	DIN	P-Member			X
India	BIS	P-Member	X		
Iran, Islamic Republic of	ISIRI	P-Member			X
Ireland	NSAI	P-Member	X		
Italy	UNI	P-Member	X		
Jamaica	BSJ	P-Member	X		
Japan	JISC	P-Member	X		
Kazakhstan	KAZMEMST	P-Member	X		
Kenya	KEBS	P-Member	X		
Korea, Republic of	KATS	P-Member	X		
Luxembourg	ILNAS	P-Member	X		
Malaysia	DSM	P-Member			X
Malta	MSA	P-Member			X
Netherlands	NEN	P-Member	X		
New Zealand	SNZ	P-Member	X		
Nigeria	SON	P-Member	X		
Norway	SN	P-Member			X
Pakistan	PSQCA	P-Member	X		
Philippines	BPS	P-Member			X
Russian Federation	GOST R	O-Member	X		
Singapore	SPRING SG	P-Member			X
Slovenia	SIST	P-Member	X		
South Africa	SABS	P-Member			X
Spain	AENOR	P-Member			X

Sweden	**SIS**	**P-Member**			X
Switzerland	**SNV**	**P-Member**	X		
United Arab Emirates	**ESMA**	**P-Member**			
United Kingdom	**BSI**	**P-Member**	X		
Uruguay	**UNIT**	**P-Member**			X
USA	**ANSI**	**Secretariat**	X		
Venezuela	**FONDONORMA**	**P-Member**			
P-Member TOTALS Total of P-Members voting: 21			21	0	17
TOTALS			22	0	17
(*) A comment file was submitted with this vote					

Comments from Voters			
France	**AFNOR**	**P-Member**	France(AFNOR).doc

Date: 2009-04-28	Document: **ISO/IEC FDIS 9594-5**

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB[1]	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of com-ment[2]	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted
FR1	2.1.3		ed	The RFC 2251 referenced in 2.1.3 is obsolete and should be replaced by RFC 4511.	*Replace the reference to RFC 2251 with:* - IETF RFC 4511 (2006), *Lightweight Directory Access Protocol (LDAP): Technical Specification Road Map*	

FR2	9.1		ed	The definition of **IdmBindError**
				
				IdmBindError {IDM-PROTOCOL:Protocols} ::= SEQUENCE {
				  protocolID IDM-PROTOCOL.&id {Protocols}),
				  errcode IDM-PROTOCOL.&bind-operation.
				    &Errors.&errorCode
				    ({Protocols} {@protocolID}),
				  respondingAETitle [0] GeneralName
				    OPTIONAL,
				  aETitleError ENUMERATED {
				    callingAETitleNotAccepted (0),
				    calledAETitleNotRecognized (1) } OPTIONAL,
				  error [1] IDM-PROTOCOL.&bind-operation.
				    &Errors.&ParameterType
				    ({Protocols} {@protocolID, @errcode}) }
				
				supposes that an error code exists for that operation but in ISO/IEC 9594-3 clause 8.1.1, **directoryBindError** has no error code.
					*Update **IdmBindError** definition as follows::*
					IdmBindError
					  {IDM-PROTOCOL:Protocols}
					  ::= SEQUENCE {
					  protocolID
					    IDM-PROTOCOL.&id ({Protocols}),
					  -- errcode IDM-PROTOCOL.
					    &bind-peration.&Errors.&errorCode
					      OPTIONAL ({Protocols}{@protocolID}),
					  respondingAETitle [0] GeneralName
					    OPTIONAL,
					  aETitleError ENUMERATED {
					    callingAETitleNotAccepted (0),
					    calledAETitleNotRecognized (1) }
					      OPTIONAL,
					  error [1] IDM-PROTOCOL.
					    &bind-operation.
					    &Errors.&ParameterType
					      ({Protocols} {@protocolID, @errcode}) }
					
					Update the 3rd paragraph of the subclause 9.1 as follows:
					An **IdmBindError** PDU is returned in response to an unsuccessful bind request. **protocolID** is the same value sent in the corresponding **bind** PDU errcode is the code for one of the errors listed against the ERRORS field of the BIND-OPERATION of the identified protocol. **error** is a value for the **PARAMETER** field of the **ERROR** identified by errcode. **respondingAETitle** is the name of the remote application entity which sent the **IdmBindError**. **aETitleError** is set to **callingAETitleNotAccepted** if a **IdmBind** PDU is	

1 **MB** = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by ******)

2 **Type of comment:**   **ge** = general   **te** = technical   **ed** = editorial

NOTE   Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

ISO electronic balloting commenting template/version 2001-10

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB[1]	**Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex** (e.g. 3.1)	**Paragraph/ Figure/Table/ Note** (e.g. Table 1)	**Type of comment[2]**	**Comment (justification for change) by the MB**	**Proposed change by the MB**	**Secretariat observations** on each comment submitted
					received and the supplied **callingAETitle** is not acceptable to the called system. **aETitleError** is set to **calledAETitleNotRecognized** if an **IdmBind** PDU is received and the remote application entity knows the application entity which is binding, but does not accept the **calledAETitle** sent in the **IdmBind** PDU as its own name.	
FR3	12.1.2		ed	NOTE 2 is badly formatted	*Modify NOTE 2 with the style for NOTE.*	
FR4	13.2.2		ed	The term "root context" is not defined and the reference to ITU-T Rec. X.518	ISO/IEC 9594-4 should be replaced with a reference to ITU-T Rec. X.501	ISO/IEC 9594-2.	*Update 13.2.2 d) as follows:* d) if conformance is claimed as a first-level DSA, conform to the requirements support of the root naming context, as defined in ITU-T Rec. X.501	ISO/IEC 9594-2;	

1   **MB** = Member body (enter the ISO 3166 two-letter country code, e.g. CN for China; comments from the ISO/CS editing unit are identified by ******)

2   **Type of comment:**   **ge** = general   **te** = technical   **ed** = editorial

NOTE   Columns 1, 2, 4, 5 are compulsory.

page 2 of 2

ISO electronic balloting commenting template/version 2001-10