

**ISO/IEC JTC 1
Information Technology**

Document Type: Summary of Voting/Table of Replies

Document Title: Summary of Voting on JTC 1 N 9872, Letter Ballot on JTC 1 Standing Document on Operations

Document Source: JTC 1 Secretary

Reference: As per the results of this ballot, the document has passed. The comments received will be discussed at the 8-12 February JTC 1 SWG-Directives meeting in Bellevue, Washington.

Action ID: ACT

Due Date:

No. of Pages: 10

Result of voting

Ballot Information:

Ballot reference:	JTC001-N-9872
Ballot type:	CIB
Ballot title:	Letter Ballot on the JTC 1 Standing Document on Operations
Opening date:	2009-11-03
Closing date:	2010-02-02
Note:	This document is circulated to JTC 1 National Bodies for a three-month approval ballot. JTC 1 National Bodies are instructed to submit their vote via the online balloting system by the due date indicated.

Member responses:

Votes cast (31)	Armenia (SARM) Australia (SA) Belgium (NBN) Canada (SCC) China (SAC) Côte d'Ivoire (CODINORM) Czech Republic (UNMZ) Denmark (DS) Finland (SFS) France (AFNOR) Germany (DIN) India (BIS) Ireland (NSAI) Italy (UNI) Jamaica (BSJ) Japan (JISC) Korea, Republic of (KATS) Lebanon (LIBNOR) Luxembourg (ILNAS) Malta (MSA) Netherlands (NEN) New Zealand (SNZ) Norway (SN) Russian Federation (GOST R) Singapore (SPRING SG) South Africa (SABS)
------------------------	--

	Spain (AENOR) Sweden (SIS) Switzerland (SNV) United Kingdom (BSI) USA (ANSI)
Comments submitted (2)	Nigeria (SON) Portugal (IPQ)
Votes not cast (5)	Ghana (GSB) Kenya (KEBS) Malaysia (DSM) Pakistan (PSQCA) United Arab Emirates (ESMA)

Questions:

Q.1	"Does your National Body approve this text?"
------------	--

Answers to Q.1: "Does your National Body approve this text?"

16x	Yes	Armenia (SARM) Belgium (NBN) China (SAC) Czech Republic (UNMZ) India (BIS) Ireland (NSAI) Italy (UNI) Jamaica (BSJ) Korea, Republic of (KATS) Luxembourg (ILNAS) New Zealand (SNZ) Norway (SN) Russian Federation (GOST R) Singapore (SPRING SG) Spain (AENOR) South Africa (SABS)
6 x	Yes with Comment	France (AFNOR) Germany (DIN) Japan (JISC) Netherlands (NEN) United Kingdom (BSI) USA (ANSI)
2 x	No	Australia (SA) Canada (SCC)
7 x	Abstain	Côte d'Ivoire (CODINORM) Denmark (DS) Finland (SFS) Lebanon (LIBNOR) Malta (MSA) Sweden (SIS)

Switzerland (SNV)

Comments from Voters		
Member:	Comment:	Date:
Australia (SA)	<i>Comment File</i>	2010-02-02 05:54:26
CommentFiles/JTC001-N-9872_SA.rtf		
Canada (SCC)	<i>Comment File</i>	2010-01-19 20:13:42
CommentFiles/JTC001-N-9872_SCC.doc		
France (AFNOR)	<i>Comment File</i>	2010-02-02 13:41:57
CommentFiles/JTC001-N-9872_AFNOR.doc		
Germany (DIN)	<i>Comment File</i>	2010-01-28 15:25:47
CommentFiles/JTC001-N-9872_DIN.rtf		
Japan (JISC)	<i>Comment File</i>	2010-01-26 03:27:48
CommentFiles/JTC001-N-9872_JISC.doc		
Netherlands (NEN)	<i>Comment File</i>	2010-02-01 11:59:48
CommentFiles/JTC001-N-9872_NEN.doc		
United Kingdom (BSI)	<i>Comment File</i>	2010-02-02 12:02:41
CommentFiles/JTC001-N-9872_BSI.doc		
USA (ANSI)	<i>Comment File</i>	2010-02-01 16:52:20
CommentFiles/JTC001-N-9872_ANSI.doc		

Comments from Commenters		
Member:	Comment:	Date:
Nigeria (SON)	<i>Comment</i>	2010-02-02 10:17:08
Yes, text okay		
Portugal (IPQ)	<i>Comment</i>	2010-02-02 13:41:04
Abstention		

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date:2010-02-04

Document: ISO_SD_9872

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB ¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/ Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comm ent ²	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted
AU-001			Ge	<p>Australia (AU) strongly supports JTC 1 basing its rules on the joint ISO/IEC Directives with rules and procedures specific to JTC 1 being addressed in the JTC 1 Supplement, without further reference to external, unreferenced Standing Documents. The structure, form and content of the entire series of documents needs further work to adhere to the following principles:</p> <p>(a) the whole series of documents needs to be revised to include more of the normative content of the JTC 1 rules appearing in the JTC 1 Supplement with less reliance on so-called "further information" and "guidance" in the many Standing Documents.</p> <p>(b) where concepts and words are established in the ISO/IEC Directives, they should have the same meaning (with potential constraint or amplification) when used in the JTC 1 Supplement and lower-level Standing Documents derived from the Supplement.</p> <p>Given the level of concern with the overall structural and terminological overlaps between the ISO/IEC Directives, the JTC1 Supplement and the proposed Standing Documents, Australia believes that significant change needs to be made before we can consider approving the Standing Documents as stand alone documents rather than our preferred option of integrated Annexes within the JTC1 Supplement.</p>	<p>Australia does NOT support publication of N9872.</p> <p>For further information see AU comments on JTC1 N9877.</p>	
AU-002			Ge	<p>This Standing Document is currently incompatible and inconsistent with current concepts and terminology in the ISO/IEC Directives and needs further work to correspond with the ISO/IEC Directives and the JTC1 Supplement with key normative provisions to be included in the JTC1 Supplement or its Annexes.</p>	<p>Include all normative elements of this document within an Annex to the JTC1 Supplement.</p>	
AU-003	Title		Te	<p>This is not a Standing Document relating to Operations. It is normative content that should correctly be included as an Annex titled JTC1 Standards Development Process.</p>	<p>Retitle as "JTC1 Standards Development Process"</p>	

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date:2010-02-04

Document: ISO_SD_9872

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB ¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/ Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comm ent ²	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted
NL			Ge			
CA		Line 20	Ed	Some of the clauses referred to also have JTC1 specific text in the supplement.	The sentence should read: "In addition to the ISO/IEC Directives Part 1 clause 2,1,6 Target Dates and the JTC1 Supplement, the...	
CA		Line 29	Te	For the enlarged timeframe, the times for FDIS registration is inconsistent.	We recommend: FDIS registration at 42 months, FDIS ballot initiate at 44 months and FDIS Ballot dispatch at 47.	
CA		Line 29	Te	There is no SD on Business Plans. SWG Planning has been tasked with the creation of such a SD, but this has not been done.	In the interim, say: "Part 1 shall be a Business Plan in accordance with the template on the JTC 1 web site." and add the URL for this template.	
JP 03	All tables	All tables	ed	Table numbers are missing.	Put table numbers in conjunction with the table titles. (Refer to ISO/IEC Directives, Part 2.)	
JP 01	All the Clause numbers	All the Clause numbers	ed	Clauses are wrongly numbered to such as "1."	Change Clause numbers such as "1." to "1" without point (.). (Refer to ISO/IEC Directives, Part 2.)	
[MB] 1 A	1	1	Ed	This Standing Document does not have proper identification, which will make it difficult to refer to it.	The following should be added to the document: Header page containing: ISO/IEC JTC 1 logo ISO/IEC Copyright Document number Document title	

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date:2010-02-04

Document: ISO_SD_9872

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB ¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/ Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comm ent ²	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted
					Document version (lineage) Every page should have a footer with document number and page number Every page should have a header with ISO/IEC Copyright Table of Contents A short foreword containing the purpose of the SD.	
FR	1	Line 20	te	Make reference to JTC1 Supplement in addition to ISO/IEC Directives Part 1, and add a reference to ISO Supplement, clause 2.1.6 and annexes SH, SI and SK	Replace "ISO/IEC Directives Part 1" with "ISO/IEC Directives Part 1 and JTC 1 Supplement" (<u>Note</u> : perform the same change where applicable in the document). Add a sentence stating: "JTC 1 target dates are in line with clause 2.1.6 and annexes SH, SI and SK of ISO Supplement."	
FR	1.1	Lines 30 and 31	te	Add a sentence indicating that target dates for Corrigenda are specified in the SD on Maintenance	Add the following sentence: "Target dates applying to Corrigenda are specified in the SD on Maintenance"	
FR	1.1	Lines 39 and 40	ed	Last sentence of this paragraph probably refers specifically to the collaboration agreement with ITU-T and should be clearer	Replace last sentence of the paragraph with: "Particular attention should be given to target dates which have been established in the context of a development in collaboration with ITU-T."	
FR	1.1	Line 44	ed	We could also mention that the deadline can be extended to up to 48 months.	Add at the end of the sentence "or to allow an extended timeframe".	
FR	1.2	Lines 48 and 49	ed	What does "special attention in the ISO/IEC directives" mean? Can we identify a specific reference to this "special attention" in ISO/IEC Directives?	Identify the relevant clause in ISO/IEC Directives or delete "in the ISO/IEC procedure".	
FR	2.3	Lines 91 and 92	ed	There is a reference to a SD on Business Plans. There is no such SD in current list.	Make reference to the place where the template is made available (JTC 1 web site?).	
FR	2.3	Line 97	ed	The statement "whether or not a WD" is too specific and limited, it is suggested to delete it.	Delete", whether or not a WD,"	

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date:2010-02-04

Document: ISO_SD_9872

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB ¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/ Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comm ent ²	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted
FR	4.3	Line 151 Line 152	ed	Add SCs in the list Reference to clause 2.4.6 is incorrect (dealing with language)	Add “SCs” after TCs. Replace “2.4.6” with “2.5.2”.	
FR	4.3	Line 155/156	ed	Clause 2.5.2 of ISO/IEC Directives Part 1 specifies that NBs will have 2, 3 or 4 months to comment. Would be useful to add a sentence in clause 2.5.2 of JTC 1 Supplement explaining that in JTC 1 the total ballot period can be extended to up to 6 months.	If a sentence is added in the clause 2.5.2 of JTC 1 Supplement, add a reference to the clause 2.5.2 of JTC 1 Supplement.	
FR	4.3	Lines 184 and 185	te	Enquiry and Approval stages are not administered by JTC 1 yet (as is mentioned in lines 184/185) JTC 1 still has some responsibility. It might be useful to supplement the document with a sentence explaining this situation and JTC 1 expected role.	Add after line 185 a sentence such as: "For the enquiry and approval stages administered by ITTF, JTC 1 and its SCs (or WGs when entrusted to do so) retain the responsibility to produce and submit the final texts to ITTF."	
FR	5	Lines 186 to 193	ed	Include DTS in addition to DTR	Replace everywhere DTR with DTS/DTR. In line 187, replace “clause” with “clauses 3.1.2 and”.	
FR	5	Lines 192 and 193	ed	There is no SD on voting	Make reference to annex JA of JTC 1 Supplement or delete the parenthesis.	
US	Lines 12-13		ED	Delete blank lines		
JP 02	Lines 20, 51, 106, 128, 152, 161 and 187	Lines 20, 51, 106, 128, 152, 161 and 187	ed	For example, “2.1.6” is not a Clause number. And “subclause” should not be stated.	Change “clause x.x.x” to just “x.x.x” and change “clause x.x” to just “x.x” respectively. (Refer to ISO/IEC Directives, Part 2.)	
UK1	Line 22 Line 24 Line 29		Ed	We do not believe the project timeframe terms : “Recommended”, “Accelerated” and “Enlarged” are correct ISO terminology.	Insert the correct terms “Default, Accelerated and Extended” both in line 22 and as headers to the following table	
UK2	Line 24 Line 27 Line 29		Ge	Combine the three tables for ease of use	Consolidate in to one table with three columns on the right, titled “ Project time” – one for each of the project timeframes	
US	Lines 71, 85		ED	Missing spaces	Insert space on each side of dash	

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date:2010-02-04

Document: ISO_SD_9872

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB ¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/ Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comm ent ²	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted
US	Lines 91-92		ED	There is no Standing Document on Business Plans	Change to read "...with the Business Plan template found in the Templates folder at http://www.itc1.org "	
US	Line 190		ED	Insert dash	"P-member"	
US	Lines 192-193		ED	Correct the reference	Should be "...see Votes on DTSS/DTRs, JTC 1 Supplement Annex JA.5.2"	