

ISO/IEC JTC 1 N 9195
ISO/IEC JTC 1
Information Technology

2008-07-18

Document Type: Summary of Voting/Table of Replies

Document Title: Summary of Voting on JTC 1 N 9028 – ISO/IEC DTR 24769, "Information technology, Automatic identification and data capture techniques – RTLS device conformance test methods -- Test methods for air interface communication at 2.4 GHz"

Document Source: JTC 1 Secretariat

Reference:

Document Status: As per the results of this ballot, the DTR has passed. SC 31 is instructed to review the comments received, prepare a disposition of comments, and if necessary, a revised text for submission to ITTF for publication.

Action ID: Information

Due Date:

No. of Pages: 12

Result of voting

Ballot Information:

Ballot reference:	JTC001-N-9028
Ballot type:	CIB
Ballot title:	ISO/IEC DTR 24769, "Information technology, automatic identification and data capture techniques -- RTLS device conformance test methods -- Test methods for air interface communication at 2.4 GHz"
Opening date:	2008-04-17
Closing date:	2008-07-17
Note:	This document is circulated to JTC 1 National Bodies for DTR ballot. National Bodies are asked to vote and submit their comments via the on-line balloting system by the due date indicated.

Member responses:

Votes cast (26)	Australia (SA) Belgium (NBN) Canada (SCC) China (SAC) Czech Republic (CNI) Denmark (DS) Finland (SFS) France (AFNOR) Germany (DIN) India (BIS) Ireland (NSAI) Italy (UNI) Jamaica (BSJ) Japan (JISC) Korea, Republic of (KATS) Malta (MSA) Netherlands (NEN)
------------------------	--

	New Zealand (SNZ) Nigeria (SON) Norway (SN) Singapore (SPRING SG) South Africa (SABS) Spain (AENOR) Switzerland (SNV) United Kingdom (BSI) USA (ANSI)
Comments submitted (1)	Ukraine (DSSU)
Votes not cast (14)	Algeria (IANOR) Azerbaijan (AZSTAND) Côte-d'Ivoire (CODINORM) Ecuador (INEN) Iran, Islamic Republic of (ISIRI) Kazakhstan (KAZMEMST) Kenya (KEBS) Malaysia (DSM) Pakistan (PSQCA) Philippines (BPS) Saudi Arabia (SASO) Slovenia (SIST) Uruguay (UNIT) Venezuela (FONDONORMA)

Questions:	
Q.1	"Does your National Body approve the attached DTR to go forward to publication?"
Q.2	"If you approve the DTR Text with comments, would you please indicate which type ? (General, Technical or Editorial)"
Q.3	"If you Disapprove the Draft, would you please indicate if you accept to change your vote to Approval if the reasons and appropriate changes will be accepted?"

Answers to Q.1: "Does your National Body approve the attached DTR to go forward to publication?"		
16 x	Approval as presented	Canada (SCC) China (SAC) Czech Republic (CNI) Finland (SFS) India (BIS) Ireland (NSAI) Italy (UNI) Jamaica (BSJ) Japan (JISC) Netherlands (NEN) Nigeria (SON) Norway (SN) Singapore (SPRING SG)

		South Africa (SABS) United Kingdom (BSI) USA (ANSI)
6 x	Abstention	Belgium (NBN) Denmark (DS) Malta (MSA) New Zealand (SNZ) Spain (AENOR) Switzerland (SNV)
3 x	Approval with comments	Australia (SA) France (AFNOR) Korea, Republic of (KATS)
1 x	Disapproval of the draft	Germany (DIN)

Answers to Q.2: "If you approve the DTR Text with comments, would you please indicate which type ? (General, Technical or Editorial)"

22 x	Ignore	Belgium (NBN) Canada (SCC) China (SAC) Czech Republic (CNI) Denmark (DS) Finland (SFS) India (BIS) Ireland (NSAI) Italy (UNI) Jamaica (BSJ) Japan (JISC) Malta (MSA) Netherlands (NEN) New Zealand (SNZ) Nigeria (SON) Norway (SN) Singapore (SPRING SG) South Africa (SABS) Spain (AENOR) Switzerland (SNV) United Kingdom (BSI) USA (ANSI)
2 x	All	France (AFNOR) Korea, Republic of (KATS)
1 x	Editorial	Australia (SA)
1 x	Technical	Germany (DIN)
0 x	General	

Answers to Q.3: "If you Disapprove the Draft, would you please indicate if you accept to change your vote to Approval if the reasons and appropriate changes will be accepted?"

25 x	Ignore	Australia (SA) Belgium (NBN) Canada (SCC) China (SAC) Czech Republic (CNI) Denmark (DS) Finland (SFS) France (AFNOR) India (BIS) Ireland (NSAI) Italy (UNI) Jamaica (BSJ) Japan (JISC) Korea, Republic of (KATS) Malta (MSA) Netherlands (NEN) New Zealand (SNZ) Nigeria (SON) Norway (SN) Singapore (SPRING SG) South Africa (SABS) Spain (AENOR) Switzerland (SNV) United Kingdom (BSI) USA (ANSI)
1 x	Yes	Germany (DIN)
0 x	No	

Comments from Voters		
Member:	Comment:	Date:
Australia (SA)	Comment File	2008-06-26 02:29:02
CommentFiles/Australia(SA).rtf		
France (AFNOR)	Comment File	2008-07-03 17:30:03
CommentFiles/France(AFNOR).doc		
Germany (DIN)	Comment File	2008-06-06 10:44:27
CommentFiles/Germany(DIN).doc		
Korea, Republic of (KATS)	Comment	2008-07-10 08:52:04
Please find the comments file		
Korea, Republic of (KATS)	Comment File	2008-07-10 08:52:04
CommentFiles/Korea,Republicof(KATS).doc		

Comments from Commenters		
Member:	Comment:	Date:
Ukraine (DSSU)	<i>Comment</i>	2008-07-16 11:52:35
abstention		

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date:2008-07-18

Document:

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB ¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/ Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comm ent ²	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted
AU01						
AU01						
AU01	Foreword		ed	There is a URL at the beginning of the foreword	Remove the URL	
AU02	Introduction		ed	May be related to AU03 below but, 24730 is referenced but is not listed in the Normative References. Should this be 24730-1 or 24730-2	Insert the correct reference to the relevant part.	
DE	Introduction		te	The statement "ISO/IEC 24730 defines the air interfaces and an application programming interface for Real Time Locating Systems (RTLS) devices used in asset management applications. Part 2 of ISO/IEC 24730 defines the air interface for these devices operating at frequencies from 2.4-2.483 GHz" is not correct since .Part 2 is not exclusively operating in the 2.4 GHz band. Another Part (5) which also operates in the 2.4 GHz ISM band is currently in the ISO process	"ISO/IEC 24730 defines the air interfaces and an application programming interface for Real Time Locating Systems (RTLS) devices used in asset management applications. Part 2 of ISO/IEC 24730 defines a unidirectional air interface for these devices operating at frequencies from 2.4-2.483 GHz"	
FR	Introduction		ge	The statement "ISO/IEC 24730 defines the air interfaces and an application programming interface for Real Time Locating Systems (RTLS) devices used in asset management applications. Part 2 of ISO/IEC 24730 defines the air interface for these devices operating at frequencies from 2.4-2.483 GHz" is not correct since .Part 2 is not exclusively operating in the 2.4 GHz band. Another Part (5) which also operates in the 2.4 GHz ISM band is currently in the ISO process	"ISO/IEC 24730 defines the air interfaces and an application programming interface for Real Time Locating Systems (RTLS) devices used in asset management applications. Part 2 of ISO/IEC 24730 defines a unidirectional air interface for these devices operating at frequencies from 2.4-2.483 GHz"	
KR 1	1	First paragraph	ed	2.4GHz real time " location system" should be " locating systems"		
AU03	2		ed	24730-1 is listed as a normative reference but is not referenced in the document	Either move 24730-1 to bibliography or remove from the Normative References	

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date:2008-07-18

Document:

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB ¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/ Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comm ent ²	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted
AU04	2		ed	18000-4 is listed as a normative reference but is not referenced in the document	Either move 18000-4 to bibliography or remove from the Normative References	
AU05	2		ed	15963 is listed as a normative reference but is not referenced in the document	Either move 15963 to bibliography or remove from the Normative References	
KR 2	3.4	RTLS	ed	Real time "location system" should be "locating systems"		
AU06	4.1		ed	May be related to AU03 above but 24730 is referenced but is not listed in the Normative References. Should this be 24730-1 or 24730-2	Insert the correct reference to the relevant part.	
FR	4.1		ed	"This Technical Report also specifies a series of tests to determine the conformance of RTLS RF receivers to the ISO/IEC 24730-2 air interfaces. The results of these tests shall be compared with the values of the parameters specified in ISO/IEC 24730 to determine whether the RF receiver under test conforms."	"This Technical Report also specifies a series of tests to determine the conformance of RTLS RF receivers to the ISO/IEC 24730-2 air interfaces. The results of these tests shall be compared with the values of the parameters specified in ISO/IEC 24730-2 to determine whether the RF receiver under test conforms."	
KR 3	4.1	Second paragraph	te	The test results for RTLS RF receivers should also be compared with the values of the parameters specified in ISO/IEC 24730-2 like RTLS tags.		
FR	4.2.2		ed	"Unless otherwise specified, a default tolerance of + 5 % shall be applied to the quantity values given to specify the characteristics of the test equipment and the test method procedures."	"Unless otherwise specified, a default tolerance of + or - 5 % shall be applied to the quantity values given to specify the characteristics of the test equipment and the test method procedures."	
KR 4	4.3	Title	ed	The first characters of "Transmission Tests" should be small letters, i.e., transmission tests.		
KR 5	4.3.1	Line 2 and 3, Figure 1	ed	The first characters of annex A, annex C, and analyzer in Fig. 1 should be capital, and the first character in caption of Fig. 1, RF Test, should be small letter (i.e., RF test)		
KR 6	4.3.3	Line 1 and 4	ed	The clause 6.4.2.4 should be changed as 6.3.2.4 because the clause 6.4.2.4 does not exist (Line 1). 2,5 milliseconds should be 2.5 milliseconds (Line 4).		
KR	4.3.4.1	Line 1	ed	2441,175MHz should be 2441.175MHz		

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date:2008-07-18

Document:

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB ¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/ Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comm ent ²	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted
7						
KR 8	4.3.4.3	Line 1 and 3	ed	30,521875MHz should be 30.521875MHz (Line 1) Appendix F should be Annex F (Line 3)		
KR 9	4.3.4.4	Line 2	ed	Sector 6.4.2.1 should be changed as clause 6.3.2.1.		
KR 10	4.3.4.5	Line 1	ed	Section 6.2 should be changed as clause 6.1.		
KR 11	4.4	Title	ed	The first characters of "RF Tests" should be small letters, i.e., RF tests.		
AU07	4.4.1		ed	May be related to AU03 above but 24730 is referenced but is not listed in the Normative References. Should this be 24730-1 or 24730-2	Insert the correct reference to the relevant part.	
KR 12	4.4.1	Line 3 and 4	ed	As a period was missed, should be 64Msa memory)". (Line 3) Appendix E should be Annex E. (Line 4)		
KR 13	4.4.2	Title	ed	Test Objective → Test objectives (should be small letter)		
KR 14	4.4.3.1	Line 1	ed	Clause 6.4.2.4 should be changed as clause 6.3.2.4.		
KR 15	4.4.3.2	Line 1	ed	Clause 6.4.2.3 should be changed as clause 6.3.2.3.		
KR 16	4.4.3.3	Line 1	ed	Clause 6.4.2.2 should be changed as clause 6.3.2.2.		
KR 17	4.4.3.4	Line 1	ed	Clause 6.4.2.1 should be changed as clause 6.3.2.1.		
KR 18	4.4.4.3	Line 1 and 3	ed	30,521875MHz should be 30.521875MHz (Line 1) Appendix F should be Annex F (Line 3)		
KR 19	4.4.4.4	Line 2	ed	Sector 6.4.2.1 should be changed as clause 6.3.2.1.		
KR	4.4.4.5	Line 1	ed	Section 6.2 should be changed as clause 6.1.		

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date:2008-07-18

Document:

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB ¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/ Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comm ent ²	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted
20						
KR 21	4.5	Title	ed	The first characters of "Optional Air Interfaces" should be small letters, i.e., optional air interfaces.		
KR 22	4.5.1.1	Line 3 and 4, Figure 1	ed	The first characters of annex A, annex C, and analyzer in Fig. 1 should be capital , i.e., Annex A, Annex C, and Analyzer.		
KR 23	4.5.1.3	Line 4 and 5	ed	Section 7.2.8.1 and 4,5 milliseconds should be clause 7.2.8 and 4.5 milliseconds.		
KR 24	4.5.1.4.1	Line 1	ed	2446,519 → 2446.519		
KR 25	4.5.1.4.4	Line 1 and 2	ed	376,8 and 535,5 → 376.8 and 535.5		
KR 26	4.5.1.4.6	Line 1	ed	19,83 → 19.83		
KR 27	4.5.1.4.6	Line 3	ed	Appendix G → Annex G		
KR 28	4.5.2.1	Figure 4	ed	Vector Signal analyzer → Vector Signal Analyzer		
KR 29	4.5.2.4.1	Line 2	ed	section 6.4.2.2. → clause 6.3.2.2.		
KR 30	4.5.2.5	Title	ed	Test Report → Test report		
KR 31	4.5.3	Title	ed	Optional Exciter Magnetic Transmitter Test → Optional exciter magnetic transmitter test		
KR 32	4.5.3.4.4	Line 4 of first and second paragraphs	ed	Spaced → Space		
KR 33	4.5.3.4.5	RMS	ed	RMS is not defined in the document. Need to be included in Abbreviations.		
KR 34	4.5.3.4.6	Title, Line 1	ed	Test Report → Test report, insert "as" between "and" and "well"		

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date:2008-07-18

Document:

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB ¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/ Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comm ent ²	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted
KR 35	4.5.4.3	Line 2 of third paragraph	ed	1,25 seconds → 1.25 seconds		
KR 36	4.5.4.4.1	Line 2 of first paragraph	te	The clause 6.5.1.2 does not exist in the ISO/IEC 24730-2. Thus an appropriate clause should be referred.	The clause 7.1.2 of ISO/IEC 24730-2 describes OOK/FSK message encodation. Thus the appropriate clause should be 7.1.2.	
KR 37	4.5.4.4.1	Line 2 of second paragraph	ed	1,25 seconds → 1.25 seconds		
KR 38	4.5.4.4.2	Line 2 of first paragraph	te	In the clause 7.2.7 of ISO/IEC 24730-2, it says that an alternating "1" and "0" signal at the symbol rate was defined in 6.5.1.2. But the clause 6.5.1.2 does not exist, and thus it needs to be modified.	The clause 7.1.2 of ISO/IEC 24730-2 describes OOK/FSK message encodation. Thus the appropriate clause should be 7.1.2.	
KR 40	Annex B	Line 4 of first paragraph	ed	244,14 microseconds → 244.14 microseconds		
KR 41	Annex B	Paragraph between Figure B.1 and Table B.1.	te	Section 4.4.3 describes the test procedures for receiver DSSS RF tests. Thus the reference number should be changed.	The clause 4.5.1 describes the tag optional OOK/FSK RF tests. So, this clause should be appropriate.	
KR 42	Annex B	Line 1 of last paragraph	ed	is defied is → is defined in		
KR 43	Annex B	Line 1 of paragraph between Table B.3 and Table B.4.	te	The section 4.6.4.1 should be clause 4.5.4.4.1 because it does not exist in this document.		
KR 44	Annex B	Line 1 of paragraph between Table B.3 and Table B.4.	ed	is defined is → is defined in		
KR 45	Annex B	Line 7 of paragraph between Table B.3 and Table B.4.	ed	from a know time → from a known time		
KR	Annex B	Line 1 of paragraph	te	The section 4.6.4.2 should be clause 4.5.4.4.2 because it does not exist in this document.		

Template for comments and secretariat observations

Date:2008-07-18

Document:

1	2	(3)	4	5	(6)	(7)
MB ¹	Clause No./ Subclause No./ Annex (e.g. 3.1)	Paragraph/ Figure/ Table/ Note (e.g. Table 1)	Type of comm ent ²	Comment (justification for change) by the MB	Proposed change by the MB	Secretariat observations on each comment submitted
46		between Table B.4 and Table B.5.				
KR 47	Annex C	Line 2 of second paragraph	ed	Unless other wise → Unless otherwise		
KR 48	Annex D	Line 3 of second paragraph	ed	244,14 microseconds → 244.14 microseconds		
KR 49	Annex F	Title	ed	High SNR Demodulation...Signals → High SNR demodulation ...signals		
KR 50	Annex G	Title	ed	High SNR Demodulation...Signals → High SNR demodulation ...signals		
KR 39	Annex A, Figure A.1	Title	ed	RF Test → RF test (Annex A), RF Test Chamber → RF test chamber (Figure A.1)		