

# Problem 1

Let  $G$  be a group acting on a set  $X$ . For  $g \in G$  and  $A \subset X$ , we define

$$gA = \{g \cdot a : a \in A\}.$$

Two sets  $A, B \subset X$  are said to be **congruent** ( $A \sim B$ ) if there exists  $g \in G$  such that  $gA = B$ . They are said to be **equidecomposable** ( $A \sim_2 B$ ) if there exists  $k \geq 1$  and subsets  $A_1, \dots, A_k$  and  $B_1, \dots, B_k$  such that:

- $A$  is the disjoint union of  $A_1, \dots, A_k$ ,
- $B$  is the disjoint union of  $B_1, \dots, B_k$ , and
- $A_i$  is congruent to  $B_i$  for all  $i$ .

## 1.1

Show that congruence is an equivalence relation.

**Solution:** We have to show the following properties:

1.  $\sim$  is *reflexive*: Let  $e$  be the identity element of  $G$ . Then it follows from the fact that  $eA = A$ .
2.  $\sim$  is *symmetric*: If given  $A \sim B$ , i.e.  $gA = B$  for some  $g \in G$ , then  $A = g^{-1}B \Rightarrow B \sim A$ .
3.  $\sim$  is *transitive*: Given  $A \sim B$  and  $B \sim C$ , i.e.  $gA = B$  and  $hB = C$  for some  $g, h \in G$ . Then  $hB = h(gA) = (hg)A = C$ , where  $hg \in G$ . Thus,  $A \sim C$ .

## 1.2

Show that equidecomposability is an equivalence relation.

**Solution:** We have to show the following properties:

1.  $\sim_2$  is *reflexive*: Suppose  $A = \sqcup_{i=1}^k A_i$ . By reflexivity of  $\sim$ ,  $A_i \sim A_i \forall 1 \leq i \leq k \Rightarrow A \sim_2 A$ .
2.  $\sim_2$  is *symmetric*: Suppose  $A \sim_2 B$ , i.e.  $A = \sqcup_{i=1}^k A_i$  and  $B = \sqcup_{i=1}^k B_i$ . Then  $A_i \sim B_i \forall i \Rightarrow B_i \sim A_i \forall i \Rightarrow B \sim_2 A$ .
3.  $\sim_2$  is *transitive*: Suppose  $A \sim_2 B$  and  $B \sim_2 C$ . Then  $A = \sqcup_{i=1}^k A_i$ ,  $B = \sqcup_{i=1}^k B_i$ , and  $C = \sqcup_{i=1}^k C_i$ . By transitivity of  $\sim$ ,  $A_i \sim C_i \forall i \Rightarrow A \sim_2 C$ .

## 1.3

Suppose  $x \in X$  and there exists  $g \in G$  such that  $g^k \cdot x \neq x$  for all  $k \geq 1$ . Show that the set  $X \setminus \{x\}$  and  $X$  are equidecomposable.

**Solution:** Let  $B = \{g^k x \mid k \geq 0\}$  and  $B' = X \setminus B$ . Clearly,  $X = B \sqcup B'$ .

Note that  $gB = \{g^k x \mid k \geq 1\} = B \setminus \{x\} \Rightarrow gB = B \setminus \{x\} \sim B$ , and  $B' \sim B'$ . Since  $X \setminus \{x\} = gB \sqcup B'$ ,  $X \setminus \{x\}$  and  $X$  are equidecomposable.

## 1.4

Let  $F_2$  denote the free group generated by the set  $\{a, b\}$ . Let  $A$  denote the set of all elements that start with  $a$ , and let  $B$  denote the set of all elements that start with  $a^{-1}$ . Show that  $A \cup B$  is equidecomposable with  $F_2$ .

**Solution:** Every element of  $F_2$  can be written uniquely as a reduced word in the generators  $a, a^{-1}, b, b^{-1}$  such that no letter is immediately followed by its inverse. Clearly  $A \cap B = \emptyset$ .

We partition  $F_2$  as:

$$F_2 = \{e\} \sqcup A \sqcup B \sqcup C,$$

where:

- $\{e\}$  is the identity element,
- $A$  is the set of elements starting with  $a$ ,
- $B$  is the set of elements starting with  $a^{-1}$ ,
- $C$  is the set of elements starting with  $b$  or  $b^{-1}$ .

Observe that for  $x \in A$ ,

$$a^{-1} \cdot x = a^{-1} \cdot a \cdot y \text{ for some } y \in F_2 \text{ such that } y \text{ does not start with } a, \text{ i.e., } y \in F_2 \setminus B$$

This implies that  $a^{-1} \cdot A = F_2 \setminus B$ , i.e.,  $A \sim F_2 \setminus B$ . By reflexivity of  $\sim$ , we have that  $B \sim B$ . Since  $F_2 = (F_2 \setminus B) \sqcup B$ ,  $F_2$  is equidecomposable with  $A \sqcup B$ .

## 1.5

Show that the group  $F_2$  is equidecomposable with the disjoint union of two copies of  $F_2$ .

**Solution:** Partition  $C$  as  $C = D \sqcup E$ , where  $D$  is the set of elements starting with  $b$  and  $E$  is the set of elements starting with  $b^{-1}$ . Then, from 1.d., we have that  $F_2 \sim_2 A \sqcup B \sim_2 D \sqcup E$ . Since  $F_2 = A \sqcup aB = D \sqcup bD$ , we can write the disjoint union as

$$F_2 \sqcup F_2 = (A \sqcup aB) \sqcup (D \sqcup bE)$$

Since  $A \sqcup B \sim_2 A \sqcup aB \sim_2 D \sqcup bE \sim_2 F_2$ , it follows that  $F_2 \sim_2 F_2 \sqcup F_2$ .

## Problem Set 2

### 2.1

Let  $\mathbb{S}^1$  be the circle group acting on itself by translations. Show that for any countable set  $D \subset \mathbb{S}^1$ , the sets  $\mathbb{S}^1 \setminus D$  and  $\mathbb{S}^1$  are equidecomposable.

**Solution:** Let  $D = \{d_1, d_2, d_3, \dots\}$ . Each  $d_k = e^{i\theta_k}$  for some  $\theta_k \in [0, 2\pi)$ . Since the action by translation (or left-multiplication) by any element of  $\mathbb{S}^1$  induces a bijection:

$$f_\theta : \mathbb{S}^1 \rightarrow \mathbb{S}^1$$

Consider the following set to collect all possible rotations taking  $d_k$  to  $d_j$  for some  $d_k, d_j \in D$ :

$$E = \{\theta \in [0, 2\pi) : \exists d \in D \exists k \in \mathbb{N}^+ \mid f_\theta^k(d) \in D\}$$

$E$  is countable since it is a countable union of countable sets. Thus,  $\exists \phi \in [0, 2\pi)$  such that  $f_\phi^k(d) \notin D \forall d \in D \forall k \in \mathbb{N}^+$  (equivalently,  $\phi \notin E$ ).

**Claim:**  $\{f_\phi^k[D] : k \in \mathbb{N}\}$  consists of pairwise disjoint sets. Assume that there exists  $x \in f_\phi^k[D] \cap f_\phi^\ell[D]$  for some natural numbers  $k \neq \ell$ . Without loss of generality, assume  $k < \ell$ . Then we would have

$$f_\phi^{-k}(x) \in D \cap f_\phi^{\ell-k}[D],$$

but this is not possible by choice of  $\phi$ . Hence, the sets  $D, f_\phi[D], f_\phi^2[D], \dots$  are pairwise disjoint.

Let

$$A = \bigsqcup_{k=0}^{\infty} f_\phi^k(D), \quad \text{and} \quad B = \mathbb{S}^1 \setminus A.$$

Then we have that

$$A \sqcup B = \mathbb{S}^1, \quad \text{and} \quad f_\phi(A) \sqcup B = \mathbb{S}^1 \setminus D.$$

Therefore,  $\mathbb{S}^1 \setminus D$  and  $\mathbb{S}^1$  are equidecomposable.

### 2.2

Show that the  $\mathbb{S}^1$ -action on  $\mathbb{S}^1 \times (0, 1)$  has the same property, where the action on the second component is trivial.

**Solution:** Let  $D = \{(d_i, e_i) \mid i \in \mathbb{N}\}$  and  $D_1 = \{d_i \mid i \in \mathbb{N}\}$ .

We can choose  $A \subseteq \mathbb{S}^1$  as in problem 1, so we have

$$A \sqcup B = \mathbb{S}^1, \quad \text{and} \quad f_\phi(A) \sqcup B = \mathbb{S}^1 \setminus D_1$$

Let  $A' = \bigsqcup_{k=0}^{\infty} f_\phi^k(D)$  and  $B'$  be its complement. Then  $B' = \{(d, e) \mid d \notin D_2 \text{ and } e \notin D_2\}$ .

Note that  $\bigsqcup_{k=1}^{\infty} f_\phi^k(D) = \{(d, e) \mid d \notin D_2 \text{ and } e \in D_2\}$ . Thus, we have

$$f_\phi(A') \sqcup B' = \mathbb{S}^1 \times (0, 1) \setminus D$$

and the required result follows.

## 2.3

Show that the  $\text{SO}(3)$  action on the 2-sphere  $\mathbb{S}^2$  has the same property; that is, for any countable subset  $D \subset \mathbb{S}^2$ , the sets  $\mathbb{S}^2 \setminus D$  and  $\mathbb{S}^2$  are equidecomposable under the  $\text{SO}(3)$  action.

**Solution:**  $\text{SO}(3)$  acts on  $\mathbb{R}^2$  by rotating a point about the origin. This is equivalent to rotating a point about a line through the origin.

Now, choose a line  $l$  that does not intersect  $D$ . As in problem 1, the set  $W$  of rotations  $r$  corresponding to a rotation about  $l$  by some angle  $\theta$  such that for  $d \in D$ ,  $r_\theta^n(d) \in D$  is countable. Thus, we can find an angle  $\psi$  such that  $r_\psi^n(d) \notin D \ \forall d \in D$ , i.e.  $r_\psi^n(d) \cap D = \emptyset \ \forall n \geq 1$ .

Let

$$A = \bigsqcup_{k=0}^{\infty} r_\psi^k(D), \quad \text{and} \quad B = \mathbb{S}^1 \setminus A.$$

Then we have that

$$A \sqcup B = \mathbb{S}^2, \quad \text{and} \quad r_\psi(A) \sqcup B = \mathbb{S}^2 \setminus D.$$

Thus, the sets  $\mathbb{S}^2 \setminus D$  and  $\mathbb{S}^2$  are equidecomposable under the  $\text{SO}(3)$  action.

*Remark: Problem 1 and Problem 3 in this section essentially follow from Problem 1.3.*

## 2.4

Let  $G$  be a group of homeomorphisms of  $\mathbb{R}^3$  that contains  $\text{SO}(3)$  and all translations. Show that the closed unit ball  $B := \{x \in \mathbb{R}^3 : \|x\| \leq 1\}$  and the punctured closed unit ball  $B \setminus \{0\}$  are equidecomposable with respect to the action of  $G$ .

**Solution:** We use problem 1.3. again. Note that every element of  $\text{SO}(3)$  fixes the origin while every translation  $t$  is such that  $t^n \cdot 0 \neq 0 \ \forall n \geq 1$ . Then, from problem 1.3.,  $B \sim_2 B \setminus 0$ .

## Problem Set 3

Let  $G$  be a group acting on a set  $X$ . We call a subset  $E \subset X$  *paradoxical* if it is equidecomposable with the union of two disjoint copies of itself.

*Remark (ii):* Let  $G$  be a group and  $H \leq G$  be its subgroup. If  $A, B \subseteq X$  are equidecomposable with respect to the action of  $H$ , then  $A \sim_2 B$  with respect to the action of  $G$  since we can take the same decomposition as was taken for the action of  $H$ . Thus, if  $X$  is  $H$ -paradoxical, it is also  $G$ -paradoxical.

### 3.1

Show that if the group  $F_2$  (the free group on two generators) acts freely on a set  $X$ , then the set  $X$  is paradoxical with respect to that action.

**Solution:** Let  $M$  be a set of representatives for the  $F_2$ -orbits of  $X$ . For  $c \in F_2$ , define

$$X_c := \{zm \mid z \in W(c), m \in M\}.$$

Then the sets  $X_a, X_{a^{-1}}, X_b$ , and  $X_{b^{-1}}$  are disjoint such that

$$X = X_a \sqcup aX_{a^{-1}} = X_b \sqcup bX_{b^{-1}}$$

$$\text{Thus } X \sim X_a \sqcup aX_{a^{-1}} \sim X_b \sqcup bX_{b^{-1}} \Rightarrow X \sim_2 X_a \sqcup aX_{a^{-1}} \sqcup X_a \sqcup aX_{a^{-1}} = X \sqcup X$$

Thus,  $X$  is paradoxical with respect to the action of  $F_2$ .

### 3.2

Show that any non-trivial element  $A \in \text{SO}(3)$  has at most two fixed points in  $S^2$ .

**Solution:** The fixed point set of  $A \in \text{SO}(3)$  is  $X_A = \{x \in S^2 \mid A \cdot x = x\}$ . We already know that this action of  $A$  on a point  $x$  can be seen as the rotation of  $x$  about some line  $l$  passing through the origin, so the set of points fixed by  $A$  in  $\mathbb{R}^3$  corresponds exactly to the line  $l$ , which intersects  $S^2$  in exactly two points that are anti-podal.

Hence, any non-trivial element  $A \in \text{SO}(3)$  has exactly two fixed points in  $S^2$ .

### 3.3

Assume that  $\text{SO}(3)$  contains a copy of  $F_2$ . Show that there exists a countable set  $D \subset S^2$  such that  $S^2 \setminus D$  is paradoxical with respect to the action of  $\text{SO}(3)$  on  $S^2$ .

**Solution:** Let  $F$  be the isomorphic copy of  $F_2$  contained in  $\text{SO}(3)$  and  $D_1 = \bigcup_{A \in F} X_A$  be the set of points that are fixed by elements of  $F$ . Let  $D = \bigcup_{A \in F} A \cdot D_1$ . Then from problem 3.1, since  $F_2$  embeds in  $\text{SO}(3)$ , it acts freely on  $S^2 \setminus D$ , i.e.  $S^2 \setminus D$  is paradoxical with respect to the action of  $F_2$  and by extension, is paradoxical with respect to the action of  $\text{SO}(3)$ .

Note:  $D$  is countable since  $F$  is countable and each element has exactly 2 fixed points.

### 3.4

Show that  $S^2$  is a paradoxical set with respect to the  $\text{SO}(3)$ -action on  $S^2$ .

**Solution:** This follows from the transitive nature of equidecomposability:

$$S^2 \sim_2 S^2 \setminus D \sim_2 S^2 \setminus D \sqcup S^2 \setminus D \sim_2 S^2 \sqcup S^2$$

Thus,  $S^2$  is  $\text{SO}(3)$ -paradoxical.

### 3.5

Show that the closed unit ball minus the origin is a paradoxical subset of  $\mathbb{R}^3$  with respect to the  $\text{SO}(3)$ -action on  $\mathbb{R}^3$ .

**Solution:** Since  $S^2$  is  $\text{SO}_3(\mathbb{R})$ -paradoxical, there exists a partition

$$\{A_1, \dots, A_n, B_1, \dots, B_m\}$$

of  $S^2$  and rotations  $g_1, \dots, g_n, h_1, \dots, h_m \in \text{SO}_3(\mathbb{R})$  such that

$$S^2 = \bigsqcup_{i=1}^n g_i[A_i] = \bigsqcup_{j=1}^m h_j[B_j].$$

Let  $B$  denote the unit ball in  $\mathbb{R}^3$  and let  $0$  denote the origin. Then, we have

$$B \setminus \{0\} = \bigcup_{0 < a \leq 1} \{(ax, ay, az) : x^2 + y^2 + z^2 = 1\}$$

Let

$$C_i = \bigcup_{0 < a \leq 1} \{(ax, ay, az) : (x, y, z) \in A_i\}$$

$$D_i = \bigcup_{0 < a \leq 1} \{(ax, ay, az) : (x, y, z) \in B_j\}$$

Then we can rewrite  $B \setminus \{0\}$  as

$$B \setminus \{0\} = \bigsqcup_{i=1}^n g_i \cdot C_i = \bigsqcup_{j=1}^m h_j \cdot D_i$$

Thus,  $B \setminus \{0\}$  is  $\text{SO}_3(\mathbb{R})$ -paradoxical.

### 3.6

Let  $G$  denote the group of all homeomorphisms of  $\mathbb{R}^3$  of the form

$$x \mapsto Ax + b,$$

where  $A \in \text{SO}(3)$  and  $b \in \mathbb{R}^3$ . Show that the closed unit ball is a paradoxical set with respect to the  $G$ -action on  $\mathbb{R}^3$ .

**Solution:** From 3.4, it suffices to show that  $B \setminus \{0\} \sim_2 B$ . From 1.3, we only need an element  $g \in G$  such that  $g^k \cdot 0 \neq 0 \ \forall k \geq 1$  to show this. Any translation  $b \in \mathbb{R}^3$  will satisfy the required property.

# 1 Problem Set 4

## 4.1

Let  $R$  be a field and let  $M(3, R)$  be the set of all  $3 \times 3$  matrices with entries in  $R$ . For  $m = 1, 2, 3$ , let  $Q_m \subset M(3, R)$  denote the set of all  $A$  with the property that  $A_{ij} = 0$  if and only if either  $i = m$  or  $j = m$ .

If  $k \geq 1$ ,  $x_1, \dots, x_k \in Q_1$  and  $y_1, \dots, y_k \in Q_3$ , then show that both

$$x_1 y_1 \cdots x_k y_k \quad \text{and} \quad y_1 x_1 \cdots y_k x_k$$

are non-zero.

**Solution:** We will prove this by induction. Note that in  $Q_1$ , matrices have zeros in the first row and first column, with non-zero entries elsewhere:

$$\begin{bmatrix} 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & * & * \\ 0 & * & * \end{bmatrix}$$

In  $Q_3$ , matrices have zeros in the third row and third column, with non-zero entries elsewhere:

$$\begin{bmatrix} * & * & 0 \\ * & * & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 \end{bmatrix}$$

**Base Case ( $k = 1$ ):**

Let  $x_1 \in Q_1$ ,  $y_1 \in Q_3$ . Compute  $x_1 y_1$ :

$$x_1 = \begin{bmatrix} 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & a & b \\ 0 & c & d \end{bmatrix}, \quad y_1 = \begin{bmatrix} p & q & 0 \\ r & s & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 \end{bmatrix}$$

Then,

$$x_1 y_1 = \begin{bmatrix} 0 & 0 & 0 \\ ar & as & 0 \\ cr & cs & 0 \end{bmatrix}$$

Since  $a, c, r, s$  are non-zero elements of a field  $R$ , the product  $x_1 y_1 \neq 0$ .

Similarly,

$$y_1 x_1 = \begin{bmatrix} p & q & 0 \\ r & s & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & a & b \\ 0 & c & d \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} 0 & qa & qb \\ 0 & sa & sb \\ 0 & 0 & 0 \end{bmatrix}$$

which is also non-zero.



**Inductive Step:**

Assume  $x_1 y_1 \cdots x_k y_k \neq 0$  for some  $k \geq 1$ . Let  $z_i = x_i y_i$ . Let  $P_1 \subset M(3, R)$  denote the set of all  $A$  with the property that  $A_{ij} = 0$  if and only if either  $i = 1$  or  $j = 3$ .

Note that  $\forall i, z_i \in P_1$ . By associativity of matrix multiplication,  $x_1 y_1 \cdots x_k y_k = z_1 \cdots z_k = M_k \in P_1$ . Thus, if  $M_k$  is non-zero and since we know  $z_{k+1}$  is non-zero,  $M_k z_{k+1} \neq 0$ . Thus,

$$x_1 y_1 \cdots x_k y_k \neq 0 \quad \forall k \geq 1$$

Similarly,  $y_1 x_1 \cdots y_k x_k \neq 0 \quad \forall k \geq 1$ .

**4.2.**

Let  $A \in M(3, R)$  be defined by

$$e_1^T A = (3, 4, 0), \quad e_2^T A = (-4, 3, 0), \quad e_3^T A = (0, 0, 5),$$

and let  $B \in M(3, R)$  be defined by

$$B_{ij} = A_{i-1 \bmod 3, j-1 \bmod 3}.$$

Show that  $A/5$  and  $B/5$  are elements of  $\text{SO}(3)$ .

**Solution:** We are given:

$$e_1^T A = (3, 4, 0), \quad e_2^T A = (-4, 3, 0), \quad e_3^T A = (0, 0, 5)$$

Hence,

$$A = \begin{bmatrix} 3 & 4 & 0 \\ -4 & 3 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 5 \end{bmatrix}, \quad \frac{A}{5} = \begin{bmatrix} \frac{3}{5} & \frac{4}{5} & 0 \\ -\frac{4}{5} & \frac{3}{5} & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix}$$

It is easy to see that  $\frac{A}{5}$  is orthogonal with determinant 1.

Define  $B$  by

$$B_{ij} = A_{i-1 \bmod 3, j-1 \bmod 3}$$

Then,

$$B = \begin{bmatrix} 5 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 3 & 4 \\ 0 & -4 & 3 \end{bmatrix}, \quad \frac{B}{5} = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & \frac{3}{5} & \frac{4}{5} \\ 0 & -\frac{4}{5} & \frac{3}{5} \end{bmatrix}$$

$\frac{B}{5}$  is also orthogonal with determinant 1. Hence, both  $\frac{A}{5}, \frac{B}{5} \in \text{SO}(3)$ .

**4.3.**

Let  $R = \mathbb{Z}/5\mathbb{Z}$ . Show that for any integer  $k$ ,  $A^k$  is an element of  $Q_3$  and  $B^k$  is an element of  $Q_1$  when viewed as elements of  $M(3, R)$ .

**Solution:** After reduction modulo 5,

$$A = \begin{bmatrix} 3 & 4 & 0 \\ 1 & 3 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 \end{bmatrix}$$

Clearly,  $A \in Q_3$  and  $A_{ij} = 0$  for  $i = 3$  or  $j = 3$ . To show if and only if,

$$A^2 = \begin{bmatrix} 13 & 24 & 0 \\ 6 & 13 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 \end{bmatrix} \equiv \begin{bmatrix} 3 & 4 & 0 \\ 1 & 3 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 \end{bmatrix} = A \in Q_3$$

Thus,  $A^k = A \in Q_3 \forall k \geq 1$ .

Similarly,

$$B^2 = \begin{bmatrix} 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 13 & 24 \\ 0 & 6 & 13 \end{bmatrix} \equiv \begin{bmatrix} 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 3 & 4 \\ 0 & 1 & 3 \end{bmatrix} \in Q_1$$

Thus,  $B^k = B \in Q_1 \forall k \geq 1$ .

#### 4.4.

Show that the subgroup of  $SO(3)$  generated by  $A/5$  and  $B/5$  is isomorphic to the free group  $F_2$ .

**Solution:** For simplicity, rewrite  $\frac{A}{5}$  as  $a$  and  $\frac{B}{5}$  as  $b$ . Let  $F_2 = \langle p, q \rangle$  and  $\phi : \langle A, B \rangle \rightarrow F_2$  be the map defined by

$$\phi(p) = a \quad \text{and} \quad \phi(q) = b$$

Now, we want to show that  $\phi$  is an isomorphism. It suffices to show that  $a$  and  $b$  have no non-trivial relations, i.e. show the following equivalent statements to be true:

Let  $e$  be the identity element of  $SO(3)$ . For any  $k \geq 1$  and natural numbers  $n_1, m_1, \dots, n_k, m_k$

$$1. \quad a^{n_1} b^{m_1} \dots a^{n_k} b^{m_k} \neq e$$

$$2. \quad b^{n_1} a^{m_1} \dots a^{n_k} b^{m_k} \neq e$$

$$3. \quad a^{n_1} b^{m_1} \dots a^{n_k} \neq e$$

$$4. \quad b^{n_1} a^{m_1} \dots b^{n_k} \neq e$$

$$(1) \Rightarrow (2) : a^{n_1} b^{m_1} \dots a^{n_k} b^{m_k} \neq e \Rightarrow a^{n_1} b^{m_1} \dots a^{n_k} \neq b^{-m_k} \Rightarrow b^{m_k} a^{n_1} b^{m_1} \dots a^{n_k} \neq e$$

Similarly, we can show  $(2) \Rightarrow (1)$ .

$$(3) \Rightarrow (1) : a^{n_1} b^{m_1} \dots a^{n_k} \neq e \Rightarrow a^{n_1 - n_k} b^{m_1} \dots a^{n_{k-1}} b^{n_{k-1}} \neq e$$

$$(4) \Rightarrow (2) : b^{n_1} a^{m_1} \dots b^{n_k} \neq e \Rightarrow b^{n_1 - n_k} a^{m_1} \dots b^{n_{k-1}} a^{n_{k-1}} \neq e$$

Now, it remains to show  $(1) \forall k \geq 1$  and any natural numbers  $n_1, m_1, \dots, n_k, m_k$ . We will prove by reduction.

Suppose there exists  $k \geq 1$  and natural numbers  $n_1, m_1, \dots, n_k, m_k$  such that  $a^{n_1}b^{m_1} \dots a^{n_k}b^{m_k} = e$ . This implies that in  $M(3, \mathbb{Z}/5\mathbb{Z})$ ,  $A^{n_1}B^{m_1} \dots A^{n_k}B^{m_k} = 0$ . But this contradicts 4.1. since each  $A^{n_i} \in Q_1$  and each  $B^{m_i} \in Q_3$ . Thus, (1) holds and  $\langle a, b \rangle \cong F_2$ .

## Problem Set 5

For a set  $S$ , let  $\mathbb{R}^S$  denote the set of all functions from  $S$  to  $\mathbb{R}$  equipped with the product topology. An **affine set** is a compact convex subset of  $\mathbb{R}^S$  for some set  $S$ .

Let  $G$  be a discrete group. An action of  $G$  on an affine set  $\Delta$  is called **affine** if the maps  $x \mapsto g \cdot x$  are continuous for all  $g \in G$  and

$$g \cdot (\alpha x + \beta y) = \alpha(g \cdot x) + \beta(g \cdot y)$$

for all  $x, y \in \Delta$  and  $\alpha, \beta \geq 0$  with  $\alpha + \beta = 1$ .

A discrete group  $G$  is called **amenable** if every affine action of  $G$  has a fixed point.

### 5.1

Show that finite groups are amenable.

**Solution:** Let  $G$  be a finite group acting affinely on a compact convex set  $\Delta$ . For any  $x \in \Delta$ , define:

$$x_0 = \frac{1}{|G|} \sum_{g \in G} g \cdot x.$$

Since  $\Delta$  is convex and compact,  $x_0 \in \Delta$ . Moreover, for any  $h \in G$ ,

$$h \cdot x_0 = \frac{1}{|G|} \sum_{g \in G} h \cdot (g \cdot x) = \frac{1}{|G|} \sum_{g \in G} (hg) \cdot x = x_0.$$

Thus,  $x_0$  is fixed by the action of  $G$ , so  $G$  is amenable.

### 5.2

Show that  $\mathbb{Z}$  is amenable.

**Solution:** Let  $\mathbb{Z}$  act affinely on a compact convex set  $\Delta$ . Let the generator  $1 \in \mathbb{Z}$  act via a continuous affine map  $T: \Delta \rightarrow \Delta$ . Then the action is given by  $n \cdot x = T^n(x)$ .

Define the Cesàro sums:

$$x_n = \frac{1}{n} \sum_{k=0}^{n-1} T^k(x),$$

which lie in the compact set  $\Delta$ . By compactness, the sequence  $(x_n)$  has a convergent subsequence whose limit  $x_\infty \in \Delta$  satisfies  $T(x_\infty) = x_\infty$ , using continuity and affinity of  $T$ . Hence,  $\mathbb{Z}$  is amenable.

### 5.3

Show that if  $G$  is an increasing union of amenable subgroups, then  $G$  is amenable.

**Solution:** Let  $G = \bigcup_{n=1}^{\infty} G_n$ , where  $G_1 \subset G_2 \subset \dots$ , and each  $G_n$  is amenable.

Let  $G$  act affinely on a compact convex set  $\Delta$ . Since each  $G_n$  is amenable, there exists a fixed point  $x_n \in \Delta$  for the action of  $G_n$ .

Since the sequence  $(x_n)$  lies in a compact set  $\Delta$ , it has an accumulation point  $x \in \Delta$ . For any  $g \in G$ , there exists  $N$  such that  $g \in G_N$ , and for all  $n \geq N$ ,  $g \cdot x_n = x_n \Rightarrow g \cdot x = x$ . Thus  $x$  is a fixed point for  $G$ , so  $G$  is amenable.

## 5.4

If  $G$  has a normal subgroup  $N$  such that both  $N$  and  $G/N$  are amenable, then show that  $G$  is amenable.

**Solution:** Suppose  $N \trianglelefteq G$  and both  $N$  and  $G/N$  are amenable.

Let  $G$  act affinely on a compact convex set  $\Delta$ . Since  $N$  is amenable, the fixed point set  $\Delta^N = \{x \in \Delta : n \cdot x = x \text{ for all } n \in N\}$  is non-empty, convex, closed, and compact.

The quotient  $G/N$  acts on  $\Delta^N$ , and this action is affine and continuous. Since  $G/N$  is amenable, it has a fixed point in  $\Delta^N$ , which is then fixed by all of  $G$ . Hence,  $G$  is amenable.

## 5.5

Show that abelian groups are amenable.

**Solution:** We already showed that  $\mathbb{Z}$  is amenable. Any finitely generated abelian group is of the form  $\mathbb{Z}^n \oplus T$ , where  $T$  is a finite abelian group. Finite groups and  $\mathbb{Z}^n$  are amenable.

Any abelian group is a union of its finitely generated subgroups, each of which is amenable. By problem 3, increasing unions of amenable subgroups are amenable. Hence, all abelian groups are amenable.

## 5.6

Show that solvable groups are amenable.

**Solution:** A group  $G$  is solvable if there exists a finite derived series

$$G = G_0 \triangleright G_1 \triangleright \cdots \triangleright G_n = \{e\}$$

with  $G_{i+1} \trianglelefteq G_i$  and  $G_i/G_{i+1}$  abelian.

We proceed by induction on the length of the derived series. The base case  $G_n = \{e\}$  is trivially amenable. Assume  $G_{i+1}$  is amenable. Then  $G_i/G_{i+1}$  is abelian and hence amenable. By problem 4,  $G_i$  is amenable.

Thus,  $G$  is amenable.

## 2 Problem Set 6

For a set  $S$ , let  $\mathbb{R}^S$  denote the set of all functions from  $S$  to  $\mathbb{R}$ , equipped with the product topology. Let  $X$  be a set and let  $\mathcal{P}(X)$  be the collection of all subsets of  $X$ . A **finitely additive measure** on  $X$  is a map

$$\mu : \mathcal{P}(X) \rightarrow [0, \infty)$$

such that  $\mu(A \cup B) = \mu(A) + \mu(B)$  whenever  $A \cap B = \emptyset$ .

### 6.1

Let  $X$  be any set and  $c \in \mathbb{R}$ . Show that the collection of finitely additive measures on  $X$  satisfying  $\mu(X) = c$  is a non-empty affine subset of  $\mathbb{R}^{\mathcal{P}(X)}$ .

**Solution:** Define  $S = \{\mu : \mathcal{P}(X) \rightarrow [0, \infty) \mid \mu \text{ is finitely additive, } \mu(\emptyset) = 0\}$  and  $T = \{\mu \in S \mid \mu(X) = c\}$ . An affine subset of  $\mathbb{R}^{\mathcal{P}(X)}$  is of the form  $\mu_0$

If  $c < 0$ , then  $T = \emptyset$ , as  $\mu(X) \geq 0$ . Assume  $c \geq 0$ . Fix  $x_0 \in X$  and define:

$$\mu(A) = \begin{cases} c & \text{if } x_0 \in A, \\ 0 & \text{if } x_0 \notin A. \end{cases}$$

This satisfies:

- $\mu(A) \geq 0$ , since  $c \geq 0$ .
- $\mu(\emptyset) = 0$ , as  $x_0 \notin \emptyset$ .
- For disjoint  $A, B$ :
  - If  $x_0 \in A$ , then  $x_0 \notin B$ , so  $x_0 \in A \cup B$ , and  $\mu(A \cup B) = c = c + 0 = \mu(A) + \mu(B)$ .
  - If  $x_0 \in B$ , similarly.
  - If  $x_0 \notin A, B$ , then  $x_0 \notin A \cup B$ , so  $\mu(A \cup B) = 0 = 0 + 0$ .
- $\mu(X) = c$ , as  $x_0 \in X$ .

Thus,  $\mu \in T$ , so  $T \neq \emptyset$  for  $c \geq 0$ .

Let  $V = \{\nu \in \mathbb{R}^{\mathcal{P}(X)} \mid \nu \text{ is finitely additive, } \nu(\emptyset) = 0, \nu(X) = 0\}$ . Then  $V$  is a vector subspace, as it is closed under addition and scalar multiplication. Fix  $\mu_0 \in T$ . For  $\mu \in T$ , we have  $\mu - \mu_0 \in V$ , since  $(\mu - \mu_0)(X) = c - c = 0$ . For  $\nu \in V$ , if  $\mu_0 + \nu \geq 0$ , then  $\mu_0 + \nu \in T$ , as  $(\mu_0 + \nu)(X) = c$ . Thus,  $T = \mu_0 + V$ , and  $T$  is affine. If  $c < 0$ ,  $T = \emptyset$ , which is trivially affine.

### 6.2

Show that the  $\text{SO}(2)$ -action on  $S^1$  is not paradoxical.

**Solution:** The group  $\text{SO}(2) \cong S^1$  acts on  $S^1 = \{z \in \mathbb{C} \mid |z| = 1\}$  by rotation:  $e^{i\theta} \cdot z = e^{i\theta}z$ . An action is paradoxical if there exist disjoint  $A, B \subseteq S^1$ , and  $g_1, \dots, g_n, h_1, \dots, h_m \in \text{SO}(2)$ , such that  $S^1 = \bigcup_i g_i A$  and  $S^1 = \bigcup_j h_j B$ .

Suppose such a decomposition exists. Let  $\mu$  be the Lebesgue measure on  $S^1$  with  $\mu(S^1) = 1$ , invariant under rotations. Then:

$$\mu(S^1) \leq \sum_i \mu(g_i A) = n\mu(A), \quad \mu(S^1) \leq m\mu(B).$$

Since  $A \cap B = \emptyset$ ,  $\mu(A) + \mu(B) \leq 1$ . Thus,  $\mu(A) \leq \frac{1}{n}$ ,  $\mu(B) \leq \frac{1}{m}$ . Since  $\mu(A) + \mu(B) \leq \frac{1}{n} + \frac{1}{m} \leq 1$ , a paradoxical decomposition requires  $n = m = 1$ , implying  $S^1 = A = B$ , contradicting  $A \cap B = \emptyset$ .

### 6.3

Let  $X = (a, b] \times (c, d] \subset \mathbb{R}^2$  be any rectangle. Show that the collection of finitely additive measures on  $X$  satisfying  $\mu(R) = \text{Area}(R)$  for all rectangles  $R \subset X$  is a non-empty affine subset of  $\mathbb{R}^{P(X)}$ .

**Solution:** A rectangle  $R = (a_1, b_1] \times (c_1, d_1] \subset X$  has  $\text{Area}(R) = (b_1 - a_1)(d_1 - c_1)$ . Let  $S = \{\mu : P(X) \rightarrow [0, \infty) \mid \mu \text{ is finitely additive, } \mu(\emptyset) = 0\}$ , and  $T = \{\mu \in S \mid \mu(R) = \text{Area}(R) \text{ for all } R\}$ .

Lebesgue measure  $\mu_0$  on  $X$ , extended to  $P(X)$  via the axiom of choice, satisfies  $\mu_0(R) = (b_1 - a_1)(d_1 - c_1)$ . Thus,  $\mu_0 \in T$ , so  $T \neq \emptyset$ .

Let  $V = \{\nu \in \mathbb{R}^{P(X)} \mid \nu \text{ is finitely additive, } \nu(\emptyset) = 0, \nu(R) = 0 \text{ for all } R\}$ . Then  $V$  is a subspace. Fix  $\mu_0 \in T$ . For  $\mu \in T$ ,  $\mu - \mu_0 \in V$ , as  $(\mu - \mu_0)(R) = \text{Area}(R) - \text{Area}(R) = 0$ . For  $\nu \in V$ ,  $\mu_0 + \nu \in T$  if  $\mu_0 + \nu \geq 0$ , satisfying  $\mu_0 + \nu(R) = \text{Area}(R)$ . Thus,  $T = \mu_0 + V$  is affine.

### 6.4

Let  $\mathcal{S}$  denote the collection of all bounded subsets of  $\mathbb{R}^2$  and let  $\Delta$  denote the collection of all  $\mu \in \mathbb{R}^{\mathcal{S}}$  such that

$$\mu(A \cup B) = \mu(A) + \mu(B) \quad \text{whenever } A \cap B = \emptyset,$$

and

$$\mu((a, b] \times (c, d]) = (b - a)(d - c)$$

for all rectangles. Show that  $\Delta$  is a non-empty affine subset of  $\mathbb{R}^{\mathcal{S}}$ .

**Solution:** Extending the Lebesgue measure  $\mu_0$  on bounded measurable sets to  $\mathcal{S}$  via the axiom of choice satisfies  $\mu_0((a, b] \times (c, d]) = (b - a)(d - c)$ . Thus,  $\mu_0 \in \Delta$ , so  $\Delta \neq \emptyset$ .

Let  $V = \{\nu \in \mathbb{R}^{\mathcal{S}} \mid \nu \text{ is finitely additive, } \nu(\emptyset) = 0, \nu((a, b] \times (c, d]) = 0 \text{ for all rectangles}\}$ . Then  $V$  is a subspace. Fix  $\mu_0 \in \Delta$ . For  $\mu \in \Delta$ ,  $\mu - \mu_0 \in V$ , as  $(\mu - \mu_0)((a, b] \times (c, d]) = 0$ . For  $\nu \in V$ ,  $\mu_0 + \nu \in \Delta$  if  $\mu_0 + \nu \geq 0$ , satisfying the rectangle condition. Thus,  $\Delta = \mu_0 + V$  is affine.

### 6.5

Show that the Banach–Tarski paradox fails in  $\mathbb{R}$ .

**Solution:** One can define a nonnegative finitely additive set function  $m(P)$ , for all subsets  $P$  of the circle, that is invariant under rotation.

This implies in particular that it is impossible to decompose  $S^1$  paradoxically into a disjoint union of finitely many pieces  $A_1, \dots, A_n$  in such a way that  $S^1$  can be written as a disjoint union of rotated versions of  $A_1, \dots, A_k$  as well as  $A_{k+1}, \dots, A_n$ , i.e.,  $r_1 A_1 \cup \dots \cup r_k A_k = S^1$  and  $r_{k+1} A_{k+1} \cup \dots \cup r_n A_n = S^1$ , where  $r_1, \dots, r_n$  are some rotations.

Then, we have

$$1 = m(S^1) = m(A_1 \cup \dots \cup A_n) = m(A_1) + \dots + m(A_n)$$

as well as

$$\begin{aligned} 1 &= m(S^1) = m(r_1 A_1 \cup \dots \cup r_k A_k) = m(A_1) + \dots + m(A_k) \\ &= m(S^1) = m(r_{k+1} A_{k+1} \cup \dots \cup r_n A_n) = m(A_{k+1}) + \dots + m(A_n) \end{aligned}$$

by finite additivity and invariance of  $m$  under rotations. This implies

$$1 = m(A_1) + \dots + m(A_n) = [m(A_1) + \dots + m(A_k)] + [m(A_{k+1}) + \dots + m(A_n)] = 2$$

which is a contradiction.