

# Learning Dynamical Systems with Side Information (Proofs)

Amir Ali Ahmadi

AAA@PRINCETON.EDU

Bachir El Khadir

BKHADIR@PRINCETON.EDU

## 1. Preliminary: Measure of Similarity Between Vector Fields

Fix a set  $\Omega \in \mathbb{R}^n$  and a time horizon  $T$ . In order to assess how close two vector fields  $f, g : \Omega \rightarrow \mathbb{R}^n$  are, we define the following two metrics. The first one compares directly the values taken by  $f$  and  $g$  on the compact set  $\Omega$ :

$$\|f - g\|_{\Omega} := \max_{x \in \Omega} \|f(x) - g(x)\|$$

The second metric of interest, which is more dynamics-focused, measures how different the trajectories of  $f$  and  $g$  starting from an invariant set  $\Omega$  are after some time  $T > 0$ , i.e.

$$d_{\Omega, T}(f - g) := \sup_{x_0 \in \Omega, t \in [0, T]} \max\{\|x(t, x_0) - y(t, x_0)\|, \|\dot{x}(t, x_0) - \dot{y}(t, x_0)\|\}$$

where  $x(t, x_0)$  (resp.  $y(t, x_0)$ ) is the trajectory starting from  $x_0 \in \Omega$  and following the dynamics of  $f$  (resp.  $g$ ).

The metric  $d_{\Omega, T}(\cdot)$  is “finer” than  $\|\cdot\|_{\Omega}$ . Indeed, by noting that  $\dot{x}(0, x_0) = f(x_0)$  and  $\dot{y}(0, x_0) = g(x_0)$ , we obtain that  $d_{\Omega, T}(f - g) \leq \|f - g\|_{\Omega}$ . The next proposition shows that for vector fields that leave the set  $\Omega$  invariant, these two metrics become equivalent.

**Proposition 1** *For any positive scalar  $L > 0$ , there exists a constant  $C_{\Omega, T, L}$  such that*

$$\|f - g\|_{\Omega} \leq d_{\Omega, T}(f - g) \leq C_{\Omega, T, L} \|f - g\|_{\Omega}$$

*for every two  $L$ -Lipchitz vector fields  $f$  and  $g$  that leave the set  $\Omega$  invariant.*

To present the proof of this proposition, we need to recall the classical lemma of *Gronwall*.

**Lemma 2 (Gronwall)** *Let  $I = [a, b]$  denote a non-empty interval on the real line. Let  $\alpha$ ,  $\beta$ , and  $u$  be continuous, real-valued functions defined on  $I$  and satisfying*

$$u(t) \leq \alpha(t) + \int_a^t \beta(s)u(s) \, ds \quad \forall t \in I.$$

*If  $\alpha$  is nondecreasing and  $\beta$  is nonnegative, then*

$$u(t) \leq \alpha(t) \exp\left(\int_a^t \beta(s) \, ds\right) \quad t \in I.$$

**Proof** (Proof of Proposition 1) Consider two trajectories  $x(t)$  and  $y(t)$  both starting from  $x_0 \in \Omega$  and following  $f$  and  $g$  respectively. The proof is divided into two parts.

For the first part of the proof, we will bound  $\|y(t) - x(t)\|$ . By definition of  $y$  and  $x$ , for every  $t \in [0, T]$  we have that

$$\begin{aligned} x(t) - y(t) &= \int_0^t f(x(s)) - g(y(s)) ds \\ &= \int_0^t f(x(s)) - g(x(s)) ds + \int_0^t g(x(s)) - g(y(s)) ds. \end{aligned}$$

Using the triangular inequality, we get

$$\|y(t) - x(t)\| \leq \int_0^t \|f(x(s)) - g(x(s))\| ds + \int_0^t \|g(x(s)) - g(y(s))\| ds. \quad (1)$$

Since  $f$  leaves  $\Omega$  invariant, we know that for all  $s \in [0, t]$ ,  $x(s) \in \Omega$  and therefore  $\|f(x(s)) - g(x(s))\| \leq \|f - g\|_\Omega$ . Furthermore, because the function  $g$  is  $L$ -Lipchiz,  $\|g(x(s)) - g(y(s))\| \leq L\|x(s) - y(s)\|$ . From (1) we conclude therefore that

$$\|y(t) - x(t)\| \leq t\|f - g\|_\Omega + L \int_0^t \|x(s) - y(s)\| ds,$$

and by Gronwall's lemma,

$$\|y(t) - x(t)\| \leq t \exp(Lt) \|f - g\|_\Omega \quad \forall t \in [0, T].$$

For the second part of the proof, we will bound  $\|\frac{\partial}{\partial t} y(t) - \frac{\partial}{\partial t} x(t)\| = \|f(x(s)) - g(y(s))\|$ . note that since  $f$  and  $g$  leave  $\Omega$  invariant, we know that for all  $s \in [0, t]$ ,  $x(s), y(s) \in \Omega$ . By triangular inequality again, we know that  $\|f(x(s)) - g(y(s))\| \leq \|f(x(s)) - g(x(s))\| + \|g(x(s)) - g(y(s))\|$ . Using the fact that  $g$  is  $L$ -Lipchiz on  $\Omega$ ,  $\|g(x(s)) - g(y(s))\| \leq L\|y(t) - x(t)\|$ . Therefore  $\|f(x(s)) - g(y(s))\| \leq \|f - g\|_\Omega + L\|y(t) - x(t)\|$ .

Putting the first and second part of the proof together, we have

$$\|y(t) - x(t)\| \leq T \exp(LT) \|f - g\|_\Omega$$

and

$$\begin{aligned} \|\frac{\partial}{\partial t} y(t) - \frac{\partial}{\partial t} x(t)\| &\leq \|f - g\|_\Omega + L\|y(t) - x(t)\| \\ &\leq \|f - g\|_\Omega + Lt \exp(Lt) \|f - g\|_\Omega. \end{aligned}$$

Therefore

$$d_{\Omega, T}(f - g) \leq C(\Omega, T, L) \|f - g\|_\Omega$$

with  $C(\Omega, T, L) = \max\{T \exp(LT), 1 + LT \exp(LT)\}$ . ■

## 2. Proof of Theorem 1

Fix a compact set  $\Omega \subset \mathbb{R}^n$ , a time horizon  $T > 0$ , and a desired accuracy  $\varepsilon > 0$ . Let  $f : \mathbb{R}^n \rightarrow \mathbb{R}^n$  be a continuous differentiable vector field that satisfies any one of the following constraints:

- (i) equilibria at a given finite set of points,
- (ii) symmetry.
- (iii) nonnegativity,
- (iv) directional monotonicity,
- (v) invariance of a full-dimensional, star-shaped basic semialgebraic set,
- (vi) gradient or Hamiltonian structure.

In this section, we prove that there exists a polynomial vector field  $p : \mathbb{R}^n \rightarrow \mathbb{R}^n$  such that

$$\|f - p\|_{\Omega} \leq \varepsilon,$$

(by proposition 1, this shows in particular that trajectories of  $f$  and  $p$  can be made arbitrarily close) and  $p$  satisfies the same side information as  $f$ . Before we give a case-by-case proof depending on which side information  $f$  satisfies, we present the following universal-approximation result that will be invoked frequently.

**Theorem 3** (*Weirstrass approximation theorem*) *If  $f : \Omega \rightarrow \mathbb{R}^n$  is continuously-differentiable, then for any  $\varepsilon > 0$ , there exists a polynomial  $p : \mathbb{R}^n \rightarrow \mathbb{R}^n$  such that*

$$\|f(x) - p(x)\| \leq \varepsilon \quad \forall x \in \Omega.$$

### 2.1. If $f$ satisfies the equilibrium conditions in (i)

Suppose  $f$  satisfies

$$f(x_i) = \alpha_i \quad i = 1, \dots, m. \tag{2}$$

Let  $p$  be a polynomial vector field uniformly approximating  $f$  as in Theorem 3. Let  $v_i = (\alpha_i - (f(x_i) - p(x_i)))$ , and note that  $\|v\| \leq \varepsilon$ .

The proposition below, shows that there exists a polynomial  $q$  such that

$$(p + q)(x_i) = \alpha_i \quad i = 1, \dots, m,$$

and  $\|q\|_{\Omega} \leq C\varepsilon$ , where  $C$  is a constant depending only on the  $x_i$ . The last inequality implies in particular that

$$\|f - (p + q)\|_{\Omega} \leq \varepsilon(1 + C).$$

**Proposition 4** *For any positive integers  $d$  and  $n$ , for any  $d$  points  $x^1, \dots, x^d$  in a compact set  $\Omega$ , there exists a constant  $C(x_1, \dots, x_d)$  such that the following holds:*

*For any vector  $v \in \mathbb{R}^d$ , there exists a polynomial  $p \in \mathbb{R}_d[x]$  such that*

$$p(x_i) = v_i, \quad i = 1, \dots, d \text{ and } \max_{x \in \Omega} |p(x)| \leq C(x_1, \dots, x_d) \|v\|_2$$

**Lemma 5 (Proposition 4.3 in Comon et al.) (Multivariate Polynomial Interpolation)** *If  $x^1, \dots, x^d$  are  $d$  different points of  $\mathbb{R}^n$ , then the vectors  $m_d(x^1), \dots, m_d(x^d)$  are linearly independent. (Here  $m_d(x^i)$  is the vector of monomials in  $x_i$  up to degree  $d$ .)*

**Proof** [Proof of Proposition 4] By Lemma 5, the system of linear equations

$$p(x_i) = v_i \quad i = 1, \dots, n \quad (3)$$

in the variable  $p \in \mathbb{R}_d[x]$  are independent. If we identify  $p$  by its coefficients in the monomial basis, then we can rewrite the system in Equation (3) as

$$Ap = v,$$

where  $A = (m_d(x^1), \dots, m_d(x^d))^T$  is a matrix depending only on  $x_1, \dots, x_d$  that has independent rows. The proof follows by taking  $C(x_1, \dots, x_d)$  to be the operator norm of the matrix  $M := (A^T A)^{-1} A^T$  and  $p = Mv$ .  $\blacksquare$

## 2.2. If $f$ satisfies the symmetry in (ii)

Suppose  $f$  satisfies a symmetry

$$B^{-1}f(Ax) = f(x). \quad (4)$$

For a vector field  $h$ , define

$$[\psi(h)](x) := \frac{B^{-1}h(Ax) + h(x)}{2}$$

Note that  $\psi$  is a linear function and that the equality in Equation (4) translates to  $\psi f = f$ . Moreover,  $\psi$  is an involution (i.e.,  $\psi^2 = \text{id}$ ) and a contraction (i.e.,  $\|\psi(h)\|_\Omega \leq \|h\|_\Omega$ ).

Let  $p$  be a polynomial vector field uniformly approximating  $f$  as in Theorem 3, i.e.,  $\|p - f\|_\Omega \leq \varepsilon$ , and let  $q = \psi p$ . Then,  $\psi(q) = q$ , and  $\|q - f\|_\Omega \leq \|q - p\|_\Omega \leq \varepsilon$ .

## 2.3. If $f$ satisfies the nonnegativity condition in (iii)

Suppose  $f$  satisfies  $f_i(x) \geq_i 0 \quad \forall x \in B_i$  for  $i, j \in \{1, \dots, n\}$ . Let  $f_\varepsilon(x)$  the vector field defined component wise by

$$f_{\varepsilon,j}(x) = f_j(x) + \varepsilon \alpha_i,$$

where  $\alpha_i = 1$  if  $\geq_i = \geq$ , and  $\alpha_i = -1$  otherwise. Approximating  $f_\varepsilon$  uniformly by a polynomial  $p$  gives the desired construction.

## 2.4. If $f$ satisfies the monotonicity condition in (iv)

Suppose  $f$  satisfies  $\frac{\partial f_i}{\partial x_j}(x) \geq_{i,j} 0 \quad \forall x \in B_{i,j}$  for  $i, j \in \{1, \dots, n\}$ . Let  $f_\varepsilon(x)$  the vector field defined component wise by

$$f_{\varepsilon,j}(x) = f_j(x) + \varepsilon \alpha_{ij} x_i,$$

where  $\alpha_{ij} = 1$  if  $\geq_{i,j} = \geq$ , and  $\alpha_{ij} = -1$  otherwise. Approximating  $f_\varepsilon$  uniformly by a polynomial  $p$  gives the desired construction.

### 2.5. If $f$ satisfies invariance in (v)

Let  $B$  be the set defined by the inequalities  $h_1(x) \geq 0, \dots, h_m(x) \geq 0$ , where each of the  $h_i$  is concave, and suppose there exists a point  $x_0 \in B$  such that  $h_i(x) > 0$  for all  $i$ . Suppose  $f$  leaves  $B$  invariant, i.e.,

$$h_j(x) \geq 0 \ \forall j \text{ and } h_i(x) = 0 \implies \langle f(x), \nabla h_i(x) \rangle \geq 0 \quad \forall x \in \mathbb{R}^n, i = 1, \dots, m. \quad (5)$$

Let  $f_\varepsilon(x) = f(x) - \varepsilon(x - x_0)$ , and notice that  $\|f_\varepsilon - f\| \leq |\Omega|\varepsilon$ . (Here  $|\Omega| := \sup_{x,y \in \Omega} \|x - y\|$ ). Moreover, if  $h_j(x) \geq 0 \ \forall j$  and  $h_i(x) = 0$ , then

$$\langle f_\varepsilon(x), \nabla h_i(x) \rangle = \langle f(x), \nabla h_i(x) \rangle + \varepsilon \langle x - x_0, \nabla h_i(x) \rangle \geq \varepsilon h_i(x_0).$$

Let  $p$  be a polynomial vector field such that  $\|p - f_\varepsilon\|_\Omega \leq \varepsilon$ , then by continuity,  $p$  satisfies Equation (5). Moreover,

$$\|f - p\| \leq \|f - f_\varepsilon\| + \|f_\varepsilon - p\| \leq \varepsilon(|\Omega| + 1).$$

### 2.6. If $f$ satisfies the gradient/Hamiltonian condition in (vi)

Suppose  $f$  is a gradient, i.e.,  $f(x) = -\nabla V(x)$  for some scalar-valued function  $V$ . Let  $W$  be polynomial approximation of  $V$ , i.e.

$$\|V(x) - W(x)\| \leq \varepsilon \quad \text{and} \quad \|\nabla V - \nabla W\| \leq \varepsilon.$$

Then, the polynomial vector field  $p := -\nabla W$  is a gradient and approximates  $f$  uniformly on  $\Omega$ .

## 3. Proof of Theorem 2

Let  $C$  denote the set of continuously differentiable vector fields. The table below shows for every side information  $S$ , there exists a continuous functional

$$L_S : C \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$$

that is continuous with respect to the  $\|\cdot\|_\Omega$  norm, and such that

$$\forall f \in C, \ f \text{ satisfies } S \iff L_S(f) = 0,$$

and

$$\forall f \in C, \ f \ \delta\text{-satisfies } S \iff L_S(f) \leq \delta.$$

Side Information $S$	Linear functional $L_S$
<b>Interp</b> ( $\{x_i, y_i\}_{i=1}^m$ )	$L_S(f) := \sum_{i=1}^m \ f(x_i) - y_i\ $
<b>Sym</b> ( $A, B$ )	$L_S(f) := \ f(Ax) - Bf(x)\ $
<b>Pos</b> ( $\{\succeq_i, B_i\}_{i=1}^n$ )	$L_S(f) := \min_i \min_{B_i} f$
<b>Mon</b> ( $\{\succeq_{i,j}, B_{i,j}\}_{i,j=1}^n$ )	$L_S(f) := \min_{i,j} \min_{B_{i,j}} \frac{\partial f_j}{\partial x_i}$
<b>Inv</b> ( $B$ )	$L_S(f) := \min_i \min_{x \in B, h_i(x)=0} \langle f(x), \nabla h_i(x) \rangle$
<b>Grad</b>	$L_S(f) := \min_{V: \mathbb{R}^n \rightarrow \mathbb{R}} \ f - \nabla V\ _\Omega$

Now let  $f$  be a vector field in  $C$  satisfying a side information  $S$ . Then, for all  $\delta > 0$ , there exists  $\varepsilon > 0$  such that

$$\forall p \in C, \quad \|p - f\| \leq \varepsilon \implies L_S(p) - L_S(f) \leq \delta.$$

By Theorem 3, there exists a polynomial vector field  $p$  such that  $\|p - f\|_\Omega \leq \varepsilon$ . In particular,  $p$   $\delta$ -satisfies the side information  $S$ . By Putinar's approximation theorem, the following polynomial inequality admits an sos certificate.

$$L_S(p) \leq \frac{\delta}{2}.$$

## References

Pierre Comon, Gene Golub, Lek-Heng Lim, and Bernard Mourrain. Symmetric tensors and symmetric tensor rank. URL <http://arxiv.org/abs/0802.1681>.