Part I Introduction

1.1 Introduction of Analytical Writing Measure

The Analytical Writing measure tests your **critical thinking** and **analytical writing skills**. It assesses your ability to articulate and support complex ideas, construct and evaluate arguments, and sustain a focused and coherent discussion. It does not assess specific content knowledge.

The Analytical Writing measure consists of two separately timed analytical writing tasks:

• a **30-minute** "Analyze an Issue" task

• a **30-minute** "Analyze an Argument" task

The Issue task presents an opinion on an issue of general interest followed by specific instructions on how to respond to that issue. You are required to evaluate the issue, consider its **complexities** and develop an argument with reasons and examples to support your views.

The Argument task requires you to evaluate a given argument according to specific instructions. You will need to consider the **logical soundness** of the argument rather than agree or disagree with the position it presents.

Individuals taking the computer-based test will use a basic word processor developed by ETS. The basic word processor contains the following functionalities: insert text, delete text, cut-and-paste and undo the previous action. Tools such as a spell checker and grammar checker are not available in the ETS software, largely to maintain fairness with those examinees who must handwrite their essays at paper-based administrations.

Everyone — even the most practiced and confident of writers — should spend some time preparing for the Analytical Writing measure before arriving at the test center. It is important to understand the skills measured and how the tasks are scored. It is also useful to review the scoring guides, sample topics, scored sample essay responses and reader commentary for each task.

The tasks in the Analytical Writing measure relate to a broad range of subjects — from the fine arts and humanities to the social and physical sciences — but no task requires knowledge of specific content. In fact, each task has been tested by actual GRE® test takers to ensure that it possesses several important characteristics, including the following:

* GRE test takers, regardless of their field of study or special interests, understood the task and could easily respond to it.
* The task elicited the kinds of complex thinking and persuasive writing that university faculty consider important for success in graduate school.
* The responses were varied in content and in the way the writers developed their ideas.

1.2 Score Description

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Score** | **Percentile** |
| 6 | 99% |
| 5.5 | 98% |
| 5 | 93% |
| 4.5 | 80% |
| 4 | 56% |
| 3.5 | 38% |
| 3 | 15% |
| 2.5 | 7% |
| 2 | 2% |
| 1.5 | 1% |
| 1 | -- |
| 0.5 | -- |
| 0 | -- |

Part II The Argument Task

**2.1 Comments from ETS**

The "Analyze an Argument" task assesses your ability to understand, analyze and evaluate arguments according to specific instructions and to convey your evaluation clearly in your writing. The task consists of a brief passage in which the author makes a case for some course of action or interpretation of events by presenting claims backed by reasons and evidence.

Your task is to discuss the **logical soundness** of the author's case **by critically examining the line of reasoning and the use of evidence**. This task requires you to read the argument and instructions carefully. You might want to read the argument more than once and make brief notes about points you want to develop more fully in your response. In reading the argument, you should pay special attention to:

* what is offered as evidence, support or proof
* what is explicitly stated, claimed or concluded
* what is assumed or supposed, perhaps without justification or proof
* what is not stated, but necessarily follows from what is stated

In addition, you should consider the **structure** of the argument — the way in which these elements are linked together to form a *line of reasoning*; i.e., you should recognize the separate, sometimes implicit steps in the thinking process and consider whether the movement from each step to the next is logically sound. In tracing this line, look for transition words and phrases that suggest the author is attempting to make a logical connection (e.g., *however, thus, therefore, evidently, hence, in conclusion*).

An important part of performing well on the Argument task is remembering what you are *not* being asked to do:

* You are not being asked to discuss whether the statements in the argument are true or accurate.
* You are not being asked to agree or disagree with the position stated.
* You are not being asked to express your own views on the subject being discussed (as you were in the Issue task).

Instead, you are being asked to evaluate the logical soundness of an argument of another writer and, in doing so, to demonstrate the critical thinking, perceptive reading and analytical writing skills that university faculty consider important for success in graduate school.

"Analyze an Argument" is a critical thinking task requiring a written response. **Consequently, the analytical skills displayed in your evaluation carry great weight in determining your score;** however, the clarity with which you convey ideas is also important to your overall score.

---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Since the Argument task is meant to assess analytical writing and informal reasoning skills that you have developed throughout your education, it has been designed neither to require any specific course of study nor to advantage students with a particular type of training.

Many college textbooks on rhetoric and composition have sections on informal logic and critical thinking that might prove helpful, but even these might be more detailed and technical than the task requires. You will not be expected to know specific methods of analysis or technical terms.

For instance, in one topic an elementary school principal might conclude that new playground equipment has improved student attendance because absentee rates have declined since it was installed. You will not need to see that the principal has committed the post hoc, ergo propter hoc fallacy; you will simply need to see that there are other possible explanations for the improved attendance, to offer some common-sense examples and to suggest what would be necessary to verify the conclusion. For instance, absentee rates might have decreased because the climate was mild. This would have to be ruled out in order for the principal's conclusion to be valid.

Although you do not need to know special analytical techniques and terminology, you should be familiar with the directions for the Argument task and with certain key concepts, including the following:

* alternative explanation — a competing version of what might have caused the events in question that undercuts or qualifies the original explanation because it too can account for the observed facts
* analysis — the process of breaking something (e.g., an argument) down into its component parts in order to understand how they work together to make up the whole
* argument — a claim or a set of claims with reasons and evidence offered as support; a line of reasoning meant to demonstrate the truth or falsehood of something
* assumption — a belief, often unstated or unexamined, that someone must hold in order to maintain a particular position; something that is taken for granted but that must be true in order for the conclusion to be true
* conclusion — the end point reached by a line of reasoning, valid if the reasoning is sound; the resulting assertion
* counterexample — an example, real or hypothetical, that refutes or disproves a statement in the argument
* evaluation — an assessment of the quality of evidence and reasons in an argument and of the overall merit of an argument

An excellent way to prepare for the "Analyze an Argument" task is to practice writing on some of the published Argument topics. There is no one way to practice that is best for everyone. Some prefer to start practicing without adhering to the 30-minute time limit. If you follow this approach, take all the time you need to evaluate the argument. Regardless of the approach you take, consider the following steps:

* Carefully read the argument and the specific instructions — you might want to read them more than once.
* Identify as many of the argument's claims, conclusions and underlying assumptions as possible and evaluate their quality.
* Think of as many alternative explanations and counterexamples as you can.
* Think of what specific additional evidence might weaken or lend support to the claims.
* Ask yourself what changes in the argument would make the reasoning more sound.

Write down each of these thoughts. When you've gone as far as you can with your evaluation, look over the notes and put them in a good order for discussion (perhaps by numbering them). Then write an evaluation according to the specific instructions by fully developing each point that is relevant to those instructions. Even if you choose not to write a full essay response, you should find it helpful to practice evaluating a few of the arguments and sketching out your responses.

When you become quicker and more confident, you should practice writing some Argument responses within the 30-minute time limit so that you will have a good sense of how to pace yourself in the actual test. For example, you will not want to discuss one point so exhaustively or to provide so many equivalent examples that you run out of time to make your other main points.

You might want to get feedback on your response(s) from a writing instructor, philosophy teacher or someone who emphasizes critical thinking in his or her course. It can also be informative to trade papers on the same topic with fellow students and discuss each other's responses in terms of the scoring guide. Focus not so much on the "right scores" as on seeing how the responses meet or miss the performance standards for each score point and what you need to do to improve.

---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

You are free to organize and develop your response in any way that you think will effec- tively communicate your evaluation of the argument. Your response may, but need not, incorporate particular writing strategies learned in English composition or writing- intensive college courses. GRE readers will not be looking for a particular develop- mental strategy or mode of writing. In fact, when GRE readers are trained, they review hundreds of Argument responses that, although highly diverse in content and form, display similar levels of critical thinking and analytical writing. Readers will see, for example, some essays at the 6 score level that begin by briefly summarizing the argu- ment and then explicitly stating and developing the main points of the evaluation. The readers know that a writer can earn a high score by developing several points in an evaluation or by identifying a central feature in the argument and developing that eval- uation extensively. You might want to look at the sample Argument responses, particu- larly at the 5 and 6 score levels, to see how other writers have successfully developed and organized their responses.

You should make choices about format and organization that you think support and enhance the overall effectiveness of your evaluation. This means using as many or as few paragraphs as you consider appropriate for your response — for example, cre- ating a new paragraph when your discussion shifts to a new point of evaluation. You might want to organize your evaluation around the structure of the argument itself, discussing the argument line by line. Or you might want to first point out a central problem and then move on to discuss related weaknesses in the argument’s line of rea- soning. Similarly, you might want to use examples if they help illustrate an important point in your evaluation or move your discussion forward (remember, however, that, in terms of your ability to perform the Argument task effectively, it is your critical think- ing and analytical writing, not your ability to come up with examples, that is being assessed). What matters is not the form the response takes, but how insightfully you evaluate the argument and how articulately you communicate your evaluation to aca- demic readers within the context of the task.

**2.2 Argument Writing Instructions**

1. Write a response in which you discuss **what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument** and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.
2. Write a response in which you examine **the stated and/or unstated assumptions** of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.
3. Write a response in which you discuss **one or more alternative explanations that could rival the proposed explanation** and explain how your explanation(s) can plausibly account for the facts presented in the argument.
4. Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the **recommendation** and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.
5. Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the **advice** and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the advice.
6. Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the **recommendation** is likely to **have the predicted result**. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.
7. Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the **prediction** and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these ques- tions would help to evaluate the prediction.
8. Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be addressed in order to decide whether the **conclusion** and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to the questions would help to evaluate the conclusion.

**2.3 Composing the Introductory Paragraph**

**A、开头段的步骤：**

1）概括作者的结论

2）概括作者的论证过程

3）阐明你对作者论述的基本判断

**B、写作范本**

**范本1：归纳作者的结论与论证过程**

1. In this argument, the arguer recommends that… To justify the claim, the arguer provides the evidence that… In addition, he cites the result of a recent study that…

2. In this analysis, the arguer claims that… To substantiate the conclusion, the arguer cites the example of … In addition, the arguer assumes that…

3. In this argument, the arguer advocates that… This recommendation is based on the observation that… Meanwhile, the arguer assumes that…

4. The conclusion in this argument is that… In support of this prediction, the arguer claims that… Moreover, the arguer assumes that…

5. In an attempt to…, the article claims that… The evidence cited is that… Additionally, the author points out that…

6. Basing his judgment on the fact that AAAAA, the fact that BBBBB and the statistical evidence that CCCCC, the arguer/author of this article reaches the conclusion that DDDDD.

7. In this argument that author reaches the conclusion that… The author also cites… as an example in support of this recommendation.

8. In this argument, the author concludes that… To support his conclusion, the author points out that… In addition, the author reasons that… Furthermore, he also assumes that…

9. The conclusion of this argument is that… The author employs several lines of reasoning to reach this conclusion. In the first, the author reasons that… In the second, the author points out that…

10. The speaker proposes that… XXX reasons are offered in support of this argument. First,… Second,…

11. In this argument, the author concludes that… The author’s line of reasoning is that…

12. In this argument, the author concludes that… The author bases this conclusion on the following claims about AAAAA:…

**范本2：概括作者存在的逻辑错误**

**直接指出错误**

1. A careful examination of this argument would reveal how groundless it is.

2. This line of reasoning in unconvincing for a couple of reasons.

3. This argument is problematic/questionable for a couple of reasons.

4. The argument suffers from several critical fallacies.

5. The argument is fraught with vague, oversimplified and unwarranted assumptions.

6. The argument is unconvincing for several critical flaws.

7. The argument is unfounded because the speaker oversimplifies the problem and its solutions.

8. This argument is unconvincing because several questionable assumptions must be made for the stated evidence to support the author’s conclusion.

**让步指出错误**

1. At first glance, the argument appears to be somehow plausible, but further reflection reveals that it suffers from at least XX logic flaws.

2. At first glance, the author’s argument appears to be somehow appealing, while a close examination will reveal how groundless it is. We do not have a look very far to see the invalidity of this argument. The argument is problematic for the following reasons.

3. At first glance, the author’s argument appears to be somewhat convincing, but further reflection reveals that it omits some important concerns that should be addressed to substantiate the argument.

4. While the author’s argument has some merit, it suffers from XX critical problems.

**C、开头段写作参考范例**

|  |
| --- |
| **(9-88-90)** Nature's Way, a chain of stores selling health food and other health-related products, is opening its next franchise in the town of Plainsville. The store should prove to be very successful: Nature's Way franchises tend to be most profitable in areas where residents lead healthy lives, and clearly Plainsville is such an area. Plainsville merchants report that sales of running shoes and exercise clothing are at all-time highs. The local health club has more members than ever, and the weight training and aerobics classes are always full. Finally, Plainsville's schoolchildren represent a new generation of potential customers: these schoolchildren are required to participate in a fitness-for-life program, which emphasizes the benefits of regular exercise at an early age. |

**In this memo** the vice president of Nature's Way (NW), a chain of stores selling health food and health-related products, recommends opening a store in Plamesville. **To support this recommendation the vice president cites the following facts about** Plainesville: **(1)** sales of exercise shoes and clothing are at all-time highs; **(2)** the local health club is more popular than ever; and **(3)** the city's schoolchildren are required to participate in a fitness program. **Close scrutiny of each of these facts, however, reveals that none of them lend credible support to the recommendation.**

|  |
| --- |
| **(4)** Of the two leading real estate firms in our town---Adams Realty and Fitch Realty---Adams is clearly superior. Adams has 40 real estate agents. In contrast, Fitch has 25, many of whom work only part-time. Moreover, Adams' revenue last year was twice as high as that of Fitch, and included home sales that averaged $168,000, compared to Fitch's $144,000. Homes listed with Adams sell faster as well: ten years ago, I listed my home with Fitch and it took more than four months to sell; last year, when I sold another home, I listed it with Adams, and it took only one month. Thus, if you want to sell your home quickly and at a good price, you should use Adams. |

**The author of this argument claims that** Adams Realty is superior to Fitch Realty. **To support this claim** the author cites certain statistics about the number and working hours of the firms' agents, **and** the number and sales prices of homes sold by the two firms. **The author also cites** anecdotal evidence involving her own experience with Fitch and Adams. **Close scrutiny of this evidence reveals that it lends little credible support for the author's assertion.**

|  |
| --- |
| **(25-100-102-164)** “A jazz music club in Monroe would be a tremendously profitable enterprise. Currently, the nearest jazz club is 65 miles away; thus, the proposed new jazz club in Monroe, the C-Note, would have the local market all to itself. Plus, jazz is extremely popular in Monroe: over 100,000 people attended Monroe's annual jazz festival last summer; several well-known jazz musicians live in Monroe; and the highest-rated radio program in Monroe is ‘Jazz Nightly’, which airs every weeknight at 7 P.M. Finally, a nationwide study indicates that the typical jazz fan spends close to $1,000 per year on jazz entertainment.” |

**This loan applicant claims** that a jazz club in Monroe would be a profitable venture. **To support this claim** the applicant points out that Monroe has no other jazz clubs. **He also cites** various other evidence that jazz is popular among Monroe residents. **Careful examination of this supporting evidence, however, reveals that it lends little credible support to the applicant's claim.**

|  |
| --- |
| **(12)** Fifteen years ago, Omega University implemented a new procedure that encouraged students to evaluate the teaching effectiveness of all their professors. Since that time, Omega professors have begun to assign higher grades in their classes, and overall student grade averages at Omega have risen by 30 percent. Potential employers, looking at this dramatic rise in grades, believe that grades at Omega are inflated and do not accurately reflect student achievement; as a result, Omega graduates have not been as successful at getting jobs as have graduates from nearby Alpha University. To enable its graduates to secure better jobs, Omega University should terminate student evaluation of professors. |

**In this memo** Omega University's dean points out that Omega graduates are less successful in getting jobs than Alpha University graduates, despite the fact that during the past 15 years the overall grade average of Omega students has risen by 30%. **The dean also points out that** during the past 15 years Omega has encouraged its students, by way of a particular procedure, to evaluate the effectiveness of their professors. **The dean reasons that** this procedure explains the grade-average increase, which in turn has created a perception among employers that Omega graduates are less qualified for jobs. **On the basis of this line of reasoning the dean concludes that** to enable Omega graduates to find better jobs Omega must terminate its professor-evaluation procedure. **This argument contains several logical flaws, which render it unconvincing.**

**2.4 Composing the Body Paragraph**

1. **FALLACIES IN INDUCTIVE REASONING**

|  |
| --- |
| **1.1 Hasty Generalization** |

|  |
| --- |
| **(15-51-130-131-133)** “Recently, butter has been replaced by margarine in Happy Pancake House restaurants throughout the southwestern United States. This change, however, has had little impact on our customers. In fact, only about 2 percent of customers have complained, indicating that an average of 98 people out of 100 are happy with the change. Furthermore, many servers have reported that a number of customers who ask for butter do not complain when they are given margarine instead. Clearly, either these customers do not distinguish butter from margarine or they use the term 'butter' to refer to either butter or margarine.” |

Finally, even if HPH's Southwest customers are happy with the change, **the speaker unfairly assumes that customers in other regions will respond similarly to it**. **Perhaps** Southwestemers are generally less concerned than other people about whether they eat margarine or butter. **Or perhaps** Southwestemers actually prefer margarine to butter, in contrast to prevailing tastes elsewhere. **Or perhaps** Southwestemers have relatively few choices when it comes to pancake restaurants.

|  |
| --- |
| **(22-119-120-138)** According to a recent report, cheating among college and university students is on the rise. However, Groveton College has successfully reduced student cheating by adopting an honor code, which calls for students to agree not to cheat in their academic endeavors and to notify a faculty member if they suspect that others have cheated. Groveton's honor code replaced a system in which teachers closely monitored students; under that system, teachers reported an average of thirty cases of cheating per year. In the first year the honor code was in place, students reported twenty-one cases of cheating; five years later, this figure had dropped to fourteen. Moreover, in a recent survey, a majority of Groveton students said that they would be less likely to cheat with an honor code in place than without. Thus, all colleges and universities should adopt honor codes similar to Groveton's in order to decrease cheating among students. |

**The author's recommendation that** other colleges follow Groveton's example **depends on the additional assumption that** Groveton **is typical** in ways relevant to the incidence of cheating. **However, this is not necessarily the case.** For instance, perhaps Groveton students are more or less likely to report cheating, or to cheat under an honor system, than typical college students. **Lacking evidence that** Groveton students **are typical in these respects, the argument is indefensible.**

|  |
| --- |
| **1.2 Misapplied Generalization** |

|  |
| --- |
| **(25-100-102-164)** “A jazz music club in Monroe would be a tremendously profitable enterprise. Currently, the nearest jazz club is 65 miles away; thus, the proposed new jazz club in Monroe, the C-Note, would have the local market all to itself. Plus, jazz is extremely popular in Monroe: over 100,000 people attended Monroe's annual jazz festival last summer; several well-known jazz musicians live in Monroe; and the highest-rated radio program in Monroe is ‘Jazz Nightly’, which airs every weeknight at 7 P.M. Finally, a nationwide study indicates that the typical jazz fan spends close to $1,000 per year on jazz entertainment.” |

Finally, the nationwide study showing that the average jazz fan spends $1,000 each year on jazz entertainment **would lend support to the applicant's claim only if Monroe residents typify jazz fans nationwide**. However, the applicant provides no credible evidence that this is the case.

|  |
| --- |
| **(63)** “Throughout the country last year, as more and more children below the age of nine participated in youth-league sports, over 40,000 of these young players suffered injuries. When interviewed for a recent study, youth-league soccer players in several major cities also reported psychological pressure exerted by coaches and parents to win games. Furthermore, education experts say that long practice sessions for these sports take away time that could be used for academic activities. Since the disadvantages outweigh any advantages, we in Parkville should discontinue organized athletic competition for children under nine.” |

**One problem with the argument is that it assumes that the nationwide statistics about** the incidence of sports injuries among youngsters **applies equally to** Parkville's children. **Yet this might not be the case, for a variety of possible reasons.** **Perhaps** Parkville maintains more stringent safety standards than the national norm; **or perhaps** children's sporting events in Parkville are better supervised by adults, **or** supervised by more adults. **Without ruling out such possibilities, the author cannot justifiably conclude that** Parkville has a sports-injury problem to begin with.

|  |
| --- |
| **1.3 False Analogy** |

|  |
| --- |
| **(77)** "Two years ago, the nearby town of Ocean View built a new municipal golf course and resort hotel. During the past two years, tourism in Ocean View has increased, new businesses have opened there, and Ocean View's tax revenues have risen by 30 percent. Therefore, the best way to improve Hopewell's economy — and generate additional tax revenues — is to build a golf course and resort hotel similar to those in Ocean View." |

Finally, **the mayor's argument rests on the unsubstantiated assumption that** Hopewell **and** Ocean View **are sufficiently alike in ways that** might affect the economic impact of a new golf course and hotel. Hopewell might lack the sort of natural environment that would attract more tourists and new businesses to the town--regardless of its new golf course and hotel. For that matter, perhaps Hopewell already contains several resort hotels and golf courses that are not utilized to their capacity. If so, building yet another golf course and hotel might amount to a misallocation of the town's resources--and actually harm the town's overall economy.

|  |
| --- |
| **(97)** The following appeared in an e-mail sent by the marketing director of the Classical Shakespeare Theatre of Bardville.  "Over the past ten years, there has been a 20 percent decline in the size of the average audience at Classical Shakespeare Theatre productions. In spite of increased advertising, we are attracting fewer and fewer people to our shows, causing our profits to decrease significantly. We must take action to attract new audience members. The best way to do so is by instituting a 'Shakespeare in the Park' program this summer. Two years ago the nearby Avon Repertory Company started a 'Free Plays in the Park' program, and its profits have increased 10 percent since then. Therefore, I recommend that we start a 'Shakespeare in the Park' program of our own. If we do so, I predict that our profits will also see a significant increase." |

**Another question that could shed light on the marketing director's recommendation is whether what worked for Avon will work for the Classical Shakespeare Theatre.** **This is an extremely complex question since there are a huge number of variables at play.** For example, if Avon specializes in affordable, family-friendly shows with simple sets and costumes, they may not only have an easier (and cheaper) time than CST in adapting their plays for performance in the park, but their target audience may also be more likely to attend both the "Free Plays in the Park" and their regular performances. On the other hand, if CST typically produces lavish productions with big-name actors and high ticket prices, it's possible that it will be difficult and expensive to stage their plays outdoors. It's also possible that CST's target audience consists largely of people who are unlikely to attend an outdoor performance. If this is the case, the program is much less likely to be successful in increasing CST's profits.

|  |
| --- |
| **1.4 All Things are Equal** |

|  |
| --- |
| **(8)** “To serve the housing needs of our students, Buckingham College should build a number of new dormitories. Buckingham's enrollment is growing and, based on current trends, will double over the next 50 years, thus making existing dormitory space inadequate. Moreover, the average rent for an apartment in our town has risen in recent years. Consequently, students will find it increasingly difficult to afford off-campus housing. Finally, attractive new dormitories would make prospective students more likely to enroll at Buckingham.” |

Secondly, the dean assumes that **this current trend** in rental rates **will continue in the future**; yet the dean **offers no evidence to substantiate this assumption**. These rates are a function of supply and demand, and it is entirely possible that construction of apartment houses will increase in the future, thereby reducing rental rates along with the need for an additional dormitory. **Without considering this possible scenario,** the dean **cannot justifiably conclude that** an additional dormitory is needed to meet future demand.

|  |
| --- |
| **(22-119-120-138)** According to a recent report, cheating among college and university students is on the rise. However, Groveton College has successfully reduced student cheating by adopting an honor code, which calls for students to agree not to cheat in their academic endeavors and to notify a faculty member if they suspect that others have cheated. Groveton's honor code replaced a system in which teachers closely monitored students; under that system, teachers reported an average of thirty cases of cheating per year. In the first year the honor code was in place, students reported twenty-one cases of cheating; five years later, this figure had dropped to fourteen. Moreover, in a recent survey, a majority of Groveton students said that they would be less likely to cheat with an honor code in place than without. Thus, all colleges and universities should adopt honor codes similar to Groveton's in order to decrease cheating among students. |

**The argument also assumes that during the five-year period all other conditions possibly affecting** the reported incidence of cheating at Groveton **remained unchanged**. Such conditions include the number of Groveton students and the overall integrity of the student body. After five years **it is entirely possible that** these conditions have changed, **and that** the reported decrease in cheating is attributable to one or more such changes. **Thus, without ruling out such alternative explanations** for the reported decrease, **the author cannot convince me that** the honor code has in fact contributed to a decline in the incidence of cheating at Groveton.

1. **CONFUSION IN CAUSAL REASONING**

|  |
| --- |
| **2.1 Causal Oversimplification** |

|  |
| --- |
| **(85)** In a study of the reading habits of Waymarsh citizens conducted by the University of Waymarsh, most respondents said that they preferred literary classics as reading material. However, a second study conducted by the same researchers found that the type of book most frequently checked out of each of the public libraries in Waymarsh was the mystery novel. Therefore, it can be concluded that the respondents in the first study had misrepresented their reading habits. |

Thirdly, **the argument fails to account for the possibility that** literary classics, the book type that the first study's respondents indicated they preferred, are not readily available at LeeviUe's public libraries --- or at least not as readily available as mystery novels. Experience informs me that this is likely, because mystery novels are in greater supply and are cheaper for libraries to acquire than literary classics. **If this is the case, it provides an alternative explanation for the fact that** more mystery novels than literary classics are checked out from Leeville's public libraries.

|  |
| --- |
| **(53-144-151)** Benton City residents have adopted healthier lifestyles. A recent survey of city residents shows that the eating habits of city residents conform more closely to government nutritional recommendations than they did ten years ago. During those ten years, local sales of food products containing kiran, a substance that a scientific study has shown reduces cholesterol, have increased fourfold, while sales of sulia, a food rarely eaten by the healthiest residents, have declined dramatically. Because of these positive changes in the eating habits of Benton City residents, we predict that the obesity rate in the city will soon be well below the national average. |

Second, **the argument relies on the dubious assumption that** following the government's nutrition recommendations promotes health **to a greater extent than** following any other nutrition regime. **It is entirely possible that** the dietary habits of Benton citizens were healthier ten years ago than they are now. **Thus without evidence to substantiate this assumption the speaker cannot reasonably conclude that** the diet of Benton's citizens has become more nutritional.

Third, **the speaker assumes too hastily tha**t increasing sales of products with kiran indicates healthier eating habits. Perhaps Benton citizens are eating these foods in amounts or at intervals that undermine the health benefits of kiran. **Without ruling out this possibility the speaker cannot reasonably conclude with any confidence that** increased kiran consumption has resulted in improved health for Benton's citizens.

|  |
| --- |
| **(17)** "To reverse a decline in listener numbers, our owners have decided that WWAC must change from its current rock-music format. The decline has occurred despite population growth in our listening area, but that growth has resulted mainly from people moving here after their retirement. We must make listeners of these new residents. We could switch to a music format tailored to their tastes, but a continuing decline in local sales of recorded music suggests limited interest in music. Instead we should change to a news and talk format, a form of radio that is increasingly popular in our area." |

First, **the manager unfairly assumes that** the decline in the number of WWAC listeners **is attributable to** the station's current format. **Perhaps the decline is due instead to** WWAC's specific mix of R&R music, or to transmission problems at the station. **Without ruling out these and other feasible reasons for the decline, the manager cannot convince me that** changing the format would reverse the trend.

Secondly, **the manager's assumption that** older people favor all-news programming **is unsupported**. **Perhaps** WWAC listeners are dedicated R&R fans who will continue to prefer this type of programming as they grow older. **Or perhaps** as WWAC's regular audience ages it will prefer a mix of R&R and news programming--rather than one format to the total exclusion of the other. **Besides**, the number of young people in the listening area might be increasing as well. **In short, the mere fact that** the number of older people in WWAC's listening area is increasing **suggests nothing about** WWAC's best programming strategy.

Thirdly, a decrease in local music recording sales **is scant evidence that** WWAC should eschew music in favor of an all-news format. Although overall music sales are in decline, **perhaps** sales of R&R recordings are actually increasing while sales of all other types of music recordings are decreasing. **For that matter**, perhaps people who buy music recordings **are generally not the same people** who listen to music on the radio. **Either scenario, if true, would seriously undermine the manager's contention that** WWAC should discontinue R&R programming.

|  |
| --- |
| **(50)** An ancient, traditional remedy for insomnia — the scent of lavender flowers — has now been proved effective. In a recent study, 30 volunteers with chronic insomnia slept each night for three weeks on lavender-scented pillows in a controlled room where their sleep was monitored electronically. During the first week, volunteers continued to take their usual sleeping medication. They slept soundly but wakened feeling tired. At the beginning of the second week, the volunteers discontinued their sleeping medication. During that week, they slept less soundly than the previous week and felt even more tired. During the third week, the volunteers slept longer and more soundly than in the previous two weeks. Therefore, the study proves that lavender cures insomnia within a short period of time. |

**A threshold problem involves the definition of** insomnia. **The speaker fails to define this critical term.** If insomnia is defined as an inability to fall asleep, then how soundly or long a person sleeps, or how fired a person feels after sleep, is irrelevant to whether the person suffers from insomnia. **In short, without a dear definition of insomnia it is impossible to assess the strength of the argument.**

**Another fundamental problem is that the speaker omits to inform us about** the test subjects' sleep patterns just prior to the experiment. **It is impossible to conclude with any confidence that** the subjects benefited from sleeping on lavender-scented pillows without comparing how they slept with the pillows to how they sleep without them.

**Yet another problem involves the fact that** subjects slept more soundly and awakened less fired the first week than the second, and that they used their regular sleep medication the first week but not the second. **This evidence tends to show only that the subjects' other sleep medications were effective; it proves nothing about the effectiveness of lavender.**

**Two final problems with the argument involve the experimental process.** **The experiment's results are reliable only if all other factors that** might affect sleep patterns **remained constant** during the three-week period, **and if the number of experimental subjects is statistically significant**. **Without evidence of the experiment's methodological and statistical reliability, the speaker's conclusion is unjustifiable.**

|  |
| --- |
| **2.2 Post hoc, ergo propter hoc** |

|  |
| --- |
| **(12)** Fifteen years ago, Omega University implemented a new procedure that encouraged students to evaluate the teaching effectiveness of all their professors. Since that time, Omega professors have begun to assign higher grades in their classes, and overall student grade averages at Omega have risen by 30 percent. Potential employers, looking at this dramatic rise in grades, believe that grades at Omega are inflated and do not accurately reflect student achievement; as a result, Omega graduates have not been as successful at getting jobs as have graduates from nearby Alpha University. To enable its graduates to secure better jobs, Omega University should terminate student evaluation of professors. |

The argument also **assumes unfairly that the grade-average increase is the result of the evaluation procedure--rather than some other phenomenon**. The dean **ignores a host of other possible explanations for the increase**--such as a trend at Omega toward higher admission standards, or higher quality instruction or facilities. **Without ruling out all other possible explanations for** the grade-average increase, the dean **cannot convince me that** by terminating the evaluation procedure Omega would curb its perceived grade inflation let alone help its graduates get jobs.

|  |
| --- |
| **(97)** The following appeared in an e-mail sent by the marketing director of the Classical Shakespeare Theatre of Bardville.  "Over the past ten years, there has been a 20 percent decline in the size of the average audience at Classical Shakespeare Theatre productions. In spite of increased advertising, we are attracting fewer and fewer people to our shows, causing our profits to decrease significantly. We must take action to attract new audience members. The best way to do so is by instituting a 'Shakespeare in the Park' program this summer. Two years ago the nearby Avon Repertory Company started a 'Free Plays in the Park' program, and its profits have increased 10 percent since then. Therefore, I recommend that we start a 'Shakespeare in the Park' program of our own. If we do so, I predict that our profits will also see a significant increase." |

**One of the most obvious questions they need to ask is whether** Avon's increased profits **were the result of** its "Free Plays in the Park" program. **In order to answer this question, they would need to know** whether Avon's increased profits came from increased ticket sales at Avon's regular shows and whether the rise in ticket sales came from new customers who had a good experience at the "Free Plays in the Park" program. **It's possible that** Avon's increased profits **were the result of factors other than** increased ticket sales that happened to coincide with the "Free Plays" program (e.g., lowering operating costs or increasing revenue from concessions). **If** Avon's increased profits **are actually the result of** increased attendance, CST would still need to determine if increased ticket sales resulted from an increase in the quality of shows or actors performing at Avon or some other factor besides the "Free Plays in the Park" program.

|  |
| --- |
| **2.3 Cum hoc, ergo propter hoc** |

|  |
| --- |
| **(3)** “Over the past two years, the number of shoppers in Central Plaza has been steadily decreasing while the popularity of skateboarding has increased dramatically. Many Central Plaza store owners believe that the decrease in their business is due to the number of skateboard users in the plaza. There has also been a dramatic increase in the amount of litter and vandalism throughout the plaza. Thus, we recommend that the city prohibit skateboarding in Central Plaza. If skateboarding is prohibited here, we predict that business in Central Plaza will return to its previously high levels.” |

Secondly, **the editorial assumes too hastily that** the Plaza's decline **is attributable to** the skateboarders--**rather than to some other phenomenon**. **Perhaps** the Plaza's primary appeal in its glory days had to do with particular shops or eateries, which were eventually replaced by less appealing ones. **Or perhaps** the crime rate in surrounding areas has risen dramatically, for reasons unrelated to the skateboarders' presence at the Plaza. **Without ruling out these and other alternative explanations for** the Plaza's decline, **the editorial's author cannot convince me that** a skateboard ban would reverse that decline.

|  |
| --- |
| **(20)** "Over the past year, our late-night news program has devoted increased time to national news and less time to weather and local news. In addition, local businesses that used to advertise during our late-night news program have just canceled their advertising contracts with us. Therefore, in order to attract more viewers to the program and to avoid losing any further advertising revenues, we should restore the time devoted to weather and local news to its former level." |

Additionally, stated in the memorandum was the fact that local businesses had just canceled their advertising contracts with the station. **An assumption being made is that the reason** businesses were pulling their ads **was directly related to** the shortened segments of the weather and local news. Considering the fact that more than one business just pulled their ad, other factors could have been involved, such as any controversy that the station's national news may have recently brought up. **If the manager could establish that** businesses discontinued advertising contracts **specifically because** they were displeased with the change in news coverage, and that the remaining advertisers are on the verge of leaving if coverage of weather and local news is not increased, **that information would help eliminate other possible explanations**.

|  |
| --- |
| **2.4 Correlation to Causation** |

|  |
| --- |
| **(43)** "Two years ago, consultants predicted that West Egg's landfill, which is used for garbage disposal, would be completely filled within five years. During the past two years, however, the town's residents have been recycling twice as much material as they did in previous years. Next month the amount of recycled material—which includes paper, plastic, and metal—should further increase, since charges for pickup of other household garbage will double. Furthermore, over 90 percent of the respondents to a recent survey said that they would do more recycling in the future. Because of our town's strong commitment to recycling, the available space in our landfill should last for considerably longer than predicted." |

**The argument's chief problem is that it relies on numerous unsubstantiated assumptions about the 6-month study**. **One such assumption is that** the participants' regular and punctual attendance **was attributable to the fact** that breakfasts were provided. **Yet logic and common sense inform me that the results might have been due instead to one or more other factors.** Perhaps these particular students were compelled to show up punctually and regularly for some other reason. Perhaps the 100 participants were comparatively reliable and disciplined children who are less likely in any event to be late for school. Or perhaps the participants are relatively healthy and therefore less likely to be absent from school than the average student. Moreover, it is uncertain whether the program's participants even ate the breakfasts that the trial program provided. **In short, without considering and ruling out alternative explanations for the study's results, the superintendent cannot justifiably conclude that the results are due to the fact that** breakfasts were provided to participating students.

1. **FALLACIES CONCERNING NECESSITY**

|  |
| --- |
| **3.1 False Dilemma** |

|  |
| --- |
| **(15-51-130-131-133)** “Recently, butter has been replaced by margarine in Happy Pancake House restaurants throughout the southwestern United States. This change, however, has had little impact on our customers. In fact, only about 2 percent of customers have complained, indicating that an average of 98 people out of 100 are happy with the change. Furthermore, many servers have reported that a number of customers who ask for butter do not complain when they are given margarine instead. Clearly, either these customers do not distinguish butter from margarine or they use the term 'butter' to refer to either butter or margarine.” |

Thirdly, **the speaker unfairly assumes that** HPH customers unhappy with the change generally complain about it. Perhaps many such customers express their displeasure simply by not returning to the restaurant. The greater the percentage of such customers, the weaker the argument's evidence as a sign of customer satisfaction with the change.

|  |
| --- |
| **(170)** The surface of a section of Route 101, paved just two years ago by Good Intentions Roadways, is now badly cracked with a number of dangerous potholes. In another part of the state, a section of Route 40, paved by Appian Roadways more than four years ago, is still in good condition. In a demonstration of their continuing commitment to quality, Appian Roadways recently purchased state-of-the-art paving machinery and hired a new quality-control manager. Therefore, I recommend hiring Appian Roadways to construct the access roads for all our new shopping malls. I predict that our Appian access roads will not have to be repaired for at least four years. |

Finally, **the vice president's recommendation rests on the unlikely assumption that** the company **has only two alternatives** - Good Intentions and Appian. **In all likelihood** the company can engage one of many other paving contractors instead. Thus to the extent the vice president recommends Appian over not just Good Intentions but over any other contractor the recommendation is unwarranted.

|  |
| --- |
| **3.2 One sidedness** |

|  |
| --- |
| **(63)** “Throughout the country last year, as more and more children below the age of nine participated in youth-league sports, over 40,000 of these young players suffered injuries. When interviewed for a recent study, youth-league soccer players in several major cities also reported psychological pressure exerted by coaches and parents to win games. Furthermore, education experts say that long practice sessions for these sports take away time that could be used for academic activities. Since the disadvantages outweigh any advantages, we in Parkville should discontinue organized athletic competition for children under nine.” |

A third problem with the argument is that **it unfairly assumes that children do not benefit academically from participating in competitive sports**. **It is entirely possible that** such sports provide children with the sort of break from academics that helps them to be more productive academically. **It is also possible that** the competitive drive that these sports might instill in young children carries over to their academics and spurs them on to perform well in school. **Without considering such potential academic benefits, the author cannot reasonably conclude that** for young children the disadvantages of participating in athletic competition outweigh the benefits.

1. **EVIDENCE FLAWS**

* **ETS tells you how to interprete data?**

*“Some arguments contain numbers, percentages, or statistics that are offered as evi- dence in support of the argument’s conclusion. For example, an argument might claim that a certain community event is less popular this year than it was last year because only 100 people attended this year in comparison with 150 last year, a 33 percent decline in attendance. It is important to remember that you are not being asked to do a mathematical task with the numbers, percentages, or statistics. Instead you should evaluate these as evidence intended to support the conclusion. In the example above, the conclusion is that a community event has become less popular. You should ask yourself: does the difference between 100 people and 150 people support that conclu- sion? Note that, in this case, there are other possible explanations; for example, the weather might have been much worse this year, this year’s event might have been held at an inconvenient time, the cost of the event might have gone up this year, or there might have been another popular event this year at the same time. Each of these could explain the difference in attendance, and thus would weaken the conclusion that the event was “less popular.” Similarly, percentages might support or weaken a conclusion depending on what actual numbers the percentages represent. Consider the claim that the drama club at a school deserves more funding because its membership has increased by 100 percent. This 100 percent increase could be significant if there had been 100 members and now there are 200 members, whereas the increase would be much less significant if there had been 5 members and now there are 10. Remember that any numbers, percentages, or statistics in Argument tasks are used only as evi- dence in support of a conclusion, and you should always consider whether they actu- ally support the conclusion.”*

|  |
| --- |
| * 1. **Specious Evidence** |

|  |
| --- |
| **(9-88-90)** Nature's Way, a chain of stores selling health food and other health-related products, is opening its next franchise in the town of Plainsville. The store should prove to be very successful: Nature's Way franchises tend to be most profitable in areas where residents lead healthy lives, and clearly Plainsville is such an area. Plainsville merchants report that sales of running shoes and exercise clothing are at all-time highs. The local health club has more members than ever, and the weight training and aerobics classes are always full. Finally, Plainsville's schoolchildren represent a new generation of potential customers: these schoolchildren are required to participate in a fitness-for-life program, which emphasizes the benefits of regular exercise at an early age. |

First, strong sales of exercise apparel **do not necessarily indicate that** Plainesville residents would be interested in NW's products, **or that** these residents are interested in exercising. Perhaps exercise apparel happens to be fashionable at the moment, or inexpensive compared to other types of clothing. For that matter, perhaps the stronger-than-usual sales are due to increasing sales to tourists. **In short, without ruling out other possible reasons for the strong sales the vice president cannot convince me on the basis of them that** Plainesville residents are exercising regularly, **let alone that** they would be interested in buying the sorts of food and other products that NW sells.

|  |
| --- |
| **(4)** Of the two leading real estate firms in our town---Adams Realty and Fitch Realty---Adams is clearly superior. Adams has 40 real estate agents. In contrast, Fitch has 25, many of whom work only part-time. Moreover, Adams' revenue last year was twice as high as that of Fitch, and included home sales that averaged $168,000, compared to Fitch's $144,000. Homes listed with Adams sell faster as well: ten years ago, I listed my home with Fitch and it took more than four months to sell; last year, when I sold another home, I listed it with Adams, and it took only one month. Thus, if you want to sell your home quickly and at a good price, you should use Adams. |

The author bases her claim partly on the fact that Adams has more agents than Fitch, and that many of Fitch's agents work only part-time. **However, the author provides no evidence that** the quality of a real-estate firm is directly proportional to the number of its agents or the number of hours per week that its agents work. **Lacking such evidence, it is equally possible that** a smaller firm is more effective than a larger one, and that a part-time agent is more effective than a full-time agent. **Besides, the author does not provide any information about** how many Adams agents work part-time.

**In further support of her claim the author points out that** the average sales price of a home sold by Adams is greater than the average price of a home sold by Fitch. **However, this evidence shows only that** the homes that Adams sells are more valuable on average than the ones that Fitch sells, **not that** Adams is more effective in selling homes than Fitch. **Moreover, it is possible that** a few relatively high-priced or low-priced properties skewed these averages, **rendering any conclusions about** the comparative quality of the two firms **based on these averages unfair**.

|  |
| --- |
| **(25-100-102-164)** “A jazz music club in Monroe would be a tremendously profitable enterprise. Currently, the nearest jazz club is 65 miles away; thus, the proposed new jazz club in Monroe, the C-Note, would have the local market all to itself. Plus, jazz is extremely popular in Monroe: over 100,000 people attended Monroe's annual jazz festival last summer; several well-known jazz musicians live in Monroe; and the highest-rated radio program in Monroe is ‘Jazz Nightly’, which airs every weeknight at 7 P.M. Finally, a nationwide study indicates that the typical jazz fan spends close to $1,000 per year on jazz entertainment.” |

The popularity of Monroe's annual jazz festival and of its nightly jazz radio show **might appear to lend support to the applicant's claim**. **However, it is entirely possible that** the vast majority of festival attendees are out-of-town visitors. **Moreover, the author provides no evidence that** radio listeners would be interested in going out to hear live jazz. For that matter, the radio program might actually pose competition for the C-Note club, especially considering that the program airs during the evening.

**Nor does the mere fact that** several well-known jazz musicians live in Monroe lend significant support to the applicant's claim. **It is entirely possible that** these musicians perform elsewhere, perhaps at the club located 65 miles away. This would go a long way toward explaining why Monroe does not currently have a jazz club, and **it would weaken the applicant's assertion that** the C-Note would be profitable.

|  |
| --- |
| * 1. **Statistical Evidence** |

1. **Sample**

|  |
| --- |
| **(43)** "Two years ago, consultants predicted that West Egg's landfill, which is used for garbage disposal, would be completely filled within five years. During the past two years, however, the town's residents have been recycling twice as much material as they did in previous years. Next month the amount of recycled material—which includes paper, plastic, and metal—should further increase, since charges for pickup of other household garbage will double. Furthermore, over 90 percent of the respondents to a recent survey said that they would do more recycling in the future. Because of our town's strong commitment to recycling, the available space in our landfill should last for considerably longer than predicted." |

Even if the participants' punctual and regular attendance was due to the breakfasts provided to them, **the statistical reliability of the trial program's results is questionable**. **The number of participants**, 100, **might constitute an insufficiently small sample to draw any reliable conclusions about** how district students 5-12 years of age would behave under similar conditions---as a group. **The larger this group compared to the sample of 100 participants, the less reliable the study's results. Also, the sample might be unrepresentative of district students as a group.** For example, perhaps the 100 participants happened to be children who eat small dinners and are therefore hungry for breakfast.

Even if the 100 participants **are statistically representative of** district students 5-12 years of age, **one cannot infer that** older, secondary-school students **would behave similarly under similar conditions**. Yet by concluding that the district should implement the program for its secondary-school students as well, **the superintendent seems to assume without supporting evidence that this is the case**. **In short, lacking assurances that** the 100 participants **are statistically representative of all** district students, **the superintendent cannot draw any reliable conclusions based on the study**.

1. **Respondent**

|  |
| --- |
| **(43)** "Two years ago, consultants predicted that West Egg's landfill, which is used for garbage disposal, would be completely filled within five years. During the past two years, however, the town's residents have been recycling twice as much material as they did in previous years. Next month the amount of recycled material—which includes paper, plastic, and metal—should further increase, since charges for pickup of other household garbage will double. Furthermore, over 90 percent of the respondents to a recent survey said that they would do more recycling in the future. Because of our town's strong commitment to recycling, the available space in our landfill should last for considerably longer than predicted." |

Finally, **the mayor provides no evidence that the survey's respondents are representative of the overall group of people** whose trash goes to the city's landfill. **Lacking such evidence, it is entirely possible that people inclined to recycle were more willing to respond to the survey than other people were**. **In short, without better evidence that the survey is statistically reliable the mayor cannot rely on it to draw any firm conclusions about** the overall recycling commitment of West Egg residents -- let alone about how quickly the landfill will reach capacity.

1. **Information Too Vague**

|  |
| --- |
| **(16)** In surveys Mason City residents rank water sports (swimming, boating and fishing) among their favorite recreational activities. The Mason River flowing through the city is rarely used for these pursuits, however, and the city park department devotes little of its budget to maintaining riverside recreational facilities. For years there have been complaints from residents about the quality of the river's water and the river's smell. In response, the state has recently announced plans to clean up Mason River. Use of the river for water sports is therefore sure to increase. The city government should for that reason devote more money in this year's budget to riverside recreational facilities. |

Citing surveys of city residents, the author reports city resident's love of water sports. **It is not clear, however, the scope and validity of that survey.** For example, the survey could have asked residents if they prefer using the river for water sports or would like to see a hydroelectric dam built, which may have swayed residents toward river sports. **The sample may not have been representative of city residents**, asking only those residents who live upon the river. The survey may have been 10 pages long, with 2 questions dedicated to river sports. **We just do not know. Unless the survey is fully representative, valid, and reliable, it can not be used to effectively back the author's argument.**

**2.5 Composing the Concluding Paragraph**

|  |
| --- |
| **(4)** Of the two leading real estate firms in our town---Adams Realty and Fitch Realty---Adams is clearly superior. Adams has 40 real estate agents. In contrast, Fitch has 25, many of whom work only part-time. Moreover, Adams' revenue last year was twice as high as that of Fitch, and included home sales that averaged $168,000, compared to Fitch's $144,000. Homes listed with Adams sell faster as well: ten years ago, I listed my home with Fitch and it took more than four months to sell; last year, when I sold another home, I listed it with Adams, and it took only one month. Thus, if you want to sell your home quickly and at a good price, you should use Adams. |

In conclusion, the author's evidence lends little credible support to her claim. To persuade me that Adams is better than Fitch, the author would need to provide clear evidence that individual Adams agents are more effective in selling homes than individual Fitch agents, and that the disparity in home sales and sales price is attributable to that difference. Finally, to better evaluate the author's claim we would need more information comparing the percentage of agents working part-time at Fitch versus Adams. We would also need more information about the comparative attractiveness of the author's two homes, and the extent to which the residential real-estate market changed during the decade between the sale of these two homes.

|  |
| --- |
| **(88-90)** The following appeared in a memorandum written by the vice president of Health Naturally, a small but expanding chain of stores selling health food and other health-related products.  "Our previous experience has been that our stores are most profitable in areas where residents are highly concerned with leading healthy lives. We should therefore build one of our new stores in Plainsville, which clearly has many such residents. Plainsville merchants report that sales of running shoes and exercise equipment are at all-time highs. The local health club, which nearly closed five years ago due to lack of business, has more members than ever, and the weight-training and aerobics classes are always full. We can even anticipate a new generation of customers: Plainsville's schoolchildren are required to participate in a program called Fitness for Life, which emphasizes the benefits of regular exercise at an early age." |

In sum, the recommendation relies on certain doubtful assumptions that render it unconvincing as it stands. To bolster the recommendation the vice president must provide dear evidence - perhaps by way of a local survey or study - that Plainesville residents who buy and wear exercise apparel, and especially the health club's members, do in fact exercise regularly, and that these exercisers are likely to buy health foods and health related products at a NW store. To better assess the recommendation, I would need to know why Plainesville's health club is nonular, and why Plainesville does not contain more health clubs. I would also need to know what competition NW might face in Plainesville.

Part III The Issue Task

**3.1 Comments from ETS**

The "Analyze an Issue" task assesses your ability to **think critically about a topic of general interest** and **to clearly express your thoughts about it in writing**. Each Issue topic makes a claim that can be discussed from various perspectives and applied to many different situations or conditions. Your task is to **present a compelling case** for your own position on the issue. Before beginning your written response, be sure to read the issue and the instructions that follow the Issue statement. **Think about the issue from several points of view, considering the complexity of ideas associated with those views.** Then, make notes about the position you want to develop and list the main reasons and examples you could use to support that position.

The GRE® readers scoring your response are not looking for a "right" answer — in fact, as far as they are concerned, there is no correct position to take. Instead, the readers are evaluating the skill with which you address the specific instructions and articulate and develop an argument to support your evaluation of the issue.

Remember that this is a task in **critical thinking** and **persuasive writing**. The most successful responses will explore the complexity of the claim and instructions. As you prepare for the Issue task, you might find it helpful to ask yourself the following questions:

* What precisely is the central issue?
* What precisely are the instructions asking me to do?
* Do I agree with all or with any part of the claim? Why or why not?
* Does the claim make certain assumptions? If so, are they reasonable?
* Is the claim valid only under certain conditions? If so, what are they?
* Do I need to explain how I interpret certain terms or concepts used in the claim?
* If I take a certain position on the issue, what reasons support my position?
* What examples—either real or hypothetical—could I use to illustrate those reasons and advance my point of view? Which examples are most compelling?

Once you have decided on a position to defend, consider the perspective of others who might not agree with your position. Ask yourself: What reasons might someone use to refute or undermine my position? How should I acknowledge or defend against those views in my essay?

**3.2 Issue Topic Instructions**

* Write a response in which you discuss **the extent to which** you agree or disagree with the statement and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should **consider ways in which the statement might or might not hold true and explain how these considerations shape your position**.
* Write a response in which you discuss **the extent to which** you agree or disagree with the recommendation and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, **describe specific circumstances in which adopting the recommendation would or would not be advantageous and explain how these examples shape your position**.
* Write a response in which you discuss **the extent to which** you agree or disagree with the claim. In developing and supporting your position, **be sure to address the most compelling reasons and/or examples that could be used to challenge your position**.
* Write a response in which you discuss **which view more closely aligns with your own position** and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, **you should address both of the views presented**.
* Write a response in which you discuss **the extent to which** you agree or disagree with the claim **AND the reason on which that claim is based**.
* Write a response in which you discuss **your views on the policy** and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should **consider the possible consequences of implementing the policy and explain how these consequences shape your position**.

**3.3 Issue Topic Segmentation**

1. **教育-学习（54篇）**

3, 6, 12, 13, 14, 15, 17, 20, 24, 25, 29, 30, 32, 33, 34, 35, 37, 39, 40, 42, 46, 47, 48, 49, 52, 54, 58, 68, 70, 73, 76, 81, 82, 83, 90, 92, 95, 96, 97, 98, 100, 102, 108, 110, 112, 116, 118, 124, 129, 135, 136, 137, 140, 142

1. **科学研究-科技（20篇）**

1, 9, 23, 27, 36, 56, 59, 64, 72, 87, 91, 101, 103, 105, 106, 109, 126, 131, 132, 143

1. **社会-文化（17篇）**

2, 5, 18, 117, 26, 28, 38, 43, 77, 78, 85, 93, 113, 120, 121, 127, 145

1. **政府-民众-艺术-环境（16篇）**

5, 7, 19, 31, 50, 55, 60, 63, 67, 69, 80, 86, 88, 115, 125, 130, 139

1. **六大焦点名词（Success, Competition, Leader, Hero, History, Law）（37篇）**

**Success（5篇）:** 51, 53, 71, 85, 144

**Competition（4篇）:** 45, 123, 128, 138

**Leader（12篇）:** 8, 16, 62, 94, 104, 107, 111, 114, 123, 128, 147, 149

**Hero（5篇）:** 22, 44, 75, 84, 122

**History（6篇）:** 41, 57, 74, 119, 133, 134

**Law（5篇）:** 10, 21, 65, 89, 148

**3.4 Composing the Introductory Paragraph**

一般而言，开头段有如下几种典型的写法：

1. **直接表明自己立场：**

这种方法美国人常用，优点是简洁、清晰、开门见山。缺点是字数少，并且很难吸引考官的眼球（除非你的文字功力极其深厚）。

1. **先承认题目的复杂性（或先陈述相互冲突的观点），然后表明自己的立场：**

* It is natural that people may disagree over such a controversial issue due to their different experiences and values. On balance, I am inclined to support/oppose the idea that…
* It is obvious that people will find it almost impossible to come to the agreement on this highly controversial issue. In the last analysis, I am inclined to support the idea that…/refute the title statement.
* As a matter of fact, issue of whether AAAAA is a complex and controversial one. On the one hand, many people may feel that BBBBB, and correspondingly CCCCC; on the other hand, it can be noted that DDDDD and hence EEEEE. There is no universal answer to this question; so different people can hold different opinions due to their distinct backgrounds. As far as I am concerned, while I agree that under some circumstances BBBBB, the ultimate goal of XXX, however, is DDDDD. My view can be greatly substantiated by the reasons addressed below.
* There is much debate over whether… Some people maintain that AAAAA, while others argue that BBBBB. As far as I am concerned, these two forces undermine each other at times, but they can also complement each other if handled properly.
* There is much controversy over the issue of TTTTT. Some people claim that AAAAA, while others argue that BBBBB. In the last analysis, I believe that CCCCC.
* There is much debate/disagreement over the issue of TTTTT. On the one hand, some people claim that… On the other hand, some people assert that… In the last analysis, I believe that…
* There is a growing public concern over AAAAA. The speaker in the title statement advocates that… By contrast, some people may argue that… On balance, I would side with the former/latter opinion.
* The issue of TTTTT may arise much controversy among people of diverse backgrounds. Although many people believe that AAAAA, I believe that BBBBB.
* Many people feel that AAAAA, and correspondingly, BBBBB. On the other hand, it can be noted that CCCCC and hence DDDDD. In this discussion, I shall present arguments favoring the former statement and refuting the later statement.

1. **先说题目观点，然后表明自己的立场：**

此类方式开头，要注意一点——逆向思考：从你自己的立场出发，去复述题目，从而让你所复述的题目表达更有利于你的行文展开。

* According to the title of statement, TTTTT.（后面加上表明立场的句子）
* Nowadays, it is widely believed that… As opposed to the commonly held view, I would insist that…

1. **先描述问题背景，然后表明自己的立场：**

**例题：(74-133-134) Knowing about the past cannot help people to make important decisions today.**

开头段：The world is changing, changing again, changing faster and still faster. With every passing day, there come new problems everywhere: new problems in politics, in political styles, in international peace and security, in global economy, in environmental protection, in food provision, in traffic, in education, in public health, in science and technology. What were precepts for our parents seem ridiculous for our generation, and what seem natural to us are still strange to our children.

1. **用问句引出话题，然后表明典型立场，最后表明自己的立场：**

特殊疑问句：

* 单层结构：What/Why…? The arguer claims that… While I admit that AAAAA, I maintain that BBBBB.
* 双层结构：What/Why…? Some people claim that… On the other hand, many people argue that… While I admit that AAAAA, I maintain that BBBBB.

一般疑问句：

注意：如果题目是多层的话，可以用多个问句开头。

**例题：(76) We can usually learn much more from people whose views we share than from people whose views contradict our own.**

**开头段：**Do we learn more from people whose ideas we share in common than from those whose ideas contradict ours? Some people claim so, for the reason that disagreement can cause stress and inhibit learning. Otherwise, in my view we learn far more from discourse and debate with those whose ideas we oppose than from people whose ideas are in accord with our own.

1. **找出题目中的矛盾焦点，然后表明自己的立场：**

* The extent to which A should do B involves a conflict between AAA and BBB. In my view, AAA takes precedence over BBB

**3.5 Composing the Body Paragraph**

As with other language, the English language uses a variety of modes to support the development of ideas, beliefs, and argument. Among the most important modes of such development figure “narration”, “description”, “exemplification”, “cause and effect”, “definition”, “comparison and contrast”, and “classification”. Each of these modes may form a complete paragraph, an essay or a paper. However, in a longer piece of writing, a combination of a number of these modes is generally employed to achieve the desired purpose. The choice and arrangement of these different modes of support depend on the purpose, nature, and organization of a particular piece of writing.

1. **Exemplification**
2. **Abstract Example（归纳论证）**

举例1：Great leaders are almost always great simplifiers, who cut through argument, debate and doubt to offer a solution everybody can understand and remember. Churchill warned the British to expect “blood, toil, tears and sweat”; F. D. Roosevelt told Americans that “the only thing we have to fear is fear itself”; Lenin promised the war-weary Russians “peace, land and bread”. Straightforward but potent message.

举例2：People universally prefer health to disease, being nourished to starving, safe communities to crime-riddled ones, and peace to war.

1. **Specific Example（举例论证）**

举例：Some examples of altruism are difficult to explain in terms of self-interest alone. The famous nurse Nightingale is a good example. Born in a rich family, she could naturally live a cozy, fortunate life. But she chose to be a nurse and devoted all her life to the wounded and the poor. Nobody can say for sure that all she did is to make profit.

1. **Contrast（对比论证）**

举例论证的推广：正反两方面举例子，使得文章更有说服力

举例：It is difficult to trust leaders who do not have experience in the areas under their leadership. The Clinton example illustrates this point. Because President Clinton Sacked military experience, people in the armed forces found it difficult to trust that his policies would reflect any understanding of their interests or needs. And when put to the test, he undermined their trust to an even greater extent with his naïve and largely bungled attempt to solve the problem of gays in the military. **In stark contrast,** President Dwight Eisenhower inspired nearly devotional trust as well as respect because of his role as a military hero in World War II.

1. **Scenario（假设论证）**

举例：As a matter of fact, proper classification is so important that chaotic classification prevents the smooth function of human society. Imaging the chaos if books were listed by date of purchase in the libraries, if goods were randomly placed in department stores, if English classes were grouped by activity – with four years of reading in the first year, four years of speaking in the second year, and so on!

1. **Authority/Quotation/Expert Opinion**

* xxx, one famous professor in Management School of Fudan University, once pointed out that…
* xxx, once said and I paraphrase that…
* Saint Confucius once said…

1. **Statistics**

* According to a recent survey conducted by the XXX department of XXX University among AAA, NN percent of AAA CCC. The result of the survey also indicates an increase of over N percent within NN years in the rates of BBB. Researchers of XXX believe that… In AAA where NOT CCC, the occurrence of such problems drops dramatically.

1. **Theory**

E.g. The theory of Maslow’s Needs Hierarchy

Physiological need----Security need----Social need----Ego need----Self Actualization

**3.6 Composing the Concluding Paragraph**

结尾段的典型表达主要是两个

1. **表明观点，与首段呼应**

* From what has been discussed above/ Taking all these factors into account/ Judging from all evidence offered, we may safely draw/ reach/ come to/ arrive at the conclusion that…
* All the evidence discussed in the above analysis supports/ justifies/ confirms/ warrants/ points to the conclusion that…
* To sum up, due to the aforementioned reasons, which sometimes intertwine to form an organic whole and thus become more persuasive than any single of them, we may safely arrive at the conclusion that…

1. **表明观点，并总结理由**

* In conclusion, I hold that… not only because… but also because…
* In sum, neither AAA nor BBB should guide decisions in the controversies at issue. Instead, decisions should be made on a case-by-case basis, considering CCC, DDD and EEE.

Part VI Sample Essays

**4.1 Sample Arugment Essays**

**Sample Argument Essay 1**

|  |
| --- |
| **(16)** In surveys Mason City residents rank water sports (swimming, boating and fishing) among their favorite recreational activities. The Mason River flowing through the city is rarely used for these pursuits, however, and the city park department devotes little of its budget to maintaining riverside recreational facilities. For years there have been complaints from residents about the quality of the river's water and the river's smell. In response, the state has recently announced plans to clean up Mason River. Use of the river for water sports is therefore sure to increase. The city government should for that reason devote more money in this year's budget to riverside recreational facilities.  **Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on the assumptions and what the implications are if the assumptions prove unwarranted.** |

**Essay Response — Score 6**

While it may be true that the Mason City government ought to devote more money to riverside recreational facilities, this author's argument does not make a cogent case for increased resources based on river use. It is easy to understand why city residents would want a cleaner river, but this argument is rife with holes and assumptions, and thus, not strong enough to lead to increased funding.

Citing surveys of city residents, the author reports city resident's love of water sports. It is not clear, however, the scope and validity of that survey. For example, the survey could have asked residents if they prefer using the river for water sports or would like to see a hydroelectric dam built, which may have swayed residents toward river sports. The sample may not have been representative of city residents, asking only those residents who live upon the river. The survey may have been 10 pages long, with 2 questions dedicated to river sports. We just do not know. Unless the survey is fully representative, valid, and reliable, it can not be used to effectively back the author's argument.

Additionally, the author implies that residents do not use the river for swimming, boating, and fishing, despite their professed interest, because the water is polluted and smelly. While a polluted, smelly river would likely cut down on river sports, a concrete connection between the resident's lack of river use and the river's current state is not effectively made. Though there have been complaints, we do not know if there have been numerous complaints from a wide range of people, or perhaps from one or two individuals who made numerous complaints. To strengthen his/her argument, the author would benefit from implementing a normed survey asking a wide range of residents why they do not currently use the river.

Building upon the implication that residents do not use the river due to the quality of the river's water and the smell, the author suggests that a river clean up will result in increased river usage. If the river's water quality and smell result from problems which can be cleaned, this may be true. For example, if the decreased water quality and aroma is caused by pollution by factories along the river, this conceivably could be remedied. But if the quality and aroma results from the natural mineral deposits in the water or surrounding rock, this may not be true. There are some bodies of water which emit a strong smell of sulphur due to the geography of the area. This is not something likely to be afffected by a clean-up. Consequently, a river clean up may have no impact upon river usage. Regardless of whether the river's quality is able to be improved or not, the author does not effectively show a connection between water quality and river usage.

A clean, beautiful, safe river often adds to a city's property values, leads to increased tourism and revenue from those who come to take advantage of the river, and a better overall quality of life for residents. For these reasons, city government may decide to invest in improving riverside recreational facilities. However, this author's argument is not likely significantly persuade the city goverment to allocate increased funding.

**Reader Commentary for Essay Response — Score 6**

This insightful response identifies important assumptions and thoroughly examines their implications. The proposal to spend more on riverside recreational facilities rests on three questionable assumptions, namely:

* that the survey provides a reliable basis for budget planning
* that the river’s pollution and odor are the only reasons for its limited recreational use
* that efforts to clean the water and remove the odor will be successful

By showing that each assumption is highly suspect, this essay demonstrates the weakness of the entire argument. For example, paragraph 2 points out that the survey might not have used a representative sample, might have offered limited choices, and might have contained very few questions on water sports.

Paragraph 3 examines the tenuous connection between complaints and limited use of the river for recreation. Complaints about water quality and odor may be coming from only a few people and, even if such complaints are numerous, other completely different factors may be much more significant in reducing river usage. Finally, paragraph 4 explains that certain geologic features may prevent effective river clean-up. Details such as these provide compelling support.

In addition, careful organization ensures that each new point builds upon the previous ones. For example, note the clear transitions at the beginning of paragraphs 3 and 4, as well as the logical sequence of sentences within paragraphs (specifically paragraph 4).

Although this essay does contain minor errors, it still conveys ideas fluently. Note the effective word choices (e.g., "rife with . . . assumptions" and "may have swayed residents"). In addition, sentences are not merely varied; they also display skillful embedding of subordinate elements. For example, note the sustained parallelism in the first sentence of the concluding paragraph.

Since this response offers cogent examination of the argument and conveys meaning skillfully, it earns a score of 6.

**Essay Response — Score 5**

The author of this proposal to increase the budget for Mason City riverside recreational facilities offers an interesting argument but to move forward on the proposal would definitely require more information and thought. While the correlations stated are logical and probable, there may be hidden factors that prevent the City from diverting resources to this project.

For example, consider the survey rankings among Mason City residents. The thought is that such high regard for water sports will translate into usage. But, survey responses can hardly be used as indicators of actual behavior. Many surveys conducted after the winter holidays reveal people who list exercise and weight loss as a top priority. Yet every profession does not equal a new gym membership. Even the wording of the survey results remain ambiguous and vague. While water sports may be among the residents' favorite activities, this allows for many other favorites. What remains unknown is the priorities of the general public. Do they favor these water sports above a softball field or soccer field? Are they willing to sacrifice the municipal golf course for better riverside facilities? Indeed the survey hardly provides enough information to discern future use of improved facilities.

Closely linked to the surveys is the bold assumption that a cleaner river will result in increased usage. While it is not illogical to expect some increase, at what level will people begin to use the river? The answer to this question requires a survey to find out the reasons our residents use or do not use the river. Is river water quality the primary limiting factor to usage or the lack of docks and piers? Are people more interested in water sports than the recreational activities that they are already engaged in? These questions will help the city government forecast how much river usage will increase and to assign a proportional increase to the budget.

Likewise, the author is optimistic regarding the state promise to clean the river. We need to hear the source of the voices and consider any ulterior motives. Is this a campaign year and the plans a campaign promise from the state representative? What is the timeline for the clean-up effort? Will the state fully fund this project? We can imagine the misuse of funds in renovating the riverside facilities only to watch the new buildings fall into dilapidation while the state drags the river clean-up.

Last, the author does not consider where these additional funds will be diverted from. The current budget situation must be assessed to determine if this increase can be afforded. In a sense, the City may not be willing to draw money away from other key projects from road improvements to schools and education. The author naively assumes that the money can simply appear without forethought on where it will come from.

Examining all the various angles and factors involved with improving riverside recreational facilities, the argument does not justify increasing the budget. While the proposal does highlight a possibility, more information is required to warrant any action.

**Reader Commentary for Essay Response — Score 5**

Each paragraph in the body of this perceptive essay identifies and examines an unstated assumption that is crucial to the argument. The major assumptions discussed are:

* that a survey can accurately predict behavior
* that cleaning the river will, in itself, increase recreational usage
* that state plans to clean the river will actually be realized
* that Mason City can afford to spend more on riverside recreational facilities

Support within each paragraph is both thoughtful and thorough. For example, paragraph 2 points out vagueness in the wording of the survey: Even if water sports rank *among* the favorite recreational activities of Mason City residents, other sports may still be much more popular. Thus, if the first assumption proves unwarranted, the argument to fund riverside facilities — rather than soccer fields or golf courses — becomes much weaker. Paragraph 4 considers several reasons why river clean-up plans may not be successful (the plans may be nothing more than campaign promises or funding may not be adequate). Thus, the weakness of the third assumption undermines the argument that river recreation will increase and riverside improvements will be needed at all.

Instead of dismissing each assumption in isolation, this response places them in a logical order and considers their connections. Note the appropriate transitions between and within paragraphs, clarifying the links among the assumptions (e.g., "Closely linked to the surveys …" or "The answer to this question requires...").

Along with strong development, this response also displays facility with language. Minor errors in punctuation are present, but word choices are apt and sentences suitably varied in pattern and length. The response uses a number of rhetorical questions, but the implied answers are always clear enough to support the points being made.

Thus, the response satisfies all requirements for a score of 5, but its development is not thorough or compelling enough for a 6.

**Essay Response — Score 4**

The problem with the arguement is the assumption that if the Mason River were cleaned up, that people would use it for water sports and recreation. This is not necessarily true, as people may rank water sports among their favorite recreational activities, but that does not mean that those same people have the financial ability, time or equipment to pursue those interests.

However, even if the writer of the arguement is correct in assuming that the Mason River will be used more by the city's residents, the arguement does not say why the recreational facilities need more money. If recreational facilities already exist along the Mason River, why should the city allot more money to fund them? If the recreational facilities already in existence will be used more in the coming years, then they will be making more money for themselves, eliminating the need for the city government to devote more money to them.

According to the arguement, the reason people are not using the Mason River for water sports is because of the smell and the quality of water, not because the recreational facilities are unacceptable.

If the city government alloted more money to the recreational facilities, then the budget is being cut from some other important city project. Also, if the assumptions proved unwarranted, and more people did not use the river for recreation, then much money has been wasted, not only the money for the recreational facilities, but also the money that was used to clean up the river to attract more people in the first place.

**Reader Commentary for Essay Response — Score 4**

This competent response identifies two unstated assumptions:

* that cleaning up the Mason River will lead to increased recreational use
* that existing facilities along the river need more funding

Paragraph 1 offers reasons why the first assumption is questionable (e.g., residents may not have the necessary time or money for water sports). Similarly, paragraphs 2 and 3 explain that riverside recreational facilities may already be adequate and may, in fact, produce additional income if usage increases. Thus, the response is adequately developed and satisfactorily organized to show how the argument depends on questionable assumptions.

However, this essay does not rise to a score of 5 because it fails to consider several other unstated assumptions (e.g., that the survey is reliable or that the efforts to clean the river will be successful). Furthermore, the final paragraph makes some extraneous, unsupported assertions of its own. Mason City may actually have a budget surplus so that cuts to other projects will not be necessary, and cleaning the river may provide other real benefits even if it is not used more for water sports.

This response is generally free of errors in grammar and usage and displays sufficient control of language to support a score of 4.

**Essay Response — Score 3**

Surveys are created to speak for the people; however, surveys do not always speak for the whole community. A survey completed by Mason City residents concluded that the residents enjoy water sports as a form of recreation. If that is so evident, why has the river not been used? The blame can not be soley be placed on the city park department. The city park department can only do as much as they observe. The real issue is not the residents use of the river, but their desire for a more pleasant smell and a more pleasant sight. If the city government cleans the river, it might take years for the smell to go away. If the budget is changed to accomodate the clean up of the Mason River, other problems will arise. The residents will then begin to complain about other issues in their city that will be ignored because of the great emphasis being placed on Mason River. If more money is taken out of the budget to clean the river an assumption can be made. This assumption is that the budget for another part of cit maintenance or building will be tapped into to. In addition, to the budget being used to clean up Mason River, it will also be allocated in increasing riverside recreational facilites. The government is trying to appease its residents, and one can warrant that the role of the government is to please the people. There are many assumptions being made; however, the government can not make the assumption that people want the river to be cleaned so that they can use it for recreational water activities. The government has to realize the long term effects that their decision will have on the monetary value of their budget.

**Reader Commentary for Essay Response — Score 3**

Even though much of this essay is tangential, it offers some relevant examination of the argument’s assumptions. The early sentences mention a questionable assumption (that the survey results are reliable) but do not explain how the survey might have been flawed. Then the response drifts to irrelevant matters — a defense of the city park department, a prediction of budget problems and the problem of pleasing city residents.

Some statements even introduce unwarranted assumptions that are not part of the original argument (e.g., "The residents will then begin to complain about other issues" and "This assumption is that the budget for another part of city maintenance or building will be tapped into"). Near the end, the response does correctly note that city government should not assume that residents want to use the river for recreation. Hence, the proposal to increase funding for riverside recreational facilities may not be justified.

In summary, the language in this response is reasonably clear, but its examination of unstated assumptions remains limited and therefore earns a score of 3.

**Essay Response — Score 2**

This statement looks like logical, but there are some wrong sentences in it which is not logical.

First, this statement mentions raking water sports as their favorite recreational activities at the first sentence. However, it seems to have a ralation between the first sentence and the setence which mentions that increase the quality of the river's water and the river's smell. This is a wrong cause and result to solve the problem.

Second, as a reponse to the complaints from residents, the state plan to clean up the river. As a result, the state expects that water sports will increase. When you look at two sentences, the result is not appropriate for the cause.

Third, the last statement is the conclusion. However, even though residents rank water sports, the city government might devote the budget to another issue. This statement is also a wrong cause and result.

In summary, the statement is not logical because there are some errors in it. The supporting setences are not strong enough to support this issue.

**Reader Commentary for Essay Response — Score 2**

Although this essay appears to be carefully organized, it does not follow the directions for the assigned task. In his/her vague references to causal fallacies, the writer attempts logical analysis but never refers to any unstated assumptions. Furthermore, several errors in grammar and sentence structure interfere with meaning (e.g., "This statement looks like logical, but there are some wrong sentences in it which is not logical").

Because this response "does not follow the directions for the assigned task" and contains errors in sentence structure and logical development, it earns a score of 2.

**Essay Response — Score 1**

The statement assumes that everyone in Mason City enjoys some sort of recreational activity, which may not be necessarily true. They statement also assumes that if the state cleans up the river, the use of the river for water sports will definitely increase.

**Reader Commentary for Essay Response — Score 1**

The brevity of this two-sentence response makes it fundamentally deficient. Sentence 1 states an assumption that is actually not present in the argument, and sentence 2 correctly states an assumption but provides no discussion of its implications. Although the response may begin to address the assigned task, it offers no development. As such, it is clearly "extremely brief ... providing little evidence of an organized response" and should earn a score of 1.

**Sample Argument Essay 2**

|  |
| --- |
| **(97)** The following appeared in an e-mail sent by the marketing director of the Classical Shakespeare Theatre of Bardville.  "Over the past ten years, there has been a 20 percent decline in the size of the average audience at Classical Shakespeare Theatre productions. In spite of increased advertising, we are attracting fewer and fewer people to our shows, causing our profits to decrease significantly. We must take action to attract new audience members. The best way to do so is by instituting a 'Shakespeare in the Park' program this summer. Two years ago the nearby Avon Repertory Company started a 'Free Plays in the Park' program, and its profits have increased 10 percent since then. Therefore, I recommend that we start a 'Shakespeare in the Park' program of our own. If we do so, I predict that our profits will also see a significant increase."  ***Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation is likely to have the predicted result. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.*** |

**Score 6**

The marketing director of the Classical Shakespeare Theatre (CST) of Bardville asserts that by instituting a program similar to Avon Reporatory Company's "Free Plays in the Park", the CST will be able to attract new audience members and increase its profits. The marketing director seems to believe that because Avon has had a 10% increase in profits since it instituted a program in which they perform plays in the park for free, that the Classical Shakespeare Theatre will experience a similar increase in profits if it institutes a "Shakespeare in the Park" program. However, this conclusion assumes not only that the "Free Plays in the Park" program caused Avon's increase in profits for Avon, but also that the CST would be able to replicate Avon's success. Before the management of the Classical Shakespeare Company implements the marketing director's recommendation, they need to answer several important questions that will help them determine whether this plan is likely to have the predicted result.

One of the most obvious questions they need to ask is whether Avon's increased profits were the result of its "Free Plays in the Park" program. In order to answer this question, they would need to know whether Avon's increased profits came from increased ticket sales at Avon's regular shows and whether the rise in ticket sales came from new customers who had a good experience at the "Free Plays in the Park" program. It's possible that Avon's increased profits were the result of factors other than increased ticket sales that happened to coincide with the "Free Plays" program (e.g., lowering operating costs or increasing revenue from concessions). If Avon's increased profits are actually the result of increased attendance, CST would still need to determine if increased ticket sales resulted from an increase in the quality of shows or actors performing at Avon or some other factor besides the "Free Plays in the Park" program.

Another question that could shed light on the marketing director's recommendation is whether what worked for Avon will work for the Classical Shakespeare Theatre. This is an extremely complex question since there are a huge number of variables at play. For example, if Avon specializes in affordable, family-friendly shows with simple sets and costumes, they may not only have an easier (and cheaper) time than CST in adapting their plays for performance in the park, but their target audience may also be more likely to attend both the "Free Plays in the Park" and their regular performances. On the other hand, if CST typically produces lavish productions with big-name actors and high ticket prices, it's possible that it will be difficult and expensive to stage their plays outdoors. It's also possible that CST's target audience consists largely of people who are unlikely to attend an outdoor performance. If this is the case, the program is much less likely to be successful in increasing CST's profits.

Also, even if both theatres' park programs are free, its still important to consider each theatre's usual ticket prices. If CST's usual ticket prices are much higher than Avon's, they may also have much less success than Avon in translating attendance at their park performances into attendance at regular CST performances. If Avon's tickets are relatively inexpensive, people who enjoy the free performances in the park may be willing to buy tickets to other Avon performances. In contrast, if CST's "Shakespeare in the Park" performances are free (like Avon's "Plays in the Park") but their usual ticket prices are very high, the program could have little positive affect on ticket sales. Even if people who attend the "Shakespeare in the Park" performances have a great experience there and want to see more plays, they may not be able to afford tickets to CST performances. The program could even result in a decreased sales of tickets to their regular performances if some CST audience members decide to save money by attending the free performances instead of the paid ones. Considering the potentially high costs of launching the program and staging plays in the park, the program could actually be a financial disaster for CST. Without clear answers to these questions and other questions, it is impossible to evaluate the director's recommendation.

**Reader Commentary for Argument Response - Sample 6**

This outstanding essay identifies a number of crucial questions that need to be answered in order to determine whether or not the marketing director's recommendation to start a "Shakespeare in the Park" program is likely to increase profits. The response focuses on two main questions: were Avon's increased profits caused by its "Free Plays in the Park" program, and, if so, could the Classical Shakespeare Theatre expect a similar increase in profits. Each of these questions is analyzed thoroughly and insightfully, with the writer clearly explaining how possible answers to these questions might affect our evaluation of the director's recommendation. For example, the response offers a thorough explanation of how differences in the two theatre's productions, their target audiences, and their ticket prices might affect their relative success in translating their plays-in-the-park programs into increased profits. Throughout this essay, the writer maintains his or her analysis by connecting these well-developed points with clear and logical transitions. The use of transitions between and within paragraphs provides a logical organization that helps the writer make his or her points effectively. Additionally, ideas are conveyed fluently and precisely throughout the essay. The writer consistently demonstrates superior facility with language and makes use of effective vocabulary. The writer's ability to convey ideas skillfully and to handle complex sentence structures is nicely demonstrated in this sentence: "For example, if Avon specializes in affordable, family-friendly shows with simple sets and costumes, they may not only have an easier (and cheaper) time than CST in adapting their plays for performance in the park, but their target audience may also be more likely to attend both the "Free Plays in the Park" and their regular performances." Thus, because of its thorough, insightful analysis, logical organization, and facility with the conventions of standard written English, this essay merits a score of 6.

**Score 5**

It seems that the marketing director at Classical Shakespeare has presented an interesting proposition, that of doing a 'Shakespeare in the Park' program in order to combat flagging attendance at Classical Shakespeare productions. Before acting on such an offer, however, it is necessary to investigate the details lurking in the background: First, what were the costs for the program that Avon Repertory initiated, and could we match them? Second, are there any incidental economic or socio-political factors that would have boosted Avon Repertory's attendance over the past two years or decreased Classical Shakespeare's attendance over the past ten years? Third, do other members of Classical Shakespeare have any alternative suggestions as to programs which might result in increased attendance with fewer costs, or reach more people than the 'Shakespeare in the Park' program?

As to the first question, knowing the cost of initiating a 'Shakespeare in the Park' program would greatly aid in evaluating the soundness of the marketing director's proposition. For starters, if the cost is significantly more than five percent of our current profits, then I would deem it unwise or risky to start that program until after we can fix the attendance situation through safer means. Doing free plays in the park, especially if few people come, would be even less lucrative than our practices at present, and it must be reasonably certain that such an event will not occur before approval for this program is obtained.

The question of incidental economic and socio-political factors may appear to be a small one, but if overlooked could have dire consequences. For example, if there has been a housing boom near Avon Repertory's location, and a bust near ours, then certainly there might be an increase and decrease, respectively, in the attendance of theatrical events, on account of a higher resident population. In such a situation, it may very well be that Avon Repertory's 'Free Plays in the Park' program had no great effect on attendance, and such a program for Classical Shakespeare would have no more effect. Thus, we must not confuse correlation (of new programs) with causation (of higher attendance) unnecessarily, although in our own case, it is unarguable that a ten year bout of falling attendance needs mitigation of some sort.

Finally, we must consider other options and alternatives besides the present one. It may very well be that the most profitable action that we can take, at present, is to begin a 'Shakespeare in the Park' program, but why copy Avon Repertory if we can find a more creative (and more profitable) solution of our own? If alternative suggestions, such as renevations to the theatre, or starting an acting program for high school students, or renewing a cooperative stage-sharing deal with a community college, or perhaps even adding a few names to our long list of industrial sponsors, could be shown to be reasonably likely to improve attendance, decrease losses, or require less manpower than the current proposal, then that program must be pursued. Hence, I would be very interested in hearing what the other members of Classical Shakespeare have to say about raising our attendance. Hopefully, together we will be able to find a creative solution

**Reader Commentary for Argument Response - Sample 5**

In accordance with the specific task instructions, this essay raises a number of important questions that help analyze the marketing director's recommendation and determine whether or not it is likely to have the predicted result. The writer raises questions such as:

* What does the "Free Plays in the Park" program at Avon cost?
* Are there other factors that could have led to Avon's increased profits?
* Are there other factors that could have led to Classical Shakespeare's decreased profits?
* Are there other potential solutions for Classical Shakespeare's problems?

In each case, the writer provides some thoughtful, generally perceptive development. For example, the writer shows specifically how the answer to the first question might help determine whether or not the recommendation would have the predicted result when he or she notes that "it may very well be that Avon Repertory's 'Free Plays in the Park' program had no great effect on attendance, and such a program for Classical Shakespeare would have no more effect." The development of the analysis in this essay is slightly beyond the adequate development seen in an essay that receives a score of 4, but it is not as thorough or compelling as the analysis seen in a 6. In the final paragraph, for example, the writer raises some relevant points, arguing that other solutions may be more effective, but some of the development borders on advice rather than analysis. The writer claims, "If alternative suggestions...could be shown to be reasonably likely to improve attendance, decrease losses, or require less manpower than the current proposal, then that program must be pursued." The notion that alternative solutions "must be pursued" pushes this part of the response away from logical critique. However, there is still sufficient development of generally thoughtful and thorough support, along with overall facility with language and logical organization, for the essay to merit a score of 5.

**Score 4**

Prior to implementing any new recommendation, there are many questions that need to be asked regarding the program, especially when starting a free program designed to increase profits. First of all, why has attendence gone down in the past ten years? There may be a reason for decreased attendance that the authors are not considering. For example if ticket prices went up it might be more difficult for community memebers to buy tickets to see the show. The answer to this question could solve the decreased profits problem and help the Classical Shakespeare Theater productions get a larger attendance.

The next issue that needs to be addressed is the decreased profits. Increased advertising would cause the company to spend more money. Therefore, are the decreased profits due to the increase in advertising spending, or are the decreased profits only from ticket sales? This is an important question because if the decreased profits are coming from the increase in advertising, then maybe the advertising needs to be decreased a little. If the decreased profits are from the decrease in ticket sales and attendance, then a new plan must be implemented to raise ticket sales and thus profits.

Putting on a play in the park will cost money, the actors will need to be paid and the set will need to be made to fit the park. Does the Classical Shakespeare Theatre have the money to put on the free plays in the park? If the company is already worried about decreased profits, then will it be able to put on the free plays. Furthermore, if the company cannot afford to put on free plays in the park, then the free plays program will not be able to give them the increased profit that they are looking for.

The last question I have is how can you guarantee that profits will increase? It worked for another company, but that does not mean it will work for the Classical Shakespeare Theater. There would need to be some evidence that the free plays in the park definitely leads to an increase in profit. This evidence will be helpful in the decision of implementing the program because if there is no proof that it will work, then a lot of consideration needs to be looked at prior to starting it and there is a possiblity that there will need to be some changes to the plan.

Answers to these questions are very important to the decision of implementing the 'Shakespeare in the Park' program. Without these answers, it is difficult to decide if the recommendation will actually yield increased profits. The program should only be implemented if it will give increased profits, so any uncertainties should be discussed and worked out prior to starting the program.

**Reader Commentary for Argument Response - Sample 4**

This essay offers a competent examination of the argument and conveys meaning with acceptable clarity. The essay clearly addresses the specific task directions by identifying and discussing important questions that need to be addressed in order to decide whether the marketing director's recommendation to institute a 'Shakespeare in the Park' program at the Classical Shakespeare Theatre is likely to have the predicted result of increasing the theatre's profits:

* Why has attendance at the Classical Shakespeare Theatre's performances decreased?
* Why have their profits decreased?
* Can the Classical Shakespeare Theatre afford to institute the proposed 'Shakespeare in the Park' program?
* What evidence is there that this program will result in increased profits?

The response explores each of these questions in turn, explaining why each question is relevant and how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation and its predicted result. For example, in the third paragraph the writer points out that "[p]utting on a play in the park will cost money." Although the response does not offer a lengthy or detailed exploration of the possible costs associated with the program (it simply mentions the need to pay actors and build a set that can be used in the park), it does offer a brief but clear explanation of why a consideration of these costs is so important -- if the theatre is already struggling financially due to decreased profits it may not have sufficient resources to implement the program. It is interesting to note that this essay manages to develop a competent analysis of the argument despite the fact that it never explicitly address the director's assumption that the Classical Shakespeare Theatre will be able to replicate the apparent success of Avon Repertory Company's 'Free Plays in the Park' program. The essay does raise the question of whether there is any credible evidence that Avon's increase in profit is the result of its 'Free Plays in the Park', but, unlike most responses to this prompt, it doesn't suggest a need to determine whether the two theatre companies are comparable.

One of the essay's strengths is its clear organization -- the main ideas are organized clearly and logically. The writer makes excellent use of transitions to signal the logical connections between phrases, sentences, and paragraphs. Finally, although the essay's use of language demonstrates general control of the conventions of standard written English, the response includes some awkward constructions (e.g., "a lot of consideration needs to be looked at prior to starting it") and imprecise language. In short, this response demonstrates sufficient competence in analysis, organization, and language to earn a score of 4 but lacks the thoughtful, thorough development and clear facility with language necessary to earn a 5.

**Score 3**

There are several questions that need to be addressed in order to conclude that the Classical Shakespeare Theatre is likely to see similar benefits that Avon Repertory Company did if it institues a Shakespeare in the Park program similar to Avon's "Free Plays in the Park."

The first question deals with how similar the two companies productions currently are. If both have similar plays of similar quality. Then Avon's results are more likely to be replicable. This is true because you would expect plays of similar quality to attract a similar demographic of people. Avon's demographic of people have already showed that a park production increases their attendance and profits.

Avon's profit level before they started their park program would also need to be evaluated. was the Avon company experiencing similar decline, or were they expanding an already growing interest. If they were growing or thriving previous to the park program, than you cannot conclude that the program was the reason for increased profits. Along those same lines, if they were instituting any other new programs during that time frame, you cannot the park was responsible for the profits.

If all of these questions are answered. It will be much more likely that the Shakespeare Company can use the Avon Company success as a reasonable expectation of the profit increase they may see.

**Reader Commentary for Argument Response - Sample 3**

Although this response clearly addresses the specific task directions and identifies some relevant questions about the recommendation, the essay's examination of the argument is limited in scope (that is, it doesn't examine most of the relevant aspects of the argument) and in its logical development of the relevant points that it does identify. For example, the essay's second paragraph identifies the need to determine "how similar the two companies productions currently are" before determining whether Avon's success in increasing its profits is "likely to be replicable." The comparability of the two theatre companies is clearly relevant since the argument is based on the apparent success of a similar program at the other theatre. Although this writer recognizes that it's important to understand the two companies' similarities and differences, the writer seems to draw the hasty and simplistic conclusion that the proposed 'Shakespeare in the Park' program is likely to be successful as long as the Classical Shakespeare Theatre is sufficiently similar to the Avon Repertory Company.

The next paragraph focuses on another relevant question: whether Avon's increased profits can be attributed to its 'Free Plays in the Park' program. This paragraph suggests that it is important to learn more about Avon's financial position prior to its introduction of the program and to discover whether Avon made any additional programming changes that might have contributed to its increased profits. The writer concludes that additional information about Avon might reveal that the program was not, in fact, responsible for Avon's increased profits but doesn't explain how this would affect the likelihood that introducing a similar program at the Classical Shakespeare Theatre would have the predicted result of increasing profits.

In addition to its limited competence in examining the argument, this response also exhibits some noticeable problems in sentence structure, grammar, usage, and mechanics. For example, both the second and fourth paragraphs include sentence fragments ("If all of these questions are answered."; "If both have similar plays of similar quality.") that result from the writer's failure to correctly link subordinate clauses with their corresponding main clauses. Although most of the essay's errors in grammar, usage, and mechanics are relatively minor (e.g., missing or incorrect punctuation, an incomplete verb, using "than" instead of "then") and do not significantly interfere with meaning, these errors do indicate limited control of language and the conventions of standard written English.

In sum, this response earns a 3 because it displays limited competence in examining the argument and in conveying meaning.

**Score 2**

I believe that the reason for an decrease in attendance is that many of Shakespeare's productions are now avaiable in many media forms. Most have been made into films. Also many children have to read them for their classes in school and are tested on them. I would much rather rent a movie and sit comfortably at home than pay to go sit in an uncomfortable chair with hundreds of people I do not know to see the play acted out before me. I believe that having the plays in a park would be a good idea. This would provide a chance for viewers to get some fresh air and have a nice family outting. While this is a good idea, the author probably should not compare themselves to the Avon Repertory Company. The author does not state the type of plays that this company puts on and this information is vital to the analysis and decision. While it is not stated, the extra advertising would need to continue for a large change like this to be successful. To really get people interested in coming out to see the plays, they should have other options available such as a place for couples to take their children. I do not see this line of reasoning as a stretch and believe that the company could increase their profits and attendence.

**Reader Commentary for Argument Response - Sample 2**

Although it provides some evidence that the writer understands the argument presented in the prompt and some evidence that the writer is attempting to assess the recommendation, this essay consists largely of the writer's own opinions about the situation described in the prompt rather than a logical examination of the argument. The essay begins by suggesting that fewer people may be attending the Classical Shakespeare Theatre's performances because they have so many other opportunities for exposure to Shakespeare's work (e.g., studying Shakespeare in school or watching one of the many widely-available film adaptations at home). Although an examination of factors that might contribute to the decline in attendance could be used to evaluate the whether the recommendation is likely to have the predicted result, this response fails to connect its discussion of declining attendance to an evaluation of the recommendation. Similarly, the essay's second paragraph mentions some issues that might indicate problems with the director's argument, such as the director's comparison of the two theatre companies, but these potential problems are never explored. Thus, although the response is relatively clear and demonstrates sufficient facility with language to warrant a higher score, its failure to provide any relevant logical analysis of the argument warrants a score of 2.

**Score 1**

Free plays in the park program is a good idea to attract new audience members.But their is a question did the auidience really get pleased from that show?, did they become fans to Shakespeare or not.It is easy to predict if the profits will increase too, or not.Try to figure out what else can attract those new audience, do not stop at a specific way, try to find out methods that can amuse those audience by Shakespeare.

When you finish doing that, be sure that your tired will not go with the wind.

Think and do not ever stop thinking, I have told once that when you die the last thing of your body stop doing his work in the brain.When you think, you will do the right, and when you do the right, you will get your profits increased.

So, keep thinking, search to find out the way, but check it before walking in it, that; this way is the right way.

**Reader Commentary for Argument Response - Sample 1**

The opening paragraph of this essay suggests at least some understanding of the general scenario described in the prompt and an attempt to respond according to the assigned task directions. In asserting that "Free plays in the park program is a good idea to attract new audience members," the response demonstrates at least a basic understanding of the argument's recommendation and desired result. The remainder of the first paragraph makes an attempt to follow the specific task directions by posing a few questions about the argument: "did the auidience really get pleased from that show?, did they become fans to Shakespeare or not." Although the writer may be attempting to question whether Avon's increased profits are the result of their 'Free Plays in the Park' program, serious deficiencies in language control and development make it impossible to discern the writer's intended meaning. In fact, it is not even clear whether the writer is able to distinguish between the two theatre companies discussed in the argument. The second half of the response, which consists of a series of generic and largely incoherent statements that seem to be encouraging the author of the argument to continue to search for new and better solutions to the problem, fails to provide any relevant discussion of the argument. This response earns a score of 1; although some of the essay's individual sentences (especially those that rely heavily on phrases taken from the prompt) are comprehensible, the essay's lack of development combined with its frequent errors in language, sentence structure, grammar, usage, and mechanics indicate fundamental deficiencies in analytical writing.

**Sample Argument Essay3**

|  |
| --- |
| **(20)** The following is a memorandum from the business manager of a television station.  "Over the past year, our late-night news program has devoted increased time to national news and less time to weather and local news. In addition, local businesses that used to advertise during our late-night news program have just canceled their advertising contracts with us. Therefore, in order to attract more viewers to the program and to avoid losing any further advertising revenues, we should restore the time devoted to weather and local news to its former level."  ***Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.*** |

**Score 6**

The decision to restore the time devoted to weather and local news to its former level is one that should be made with more careful consideration of evidence, data, and viewer/client feedback by the business manager of this television station. Many assumptions have been made on the business manager's part about the exact cause of the problems with the program. He or she should approach the idea of making changes with more caution.

The memorandum stated that more complaints received from viewers were concerned with the station's coverage of weather and local news, but it did not state the nature of the complaints. The viewers may have been complaining about the accuracy or quality of the weather and local news rather than the shortened length of the segments. More specific information about the complaints--including whether they were about the late-night edition or about other news programs during the day--would support the argument because it would show if there was a relationship between the shortened length of the segments in the late-night news program and the viewers' dissatisfaction with these particular segments. Sometimes it is the personalities and the chemistry of the news anchors that govern people's decisions about which station's news they watch. The business manager will never know unless he asks the viewers exactly why they do or do not enjoy watching his news program.

Additionally, stated in the memorandum was the fact that local businesses had just canceled their advertising contracts with the station. An assumption being made is that the reason businesses were pulling their ads was directly related to the shortened segments of the weather and local news. Considering the fact that more than one business just pulled their ad, other factors could have been involved, such as any controversy that the station's national news may have recently brought up. Janet Jackson's notorious wardrobe malfunction comes to mind. Though that incident happened during a national sporting event, there are many controversial national news topics that have the potential to create such a stir with the local public. If the manager could establish that businesses discontinued advertising contracts specifically because they were displeased with the change in news coverage, and that the remaining advertisers are on the verge of leaving if coverage of weather and local news is not increased, that information would help eliminate other possible explanations.

Evidence that research had been conducted to find specific ways to attract viewers to a news program would also strengthen the argument. Moreover, findings from research about what viewers would like to see on the program may help. Assuming that they would like to see more weather and local news does not seem safe. Perhaps they are looking for something besides national news, local news, and weather all together. Or possibly they are tuning into another station that has something in their program that draws their attention. Data about which ratings are highest and what people are watching would assist the business manager in his or her decision about how to change the program.

The station cannot expect to go back to the programming it once had and be successful. Obviously, something about the previous programming must not have been working; otherwise they would not have changed their structure the last time. They cannot expect to see different results if they go back to the same structure. Careful analysis of all the factors I have presented is the best first step to making a change in the structure of their news program.

**Reader Commentary for Essay Response – Score 6**

This outstanding response clearly identifies specific evidence necessary to evaluate the argument, and explains lucidly why the evidence is necessary. This response does a particularly nice job of both identifying specific evidence that would strengthen the prompt's argument and identifying evidence that would undermine the argument. For example, the response notes that while the argument assumes that lost advertising contracts are the result of the station's decreased attention to weather and local news, myriad factors, this assumption is unsupported by specific evidence. The response then provides a cogent and thorough discussion of the kinds of evidence needed to examine this assumption and how the evidence might strengthen or weaken the prompt's argument.

Each paragraph here is fully and cogently developed, and the response as a whole is organized logically. Finally, the response consistently demonstrates fluency and skillful use of language. For these reasons, the response earns a score of 6.

**Score 5**

As the business manager of the television station, I would be concerened with two things; the fact that there are fewer advertisers during the late-night news, and the increased complaints recieved from viewers about weather and local news. To support the argument that the station should restore the time devoted to weather and local news, I would carefully analyze the reasons for these factors.

In reguards to the complaints recieved, I would gather specific accounts that address both the issue of weather and local news. Several recorded phone calls, emails, or letters would suffice to show first-hand data that there is concern among some viewers. Next, I would do a thorough study into what percent of complaints are about news and weather, as opposed to other content of the program. If content complaints as well as specific weather and local-news related complaints are up, this would not support my argument.

If historical evidence about viewership and number of written grievences could be gathered, this would be even better. The station could look at the specific complaints, and number of comments from the previous year and compare them to this year's. Next, I would conduct surveys of viewers to understand the reasons why they watch the late-night news. I would also look at trends and variations among viewers of morning, evening, and late-night news. There is a chance that the demographics of individuals watching at these various times are completely different. A broad large-scale survey could be conducted to determine viewer interests. If other stations have taken such measures, perhaps this station could get a copy of results, to look at larger trends in the country. Before we assume that bringing back more local news and weather will increase our viewership, we need to understand why those individuals are not happy right now.

In terms of a stations success, funding from advertisers is very important. A station can run if they lack the audience, but have a financial backing; not the other way around. I would ask the advertisers who have dropped their contracts with the station why they did so. If the reasoning was because the receptionist was rude to them last time they called the station, then we could address that problem instead of rearranging our programing. We could also analize what kinds of local advertisers are leaving. It could be that they have found more of an audience for their product advertising on another time-slot, or more specific special-interest cable channel that speaks more to their market. It would also be benificial to speak with the advertisers as their marketing people may have better insight into the viewership of the late-night news than the station has. The previously mentioned viewer survey could have already been done by the local business advertisers, and this could help the station realign itself with the market. Though it might be difficult to coordinate, it would definately be adventageous to contact other local station to inquire about their contract status with the local bussinesses. A general lackluster response from community business could be a result of a larger-scale economic downturn, rather than the change in programing of one station. If the station wants the support back from local bussiness advertisers, it can't just make assumptions about what is driving contracts with television stations.

Lastly, if all evidence seemed to suggest that the decreased covereage of local news and weather was the reason for increased complaints from viewers and dropped contracts of local business advertisers, then there could be a test piolet week or month of heavier covereage of weather and local news during the late-night broadcasting. If complaints are still pouring in, it might be time to fire the news anchor- or at least to thouroughly analize the possible consequense of and reasons for doing so.

**Reader Commentary for Essay Response – Score 5**

This strong response offers a generally thoughtful and well-developed discussion of the specific evidence needed to evaluate the prompt's argument. In particular, the essay cites the need to obtain evidence detailing the nature and scope of the complaints, the preferences of the audience, and the reasons for the cancelled advertising contracts. Although this response sometimes lacks the full and cogent development of a 6, it does indicate how and why different types of evidence are necessary for a thorough evaluation of the argument. The response also occasionally digresses from its discussion of the evidence needed to evaluate the argument into specific strategies the television station might use to gather the needed evidence. On the whole, the essay conveys ideas clearly and demonstrates facility with standard written English but the response does lack the fluency and precision of language necessary for a 6. For these reasons, the response warrants a score of 5.

**Score 4**

In order for this argument to be strengthened, specific details about the viewers complaining and the businesses that pulled advertising need to be elucidated.

First, the station should be concerned about what the viewers are specifically complaining about in regards to the weather and local news coverage. It is possible that the viewers were complaining for various reasons, which may include the following: the anchorperson or weatherperson, and their physical appearance, or delivery of the news/weather, the quality of the graphics being used during these segments, or the quality or choice of the stories covered. The television station needs to determine the exact complaints, for it would strengthen the above argument if the complaints were specifically about the time spent on the local news and weather.

Along the lines of clarity, the station needs to determine the reasons why local businesses cancelled their advertising contracts. Alternative reasons for this may include another station offering cheaper air time during the same time slot, the local economy going bad, leading to these companies needing to cut costs in advertising, or consumer reports for the companies that detail better times to advertise to their customers. The television station may be losing these advertising contracts for other reasons than time devoted to local news and weather.

Finally, a closer look at viewer numbers might strengthen the argument that time spent on local news and weather is affecting this aspect. Support for this memorandum would come in the form of viewer percentages dropping the after the time devoted to national news increased. The business manager should make sure that the viewer numbers did not increase over the past year because of the increase in national news coverage. This would invalidate the argument in regards to attracting more viewers.

In conclusion, to stregthen or support the argument that restoring the time devoted to local news and weather would attract new viewers and avoid losing contracts, the business manager needs to outline that the complaints from viewers and cancelling of advertising contracts specifically occurred because of the shift to increased national news coverage.

**Reader Commentary for Essay Response – Score 4**

This response earns a score of 4 by demonstrating competence both in its analysis of the argument and in its control of language. The response opens by noting the need for "specific details about the viewers complaining and the businesses that pulled advertising." It goes on to discuss how evidence suggesting alternative explanations for the viewer complaints and loss of advertising would undermine the argument. Although the essay provides some satisfactory support for and development of its analysis, the analysis as a whole is competent rather than generally thoughtful. Similarly, the response conveys meaning with only acceptable clarity.

**Score 3**

The aforementioned arguement is a quality assement of a potentially costly situation. In order for the news agency to ensure its continued success at the level that they once were it is absolutely necessary that they return to the level of local news that they once had. The arguement that has been presented to me seems to be logical one. There is a clear statement of the problem and there is a significant amount of detail that leads readers to see that the decline in the amount of buisness that the station does is directly related to the dereliction that it is given to the local news.

However, in order to make this arguement stronger than it already is, I think that there are certain things that could be added to bolster the information that is already here. First of all, it may be necessary to include some sort of survey results from both the community and local buisnesses to ensure that the reason that they have withdrawn their buisness is because of the program's focus shift. It may be possible that this station is merely doing a bad job at delivering the news and that this is the reason for the decline. It is important to make sure the motivation for changing formats is the correct one.

Secondly, is should be noted that it is important to examine the complaints that were recieved during this time period. The information provided does not specifiy whether there was a spike in the amount of complaints that were comming in, or whether it was merely the same amount as usual. This would also be a point that needs to be examined closely before any definate decision could be made.

All in all, I think that the information that has been provided here is a sound and logical argument for returning the news back to the original format. However, I also feel that if the suggestions that I made were taken seriously, then it may be possible to make this arguement even better than it originally was.

**Reader Commentary for Essay Response – Score 3**

Although the response seems largely to accept the argument's claims, it demonstrates some competence in addressing the task by noting the need for information that could "bolster the information that is already there." The response goes on to question whether advertisers might have withdrawn for other reasons and whether the level of viewer complaints was any different from the usual, but the discussion does not go much beyond emphasizing the need for information. Moreover, though the discussion implies how particular pieces of evidence would strengthen the response, it does not articulate an explanation. Organization here is adequate, and control of language, though somewhat uneven, is sufficient to convey ideas with acceptable clarity. In short, the response's organization and control of language might be sufficient to warrant an upper-half score, the response must receive a score of 3 due to its limited development of relevant analysis.

**Score 2**

In this passage, it is evident that the problem began when the formation of the station time had changed. There is a need for local and weather news in the late-night news programs. What is being targeted here is that if the late-nightly news is for local viewser, than local veiwers should get the local news and weather followed by the world news. As Americans were are affected by what is happening in the world, but the most affected news is of what is happening in the 'back yard.'

There has to be a compromise in news watching. There may be news that affects us in afar instead of up close. Most Americans want to know what happened near by, while others want to know what happened far away. Before the circulatioin had changed, the news station should have given a pole of all the late-night viewers to determine which program would be more benefitial to them, world news or local/weather news.

In late-night news, the only viewers who would view this are the viewers who would be up late, which means these people work through the afternoon and evenings and miss the news broadcast at this time. The early day viewers usually watch the news during the morning and evening news. Even though the late-night views are watching the news, they still want to see what tomorrow will bring as far as controversy in the neighborhood or rain. Advertisements should be played mostly during the evening and the nightly news for better response to the ads. Most Americans work morning to evening and watch the evening and nightly news.

With this news program playing in the late-night, most views are not affected by it. When the news is playing and there is crucial information that needs to be heard, there are some Americans who rarly want to look at local adverisment, especially since they may be sleeping or working during the regular business hours of the advertisee.

There are many points that can be argued on the late-night news mainly because it is late-night. It does not affect the majority of the American population because they are mostly sleeping. For a company who is advertising during this time frame, there should be an inclusion in the contract with the news company that states the advertisement that plays on late-night news should also play on the morning news or on the evening news. With this exposure, the contract would be satisfied.

**Reader Commentary for Essay Response – Score 2**

Rather than identifying specific evidence needed to evaluate the prompt's argument, this response consists largely of a lengthy discussion of why and when people watch news programs. The essay's only acknowledgement of the assigned task appears in the second paragraph where the writer suggests that the station "should have given a pole" to determine what kind of information late-night viewers want. However, this call for additional evidence is not developed or supported in any way.

The response also suffers from errors in usage, grammar, and syntax that can interfere with meaning (for example, in such sentences as "When the news is playing and there is crucial information that needs to be heard, there are some Americans who rarly want to look at local adverisment, especially since they may be sleeping or working during the regular business hours of the advertisee"). Although these errors are not frequent or serious enough to rule out a score of 3, the response must, nevertheless, receive a score of 2 because it largely disregards the specific task directions.

**Score 1**

The viewers concern local news.The local businesses want advertising.

I think the business manager should decrease national news for a television station will increase weather and local news.The local Advertising will be come back.The programs should have national news,local news,weather and advertising.The manager must be look for the stucture of the TV time.

In conclusion, I think the manager should restores the time to national news and talk with local business advertising for a television station.

**Reader Commentary for Essay Response – Score 1**

Although this response suggests some slight understanding of the argument's content and provides some visual cues that suggest organization, it suffers from pervasive errors in grammar and sentence structure that result in near-incoherence. Thus, the appropriate score is a 1.

**Sample Argument Essay 4**

|  |
| --- |
| **(80)** The following is taken from a memo from the advertising director of the Super Screen Movie Production Company.  "According to a recent report from our marketing department, during the past year, fewer people attended Super Screen-produced movies than in any other year. And yet the percentage of positive reviews by movie reviewers about specific Super Screen movies actually increased during the past year. Clearly, the contents of these reviews are not reaching enough of our prospective viewers. Thus, the problem lies not with the quality of our movies but with the public's lack of awareness that movies of good quality are available. Super Screen should therefore allocate a greater share of its budget next year to reaching the public through advertising."  ***Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.*** |

**Benchmark 6**

The argument presented above is relatively sound, however, the author fails to recognize all the elements necessary to evaluate his situation. The idea that more money be invested in advertising may be a helpful one, but perhaps not because people are unaware of the current reviews. To clarify, it may be necessary to advertise more in order to increase sales, however that could be due to many circumstances such as a decrease in the public's overall attendance, an increase in the cost of movies, or a lack of trust in the opinions of the reviewers.

The advertising director first needs to determine the relative proportion of movie goers that choose to see Silver Screen films. That will help him to understand his market share. If the population in general is attending less, then he may still be out-profiting his competitors, despite his individual sales decrease. In fact, his relative sales could be increasing. Determining where he stands in his market will help him to create and implement an action plan.

Another important thing to consder is the relative cost of attending movies to the current standard of living. If the standard of living is decreasing, it may contribute to an overall decrease in attendance. In that case, advertising could be very helpful, in that a clever campaign could emphasize the low cost of movies as compared to many other leisure activities. This could offset financial anxieties of potential customers.

Finally, it is important to remember that people rarely trust movie reviewers. For that reason, it is important that the films appeal to the populus, and not critics alone. The best advertisement in many cases is word of mouth. No matter what critics say, people tend to take the opinions of friends more seriously. This supports continual funding to produce quality movies that will appeal to the average person.

There is no reason that silver screen should not spend more on advertisement, however, there is reason to continue to invest in diverse, quality films. Furthermore, the company must consider carefully what it chooses to emphasize in its advertisement.

**Reader Comment on 6**

Although the essay begins by stating that the argument "is relatively sound," it immediately goes on to develop a critique. The essay identifies three major flaws in the argument and provides a careful and thorough analysis. The main points discussed are that

* the fall-off in attendance might be industry wide
* the general state of the economy might have affected movie attendance
* movie goers "rarely trust movie reviewers"

Each of these points is developed; together they are presented within the context of a larger idea: that while spending more money on advertising may be helpful, the company should "continue to invest in diverse, quality films."

This is a smoothly written, well-developed analysis in which syntactic variety and the excellent use of transitions make for a virtually seamless essay. This paper clearly merits a score of 6.

**Benchmark 5**

The advertising director of Silver Screen should lose his job. It is clear that his analysis of the decrease in attendance in the past year was incomplete. A better qualified individual might have explored the issue further by doing several different things. First of all, surveys of the general population could provide a clue to the decreased viewership. They may find that people aren't as willing to pay the high prices anymore. A survey may also reveal that people are aware of Silver Screen, but opt not to see the films. An inspection of the nature of the films made by Silver Screen could also hint to the root of the problem. If Silver Screen produces a lot of the same type of movie, then the problem may be that they don't produce enough to appeal to the diverse interests of the population. For instance, if their movies typically contain excessive violence and foul language, parents won't take their children to these films. That is a significant portion of the potential viewing population lost.

The ad director mentions that reviewers liked specific films and gave more favorable reviews than in the past. But he neglects to mention the specific numbers- critics may have raved about 2 movies and turned their thumbs down the 10 others. If that is the case, it's no wonder that viewership has declined.

Spending more on advertising, and less on production, as the ad director suggests, could drive the company out of business. If the media builds alot of hype over a new release that was poorly produced, people are more likely to be disappointed, and skeptical about future productions. This is certainly not in the company's best interests. What is in the company's best interest is a broader scope of the problem, and different approaches to solving I

**Reader Comment on 5**

This strong essay begins with an attack on the advertising director of Silver Screen but quickly shifts to identifying major flaws in the argument. The main points of the critique are that

* the real reasons for a decline in viewership have not yet been identified;
* Silver Screen may not produce different kinds of movies to appeal to diverse interests;
* the number of favorably reviewed movies may actually have been very low; and
* spending money to produce a possibly poor movie would hurt rather than help the company.

Although more points are made here than are made in sample 6, each of the points made in the 6 essay is developed. That is not the case here. In this essay, each point is supported (by perhaps an additional sentence), but it is not further developed. The essay is smoothly organized with few but appropriate transitions. The writing is strong with some variety in syntax. For these reasons, this response earns a score of 5.

**Benchmark 4**

Although the reasoning in this arguement is logical, the writer failed to consider other reasons for the disparity between the percentage of people attending the company's movie and the percentage of favorable reviews. Perhaps the fault lies with the reviewers and not the production company; the public may not trust the critics' reviews. Another posibility for the attendance drop is that the general public does not find the subject matter of the movies enticing. If that were the case, spending less on producing new movies in an effort to re-direct funds to advertising could backfire by further limiting the types of movies available to the potential audience. Maybe the general public is simply not impressed with the critically-acclaimed qualities of the movies (such as eloquent screenplays, artful cinematography, and realistic acting) and and would prefer seeing flashy special effects and big-name stars. The possible reasons for the attendance decline are numerous; even aspects not directly related to the movie industry (such as the improving quality of television programming and the increasing popularity of home computer use) may play large roles. The company's management would be wise to consider and study the entire realm of possibilities before making drastic changes in its budget based on one statistical discovery.

**Reader Comment on 4**

This essay identifies and analyzes some important flaws in the argument. Although the number of points mentioned is the same as that in the sample 5 essay, this response remains at the 4 score level because the features of the argument that are identified are not developed or supported.

The essay identifies four points:

* the public might not trust critics
* the movies' subject matter might not be appealing
* the public might prefer seeing special effects or big-name stars rather than good cinematography or realistic acting
* perhaps improvement in TV programming or increased use of home computers has kept people away from movie theaters

Ideas in the essay are conveyed well and clearly; the use of language and syntax are generally strong. But the essay's "bare-bones" analysis give it a list-like quality. It is therefore merely adequate and merits a score of 4.

**Benchmark 3**

This argument states the problem but the conclusion is not compatible to the rest of the statement.

Silver Screen recognized that fewer people attended movies in the studied year. I would recommend that they find out if this was happening with the entire movie market. It might of have been a poor year for movies for all movie companies.

Silver Screen recognized that of the movies that they did, they received favorable reviews. It should be concluded that they are doing well with the movies that they are making. Obviously, they are on track with the consumer in what they are producing.

I understand the conclusion that more people need to be exposed to the movies available for viewing. The last statement focuses on the fact that advertising needs to be increased, but does it by cutting production costs. This is wrong, instead of continuing what is working the company plans on focusing on advertising while taking away from producing. The consumers like the movies they make. If Silver Screen focuses their funds with advertising, producing funds will suffer. It will not matter how much advertising is done, if it is a poorly produced movie, nobody will want to go? Eventually, Silver Screen will get the reputation of producing bad movies. There has to be some compromise which doesn't hurt producing costs.

**Reader Comment on 3**

This essay is flawed. It makes two points, the first of which is undeveloped (paragraph 2) and the second of which (the remainder of the essay) is mainly discussion rather than analysis, although some meager analysis is present. The author also offers a questionable assumption of his or her own in stating that "the consumers like the movies they make." Overall, there is nothing incisive or convincing in this essay. It is loosely organized and not well developed.

The essay is clear; what errors there are never interfere with a reader's understanding, but there are frequent minor errors in language, syntax, and punctuation.

For all of these reasons, the essay is clearly limited and deserves a score of 3.

**Benchmark 2**

Americans are spending millions of their hard earned dollars to see the latest theatrical productions, and we here at Silver Screen want to exploit our share of that profit. Surveys have proven that ourmovies are better than ever, but yet our attendance is lower than ever. This finding screams one shortcoming: advertisement.

Try to think of the last movie you remember. The movie which probably leaps into everyone's mind is Independence Day. Why? Certainly not because of the actual film, but because of all the 'hype' which the movie received. Furthermore, this grand production paid off big for the production company.

Does anyone that you know drive by the theatre just to see what is playing and then pick a film based on the catchiness of the title? No. Viewers buy tickets for movies which they have seen effectively advertised on television and radio.

Not only must Silver Screen advertise more, but we must advertise when it really counts: Monday Night Football, the evening news, awards shows, etc.

Everyone has heard the saying, "you must spend money to make money", and it is proven true in this industry.

From a completely economical standpoint, the ad is actually more important than the film itself. Consumers are compelled by the preview and buy a ticket. I am not suggesting that we compromise the integrity of our films, but I cannot overstate the importance of this decision.

Therefore, I submit that the Silver Screen Production Company attempt to secure 30% of the fiscal budget for advertisement. It will be the best money you have ever spent.

**Reader Comment on 2**

The writer of this seriously flawed essay has adopted the position that she or he works for Silver Screen and that it is her or his job to present in expanded form the fallacious reasoning of the argument. In so doing, the writer turns the argument task into an issue-like discussion. The writer presents no analysis of the argument.

The essay is characterized by a series of undeveloped paragraphs, yet there is some variety in syntax and there is adequate control of both language and the elements of writing. However, even though the writing may be at a 4 score level, the absence of any kind of critique requires a score of 2.

**Benchmark 1**

The author make a conclusion that Silver Screen should spend more of its budget next year on reaching the public through advertising and less on producing new movies. Becase the author think the public is lack of awareness that movies quality are available. Althogh the percentage of generally favorable comments by movie reviews actually increased during this period, it is the opnion of the movie reviews which not stand for the reviews of the most people. So these fact is not sufficient provide the conclusion. Furthermore the author think we need let more prospective viewer have the same opnion of the movie viewer. It is not unreasonable that it will decrease his inference. So I don't think it is a good conclusion for Silver Screen to spend more money on advertise instead of improvethe quality of movie.

**Reader Comment on 1**

This fundamentally flawed essay is characterized by three essential deficiencies:

* It provides little evidence of the ability to understand and analyze the argument.
* It provides little evidence of the ability to develop an organized response.
* It contains a pervasive pattern of errors in grammar and usage that results in incoherence.

Where the language makes sense and looks controlled, the writer has relied on the language and phrasing of the argument topic. Where the writer has relied on her or his own knowledge and command of language and syntax, we see serious and fundamental deficiencies. Thus, this response requires a score of 1.

**Sample Argument Essay 5**

|  |
| --- |
| *(142)* Hospital statistics regarding people who go to the emergency room after roller-skating accidents indicate the need for more protective equipment. Within that group of people, 75 percent of those who had accidents in streets or parking lots had not been wearing any protective clothing (helmets, knee pads, etc.) or any light-reflecting material (clip-on lights, glow-in-the-dark wrist pads, etc.). Clearly, the statistics indicate that by investing in high-quality protective gear and reflective equipment, roller skaters will greatly reduce their risk of being severely injured in an accident. 142  ***Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.*** |

**Essay Response — Score 6**

The argument above is well-presented and appears to be relatively sound at first glance: because of the hospital statistics regarding people who go to the emergency room after roller-skating accidents, the roller skaters should investing in high-quality protective gear and reflective equipment in order to reduce their risk of being severely injured in an accident. However, as more light is shed on the issue and more detailed facts are concerned, it is easy to see that the argument suffers from several grave fallacies in its assumptions as well as commits a false analogy.

To begin with, as mentioned in the argument, there are two distinct kinds of gear—preventative gear, such as light reflecting material, and protective gear, such as helmets. Preventative gear is intended to warn others, presumably for the most part motorists, of the presence of the roller skater. It works only if the “other” is a responsible and caring individual who will afford the skater the necessary space and attention. Protective gear is intended to reduce the effect of any accident, whether it is caused by another, the skater or some force of nature. Protective gear does little, if anything, to prevent accidents but is presumed to reduce the injuries that occur in an accident. The statistics on injuries suffered by skaters would be more interesting if the skaters were grouped into those wearing no gear at all, those wearing protective gear only, those wearing preventative gear only and those wearing both. These statistics could provide skaters with a clearer understanding of which kinds of gear are more beneficial.

In addition, the argument is much weakened by the fact that it does not take into account the inherent differences between skaters who wear gear and those who do not. It is at least likely that those who wear gear may be generally more responsible and/or safety conscious individuals. The skaters who wear gear may be less likely to cause accidents through careless or dangerous behavior. It may, in fact, be their natural caution and responsibility that keeps them out of the emergency room rather than the gear itself. Also, the statistic above is based entirely on those who are skating in streets and parking lots which are relatively dangerous places to skate in the first place. People who are generally more safety conscious may choose to skate in safer areas such as parks or back yards.

Moreover, the statistic also can not make sense when come to the conclusion that safety gear prevents severe injuries. The conclusion suggests that it is presumed that people come to the emergency room only with severe injuries. This is certainly not the case. Also, given that skating is a recreational activity that may be primarily engaged in during evenings and weekends when doctors' offices are closed, skater with less severe injuries may be especially likely to come to the emergency room for treatment.

Last but not least, there is absolutely no evidence provided that high quality gear is any more beneficial than other kinds of gear. For example, a simple white t-shirt may be easily catched by

others' sight that provide the same or even more preventative benefit as a higher quality, more expensive, shirt designed only for skating. Before skaters are encouraged to invest heavily in gear, a more complete understanding of the benefit provided by individual pieces of gear would be helpful.

Overall, the argument is far from forceful enough to persuade the roller skaters should invest in high-quality protective gear and reflective equipment in order to reduce their risk. Before any final decisions are made about whether the roller skaters should invest in high-quality protective gear and reflective equipment, much work is left for the arguer to do to make his/her argument more logical and cogent.

**Reader Commentary for Essay Response — Score 6**

This outstanding response presents a comprehensive examination of the argument’s root flaws. Specifically, the response exposes several points that undermine the argument:

that preventative gear and protective gear are not the same

that skaters who wear gear may be less prone to accidents because they are, by nature, more responsible    and cautious

that the statistics do not differentiate by the severity of the injuries

that gear may not need to be high-quality to be beneficial  The discussion is smoothly and logically organized, and each point is thoroughly and cogently developed. In addition, the writing is succinct, economical, and contains few minor errors. Sentences are varied and complex, and the diction is expressive and precise.  In sum, this response exemplifies a score of 6 because it presents cogent, well-articulated critique and conveys meaning skillfully.

**Essay Response — Score 5**

This argument is too weak to be convincing, relying on the correlation of two incomplete statistics. Correlation does not always imply causation, though it might be tempting to believe it is. Here, the implication is that protective gear will reduce the risk of accident. It assumes that lack of protective gear is the main cause of severe injury in roller skates, which is not necessarily true under any circumstance.  First, it claims that 75 percent of roller-skaters who have had accidents in streets or parking lots were not wearing any protective gear. This says nothing about the cause or the degree of severity of injuries. Some may have been hit by vehicles in broad daylight, in which case neither padding nor reflective material would have saved a skater. Common sense dictates that padding will reduce your risk of being injured, but in extreme cases, padding may do very little.  The argument also ignores the fact that roller-skating is something of an “extreme sport.” While the injured may have been injured with roller skates on the street or in a parking lot, the injuries may have resulted from the skater's predilection for performing dangerous tricks. Often, these tricks involve careful balancing on thin objects while moving at high speed, and it is questionable how much padding would protect a skater. One would need to compare this to the statistics of injuries occurring in skate parks.

Lastly, the last 25 percent of emergency room cases of this type are also ignored. What would be useful are the types of injuries incurred on these people as a basis of comparison. They may all have been injured so severely that they are forced into extended hospital stays. By the same argument as given above, 100% of all skaters wearing protective gear suffered extreme injuries, thus it is imperative that skaters not wear any such accessories at all.

The use of statistics is a shaky way of bolstering an already decent argument. There are too many implications derived from the data the way it is presented. As such, the numbers are an indirect method of supporting the need for more protective accessories in skating. The argument could be improved by providing more statistics detailing the nature of injuries and a better representative group with which to compare data. One simply cannot compare injuries caused by carelessness or recklessness as opposed to general accidents, at least not statistically, as carelessness will improve the chances of injury. As it stands, the argument has too many holes with which it can be torn apart.

**Reader Commentary for Essay Response — Score 5**

This strong response sets out to critique the argument’s use of statistics and its assumption that lack of protective gear causes more severe injuries, and it does just that. The response identifies and critiques insufficiencies of the statistics that cause the argument to be less than compelling:

that the statistics do not differentiate between the causes or severity of the injuries

that the statistics only represent people who skate in parking lots and streets, and that these people may  engage in more dangerous activities than those who skate in skate parks

• that no information is given about the extent of the injuries for the other 25 percent who were wearing

protective gear, and that their injuries might have been comparable to or worse than those who did not wear gear   The respondent develops each of these points by offering alternative explanations and, in paragraphs 2 and 3, by calling for additional data that would be needed to confirm or refute the argument’s assumptions. The response does not analyze the argument as insightfully or develop its critique as fully as required for a 6, but the clear organization, strong control of language, and substantial degree of development warrant more than a score of 4.

**Essay Response — Score 4**

  This argument is based on the claim that investing in high-quality protective gear and reflective equipment, roller skaters will reduce the risk of being severly injured in an accident. This is based on a stastic that states that 75 percent of the people who go to the emergency room after a roller- skating accident had not been wearing any protective clothing or light-reflecting material. However, this argument makes many assumptions which weaken the argument as a whole.   First, the argument assumes that the people who went to the emergency room after roller-skating injuries were skating properly. The accidents could have been avoided if the skaters were following skating rules, such as where to skate and obeying laws of traffic. Any violations to these skating rules could have been the reason the skaters were injured. However, the argument fails to address this issue, which makes it unsound.   Second, the argument assumes that the skaters who were injured did not take any abnormal risks. The accidents could have occured because of the risks taken by the skaters. Readers do not know if the statistics were collected from a representative sample. The data could have been collected from a group of young males who tend to take risks greater than those of older women, but the argument does not address this issue. The argument assumes that the statistics sample the population accurately, which provides weakness to this argument.

Last, the argument assumes that protective equipment will solve the problem of sever roller-skating injuries. In actuality, the assumptions that the argument makes prior to this assumption creates a great deal of skepticism for readers. There are many external factors that were not addressed in this argument and that would alter the conclusion if they were considered. It weakens the argument to assume that the addition of protective gear would directly reduce the risk of being severely injured in an accident.

For all these reasons, the argument can be viewed as fundamentally unsound. The argument could be strengthened by addressing whether or not the skaters followed rules and laws effecting skating. It could be strengthened by identifying the risks taken by the skaters from which the data was collected. And the argument could be greatly stengthened by eliminating any external forces or addressing them in the argument. All of these adjustments would provide the agrument with a solid foundation.

**Reader Commentary for Essay Response — Score 4**

This response presents a competent critique of the argument and conveys meaning adequately.  After paraphrasing the argument in paragraph 1, the respondent analyzes some questionable assumptions:

that skaters who went to the emergency room had been skating properly and obeying traffic laws

that skaters who went to the emergency room did not take any abnormal risks

that statistics were collected from a representative sample

that protective equipment will solve the problem of severe roller-skating injuries   At first glance, the response appears well organized and each point seems equally developed. However, it is not clear that “skating properly” and “not tak[ing] any abnormal risks” are two separate issues as suggested by the organization of the response. Rather than organizing information logically, the respondent attempts to fit the critique into a formulaic package. In addition, the discussion in paragraph 4 offers little in the way of analysis, instead relying on empty generalities. Despite appearances, discussion of the points listed above is only adequately developed and competently presented. The response is not thorough or thoughtful enough to merit a score of 5.   The writer's general control of language also supports a score of 4. The paper is free of significant or persistent errors. Diction is apt and sentence construction is generally skillful.

**Essay Response — Score 3**

In many roller skating accidents the person injured is not wearing appropriate protective equipment. The statement assumes that the cause of the accident was the injured persons lack of high-quality protective gear and reflective equipment. The statment does not address the fact that accidents can occur and injuries may result even if a person does have the appropraite high-quality protective gear and reflective equipment.   The hospital statistics does show that 25% of those injured in roller-skating accidents in a street or parking lot were wearing some form of protective clothing although they were still injured. This shows that their is a 1 in 4 chance that someone wearing protective equipment will stil be injured if involved in an accident. The arguement  depends purely on assumptions that the accidents that roller-skaters are involved in are minor and not life threatening. The their was a greater amount of life-threateing injuries such as roller-skater verses automobile, the fact that they wore protective equipment would be of little help to the injured person.

More analysis would need to be done before deciding if the high-quality protective gear and reflective equipment would greatly reduce the risk of being severly injured in an accident. One must consider what types of accidents roller-skaters are most likely to get into and weither they would be injured despite the fact that they wear protective equipment.

**Reader Commentary for Essay Response — Score 3**

This response demonstrates some competence in its critique of the argument and in conveying meaning but is obviously flawed.

This response suffers from poor reasoning, both in its interpretation and in its criticism of the argument. First, the response misstates the argument’s conclusion in paragraph 1: “The statement assumes that the cause of the accident was the injured persons lack of high-quality protective gear and reflective equipment.” From this faulty reading of the prompt, a slew of illogic progresses.

The response focuses its critique on the 25 percent of skaters who suffered injuries despite having worn some type of protective or reflective equipment. From this fact, the respondent draws a faulty conclusion that there is a 1 in 4 chance that someone wearing protective equipment will still be injured in an accident. Even if that followed from the original statistics, the respondent does not explain how such a fact weakens the argument.

In the end the response does offer two potentially relevant points of criticism:

* that the type of injuries is not addressed

that the type of accidents is not addressed  However, these points are undeveloped; the response calls for more information about types of accidents and   injuries but does not explain how such information would strengthen the argument.   There are a few minor errors in writing. However, it is lack of development and poor reasoning that force a score of 3.

**Essay Response — Score 2**

 The judgement is questionable. First, the the statistics focus on the protective equipment of rollerskating, but it shows us that statistics in streets or parking lots. Isn't it strang? whether the equipment is useful or not should be test in the rollerskating field.   Second, the statistics only show the 75 percent of people who go to the emergency room without protective  equipment, but how about the people who wear equipment. Maybe the people with protective equipment become careless and they are dead in accidents, so they are not counted in these statistics.  In order to make consummer believe the use of the protective equipments, the satistics should show the injure population with and without equipments and the noninjure pepulation with and without equipments. Moreover, it should divide the injure conditions. There is a large different from bone break and skin break.  Finally, without more detailed, I do not think the judgement is correct.

**Reader Commentary for Essay Response — Score 2**

This response demonstrates serious weaknesses in analytical writing. The response attempts critique based on logical analysis but fails to provide reasonable development.  The response offers three other points of critique:

• the statistics are “questionable” because they only represent skaters who skate in the street or parking lots (“it shows us that statistics in streets or parking lots. Isn’t it strang?”)

• the statistics are misleading because they do not include skaters who have died while wearing protective equipment

• the statistics should differentiate between type of injuries (“it should divide the injure conditions”)

While these are valid points of critique (that are often used in more successful responses), this response fails to provide relevant and reasonable support for them. In addition, this response has serious problems in the use of language and sentence structure that interfere with meaning (see examples above).

**Essay Response — Score 1**

  If the assumptions contained within this arguement are true then it could be correlated that not only would protective gear assist in reducing injury occurance amongst rollerbladers but could also initiate city code to enforce such gear to be worn. If the arguement is a falsehood and the injury could be conected more to the time of day injury occured or even the sport itself then there will no change in the injury occurance rate.

**Reader Commentary for Essay Response — Score 1**

 This fundamentally deficient response offers two hypothetical scenarios: what would happen if the argument were true; and what would happen if the argument were false. There is no evidence of an ability to understand or analyze the argument. In addition, each of the two sentences contains minor errors in grammar. However, it is primarily the lack of critique that forces a score of 1.

**Sample Argument Essay 6**

|  |
| --- |
| The following appeared in an article written by Dr. Karp, an anthropologist.  "Twenty years ago, Dr. Field, a noted anthropologist, visited the island of Tertia and concluded from his observations that children in Tertia were reared by an entire village rather than by their own biological parents. However, my recent interviews with children living in the group of islands that includes Tertia show that these children spend much more time talking about their biological parents than about other adults in the village. This research of mine proves that Dr. Field's conclusion about Tertian village culture is invalid and thus that the observation-centered approach to studying cultures is invalid as well. The interview-centered method that my team of graduate students is currently using in Tertia will establish a much more accurate understanding of child- rearing traditions there and in other island cultures." 10, 21, 23  ***Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.*** |

**Essay Response — Score 6**

It might seem logical, at first glance, to agree with the argument in Dr. Karp’s article that children in Tertia actually are raised by their biological parents (and perhaps even, by implication, that an observation-centered approach to anthropological study is not as valid as an interview-centered one). However, in order to fully evaluate this argument, we need to have a significant amount of additional evidence. The argument could end up being much weaker than it seems, or it might actually be quite valid. In order to make that determination, we need to know more then analyze what we learn.

The first piece of evidence that we would need in order to evaluate Dr. Karp’s claims is information about whether or not Tertia and the surrounding island group have changed significantly in the past 20 years. Dr. Field conducted his observational study 20 years ago, and it is possible that Tertia has changed significantly since then. For example, if we had evidence that in teh intervening years Westerners had settled on the island and they introduced a more typical Western-style family structure, it would certainly weaken Dr. Karp’s argument. In that case, the original study could have been accurate, and Dr. Karp’s study could be correct, as well, though his conclusion that Dr.Field’s method is ineffective would be seriously weakened.

Another piece of evidence that might help us evaluate this claim involves the exact locations where Dr. Karp’s interviews took place. According to this article, Dr. Karp and his graduate students conducted interviews of “children living in the group of islands that includes Tertia.” If we were to learn that they never interviewed a single Tertian child, it would significantly weaken the conclusion. It could turn out to be the case, for example, that children on Tertia are raised communally, whereas children on other islands nearby are raised by their biological parents.

In order to fully evaluate this article, we would also need to learn more about the interview questions that Dr. Karp’s team used. What exactly did they ask? We don’t know, nor do we know what the children’s responses actually were. What did they say about their biological parents? The mere fact that they speak more frequently about their biological parents than they do about other adults does not mean that they are raised by their biological parents. It would significantly undermine Dr. Karp’s argument if it turned out that the children said things like how much they missed their parents or how their parents had left them in a communal environment. Without knowing WHAT the children said, it is hard to accept Dr. Karp’s conclusion.

It is slightly more difficult to discuss teh evidence we might need in order to evaluate the more interesting claims in Dr. Karp’s article, namely his extension of the results of his study to a conclusion that interview-centered methods are inherently more valid than observational-centered approaches. In order to fully evaluate this claim, in fact, we would need to look at many more examples of interview-based and observation-based anthropological studies and we would also need to look into different study designs. Perhaps Dr. Field did not conduct an effective observational study, but other observational approaches could be effective. In order to make such grandiose claims, Dr. Karp really needs a lot of additional evidence (ideally a meta -analysis of hundreds of anthropological studies).

Clearly, then, we need to have additional evidence in order to get a more complete understanding of the strengths and weaknesses of Dr. Karp’s article. We need to know about Tertia and the surrounding islands, whether or not they have changed over the past 20 years. We also need to know about study design (Dr. Karp’s and Dr. Field’s). And we really need a lot more information if we want to extend the results of a study about one island culture to all anthropological fieldwork.

**Reader Commentary for Essay Response — Score 6**

This outstanding response clearly addresses the specific task directions and presents a cogent, insightful analysis by specifically detailing the impact that different pieces of evidence would have on the argument. The introductory paragraph sets up the organization of the response, and each body paragraph provides the sort of compelling development typical in responses that receive a score of 6. For example, after the writer discusses possible evidence that Tertian child rearing practices have changed over the past 20 years, he or she clearly explains the impact information about those changes might have on the argument, saying, “In that case, the original study could have been accurate, and Dr. Karp’s study could be correct, as well, though his conclusion that Dr. Field’s method is ineffective would be seriously weakened.” Not only is this argument compelling, but it also demonstrates sophisticated syntax and facility with language.

There is more insightful development in the fifth paragraph, in which the writer examines Dr. Karp’s claims about interview-based studies. Although there are a few typos and minor errors here, nothing in the response distracts from the overall fluency of the writing. Sentences like this one demonstrate the fluent and precise diction and varied syntax that are evident throughout the response: “It could turn out to be the case, for example, that children on Tertia are raised communally, whereas children on other islands nearby are raised by their biological parents.”

Because of its compelling and insightful development and fluent and precise language, this response fits all of the bullet points for a 6.

**Essay Response — Score 5**

There seems to be an abundance of evidence that, if we were to examine it closely, might make us reconsider Dr. Karp’s argument here. If we look first at the evidence that might weaken this argument, we can see a lot of the problems with Dr. Karp’s article. It would certainly weaken the argument if we were to discover that Dr. Karp and his students did not actually conduct any of their interviews on the island of Tertia itself. Looking closely at the article, we see that Dr. Karp claims the interviews were conducted with children from the island group that includes Tertia. There is no evidence that they interviewed Tertian children. It would definitely weaken the argument if we were to learn that they interviewed children only on islands close to Tertia. Those islands may or may not have similar child-rearing traditions, and geographic proximity does not guarantee societal similarity.

Another piece of evidence that would weaken the argument could come from transcripts of the interviews themselves. Dr. Karp’s article makes the claim that the children “spend much more time talking about their biological parents than about other adults,” but he gives no indication of what exactly they say about their biological parents. After all, the children may be talking about how they never see their parents.

One more important piece of evidence that might undermine the argument Dr. Karp is making in this article. He admits that twenty years have passed since Dr. Field’s study was conducted, but he does not provide evidence that proves child-rearing techniques have not changed significantly in that time. Any number of factors could have led to a significant shift in how children are raised. Influences from other cultures, significant catastrophic events, or a change in government structures could have led to a change in family dynamics. Any evidence of such changes would clearly undermine Dr. Karp’s argument.

If we went looking for evidence that could strengthen the argument, we might also find something interesting. Obviously, some of the evidence above might strengthen the argument if they were NOT as discussed above (e.g., if there were evidence that the Tertian islands have NOT changed since Dr. Field’s study or if there were transcripts that showed the children spoke about how much they loved living with their biological parents). However, if we discovered that there are numerous interview-based studies that confirm Dr. Karp’s findings, it would go a long way toward bolstering his claim about Tertian child-rearing AND his claim about interview-centered studies being more effective. Another piece of evidence that would strengthen Dr. Karp’s argument is undermining Dr. Field’s original study. Maybe Dr. Field was sloppy, for example.

Dr. Karp’s article, then, ends up looking like something of an empty shell. Depending on the evidence we find to fill it out, we may discover that it is quite convincing, or we could determine that he is full of hot air.

**Reader Commentary for Essay Response — Score 5**

This strong response presents a generally thoughtful and well-developed analysis of the argument, and it follows the specific task directions quite clearly. This writer approaches the task by first discussing the evidence that might weaken Dr. Karp’s argument and then, in somewhat less depth, considering the evidence that could strengthen it. In both cases the writer analyzes the ways in which the evidence would bear on the argument. For example, the writer notes, “Influences from other cultures, significant catastrophic events, or a change in government structures could have led to a change in family dynamics. Any evidence of such changes would clearly undermine Dr. Karp’s argument.” Although the development presented here is strong, the response does not present the compelling development required for a 6. For instance, in the first para-graph there is some repetition, and in the third paragraph the reader must fill in the implications of potential “changes” in Tertia, which are not fully fleshed out. How could a catastrophic event or a change in governmental structure have led to changes in child rearing traditions? The development, then, is strong but not outstanding. Also, the response demonstrates some facility with language, though it does not convey meaning skillfully enough to merit a score of 6. In general, the response demonstrates strong writing skills, in spite of some minor errors like the sentence fragment that begins paragraph three. Sentences like this one demonstrate the quality of the writing seen throughout the response: “Those islands may or may not have similar child- rearing traditions, and geographic proximity does not guarantee societal similarity.” In terms of writing skill and analysis, then, this response earns a score of 5.

**Essay Response — Score 4**

Dr. Karp’s arguments that his research proves that obervation-centered research is invalid and that his interview-centered method “will establish a much more accurate understanding of child-rearing traditions there and in other island cultures” need more support. While the findings from Dr. Karp’s interviews do challenge Dr. Field’s results, one then cannot make the assumption that Dr. Field’s research is invalid. This essay will attempt to explain three ways in which Dr. Karp can strengthen his argument.

First, Dr. Karp should provide more information about the content of the interviews. Misinterpretation from observation can be as likely as misinterpretation in interivews. It is possible that while children may spend more time talking about their own biological parents, other people from the village are still assisting in most of the rearing of the child. Perhaps asking the children how much time they spend with their parents, who disciplines them, and other specific questions about rearing would provide a more complete answer about who exactly is raising the children.

Second, Dr. Karp could provide some information about societal changes in the past twenty years. If there have been significant changes on the island of Tertia, it is possible that both anthropologists are correct. Twenty years ago, the entire village raised children, and now, biological parents raise their own children. Recents events could explain the change - such as introduction of Western mass media or changes in government (monarchy to democracy). Perhaps even interviewing adults to get a better understanding on child rearing. Not to mention, interpretting information from children and using that information to generalize about an entire island is not the most effective means.

Thirdly, Dr. Karp needs more proof that the observation-centered approach to studying cultures in invalid. A potential mistake in one article can hardly invalidate an entire method of research. Other anthropologists who employ the interview-centered method need to dispute the work of anthropoligsts who use the observation-centered approach. Only when a significant amount of research can be disproved can an entire method of research be invalidated.

To conclude, Dr. Karp needs to do more research and provide more evidence before his large claims can be fully supported. In fact, it will take more than Dr. Karp alone to prove observation-centered method of research is invalid and further, that the interview-centered method is better. In terms of his own research, Dr. Karp needs to conduct more interviews on the Tertia islands and scientifically prove Dr. Field’s research wrong.

**Reader Commentary for Essay Response — Score 4**

This adequate response manages to identify some important features of the argument, presenting a competent examination and generally following the task directions. The response does not merit a score of 5 or 6, however, because it does not present compelling or insightful development. The response identifies basic points about the content of the interviews, possible changes in Tertia, and observation-centered studies, but these points are developed only adequately. Development in paragraph four (“Thirdly . . . ”) is generic and thin, and the final paragraph just recapitulates the assertions made earlier. The response does follow the specific task instructions, but it does not develop its discussion of specific evidence fully. For example, there is a

claim that “specific questions about rearing would provide a more complete answer about who

exactly is raising the children,” but the response does not explain what sorts of questions would give which answers or how those answers would strengthen or weaken the argument. Also, language control in this response is merely adequate, not strong. There are some typos and other errors (e.g., a sentence fragment in paragraph 3: “Perhaps even interviewing adults to get a better understanding on child rearing”), but the response generally demonstrates control of the

conventions of standard written English, and main points are made with reasonable clarity. Because of its adequate control of language and competent analysis, this response earns a score of 4.

**Essay Response — Score 3**

It will be very inappropriate to condemn Dr. Field’s observations and findings. A critical look and analyses of the argument shows that details of Dr. Field’s work was not given out. In fact, it is sad on the side of the writer to think that Dr.Fields work is invalid.

First, the fact that the children of Tertia spend much time talking about their biological parents than about other adults in the village can be interpreted in a different way. The writer did not give any clue on what exactly the children were saying about their biological parents. It could be that they were talking about their parents irresponsibility of rearing them by themselves than leaving them in the hands of the whole community to bring them up. In fact, the argument could have been strengthened if the writer gave what exactly the children were talking about.

On the other hand, the writer failed on his or her part as a researcher to look at the time frame from the time Dr. Field did his analyses to the the time writer also conducted His or Her research. This would have given him the insight as what new developments has taken place within the twenty years gap that Dr. Field did His analyses. The writer’s argument would have given a lot of meaning if the writer had research into the cultural developments that has taken place since the time Dr. fields last visited and didcompleted His work at Tertia.

Also, as a reader, the tone this writing is not very convincing. It almost seems like Dr. Karp is making Dr. Fields look bad, instead of supporting his own research with information. He really only says one sentence about his own research, the rest of it is about how Fields work is not as good and saying things about Fields work. He needs to have more details about his own work to really sell the reader on it. He needs to write more about what the interview-centered method is, since he does not even say what it is. This will be more convincing if it is less of an attack on Dr. Field and more about the researches.

On the whole the writer’s work is incomplete and His or Her criticisms are unfounded. The writer needs to change the qualitative way of His or Her research into a more quatitative approach. If done in this way the impact of His or Her findings will be very strong and convincing.

**Reader Commentary for Essay Response — Score 3**

Although this response analyzes some important features of the argument, it is limited in development and often lacks acceptable clarity in expressing its ideas. In particular, this response contains occasional major errors and frequent minor errors that can interfere with meaning. Misused words, subject/verb agreement problems, and other lapses occur throughout the response. In addition to the problems with language control, the response demonstrates limited relevant development. It is true that the response makes an attempt to follow the specific task instructions, identifying the fact that the argument might be strengthened by evidence that the children were talking in a positive manner about their parents. However, the response does not explain exactly how this evidence would strengthen the argument. Similarly, there is discussion of the elapsed time

between the two studies, but the response does not clarify how information about the “cultural developments” over the past 20 years would strengthen the argument Dr. Karp is making. Additionally, some of the points the response is making are not actually relevant to an analysis of the logic of the argument. The discussion of Dr. Karp’s tone in the fourth paragraph, for example, is a rhetorical critique, not a logical one. There is an attempt to talk about evidence (“He needs to have more details . . . ”), but the focus in this paragraph is on “selling” the reader, not creating a

persuasive argument. Because of its limited development and language control, this response earns a score of 3.

**Essay Response — Score 2**

The argument is on the article written by Dr. Karp , an anthropologist and his study and the new plan to study the same in the tertia region.Dr.Karp has written an article on Children in Tertia and about the culture.

The arguement is that they have not mention the type of intreview and the type of questions of the interviwes.They haven’t indicate the education level in the children and the background of the children. What are all the things the team is going to observe and study on the child rearing tradition is not clearly mention.

The team is going to study and correlate the tradition with the other island culture but there is a possibility of different environment of other island or differnt biological parents. The resource availability on one island is different than the other is also a possibility . In that situation it is not possible to correlate the culture between to iceland.

There is a possibility , Dr. Field’s interview time , lacking of infrastructure in the tartia. There was no developement of schools and other refreshment activity or the parents may not spent enough time with the children due to various reasons and that effect to the children , so they might have spend more time talking about their biological parent.

To support the argument more information about the nature, cultural background and also the type of infrastructure presence in the area is require, the kind of study carring out in the study area is require. Which would help to give more support the argument.

**Reader Commentary for Essay Response — Score 2**

This response demonstrates serious weaknesses in analytical writing. There seem to be some attempts at logical analysis, though none that specifically and clearly examine the evidence that might weaken or strengthen the argument. Additionally, there is little or no relevant or reasonable support for the writer’s points. In large part, the lack of logical development seems to be due to the serious and frequent problems with language control seen throughout the response. There are basic errors in just about every sentence of the response, and these errors frequently interfere with meaning. This sentence exemplifies the problems seen throughout the response: “There was no developement of schools and other refreshment activity or the parents may not spent enough time with the children due to various reasons and that effect to the children , so they might have spend more time talking about their biological parent.” The writer isattempting to discuss some points that are relevant to an analysis of this argument, but meaning is obscured by all of the errors present. However, some meaning can be discerned, and these errors are not severe enough to drop the score to a 1.

**Essay Response — Score 1**

Twenty years ago Dr field an anthropologist found result after reserch that in small village of tertia children reared by entire village but according to dr karp he talked most of the children that they talk about there boilogical parents. so it conclude that the reserch of dr field is unvalid now and what type of methods dr field used may be not cover all aspects of there culture and also other cultures of other islands. reared the children by entire village is not logical but in some cultures there are some surprising customs . so may be dr field did not anlysed the culture of that island on various parameters , which we are using now a days.intrveiw with children and observing their

behaviour is important because some time the person talk one thing and behave in different way look like either he not telling correct or he is showing his altitude in misguiding way. i think the behaviour of the children shows proper report of research and you can observe their altitude to the other adult peoples of the village and to their own biological parents.The expert reserch scholer can easily feel their emotions and behavour during some time stay with their culture. dr field maybe more research time, maybe, for longer.

**Reader Commentary for Essay Response — Score 1**

This fundamentally deficient response mainly consists of a summary of the prompt, and although there is some evidence of understanding, the response provides little evidence of the ability to develop and organize an analysis of the argument. Also, severe problems in language persistently interfere with meaning. In fact, the material that does not come directly from the prompt is more or less incomprehensible.

**Sample Argument Essay 7**

|  |
| --- |
| The following appeared in a memorandum from the owner of Movies Galore, a chain of video rental stores.  “In order to reverse the recent decline in our profits, we must reduce operating expenses at Movies Galore’s ten video rental stores. Since we are famous for our special bargains, raising our rental prices is not a viable way to improve profits. Last month our store in downtown Marston significantly decreased its operating expenses by closing at 6:00 P.M. rather than 9:00 P.M. and by reducing its stock by eliminating all movies released more than five years ago. Therefore, in order to increase profits without jeopardizing our reputation for offering great movies at low prices, we recommend implementing similar changes in our other nine Movies Galore stores.”  ***Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be addressed in order to decide whether implementing the recommendation is likely to have the predicted result and explain how the answers to those questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.*** |

**Essay Response — Score 6**

One question which needs to be addressed before implementing the recommendation is whether there are not other ways to improve profits besides cutting operating expenses. Without proof, the author decides, first, that there are only two viable options for increasing the profits of Movies Galore: raising rental prices, and cutting costs. He rules out the first course, and hence claims the second option must be chosen. But it seems there may be alternative methods of increasing profits, such as initiating advertising campaigns or closing unprofitable Movies Galore locations.

Even if it is granted that there are only two options for increasing profitability — cutting costs, and raising rental prices — one might wonder why raising rental prices  is so unthinkable. The author implies that because Movies Galore is famous for special bargains, raising the rental prices would eliminate this competitive advantage and decrease profitability. However, in making this conclusion, he makes several assumptions without considering questions that need to be addressed. First, he assumes that there is no room to raise current prices and yet maintain lower prices than competitors. One would need to ask if prices could be increased slightly, while keeping them cheap. Even if there is no room for such a strategy, the author assumes that Movies Galore’s reputation for bargain pricing would evaporate if they increased their prices slightly. Perhaps such a reputation would be widespread enough to persist despite a slight increase in prices. And thirdly, even if the reputation for bargains would be eliminated by an increase in prices, the author assumes that Movies Galore cannot

change course and be successful in some other way. Perhaps it could instead become known as the store with the friendliest employees. Perhaps it already is, and the author is wrong to believe that a causal relationship between bargain prices and success exists, when the real cause of Movies Galore’s good reputation is entirely independent of its prices. The author needs to answer these questions to convince us that profits are caused by bargains, and not by the other factors that may be involved.

Another question that needs to be raised is whether or not the downtown Marston store is truly analogous to the other nine Movies Galore stores. The author seems to assume that because the cost-cutting measures worked at the Marston location, it will work at the others, but this is far from clear. Perhaps the patrons of the other Movies Galore locations would resent such changes in the hours and stock of their local stores.

Perhaps the most important question that needs to be asked is whether the Marston location’s changes truly increased profitability. The author writes that the Marston store decreased operating expenses by closing earlier and cutting its stock, but he makes no mention of increased profitability. It is quite possible that the Marston location’s profits decreased as a result of their cost cutting, and this is a question that needs to be addressed. The author then jumps to the conclusion that taking similar measures would increase profitability at other locations, though such a connection has not even been established at the Marston store.

Even if the cost-cutting measures increased profitability at the Marston store last month (and a causal relationship, though presumably assumed, is still far from evident), there is no guarantee that such measures would continue to increase profitability over time. One would need to ask: Why not observe how the Marston location’s action affect profitability over several months, before implementing such sweeping changes at every store? A single month is a very short time span, and the habits of customers may change slowly. As word gets around that the Marston store has cut their hours and their selection, they may in fact jeopardize their reputation for offering “great movies at low prices.” After all, the name of the franchise is Movies Galore, and by drastically reducing the available selection, they may alienate their customer base. If, as mentioned above, Movies Galore is famous for more than its great bargains—if customers prefer Movies Galore because of its selections, as well— then such a move may drastically reduce profits over time. It seems extremely rash to implement such a new and relatively untried strategy at every Movies Galore location, before the effects can be fully observed and interpreted.

**Reader Commentary for Essay Response — Score 6**

This outstanding response clearly addresses the specific task directions and presents a cogent, insightful analysis by discussing specific questions that need to be addressed in order to analyze the argument presented. It is worth noting that although the directions ask for questions, it is not necessary that these be phrased in question form. The response articulately discusses the information needed to evaluate whether the recommendation is likely to have the predicted result and demonstrates how this information would help to evaluate the recommendation. There are many examples of ways in which the writer addresses questions without putting them in question form (e.g., “he assumes that there is no room to raise current prices and yet maintain lower prices than competitors. One would need to ask...” or “it seems there may be alternative methods of increasing profits”). Throughout this response, the writer provides the cogent development typical of a 6 response. For example, the discussion of Movies Galore’s reputation gets at a number of flaws in the argument’s reasoning, making nuanced points (e.g., “Perhaps it could instead become known as the store with the friendliest employees. Perhaps it already is...”) that create a compelling case for the writer’s objections. Transitions are natural, and the paragraphs build on one another, succinctly and completely developing the writer’s points. Because of its compelling and insightful development and fluent and precise language, this response fits all of the bullet points for a score of 6.

**Essay Response — Score 5**

Management’s prediction that declining profits could be reversed by reducing operating hours and reducing stock seems to be rash since there is little evidence that proper research has been conducted. It may be true that profits could be restored by cutting operating costs, but management needs to ask whether making these changes would have a negative impact on its best sources of revenue.

The management states that the downtown Marston store “significantly decreased its operating expenses by closing at 6:00pm rather than 9:00pm.” It is reasonable to think that closing at 6:00pm

rather than 9:00pm would decrease operating expenses, but the business is concerned with renting movies and these may be the busiest and most profitable hours of operation. Could it be that most people renting movies have normal working hours and have leisure time at night and to fill that time they turn to renting movies? If management researches its daily rental history, it may discover that its peak rental hours are between 6:00pm and 9:00pm. If this is the case, the store could lose significant income or even go out of business altogether. If management wants to reverse a decline in profits by cutting hours of operation and thereby reducing expenses, it would be adventageous to determine through research which block of time during the day is the least profitable and then cut those hours of operation. For instance, if it is found that profits are lowest during the morning hours or around noon, it would be better to close the store during those hours rather than during the hours that bring in the greatest profits.

The management then states that operating expenses will also be cut “by eliminating all movies released ore than five years ago.” Again, more research is needed in order to determine if this would indeed help reverse the decline in profits that Movies Galore is experiencing. Is it possible that the success of a movie rental business is based on its ability to provide customers with a wide array of movie selections, both new and old? It could be dangerous for this business to eliminate its stock of older movies without first determining the percentages of income that come from each product. Management should research its history of movie rentals in order to determine if a significant percentage of its profits come from the rental of older movies. Even if little profit does come from older movies, it may still be unwise to eliminate the stock of older movies. If Movies Galore maintains a variety of movies,  a person searching for a current movie may decide to rent an older movie as well. This may be especially relevent in the case of a new movie that is a sequal to an older movie or part of a trilogy. Reducing movie variety may also damage the reputation of the stores. The management states that Movie Galore already has a “reputation for offering great movies.” If movie variety is suddenly reduced, the stores may gain a negative reputation.

Overall, the management makes a prediction that is untrustworthy and potentially damaging. More research should be conducted to see if indeed such changes to cut operation costs will be effective, and if not, what should be done instead. If the proper investigation is implemented by the management, Movies Galore stores may reverse the recent decline of profits.

**Reader Commentary for Essay Response — Score 5**

This strong response presents a generally thoughtful and well-developed analysis of the argument, and it follows the specific task directions clearly. The response approaches the task by asking questions that seek to understand whether the management of Movies Galore truly understands where its greatest profits are generated. It first questions whether closing the stores between 6:00 and 9:00 pm would be optimal since that is when people with “normal working hours” might have the leisure to rent movies, and, then, it questions whether eliminating movies released more than five years ago would be prudent since it is possible that profits rely on carrying “a wide array of movie selections, both new and old.” In both cases, the writer indicates the specific kinds of information that management would need to gather (e.g., “If management researches its daily rental history, it may discover that its peak rental hours are between 6:00pm and 9:00pm”) in order to determine whether its prediction is valid. Likewise, in both cases, the writer also analyzes the ways that this specific information would impact the predicted result (e.g., “If this is the case, the store could lose significant income or even go out of business altogether”). In general, then, development of the points the writer makes is thorough, but it is not as compelling as that required for a 6. Also, the response, on the whole, demonstrates facility with written English; how- ever, it lacks the fluency necessary to merit a score of 6. In general, writing skills, in spite of a few spelling errors and some repetitious sentence structuring (several sentences in both the second and third paragraphs

depend upon an “if...then” construction) are strong, as evidenced by the following characteristic sentence: “It is reasonable to think that closing at 6:00pm rather than 9:00pm would decrease operating expenses, but the business is concerned with renting movies and these may be the busiest and most profitable hours of operation.” In terms of writing skill and analysis, then, this response earns a score of 5.

**Essay Response — Score 4**

The owner of Movies Galore is proposing a reduction in operating expenses in all of its chain stores. This reduction would consist of closing the stores 3 hours early and reducing its stock to include movies released only within the last 5 years. To determine if this proposition would be effective in increasing profits across the chain, several pieces of additional information would be needed.

First, it is necessary to ask if the Marston store is similar to the other Movies Galore stores. If this is not the case, the proposition might have quite the opposite of the intended effect. The performance of the other stores would be a critical piece to this proposition since what works for one store, may not work for another.

Second, what effect did the reduction in operating expenses had on store profits  in Marston? Because the declines in profit are termed to be “recent” and that the reduction of operating expenses happened within the last month, this is unclear. It is possible that only a brief period of low profits, consistent with variablity in the market, spurred the reduction and this actually caused a greater decrease in profits. It is also possible that no improvements have been seen in profits since the reduction, rendering it ineffective. Data regarding profits from several months before and several months after the reduction in operating expenses would be necessary to determine if this reduction was at all helpful.

Finally, to what degree did each of the two changes made, closing early and getting rid of older movies, affect profits? To determine if such a change would be helpful, it is important to understand how each variable contributed to the end result, assuming that it was effective. Perhaps closing early resulted in such a decline in the operating costs as employees did not have to be paid, that the reduction in their stock was unnecessary. It could be the the stock reduction actually decreased profits but this was masked by the increased profits caused by closing early. A more in depth analysis of the variables involved is necessary.

To accept such an extreme change in the practices of these stores, the preceeding recommendations should be followed. Specifically, the necessity of the reduction in other stores shoudl be determined, data regarding the effectiveness of the reduction in operating expenses in the Marston store should be analyzed, and an analysis of the components of this reduction should be completed.

**Reader Commentary for Essay Response — Score 4**

This adequate response presents a competent examination of the argument and conveys meaning with acceptable clarity. In accordance with the task directions, the response raises appropriate questions that could help to evaluate the recommendation and its predicted result. Unlike the thoughtful development of a 5-level response, how- ever, this response develops its ideas (i.e., answers to the questions it raises) unevenly, sometimes underdeveloping key claims. For example, the relatively brief second para- graph supports the assertion that the downtown Marston store may not be comparable to the chain’s other stores, but it does so with minimal reasoning. Other body para- graphs more satisfactorily develop questions about the timing of the recommendation and the profits that have actually been generated, while the conclusion merely recapitulates the assertions made earlier. A basic organizational structure, aided by the use of simple transitions between paragraphs and sufficient sentence variety within para- graphs, are other qualities of this response that underscore its adequacy. The language control is also adequate, demonstrating control, but not facility, with the conventions of standard written English. There are some minor grammatical errors and typos (e.g., there is a tense error in paragraph 3: “what effect did the reduction in operating expenses had on store profits in Marston?”; there is also vague diction in the same paragraph: “Because the declines in profit are termed to be ‘recent’ and that the reduction of operating expenses happened within the last month, this is unclear”), but the response manages to convey ideas with acceptable clarity overall. Because of its adequate analytical development and language control, this response earns a score of 4.

**Essay Response — Score 3**

It is imperative that “Movies Galore” must find a way to reduce operating expenses without jepardizing its popularity with the customer. The option of reducing operating hours and reducing its stock of avalible movies is a good start, however these two ideas need some revising in order for them to be successful in turning the company’s profits around.

The reduction of hours needs to be reversed. Instead of closing earlier they should open later. People go to the video store to rent movies more frequently in the evening hours than in the morning. In the morning is when most customers return movies. The adjustment in hours can be structured so that the store opens later in the morning, and costomers can simply return the movies in a drop box, allowing the store to remain open later in the evening for people who want to rent movies.

Reducing the stock by “eliminating all movies released more than five years ago” is a good way to reduce costs, but again it may hurt buisness. Unlike food moves don’t go bad after a certain amount of time. In some cases it is quite the opposite, they become classics. It would be bad business to assume that people will not want to rent movies over five years old, and “Movies Galore” might actually lose customers if they do so. Instead of eliminating an entire group of movies of a certain age, spread the reduction of stock throughout the entire store, making it a more subtle reduction to the consumer, but an effective cost-saver to the store.

The basic ideas of cutting stock and reducing operating hours do indicate saving money, however only if it is done correctly with both the business and the consumer in mind. It is obvious that “Movies Galore” has the consumer in mind because of its refusal to jeopardize their reputation “for offering great movies at a low price.” So they need to consider exactly how their proposals are going to impact the consumer and whether or not they will actually lose business by putting these policies in place.

If teh management at “Movies Galore” uses good business sense then there is no reason that their declining profits cannot be turned around, with little to no affect on the consumer.

**Reader Commentary for Essay Response — Score 3**

While this response conveys ideas with acceptable clarity, despite an occasional error, it earns a score in the lower half because it mainly discusses tangential matters. The introductory paragraph, for example, suggests that instead of presenting an examination of the prompt’s logic, the response will offer business advice to turn “the company’s profits around.” And that is what paragraphs 2 and 4 do: they avoid relevant analysis and instead engage in analyzing tangential matters and generally agreeing with the prompt. Paragraph 2, for example, implicitly agrees with the reduction in hours but suggests that a better business tactic would be to switch the early closing for a later closing and later opening. Paragraph 4 agrees with the overall recommendation and concludes that Movies Galore is generally going in the right business direction. What relevant analysis is present occurs in

paragraph 3, which questions the wisdom of reducing the stock of older movies since this might hurt rather than help profitability. So, although the response exhibits competent control of the conventions of standard written English, it does not manage to exhibit adequate development of relevant analysis. The fact that its relevant analysis is greatly outweighed by tangential material and business advice indicates that the response is limited in addressing the specific task directions. Thus, it merits a score of 3.

**Essay Response — Score 2**

In order to reverse the decrease or decline in the profits it is very necessary to take some steps which are benefical to both the customer and the seller. Thus to increase the profits, offering movies at low prices can be one of the ways. This will not only increase the purchasing ability of the customers but also bring about an increase in the sales and the profits made by the company. Raising the rental prices of the videos would not be a better option because this will not lead to an increase in the profits made by the company. If the customers will get videos in lower price in comparsion to the rent, they will prefer to purchase more videos then taking them on the rent.

The increase in the profits can also be brought about by giving various exciting offers at different occassions, for example- buy three and get one free video at the time of Christmas , New Year etc can attract more and more customers towards the stores and also bring about an increase in the profits earned by the stores.

Increase in the video sales can also be brought about by offering several discount schemes when the hit and great movies are being released.Thus, in order to increase the profits without jeopardizing the reputation of the stores , it is recommended to implement the similar changes as mentioned above in all the other nine Movies Galore stores.

**Reader Commentary for Essay Response — Score 2**

This response clearly fits the second bulleted description of a 2 in the scoring guide. It does not follow the directions of the assigned task. Instead of discussing questions that need to be addressed in order to determine if the recommendation is likely to have the predicted result, the writer merely posits potential strategies to increase profits. The response also develops ideas poorly and contains serious errors in grammar, usage, and mechanics, such as in this sentence: “If the customers will get videos in lower price in comparsion to the rent, they will prefer to purchase more videos then taking them on the rent.” However, it is the response’s overall disregard of the specific task directions that earns it a score of 2.

**Essay Response — Score 1**

Yes reducing the price of the movies would attract more coustmers.No one will be ready to purchase a movie for a high price rather than that they could see the movie in a theater.Watching a movie in the theater would be lesser than renting the movie.

It is stated that making special bargains and increasing the rental prices will not result in yeilding any profits.

They had to shut down their store at 6:00pm instead of 9:00pm

!

**Reader Commentary for Essay Response — Score 1**

This response is fundamentally deficient. Although the response arguably offers some evidence that the writer understands the basic subject matter, it provides little evidence of understanding the argument made in the prompt. The “Yes” that begins the first sentence makes it seem as if the writer is responding to a claim made in the prompt, but the fact that the remainder of the sentence makes a claim that never appears in the prompt (i.e., “reducing the price of the movies would attract more coustmers”) suggests, at best, a very limited understanding of the argument. Although the brief open- ing paragraph is somewhat relevant to the argument’s assertion that “raising our rental prices is not a viable way to improve profits,” it is not sufficient to demonstrate either that the writer understands the argument or that the writer is able to develop an organized response. The second paragraph consists almost entirely of verbatim or poorly paraphrased material from the prompt and, as such, provides no additional evidence either that the writer understands the argument or that the writer has the ability to develop an organized response. Thus, despite its relatively clear use of language, this response demonstrates fundamental deficiencies in analytical writing that warrant a score of 1.

**4.2 Sample Issue Essays**

**Sample Issue Essay 1**

**(1)** As people rely more and more on technology to solve problems, the ability of humans to think for themselves will surely deteriorate.

Discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the statement and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should consider ways in which the statement might or might not hold true and explain how these considerations shape your position.

**Essay Response — Score 6**

The statement linking technology negatively with free thinking plays on recent human experience over the past century. Surely there has been no time in history where the lived lives of people have changed more dramatically. A quick reflection on a typical day reveals how technology has revolutionized the world. Most people commute to work in an automobile that runs on an internal combustion engine. During the workday, chances are high that the employee will interact with a computer that processes information on silicon bridges that are .09 microns wide. Upon leaving home, family members will be reached through wireless networks that utilize satellites orbiting the earth. Each of these common occurrences could have been inconceivable at the turn of the 19th century.

The statement attempts to bridge these dramatic changes to a reduction in the ability for humans to think for themselves. The assumption is that an increased reliance on technology negates the need for people to think creatively to solve previous quandaries. Looking back at the introduction, one could argue that without a car, computer, or mobile phone, the hypothetical worker would need to find alternate methods of transport, information processing and communication. Technology short circuits this thinking by making the problems obsolete.

However, this reliance on technology does not necessarily preclude the creativity that marks the human species. The prior examples reveal that technology allows for convenience. The car, computer and phone all release additional time for people to live more efficiently. This efficiency does not preclude the need for humans to think for themselves. In fact, technology frees humanity to not only tackle new problems, but may itself create new issues that did not exist without technology. For example, the proliferation of automobiles has introduced a need for fuel conservation on a global scale. With increasing energy demands from emerging markets, global warming becomes a concern inconceivable to the horse-and-buggy generation. Likewise dependence on oil has created nation-states that are not dependent on taxation, allowing ruling parties to oppress minority groups such as women. Solutions to these complex problems require the unfettered imaginations of maverick scientists and politicians.

In contrast to the statement, we can even see how technology frees the human imagination. Consider how the digital revolution and the advent of the internet has allowed for an unprecedented exchange of ideas. WebMD, a popular internet portal for medical information, permits patients to self research symptoms for a more informed doctor visit. This exercise opens pathways of thinking that were previously closed off to the medical layman. With increased interdisciplinary interactions, inspiration can arrive from the most surprising corners. Jeffrey Sachs, one of the architects of the UN Millenium Development Goals, based his ideas on emergency care triage techniques. The unlikely marriage of economics and medicine has healed tense, hyperinflation environments from South America to Eastern Europe.

This last example provides the most hope in how technology actually provides hope to the future of humanity. By increasing our reliance on technology, impossible goals can now be achieved. Consider how the late 20th century witnessed the complete elimination of smallpox. This disease had ravaged the human race since prehistorical days, and yet with the technology of vaccines, free thinking humans dared to imagine a world free of smallpox. Using technology, battle plans were drawn out, and smallpox was systematically targeted and eradicated.

Technology will always mark the human experience, from the discovery of fire to the implementation of nanotechnology. Given the history of the human race, there will be no limit to the number of problems, both new and old, for us to tackle. There is no need to retreat to a Luddite attitude to new things, but rather embrace a hopeful posture to the possibilities that technology provides for new avenues of human imagination.

**Reader Commentary for Essay Response — Score 6**

The author of this essay stakes out a clear and insightful position on the issue and follows the specific instructions by presenting reasons to support that position. The essay cogently argues that technology does not decrease our ability to think for ourselves, but merely provides "additional time for people to live more efficiently." In fact, the problems that have developed alongside the growth of technology (pollution, political unrest in oil-producing nations) actually call for more creative thinking, not less.

In further examples, the essay shows how technology allows for the linking of ideas that may never have been connected in the past (like medicine and economic models), pushing people to think in new ways. Examples are persuasive and fully developed; reasoning is logically sound and well supported.

Ideas in the essay are connected logically, with effective transitions used both between paragraphs ("However" or "In contrast to the statement") and within paragraphs. Sentence structure is varied and complex and the essay clearly demonstrates facility with the "conventions of standard written English (i.e., grammar, usage and mechanics)," with only minor errors appearing. Thus, this essay meets all the requirements for receiving a top score, a 6.

**Essay Response — Score 5**

Surely many of us have expressed the following sentiment, or some variation on it, during our daily commutes to work: "People are getting so stupid these days!" Surrounded as we are by striding and strident automatons with cell phones glued to their ears, PDA's gripped in their palms, and omniscient, omnipresent CNN gleaming in their eyeballs, it's tempting to believe that technology has isolated and infantilized us, essentally transforming us into dependent, conformist morons best equipped to sideswip one another in our SUV's.

Furthermore, hanging around with the younger, pre-commute generation, whom tech-savviness seems to have rendered lethal, is even less reassuring. With "Teen People" style trends shooting through the air from tiger-striped PDA to zebra-striped PDA, and with the latest starlet gossip zipping from juicy Blackberry to teeny, turbo-charged cell phone, technology seems to support young people's worst tendencies to follow the crowd. Indeed, they have seemingly evolved into intergalactic conformity police. After all, today's tech-aided teens are, courtesy of authentic, hands-on video games, literally trained to kill; courtesy of chat and instant text messaging, they have their own language; they even have tiny cameras to efficiently photodocument your fashion blunders! Is this adolescence, or paparazzi terrorist training camp?

With all this evidence, it's easy to believe that tech trends and the incorporation of technological wizardry into our everyday lives have served mostly to enforce conformity, promote dependence, heighten comsumerism and materialism, and generally create a culture that values self-absorption and personal entitlement over cooperation and collaboration. However, I argue that we are merely in the inchoate stages of learning to live with technology while still loving one another. After all, even given the examples provided earlier in this essay, it seems clear that technology hasn't impaired our thinking and problem-solving capacities. Certainly it has incapacitated our behavior and manners; certainly our values have taken a severe blow. However, we are inarguably more efficient in our badness these days. We're effective worker bees of ineffectiveness!

If T\technology has so increased our senses of self-efficacy that we can become veritable agents of the awful, virtual CEO's of selfishness, certainly it can be beneficial. Harnessed correctly, technology can improve our ability to think and act for ourselves. The first challenge is to figure out how to provide technology users with some direly-needed direction.

**Reader Commentary for Essay Response — Score 5**

The language of this essay clearly illustrates both its strengths and weaknesses. The flowery and sometimes uncannily keen descriptions are often used to powerful effect, but at other times this descriptive language results in errors in syntax. See, for example, the problems of parallelism in the second-to-last sentence of paragraph 2 ("After all, today's tech-aided teens ...").

There is consistent evidence of facility with syntax and complex vocabulary ("Surrounded as we are by striding and strident automatons with cell phones glued to their ears, PDA's gripped in their palms, and omniscient, omnipresent CNN gleaming in their eyeballs, it's tempting to believe..."). However, such lucid prose is often countered by an over-reliance on abstractions and tangential reasoning. For example, what does the fact that video games "literally train [teens] to kill" have to do with the use or deterioration of thinking abilities?

Because this essay takes a complex approach to the issue (arguing, in effect, that technology neither enhances nor reduces our ability to think for ourselves, but can do one or the other, depending on the user) and because the author makes use of "appropriate vocabulary and sentence variety," a score of 5 is appropriate.

**Essay Response — Score 4**

In all actuality, I think it is more probable that our bodies will surely deteriorate long before our minds do in any significant amount. Who can't say that technology has made us lazier, but that's the key word, lazy, not stupid. The ever increasing amount of technology that we incorporate into our daily lives makes people think and learn every day, possibly more than ever before. Our abilities to think, learn, philosophize, etc. may even reach limits never dreamed of before by average people. Using technology to solve problems will continue to help us realize our potential as a human race.

If you think about it, using technology to solve more complicating problems gives humans a chance to expand their thinking and learning, opening up whole new worlds for many people. Many of these people are glad for the chance to expand their horizons by learning more, going to new places, and trying new things. If it wasn't for the invention of new technological devices, I wouldn't be sitting at this computer trying to philosophize about technology. It would be extremely hard for children in much poorer countries to learn and think for themselves with out the invention of the internet. Think what an impact the printing press, a technologically superior mackine at the time, had on the ability of the human race to learn and think.

Right now we are seeing a golden age of technology, using it all the time during our every day lives. When we get up there's instant coffee and the microwave and all these great things that help us get ready for our day. But we aren't allowing our minds to deteriorate by using them, we are only making things easier for ourselves and saving time for other important things in our days. Going off to school or work in our cars instead of a horse and buggy. Think of the brain power and genius that was used to come up with that single invention that has changed the way we move across this globe.

Using technology to solve our continually more complicated problems as a human race is definately a good thing. Our ability to think for ourselves isn't deteriorating, it's continuing to grow, moving on to higher though functions and more ingenious ideas. The ability to use what technology we have is an example

**Reader Commentary for Essay Response — Score 4**

This essay meets all the criteria of a level-4 essay. The writer develops a clear position ("Using technology to solve our problems will continue to help us realize our potential as a human race"). The position is then developed with relevant reasons ("using technology to solve more complicat[ed] problems gives humans a chance to expand their thinking and learning" and "we are seeing a golden age of technology").

Point 1, "using technology," is supported with the simple but relevant notion that technology allows us access to information and abilities to which we would not normally have access. Similarly, point 2, the "golden age," is supported by the basic description of our technologically saturated social condition. Though the overall development and organization of the essay does suffer from an occasional misdirection (see paragraph 3's abrupt progression from coffee pots to the benefits of technology to cars), the essay as a whole flows smoothly and logically from one idea to the next.

It is useful to compare this essay to the level-3 essay presented next. Though both essays entail some surface-level discussion and often fail to probe deeply into the issue, this writer does take the analysis a step further. In paragraph 2, the distinction between this essay and the next one (the level-3 response) can most clearly be seen. To support the notion that advances in technology actually help increase thinking ability, the writer draws a clever parallel between the promise of modern, sophisticated technology (computer) and the actual "impact" of equally "promising" and pervasive technologies of the past (printing press).

Like the analysis, the language in this essay clearly meets the requirements for a score of 4. The writer displays sufficient control of language and the conventions of standard written English. The preponderance of mistakes are of a cosmetic nature ("trying to solve more complicating problems.") There is a sentence fragment ("Going off ...") along with a comma splice ("Our ability ... isn't deteriorating, it's continuing to grow ...") in paragraph 3. However, these errors are minor and do not interfere with the clarity of the ideas being presented.

**Essay Response — Score 3**

There is no current proof that advancing technology will deteriorate the ability of humans to think. On the contrary, advancements in technology had advanced our vast knowledge in many fields, opening opportunities for further understanding and achievement. For example, the problem of dibilitating illnesses and diseases such as alzheimer's disease is slowing being solved by the technological advancements in stem cell research. The future ability of growing new brain cells and the possibility to reverse the onset of alzheimer's is now becoming a reality. This shows our initiative as humans to better our health demonstrates greater ability of humans to think.

One aspect where the ability of humans may initially be seen as an example of deteriorating minds is the use of internet and cell phones. In the past humans had to seek out information in many different enviroments and aspects of life. Now humans can sit in a chair and type anything into a computer and get an answer. Our reliance on this type of technology can be detrimental if not regulated and regularily substituted for other information sources such as human interactions and hands on learning. I think if humans understand that we should not have such a reliance on computer technology, that we as a species will advance further by utilizing the opportunity of computer technology as well as the other sources of information outside of a computer. Supplementing our knowledge with internet access is surely a way for technology to solve problems while continually advancing the human race.

**Reader Commentary for Essay Response — Score 3**

This essay never moves beyond a superficial discussion of the issue. The writer attempts to develop two points: that advancements in technology have progressed our knowledge in many fields and that supplementing rather than relying on technology is "surely a way for technology to solve problems while continually advancing the human race." Each point, then, is developed with relevant but insufficient evidence. In discussing the potential of technology to advance knowledge in many fields (a broad subject, rife with possible examples), the writer uses only one limited and very brief example from a specific field (medicine and stem-cell research).

Development of the second point is hindered by a lack of specificity and organization. The writer creates what might be best described as an outline. The writer cites a need for regulation/supplementation and warns of the detriment of over-reliance upon technology. However, the explanation of both the problem and solution is vague and limited ("Our reliance ... can be detrimental. If humans understand that we should not have such a reliance ... we will advance further"). There is neither explanation of consequences nor clarification of what is meant by "supplementing." This second paragraph is a series of generalizations that are loosely connected and lack a much-needed grounding.

In the essay, there are some minor language errors and a few more serious flaws (e.g., "The future ability of growing new brain cells" or "One aspect where the ability of humans may initially be seen as an example of deteriorating minds"). Despite the accumulation of such flaws, the writer's meaning is generally clear. Thus, this essay earns a score of 3.

**Essay Response — Score 2**

In recent centuries, humans have developed the technology very rapidly, and you may accept some merit of it, and you may see a distortion in society occured by it. To be lazy for human in some meaning is one of the fashion issues in thesedays. There are many symptoms and resons of it. However, I can not agree with the statement that the technology make humans to be reluctant to thinkng thoroughly.

Of course, you can see the phenomena of human laziness along with developed technology in some place. However, they would happen in specific condition, not general. What makes human to be laze of thinking is not merely technology, but the the tendency of human that they treat them as a magic stick and a black box. Not understanding the aims and theory of them couses the disapproval problems.

The most important thing to use the thechnology, regardless the new or old, is to comprehend the fundamental idea of them, and to adapt suit tech to tasks in need. Even if you recognize a method as a all-mighty and it is extremely over-spec to your needs, you can not see the result you want. In this procedure, humans have to consider as long as possible to acquire adequate functions. Therefore, humans can not escape from using their brain.

In addition, the technology as it is do not vain automatically, the is created by humans. Thus, the more developed tech and the more you want a convenient life, the more you think and emmit your creativity to breakthrough some banal method sarcastically.

Consequently, if you are not passive to the new tech, but offensive to it, you would not lose your ability to think deeply. Furthermore, you may improve the ability by adopting it.

**Reader Commentary for Essay Response — Score 2**

The language of this essay is what most clearly links it to the score of 2. Amidst sporadic moments of clarity, this essay is marred by serious errors in grammar, usage and mechanics that often interfere with meaning. It is unclear what the writer means when he/she states, "To be lazy for human in some meaning is one of the fashion issues in thesedays," or "to adapt suit tech to tasks in need."

Despite such severe flaws, the writer has made an obvious attempt to respond to the prompt ("I can not agree with the statement that the technology make humans to be reluctant to thinking thoroughly") as well as an unclear attempt to support such an assertion ("Not understanding the aims and theory of them [technology] couses the disapproval problems" and "The most important thing to use the thechnology ... is to comprehend the fundamental idea of them"). On the whole, the essay displays a seriously flawed but not fundamentally deficient attempt to develop and support its claims.

(**Note:** In this specific case, the analysis is tied directly to the language. As the language falters, so too does the analysis.)

**Essay Response — Score 1**

Humans have invented machines but they have forgot it and have started everything technically so clearly their thinking process is deterioating.

**Reader Commentary for Essay Response — Score 1**

The essay is clearly on topic, as evidenced by the writer's usage of the more significant terms from the prompt: "technically" (technologically), "humans," "thinking" (think) and "deteriorating" (deteriorate). Such usage is the only clear evidence of understanding. Meaning aside, the brevity of the essay (one sentence) clearly indicates the writer's inability to develop a response that follows the specific instructions given ("Discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the statement above and explain your reasoning for the position you take").

The language, too, is clearly level 1, as the sentence fails to achieve coherence. The coherent phrases in this one-sentence response are those tied to the prompt: "Humans have invented machines" and "their thinking process is deteriorating." Otherwise, the point being made is unclear.

**Sample Issue Essay 2**

**(6)** A nation should require all of its students to study the same national curriculum until they enter college.

*Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the recommendation and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, describe specific circumstances in which adopting the recommendation would or would not be advantageous and explain how those examples shape your position.*

**Score 6**

Nations should not require that all students study the same national curriculum. If every child were presented with the same material, it would assume that all children learn the same and that all teachers are capable of teaching the same material in the same way. In addition to neglecting differences in learning and teaching styles, it would also stifle creativity and create a generation of drones. The uniformity would also lend itself to governmental meddling in curriculum that could result in the destruction of democracy. If every teacher is forced to teach a certain text, the government need only change that text to misinform an entire generation. Lastly, a standardized curriculum would also adversely affect students who come from lower income families or families who have little education as they might not have as many resources for learning outside of school.

Children all learn in very different ways. If the curriculum is standardized completely, it leaves little room for exploratory learning. One child may learn how to spell from reading, another may learn from phonics. If the curriculum is standardized, suppose one aspect is dropped, that may exclude certain children from learning adequately. This is not to say of course that there shouldn't be requirements, but they should be general requirements, not something so specific as a curriculum. Especially at the high school level this would be detrimental to the variety of subjects that a student can learn. Standards and the "No Child Left Behind" act in America are already forcing the reduction in programs such as art and music that have a less defineable curriculum. Additionally, education systems are rarely funded well enough to achieve the general goal of educating children. If a national curriculum were implemented, would it come with a significant increase in financial support? History suggests that it would not.

Teachers also have different methods of teaching; if say, the English curriculum of all high schools were standardized, then a book that one teacher teaches excellently and therefore inspires students to read more and learn on their own might be eliminated, and although that teacher ought to be capable enough to teach the curriculum books, his or her students will still be missing out on what might have been a great learning experience. It also limits how much of the teacher's unique knowledge he or she can bring to the classroom. It is these inspirational books or experiences that allow teachers to reach students; if they are put in a mold, the quality of teaching and learning will go down.

Learning should be enjoyable and children and adolescents should be taught not only the curriculum in school, but that the body of knowledge that exists in the world today is enormous and that you can learn your whole life. Having a national curriculum implies that there is a set group of things worth learning for every person. Maybe this is true, but for students, it sets up a world where there is a finite amount of knowledge to be acquired for the purpose of regurgitating it on a test. Teaching a standard curriculum doesn't encourage inquiries; it doesn't make students ask questions like, "Why?" and "How?" School's real purpose is teaching people to learn, not just teaching them a set group of facts. By teaching them to learn, students can continue doing so, they can extend skills from one area of knowledge to another. This type of learning fosters creativity that can be used not only in math or science or English, but in art or music or creative writing. Teaching a brain to go beyond being a file cabinet for facts is the best way to teach creativity. Creativity is too often assumed to be something only for the arts. It is creativity that results in innovation and it is innovation that has resulted in the greatest achievements of humanity in the sciences and humanities alike.

Finally, the education system of a country is designed to put all children on a level playing field. Though this is only an ideal, it is a noble ideal. If the school curriculum becomes standardized, children who have highly educated parents, or more money to buy books outside of school, or more resources for tutors or private schools will immediately gain a foothold. Poorer students from uneducated families in the current American school system are already at a disadvantage, but at least now there is hope through variety that something can reach out to them and inspire them. There is hope that they can find a class that interests them. If the curriculum becomes rigid and standardized, it is these disadvantaged students who fall through the cracks.

There are many reasons not to standardize the curriculum. The uniqueness of students and teachers is the most obvious, but students from less educated backgrounds will suffer the most. The creativity of a nation as a whole would fall with a standardized curriculum. Most importantly though is the question of who and what? Who chooses the curriculum? What is important enough that it must be taught? These questions assume that there is some infallible committee that can foresee all and know what knowledge will be important in everyone's lives. There is no person, no group, no comittee capable of deciding what knowledge is necessary. Curriculum should have standards, not be standardized and education should be as much about knowledge as it about learning to learn.

**Reader Commentary for Essay Response – Score 6**

This outstanding response develops an articulate and insightful position rejecting the prompt's recommendation of a national curriculum. The writer understands a national curriculum to mean both the material that is taught and the way it is taught. The essay offers a wide-ranging discussion of the practical and theoretical implications of a national curriculum for students, for teachers, and for a nation. For example, the response argues that prescribing particular content and teaching methods might make it more difficult for teachers to tailor lessons to students with different learning styles and might also force effective teachers to adopt teaching methods that are less effective for them and their students. Although the essay clearly rejects the recommendation for a national curriculum, the writer does concede that there is a need for educational standards that are flexible enough to allow for individual, socioeconomic, and regional differences.

The response maintains a well-focused, well-organized discussion, developing each point fully and connecting ideas logically without relying on obvious transitional phrases. The writing is fluent, despite minor errors in grammar and mechanics; sentence structure is varied and diction is effective. In sum, this response meets all of the criteria for a score of 6.

**Score 5**

While it may be to the advantage of a nation that all its students learn the same basic information, this can be accomplished without going to the lengths of having a national curriculum. By requiring that all students know a certain amount in basic areas of knowledge without specifying the details, a nation can achieve the same benefits of a national curriculum without unduly denying the freedom of teachers to teach as they see fit. A system of simple national standards is good enough. To go further and create a full-fledged national curriculum would gain nothing and impair the ability of teachers.

It is important to ensure that all students learn the fundamentals of different subject areas. In order to graduate from high school, for example, all students should have a good understanding of algebra, of basic concepts in science and history, and an ability to read critically. These are skills that will benefit people in all kinds of different careers. Even if you never manipulate an equation after graduating from high school, you will have a far better understanding of the world around you if you know simple facts of math and science. Fields such as English and history are even more important, as they are absolutely necessary to maintain an informed citizenry capable of making important decisions that all citizens of a democracy are called upon to make. In order to achieve this, it is necessary to have national standards of education. Most teachers are very capable of imparting knowledge on students, and most school boards are similarly well-intentioned. Nevertheless, without national standards, some students are bound to fall through the cracks, and some school boards, under pressure from groups of parents, may eliminate certain subject matter from schools, as has happened recently with the teaching of evolution in conservative areas of the United States. In order to ensure that all students learn all that they need to know as functioning adults, some kind of national standards should be in place.

These national standards, however, need not go so far as to constitute a single national curriculum. No one knows a class of students better than its teachers, and no one else can shape a curriculum for their maximum benefit. A national curriculum would necessarily mean a one-size-fits-all approach, and what is appropriate in one classroom may not be in another. Partly this is a result of the intellectual levels of the students in question: some may be able to learn far more about a particular subject than others. But it is also a question of student goals. The desire for specialization begins before college. A student who wants to become an auto mechanic should be able to take auto shop classes, classes which would not be of interest to a future lawyer or scientist. This notion may sound unacceptably elitist in today's climate in which a college education has become almost an automatic goal of education, but it does not need to be this way. Students with limited interest in higher education should be able to opt out, to follow another curriculum that is more likely to lead to happiness later in life. As a society, we should not discourage them, but rather ensure that there are enough high-paying jobs available for skilled laborers with high school diplomas.

Everyone needs certain basic knowledge in order to function in society today. To this extent, we need national standards of instruction for students. But we do not need to cram every student into the same classes and force them to learn what we think is best for them.

**Reader Commentary for Essay Response – Score 5**

This strong response presents a generally thoughtful, well-developed analysis of the issue and conveys meaning clearly. The introductory paragraph clearly disagrees with the prompt's recommendation: "By requiring that all students know a certain amount in basic areas of knowledge without specifying the details, a nation can achieve the same benefits of a national curriculum without unduly denying the freedom of teachers to teach as they see fit." The writer supports this position by first arguing for the necessity of national standards, citing the individual's need for fundamental knowledge in core areas, and by asserting that such knowledge makes for an informed, thoughtful citizenry. The discussion furthers this argument by examining some of the disadvantages of a rigid national curriculum, namely the inability of a national curriculum to accommodate students' individual needs and interests.

The response develops its position with strong reasons and examples, though these reasons and examples are not always fully developed. For example, the response asserts that knowledge of English and history is "absolutely necessary to maintain an informed citizenry" and that "in order to achieve this, it is necessary to have national standards of education," but it never really explains how or why national standards would result in better-informed citizens than regional standards or a national curriculum would.

The response maintains a clear focus and organization with clear and logical transitions.

Although the response conveys ideas clearly and demonstrates facility with standard written English, it lacks the precision of expression necessary for the highest score. In sum, this response demonstrates all of the characteristics required to earn a score of 5.

**Score 4**

As an educator, this topic is quite controversial to me. By having one set curriculum in the entire nation, students would be taught the same material. Students from the rural Texas will study the same thing as students in Brooklyn, NY and suburban Chicago. If they move from state to state, they will have covered the same material and they would be able to participate in class right away. You could also say that all students should have learned the same material, for which they should all be equal and should have the same opportunities. But it is unrealistic. I disagree with a national curriculum because all students are not the same, they have different interests, and this curriculum would not permit teachers to explore and teach to students interests.

First, a curriculum that becomes nation wide is supposed to teach all students the same material and perhaps the same way. All seventh graders will have to solve algebraic equations and then they will all be the same. But students are not the same. All children develop at different rates, they have different abilities. One cannot expect a child from Uptown Manhattan to be doing the same thing as the kids in southern Illinois. The conditions are different, they have different funding and quality of teachers. Parents involvement in their childrens education is different and that would affect what the students learn.

Besides having different abilities, the students have different interests or necesities. In one part of the nation it may be important to learn trigonometry and calculus because it is a high tech area. They use many computers and there might be a big market for careers in that field, but in another part of the country it might be more important to learn about farming and erosion. That the interest would be different. Teachers also need the freedom to teach what the students are interested in. If the kids want to know about the Chicano Movement, they should have the opportunity to learn about it, instead of learning about African American Civil Rights Movement. City kids are interested in different things than kids rural areas, as well as kids from the East Coast and the West Coast.

For these reasons I would have to disagree with a national curriculum. Children are different and they should have the right to learn about things they are interested in. Teachers should have the freedom to teach what he/she thinks is more important or interesting to their students. Teachers should teach their students, not a curriculum.

**Reader Commentary for Essay Response – Score 4**

This response presents a competent analysis of the issue and conveys meaning with acceptable clarity. The writer begins by acknowledging some of the perceived strengths of a national curriculum but then disagrees with the prompt, arguing that "all students are not the same, they have different interests, and this curriculum would not permit teachers to explore and teach to students interests." The writer supports this position by suggesting that a standardized approach to education will fail to address the different types of students who make up a nation's youth; for instance, students in two different geographical areas may be subject to different socioeconomic conditions as well as different cultural attitudes toward the role of education. The writer continues exploring the role of geography by pointing out that different areas naturally emphasize different aspects of curriculum based upon regional concerns and that a national curriculum would unfairly homogenize education.

The response is adequately focused and organized, and although it contains some errors, it demonstrates sufficient control of language in order to express its ideas.

**Score 3**

Until now, many countries have mandatory course for their students until they enter the college. It is beneficial to students to have same amout knowledge in their schools. Also, I agree this recommendation because these reasons.

Even if students have extraordinary abilities to study, it just will be some specific parts of academic fields. Generally, most ordiany students have abilities to follow their study through their courses. For all students, if people want to be had same knowlege and same academic background, the national curriculum is essential. Of course, some people don't want to follow their mandatoyr courses so that someone takes privite classes in their house or takes a different class in other substituted schools. However, if students want to enter the college, they have to take a national test, for example, SAT. Like this test will require generalized knowledge until in the high school. For preparing this test, every students have to study requisited courses of SAT. Even though some students take privite courses, they also have to prepare these classes. Because of this, national curriculum is needed. If they do not need to take a test to enter the college, they won't prepare these classes. However, until now, every college wants to accept to be experimented students so that they need standarized test for everybody. Recently, even though national curriculum is becoming a social issue to criticize its efficency, if governments don't change their policy about thier educational programs, it has to exist in the education.

However, the same national curriculum has some troubles. If one student doesn't follow the same curriculum, this student will be fale to enter the college. The mandatory curriculum does not allow individual characteristics, some students who have surprisingly abilities for other fields, for example, playing chess, singing the classic song, and operating computer systems, will not enter the college. So, we should consider this problem in the same national curriculum.

Nevertheless, the system of the education will not change to allow other possibilities, a nation has to require all of their students to study the same courses, until the college. It is related to educational systems so that it is difficult to decide whatever is right. However, while the current educaitonal system exist a nation, the country should require the same curriculum to its students.

**Reader Commentary for Essay Response – Score 3**

This response demonstrates some competence in analyzing the issue and in conveying meaning, but it is obviously flawed. The writer adopts a position of agreement with the prompt, arguing that since higher education requires students to pass standardized exams, a curriculum which emphasized the same education for all students would be more conducive to passing college entrance exams and tests such as the SAT. In the course of this argument, the writer does consider that the implementation of a national curriculum would remove the opportunity for students to explore areas of study outside their core coursework but argues that this loss can be made up during the students' university coursework.

The response presents a clear position on the issue and develops that position with relevant reasons and examples, but it fails to convey ideas with acceptable clarity; it has problems in language and sentence structure that result in a lack of clarity. These frequent minor errors and occasional major errors in grammar, usage, and mechanics preclude the response from receiving an upper-half score. In order to merit a score of 4, this response would need to demonstrate better control of the conventions of standard written English.

**Score 2**

A nation should teach all it's students the same national curriculum until they enter college so that can prepare for college. Allowing everyone to learn the same curriculum will teach our society how to communicate with one another. This is a nation of equal opportunity and should be treated and taught equally. I believec that this would allows young individuals to get an better understanting of all different kinds of religions, culture,and society. All school teach the same history,but some may forcus more on what they feel is important then depending on where you are from.

**Reader Commentary for Essay Response – Score 2**

After agreeing with the prompt's recommendation, this brief essay presents a series of unsupported claims about education and culture. The discussion fails to develop any of these claims with relevant reasons and/or examples or to make logical connections between them; as a result, the discussion is disorganized and unfocused. The final sentence states that all schools "teach the same history,but some may forcus more on what they feel is important then depending on where you are from." As a result of the response's frequent errors in language and sentence structure, it isn't at all clear whether this statement is intended as an observation of current practices or a recommendation that history curricula should be flexible enough to account for regional interests.

Though this response does contain frequent errors and lacks sentence variety, these flaws serve more to impede clarity than to interfere significantly with meaning. The essay is scored a 2 primarily because it is "seriously limited in addressing the specific task directions and in presenting or developing a position on the issue."

**Score 1**

No i disagree with recommendation becaus it is not compulsary to student to study same national curriculum until they enter college.

Each and every student is own idea and family dream so,could not say like that student study the same nation curriculum until they enter college.we create a enviroment to all student are go and come in different country so we share over idea and comfortably leave with each other.

It is very necessary to colobrate with each other we develope owr nation and different technology.We take a example of "SUNITA VILLIUM" she is a American scientist work in "NASA" basically she is a INDIAN.But she complite study in USA.

So,it is not necessary to studay in own national Curriculum .but we devlope environment to student study with different country and devlope nation name and over parents name.

Also develope support position it is very advantageous for student.some time what happen student is intelligent but he/she not able to study well we develope some kind of facillity to student study well and he/she devlope over country.

To conclude "A nation should not require all of its student to study the same national curriculum until they entre college."

**Reader Commentary for Essay Response – Score 1**

Although this essay is obviously attempting to respond to the prompt's recommendation, its severe problems in language and sentence structure and its pervasive grammar, usage, and mechanics errors make it impossible to discern whether the writer understands the recommendation made in the prompt.. In fact, the only clear phrases in the response are those that are borrowed from the prompt. These fundamental deficiencies in analytical writing warrant a score of 1.

**Sample Issue Essay 3**

**(106)** In most professions and academic fields, imagination is more important than knowledge.

*Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the claim. In developing and supporting your position, be sure to address the most compelling reasons and/or examples that could be used to challenge your position*

**Score 6**

Imagination is an integral part of any profession, enabling professionals and academics to think beyond their own experience and transcend seemingly insurmountable boundaries of thought or possibility. Moreover, imagination is the gateway to knowledge, since intellectual curiosity is the quintessence of human nature, and without that pursuit of understanding, there would be no knowledge to glean. I must profess, however, that I am ambivalent towards this subject, torn between my desire to ascribe this value to imagination and, on the other hand, my appreciation of the knowledge bases which govern it. In the end, though, I must err on the side of caution, known as knowledge, as the more important factor.

My reason for placing knowledge in slightly higher regard than imagination is based on the following assertion: our imagination, or our ability to think beyond our own experience of what is possible or probable, is governed by what we have already experienced, i.e. knowledge. Without knowledge, imagination could not exist. I daresay knowledge and imagination might exist within a symbiotic relationship, each influencing the progression of the other, but knowledge is the foundation of that system (and therefore more important).

After all, in any field, there are set protocols that must be followed in order to achieve a desired response, whether it's fixing a pipe or hypothesizing about the laws of matter. Without these knowledge bases, the plumber and scientist would be left to their own devices to approach the situation as they see fit, rather than having a touchstone of previously gleaned knowledge to reference. Understanding is essential to success, and since our history has garnered a wealth of knowledge concerning a plethora of subjects, it would be foolish to disregard it. While imagination is the heart of gaining new knowledge, we must build upon what we already know before leaping to conclusions without merit.

Conversely, it could be argued that imagination supercedes knowledge, since imaginative approaches have the ability to change the trajectory of a discipline. In some cases, having too much knowledge may, in fact, make it difficult to make a break-through in a particular field. You might be bound by what you know already (be it the typical methods of affixing a pipe or the writings of Sir Issac Newton on the laws of matter) and thus incapable of moving forward. Tradition could dull progress.

Another argument for the idea that imagination supercedes knowledge is the fact that, as homo sapiens, without our curiosity and ability to construe experience on different levels of consciousness, we would never have evolved into the highly-functioning species we are today. Imagination enables us to probe deeper, to ask burning questions, and to unlock mysteries. However, all of these attributes, all the flights of imagination are geared toward a single goal: to pursue new knowledge, new modes of understanding. And these advancements must be based on previously established knowledge. Without access to that knowledge base, one might disregard a highly important fact of their field and thus render their findings ineffective, or even perhaps harmful in some cases.

Rather than viewing knowledge and imagination as antitheses, it behooves us to view them as existing in the aforementioned symbiotic state, evolving together but built upon a foundation of knowledge. Knowledge is not static, and imagination is not a formless entity which is governed by its own rules; rather, it is governed by what we understand.

**Reader Commentary for Issue Response - Sample 6**

In this essay, the writer addresses the specific task directions by presenting an insightful position on the issue and exploring arguments that could be used to challenge that position. This writer disagrees with the prompt, arguing that, "knowledge and imagination might exist within a symbiotic relationship, each influencing the progression of the other, but knowledge is the foundation of that system (and therefore more important)." This position is developed fully with compelling reasons and examples, and the writer maintains focus and organization when moving into the discussion of the reasons or examples that could be used to undermine his or her position. Throughout this essay, ideas are connected logically (see, for example, the clear transition in the fifth paragraph from the discussion of a particular counterargument to the writer's refutation of that objection). Also, the essay demonstrates superior facility with the conventions of standard written English. Syntax is varied, vocabulary is used effectively, and there are only a few minor errors, none of which interfere with clarity. A good example of the level of language facility seen throughout this essay can be found here: "Rather than viewing knowledge and imagination as antitheses, it behooves us to view them as existing in the aforementioned symbiotic state, evolving together but built upon a foundation of knowledge." Because of its facility with language and its cogent, well-developed analysis, then, this essay merits a score of 6.

**Score 5**

Although the above statement says that imagination is far more important than knowledge in most professional and academic realms, it is short-sighted to hold such a belief as completely true. Such a dichotomy does not reflect reality, especially in the ever-analyzing and critical worlds of academia, where the point is to question what is given in order to evolve a theory, whether philosphical, scientific or business practices.

Instead, a combination of imagination and knowledge is crucial in professional and academic fields. Without knowledge and an in-depth understanding of what has come before, imagination is not grounded and has no relevant basis for the subject at hand. The same is true without imagination and creativity: if a person or team is completely knowlegeable in the history, contexts, and people in their respective fields, but lacks the imagination to take the field or project to the next level, then you only have a stagnant historian who never tries anything innovative.

Some may say that knowlege is more important than anything else because without it, a person, group or company can have no proficiency in their field, and therefore cannot compete with their peers or be critiqued by their peers so as to improve. Their competition and peers will instead not be interested in the processes the unimagative, knowlegeable person is engaging in. With some knowledge and imagination, a person can use what they know and apply it towards what they hope to discover.

On the other hand, many say that imagination is far more important than knowledge. Without the constraints of knowledge, mistakes made for lack of knowledge may turn out to be great discoveries. Likewise, if a person, group or company is thinking "outside the box," that is outside the constraints of a certain field with its cultural taboos and whatnot, who knows what they may come up with. This is too idealistic, though, and unrealistic, too. At least a basic supply of knowlege on the subject will greatly compliment any creativity if the discoveries are to be of any specific use.

In agreeing that a combination is necessary, one also must recognize that we should avoid extremes to be the most productive. If someone is too heavily well-read and fluent in what has been done in the past in their field, and has been taught to follow precedent, creativity will suffer. The same is true for the student of a truly creative type. If they are taught to always be capricious and be completely creative, something may be discovered, but it may not contribute anything to the field initially focused on. In this case, a person needs to have some knowledge in certain fields to see what is possible.

Without any knowledge on a subject, imagination will likely flounder and amount to very little that is of use - and it will not be of use to others in the field. Without imagination, knowledge is stagnant and ceases to push the industry or field forward with new ideas and discoveries. Therefore, a balance of the two, not necessarily equal, but a balance all the same, is necessary for the ultimate productivity in most professions and academic fields.

**Reader Commentary for Issue Response - Sample 5**

This strong essay earns a score of 5 because it presents a generally thoughtful position on the issue and follows the specific task directions clearly. In this case, the writer neither fully agrees nor disagrees with the prompt, choosing instead to explore a middle ground in which imagination and knowledge are both important to some degree. This position is developed with some logically sound reasons and well-chosen examples (e.g., the "stagnant historian" or the student who is a "creative type"). However, these supporting examples are not developed fully, which keeps this response from receiving a score of 6. It is important to note that this writer very clearly follows the specific task instructions. After presenting his or her position on the issue, the writer notes specific arguments that could be used to contradict that position. In this case, the writer goes so far as to offer a variety of counterarguments, some in favor of knowledge and others in favor of imagination. In addition to its strong development, this essay does meet the Scoring Guide descriptor for language use at the score of 5, which notes that an essay earning this score point "demonstrates facility with the conventions of standard written English but may have minor errors." In this particular essay, we can see both the facility with language (e.g., varied syntax and appropriate use of vocabulary), but also a few minor errors (e.g., misspelled words, problems with parallelism). A good example of the writer's general facility with language can be seen in the final paragraph: "Therefore, a balance of the two, not necessarily equal, but a balance all the same, is necessary for the ultimate productivity in most professions and academic fields." The complex syntax here is controlled well. Because of its generally thoughtful, well developed analysis and its overall facility with language, this essay earns a score of 5.

**Score 4**

While in some fields imagination is of key importance, I disagree with the claim that imagination is more important that knowledge in "most fields." Imagination may be important in creative fields. For an artist, creativity, along with technical skill, determines the quality of their product. However, I would argue that all professions and academic fields - identified expressly in the statement above - require knowledge as their base. Some may be enhanced by imagination, but knowledge is the fundamentally important ingredient with which imagination can play.

Some may say that without imagination, knowledge alone will not innovate. I would counter than gaining knowledge, along with instilling expertise in a theoretical or subject area, provides an individual with the mental tools of reasoning and perceptiveness. While they may not be called "imagination," it is possible to use these tools to do imaginative things - to innovate and to deviate from proscribed theories of the past.

I would also point out to the skeptic that without knowledge, imagination suffers. An imaginative painter will surely produce better work with a detailed knowledge of the qualities of different paints, canvasses and other tools of the trade, than they would with their creative impulses alone.

In addition, if imagination were championed above all in most professions and academic fields, the resulting lack of technical ability could be disastrous. How structurally sound would our bridges, roads, and cars be if they were each crafted by individuals following their own rules and ideas? Without base knowledge, not only are we vulnerable to repeating mistakes of the past, but we face immense difficulty in working together.

Further, if engineering students had to rely on their imagination to "reinvent the wheel," their aptitude for the subject would have far less potential. Rather than learning, questioning, and improving on the knowledge of the past, those students would only be able to rely on their own imaginative resources. It is the choice between individuals running a marathon, and a team running the same distance as a relay. Which group of people will be more exhausted at the end, to have traveled to same distance?

In conclusion, I firmly believe that while imagination may enhance knowledge, it is certainly not enough to sustain "most professions and academic fields." Instead, it is knowledge that sustains most fields, whether imagination is present or not.

**Reader Commentary for Issue Response - Sample 4**

This is an adequate essay that presents a clear position on the issue, following the assigned task and developing its points with relevant reasons and examples. The writer disagrees with the prompt, arguing that knowledge is more important than imagination because it must be the "base" for all professions and academic fields. This position is supported adequately, and the writer brings up counterarguments that might be raised against it (e.g., "Some may say that without imagination, knowledge alone will not innovate."). However, this essay does not demonstrate the thoughtful or compelling development required for a score of 5 or 6. Much of the development is repetition, simply providing another example that does not build on previous examples or add depth to the discussion (e.g., see the similarities between the discussion of people designing bridges and the discussion of engineering students). The use of language in this response, however, may be better than adequate, as the writer demonstrates appropriate vocabulary and sentence variety. A good example of the level of language control demonstrated throughout this essay is seen here: "However, I would argue that all professions and academic fields - identified expressly in the statement above - require knowledge as their base. Some may be enhanced by imagination, but knowledge is the fundamentally important ingredient with which imagination can play." The writer is effectively using complex sentence structures and demonstrating control of the conventions of standard written English. However, the response earns a score of 4 because its development is just adequate, not strong or outstanding.

**Score 3**

I agree a lot with the given claim. Our knowledge is all the things that we learned in life. Knowledge is applicable at many places and its required at most of the places. Every normal person can gain knowledge by studying and learning new things through Books, Institutions, Telivision, Internet or any other source. Gaining knowledge just requires time, learning and study, and a little amount of will power to keep ourselves into it. Imagination on the other hand means our power to imagine something new and novel, to think of new things and new ways of doing things. Imagination opens new doors to the existing.

In many professions and fields imagination is more important than knowledge. Artists are the best examples of people with imagination and less knowledge. They create new arts without the help of knowledge. For a more professional point of view lets consider a fashion dress designer. A designer will design new designs with imagination, not with knowledge. A good imagination will lead the designer with new designs. Researchers and Philosophers also have great imagination power.

Our mind is like a searcher. To perform a particular task, it searches all the paths available and chooses the suitable. But again imagination is like a hierarchy. To think about a car, you should know what a car is, then only you can think about it or a new design or any modification in the car. Knowing about the car is your knowledge, but thinking about a new design or any modifications in the current one is your imagination. Imagination is a creation of our mind, which is made up from our knowledge.

The given claim can also be challenged. It can also be said that a person having more knowledge will have better intellectual for imagination. In other words imagination also requires knowledge. As he already has some knowledge he can use his knowledge to imagine more creative things. All the things that our mind think and our imagination are directly a combination or alteration in the things we know. We can think of things that we know about. If we will think of anything new, it will be based on the things we have already encountered in our life. Just like we cannot see a person in our dream whom we have not seen in our real life, we cannot think about anything new which is not made up of existing things. Our knowledge helps our imagination. Considering the case of designer, we can say that if the designer knows about all the new fabrics available he can think of a better design. For example if you don't know what nylon is, than how can you think about a drees made of nylon. So to challenge the given claim it can be said that "Knowledge aids Imagination".

**Reader Commentary for Issue Response - Sample 3**

This essay earns a score of 3 because it is weak in the use of reasons and examples and because problems with focus and language control result in a lack of clarity. The writer here attempts to lay out a thoughtful position, arguing that imagination is more important than knowledge, but that knowledge can aid imagination. The writer even follows the specific task directions by offering arguments that could be used to challenge his or her position. However, because of language errors and problems with focus, this essay is characterized by a lack of clarity, and thus it cannot receive a score higher than a 3. Also, although the essay provides a number of examples that could be relevant (e.g., fashion designers or cars), those examples are not developed adequately. The essay makes assertions that are not supported, or it contradicts its own logic. At one point, the writer claims, "A designer will design new designs with imagination, not with knowledge." Later on, however, the writer argues that you cannot design without knowledge to aid the imagination. Although a stronger essay might have managed to reconcile these two statements by offering a more nuanced position, in this case the essay simply contradicts itself. This contradiction undermines the writers position, providing another example of the weak development that helps this essay earn a score of 3.

**Score 2**

I tend to agree that imagination is often better than knowledge for some to make the profession more interesting. When a person can visualize and imagine whats actually happening without seeing or being able to physically touch it is better than just having the knowledge of whats going on. In some academic fields, imagination helps to better understand the knowledge behind it all. These fields that imagination helps to better understand are art, music, chemistry, and dance. The persons who participate in these fields can use both their imagination and knowledge to get through the academic field and through their professions.

Most would say that this would be incorrect because if they rely on their imagination then they would not be using knowledge in the process. If an artist is painting a replica of the Mona Lisa, he can invision being there physically doing the painting and still be looking at the actual painting to perform the replica. In order to have imagination you first have to have knowledge because they cause the thought process.

Futhermore, the knowledge is more prevalent than the imagination, because people like to read and look at facts verus someones imagination.

**Reader Commentary for Issue Response - Sample 2**

This essay earns a score of 2 because it is seriously limited in developing its position on the issue. Whereas some essays that earn a score of 2 do so because they ignore the specific task directions, this response does make an attempt to follow the directions. The first paragraph presents the writer's position on the issue ("I tend to agree that imagination is often better than knowledge for some to make the profession more interesting."), and paragraph two acknowledges arguments that might be used against that position. However, the writer in this case provides minimal development for his or her main points. The reasons and examples that are offered in support of the essay's claims do not provide logical support for the writer's position on the issue. For example, in the first paragraph the writer claims that in "some academic fields, imagination helps to better understand the knowledge behind it all," but even when examples are provided ("art, music, chemistry, and dance"), there is no discussion or indication of how or why imagination is important in these fields. In the next paragraph, the example of the painter is seriously unclear, offering support of little, if any, value for the writer's position on the issue. There are some problems with language and sentence structure, but not such significant problems as would frequently interfere with meaning. The language control in this response is more at the 3 level. However, because of its problems with development, this essay earns a score of 2.

**Score 1**

In the given issue states that In most professions and academic fields, imagination is more important than knowledge.is contraversal on . on the one hand imagination is too important for reach on the top position of our own carrier. by the imagination we can complete our goal. on the other hand By the imagination we loss our time. however the final analysis is that imagination is good thing for do some thing.

Firstly, By the imagination we decide our goal and we decide in which field we have to become our carrier. so by the imagination we conclud that in how many time we have to finish our work. If we imagine about our work hten we complete our work very fast so in this time we do not loss our time.

Secondly, imagination is more important than knowledge because by the imaginaion we creat our own ideas and so we fulfill our goal. by imagination we can conclude many ideas in our professions and academic fields also.

however, some time imagination is provs that lost of time beacause some time people imagine many nagetive things which is harmful for to fulfill our goal . some time people have imagine negetive points so negetive points creat problem to achive the goal.in spita of this imagination is good thing for became carrier.

to conclude that In most profession and academic fields, imagination is more important than knowledge.

**Reader Commentary for Issue Response - Sample 1**

This essay fits most of the descriptors from the Scoring Guide for a score of 1. Although the writer's repeated references to "imagination" and "knowledge" indicate an attempt to respond to the prompt, the essay is characterized by severe problems in language and sentence structure that persistently interfere with meaning. A good example of the level of language control that appears through the response can be seen here: "some time people have imagine negetive points so negetive points creat problem to achive the goal.in spita of this imagination is good thing for became carrier." Even when the writer is directly using language from the prompt, it is difficult to determine the meaning of the sentences created (e.g., "imagination is more important than knowledge because by the imaginaion we creat our own ideas and so we fulfill our goal."). There are some markers of organization, including paragraph breaks and transitions ("Firstly," "Secondly," "however," and "to conclude"), but the incoherence of the sentences makes these organizational markers meaningless. Unlike some essays that receive a score of 1, this particular response does show some signs that the writer may have the ability to understand the issue. However, the pervasive grammar errors lead to incoherence, making a score of 1 appropriate.

**Sample Issue Essay4**

**(47)** Educators should find out what students want included in the curriculum and then offer it to them.

*Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the recommendation and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, describe specific circumstances in which adopting the recommendation would or would not be advantageous and explain how these examples shape your position.*

## Benchmark 6

The statement above conceals intesting connotations far above curriculum development. Issues of classroom control and development of scholarly talents are at stake, not simply a debate over which books are acceptable or over revisionist histories.

The statement itself is a bit misleading in that in my experience, student control over curriculum hardly existed. Each year, there were certain course offerings made available, and students were to choose from those offerings, of course bearing in mind requirements for graduation set forth by the administration. On a classroom level, the immediate, initial material may have been somewhat directed by the students, but this was a part of the process allowed by the teacher/professor in order to gain the interest and attention of the students. However, too much of any one thing becomes problematic; letting students set the curriculum, as with letting students choose and design their own major in college, serves ultimately to dilute the quality of the educational experience unless a single advisor can devote significant amounts of time to the individual student. This amount of time, or even the expense to the student of this individual attention, seem to indicate that resources would be better allocated elsewhere.

Of course, any school in which the students decide "what goes" is bound to have problems controlling students. Once the educators, be they administrators or teachers, are under the control of students, even a democratic situation would be like holding royalty acountable to the mob. Presently, students hear for hours that they should not forget to use a condom in the heat of the moment, and educators think the message gets through, while half the kids can't even remember to bring a pencil to class. Students go to school not to simply learn the Pythagorean theorem, but to learn direction and receive guidance. This cannot occur when students are in charge, and standards, already hard to find in America's contemporary public schools, will become unenforceable. If students dictate and administrators do, students will never learn academic responsibility, and if they can't be held accountable for homework, what other responsibilities will they avoid when they get older?

But in another sense, teachers and students do exist in a partnership of sorts. Teachers are there to satisfy the needs of the student, and the student, while perhaps not being the most experienced/ knowledgeable person on what his/her needs actually are (versus wants), at least should be afforded some say. In addition, we must remember what the purpose of education is, and that there are different levels of education.

In high school, the focus is not so much on learning actual material. The focus is on developing study habits, and on social interaction. The best secondary schools promote an environment in which individual creativity and pacing can be developed, where students are taught to thinkon their own, and learn to debate and argue in a scholarly way, through writing and other formal methods of discourse. Group collaboration and interpersonal skills are developed and honed. The actual details of what is studied and tested is of less importance. Whether a student reads Maya Angelou, or Yeats, or Euripides essentially is beside the point as long as a student's mind is cultivated, not just their ability to record and recite. What is important is that secondary students develop and grow in the hands of the professionals.

The secondary educational experience is designed to prepare a student for college. It is in college where the individual learns to examine the world and how it works, and the individual's place in it.

As for duty, it is the educators' duty not simply to determine the curriculum, but to present it effectively. They cannot half-heartedly paint it on the blackboard, they must enliven it and actually teach. Hard work must be lauded, while freeloaders are punished. These are the duties of teachers, and the duty of the students is not just to learn or study, but to grow. An independent mind is what students need, and that mind has to be in a position to want and be able to question beyond the material presented, not simply to question its legitimacy. That distinction, though subtle, is the difference between letting the students follow a self-destructive course of premature self-determination on the one hand , and permitting on the other hand the fostering of great talents through a cooperative, mentoring relationship

## Reader Comment on 6

This is an insightful, well-articulated discussion of curricular responsibility and the larger issue of academic responsibility. After a brief introduction examining assumptions implied by the topic, the writer skillfully develops the position that letting students dictate the curriculum could dilute the educational experience. Allowing students to determine the curriculum, the writer claims, will deny them the guidance and direction they need to learn academic responsibility.

The line of reasoning is strengthened by the discussion of how teachers and students can work in partnership to satisfy the needs of students. The argument is further advanced with concrete examples from high school courses showing how teachers provide guidance for students through group collaboration, development of interpersonal skills, and preparation for college. The examples are varied (from condom use to reading Angelou, Yeats, or Euripedes) and used effectively to further support the writer's position.

In the conclusion, the writer thoughtfully discusses how educators should not only determine the curriculum but present it in an enlivened and appropriate manner. The final sentence, contrasting a "self-destructive course of premature self-determination" and "a cooperative, mentoring relationship," ties the essay together.

The essay is clearly organized, although the writer does not rely on conventional phrases (such as "first," "second," etc.) to signal the organizational structure. Instead, the organization and focus progress through the line of reasoning that moves fluently and coherently from one paragraph to the next.

Language use is generally precise and effective (e.g., "holding royalty accountable to the mob"), and sentence structure is well controlled (e.g., "hard work must be lauded, while freeloaders are punished"). The few errors are minor, the kind that can easily be made -- and forgiven -- under testing conditions.

This outstanding response received a score of 6.

## Benchmark 5

FROM WHENCE SHOULD CURRICULUM COME?

"It is unfortunate that today's educators place so much emphasis on finding out what students want to include in the curriculum and then giving it to them. It is the educator's duty to determine the curriculum and the students' duty to study what is presented to them."

As an elementary educator, I believe this stance is extremist. Educators and the public must come to a middle road. The high road and the low road are intimated in this statement. I believe the high road on this topic (from whence should curriculum come) represents a nouveau approach. Ask the students what they want to learn and study for the year; then meander, research and branch off of their interests. The low road on this topic (directly endorsed by this statement) is old fashioned and outdated. The assumptions behind this view include a magical ability by teachers to infuse reams of information, data and knowledge into students' brains that then become internalized and applied by the students.

In a complex and frightening society, we must look to the middle road. We must infuse the best of the high and the low roads. Current research has had a lot to say on curriculum development. Overreaching arguments defend the quality of students' self-directed learning. However, in order to prepare our students for this society, we must have developed the backbone and anchor for curriculum. Content and performance standards (i.e. curricula) need to be developed by the district's educators as a map for teachers. When educators provide students with choices WITHIN the map of curriculum, students relish in the freedom and take ownership for their learning.

Were we to provide students the ultimate authority in curriculum development, we would be doing an injustice not only to our students but to society as a whole. There are specific skills and abilities that need to be developed and taught -- regardless of students' (or for that matter, teachers') interest. In my profession as an elementary educator and as a parent, I value the abilities to read, write and be mathematically proficient. Those students not mastering those critical skills are at a disadvantage. We see those students become destructive or depressed. I have observed students struggling with the basics become outcasts in their own little worlds. Very young outcasts grow into adult outcasts.

I do NOT think it is unfortunate that today's educators emphasize students' interests. It IS our duty, however, to provide the parameters for their education. We can not simply state that educators determine curriculum and students follow. This is just not reality in the classrooms. When standards and curricular maps have been developed, teachers of today's children have the responsibility (yes, the duty!) to bring life to those maps. One crucial and successful way, is to provide students variety and choices within the context of "what needs to be covered." The educator who brings curricula to life for her students and gives her students the responsibility to make choices helps to prepare our children for thriving -- not just surviving.

## Reader Comment on 5

This response presents a well-developed analysis of the issue and displays strong control of the elements of writing. The essay argues in favor of a "middle road" position on the issue by analyzing the pros and cons of both teacher-determined and student-driven curricula. The argument is clear and well focused, supported with first-hand experience and the results of educational research.

The writer endorses a curriculum that emphasizes strong basic skills (reading, writing, and math) and reminds the reader that the teachers' ultimate responsibility should be to bring curricula to life in order to "prepare our children for thriving -- not just surviving."

This essay displays a strong facility with written English language; the careful choice of words and carefully structured paragraphs help unify the structure of the argument. Overall, this response displays a strong command of academic writing skills and thus received a score of 5.

## Benchmark 4

The above quotation a concrete example of a major problem in our society today. While probably stated with good intentions, the quotation misses the mark on the path education needs to follow. As our society changes, so do our educational needs, and thus our educational curriculum needs to change also.

I find fault with the quotation on two fronts. First, the quotation does not acknowledge that curriculum must change. It seems to say the educator should decide when to change the curriculum. This does not lead to optimal learning conditions, ask anyone who studied high school history out of outdated textbooks. One can also infer some students won't be taught up-to-date informationin a wide variety of areas. This can become ideologically dangerous. What happens when students are not given full teachings of such vital movements as the Equal Rights Amendment or the Constitution of their country? An unenlightened society is a grave society with little hope. Curriculum must change, and should not be left to input from a single voice.

The second argument answers who should make curriculum adjustments. Obviously the educator still plays alarge role in this matter. The students also need to be part of the decision process. The two groups need a give and take relationship when deciding topics for the classroom. If the students could benefit from learning material that is presently not taught in the classroom, it should be entered. Sex education and AIDS education classes needed to be part of the curriculum to inform young people. Those classes were added and have worked well.

A third party that has a role in curriculum development is private business, including research labs, goods and service providers, and financial businesses. By hiring employees with certain capabilities they have indirectly influenced curriculum for years. As time passes they will have more input by demanding subpar schools raise the level of student test scores in certain areas, either by stating so or by not hiring unqualified students

The quotation echoes of a time when school learning consisted of the three "R"'s and little else. For better or worse our society is much more complex now than then. For our schools to keep pace with our society we need to adjust our curriclum to what it should be, what we want it to be, and what it needs to be.

## Reader Comment on 4

This essay presents a competent discussion of the issue. The essay's argument -- that curriculum should be determined by many voices, including that of private business -- is clearly expressed and adequately developed. The writer supports this position with relevant reasons, including an analysis of the need for private business to become involved in education. Examples are clearly relevant (e.g., sex education and AIDS education are cited as examples of how schools are offering new classes to meet the contemporary needs), and the writer uses details to help develop and illustrate important points. While the essay presents several ideas that are thought provoking -- e.g., "An unenlightened society is a grave society with little hope" -- those ideas are not expressed precisely or persuasively enough to merit a score of 5.

The conclusion is appropriate; it reinforces the main idea of the essay, that schools need to keep pace with society and adjust curricula to meet the needs of both students and employers.

The essay consistently displays adequate control over the conventions of academic writing. Sentence structure is generally adequate, although many of the sentences would benefit from restructuring and the use of transitions to more effectively communicate the writer's ideas.

For all of these reasons -- competent analysis and adequate control of the elements of writing -- this essay received a score of 4.

## Benchmark 3

In today's society, there is too much emphasis placed on students desires rather than their needs. The students of today should have to study what is presented to them, rather than what is desired by them. Students are searching for the easy way out, and educators' are supplying them with that. Students should not only be presented with mandatory curriculum, but the educators should strive to insure that each individual student truly gains from their education, rather than just breezing through it.

It is vital to the continued success and expansion of the United States, that the young people be challenged in their curriculum and be encouraged to succeed in all that they do. The educators should determine a more strenuous curriculum, and enforce it at an earlier age. Thus, the young people of today will expect to be challenged, rather than avoiding it. Students have the easy way out, and they are not truly giving all that they can. There is so much potential that is just waiting to flourish, but it is the educators' reponsibility to tap into that potential.

In conclusion, it is the educators responsibility to enforce curriculum and than raquesting it. Students should be challenged and expect curriculum that will eventually lead them to a path of success.

## Reader Comment on 3

This brief essay is flawed by its generalities, repetition, and limited development. The central thesis -- that it is the burden of educators to teach what they believe is necessary and that our educational system should not allow students to "breeze through" the educational system -- is not adequately supported. The middle of the essay merely repeats much of what was said in the introduction. The writer discusses the concepts of students' potential and educators' responsibilities in only the most general terms.

The two-sentence conclusion simply repeats earlier discussion and does not sufficiently tie together and comment upon the earlier discussion. To earn a score of 4, this essay would need to provide specific reasons and examples that more adequately develop its main points.

Also, the phrasing is often vague ("giving all that they can" and "path of success"), and the syntax is at times poorly controlled ("young people of today will expect to be challenged, rather than avoiding it.") Still, the problems are not severe or frequent. For all of these reasons, this essay received a 3.

## Benchmark 2

There are many school violences in each school. Those are big problems to our govenment and social. School violences effect the studying of students. This is very serious, even some students are nervious to go school. In fact, the government must give students a clean place to study. Teachers should help students know it is a duty to study. So, everyone should face those big problems.

Do we know what are students' ideas? Do the educators try to know? Most educators hope the govenment can give students more and help them more. These are people's hope. But it is so unfortunate that students can't have a good place to study. Also, teachers have to teach the students. Not that students can know what to study by themself. In the compus, there are many guys sell the drugs and acohol to younger students. Why those guys can go into the school? That is also the main problem.

When we were little, we didn't know what is correct and what is wrong. So we lose ourself easily. At the same time, we need much care from parents and teachers. So our teachers and parents play the important roles and they own must do better. Because some students learn some bad habits from their teachers and parents.

If we want to resolve all the problems, we must face the problems and find out the reasons, then try to resolve them. We also must care all students. If we can help them, tring to do our best. Then, the problems will become less and less.

## Reader Comment on 2

This is a seriously flawed response to the topic. The writer begins by discussing school violence and the need for a good place to study, parental and teacher influence, and resolution of school problems. The issue of who should determine the curriculum, teachers or students, is implied but not addressed directly. In fact, teacher-directed learning seems to be a small point in a series of concerns related to school violence. The development of a position on the issue is unfocused and disorganized. Even the example, drug selling, relates to school violence and not to curricular responsibility.

Language errors are numerous. Problems with correct use of tense, diction, word order, sentence structure, and subject-verb agreement also interfere with meaning. Had the writer not included references to teachers helping students know what to study, the essay would probably have received a score of 1 instead of a 2.

## Benchmark 1

Today some educators place much emphasis on what students want,there is a conflict about what is the educator's duty for what educatee should get.

Normally, the college or university in our country ,students just study what they are tought,it is the professor's duty to dermine what should appear in the classroom.Nowday china has taken the polices of opening reforming,every thing chang vastly.Students can't get the job position from goverment authority but must look for the work chance by themself ,so students have taken great care to what they learn int the college and what kind of knowlege does the job market need.If our high education institute ignore this chang and keep the tranditional teaching method,it will seem as wast student's time and money and the colleges will lost their student.

It may be the best way for the developing country to reform their high education system, especially with those majors that closely connected with market or industry application.we must give our student most upcoming technolegy or skill to meet the need of outdoor of our college,the information from students may be the best reference for the educator to determine what they should take to the classroom.

## Reader Comment on 1

This essay displays little ability to develop and organize a coherent response to the topic.

The essay takes the position that China needs to reform its traditional approach to curriculum by becoming more student centered and technologically current. However, the reader has to work hard to decipher the generally confusing line of reasoning, which does not obviously address the central issue presented in the topic.

There is an attempt to organize the argument into a three-paragraph essay, but the one-sentence introduction is simply a variation of the topic statement. The brief body of the essay does not advance an opinion in a coherent manner, and the final paragraph shifts the focus to the need for technology in the curriculum.

The errors (comma splices, misspellings, verb problems, etc.) are so intrusive that coherence remains a problem.

This essay would need considerable rewriting in order to earn a higher score than 1.

**Sample Issue Essay 5**

**(100)** The best ideas arise from a passionate interest in commonplace things.

*Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the statement and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should consider ways in which the statement might or might not hold true and explain how these considerations shape your position.*

**Benchmark 6**

Even the most brilliant thinkers, from Socrates to Satre, live lives in time. A childhood, an adolescence, an adulthood; these are common to me and you as well as the greatest writers. Furthermore, many of the great thinkers we esteem in our Western culture lived somewhat unevetful lives. What distinguished their life from say a common laborer was their work. Therefore, what provided the grist for their work? One might say that they were brilliant and this alone was sufficient to distinguish their lives from the masses. Intellect alone can not devise situations or thoughts from no where; there must be a basis and that basis is most common, if not always, observation of the common, of the quotidian. Critics of this idea may argue that these thinkers were products of fine educations and were well schooled in the classics. This, they may point to, is the real basis for their knowledge. I would agrue that although it may be a benefit to study classics and be well schooled in diverse disciplines, these pursuits merely refine and hone an ability each and every person has, the ability to study human nature. Where best to study human nature than in the day to day routine each one of us can witness in him or herself or those around us.

I propose that the two best disciplines to understand this power of the commonplace and its ability to cause a groundswell of thought are philosophy and literature. Every school of philosophy, from the Greeks to our day, share a common mission or intent and that is to understand and explain human existence, with all of its concommitant features. Generally speaking, the Greek philosophers, epitomized in Aristotle, attempted to set down rules for human behavior founded on logic. These rules applied not only to the rare forms of human behavior but largely focused on the more mundane motions of daily life. Many of Aristotle's rules were based on his observations of others as well as himself. Contrast this venture with the existentialists of our century who attempted to look behind the real motivations of human behavior as well understand man's relation to the Universe. To do this, what did these philosophers do? They studied those around them; they submerged themselves in the commonplace, in cities with hordes of annonymous people. While the existentialists, as well those philosophers before, exploited their uncommon eduation and intellect, the basis for their movement was ordinary human behavior and existence.

Finally, literature is similar to philosophy in that it seeks to explain and understand human behavior and therefore rooted in the commonplace. Nevertheless, its relative strength over philosophy is literature's ability to emotionally and spiritually move the reader through the use of contrived situations and fictional characters. It can do this when even the central theme of a piece maybe love between a man and a woman (e.g.commonplace). Literature also distinguishes itself from philosophy in that the breadth of the fiction may be huge. The plot and the detail can be quite ordinary or fanatastic. However, this does not mean that the central themes of all literature, whether ordinary or fantastic, deal with human beings and the problems they find in the world, something which we all share.

In conclusion, I hope it has been shown that a passionate desire to understand and explain human behavior, the significance of our existence and deal constructively with the challanges of life are the centerpieces of at least in two of the most influential areas in human thought. What is more commonplace than the existence of man. (592 words)

**Reader Comment on 6**

This essay sustains a well-focused and insightful analysis of the issue. Beginning with the observation that the greatest thinkers "live lives in time," the writer reasons that the great thinkers develop their ideas through observation of common occurrences and everyday reality. One of the strengths of this essay is the way in which it thoughtfully considers the opposing claim: that great thinkers are primarily the product of fine education, and that, being "well schooled in the classics," they are far removed from everyday life. The writer notes that, while it "may be a benefit to study classics," it is nevertheless true that being "well schooled in diverse disciplines" will simply "refine and hone an ability to study human nature" in its everyday manifestations. This observation is indicative of the writer's sophisticated grasp of the complexities of the issue.

The writer goes on to demonstrate the intellectual "power of the commonplace" by skillfully developing two compelling examples from academic life: philosophy and literature. Aristotle is cited as a philosopher who studied the "more mundane motions of daily life." Similarly, the writer explains, twentieth-century existentialists, in attempting to understand man's relation to the universe, found inspiration in the commonplace.

Another strength in this essay is the way it introduces an idea and then builds on that idea as the argument unfolds. For instance, in a discussion of the existentialists in the second paragraph, the writer expands on an earlier point about "thinkers" in general: the existentialists may have "exploited their uncommon education and intellect," but the "basis for their movement was ordinary human behavior and existence." It is logical connections such as these that make for a coherent and well-focused discussion.

The writer uses language fluently and controls sophisticated syntax throughout the essay: "I would argue that although it may be a benefit to study classics and be well schooled in diverse disciplines, these pursuits merely refine and hone an ability each and every person has, the ability to study human nature."

This is not a flawless paper: word choice, for example, is not always precise. But the essay's cogent analysis, effective organization, and sophisticated sentence structure merit a solid score of 6.

**Benchmark 5**

I can agree with the statement above that, "The best ideas arise from a passionate interest in commonplace things. " The statement is an accurate description of how many people form great ideas from ordinary things in life. Sports are all great ideas that are made from commonplace things. What makes sports some of the best ideas is not what they began as but what they evolved into.

All athletic competitions began from commonplace things being brought together for the purpose of entertainment, excercise, and social interaction. Many of the sports people enjoy today are the results of someone's idea creating a new dimension of our lifestyle out of an ordinary object. Baseball, basketball, and track especially show that the idea of creating something wonderful out of ordinary objects is true.

Who would have thought that a stick and a ball would spawn into a national pastime, a generational tie between father and son, , a national bond between all races, and a multibillion dollar industry. Baseball began when someone decided to throw a ball at someone with a stick and that person with the stick would then try to hit the ball. What a simple concept and what a wonderful consequence.

Today the simple game of baseball is played all over the world. It is a sport that crosses international divides of religion, race, and politics. This one simple game, a bat hitting a ball, can bring the whole world together. But baseball is just one sport that shows the ablitiy to bridge cultural gaps.

When Mr. Naismith nailed a peachbasket to a post and threw a ball into it he had no idea that millions of people would be playing his game today. Mr. Naismith invented the game of basketball, which most everyone has played at some point in his or her life. Throwing a ball into a basket. What could be more simple or commonplace than a ball and a peach basket.

Today, basketball is the new American pastime. It replaced baseball because it is cheaper than baseball and it can be played by only one person. This interest in balls and new uses for them, as we can see in both baseball and basketball, brought about a huge social phenomena of excercise and new social interaction that would bring people together rather than divide them.

It doesn't take a ball to create a sport from a commonplace item. Track and field has no balls used in it, unless you consider the shotput a ball. The whole sport of track and field is made of simple ideas: running, jumping, and throwing. Simple but yet it is one of the most watched events worldwide as evidenced by the recent Olympic Games. For example, team relay races consist of four people running around an oval track passing a baton to each other. A baton that is the only object you need to have a relay race,a baton is definetly a commonplace thing. Yet this event has such stars as Carl Lewis who is known world wide.

Sports and how they were created is the epitome of the idea that "the best ideas arise form a passionate interest in commonplace things." What might have seemed boring at the time of hitting a ball, or throwing a ball into a net, or passing a baton are all now events that millions take part in and even more watch. What makes these ideas great is that they all bring people from different backgrounds together, wether they intended to or not.

**Reader Comment on 5**

This essay presents a thoughtful, if not very well-developed, discussion of the issue. Drawing examples from the world of sports, the writer notes that most sports begin with a simple idea. Baseball, for example, "began when someone decided to throw a ball at someone with a stick and that person with the stick would then try to hit the ball." From this simple idea came a sport that is played and enjoyed all over the world. Instead of focusing solely on the universal appeal of sports, however, the essay introduces the idea that sports cross "international divides of religion, race, and politics." This is a perceptive idea, but it is not effectively supported or sustained.

Throughout the essay, ideas are expressed clearly and word choice is accurate. Sentences are at times well formed and varied: "Today the simple game of baseball is played all over the world. It is a sport that crosses international divides of religion, race, and politics. This one simple game, a bat hitting a ball, can bring the whole world together." On the whole, however, this is a 5 essay; it lacks the syntactic sophistication and insightful analysis necessary for a score of 6.

**Benchmark 4**

While the best ideas do indeed arise from mankind's interest in the commonplace, one must realize that the "commonplace ideas" of our current society continue to evolve at such a rapid rate that we are converging on the Twenty-First Century on a wave of thought, ideas, and creation that would surely baffle our forefathers.

Simply put, Thomas Jefferson, a brilliant, and progressive thinker, was motivated to create certain societal services that he felt necessary for his time. Historians report that Mr. Jefferson witnessed a fire which destroyed a man's home. The victim was left with nothing. Mr.Jefferson, thinking it most unfortunate that a man should lose all his worldly posessions, developed a system of homeowners insurance. Of course today, we have taken insurance to a new and all-encompassing level. President Roosevelt adored nature and found great solace while visiting Yosemite in Wyoming. Among his many accomplishments, Rooselvelt, our twenty-sixth President, is perhaps best known for his creation of a National Parks Protection program.

Over time, the basic needs of mankind have been met due to interests in the commonplace mixed with a progressive trait in man to make things simpler, faster, less expensive, and more gratifying.

Today, our "simple thoughts" turn to ideas such as space stations, the technological superhighway, and electric vehicles. Sadly, we must also repair much of the fallout from some of our "commonplace" inspired ideas. For example, evolved transportation has a price as we work to restore our environment.

If we are inspired by the simple motivations, dreams, and tasks of everyday life then we must make a commitment to development our muse. Perhaps, the best way to move ahead is to step back; to re-examine and learn from the art, science, history, love and war of our founding fathers. Perhaps simple is best. After all, that's where all the best ideas are born.

**Reader Comment on 4**

This essay presents a competent discussion of the issue. The opening paragraph introduces two ideas that serve as the primary focus of the essay. The first is that, as the topic claims, the best ideas are the result of an interest in commonplace things; the second is that our ideas are evolving at a rate of rapidity that would "surely baffle our forefathers." These two ideas are adequately developed in the course of the paper, but not with enough fluency or complexity to merit a score of 5.

The second paragraph, which considers the way in which ideas arise from an interest in commonplace things, is the most thoroughly developed section of the response. The examples are relevant: Thomas Jefferson, who used everyday observations to come up with the idea of homeowners insurance, and Theodore Roosevelt, whose passionate interest in nature led him to develop the National Parks Protection program.

The essay's other area of focus -- the rapid rate at which our ideas change -- is discussed in the third paragraph. Some good ideas emerge, but, unfortunately, they are not well developed.

The essay is organized with an introduction, three supporting paragraphs, and a conclusion. However, the organization would be stronger if the ideas in one paragraph or section were more clearly connected to the points made in the next section.

While there are some errors, they are not severe enough to interfere with meaning. In general, the writer expresses ideas adequately, although at times the wording seems almost haphazard and therefore a bit confusing: "to re-examine and learn from the art, science, history, love and war of our founding fathers." For reasons of adequate content and adequate presentation of ideas, this essay received a score of 4.

**Benchmark 3**

The best ideas arise from a passionate interest in commonplace things. This is something I learned from everyday experiences. I always found that the things I decorated my life with abundantly, were the things I treasured most. It could be a memory, a possesion, or just a view. It's hard to create a whole picture without first looking at the pieces within it. My whole life of school and studies have brought me to college and have sparked my interest in applying to a graduate program. Never before did I realize how these little efforts would create this dream. In my field of dietetics many would be amazed to find that the food we eat could kill us or help us from disease.

There are many times where I'll be looking at the beautiful view, and I just have to go out and enjoy it. I do this by walking, gardening, or just lying in the grass. The feeling of the warm sun makes me dream. I know I'm not the only one who tends to overlook the basic things, like the tree outside that you used to climb, or the food you eat to give you energy and growth. We just have to take the time from our busy schedules to stop and smell the roses. Everyone's life is different, with our own experinces and thoughts to motivate us, and no matter who we are, some of the simplest things can bring great achievements in our lives.

**Reader Comment on 3**

This is a limited response; it does not adequately analyze the issue. The essay is primarily concerned with discussing the writer's own personal enjoyment of commonplace things. As such it never fully engages the topic's central issue -- the quality of the ideas that come from those commonplace things. Early in the response, the writer makes the following observation: "I always found that the things I decorated my life with abundantly, were the things I treasured most." This is typical of the simplistic analysis that characterizes this essay.

At the end of the first paragraph, the writer does make some hesitant steps toward a discussion of the ideas that might come from these everyday experiences, mentioning that "in my field of dietetics many would be amazed to find that the food we eat could kill us or help us from disease." This insight is not adequately developed, however, and, in the second paragraph, the writer returns to a discussion of the idea that one must enjoy the little things in life. In short, the essay is limited in its development, revealing only a partial understanding of the topic's assertion.

In general, the essay displays control of standard written English. There is not much syntactic variety, but neither are there profound errors. The essay received the score of 3 because its analysis is simplistic and vague, and its development is limited.

**Benchmark 2**

The thought of a passion

In reading such a passage as the one given to me as an assignment I can't help but think of an analogy that entered my mind. It is my enduring interest in the field of multimedia. I say this because of the ideas in which I cultivate as an artist of many media materials such as paints, film, computer animated software, etc. Being an expressionist I take in my surroundings and personal experiences from commonplaces and things and tell a story from my perspective using the various tools whether it be computer aided or hand drawn. My ideas come from people or things because it tells a story. The story can be abstract, little, big, or even strange. To record stories like these may spark ideas that may come to me in a domino effect. It's beautiful] I shared this with you to conclude that sometimes even common things such as a pencil and an empty page can spelllout your fate and unlimited possibilities when you have a passion or an interest that drives your hunger for innovation.

**Reader Comment on 2**

This essay is seriously flawed in its analysis of the issue. The writer attempts to address the topic by focusing on his or her interest in "multimedia" art. Yet, while isolated words and phrases from the topic appear throughout the essay, the essay never clearly states a position on the issue. For example, in a discussion of multimedia art, the writer makes the following observation: "Being an expressionist I take in my surroundings and personal experiences from commonplaces and things and tell a story from my perspective using the various tools whether it be computer aided or hand drawn." The essay circles around the issue, without ever really engaging it.

The essay is also marked by serious flaws in language use: inaccurate word choice ("and tell a story from my perspective using the various tools whether it be computer aided or hand drawn."), unclear pronoun reference ("My ideas come from people or things because it tells a story"), and, in general, a debilitating lack of clarity and precision. These errors frequently interfere with meaning, a characteristic of many essays scored 2.

**Benchmark 1**

The best ideas arise from a passionate interest in commonplace things because they are from places in the heart. These iseas draw you to learn more about them. The idea or ideas have become passionate to you by either personal experience or by observation. It catches your attention and causes you to examine why or how the occurance /idea exsists. Institentively the desire to know more about the idea pushes you into futher research of the subject. The idea can be something you don't understand to be acceptable or unacceptable. The drive to understand leads to passion and that passion drives you to develope a great idea.

**Reader Comment on 1**

This essay is fundamentally flawed; it does not present an organized, coherent response to the topic. Sentences and fragments are strung together with little, if any, underlying logic. The writer's position seems to be that the more passionate we are about an idea, the more we will pursue it. But this idea is not really developed, even in a perfunctory way.

The errors are so pervasive and fundamental that they seriously interfere with meaning. This response requires considerable revisions to receive a score higher than 1.

**Sample Issue Essay 6**

123. “The best way for a society to prepare its young people for leadership in government, industry, or other fields is by instilling in them a sense of cooperation, not competition.”

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the claim. In developing and supporting your position, be sure to address the most compelling reasons or examples that could be used to challenge your position.

**Essay Response – Score 6**

Whenever people argue that history is a worthless subject or that there is nothing to be gained by just “memorizing a bunch of stupid names and dates,” I simply hold my tongue and smile to myself. What I’m thinking is that, as cliche as it sounds, you do learn a great deal from history (and woe to those who fail to learn those lessons). It is remarkable to think of the number of circumstances and situations in which even the most rudimentary knowledge of history will turn out to be invaluable. Take, for example, the issue at hand here. Is it better for society to instill in future leaders a sense of competition or cooperation? Those who have not examined leaders throughout time and across a number of fields might not have the ability to provide a thorough and convincing answer to this question, in spite of the fact that it is crucial to the future functioning of our society. Looking closely at the question of leadership and how it has worked in the past, I would have to agree that the best way to prepare young people for leadership roles is to instill in them a sense of cooperation.

Let us look first at those leaders who have defined themselves based on their competitiveness. Although at first glance it may appear that a leader must have a competitive edge in order to gain and then maintain a leadership position, I will make two points on this subject. First, the desire to compete is an inherent part of human nature; that is, it is not something that needs to be “instilled” in young people. Is there anyone who does not compete in some way or another every single day? You try to do better than others in your school work or at the office, or you just try to do better than yourself in some way, to push yourself. When societies instill competitiveness in their leaders,  leads to trouble. The most blatant example in this case is Adolf Hitler, who took competition

very extreme, trying to prove that his race and his country were superior to all. We do not, ho it only to the wever, need to look that far to find less extreme examples (i.e., Hitler is not the extreme example that disproves the rule). The recent economic meltdown was caused in no large part by the leaders of American banks and financial institutions who were obsessed with competing for the almighty dollar. Tiger Woods, the ultimate competitor in recent golfing history and in many ways a leader who brought the sport of golf to an entirely new level, destroyed his personal life (and perhaps his career--still yet to be determined) by his overreaching sense that he could accomplish anything, whether winning majors or sleeping with as many women as possible. His history of competitiveness is well documented; his father pushed him froma very early age to be the ultimate competitor. It served him well in some respects, but it also proved to be detrimental and ultimately quite destructive.

Leaders who value cooperation, on the other ahnd, have historically been less prone to these overreaching, destructive tendencies. A good case in point would be Abraham Lincoln. Now, I am sure at this point you are thinking that Lincoln, who served as President during the Civil War and who refused to compromise with the South or allow secession, could not possibly be my model of cooperation! Think, however, of the way Lincoln structured his Cabinet. He did not want a group of “yes men” who would agree with every word he said, but instead he picked people who were more likely to disagree with his ideas. And he respected their input, which allowed him to keep the government together in the North during a very tumultuous period (to say the least). My point in choosing the Lincoln example is that competitiveness and conflict may play better to the masses and

be more likely to be recorded in the history books, but it was his cooperative nature that allowed him to govern effectively. Imagine if 109the CEO of a large company were never able to compromise and insisted that every single thing be done in exactly her way. Very quickly she would lose the very people that a company needs in order to survive, people with new ideas, people ready to make great advances. Without the ability to work constructively with those who have conflicting ideas, a leader will never be able to strike deals, reach consensus, or keep an enterprise on track. Even if you are the biggest fish in the pond, it is difficult to force your will on others forever; eventually a bigger fish comes along (or the smaller finish team up against you!).

In the end, it seems most critical for society to instill in young people a sense of cooperation. In part this is true because we seem to come by our competitive side more naturally, but cooperation is more often something we struggle to learn (just think of kids on the playground). And although competitive victory is more showy, more often than not the real details of leadership come down to the ability to work with other people, to compromise and cooperate. Getting to be President of the United States or the managing director of a corporation might require you to win some battles, but once you are there you will need diplomacy and people-skills. Those can be difficult to learn, but if you do not have them, you are likely to be a short-lived leader.

**Reader Commentary for Essay Response – Score 6**

This outstanding response earns a score of 6 for presenting an insightful position on the issue and supporting its analysis with compelling reasons and persuasive examples. The response takes the insight-ful position that competition, though necessary to some aspects of leadership, is less important for young people to learn because it is inherent in the human condition and can lead to dangerous excesses, where-as cooperation is more difficult to learn but more essential. The response follows the task directions by using counterarguments in the development of its position. For example, the discussion of Lincoln explores conflicting sides of his Presidency (the “competition” of the Civil War and the “cooperation” within his Cabinet). In fact, the response skillfully explores the

nuances of both cooperation and competition, building its position of agreement with the prompt by looking closely at many sides of both concepts. Additionally, the response demonstrates superior facility with language. There are a few minor errors, mainly typos, but in general the response demonstrates excel-lent sentence variety and diction. This sentence is typical of the quality of the writing throughout the response: “My point in choosing the Lincoln example is that competitiveness and conflict may play better to the masses and be more likely to be recorded in the history books, but it was his cooperative nature that allowed him to govern effectively.” In this complex sentence, the writer makes skillful use of parallel structure and subordination. Because of its fluent writing and insightful development, then, this response earns a score of 6.

**Essay Response – Score 5**

Cooperation, the act of working as a group to achieve a collective goal, is an important value for young children to learn. Another vital life lesson children can learn is how to be competitive, which is a mindset in which a person feels the need to accomplish more than another person. Both are necessary to become well rounded individuals, but concerning preparing for a future in government, industry or various other fields, a sense of cooperation is much more important. While not all children are overly competitive in nature, every person has some level of competitive drive inside them. This is a natural thing and is perfectly normal. Unfortunately, if this competitive nature is emphasized, the child will have problems relating socially to other children, and subsequently, will have issues interacting with adults later in life. A fierce competitive drive will blind an individual, causing them to not see situations where group effort will be more greatly rewarded than an

individual effort. Take for instance the many teams of people working for NASA. If the people that make up these teams were all out to prove that they were superior to others, our entire space program would be jeapordized. One needs to look beyond the scope of what is best on an individual level and learn to look at what will most benefit a broad group of people. This is where instilling a sense of cooperation in young children is vital. Cooperation is taught at an early age and must be emphasized throughout life to fully embrace the concept.

In the world of sports a competitive drive is vital; unfortunately, life is not a sports game that simply leads to a winning or losing score. Life is far more complex than this simple idea and there is no winner or loser designation to accompany it. We all have to work together to come to a conclusion that will assist 110not just ourselves, but others and future generations. In every scenario there will be individuals that have brilliant ideas, but those ideas require other people to build upon, perfect and impliment. Take for instance Bill Gates; Bill Gates is responsible for the Microsoft coorporation which he invented in his garage. His competitive drive assisted in building his idea, but it was the collaborative effort of many people that helped propel his invention into the world known product it is today. Without the cooperation of others, his genius invention might never have made it out of his garage. It may be true that an individual can change the world, but only so far as to say that an individual can construct an idea that will inevitably change the world. Once an idea is formulated, it then takes a team of people working collectively towards a common goal to make sure that the brillant, life-altering idea makes it to furtuition. Without the cooperation of many, an idea could simply remain as a picture on a drawing board. It is because of this possibility that instilling a cooperative demeanor in children is much more important than developing a competivie attitude. Competition is a natural thing that will develop with or without encouragement but the same cannot be said for a sense of cooperation.

**Reader Commentary for Essay Response – Score 5**

Arguing that cooperation is less natural and more important for leadership, this response develops a thoughtful position on the issue and conveys meaning clearly and well. For these reasons it earns a score of 5. Note that it does not develop its reasons and examples as thoroughly as the sample 6 does, but it still presents thoughtful analysis using well chosen examples. For example, the discussion of Bill Gates is thoughtful, exploring the ways that both competition (the “competitive drive” that led him to found a company) and cooperation (the “collaborative effort of many people” is what made the company work) were essential to his success as a leader. Throughout the response, then, counterarguments are used to create a nuanced position on the issue. The writer looks at conflicting aspects of competition, which is vital but insufficient for life because life is “more complex” than a sporting event, and cooperation, which is critical but more difficult to learn. In addition, the writer conveys meaning clearly, demonstrating sentence variety and a facility with language that is more than adequate. There are a few minor errors, mainly typos and misspelled words, but language control in this response is more than adequate (e.g., “One needs to look beyond the scope of what is best on an individual level and learn to look at what will most benefit a broad group of people.”). Because of its facility with language and its thoughtful position on the issue, this response earns a score of 5.

**Essay Response – Score 4**

When the generation of today matures, it is important for them to succeed and become the successful leaders in government, industry and other fields. There are many traits that leaders must possess, and cooperation is one of these very important characters. Nonetheless it is important for leaders to have a sense of competition, so as to prevent themselves from be-ing complacent with their position.

Cooperation is needed in order to be a functional person in society, while still adhering to social standards. Most leaders in society, did not start out as such. A person cannot isolate themselves from

others with demeanor and attitude and expect to become an executive. While there may be leaders that have developed this ill attitude towards others, they did not get there by being that way. A person who is able to effectively cooperate with others, will subsequently develop a nexus of supporters. Through collaboration, people are able to develop their studies further and better themselves. However, it is still important for there to be a sense of competition. Competition is the root of motivation for most. It drives us to become stronger, smarter, and to want more. Nonetheless, the spirit of competition must also be reigned in, and not be allowed to run wild. Competitiveness can lead to abuse of power and distasteful actions, which is quite the opposite of someone who displays cooperativeness.

Some may argue that competition is not needed. That those that are meant to be leaders will not become complacent, because they have their own internal drive to lead. If there was no competition, there would be no world records. Michael Phelps may not be a leader of government or industry, but he is certainly educated on the technique of swimming, and leader in his field. Would he be as good as he is today if there was not competition? Would the leaders of Microsoft have been motivated to create Bing if there was no Google? 111Cooperation helped many leaders get where they are today, and will continue to do so in the future. But leaders, as well as those that aspire to be one, all need to have a sense of competition as well.

**Reader Commentary for Essay Response – Score 4**

This adequate response presents a clear position on the issue in accordance with the assigned task, arguing that both competition and cooperation are important for leaders. The response uses

counterarguments both in the construction of its overall position (comparing the value of both competition and cooperation) and in its discussion of the positive and negative aspects of competition. However, the development of ideas in this response is not as thorough or as persuasive as one would expect to see in a response that earns a score of 5 or 6. For instance, the example of Microsoft inventing Bing to compete with Google is certainly relevant, but it is not developed with any thoughtfulness. It is simply stated. Other examples are somewhat more fully developed, but there is also some tangential material (e.g., even the writer seems to understand that Michael Phelps does not quite fit into a discussion of leadership). In addition to its adequate development, this response displays adequate control of language. This response does not have the sentence variety or the skillful diction seen in a response that earns a higher score. There are some minor errors present, but nothing that interferes with clarity. Because this response presents a clear position on the issue, expressing meaning with adequate clarity, it earns a score of 4.

**Essay Response – Score 3**

Leadership is a tough task to master.To be a leader means you must be better than a bunch of folks and work with them to accomplise a greater goal.Leadership in any feild needs cooperarive effort and a leader must be able to inspire and make the human resourse at hand to work better.In doing so there is a far cry of an immense responsibility.I therefore stand by taking help from inmates to do the same.

Like the say ‘when going gets tough the tough gets going’.So there is no point of getting bogged down rather plan more ways to get the work done and one of the sureshot approach is by working together.I believe to the core of my heart that there can be nothing equal to cooperation and unity in a work field.As simple as it sounds if one can do a work in hermit atmosphere at certain efficiency, a number of brains working toghether can be more effi cient.An atmosphere where everyone works holding hands and when someone falls there are people to make him stand again makes a much better picture in my mind everytime.

Compitition is not a evil it can inspire some one to work better and looking to do better can be considered good.But am afraid what fear here is that when you compete with someone you set you limits to that person.So once you do better than him/her you tend to be relaxed and that is where when the real evil creeps in.

With cooperation you have a goal and associated effort to work for the same.Rather than individual petty and competition to be better placed than an friend it would be far more appreciable to keep working for the common goal.That way even the goal gets more defined at some level.So lets all drop all this boundaries of indivisualism and keep working for a common goal,and if you want to compete then compete with yourself and get better than what you were yesterday.

**Reader Commentary for Essay Response – Score 3**

This response displays some competence in presenting a position according to the task directions, but it earns a score of 3 because frequent minor errors do interfere with clarity. The writer agrees with the prompt that cooperation is more important, and it explores some counterarguments in its assertion that competition “can inspire some one to work better and looking to do better can be considered good.” How-ever, almost every sentence in this response has at least one minor error. Some of the errors are typos or minor mechanical problems like missing spaces after punctuation. But other errors have more impact on meaning. Missing words, incorrect sentence boundaries, and improper verb forms contribute to a lack of clarity throughout the response. This sentence is typical of the limited language control seen throughout this response: “So there is no point of getting bogged down rather plan more ways to get the work done and one of the sureshot approach is by working together.” Because of its limited clarity, then, this response earns a score of 3.

**Essay Response – Score 2**

Both a sense of cooperation and competition is needed to be a good leader. If one is focused on competition and ignores or refuse to work with others then there would be problems for that leader. A 112leader needs to be able to get along, cooperate and know how to interact with others and allies. Treaties and allies require cooperation. Trade agreements and aid as well. A leader cannot achieve much alone. Competition is also needed to encourage people to be the best. If no one does there best to obtain a goal how would a leader be chosen. What kind of leader would that make? The best way for a society to prepare its young is to instill a sense of both competition and cooperation.

**Reader Commentary for Essay Response – Score 2**

This response earns a score of 2 for its seriously limited development. There is a clear position on the issue, as the writer argues that the “best way for a society to prepare its young is to instill a sense of both competition and cooperation.” However, the writer provides few, if any, relevant reasons or examples to support and develop this position. The discussion of cooperation is supported only by very generic assertions like the notion that “treaties and allies require cooperation.” And there is even less development in the discussion of competition. In order to receive a higher score, the response would need to provide more support for its position. Language control in this response is adequate, but the response earns a score of 2 because of its seriously limited development.

**Essay Response – Score 1**

Best way for a socity to prepare it’s young people for leadership in government, industry, or other fields is by instilling in them a sense of coopertion, not competition. This statement is very true, whether we mean leadership in government, industry, or any other fields. For leadership in

government, industry, or other fields some people argue that the best way for society to prepare it’s young people is by instilling in them a sense of cooperation. Other people argue that the best way is through competition. It can be difficult for many people to decide between these two choices. There are many arguments that support both sides. I fully agree that the best way is to instilling in them a sense of cooperation, not competition.

**Reader Commentary for Essay Response – Score 1**

This response earns a score of 1 because it demonstrates little evidence of the ability to develop a position on the issue. Instead of developing a position, the response simply repeats the language of the prompt, adding some generic language that could be applied to any Issue prompt. For example, consider these sentences: “It can be difficult for many people to decide between these two choices. There are many arguments that support both sides.” This is a totally generic analytical framework that has not been filled in with any specific exploration related to this prompt. The writer is clearly making an attempt to respond to the prompt, and the final sentence does seem to indicate a position on the issue. So the response does not merit a score of 0. However, the vast majority of the response is simply repetition of language from the prompt and/or generic material. Thus, it earns a score of 1.

**Sample Issue Essay 7**

103. The best ideas arise from a passionate interest in commonplace things.

Discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the statement above and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should consider ways in which the statement might or might not hold true and explain how those considerations shape your position.

**The following sample issue response received a score of 6:**

Passion is clearly necessary for a truly great idea to take hold among a people—passion either on the part of the original thinker, the audience, or ideally both. The claim that the most lucrative subject matter for inspiring great ideas is “commonplace things” may seem initially to be counterintuitive. After all, aren’t great ideas usually marked by their extraordinary character? While this is true, their extraordinary character is as often as not directly derived from their insight into things that had theretofore gone unquestioned. While great ideas certainly can arise through seemingly pure innovation... say, for example, Big Bang cosmology, which developed nearly all of its own scientific and philosophical precepts through its own process of formation, it is nevertheless equally true that such groundbreaking thought was, and is, still largely a reevaluation of previous assumptions to a radical degree... after all, the question of the ultimate nature of the universe, and man’s place in it, has been central to human thought since the dawn of time. Commonplace things are, additionally, necessary as material for the generation of “the best ideas” since certainly the success among an audience must be considered in evaluating the significance and quality of an idea.

The advent of Big Bang cosmology, which occured in rudimentary form almost immediately upon Edwin Hubble’s first observations at the Hooker telescope in California during the early 20th century, was the most significant advance in mankind’s understanding of the universe in over 400 years. The seemingly simple fact that everything in the universe, on the very large scale, is moving away from everything else in fact betrays nearly all of our scientific knowledge of the origins and mechanics of the universe. This slight, one might even say commonplace, distortion of tint on a handful of photographic plates carried with it the greatest challenge to Man’s general, often religiously reinforced, conception of the nature of the world to an extent not seen since the days of Galileo. Not even Charles Darwin’s theory, though it created more of a stir than Big Bang cosmology, had such shattering implications for our conceptions of the nature of our reality. Yet it is not significant because it introduced the question of the nature of what lies beyond Man’s grasp. A tremendous number of megalithic ruins, including the Pyramids both of Mexico and Egypt, Stonehenge, and others, indicate that this question has been foremost on humankind’s collective mind since time immemorial. Big Bang cosmology is so incredibly significant in this line of reasoning exactly because of the degree to which it changed the direction of this generally held, constantly pondered, and very ancient train of thought.

Additionally, there is a diachronic significance to the advent of Big Bang cosmology, which is that, disregarding limitations such as the quality of optical devices available and the state of theoretical math, it could have happened at any point in time. That is to say, all evidence points to roughly the same raw intellectual capacity for homo sapiens throughout our history, our progress has merely depended upon the degree of it that a person happens to inherit, a pace that has been increasing rapidly since the industrial revolution. Yet this discovery had to happen at a certain point in time or another—it cannot have been happening constantly or have never happened yet still be present— and this point in time does have its own significance. That significance is precisely the fact that the aforementioned advent must have occurred at precisely the point in time at which it truly could have occured—that is to say, it marks the point in our history when we had progressed sufficiently to

begin examining, with remarkable substantiated acuity, the workings of the universe across distances that would take millions of human lifetimes to reach or to traverse. The point for the success of this advent must necessarily have been, additionally, the point at which the audience concerned was capable and prepared to accept such a radical line of reasoning.

Both factors, a radical, passionate interpretation of the commonplace and the preparedness to accept such an interpretation, are necessary for the formulation of a truly great idea. If the passion is absent from an inquiry by the thinker or by the bulk of an audience, the idea will die out if it comes to fruition at all. If the material is not sufficiently commonplace to be considered by an informed audience of sufficient size, the same two hazards exist. Given these two factors, the idea must still be found palatable and interesting by the audience if it is to hope to gain a foothold and eventually establish itself in a significant fashion.

**Comments on sample essay receiving score of 6:**

This outstanding response presents a cogent, well-articulated analysis of the complexities of the issue by arguing that (1) great ideas develop from commonplace observations that are interpreted in a radical way; and (2) passion is required of both thinkers and the audience in order for great ideas to take hold.

The argument is based on an extended example (Big Bang cosmology) and has two parts. The first part defines “commonplace things” as universal questions (i.e., the quest to understand the cosmos is commonplace, though complex, because it is an ancient and universal question) and places Big Bang cosmology in context with the scientific breakthroughs of Galileo and the Pyramids of ancient Mexico and Egypt.

The second part explains Big Bang as the result of a convergence of factors: both thinkers and the audience must be ready to reevaluate “previous assumptions” and accept “radical, passionate interpretations.”

The argument’s careful line of reasoning is strengthened by appropriate transitions between paragraphs (“Additionally,” “Both factors, a radical, passionate interpretation of the commonplace and the preparedness to accept such an interpretation, are necessary for the formulation of a truly great idea,” etc.) and within paragraphs (“Not even Charles Darwin’s,” “Yet,” “that is to say,” etc.). Fluent and precise language—advent, rudimentary, diachronic, shattering implications, megalithic ruins—and effective sentence variety also characterize this response as outstanding. Finally, despite the presence of minor errors (overuse of comma and inconsistent use of ellipses in paragraph 1), this response demonstrates facility with the conventions of standard written English.

**The following sample issue response received a score of 5:**

The statement above comes from the perspective that the best thinkers, inventors, and innovators are the way that they are because they explore passionately the interesting things around them. Yes, I would say that this is definitely true.I understand best the things that interest me, but it is only the things with which I am familiar with and understand in my surroundings. It would be difficult to take passionate interest in the things which I did not have available in my environment.

For example, let’s consider some “idea” people in history. The person who invented the basketball hoop, or the game of volleyball, or ice skates, all had interest in those things before they had their brilliant ideas. I do know that the inventor of the basketball hoop used to coach a basketball team of young boys, and they would throw the ball into a fruit basket that was nailed to the wall. Obviously, a basket has a bottom to it, and they would have to fish it out after every successful throw. So he

had the brilliant idea of cutting out the bottom of the basket. It seems so simple to us now, but nobody had ever played basketball like that in his day.

The phrase, “commonplace things” can be rather misleading, I believe. I think every person has slightly different “commonplace things” in their environment depending on their interests, their financial status, and availability of items. What is commonplace for one person may never be known by another. I take passionate interest in things having to do with sewing using patterns, fabrics and threads. However, my mother and grandmother are excellent seamstresses and I had the availability of learning from them. It was a “commonplace thing” for me. I have had some wonderful ideas come out of my passion for this kind of art.

Orville and Wilbur Wright had a passionate interest in things having to do with flight, a rather ordinary thing for the sorts of birds who can fly with their wings, but certainly not people. If I had lived during the Wright brothers’ time, I would probably not have had the same passionate interest in figuring out how to make humans fly, because it is not something that I would have thought possible. But their dreams and visionary possibilities were much bigger than mine would have been at that time. They not only had a passionate interest but they were willing to experiment, to risk financial ruin and ridicule, and even put their lives on the line. So while it is true that the best ideas arise from a passionate interest in commplace things, there also has to be an element of daring to challenge “norms” and not being able to just accept things as they are. There has to be a desire to make things better and to improve on the present.

There also has to be the element of not being afraid of failure. Most ideas do inevitably fail. Einstein is viewed today as being one of the most brilliant thinkers and “idea” people in all of history. But nobody really talks about how many times his ideas failed. The number is quite amazing. Many people are afraid of failure, so even though they make take a passionate interest in something commonplace, and have some great ideas, they may never carry them through because of uncertainty that they would work. We must be willing to try!

So, yes, it is true that the best ideas arise from a passionate interest in commonplace things, because these are the things that we know, these are the things that we understand, and the things that we want to explore in even more depths. But there must be more elements involved than just taking interest in something. We must be willing to face risks of many kinds in order to separate the ideas that fail from the ones that will triumphantly succeed.

**Comments on sample essay receiving score of 5:**

This strong response presents a well- considered analysis of the complexities of the issue by arguing that great ideas come, not only from a passionate interest in the commonplace, but also from great imagination and a willingness to succeed.

The logic of the response unfolds very smoothly: paragraph 3 explores the term “commonplace” and offers support for the prompt’s position; paragraphs 4 and 5 discuss the related issues of imagination, willingness to experiment, and overcoming failure. The examples are well chosen and generally well developed.

Paragraph 2 offers a relevant, though predictable, sports example (invention of basketball hoop) to examine how commonplace things/familiarity can spark great ideas. A personal example is used in paragraph 3 to further explore the definition of “commonplace” and illustrate how the term is relative to financial status and availability (though only the concept of availability is developed in this example). Paragraph 2 logically extends into paragraph 3, and the same connection is seen between paragraphs 4 and 5.

In paragraph 4 the Wright brothers are used to argue that great ideas also come from imagination and a willingness to experiment. The final example, in which Einstein is offered to illustrate the necessity of overcoming failure, is not as fully developed as the others. The respondent does not explain what failures Einstein endured or how he overcame them, which makes the example less compelling. Overall, the analysis demonstrated in the examples is “perceptive and clear,” but not “insightful and cogent” as required for a score of 6. While the response expresses ideas clearly, using appropriate vocabulary and sentence variety, it does not use language as fluently and precisely as would a typical 6. Occasional wordiness/ awkwardness could be avoided with more precise diction (e.g., “There also has to be the element of not being afraid of failure,” or “I have had some wonderful ideas come out of my passion for this kind of art”).

**The following sample issue response received a score of 4:**

In agreement with the statement, many great inventions have come from individuals interested in commonplace things. Out of simplicity arises great ideas, and I would consider commonplace things to be simplistic. However, it is hard to say that the “best” ideas arise from passion in commonplace things, because one could argue that the best ideas involve interest in remarkable things, which is what makes them the “best” ideas.

If the statement is viewed from the standpoint of all ideas from the beginning of civilization, then the statement holds true. Examples of commonplace things are food and shelter. If a person had an abundance of food and needed to transport it, they may have the idea to weave a basket or make some sort of tote in order to load more at once. With that idea, eventually the people would think of things to make the first idea more useful, such as adding wheels to your carrying device. With shelter, first people (Cro-Magnon)may have kept out of weather and unsafe territory by using caves as shelter. From passionate interest in the common shelter a person may have come up with brilliant ideas about structures, architecture, and construction.

In concern with the opposing view that the best ideas arise from remarkable things, one could argue that best ideas are medical breakthroughs and all other aspects of Science. Working with substances and molecules and creating ions and isotopes is not a commonplace thing. However, it is what the people who make the scientific breakthroughs have passionate interest in expanding.

Looking at the big picture, I would say that if people did not have “passionate interest in commonplace things”, then the idea that led us to the remarkable things would have never occurred. If that is true then the statement holds true because the best ideas do arise from a passionate interest in commonplace things. Though some older ideas may seem obsolete now, there was a time that without those ideas, we would still be in the dark ages.

Overall, I agree with the statement. The best ideas do arise from a passionate interest in commonplace things. Though I do not consider medical breakthroughs coming from interest in commonplace things, our species appears to be reaching the point in which cancer and AIDS could be considered a commonplace thing. If that is true, then when someone finds a cure for cancer or AIDS it will be one of the best ideas arising from a passionate interest in a commonplace thing. Once again reinforcing the truth of the statement.

**Comments on sample essay receiving score of 4:**

This response presents a competent analysis and conveys meaning adequately.

Paragraph 2 offers appropriate and adequately developed examples from “the beginning of civilization” to illustrate how commonplace needs inspire innovation: the need to transport food led to the invention of woven baskets and, eventually, the invention of the wheel; similarly, the need for

shelter that drove “Cro-Magnon” to the caves eventually inspired “brilliant ideas about structures, architecture, and construction.”

Paragraph 3, which explores the “opposing view” (the best ideas arise from remarkable things), is less developed. The respondent claims that the best ideas are “medical breakthroughs and all other aspects of Science,” without explaining what is meant by “Science” or why these types of ideas are the “best.” Does “Science” include engineering, computer sciences, and the social sciences? Why are advances in science and medicine better than advances in religion the arts, or philosophy? The response also fails to acknowledge the commonplace interests (e.g., desire to improve quality of life) that drive medical/scientific research. While the response addresses two sides of the issue, it never delves into complexity the way a 5 or 6 would.

In paragraph 4, the response comes to a new conclusion: without initial interest in commonplace things, interest in remarkable things would be impossible. This is an interesting position that, if developed and supported with well-chosen examples, could lead to complex analysis. However, the conclusion is merely stated, loosely supported with generalities, and then further confounded by shaky logic in paragraph 5.

Ideas are expressed with reasonable clarity and the response generally demonstrates control of language. It is lack of complexity and logical development that keep this response from earning a higher score.

**The following sample issue response received a score of 3:**

How do new knowledge came into being? Sometimes it stemed from exsiting knowledge. Sometimes it was born all out of sudden. Both ways seem work well. As I see through this question, I believe that what plays a key role in creating new ideas is a passionate interest.

Throughout history, a myriad of examples help prove the importance of interest. Edison, the greatest inventors in the world, possessed a sharp interest ever since his childhood. In his eyes, every common things were full of mysteries. It was his unique interest which helped him look into the machanism of things around therefore new iders came into his mind and, changed into conceret machines facilitating our lives. Another famous example is that of Newton. A riped apple from a tree fell onto his head one afternoon. For ordinary people, this kind of trivial instance would slip off their mind at once. However, Newton lost hisself in thought of the relation between objects. Finally he found gravitation and opened up a new era of physics.

On the other hand, without interest, the opportunity of great discoveries will pass by. Most people are experiencing ordinary lives everyday. Why don’t they come up with great ideas? Because interest is a state of skeptism, a state in which we do not stop to disclose the truth beneath a surface of commonplaces. Interest means the ability to explore the internal corelations. Therefore, with a passiontae interest, those commonplace things are no longer commonplace, and new ideas are created.

From what have been discussed above, we can see that interest serves as force to propell the exploration of unknowns, to perfect the structure of human knowledge, and to move towards the ultimate truth.

**Comments on sample essay receiving score of 3:**

This limited response demonstrates some competence in its analysis and in conveying meaning but is obviously flawed.

The response agrees with the prompt by arguing that a passionate interest allows people to see beyond the commonplace and create new ideas (paragraphs 1 and 3). However, the response is limited in presenting and developing this position.

In paragraph 2 the response offers two relevant but underdeveloped examples to illustrate the importance of interest in generating ideas.

The Edison example is not persuasive because its development is limited to generalities (“common things were full of mysteries...which helped him look into the machanism of things...therefore new iders came into his mind and, changed into conceret machines”). The response does not provide specific examples of the common “things” that interested Edison nor does it discuss any of Edison’s particular ideas. Thus, it does little to advance the response’s position. The Newton example is not penalized for historical inaccuracy. However, like the previous example, it is overly general and underdeveloped.

The response also contains an accumulation of language errors (in usage, word choice, and sentence structure) that often result in a lack of clarity. For instance, the rhetorical device used in paragraph 1 contains frequent errors that render it ineffective. The imprecise language use in the Newton example is particularly unsettling: “Newton lost hisself in thought of the relation between objects. Finally he found gravitation and opened up a new era of physics.” While these errors do not generally interfere with meaning, they constitute a lack of language control that precludes a score of 4.

**The following sample issue response received a score of 2:**

The above statement reinforces my values and beliefs. I agree that the best ideas arises from a paasionate interest. I agree simply because a person must be able to personally relate to a thing in order to become passionate to the idea. The person behind the best ideas are passionate because the commonplace things have affected the person on a personally level or on a mutual level. The relationship between the commonplace thing and the best idea unites a passionate interest to the person who it has affected. A person must have a desire to build on their passion in order to follow through on his or her idea.

**Comments on sample essay receiving score of 2:**

This response presents a seriously flawed analysis of the issue.

The response agrees with the prompt by arguing that a person must be able to relate to something in order to develop passion for it. (The connection between things one can “relate to” and “commonplace things” is implied.) The response also states that passion is necessary in order for a person to follow through on an idea. However, neither of these claims is supported with relevant reasons or examples.

Furthermore, flawed word choice and other language control problems make the reasoning hard to follow (particularly in sentences 4 and 5: “The person behind the best ideas are passionate because the commonplace things have affected the person on a personally level or on a mutual level. The relationship between the commonplace thing and the best idea unites a passionate interest to the person who it has affected.” In those sentences the respondent attempts to analyze the relationship between commonplace things, passion, and ideas). Nevertheless, this response is not a 1: the respondent does provide evidence of the ability to understand the issue and attempts to present a position on it.

**The following sample issue response received a score of 1:**

This topic can be found to be true in many different areas. The best ideas that people have come up with are usually founded be improving commonplace things. For example in order to improve the effiecency of writing the typewriter was invented, then following that the computer was invented.

**Comments on sample essay receiving score of 1:**

This response presents a fundamentally deficient discussion of the issue.

The first sentence consists of generic language that can be applied to any prompt. Thus, it neither enhances nor detracts from the analysis. The remainder of the response consists of a statement in support of the prompt and a list of two examples (the typewriter and the computer). The examples offered are potentially relevant but completely undeveloped. Basic errors in usage and grammar are pervasive, but it is primarily the inability to develop an organized response that makes this response a 1.

**Sample Issue Essay 8**

6. “A nation should require all of its students to study the same national curriculum until they enter college.”

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the recommendation and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, describe specific circumstances in which adopting the recommendation would or would not be advantageous and explain how these examples shape your position.

**Essay Response – Score 6**

Nations should not require that all students study the same national curriculum. If every child were presented with the same material, it would assume that all children learn the same and that all teachers are capable of teaching the same material in the same way. In addition to neglecting

differences in learning and teaching styles, it would also stifle creativity and create a generation of drones. The uniformity would also lend itself to governmental meddling in curriculum that could result in the destruction of democracy. If every teacher is forced to teach a certain text, the government need only change that text to misinform an entire generation. Lastly, a standardized curriculum would also adversely affect students who come from lower income families or families who have little education as they might not have as many resources for learning outside of school.

Children all learn in very different ways. If the curriculum is standardized completely, it leaves little room for exploratory learning. One child may learn how to spell from reading, another may learn from phonics. If the curriculum is standardized, suppose one aspect is dropped, that may exclude certain children from learning adequately. This is not to say of course that there shouldn’t be requirements, but they should be general requirements, not something so specific as a curriculum. Especially at the high school level this would be detrimental to the variety of subjects that a student can learn. Standards and the “No Child Left Behind” act in America are already forcing the reduction in programs such as art and music that have a less defineable curriculum. Additionally, education systems are rarely funded well enough to achieve the general goal of educating children. If a national curriculum were implemented, would it come with a significant increase in financial support? History suggests that it would not.

Teachers also have different methods of teaching; if say, the English curriculum of all high schools were standardized, then a book that one teacher teaches excellently and therefore inspires students to read more and learn on their own might be eliminated, and although that teacher ought to be capable enough to teach the curriculum books, his or her students will still be missing out on what might have been a great learning experience. It also limits how much of the teacher’s unique knowledge he or she can bring to the classroom. It is these inspirational books or experiences that allow teachers to reach students; if they are put in a mold, the quality of teaching and learning will go down.

Learning should be enjoyable and children and adolescents should be taught not only the curriculum in school, but that the body of knowledge that exists in the world today is enormous and that you can learn your whole life. Having a national curriculum implies that there is a set group of things worth learning for every person. Maybe this is true, but for students, it sets up a world where there is a finite amount of knowledge to be acquired for the purpose of regurgitating it on a test. Teaching a standard curriculum doesn’t encourage inquiries; it doesn’t make students ask questions like, “Why?” and “How?” School’s real purpose is teaching people to learn, not just teaching them a set group of facts. By teaching them to learn, students can continue doing so, they can extend skills from one area of knowledge to another. This type of learning fosters creativity that can be used not

only in math or science or English, but in art or music or creative writing. Teaching a brain to go beyond being a file cabinet for facts is the best way to teach creativity. Creativity is too often assumed to be something only for the arts. It is creativity that results in innovation and it is innovation that has resulted in the greatest achievements of humanity in the sciences and humanities alike.

Finally, the education system of a country is designed to put all children on a level playing field. Though this is only an ideal, it is a noble ideal. If the school curriculum becomes standardized, children who have highly educated parents, or more money to buy books outside of school, or more resources for tutors or private schools will immediately gain a foothold. Poorer students from uneducated families in the current American school system are already at a disadvantage, but at least now there is hope through variety that something can reach out to them and inspire them. There is hope that they can find a class that interests them. If the curriculum becomes rigid and standardized, it is these disadvantaged students who fall through the cracks.

There are many reasons not to standardize the curriculum. The uniqueness of students and teachers is the most obvious, but students from less educated backgrounds will suffer the most. The creativity of a nation as a whole would fall with a standardized curriculum. Most importantly though is the question of who and what? Who chooses the curriculum? What is important enough that it must be taught? These questions assume that there is some infallible committee that can foresee all and know what knowledge will be important in everyone’s lives. There is no person, no group, no comittee capable of deciding what knowledge is necessary. Curriculum should have standards, not be standardized and education should be as much about knowledge as it about learning to learn.

**Reader Commentary for Essay Response – Score 6**

This outstanding response develops an articulate and insightful position rejecting the prompt’s recommendation of a national curriculum. The writer understands a national curriculum to mean both the material that is taught and the way it is taught. The essay offers a wide-ranging discussion of the practical and theoretical implications of a national curriculum for students, for teachers, and for a nation. For example, the response argues that prescribing particular content and teaching methods might make it more difficult for teachers to tailor lessons to students with different learning styles and might also force effective teachers to adopt teaching methods that are less effective for them and their students. Although the essay clearly rejects the recommendation for a national curriculum, the writer does concede that there is a need for educational standards that are flexible enough to allow for individual, socioeconomic, and regional differences.

The response maintains a well-focused, wellorganized discussion, developing each point fully and connecting ideas logically without relying on obvious transitional phrases. The writing is fluent, despite minor errors in grammar and mechanics; sentence structure is varied and diction is effective. In sum, this response meets all of the criteria for a score of 6.

**Essay Response – Score 5**

While it may be to the advantage of a nation that all its students learn the same basic information, this can be accomplished without going to the lengths of having a national curriculum. By requiring that all students know a certain amount in basic areas of knowledge without specifying the details, a nation can achieve the same benefits of a national curriculum without unduly denying the freedom of teachers to teach as they see fit. A system of simple national standards is good enough. To go further and create a full-fledged national curriculum would gain nothing and impair the ability of teachers.

It is important to ensure that all students learn the fundamentals of different subject areas. In order to graduate from high school, for example, all students should have a good understanding of algebra, of basic concepts in science and history, and an ability to read critically. These are skills that will benefit people in all kinds of different careers. Even if you never manipulate an equation after graduating from high school, you will have a far better understanding of the world around you if you know simple facts of math and science. Fields such as English and history are even more important, as they are absolutely necessary to maintain an informed citizenry capable of making important decisions that all citizens of a democracy are called upon to make. In order to achieve this, it is necessary to have national standards of education. Most teachers are very capable of imparting knowledge on students, and most school boards are similarly well-intentioned. Nevertheless, without national standards, some students are bound to fall through the cracks, and some school boards, under pressure from groups of parents, may eliminate certain subject matter from schools, as has happened recently with the teaching of evolution in conservative areas of the United States. In order to ensure that all students learn all that they need to know as functioning adults, some kind of national standards should be in place.

These national standards, however, need not go so far as to constitute a single national curriculum. No one knows a class of students better than its teachers, and no one else can shape a curriculum for their maximum benefit. A national curriculum would necessarily mean a one-size-fits-all approach, and what is appropriate in one classroom may not be in another. Partly this is a result of the intellectual levels of the students in question: some may be able to learn far more about a particular subject than others. But it is also a question of student goals. The desire for specialization begins before college. A student who wants to become an auto mechanic should be able to take auto shop classes, classes which would not be of interest to a future lawyer or scientist. This notion may sound unacceptably elitist in today’s climate in which a college education has become almost an automatic goal of education, but it does not need to be this way. Students with limited interest in higher education should be able to opt out, to follow another curriculum that is more likely to lead to happiness later in life. As a society, we should not discourage them, but rather ensure that there are enough highpaying jobs available for skilled laborers with high school diplomas.

Everyone needs certain basic knowledge in order to function in society today. To this extent, we need national standards of instruction for students. But we do not need to cram every student into the same classes and force them to learn what we think is best for them.

**Reader Commentary for Essay Response – Score 5**

This strong response presents a generally thoughtful, well-developed analysis of the issue and conveys meaning clearly. The introductory paragraph clearly disagrees with the prompt’s recommendation: “By requiring that all students know a certain amount in basic areas of knowledge without specifying the details, a nation can achieve the same benefits of a national curriculum without unduly denying the freedom of teachers to teach as they see fit.” The writer supports this position by first arguing for the necessity of national standards, citing the individual’s need for fundamental knowledge in core areas, and by asserting that such knowledge makes for an informed, thoughtful citizenry. The discussion furthers this argument by examining some of the disadvantages of a rigid national curriculum, namely the inability of a national curriculum to accommodate students’ individual needs and interests.

The response develops its position with strong reasons and examples, though these reasons and examples are not always fully developed. For example, the response asserts that knowledge of English and history is “absolutely necessary to maintain an informed citizenry” and that “in order to achieve this, it is necessary to have national standards of education,” but it never really explains

how or why national standards would result in better-informed citizens than regional standards or a national curriculum would.

The response maintains a clear focus and organization with clear and logical transitions. Although the response conveys ideas clearly and demonstrates facility with standard written English, it lacks the precision of expression necessary for the highest score. In sum, this response demonstrates all of the characteristics required to earn a score of 5.

**Essay Response – Score 4**

As an educator, this topic is quite controversial to me. By having one set curriculum in the entire nation, students would be taught the same material. Students from the rural Texas will study the same thing as students in Brooklyn, NY and suburban Chicago. If they move from state to state, they will have covered the same material and they would be able to participate in class right away. You could also say that all students should have learned the same material, for which they should all be equal and should have the same opportunities. But it is unrealistic. I disagree with a national curriculum because all students are not the same, they have different interests, and this curriculum would not permit teachers to explore and teach to students interests.

First, a curriculum that becomes nation wide is supposed to teach all students the same material and perhaps the same way. All seventh graders will have to solve algebraic equations and then they will all be the same. But students are not the same. All children develop at different rates, they have different abilities. One cannot expect a child from Uptown Manhattan to be doing the same thing as the kids in southern Illinois. The conditions are different, they have different funding and quality of teachers. Parents involvement in their childrens education is different and that would affect what the students learn.

Besides having different abilities, the students have different interests or necesities. In one part of the nation it may be important to learn trigonometry and calculus because it is a high tech area. They use many computers and there might be a big market for careers in that field, but in another

part of the country it might be more important to learn about farming and erosion. That the interest would be different. Teachers also need the freedom to teach what the students are interested in. If the kids want to know about the Chicano Movement, they should have the opportunity to learn about it, instead of learning about African American Civil Rights Movement. City kids are interested in different things than kids rural areas, as well as kids from the East Coast and the West Coast.

For these reasons I would have to disagree with a national curriculum. Children are different and they should have the right to learn about things they are interested in. Teachers should have the freedom to teach what he/she thinks is more important or interesting to their students. Teachers should teach their students, not a curriculum.

**Reader Commentary for Essay Response – Score 4**

This response presents a competent analysis of the issue and conveys meaning with acceptable clarity. The writer begins by acknowledging some of the perceived strengths of a national curriculum but then disagrees with the prompt, arguing that “all students are not the same, they have different interests, and this curriculum would not permit teachers to explore and teach to students interests.” The writer supports this position by suggesting that a standardized approach to education will fail to address the different types of students who make up a nation’s youth; for instance, students in two different geographical areas may be subject to different socioeconomic conditions as well as different cultural attitudes toward the role of education. The writer continues exploring the

role of geography by pointing out that different areas naturally emphasize different aspects of curriculum based upon regional concerns and that a national curriculum would unfairly homogenize education.

The response is adequately focused and organized, and although it contains some errors, it demonstrates sufficient control of language in order to express its ideas.

**Essay Response – Score 3**

Until now, many countries have mandatory course for their students until they enter the college. It is beneficial to students to have same amout knowledge in their schools. Also, I agree this recommendation because these reasons.

Even if students have extraordinary abilities to study, it just will be some specific parts of academic fields. Generally, most ordiany students have abilities to follow their study through their courses. For all students, if people want to be had same knowledge and same academic background, the national curriculum is essential. Of course, some people don’t want to follow their mandatoyr courses so that someone takes privite classes in their house or takes a different class in other substituted schools. However, if students want to enter the college, they have to take a national test, for example, SAT. Like this test will require generalized knowledge until in the high school. For preparing this test, every students have to study requisited courses of SAT. Even though some students take privite courses, they also have to prepare these classes. Because of this, national curriculum is needed. If they do not need to take a test to enter the college, they won’t prepare these classes. However, until now, every college wants to accept to be experimented students so that they need standarized test for everybody. Recently, even though national curriculum is becoming a social issue to criticize its efficency, if governments don’t change their policy about thier educational programs, it has to exist in the education.

However, the same national curriculum has some troubles. If one student doesn’t follow the same curriculum, this student will be fale to enter the college. The mandatory curriculum does not allow individual characteristics, some students who have surprisingly abilities for other fields, for example, playing chess, singing the classic song, and operating computer systems, will not enter the college. So, we should consider this problem in the same national curriculum.

Nevertheless, the system of the education will not change to allow other possibilities, a nation has to require all of their students to study the same courses, until the college. It is related to educational systems so that it is difficult to decide whatever is right. However, while the current educaitonal system exist a nation, the country should require the same curriculum to its students.

**Reader Commentary for Essay Response – Score 3**

This response demonstrates some competence in analyzing the issue and in conveying meaning, but it is obviously flawed. The writer adopts a position of agreement with the prompt, arguing that since higher education requires students to pass standardized exams, a curriculum which emphasized the same education for all students would be more conducive to passing college entrance exams and tests such as the SAT. In the course of this argument, the writer does consider that the implementation of a national curriculum would remove the opportunity for students to explore areas of study outside their core coursework but argues that this loss can be made up during the students’ university coursework.

The response presents a clear position on the issue and develops that position with relevant reasons and examples, but it fails to convey ideas with acceptable clarity; it has problems in language and sentence structure that result in a lack of clarity. These frequent minor errors and occasional major

errors in grammar, usage, and mechanics preclude the response from receiving an upper-half score. In order to merit a score of 4, this response would need to demonstrate better control of the conventions of standard written English.

**Essay Response – Score 2**

A nation should teach all it’s students the same national curriculum until they enter college so that can prepare for college. Allowing everyone to learn the same curriculum will teach our society how to communicate with one another. This is a nation of equal opportunity and should be treated and taught equally. I believec that this would allows young individuals to get an better understanting

of all different kinds of religions, culture,and society. All school teach the same history,but some may forcus more on what they feel is important then depending on where you are from.

**Reader Commentary for Essay Response – Score 2**

After agreeing with the prompt’s recommendation, this brief essay presents a series of unsupported claims about education and culture. The discussion fails to develop any of these claims with relevant reasons and/or examples or to make logical connections between them; as a result, the discussion is disorganized and unfocused. The final sentence states that all schools “teach the same history,but some may forcus more on what they feel is important then depending on where you are from.” As a result of the response’s frequent errors in language and sentence structure, it isn’t at all clear whether this statement is intended as an observation of current practices or a recommendation that history curricula should be flexible enough to account for regional interests.

Though this response does contain frequent errors and lacks sentence variety, these flaws serve more to impede clarity than to interfere significantly with meaning. The essay is scored a 2 primarily because it is “seriously limited in addressing the specific task directions and in presenting or developing a position on the issue.”

**Essay Response – Score 1**

No i disagree with recommendation becaus it is not compulsary to student to study same national curriculum until they enter college.

Each and every student is own idea and family dream so,could not say like that student study the same nation curriculum until they enter college.we create a enviroment to all student are go and come in different country so we share over idea and comfortably leave with each other.

It is very necessary to colobrate with each other we develope owr nation and different technology. We take a example of “SUNITA VILLIUM” she is a American scientist work in “NASA” basically she is a INDIAN.But she complite study in USA.

So,it is not necessary to studay in own national Curriculum .but we devlope environment to student study with different country and devlope nation name and over parents name.

Also develope support position it is very advantageous for student.some time what happen student is intelligent but he/she not able to study well we develope some kind of facillity to student study well and he/she devlope over country.

To conclude “A nation should not require all of its student to study the same national curriculum until they entre college.”

**Reader Commentary for Essay Response – Score 1**

Although this essay is obviously attempting to respond to the prompt’s recommendation, its severe problems in language and sentence structure and its pervasive grammar, usage, and mechanics errors make it impossible to discern whether the writer understands the recommendation made in the prompt. In fact, the only clear phrases in the response are those that are borrowed from the prompt. These fundamental deficiencies in analytical writing warrant a score of 1.

**Sample Issue Essay 9**

52.  The best way to teach is to praise positive actions and ignore negative ones.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the recommendation and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, describe specific circumstances in which adopting the recommendation would or would not be advantageous and explain how these examples shape your position.

**Score 6 Response \***

The recommendation presents a view that I would agree is successful most of the time, but one that I cannot fully support due to the “all or nothing” impression it gives.

Certainly as an educator I agree fully that the best way to elicit positive response from students is to make use of students’ positive energy and then encourage actions that you would like to see repeated. It is human nature that we all want to be accepted and achieve on some level, and when people in authority provide feedback that we have done something well, the drive to repeat the action that was praised is bound to be particularly strong.

This blanket statement would obviously pay dividends in situations in which a teacher desires to have students repeat particular behaviors. For example, if an educator is attempting to teach students proper classroom etiquette, it would be appropriate to openly praise a student who raises his or her hand when wishing to speak or address the class. In such cases, the teacher may also help shape positive behaviors by ignoring a student who is trying to interject without approval from the teacher. In fact, the decision to ignore students who are exhibiting inappropriate behaviors of this type could work very well in this situation, as the stakes are not very high and the intended outcome can likely be achieved by such a method. However, it is important to note here that this tactic would only be effective in such a “low-stakes” situation, as when a student speaks without raising her hand first. As we will discuss below, ignoring a student who hits another student, or engages in more serious misbehaviors, would not be effective or prudent.

To expand on this point, it is important for teachers to be careful when working with the second half of this statement, only ignoring negative actions that are not serious. Take for instance a student who is misbehaving just by chatting with a fellow classmate. This student might not be presenting much of a problem and may be simply seeking attention. Ignoring the student might, in fact, be the best solution. Now assume the negative action is the improper administering of chemicals in a science experiment or the bullying of a fellow student. To ignore these negative actions would be absurd and negligent. Now you are allowing a problem to persist, one that could potentially lead to much bigger and more dangerous issues. In a more serious situation, addressing the negative actions quickly and properly could stop the problem it in its tracks. It is for reasons like this that I do not advocate the idea that a teacher can be successful by simply ignoring negative actions.

I do, however, greatly support the idea that the central focus of teaching should be to build on and encourage positive actions. However, the author’s all-encompasing statement leaves too many negative possibilities for the classroom. Perhaps a better way to phrase this statement would be to say, “The best way to teach is to praise positive actions and ignore negative ones that are not debilitating to class efficiency or the safety of any individual”.

Thus, in the original statement, there are indeed some good intentions, and there could be a lot of merit in adopting its basic principles. Data proves that positive support can substantially increase motivation and desire in students and contribute to positive achievements. In fact, most studies of teaching efficacy indicate that praising positive actions and ignoring negative ones can create a

more stable and efficient classroom.It needs to be stressed, however, that this tool is only effective at certain levels of misbehavior. As mentioned above, when the behavior is precipitated by feelings of revenge, power or total self-worthlessness, this methodology will likely not work. It is likely to be very successful, however, when the drive behind the misbehavior is simple attention seeking. In many of these instances, if the teacher demonstrates clearly that inappropriate behavior does not result in the gaining of attention, students are more likely to seek attention by behaving properly. Should the student choose this path, then the ignoring has worked and when the positive behavior is exhibited, then the teacher can utilize the first part of the theory and support or praise this behavior.Now it is much more likely to be repeated. If the student does not choose this path and instead elects to raise the actions to a higher level that presents a more serious issue, then ignorance alone cannot work and other methods must be employed.

In conclusion, one can appreciate the credo expressed in this instance, but surely we all can see the potential error of following it through to the extreme.

**Reader Commentary**

This response receives a 6 for its well-articulated, insightful analysis of the issue. Rather than simply rejecting or accepting the prompt, the writer argues that the recommendation made by the prompt can often be true but is too “all or nothing“ to be endorsed without qualification. The writer turns this idea into an insightful position by providing examples and evidence to fully and persuasively support its nuanced argument. The response offers nicely detailed situations that provide compelling support for a claim that the recommendation can, in fact, work. At the same time, it also highlights the recommendation’s limits using additional specific, detailed examples. Particularly persuasive is the fourth paragraph, in which the writer compares the impact of ignoring minor behavioral problems like talking in class to the potential costs of ignoring more serious issues like bullying. Thus, the writer recognizes that the prompt’s claim, as well as his/her own, is inevitably dependent on the specific context for its success or failure. Throughout the response, the writer demonstrates the ability to convey ideas fluently and precisely, using effective vocabulary and sentence variety. This sentence demonstrates the level of language facility seen throughout the response: ”It is human nature that we all want to be accepted and achieve on some level, and when people in authority provide feedback that we have done something well, the drive to repeat the action that was praised is bound to be particularly strong.”

**Score 5 Response**

I partially agree with the statement “The best way to teach is to praise positive actions and ignore negative ones”. Children should be rewarded when they perform well; however, they should not be ignored for performing sub-optimally. For purposes of this essay, the term “actions” is defined as behaviors within the classroom.

Utilizing positive reinforcements, such as tangible rewards, can be a good method to teach children. If the teacher praises children for actions that are desirable, then the children are more likely to repeat those actions. For example, a student who completes an assignment on time and does a good job is likely to want to do a good job on the next assignment if he gets positive feedback. Likewise, the children who are not currently engaging in the desirable actions may be more inclined to do so in order to recieve the positive reinforcement.

Conversely, children should not be ignored for negative actions. If a child is not exhibiting appropriate behavior in the classroom, then it is the teacher’s responsibility to encourage the child to perform optimally. Ignoring something doesn’t make it go away, actions and consequences do. A student who is being disruptive in class will continue to be disruptive unless the teacher does something about it. However, the teacher’s actions need be appropriate.

Before the teacher attempts to modify a child’s behavior, the teacher needs to try and identify the reason behind the behavior. For instance, children who leave their seat often, stare in to space, or call out of turn may be initially viewed as having poor behavior. However, the teacher may suspect that the child has an attentional problem, and request that the child be tested. If the child does have  an attentional problem, then the teacher can work with a related service, such as occupational therapy, to alter the classroom environment in order to cater to the needs of the child. For instance, the teacher could remove some of the stimulating bulliten board displays to make the room more calming to the child. If the child becomes more attentive in class then the teacher was able to assist the child without scorning them or ignoring them. The teacher met the needs of the child and created an enviornment to enable the child to optimally perform in the educational setting.

On the other hand, if the child is tested, and does not have any areas of concern that may be impacting the educational performance in the classroom, then the negative behavior may strictly be due to defiance. In such a case, the teacher still should not ignore the child, because the negative actions may hinder the learning opportunity for the remaining children in the class. As a result, a child who is being disruptive to the learning process of the class should be set apart from the class so that they do not receive the positive reinforcement of peer attention.

The teacher should not ignore the student who is misbehaving, but that does not mean that the teacher just needs to punish. It is better to address the child privately and make sure the child is  aware of the negative actions. Once the child is aware, then the teacher should once again try to determine the reason why the child is behaving in a negative manner. Perhaps the child’s parents are in the middle of a divorce and the child is outwardly expressing his frustration in the classroom. Or the academic content of the class may not be challenging enough for the child and so he is misbehaving out of boredom. Whatever the reason behind the behavior, the key factor is that the teacher works with the child to try and identify it. Simply punnishing or ignoring the child would not solve the problem, whereas working to create a plan for success in the classroom would. Likewise, rather than punnishing and defeating the child, the teacher is working with and empowering the child; a much more positive outcome to the situation.

**Reader Commentary**

This strong response presents a thoughtful and well-developed analysis of the issue. In this case the writer argues that teachers need to modify their approach based on context and observation, meaning that a blanket approach cannot be successful. The writer supports this position with relevant reasons and examples that present logically sound support. Note that the task instructions ask writers to discuss situations in which the statement might or might not hold true, and this response does that quite clearly. In the second paragraph, the writer gives an example of a student who completes an assignment on time and receives positive feedback, showing how the recommendation could hold true. Other examples show situations in which it might not hold true, and these various points are brought together to support the writer’s position that teachers have to look at the context of the situation and cannot rely on simply ignoring negative actions. This response also demonstrates facility with language, using appropriate vocabulary and sentence variety. Sentences like this one demonstrate the writer’s command of the conventions of standard written English: “If the child does have an attentional problem, then the teacher can work with a related service, such as occupational therapy, to alter the classroom environment in order to cater to the needs of the child.” There are some minor errors, but overall the response demonstrates strong control of language. Although the response is clearly stronger than a 4, which would simply present a clear position on the issue according to the task instructions, it does not reach the level of a 6 because it does not develop its points in a way that creates a cogent and insightful position. It does, however, present a generally thoughtful and well-developed analysis of the issue, leading to a score of 5.

**Score 4 Response**

I absolutely agree with the first section of the statement above, but find fault with the latter half.

There is no doubt that praising positive actions is an excellent way to teach, and this method is most clearly exemplified when dealing with much younger children. When a young child is learning basic social behavior, it is imperative that he is encouraged to repeat positive actions. For example, when a child voluntarily shares his toys with another, if a teacher rewards that behavior, the child will understand that this is a good practice, and likely share again in the future.

In contrast, if a child displays negative behavior by stealing a toy away from his playmate, it would be very dangerous for the teacher to ignore this action, for then the child may never recognize that this is unacceptable. In this instance, the child has not learned from the situation at all. So what should a teacher do when faced with such a situation? Punishment is not necessarily the optimal choice, either. Rather than scolding a child for mistreating his playmates and sending him off to a corner, a teacher would be wise to demonstrate the positive alternative: to share his toys instead. In this case, rather than ignoring or punishing negative actions, the teacher could seize the opportunity to reinforce positive behavior, and further extend the child’s learning experience.

In summary, positive reinforcement is certainly an excellent method for teaching new methods or behaviors, and encouraging a student to learn more. However to ignore, rather than recognize and correct negative actions, would be a disservice to the student, for he would not know what conclusion to draw from his action.

**Reader Commentary**

This adequate response follows the task directions and presents a clear position on the issue, supporting its main points with examples that are relevant, if only adequately developed. For instance, the discussion in the second paragraph of a teacher who reinforces the positive behavior of sharing a toy is certainly relevant and on-task (i.e., it describes a situation in which adopting the recommendation would be advantageous). However, the development of this idea does not lead to generally thoughtful or insightful analysis. Instead, it is simply presented as an example. In addition to its adequate development, this response also demonstrates sufficient control of the conventions of standard written English, and its main points are made with reasonable clarity. Some of the sentences demonstrate the syntactical variety normally seen in responses that receive higher scores (e.g., “Rather than scolding a child for mistreating his playmates and sending him off to a corner, a teacher would be wise to demonstrate the positive alternative: to share his toys instead”). However, the overall use of language in this response is merely adequate.

**Score 3 Response**

Praising postive actions and ignoring negative ones may be a good way to teach but not the best way. Ignoring negative actions could negate all the postive praises given to an individual, having negative actions go unchecked will lead to habits formed that would overwhelm any positive actions that are complementary to an individuals learning process.

For instance, in a classroom full of eight-year old kids; if during a lesson they are making alot of noise, having this ignored would tell the kids that it is okay to be disruptive in class. The individuals in that class would develop the habit of being distruptive hence hindering their learning process. However if the eight-year old kids were immediately told to stop the distruption then it will never become a habit.

Every action needs to have a related consequence follow in a learning environment. In the early years of education, the way they are taught becomes a lifelong habit which is hard to change in later years. If negative actions are not assigned a related consequences then teaching becomes ineffective because the students negative actions soon diminish the ability to do well in school. The way postive actions are dealt with should also be done with negative actions rather than being ignored which in turn enhance the learning environment.

**Reader Commentary**

Although this response has minor errors in its use of language, it receives a 3 primarily for insufficient overall clarity and for the limited development of its claims. The writer does make an attempt to follow the specific task instructions, and the response has a clear position on the issue, arguing that it is not acceptable practice to ignore negative behaviors. However, the development provided in support of that position is limited. The example of “eight-year old kids” making noise during class can be seen as a situation in which following the recommendation is not advantageous. Instead of developing that point in a logically persuasive way, however, the writer proceeds to make an unsupported assertion about the consequences of following the recommendation (“The individuals in that class would develop the habit of being distruptive hence hindering their learning process”). Another issue that keeps this response at the 3 level is a lack of clarity, particularly in the final paragraph. The final sentence demonstrates this problem with clarity: “The way postive actions are dealt with should also be done with negative actions rather than being ignored which in turn enhance the learning environment.” Problems with the structure of this sentence make it difficult to determine the writer’s intended meaning.

**Score 2 Response**

I don’t agree with this afirmation, because I think is very important to praise positive actions but also is important to sign the negative ones, in some situations acording to the students level, grade, etc., could be better to put more emphasis in the positive things and if not ignore all the negative ones, do not give so much importance to them, this is particulary important in the lowest levels of education.

But in another situations you must sign the negative things, trying to avoid that the students can repeat them in the future, because I think you can also learn from the negative situations.

For this reason I believe that is important to praise positive actions but is also important no to ignore the negative ones, because in a given situation the student can have troubles recongnising what is right and what is wrong. And finally as a conclusion I think that the best way to teach is combination of praise positive things but also to sign the negative ones.

**Reader Commentary**

This response clearly fits several characteristics of a 2, as defined by the scoring guide. It is seriously limited in its development, organization, and focus. The response repeats itself rather than developing any of its statements, pointing to an inability to organize a response capable of supporting any specific claims with relevant reasons or examples. Additionally, serious language control problems frequently interfere with meaning. Thus, even though the writer does seem to be making an attempt to respond to the specific task instructions, the response merits a score of 2.

**Score 1 Response**

Write a response in which you disuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the recommendation and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting

position, describe specific circumstances in which adopting the recommendation would or would not be advantageous and explain how these examples shape your position.

Author says that The best way to teach is to praise positive actions and ignore negative ones. I agree to this recommendation. Explaining, I strongly believe that the best way to teach is not to praise positive action and ignore negative ones but is makeing everyone to be a good ones. Specific crimstances lead me which adopting the recommendation as the following:

First, we will lost the good children who have negative maner if we ignore them. Children are future, not all. Praise in negative should not be, teaching to children to best way. I strongly believe adopting this recommeindation would be not advantages.second, negative ones in today may be a great people in the future. Not only ones behave do worse they are teenage. Teenage in today is not easy for all! Negative ones can not better, if only prainse positive actions, ignore negativeone. Negative ones may not positive be having, but if we praise them only, they not think they should be positive person later. conclusion, specific circumstances are which adopting the recommendation would not be advantage, I am not agree to the the recommendation. Ignore negative manor when they will not be positive behavrio in futre. But they can, if do not ignore them. we should not ignor negative person but should make them think that they can be a good man future like positive person.

**Reader Commentary**

This response has severe and pervasive problems in language and sentence structure that, as stated in the scoring guide, consistently interfere with meaning and result in incoherence. The response begins by repeating the prompt, but then the severe problems with language control and organization undermine any evidence of the ability to understand the prompt or to present and develop a clear position. For example, it is not clear what the writer means by the claim that the best way to teach is “makeing everyone to be a good ones.” Severe problems with language control in that sentence and throughout the response prevent it from developing a coherent position on the issue or responding to the specific task instructions. Although the writer makes an attempt at organization, with points marked as first, second, and conclusion, the response actually exhibits little or no evidence of the ability to develop any potential understanding of the prompt into a logical position on the issue.

**Sample Issue Essay 10**

130. Some people believe that corporations have a responsibility to promote the well-being of the societies and environments in which they operate. Others believe that the only responsibility of corporations, provided they operate within the law, is to make as much money as possible.

Write a response in which you discuss which view more closely aligns with your own position and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should address both of the views presented.

**Score 6 Response\***

It is not uncommon for some to argue that, in the world in which we live, corporations have a responsibility to society and to the environment in which they operate. Proponents of this view would argue that major environmental catastrophes (e.g.,  the oil spill in the Gulf) are key examples of the damage that can be wrought when corporations are allowed to operate unchecked. Yet within that very statement lies a contradiction that undermines this kind of thinking — it is necessary for outside forces to check the behavior of corporations, because we do not expect corporations to behave in such a manner. In fact, the expectation is simply that corporations will follow the law, and in the course of doing so, engage in every possible tactic to their advantage in the pursuit of more and greater profit. To expect otherwise from corporations is to fail to understand their puropose and their very structure.

The corporation arose as a model of business in which capital could be raised through the contributions of stockholders; investors purchases shares in a company, and their money is then used as the operating capital for the company. Shareholders buy stock not because they are hoping to better make the world a better place or because they have a desire to improve the quality of life but because they expect to see a return in their investment in this company. The company may itself have generally altruistic goals (perhaps it is a think tank that advises the government on how to improve relations with the Middle East, or perhaps it is a company built around finding alternative forms of energy), but the immediate expectation of the investor is that he himself will see dividends, or profits, from the investment he has made. This is even more true in the case of companies that are purely profit driven and which do not have goals that are particularly directed toward social improvement—a description that applies to the vast majority of corporations.

Is it a bad thing to have a corporation negatively affect the environment (and by extentsion, its inhabitants)? To pump noxious fumes into the atmosphere as a by-product of its manufacturing processes? Of course, and this is why agencies such as the EPA were established and why governments—federal, state, and local—are expected to monitor such companies to ensure that such practices fall within the boundaries of legal expectations. Any and all corporations should be expected to temper their pursuit of profit with the necessity of following those safeguards that have been legislated as protections. But the assumption that corporations have an inherent obligation or responsibility to go above and beyond that to actively PROMOTE the environment and the well- being of society is absurd.

Engaging in practices to adhere to legal expectations to protect society and the environment is costly to corporations. If the very purpose of a corporation is to generate profits, and the obligation to adhere to safety expectations established by law cuts into those profits, then to expect corporations to embrace such practices beyond what is required is to presume that they willingly engage in an inherently self- destructive process: the unnecessary lowering of profits. This is antithetical to the very concept of the corporation. Treehuggers everywhere should be pleased that environmental protections exist, but to expect corporations to “make the world a better place” is to embrace altruism to the point that it becomes delusion.

This is not to say that we should reject efforts to hold corporations accountable. In fact, the opposite is true — we should be vigilant with the business world and maintain our expectations that corporations do not make their profits at the EXPENSE of the well-being of society. But that role must be fulfilled by a watchdog, not the corporation itself, and those expectations must be imposed UPON the corporations, not expected FROM them.

**Reader Commentary**

This response receives a 6 for developing an insightful position on the issue in accordance with the assigned task, skillfully weaving a position that takes into consideration both of the statements in the prompt. Beginning in the first paragraph, the writer rejects the idea that corporations themselves “have a responsibility to promote the well- being of the societies and environments in which they operate.” In the second para- graph, the writer offers compelling reasons for this rejection by discussing the purpose and structure of corporations. The writer then considers the role of government in promoting corporations’ social and environmental responsibility, developing the position fully. A cogent statement of the writer’s position appears at the conclusion of the response: “we should be vigilant with the business world and maintain our expectations that corporations do not make their profits at the EXPENSE of the well-being of society. But that role must be fulfilled by a watchdog, not the corporation itself.” The response as a whole is logically organized, with each paragraph serving as a stepping stone in the development of the writer’s position. It also demonstrates the writer’s ability to convey ideas fluently and precisely, using effective vocabulary and sentence variety. This sentence demonstrates the level of language facility seen throughout the response: “If the very purpose of a corporation is to generate profits, and the obligation to adhere to safety expectations established by law cuts into those profits, then to expect corporations to embrace such practices beyond what is required is to presume that they willingly engage in an inherently self-destructive process: the unnecessary lowering of profits.” Here the writer has skillfully maintained control of complex syntax and diction while making a logically compelling point. The sentence demonstrates the outstanding nature of this response.

**Score 5 Response**

In order to survive, corporations must make money. Successful corporations try and make as much money as possible. Yet this incentive to make money does not mean that a corporation can be a detriment to the society in which it operates. Corporations have a duty and a responsability to ensure the well being of the society in which they are a part.

Contributing to the well being of a society is actually benefical to a corporation in many cases. One of these is making sure that workers are well taken care of. Absenteeism and neglect while on duty are a big problem for corporations, as is attracting the best workers, who hopefully will lower the risks caused by absenteeism and neglect. One way that corporations can attract these workers is by offering them generous benefits. If, for example, an employer includes with employment a good health care plan, they will be able to attract better workers than one that does not, and that will aid the corporation greatly. Health care plans provided by employers mean that these people have at their disposal health coverage, which means that they have the care they need if they get sick. This also might encourage preventive care, something that has been shown to reduce the cost and risk of developing other major ailments.

Another area where corporations providing support for themselves and society is in the creation of human capital. Globalization and increased education means that employers need a better educated workforce more than ever. One way that employers can contribute to this is by sponsoring worker training programs, or paying for their employees to return to school. This creates a more educated workforce for employers, as well as may increase the loyalty of employees to an employer. An

employee who received an education sponsored by an employer may be thankful for receiving that education, and may work harder for that employer. This creates a benefit for employers and employees.

The main reason that corporations have a duty to contribute to the well being of society is that they are a part of the society. Even though they have an economic desire to make a profit, corporations also should think long term about actions they take which could hurt their company. A good example of this is BP, after the recent oil spill in the gulf. Their desire to make a profit meant that they did not keep up on all of their safety regulations and standards, and the result of the then faulty equipment caused a massive spill. This cost them huge amounts of money to clean up, as well as the fines they had to pay for causing this. The biggest loss for BP however is that there brand name will be associated in the US and abroad as the company that caused this giant oil spill. As the spill was happening, many people boycotted the company, resulting in lost potential revenue. They may realize that as they lose business to people upset by the spill, that making sure a spill didn’t happen in the first place was cheaper.

Another reason corporations have to ensure the well-being of a society is that by makign a society better off, a company may have more consumers. This is especially true for corporations that sell goods for middle and upper class consumers. If a corporation tries to bring people up and increase the overall economic well being of society, they may find that more and more people have to ability to afford their goods.

This could generate huge new profits for this corporation, since their pool of potential consumers has gone up considerably. Concentrating on the long term here means that corporations can increase their pool of potential consumers.

By denying responsabilty to a society, a corporation is only looking at the possible short term profits, not the potential long term ones. While in the short term it may work for a corporation to ignore their societal responsability, it is advantageous in the long term for the entire corporation to make sure society is getting better. The potential for new markets, products, production processes and other beneficial factors that come from promoting well being is quite large. This is something that corportions should be ready and willing to take advantage of, and something that society should hold them accountable for.

**Reader Commentary**

This strong response receives a 5 for its thoughtful, well-developed analysis of the issue. In this case, the writer argues that corporations do indeed have a responsibility to promote the well-being of the societies and environments in which they operate, offering several reasons and well-chosen examples to explain why it is in the interests of corporations to fulfill these responsibilities. The writer clearly follows the task directions by addressing the two views provided by the prompt, both explicitly in the open- ing paragraph and more subtly throughout the response. While the writer clearly signals at the beginning his or her alignment with the first position (“Corporations have a duty and a responsability to ensure the well being of the society of which they are a part”), the paragraphs that follow in fact acknowledge the writer’s opening statement (“In order to survive, corporations must make money”). In areas such as employee health care and education, as well as in relation to broader issues such as the environment and the general level of prosperity in society, the writer argues that corporations should strive to meet their social obligations because in the long term, it is economically advantageous to do so. The various reasons and examples offered are brought together to support a thoughtful position that implicitly suggests that the two views are not as mutually exclusive as they might first appear. The response also demonstrates considerable facility with language. There are some minor errors, but overall the writer’s control of language is

strong, demonstrating sentence variety and appropriate use of vocabulary. The response lacks the superior fluency and precision of a 6 but nevertheless conveys meaning clearly and well. Discernibly stronger than the adequate level of analysis in a 4, the response has thoughtful, nuanced analysis of the issue that earns it a score of 5.

**Score 4 Response**

While some people may believe that corporations have a responsibility to protect society, others believe that the only purpose of a corporation is to make money. I agree that making profits is important. In the grand scheme of things, though, all companies have a responsibility to watch out for their customers. Their customers are how they make their money. If they’re not watching out for their customers, they obviously will see a drop in their profits.

Consider light bulbs. This is an invention that has all kinds of potential for serious accidents. It is basically just a glass globe with electricity running through it! If a bulb gets too hot, it could potentially start a fire. Similarly, if someone removed the glass from around the tungsten wire, you’d basically have an exposed electrical wire that could hurt anyone who touched it. Makers of light bulbs know and understand all these dangers. They want consumers to purchase their products, so the first and smartest way to make that happen is to ensure that the products are safe and thus more attractive to the customer base. If everyone who used light bulbs was afraid of getting zapped profits would obviously go down and light bulbs would not be a very profitable enterprise.

This same thinking applies to all major products. The automobile is one of the most dangerous tools man uses. Tens of thousands of automobile drivers die every year in accidents. Insuring that the vehicles contain designs and parts that promote customer safety is a main focus of car manufacturers. Certain parts of of cars were built with promoting driver’s well-being in mind. For instance, air bags, anti-lock braking systems, online crash reporting. These features are considered standard now, and they were all developed to increase the safety of consumers. These features were not cheap to develop, but car manufacturers improved their profits anyway because they developed products with public safety in mind, which is what customers expect. If this symbiosis relationship wasn’t true, then we would still have cars without airbags or even seatbelts. Worrying about the safety and actually improving it for customers is not just a basic responsibility of corporations, but it drives their profits, too.

In conclusion, its pretty clear that a corporation’s desire to make more profits is in line with a corporation’s responsibility to consumers. Increasing the focus on consumers, worrying about taking care of them and the environment, can only lead to bigger profits and success for corporations in the long run.

**Reader Commentary**

This adequate response follows the task directions and presents a clear position on the issue. It supports and develops its position competently, using relevant examples. In accordance with the assigned task, the response addresses both of the competing positions. Specifically, its position and the examples it develops argue that businesses can care about both profits and ethical responsibility through the ways they develop products. The development of examples and ideas, while adequate, is not as thoughtful or compelling as would be needed to earn higher scores. For instance, both of the examples the response uses are about product safety; the discussion of automobile design does not advance the position much more than the prior discussion of lightbulb production. Language control in the response is also competent. It demonstrates sufficient control of the conventions of standard written English, and its main points are made with acceptable clarity. The response features a few grammatical and mechanical errors (e.g., “Certain parts of of cars...” and “symbiosis relationship”) and some awk- ward sentences. However, for the 4 range, GRE raters allow for minor

errors in responses like this one that holistically demonstrate sufficient clarity and control. Over- all, then, this response demonstrates adequate development and control of language, making the score of 4 appropriate.

**Score 3 Response**

Corporations can be viewed as both beneficial and bad. This statement addresses both views that many people have about corporations. Views come from personal experiences and is the reason why some people like corporations and why some people do not.

Half of this argument deals with people that like the idea of corporations. Some people believe that corporations help stmiulate societies and promote the well being of society. These people are ones that have never encountered a corupt corporation. Just like in any other aspects of life, people can get images of something as being good if they only brush the outside. It isn’t until they are being faced with a problem within a particular corporation where they either work for them or have just dealt with them. Also, people that are benefited from corporations are obviously going to like the idea of an corporation.

The other side of this argument is that many people believe corporations are just money hungry. This can be seen in many corporations throughout America. Many small business owners will side with this argument. The problem lies that this is corporate America and the little businesses are being taking over by larger corporations. As Mark Twain once said, “The vast amount of money is only in a couple of hands”. This statement still lies true today. In addition, corporations are large and with that being said they lead to more lines of coruption. In small buisnesses, the owners can oversee their store entirely. Can these corporation owners really oversee every- thing that is going on? Ask any employee at a corporate office if they believe their workplace is being ran how they think the corporation would want it. One is likely to find the answer that it is not.

Just like any other issue there are two sides to the story. The problem with this issue is that most will agree that corporations are only there to make money. They don’t care about the people that are helping them make money. They only care at the end of the day how much money they made.

**Reader Commentary**

This response receives a score of 3 primarily because it is limited in focus. Rather than addressing the conflicting views of corporate responsibility given in the prompt, the response instead incorrectly casts the two positions as “people that like the idea of corporations” and people who “believe corporations are just money hungry.” The writer proceeds to develop an explanation of these two positions, citing the various qualities that lead each group of people to their beliefs, but the response concludes by declaring that “there are two sides to the story” without adopting any position of its own. This highlights another limitation of the response, the fact that it does not completely address the specific task directions. Although the response does discuss the two opposing positions, it never discusses which view more closely aligns with the writer’s own. The response does contain adequate organization, and the writing demonstrates a sufficient control of language. Sentences such as “Just like in any other aspects of life, people can get images of something as being good if they only brush the outside” are typical of the writing in this response and, despite the presence of some errors, demonstrate a sufficient control of the conventions of standard written English. However, even though the response demonstrates some qualities of a 4, its problems with focus and its failure to develop a clear position on the issue in accordance with the assigned task mean that it merits a score of 3.

**Score 2 Response**

I think corporations have a responsibility to not only follow the law but also work with the societies and enviroments they are in. Our societies and environments in this age are affected by corporations’ operations. An example of this is BP’s accident in the Gulf of Mexico — they might have been following the law and regulations, but once an accident happens, our societies and environments are affected. Many fishermen and businesses around the area have been affected by the accident. Now BP faces so many liabilities and needs to pay money. As a result, they are loosing more than they made in the past.

It is also important that corporations makes as much as money possible. If they do well, there might be more employment opportunities for people and more taxes for the city, states and federal which help our country’s economy better.

However, there are always choices that corporations can take and they can make money by promoting the well-being of the societies and environments. It might cost them more but it will also help to save thier expenses.

**Reader Commentary**

This seriously flawed response attempts to address the task directions by considering both of the views presented in the prompt. The first paragraph seems to embrace the first view given in the prompt when it asserts that “corporations have a responsibility to...work with the societies and environments they are in.” The writer uses the example of the BP oil spill in the Gulf of Mexico to demonstrate that “our societies and environments in this age are affected by corporations’ operations,” but, apart from restating these same claims, the paragraph provides no real support for this position. Instead, the writer moves on to a discussion of the financial implications of the oil spill for BP. The second paragraph then makes an abrupt transition to a discussion of the prompt’s second view and again seems to embrace this position when it claims that “it is also important that corporations makes as much as money possible.” This position is supported with a single relevant but undeveloped reason. Although the writer attempts to reconcile the two positions in the last paragraph by arguing that “there are always choices that corporations can take and they can make money by promoting the well- being of the societies and environments,” the response provides no support for this position beyond its unsupported and contradictory claim that “it might cost them more but it will also help to save their expenses.” Overall, then, this response provides few examples in support of its claims. The response’s poor focus and its very limited sup- port, then, warrant a score of 2.

**Score 1 Response**

It is certainly true that some people believe that corporations have a responsibility to promote the well being of societies and environments. On the other hand, some other people argue that the only responsibility of corporations, provided they operate within the law, is to make as much money as possible. It is easy to see why it would be difficult for some people to decide between these two positions.

The responsibility of all citizens of a society, including corporate citizens, is ultimately to further the well being of the society as a whole. It takes little more than examining the recent United States financial crisis to see the ill effects suffered by society at large when corporations focus on maximizing profits.

**Reader Commentary**

This response earns a score of 1 because it provides little evidence of the ability to develop an organized response. The first paragraph begins with a nearly word-for-word restatement of the prompt, which increases the length of the response but does not demonstrate the ability to develop a position on the issue in relation to the specific task instructions. The final sentence in the first paragraph is analytically empty in that it could be applied to any prompt that asks writers to discuss two competing positions. The writer does nothing to relate that sentence to this specific prompt. The second paragraph, then, is all that the writer has provided in terms of original analysis of the issue. Although it does demonstrate understanding of the issue, it fits the “extremely brief” description from the scoring guide description of a 1. Because of the extreme brevity of its analysis, then, this response merits a score of 1.

附录：新GRE所有写作题库

**Argument部分**

1、Woven baskets characterized by a particular distinctive pattern have previously been found only in the immediate vicinity of the prehistoric village of Palea and therefore were believed to have been made only by the Palean people. Recently, however, archaeologists discovered such a "Palean" basket in Lithos, an ancient village across the Brim River from Palea. The Brim River is very deep and broad, and so the ancient Paleans could have crossed it only by boat, and no Palean boats have been found. Thus it follows that the so-called Palean baskets were not uniquely Palean.

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

2、The following appeared as part of a letter to the editor of a scientific journal.

"A recent study of eighteen rhesus monkeys provides clues as to the effects of birth order on an individual's levels of stimulation. The study showed that in stimulating situations (such as an encounter with an unfamiliar monkey), firstborn infant monkeys produce up to twice as much of the hormone cortisol, which primes the body for increased activity levels, as do their younger siblings. Firstborn humans also produce relatively high levels of cortisol in stimulating situations (such as the return of a parent after an absence). The study also found that during pregnancy, first-time mother monkeys had higher levels of cortisol than did those who had had several offspring."

Write a response in which you discuss one or more alternative explanations that could rival the proposed explanation and explain how your explanation(s) can plausibly account for the facts presented in the argument.

3、The following appeared as a letter to the editor from a Central Plaza store owner.

"Over the past two years, the number of shoppers in Central Plaza has been steadily decreasing while the popularity of skateboarding has increased dramatically. Many Central Plaza store owners believe that the decrease in their business is due to the number of skateboard users in the plaza. There has also been a dramatic increase in the amount of litter and vandalism throughout the plaza. Thus, we recommend that the city prohibit skateboarding in Central Plaza. If skateboarding is prohibited here, we predict that business in Central Plaza will return to its previously high levels."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation is likely to have the predicted result. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

4、The following appeared in a letter from a homeowner to a friend.

"Of the two leading real estate firms in our town—Adams Realty and Fitch Realty—Adams Realty is clearly superior. Adams has 40 real estate agents; in contrast, Fitch has 25, many of whom work only part-time. Moreover, Adams' revenue last year was twice as high as that of Fitch and included home sales that averaged $168,000, compared to Fitch's $144,000. Homes listed with Adams sell faster as well: ten years ago I listed my home with Fitch, and it took more than four months to sell; last year, when I sold another home, I listed it with Adams, and it took only one month. Thus, if you want to sell your home quickly and at a good price, you should use Adams Realty."

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

5、The following appeared in a letter to the editor of the *Balmer Island Gazette*.

"On Balmer Island, where mopeds serve as a popular form of transportation, the population increases to 100,000 during the summer months. To reduce the number of accidents involving mopeds and pedestrians, the town council of Balmer Island should limit the number of mopeds rented by the island's moped rental companies from 50 per day to 25 per day during the summer season. By limiting the number of rentals, the town council will attain the 50 percent annual reduction in moped accidents that was achieved last year on the neighboring island of Seaville, when Seaville's town council enforced similar limits on moped rentals."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation is likely to have the predicted result. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

6、Arctic deer live on islands in Canada's arctic regions. They search for food by moving over ice from island to island during the course of the year. Their habitat is limited to areas warm enough to sustain the plants on which they feed and cold enough, at least some of the year, for the ice to cover the sea separating the islands, allowing the deer to travel over it. Unfortunately, according to reports from local hunters, the deer populations are declining. Since these reports coincide with recent global warming trends that have caused the sea ice to melt, we can conclude that the purported decline in deer populations is the result of the deer's being unable to follow their age-old migration patterns across the frozen sea.

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

7、The following is a recommendation from the Board of Directors of Monarch Books.

"We recommend that Monarch Books open a café in its store. Monarch, having been in business at the same location for more than twenty years, has a large customer base because it is known for its wide selection of books on all subjects. Clearly, opening the café would attract more customers. Space could be made for the café by discontinuing the children's book section, which will probably become less popular given that the most recent national census indicated a significant decline in the percentage of the population under age ten. Opening a café will allow Monarch to attract more customers and better compete with Regal Books, which recently opened its own café."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation is likely to have the predicted result. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

8、The following appeared in a memo from the director of student housing at Buckingham College.

"To serve the housing needs of our students, Buckingham College should build a number of new dormitories. Buckingham's enrollment is growing and, based on current trends, will double over the next 50 years, thus making existing dormitory space inadequate. Moreover, the average rent for an apartment in our town has risen in recent years. Consequently, students will find it increasingly difficult to afford off-campus housing. Finally, attractive new dormitories would make prospective students more likely to enroll at Buckingham."

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

9、Nature's Way, a chain of stores selling health food and other health-related products, is opening its next franchise in the town of Plainsville. The store should prove to be very successful: Nature's Way franchises tend to be most profitable in areas where residents lead healthy lives, and clearly Plainsville is such an area. Plainsville merchants report that sales of running shoes and exercise clothing are at all-time highs. The local health club has more members than ever, and the weight training and aerobics classes are always full. Finally, Plainsville's schoolchildren represent a new generation of potential customers: these schoolchildren are required to participate in a fitness-for-life program, which emphasizes the benefits of regular exercise at an early age.

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

10、Twenty years ago, Dr. Field, a noted anthropologist, visited the island of Tertia. Using an observation-centered approach to studying Tertian culture, he concluded from his observations that children in Tertia were reared by an entire village rather than by their own biological parents. Recently another anthropologist, Dr. Karp, visited the group of islands that includes Tertia and used the interview-centered method to study child-rearing practices. In the interviews that Dr. Karp conducted with children living in this group of islands, the children spent much more time talking about their biological parents than about other adults in the village. Dr. Karp decided that Dr. Field's conclusion about Tertian village culture must be invalid. Some anthropologists recommend that to obtain accurate information on Tertian child-rearing practices, future research on the subject should be conducted via the interview-centered method.

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

11、The council of Maple County, concerned about the county's becoming overdeveloped, is debating a proposed measure that would prevent the development of existing farmland in the county. But the council is also concerned that such a restriction, by limiting the supply of new housing, could lead to significant increases in the price of housing in the county. Proponents of the measure note that Chestnut County established a similar measure ten years ago, and its housing prices have increased only modestly since. However, opponents of the measure note that Pine County adopted restrictions on the development of new residential housing fifteen years ago, and its housing prices have since more than doubled. The council currently predicts that the proposed measure, if passed, will result in a significant increase in housing prices in Maple County.

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the prediction and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the prediction.

12、Fifteen years ago, Omega University implemented a new procedure that encouraged students to evaluate the teaching effectiveness of all their professors. Since that time, Omega professors have begun to assign higher grades in their classes, and overall student grade averages at Omega have risen by 30 percent. Potential employers, looking at this dramatic rise in grades, believe that grades at Omega are inflated and do not accurately reflect student achievement; as a result, Omega graduates have not been as successful at getting jobs as have graduates from nearby Alpha University. To enable its graduates to secure better jobs, Omega University should terminate student evaluation of professors.

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

13、In an attempt to improve highway safety, Prunty County last year lowered its speed limit from 55 to 45 miles per hour on all county highways. But this effort has failed: the number of accidents has not decreased, and, based on reports by the highway patrol, many drivers are exceeding the speed limit. Prunty County should instead undertake the same kind of road improvement project that Butler County completed five years ago: increasing lane widths, resurfacing rough highways, and improving visibility at dangerous intersections. Today, major Butler County roads still have a 55 mph speed limit, yet there were 25 percent fewer reported accidents in Butler County this past year than there were five years ago.

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

14、The following appeared as part of an article in a business magazine.

"A recent study rating 300 male and female Mentian advertising executives according to the average number of hours they sleep per night showed an association between the amount of sleep the executives need and the success of their firms. Of the advertising firms studied, those whose executives reported needing no more than 6 hours of sleep per night had higher profit margins and faster growth. These results suggest that if a business wants to prosper, it should hire only people who need less than 6 hours of sleep per night."

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

15、The following memorandum is from the business manager of Happy Pancake House restaurants.

"Recently, butter has been replaced by margarine in Happy Pancake House restaurants throughout the southwestern United States. This change, however, has had little impact on our customers. In fact, only about 2 percent of customers have complained, indicating that an average of 98 people out of 100 are happy with the change. Furthermore, many servers have reported that a number of customers who ask for butter do not complain when they are given margarine instead. Clearly, either these customers do not distinguish butter from margarine or they use the term 'butter' to refer to either butter or margarine."

Write a response in which you discuss one or more alternative explanations that could rival the proposed explanation and explain how your explanation(s) can plausibly account for the facts presented in the argument.

16、In surveys Mason City residents rank water sports (swimming, boating, and fishing) among their favorite recreational activities. The Mason River flowing through the city is rarely used for these pursuits, however, and the city park department devotes little of its budget to maintaining riverside recreational facilities. For years there have been complaints from residents about the quality of the river's water and the river's smell. In response, the state has recently announced plans to clean up Mason River. Use of the river for water sports is, therefore, sure to increase. The city government should for that reason devote more money in this year's budget to riverside recreational facilities.

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

17、The following appeared in a memorandum from the manager of WWAC radio station.

"To reverse a decline in listener numbers, our owners have decided that WWAC must change from its current rock-music format. The decline has occurred despite population growth in our listening area, but that growth has resulted mainly from people moving here after their retirement. We must make listeners of these new residents. We could switch to a music format tailored to their tastes, but a continuing decline in local sales of recorded music suggests limited interest in music. Instead we should change to a news and talk format, a form of radio that is increasingly popular in our area."

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

18、The following is a memorandum from the business manager of a television station.

"Over the past year, our late-night news program has devoted increased time to national news and less time to weather and local news. During this period, most of the complaints received from viewers were concerned with our station's coverage of weather and local news. In addition, local businesses that used to advertise during our late-night news program have canceled their advertising contracts with us. Therefore, in order to attract more viewers to our news programs and to avoid losing any further advertising revenues, we should expand our coverage of weather and local news on all our news programs."

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

19、Two years ago, radio station WCQP in Rockville decided to increase the number of call-in advice programs that it broadcast; since that time, its share of the radio audience in the Rockville listening area has increased significantly. Given WCQP's recent success with call-in advice programming, and citing a nationwide survey indicating that many radio listeners are quite interested in such programs, the station manager of KICK in Medway recommends that KICK include more call-in advice programs in an attempt to gain a larger audience share in its listening area.

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

20、The following is a memorandum from the business manager of a television station.

"Over the past year, our late-night news program has devoted increased time to national news and less time to weather and local news. During this time period, most of the complaints received from viewers were concerned with our station's coverage of weather and local news. In addition, local businesses that used to advertise during our late-night news program have just canceled their advertising contracts with us. Therefore, in order to attract more viewers to the program and to avoid losing any further advertising revenues, we should restore the time devoted to weather and local news to its former level."

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

21、The following appeared in an article written by Dr. Karp, an anthropologist.

"Twenty years ago, Dr. Field, a noted anthropologist, visited the island of Tertia and concluded from his observations that children in Tertia were reared by an entire village rather than by their own biological parents. However, my recent interviews with children living in the group of islands that includes Tertia show that these children spend much more time talking about their biological parents than about other adults in the village. This research of mine proves that Dr. Field's conclusion about Tertian village culture is invalid and thus that the observation-centered approach to studying cultures is invalid as well. The interview-centered method that my team of graduate students is currently using in Tertia will establish a much more accurate understanding of child-rearing traditions there and in other island cultures."

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

22、According to a recent report, cheating among college and university students is on the rise. However, Groveton College has successfully reduced student cheating by adopting an honor code, which calls for students to agree not to cheat in their academic endeavors and to notify a faculty member if they suspect that others have cheated. Groveton's honor code replaced a system in which teachers closely monitored students; under that system, teachers reported an average of thirty cases of cheating per year. In the first year the honor code was in place, students reported twenty-one cases of cheating; five years later, this figure had dropped to fourteen. Moreover, in a recent survey, a majority of Groveton students said that they would be less likely to cheat with an honor code in place than without. Thus, all colleges and universities should adopt honor codes similar to Groveton's in order to decrease cheating among students.

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

23、The following appeared in an article written by Dr. Karp, an anthropologist.

"Twenty years ago, Dr. Field, a noted anthropologist, visited the island of Tertia and concluded from his observations that children in Tertia were reared by an entire village rather than by their own biological parents. However, my recent interviews with children living in the group of islands that includes Tertia show that these children spend much more time talking about their biological parents than about other adults in the village. This research of mine proves that Dr. Field's conclusion about Tertian village culture is invalid and thus that the observation-centered approach to studying cultures is invalid as well. The interview-centered method that my team of graduate students is currently using in Tertia will establish a much more accurate understanding of child-rearing traditions there and in other island cultures."

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

24、A recently issued twenty-year study on headaches suffered by the residents of Mentia investigated the possible therapeutic effect of consuming salicylates. Salicylates are members of the same chemical family as aspirin, a medicine used to treat headaches. Although many foods are naturally rich in salicylates, food-processing companies also add salicylates to foods as preservatives. The twenty-year study found a correlation between the rise in the commercial use of salicylates and a steady decline in the average number of headaches reported by study participants. At the time when the study concluded, food-processing companies had just discovered that salicylates can also be used as flavor additives for foods, and, as a result, many companies plan to do so. Based on these study results, some health experts predict that residents of Mentia will suffer even fewer headaches in the future.

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the prediction and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the prediction.

25、The following was written as a part of an application for a small-business loan by a group of developers in the city of Monroe.

"A jazz music club in Monroe would be a tremendously profitable enterprise. Currently, the nearest jazz club is 65 miles away; thus, the proposed new jazz club in Monroe, the C-Note, would have the local market all to itself. Plus, jazz is extremely popular in Monroe: over 100,000 people attended Monroe's annual jazz festival last summer; several well-known jazz musicians live in Monroe; and the highest-rated radio program in Monroe is 'Jazz Nightly,' which airs every weeknight at 7 P.M. Finally, a nationwide study indicates that the typical jazz fan spends close to $1,000 per year on jazz entertainment."

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

26、The following appeared in the summary of a study on headaches suffered by the residents of Mentia.

"Salicylates are members of the same chemical family as aspirin, a medicine used to treat headaches. Although many foods are naturally rich in salicylates, for the past several decades, food-processing companies have also been adding salicylates to foods as preservatives. This rise in the commercial use of salicylates has been found to correlate with a steady decline in the average number of headaches reported by participants in our twenty-year study. Recently, food-processing companies have found that salicylates can also be used as flavor additives for foods. With this new use for salicylates, we can expect a continued steady decline in the number of headaches suffered by the average citizen of Mentia."

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

27、The following appeared in a letter to the editor of a local newspaper.

"Commuters complain that increased rush-hour traffic on Blue Highway between the suburbs and the city center has doubled their commuting time. The favored proposal of the motorists' lobby is to widen the highway, adding an additional lane of traffic. But last year's addition of a lane to the nearby Green Highway was followed by a worsening of traffic jams on it. A better alternative is to add a bicycle lane to Blue Highway. Many area residents are keen bicyclists. A bicycle lane would encourage them to use bicycles to commute, and so would reduce rush-hour traffic rather than fostering an increase."

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

28、The following appeared in the summary of a study on headaches suffered by the residents of Mentia.

"Salicylates are members of the same chemical family as aspirin, a medicine used to treat headaches. Although many foods are naturally rich in salicylates, for the past several decades, food-processing companies have also been adding salicylates to foods as preservatives. This rise in the commercial use of salicylates has been found to correlate with a steady decline in the average number of headaches reported by participants in our twenty-year study. Recently, food-processing companies have found that salicylates can also be used as flavor additives for foods. With this new use for salicylates, we can expect a continued steady decline in the number of headaches suffered by the average citizen of Mentia."

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

29、The following appeared in an editorial in a local newspaper.

"Commuters complain that increased rush-hour traffic on Blue Highway between the suburbs and the city center has doubled their commuting time. The favored proposal of the motorists' lobby is to widen the highway, adding an additional lane of traffic. Opponents note that last year's addition of a lane to the nearby Green Highway was followed by a worsening of traffic jams on it. Their suggested alternative proposal is adding a bicycle lane to Blue Highway. Many area residents are keen bicyclists. A bicycle lane would encourage them to use bicycles to commute, it is argued, thereby reducing rush-hour traffic."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

30、The following appeared as a recommendation by a committee planning a ten-year budget for the city of Calatrava.

"The birthrate in our city is declining: in fact, last year's birthrate was only one-half that of five years ago. Thus the number of students enrolled in our public schools will soon decrease dramatically, and we can safely reduce the funds budgeted for education during the next decade. At the same time, we can reduce funding for athletic playing fields and other recreational facilities. As a result, we will have sufficient money to fund city facilities and programs used primarily by adults, since we can expect the adult population of the city to increase."

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

31、The following appeared in a letter to the editor of Parson City's local newspaper.

"In our region of Trillura, the majority of money spent on the schools that most students attend—the city-run public schools—comes from taxes that each city government collects. The region's cities differ, however, in the budgetary priority they give to public education. For example, both as a proportion of its overall tax revenues and in absolute terms, Parson City has recently spent almost twice as much per year as Blue City has for its public schools—even though both cities have about the same number of residents. Clearly, Parson City residents place a higher value on providing a good education in public schools than Blue City residents do."

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

32、The following appeared in a memo from a vice president of Quiot Manufacturing.

"During the past year, Quiot Manufacturing had 30 percent more on-the-job accidents than at the nearby Panoply Industries plant, where the work shifts are one hour shorter than ours. Experts say that significant contributing factors in many on-the-job accidents are fatigue and sleep deprivation among workers. Therefore, to reduce the number of on-the-job accidents at Quiot and thereby increase productivity, we should shorten each of our three work shifts by one hour so that employees will get adequate amounts of sleep."

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

33、The following appeared in a memorandum from the planning department of an electric power company.

"Several recent surveys indicate that home owners are increasingly eager to conserve energy. At the same time, manufacturers are now marketing many home appliances, such as refrigerators and air conditioners, that are almost twice as energy efficient as those sold a decade ago. Also, new technologies for better home insulation and passive solar heating are readily available to reduce the energy needed for home heating. Therefore, the total demand for electricity in our area will not increase—and may decline slightly. Since our three electric generating plants in operation for the past twenty years have always met our needs, construction of new generating plants will not be necessary."

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

34、The vice president of human resources at Climpson Industries sent the following recommendation to the company's president.

"In an effort to improve our employees' productivity, we should implement electronic monitoring of employees' Internet use from their workstations. Employees who use the Internet from their workstations need to be identified and punished if we are to reduce the number of work hours spent on personal or recreational activities, such as shopping or playing games. By installing software to detect employees' Internet use on company computers, we can prevent employees from wasting time, foster a better work ethic at Climpson, and improve our overall profits."

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

35、The following appeared in a letter from the owner of the Sunnyside Towers apartment complex to its manager.

"One month ago, all the showerheads in the first three buildings of the Sunnyside Towers complex were modified to restrict maximum water flow to one-third of what it used to be. Although actual readings of water usage before and after the adjustment are not yet available, the change will obviously result in a considerable savings for Sunnyside Corporation, since the corporation must pay for water each month. Except for a few complaints about low water pressure, no problems with showers have been reported since the adjustment. I predict that modifying showerheads to restrict water flow throughout all twelve buildings in the Sunnyside Towers complex will increase our profits even more dramatically."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the prediction and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the prediction.

36、The following report appeared in the newsletter of the West Meria Public Health Council.

"An innovative treatment has come to our attention that promises to significantly reduce absenteeism in our schools and workplaces. A study reports that in nearby East Meria, where fish consumption is very high, people visit the doctor only once or twice per year for the treatment of colds. Clearly, eating a substantial amount of fish can prevent colds. Since colds represent the most frequently given reason for absences from school and work, we recommend the daily use of Ichthaid—a nutritional supplement derived from fish oil—as a good way to prevent colds and lower absenteeism."

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

37、The following appeared in a recommendation from the planning department of the city of Transopolis.

"Ten years ago, as part of a comprehensive urban renewal program, the city of Transopolis adapted for industrial use a large area of severely substandard housing near the freeway. Subsequently, several factories were constructed there, crime rates in the area declined, and property tax revenues for the entire city increased. To further revitalize the city, we should now take similar action in a declining residential area on the opposite side of the city. Since some houses and apartments in existing nearby neighborhoods are currently unoccupied, alternate housing for those displaced by this action will be readily available."

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

38、The following appeared in a memo from the new vice president of Sartorian, a company that manufactures men's clothing.

"Five years ago, at a time when we had difficulties in obtaining reliable supplies of high quality wool fabric, we discontinued production of our alpaca overcoat. Now that we have a new fabric supplier, we should resume production. This coat should sell very well: since we have not offered an alpaca overcoat for five years and since our major competitor no longer makes an alpaca overcoat, there will be pent-up customer demand. Also, since the price of most types of clothing has increased in each of the past five years, customers should be willing to pay significantly higher prices for alpaca overcoats than they did five years ago, and our company profits will increase."

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

39、A recent sales study indicates that consumption of seafood dishes in Bay City restaurants has increased by 30 percent during the past five years. Yet there are no currently operating city restaurants whose specialty is seafood. Moreover, the majority of families in Bay City are two-income families, and a nationwide study has shown that such families eat significantly fewer home-cooked meals than they did a decade ago but at the same time express more concern about healthful eating. Therefore, the new Captain Seafood restaurant that specializes in seafood should be quite popular and profitable.

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

40、Milk and dairy products are rich in vitamin D and calcium—substances essential for building and maintaining bones. Many people therefore say that a diet rich in dairy products can help prevent osteoporosis, a disease that is linked to both environmental and genetic factors and that causes the bones to weaken significantly with age. But a long-term study of a large number of people found that those who consistently consumed dairy products throughout the years of the study have a higher rate of bone fractures than any other participants in the study. Since bone fractures are symptomatic of osteoporosis, this study result shows that a diet rich in dairy products may actually increase, rather than decrease, the risk of osteoporosis.

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

41、The following appeared in a health newsletter.

"A ten-year nationwide study of the effectiveness of wearing a helmet while bicycling indicates that ten years ago, approximately 35 percent of all bicyclists reported wearing helmets, whereas today that number is nearly 80 percent. Another study, however, suggests that during the same ten-year period, the number of bicycle-related accidents has increased 200 percent. These results demonstrate that bicyclists feel safer because they are wearing helmets, and they take more risks as a result. Thus, to reduce the number of serious injuries from bicycle accidents, the government should concentrate more on educating people about bicycle safety and less on encouraging or requiring bicyclists to wear helmets."

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

42、The following is a letter to the head of the tourism bureau on the island of Tria.

"Erosion of beach sand along the shores of Tria Island is a serious threat to our island and our tourist industry. In order to stop the erosion, we should charge people for using the beaches. Although this solution may annoy a few tourists in the short term, it will raise money for replenishing the sand. Replenishing the sand, as was done to protect buildings on the nearby island of Batia, will help protect buildings along our shores, thereby reducing these buildings' risk of additional damage from severe storms. And since beaches and buildings in the area will be preserved, Tria's tourist industry will improve over the long term."

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

43、The following appeared in a memorandum written by the chairperson of the West Egg Town Council.

"Two years ago, consultants predicted that West Egg's landfill, which is used for garbage disposal, would be completely filled within five years. During the past two years, however, the town's residents have been recycling twice as much material as they did in previous years. Next month the amount of recycled material—which includes paper, plastic, and metal—should further increase, since charges for pickup of other household garbage will double. Furthermore, over 90 percent of the respondents to a recent survey said that they would do more recycling in the future. Because of our town's strong commitment to recycling, the available space in our landfill should last for considerably longer than predicted."

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

44、The following appeared in a letter to the editor of a journal on environmental issues.

"Over the past year, the Crust Copper Company (CCC) has purchased over 10,000 square miles of land in the tropical nation of West Fredonia. Mining copper on this land will inevitably result in pollution and, since West Fredonia is the home of several endangered animal species, in environmental disaster. But such disasters can be prevented if consumers simply refuse to purchase products that are made with CCC's copper unless the company abandons its mining plans."

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

45、The following is part of a memorandum from the president of Humana University.

"Last year the number of students who enrolled in online degree programs offered by nearby Omni University increased by 50 percent. During the same year, Omni showed a significant decrease from prior years in expenditures for dormitory and classroom space, most likely because instruction in the online programs takes place via the Internet. In contrast, over the past three years, enrollment at Humana University has failed to grow, and the cost of maintaining buildings has increased along with our budget deficit. To address these problems, Humana University will begin immediately to create and actively promote online degree programs like those at Omni. We predict that instituting these online degree programs will help Humana both increase its total enrollment and solve its budget problems."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the prediction and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the prediction.

46、The following appeared in a health magazine published in Corpora.

"Medical experts say that only one-quarter of Corpora's citizens meet the current standards for adequate physical fitness, even though twenty years ago, one-half of all of Corpora's citizens met the standards as then defined. But these experts are mistaken when they suggest that spending too much time using computers has caused a decline in fitness. Since overall fitness levels are highest in regions of Corpora where levels of computer ownership are also highest, it is clear that using computers has not made citizens less physically fit. Instead, as shown by this year's unusually low expenditures on fitness-related products and services, the recent decline in the economy is most likely the cause, and fitness levels will improve when the economy does."

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

47、The following appeared in a memorandum from the owner of Movies Galore, a chain of movie-rental stores.

"Because of declining profits, we must reduce operating expenses at Movies Galore's ten movie-rental stores. Raising prices is not a good option, since we are famous for our low prices. Instead, we should reduce our operating hours. Last month our store in downtown Marston reduced its hours by closing at 6:00 p.m. rather than 9:00 p.m. and reduced its overall inventory by no longer stocking any DVD released more than five years ago. Since we have received very few customer complaints about these new policies, we should now adopt them at all other Movies Galore stores as our best strategies for improving profits."

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

48、The following appeared in a magazine article about planning for retirement.

"Clearview should be a top choice for anyone seeking a place to retire, because it has spectacular natural beauty and a consistent climate. Another advantage is that housing costs in Clearview have fallen significantly during the past year, and taxes remain lower than those in neighboring towns. Moreover, Clearview's mayor promises many new programs to improve schools, streets, and public services. And best of all, retirees in Clearview can also expect excellent health care as they grow older, since the number of physicians in the area is far greater than the national average."

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

49、The following is part of a memorandum from the president of Humana University.

"Last year the number of students who enrolled in online degree programs offered by nearby Omni University increased by 50 percent. During the same year, Omni showed a significant decrease from prior years in expenditures for dormitory and classroom space, most likely because online instruction takes place via the Internet. In contrast, over the past three years, enrollment at Humana University has failed to grow and the cost of maintaining buildings has increased. Thus, to increase enrollment and solve the problem of budget deficits at Humana University, we should initiate and actively promote online degree programs like those at Omni."

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

50、An ancient, traditional remedy for insomnia—the scent of lavender flowers—has now been proved effective. In a recent study, 30 volunteers with chronic insomnia slept each night for three weeks on lavender-scented pillows in a controlled room where their sleep was monitored electronically. During the first week, volunteers continued to take their usual sleeping medication. They slept soundly but wakened feeling tired. At the beginning of the second week, the volunteers discontinued their sleeping medication. During that week, they slept less soundly than the previous week and felt even more tired. During the third week, the volunteers slept longer and more soundly than in the previous two weeks. Therefore, the study proves that lavender cures insomnia within a short period of time.

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

51、The following memorandum is from the business manager of Happy Pancake House restaurants.

"Butter has now been replaced by margarine in Happy Pancake House restaurants throughout the southwestern United States. Only about 2 percent of customers have complained, indicating that 98 people out of 100 are happy with the change. Furthermore, many servers have reported that a number of customers who ask for butter do not complain when they are given margarine instead. Clearly, either these customers cannot distinguish butter from margarine or they use the term 'butter' to refer to either butter or margarine. Thus, to avoid the expense of purchasing butter and to increase profitability, the Happy Pancake House should extend this cost-saving change to its restaurants in the southeast and northeast as well."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation is likely to have the predicted result. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

52、The following appeared in a letter from the owner of the Sunnyside Towers apartment building to its manager.

"One month ago, all the showerheads on the first five floors of Sunnyside Towers were modified to restrict the water flow to approximately one-third of its original flow. Although actual readings of water usage before and after the adjustment are not yet available, the change will obviously result in a considerable savings for Sunnyside Corporation, since the corporation must pay for water each month. Except for a few complaints about low water pressure, no problems with showers have been reported since the adjustment. Clearly, restricting water flow throughout all the twenty floors of Sunnyside Towers will increase our profits further."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation is likely to have the predicted result. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

53、The following appeared in a health magazine.

"The citizens of Forsythe have adopted more healthful lifestyles. Their responses to a recent survey show that in their eating habits they conform more closely to government nutritional recommendations than they did ten years ago. Furthermore, there has been a fourfold increase in sales of food products containing kiran, a substance that a scientific study has shown reduces cholesterol. This trend is also evident in reduced sales of sulia, a food that few of the most healthy citizens regularly eat."

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

54、Humans arrived in the Kaliko Islands about 7,000 years ago, and within 3,000 years most of the large mammal species that had lived in the forests of the Kaliko Islands had become extinct. Yet humans cannot have been a factor in the species' extinctions, because there is no evidence that the humans had any significant contact with the mammals. Further, archaeologists have discovered numerous sites where the bones of fish had been discarded, but they found no such areas containing the bones of large mammals, so the humans cannot have hunted the mammals. Therefore, some climate change or other environmental factor must have caused the species' extinctions.

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

55、The following appeared in an editorial in a business magazine.

"Although the sales of Whirlwind video games have declined over the past two years, a recent survey of video-game players suggests that this sales trend is about to be reversed. The survey asked video-game players what features they thought were most important in a video game. According to the survey, players prefer games that provide lifelike graphics, which require the most up-to-date computers. Whirlwind has just introduced several such games with an extensive advertising campaign directed at people ten to twenty-five years old, the age-group most likely to play video games. It follows, then, that the sales of Whirlwind video games are likely to increase dramatically in the next few months."

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

56、The following appeared in a memo from the vice president of marketing at Dura-Sock, Inc.

"A recent study of our customers suggests that our company is wasting the money it spends on its patented Endure manufacturing process, which ensures that our socks are strong enough to last for two years. We have always advertised our use of the Endure process, but the new study shows that despite our socks' durability, our average customer actually purchases new Dura-Socks every three months. Furthermore, our customers surveyed in our largest market, northeastern United States cities, say that they most value Dura-Socks' stylish appearance and availability in many colors. These findings suggest that we can increase our profits by discontinuing use of the Endure manufacturing process."

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

57、The following appeared in a memo from the vice president of marketing at Dura-Sock, Inc.

"A recent study of our customers suggests that our company is wasting the money it spends on its patented Endure manufacturing process, which ensures that our socks are strong enough to last for two years. We have always advertised our use of the Endure process, but the new study shows that despite our socks' durability, our average customer actually purchases new Dura-Socks every three months. Furthermore, our customers surveyed in our largest market, northeastern United States cities, say that they most value Dura-Socks' stylish appearance and availability in many colors. These findings suggest that we can increase our profits by discontinuing use of the Endure manufacturing process."

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

58、The vice president for human resources at Climpson Industries sent the following recommendation to the company's president.

"In an effort to improve our employees' productivity, we should implement electronic monitoring of employees' Internet use from their workstations. Employees who use the Internet inappropriately from their workstations need to be identified and punished if we are to reduce the number of work hours spent on personal or recreational activities, such as shopping or playing games. Installing software on company computers to detect employees' Internet use is the best way to prevent employees from wasting time on the job. It will foster a better work ethic at Climpson and improve our overall profits."

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

59、The following appeared in a memo from the president of Bower Builders, a company that constructs new homes.

"A nationwide survey reveals that the two most-desired home features are a large family room and a large, well-appointed kitchen. A number of homes in our area built by our competitor Domus Construction have such features and have sold much faster and at significantly higher prices than the national average. To boost sales and profits, we should increase the size of the family rooms and kitchens in all the homes we build and should make state-of-the-art kitchens a standard feature. Moreover, our larger family rooms and kitchens can come at the expense of the dining room, since many of our recent buyers say they do not need a separate dining room for family meals."

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

60、The following appeared in a letter from a firm providing investment advice for a client.

"Most homes in the northeastern United States, where winters are typically cold, have traditionally used oil as their major fuel for heating. Last heating season that region experienced 90 days with below-normal temperatures, and climate forecasters predict that this weather pattern will continue for several more years. Furthermore, many new homes are being built in the region in response to recent population growth. Because of these trends, we predict an increased demand for heating oil and recommend investment in Consolidated Industries, one of whose major business operations is the retail sale of home heating oil."

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

61、The following appeared in an article in the *Grandview Beacon*.

"For many years the city of Grandview has provided annual funding for the Grandview Symphony. Last year, however, private contributions to the symphony increased by 200 percent and attendance at the symphony's concerts-in-the-park series doubled. The symphony has also announced an increase in ticket prices for next year. Given such developments, some city commissioners argue that the symphony can now be fully self-supporting, and they recommend that funding for the symphony be eliminated from next year's budget."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

62、The following appeared in a memo from the director of a large group of hospitals.

"In a laboratory study of liquid antibacterial hand soaps, a concentrated solution of UltraClean produced a 40 percent greater reduction in the bacteria population than did the liquid hand soaps currently used in our hospitals. During a subsequent test of UltraClean at our hospital in Workby, that hospital reported significantly fewer cases of patient infection than did any of the other hospitals in our group. Therefore, to prevent serious patient infections, we should supply UltraClean at all hand-washing stations throughout our hospital system."

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

63、The following appeared in a letter to the editor of the *Parkville Daily* newspaper.

"Throughout the country last year, as more and more children below the age of nine participated in youth-league sports, over 40,000 of these young players suffered injuries. When interviewed for a recent study, youth-league soccer players in several major cities also reported psychological pressure exerted by coaches and parents to win games. Furthermore, education experts say that long practice sessions for these sports take away time that could be used for academic activities. Since the disadvantages outweigh any advantages, we in Parkville should discontinue organized athletic competition for children under nine."

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

64、Collectors prize the ancient life-size clay statues of human figures made on Kali Island but have long wondered how Kalinese artists were able to depict bodies with such realistic precision. Since archaeologists have recently discovered molds of human heads and hands on Kali, we can now conclude that the ancient Kalinese artists used molds of actual bodies, not sculpting tools and techniques, to create these statues. This discovery explains why Kalinese miniature statues were abstract and entirely different in style: molds could be used only for life-size sculptures. It also explains why few ancient Kalinese sculpting tools have been found. In light of this discovery, collectors predict that the life-size sculptures will decrease in value while the miniatures increase in value.

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the prediction and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the prediction.

65、When Stanley Park first opened, it was the largest, most heavily used public park in town. It is still the largest park, but it is no longer heavily used. Video cameras mounted in the park's parking lots last month revealed the park's drop in popularity: the recordings showed an average of only 50 cars per day. In contrast, tiny Carlton Park in the heart of the business district is visited by more than 150 people on a typical weekday. An obvious difference is that Carlton Park, unlike Stanley Park, provides ample seating. Thus, if Stanley Park is ever to be as popular with our citizens as Carlton Park, the town will obviously need to provide more benches, thereby converting some of the unused open areas into spaces suitable for socializing.

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

66、The following appeared in a memo from the owner of a chain of cheese stores located throughout the United States.

"For many years all the stores in our chain have stocked a wide variety of both domestic and imported cheeses. Last year, however, all of the five best-selling cheeses at our newest store were domestic cheddar cheeses from Wisconsin. Furthermore, a recent survey by *Cheeses of the World* magazine indicates an increasing preference for domestic cheeses among its subscribers. Since our company can reduce expenses by limiting inventory, the best way to improve profits in all of our stores is to discontinue stocking many of our varieties of imported cheese and concentrate primarily on domestic cheeses."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation is likely to have the predicted result. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

67、The following appeared as part of a business plan developed by the manager of the Rialto Movie Theater.

"Despite its downtown location, the Rialto Movie Theater, a local institution for five decades, must make big changes or close its doors forever. It should follow the example of the new Apex Theater in the mall outside of town. When the Apex opened last year, it featured a video arcade, plush carpeting and seats, and a state-of-the-art sound system. Furthermore, in a recent survey, over 85 percent of respondents reported that the high price of newly released movies prevents them from going to the movies more than five times per year. Thus, if the Rialto intends to hold on to its share of a decreasing pool of moviegoers, it must offer the same features as Apex."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation is likely to have the predicted result. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

68、A recent study reported that pet owners have longer, healthier lives on average than do people who own no pets. Specifically, dog owners tend to have a lower incidence of heart disease. In light of these findings, Sherwood Hospital should form a partnership with Sherwood Animal Shelter to institute an adopt-a-dog program. The program would encourage dog ownership for patients recovering from heart disease, which should reduce these patients' chance of experiencing continuing heart problems and also reduce their need for ongoing treatment. As a further benefit, the publicity about the program would encourage more people to adopt pets from the shelter. And that will reduce the incidence of heart disease in the general population.

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

69、The following appeared in a memo from a vice president of a large, highly diversified company.

"Ten years ago our company had two new office buildings constructed as regional headquarters for two regions. The buildings were erected by different construction companies—Alpha and Zeta. Although the two buildings had identical floor plans, the building constructed by Zeta cost 30 percent more to build. However, that building's expenses for maintenance last year were only half those of Alpha's. In addition, the energy consumption of the Zeta building has been lower than that of the Alpha building every year since its construction. Given these data, plus the fact that Zeta has a stable workforce with little employee turnover, we recommend using Zeta rather than Alpha for our new building project, even though Alpha's bid promises lower construction costs."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

70、The following appeared in a memo from a vice president of a large, highly diversified company.

"Ten years ago our company had two new office buildings constructed as regional headquarters for two regions. The buildings were erected by different construction companies—Alpha and Zeta. Although the two buildings had identical floor plans, the building constructed by Zeta cost 30 percent more to build. However, that building's expenses for maintenance last year were only half those of Alpha's. Furthermore, the energy consumption of the Zeta building has been lower than that of the Alpha building every year since its construction. Such data indicate that we should use Zeta rather than Alpha for our contemplated new building project, even though Alpha's bid promises lower construction costs."

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

71、The following is a letter to the editor of the *Waymarsh Times*.

"Traffic here in Waymarsh is becoming a problem. Although just three years ago a state traffic survey showed that the typical driving commuter took 20 minutes to get to work, the commute now takes closer to 40 minutes, according to the survey just completed. Members of the town council already have suggested more road building to address the problem, but as well as being expensive, the new construction will surely disrupt some of our residential neighborhoods. It would be better to follow the example of the nearby city of Garville. Last year Garville implemented a policy that rewards people who share rides to work, giving them coupons for free gas. Pollution levels in Garville have dropped since the policy was implemented, and people from Garville tell me that commuting times have fallen considerably. There is no reason why a policy like Garville's shouldn't work equally well in Waymarsh."

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

72、The following appeared as a letter to the editor of a national newspaper.

"Your recent article on corporate downsizing\* in Elthyria maintains that the majority of competent workers who have lost jobs as a result of downsizing face serious economic hardship, often for years, before finding other suitable employment. But this claim is undermined by a recent report on the Elthyrian economy, which found that since 1999 far more jobs have been created than have been eliminated, bringing the unemployment rate in Elthyria to its lowest level in decades. Moreover, two-thirds of these newly created jobs have been in industries that tend to pay above-average wages, and the vast majority of these jobs are full-time."

\*Downsizing is the process whereby corporations deliberately make themselves smaller, reducing the number of their employees.

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

73、The following appeared on the Mozart School of Music Web site.

"The Mozart School of Music should be the first choice for parents considering enrolling their child in music lessons. First of all, the Mozart School welcomes youngsters at all ability and age levels; there is no audition to attend the school. Second, the school offers instruction in nearly all musical instruments as well a wide range of styles and genres from classical to rock. Third, the faculty includes some of the most distinguished musicians in the area. Finally, many Mozart graduates have gone on to become well-known and highly paid professional musicians."

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

74、The president of Grove College has recommended that the college abandon its century-old tradition of all-female education and begin admitting men. Pointing to other all-female colleges that experienced an increase in applications after adopting coeducation, the president argues that coeducation would lead to a significant increase in applications and enrollment. However, the director of the alumnae association opposes the plan. Arguing that all-female education is essential to the very identity of the college, the director cites annual surveys of incoming students in which these students say that the school's all-female status was the primary reason they selected Grove. The director also points to a survey of Grove alumnae in which a majority of respondents strongly favored keeping the college all female.

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

75、The following appeared in a letter to the editor of a Batavia newspaper.

"The department of agriculture in Batavia reports that the number of dairy farms throughout the country is now 25 percent greater than it was 10 years ago. During this same time period, however, the price of milk at the local Excello Food Market has increased from $1.50 to over $3.00 per gallon. To prevent farmers from continuing to receive excessive profits on an apparently increased supply of milk, the Batavia government should begin to regulate retail milk prices. Such regulation is necessary to ensure fair prices for consumers."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation is likely to have the predicted result. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

76、The following appeared in a newsletter offering advice to investors.

"Over 80 percent of the respondents to a recent survey indicated a desire to reduce their intake of foods containing fats and cholesterol, and today low-fat products abound in many food stores. Since many of the food products currently marketed by Old Dairy Industries are high in fat and cholesterol, the company's sales are likely to diminish greatly and company profits will no doubt decrease. We therefore advise Old Dairy stockholders to sell their shares, and other investors not to purchase stock in this company."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the advice and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the advice.

77、The following recommendation appeared in a memo from the mayor of the town of Hopewell.

"Two years ago, the nearby town of Ocean View built a new municipal golf course and resort hotel. During the past two years, tourism in Ocean View has increased, new businesses have opened there, and Ocean View's tax revenues have risen by 30 percent. Therefore, the best way to improve Hopewell's economy—and generate additional tax revenues—is to build a golf course and resort hotel similar to those in Ocean View."

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

78、The following appeared in a memo from the vice president of a food distribution company with food storage warehouses in several cities.

"Recently, we signed a contract with the Fly-Away Pest Control Company to provide pest control services at our fast-food warehouse in Palm City, but last month we discovered that over $20,000 worth of food there had been destroyed by pest damage. Meanwhile, the Buzzoff Pest Control Company, which we have used for many years, continued to service our warehouse in Wintervale, and last month only $10,000 worth of the food stored there had been destroyed by pest damage. Even though the price charged by Fly-Away is considerably lower, our best means of saving money is to return to Buzzoff for all our pest control services."

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

79、Since those issues of *Newsbeat* magazine that featured political news on their front cover were the poorest-selling issues over the past three years, the publisher of *Newsbeat* has recommended that the magazine curtail its emphasis on politics to focus more exclusively on economics and personal finance. She points to a recent survey of readers of general interest magazines that indicates greater reader interest in economic issues than in political ones. *Newsbeat*'s editor, however, opposes the proposed shift in editorial policy, pointing out that very few magazines offer extensive political coverage anymore.

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

80、The following is taken from a memo from the advertising director of the Super Screen Movie Production Company.

"According to a recent report from our marketing department, during the past year, fewer people attended Super Screen-produced movies than in any other year. And yet the percentage of positive reviews by movie reviewers about specific Super Screen movies actually increased during the past year. Clearly, the contents of these reviews are not reaching enough of our prospective viewers. Thus, the problem lies not with the quality of our movies but with the public's lack of awareness that movies of good quality are available. Super Screen should therefore allocate a greater share of its budget next year to reaching the public through advertising."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

81、The following appeared in a business magazine.

"As a result of numerous complaints of dizziness and nausea on the part of consumers of Promofoods tuna, the company requested that eight million cans of its tuna be returned for testing. Promofoods concluded that the canned tuna did not, after all, pose a health risk. This conclusion is based on tests performed on samples of the recalled cans by chemists from Promofoods; the chemists found that of the eight food chemicals most commonly blamed for causing symptoms of dizziness and nausea, five were not found in any of the tested cans. The chemists did find small amounts of the three remaining suspected chemicals but pointed out that these occur naturally in all canned foods."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be addressed in order to decide whether the conclusion and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to the questions would help to evaluate the conclusion.

82、The following appeared in a memo from the vice president of marketing at Dura-Socks, Inc.

"A recent study of Dura-Socks customers suggests that our company is wasting the money it spends on its patented Endure manufacturing process, which ensures that our socks are strong enough to last for two years. We have always advertised our use of the Endure process, but the new study shows that despite the socks' durability, our customers, on average, actually purchase new Dura-Socks every three months. Furthermore, customers surveyed in our largest market—northeastern United States cities—say that they most value Dura-Socks' stylish appearance and availability in many colors. These findings suggest that we can increase our profits by discontinuing use of the Endure manufacturing process."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

83、The following is a letter to the editor of an environmental magazine.

"In 1975 a wildlife census found that there were seven species of amphibians in Xanadu National Park, with abundant numbers of each species. However, in 2002 only four species of amphibians were observed in the park, and the numbers of each species were drastically reduced. There has been a substantial decline in the numbers of amphibians worldwide, and global pollution of water and air is clearly implicated. The decline of amphibians in Xanadu National Park, however, almost certainly has a different cause: in 1975, trout—which are known to eat amphibian eggs—were introduced into the park."

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

84、The following is a letter to the editor of an environmental magazine.

"Two studies of amphibians in Xanadu National Park confirm a significant decline in the numbers of amphibians. In 1975 there were seven species of amphibians in the park, and there were abundant numbers of each species. However, in 2002 only four species of amphibians were observed in the park, and the numbers of each species were drastically reduced. One proposed explanation is that the decline was caused by the introduction of trout into the park's waters, which began in 1975. (Trout are known to eat amphibian eggs.)"

Write a response in which you discuss one or more alternative explanations that could rival the proposed explanation and explain how your explanation(s) can plausibly account for the facts presented in the argument.

85、In a study of the reading habits of Waymarsh citizens conducted by the University of Waymarsh, most respondents said that they preferred literary classics as reading material. However, a second study conducted by the same researchers found that the type of book most frequently checked out of each of the public libraries in Waymarsh was the mystery novel. Therefore, it can be concluded that the respondents in the first study had misrepresented their reading habits.

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

86、The following appeared in a memo at XYZ company.

"When XYZ lays off employees, it pays Delany Personnel Firm to offer those employees assistance in creating résumés and developing interviewing skills, if they so desire. Laid-off employees have benefited greatly from Delany's services: last year those who used Delany found jobs much more quickly than did those who did not. Recently, it has been proposed that we use the less expensive Walsh Personnel Firm in place of Delany. This would be a mistake because eight years ago, when XYZ was using Walsh, only half of the workers we laid off at that time found jobs within a year. Moreover, Delany is clearly superior, as evidenced by its bigger staff and larger number of branch offices. After all, last year Delany's clients took an average of six months to find jobs, whereas Walsh's clients took nine."

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

87、In a study of the reading habits of Waymarsh citizens conducted by the University of Waymarsh, most respondents said they preferred literary classics as reading material. However, a second study conducted by the same researchers found that the type of book most frequently checked out of each of the public libraries in Waymarsh was the mystery novel. Therefore, it can be concluded that the respondents in the first study had misrepresented their reading preferences.

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

88、The following appeared in a memorandum written by the vice president of Health Naturally, a small but expanding chain of stores selling health food and other health-related products.

"Our previous experience has been that our stores are most profitable in areas where residents are highly concerned with leading healthy lives. We should therefore build one of our new stores in Plainsville, which clearly has many such residents. Plainsville merchants report that sales of running shoes and exercise equipment are at all-time highs. The local health club, which nearly closed five years ago due to lack of business, has more members than ever, and the weight-training and aerobics classes are always full. We can even anticipate a new generation of customers: Plainsville's schoolchildren are required to participate in a program called Fitness for Life, which emphasizes the benefits of regular exercise at an early age."

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

89、The following appeared in a memo at XYZ company.

"When XYZ lays off employees, it pays Delany Personnel Firm to offer those employees assistance in creating résumés and developing interviewing skills, if they so desire. Laid-off employees have benefited greatly from Delany's services: last year those who used Delany found jobs much more quickly than did those who did not. Recently, it has been proposed that we use the less expensive Walsh Personnel Firm in place of Delany. This would be a mistake because eight years ago, when XYZ was using Walsh, only half of the workers we laid off at that time found jobs within a year. Moreover, Delany is clearly superior, as evidenced by its bigger staff and larger number of branch offices. After all, last year Delany's clients took an average of six months to find jobs, whereas Walsh's clients took nine."

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

90、The following appeared in a memorandum written by the vice president of Health Naturally, a small but expanding chain of stores selling health food and other health-related products.

"Our previous experience has been that our stores are most profitable in areas where residents are highly concerned with leading healthy lives. We should therefore build one of our new stores in Plainsville, which clearly has many such residents. Plainsville merchants report that sales of running shoes and exercise equipment are at all-time highs. The local health club, which nearly closed five years ago due to lack of business, has more members than ever, and the weight-training and aerobics classes are always full. We can even anticipate a new generation of customers: Plainsville's schoolchildren are required to participate in a program called Fitness for Life, which emphasizes the benefits of regular exercise at an early age."

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

91、Three years ago, because of flooding at the Western Palean Wildlife Preserve, 100 lions and 100 western gazelles were moved to the East Palean Preserve, an area that is home to most of the same species that are found in the western preserve, though in larger numbers, and to the eastern gazelle, a close relative of the western gazelle. The only difference in climate is that the eastern preserve typically has slightly less rainfall. Unfortunately, after three years in the eastern preserve, the imported western gazelle population has been virtually eliminated. Since the slight reduction in rainfall cannot be the cause of the virtual elimination of western gazelle, their disappearance must have been caused by the larger number of predators in the eastern preserve.

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

92、Workers in the small town of Leeville take fewer sick days than workers in the large city of Masonton, 50 miles away. Moreover, relative to population size, the diagnosis of stress-related illness is proportionally much lower in Leeville than in Masonton. According to the Leeville Chamber of Commerce, these facts can be attributed to the health benefits of the relatively relaxed pace of life in Leeville.

Write a response in which you discuss one or more alternative explanations that could rival the proposed explanation and explain how your explanation(s) can plausibly account for the facts presented in the argument.

93、The following appeared in a memorandum from the manager of WWAC radio station.

"WWAC must change from its current rock-music format because the number of listeners has been declining, even though the population in our listening area has been growing. The population growth has resulted mainly from people moving to our area after their retirement, and we must make listeners of these new residents. But they seem to have limited interest in music: several local stores selling recorded music have recently closed. Therefore, just changing to another kind of music is not going to increase our audience. Instead, we should adopt a news-and-talk format, a form of radio that is increasingly popular in our area."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

94、The vice president of human resources at Climpson Industries sent the following recommendation to the company's president.

"A recent national survey found that the majority of workers with access to the Internet at work had used company computers for personal or recreational activities, such as banking or playing games. In an effort to improve our employees' productivity, we should implement electronic monitoring of employees' Internet use from their workstations. Using electronic monitoring software is the best way to reduce the number of hours Climpson employees spend on personal or recreational activities. We predict that installing software to monitor employees' Internet use will allow us to prevent employees from wasting time, thereby increasing productivity and improving overall profits."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the prediction and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the prediction.

95、The following appeared in a memo from the new vice president of Sartorian, a company that manufactures men's clothing.

"Five years ago, at a time when we had difficulty obtaining reliable supplies of high-quality wool fabric, we discontinued production of our popular alpaca overcoat. Now that we have a new fabric supplier, we should resume production. Given the outcry from our customers when we discontinued this product and the fact that none of our competitors offers a comparable product, we can expect pent-up consumer demand for our alpaca coats. This demand and the overall increase in clothing prices will make Sartorian's alpaca overcoats more profitable than ever before."

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

96、The following appeared in a memo from the new vice president of Sartorian, a company that manufactures men's clothing.

"Five years ago, at a time when we had difficulty obtaining reliable supplies of high-quality wool fabric, we discontinued production of our popular alpaca overcoat. Now that we have a new fabric supplier, we should resume production. Given the outcry from our customers when we discontinued this product and the fact that none of our competitors offers a comparable product, we can expect pent-up consumer demand for our alpaca coats. Due to this demand and the overall increase in clothing prices, we can predict that Sartorian's alpaca overcoats will be more profitable than ever before."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the prediction and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the prediction.

97、The following appeared in an e-mail sent by the marketing director of the Classical Shakespeare Theatre of Bardville.

"Over the past ten years, there has been a 20 percent decline in the size of the average audience at Classical Shakespeare Theatre productions. In spite of increased advertising, we are attracting fewer and fewer people to our shows, causing our profits to decrease significantly. We must take action to attract new audience members. The best way to do so is by instituting a 'Shakespeare in the Park' program this summer. Two years ago the nearby Avon Repertory Company started a 'Free Plays in the Park' program, and its profits have increased 10 percent since then. If we start a 'Shakespeare in the Park' program, we can predict that our profits will increase, too."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation is likely to have the predicted result. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

98、The following is a recommendation from the business manager of Monarch Books.

"Since its opening in Collegeville twenty years ago, Monarch Books has developed a large customer base due to its reader-friendly atmosphere and wide selection of books on all subjects. Last month, Book and Bean, a combination bookstore and coffee shop, announced its intention to open a Collegeville store. Monarch Books should open its own in-store café in the space currently devoted to children's books. Given recent national census data indicating a significant decline in the percentage of the population under age ten, sales of children's books are likely to decline. By replacing its children's books section with a café, Monarch Books can increase profits and ward off competition from Book and Bean."

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

99、The following is a recommendation from the business manager of Monarch Books.

"Since its opening in Collegeville twenty years ago, Monarch Books has developed a large customer base due to its reader-friendly atmosphere and wide selection of books on all subjects. Last month, Book and Bean, a combination bookstore and coffee shop, announced its intention to open a Collegeville store. Monarch Books should open its own in-store café in the space currently devoted to children's books. Given recent national census data indicating a significant decline in the percentage of the population under age ten, sales of children's books are likely to decline. By replacing its children's books section with a café, Monarch Books can increase profits and ward off competition from Book and Bean."

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

100、The following was written as a part of an application for a small-business loan by a group of developers in the city of Monroe.

"Jazz music is extremely popular in the city of Monroe: over 100,000 people attended Monroe's annual jazz festival last summer, and the highest-rated radio program in Monroe is 'Jazz Nightly,' which airs every weeknight. Also, a number of well-known jazz musicians own homes in Monroe. Nevertheless, the nearest jazz club is over an hour away. Given the popularity of jazz in Monroe and a recent nationwide study indicating that the typical jazz fan spends close to $1,000 per year on jazz entertainment, a jazz music club in Monroe would be tremendously profitable."

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

101、There is now evidence that the relaxed pace of life in small towns promotes better health and greater longevity than does the hectic pace of life in big cities. Businesses in the small town of Leeville report fewer days of sick leave taken by individual workers than do businesses in the nearby large city of Masonton. Furthermore, Leeville has only one physician for its one thousand residents, but in Masonton the proportion of physicians to residents is five times as high. Finally, the average age of Leeville residents is significantly higher than that of Masonton residents. These findings suggest that people seeking longer and healthier lives should consider moving to small communities.

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

102、The following was written as a part of an application for a small-business loan by a group of developers in the city of Monroe.

"Jazz music is extremely popular in the city of Monroe: over 100,000 people attended Monroe's annual jazz festival last summer, and the highest-rated radio program in Monroe is 'Jazz Nightly,' which airs every weeknight. Also, a number of well-known jazz musicians own homes in Monroe. Nevertheless, the nearest jazz club is over an hour away. Given the popularity of jazz in Monroe and a recent nationwide study indicating that the typical jazz fan spends close to $1,000 per year on jazz entertainment, we predict that our new jazz music club in Monroe will be a tremendously profitable enterprise."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the prediction and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the prediction.

103、There is now evidence that the relaxed pace of life in small towns promotes better health and greater longevity than does the hectic pace of life in big cities. Businesses in the small town of Leeville report fewer days of sick leave taken by individual workers than do businesses in the nearby large city of Masonton. Furthermore, Leeville has only one physician for its one thousand residents, but in Masonton the proportion of physicians to residents is five times as high. Finally, the average age of Leeville residents is significantly higher than that of Masonton residents. These findings suggest that the relaxed pace of life in Leeville allows residents to live longer, healthier lives.

Write a response in which you discuss one or more alternative explanations that could rival the proposed explanation and explain how your explanation(s) can plausibly account for the facts presented in the argument.

104、The following appeared in a memo from a vice president of a manufacturing company.

"During the past year, workers at our newly opened factory reported 30 percent more on-the-job accidents than workers at nearby Panoply Industries. Panoply produces products very similar to those produced at our factory, but its work shifts are one hour shorter than ours. Experts say that fatigue and sleep deprivation among workers are significant contributing factors in many on-the-job accidents. Panoply's superior safety record can therefore be attributed to its shorter work shifts, which allow its employees to get adequate amounts of rest."

Write a response in which you discuss one or more alternative explanations that could rival the proposed explanation and explain how your explanation(s) can plausibly account for the facts presented in the argument.

105、The following appeared in a memo from the vice president of Butler Manufacturing.

"During the past year, workers at Butler Manufacturing reported 30 percent more on-the-job accidents than workers at nearby Panoply Industries, where the work shifts are one hour shorter than ours. A recent government study reports that fatigue and sleep deprivation among workers are significant contributing factors in many on-the-job accidents. If we shorten each of our work shifts by one hour, we can improve Butler Manufacturing's safety record by ensuring that our employees are adequately rested."

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

106、The following appeared in a memo from the Board of Directors of Butler Manufacturing.

"During the past year, workers at Butler Manufacturing reported 30 percent more on-the-job accidents than workers at nearby Panoply Industries, where the work shifts are one hour shorter than ours. A recent government study reports that fatigue and sleep deprivation among workers are significant contributing factors in many on-the-job accidents. Therefore, we recommend that Butler Manufacturing shorten each of its work shifts by one hour. Shorter shifts will allow Butler to improve its safety record by ensuring that its employees are adequately rested."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation is likely to have the predicted result. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

107、The following appeared in a memo from the business manager of a chain of cheese stores located throughout the United States.

"For many years all the stores in our chain have stocked a wide variety of both domestic and imported cheeses. Last year, however, all of the five best-selling cheeses at our newest store were domestic cheddar cheeses from Wisconsin. Furthermore, a recent survey by *Cheeses of the World* magazine indicates an increasing preference for domestic cheeses among its subscribers. Since our company can reduce expenses by limiting inventory, the best way to improve profits in all of our stores is to discontinue stocking many of our varieties of imported cheese and concentrate primarily on domestic cheeses."

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

108、The following appeared in a memo from the owner of a chain of cheese stores located throughout the United States.

"For many years all the stores in our chain have stocked a wide variety of both domestic and imported cheeses. Last year, however, all of the five best-selling cheeses at our newest store were domestic cheddar cheeses from Wisconsin. Furthermore, a recent survey by *Cheeses of the World* magazine indicates an increasing preference for domestic cheeses among its subscribers. Since our company can reduce expenses by limiting inventory, the best way to improve profits in all of our stores is to discontinue stocking many of our varieties of imported cheese and concentrate primarily on domestic cheeses."

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

109、The following appeared in a memorandum from the general manager of KNOW radio station.

"Several factors indicate that radio station KNOW should shift its programming from rock-and-roll music to a continuous news format. Consider, for example, that the number of people in our listening area over fifty years of age has increased dramatically, while our total number of listeners has declined. Also, music stores in our area report decreased sales of recorded music. Finally, continuous news stations in neighboring cities have been very successful. The switch from rock-and-roll music to 24-hour news will attract older listeners and secure KNOW radio's future."

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

110、The following appeared in a memorandum from the manager of KNOW radio station.

"Several factors indicate that KNOW radio can no longer succeed as a rock-and-roll music station. Consider, for example, that the number of people in our listening area over fifty years of age has increased dramatically, while our total number of listeners has declined. Also, music stores in our area report decreased sales of rock-and-roll music. Finally, continuous news stations in neighboring cities have been very successful. We predict that switching KNOW radio from rock-and-roll music to 24-hour news will allow the station to attract older listeners and make KNOW radio more profitable than ever."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the prediction and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the prediction.

111、The following appeared in a memorandum from the owner of Movies Galore, a chain of movie-rental stores.

"In order to stop the recent decline in our profits, we must reduce operating expenses at Movies Galore's ten movie-rental stores. Since we are famous for our special bargains, raising our rental prices is not a viable way to improve profits. Last month our store in downtown Marston significantly decreased its operating expenses by closing at 6:00 P.M. rather than 9:00 P.M. and by reducing its stock by eliminating all movies released more than five years ago. By implementing similar changes in our other stores, Movies Galore can increase profits without jeopardizing our reputation for offering great movies at low prices."

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

112、The following appeared in a memorandum from the owner of Movies Galore, a chain of movie-rental stores.

"In order to reverse the recent decline in our profits, we must reduce operating expenses at Movies Galore's ten movie-rental stores. Since we are famous for our special bargains, raising our rental prices is not a viable way to improve profits. Last month our store in downtown Marston significantly decreased its operating expenses by closing at 6:00 p.m. rather than 9:00 p.m. and by reducing its stock by eliminating all movies released more than five years ago. Therefore, in order to increase profits without jeopardizing our reputation for offering great movies at low prices, we recommend implementing similar changes in our other nine Movies Galore stores."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

113、The following is a recommendation from the personnel director to the president of Acme Publishing Company.

"Many other companies have recently stated that having their employees take the Easy Read Speed-Reading Course has greatly improved productivity. One graduate of the course was able to read a 500-page report in only two hours; another graduate rose from an assistant manager to vice president of the company in under a year. Obviously, the faster you can read, the more information you can absorb in a single workday. Moreover, Easy Read would cost Acme only $500 per employee—a small price to pay when you consider the benefits. Included in this fee is a three-week seminar in Spruce City and a lifelong subscription to the Easy Read newsletter. Clearly, to improve productivity, Acme should require all of our employees to take the Easy Read course."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the advice and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the advice.

114、The following appeared in a memo from the vice president of a food distribution company with food storage warehouses in several cities.

"Recently, we signed a contract with the Fly-Away Pest Control Company to provide pest control services at our warehouse in Palm City, but last month we discovered that over $20,000 worth of food there had been destroyed by pest damage. Meanwhile, the Buzzoff Pest Control Company, which we have used for many years in Palm City, continued to service our warehouse in Wintervale, and last month only $10,000 worth of the food stored there had been destroyed by pest damage. Even though the price charged by Fly-Away is considerably lower, our best means of saving money is to return to Buzzoff for all our pest control services."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

115、The following appeared in a memo from a vice president of a large, highly diversified company.

"Ten years ago our company had two new office buildings constructed as regional headquarters for two different regions. The buildings were erected by two different construction companies—Alpha and Zeta. Even though the two buildings had identical floor plans, the building constructed by Zeta cost 30 percent more to build, and its expenses for maintenance last year were twice those of the building constructed by Alpha. Furthermore, the energy consumption of the Zeta building has been higher than that of the Alpha building every year since its construction. Such data, plus the fact that Alpha has a stable workforce with little employee turnover, indicate that we should use Alpha rather than Zeta for our contemplated new building project."

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

116、The following appeared in a memo from the vice president of a food distribution company with food storage warehouses in several cities.

"Recently, we signed a contract with the Fly-Away Pest Control Company to provide pest control services at our warehouse in Palm City, but last month we discovered that over $20,000 worth of food there had been destroyed by pest damage. Meanwhile, the Buzzoff Pest Control Company, which we have used for many years in Palm City, continued to service our warehouse in Wintervale, and last month only $10,000 worth of the food stored there had been destroyed by pest damage. This difference in pest damage is best explained by the negligence of Fly-Away."

Write a response in which you discuss one or more alternative explanations that could rival the proposed explanation and explain how your explanation(s) can plausibly account for the facts presented in the argument.

117、The following appeared in a memo from the vice president of a food distribution company with food storage warehouses in several cities.

"Recently, we signed a contract with the Fly-Away Pest Control Company to provide pest control services at our warehouse in Palm City, but last month we discovered that over $20,000 worth of food there had been destroyed by pest damage. Meanwhile, the Buzzoff Pest Control Company, which we have used for many years in Palm City, continued to service our warehouse in Wintervale, and last month only $10,000 worth of the food stored there had been destroyed by pest damage. Even though the price charged by Fly-Away is considerably lower, our best means of saving money is to return to Buzzoff for all our pest control services."

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

118、The following appeared as part of an article in a business magazine.

"A recent study rating 300 male and female advertising executives according to the average number of hours they sleep per night showed an association between the amount of sleep the executives need and the success of their firms. Of the advertising firms studied, those whose executives reported needing no more than six hours of sleep per night had higher profit margins and faster growth. On the basis of this study, we recommend that businesses hire only people who need less than six hours of sleep per night."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

119、Evidence suggests that academic honor codes, which call for students to agree not to cheat in their academic endeavors and to notify a faculty member if they suspect that others have cheated, are far more successful than are other methods at deterring cheating among students at colleges and universities. Several years ago, Groveton College adopted such a code and discontinued its old-fashioned system in which teachers closely monitored students. Under the old system, teachers reported an average of thirty cases of cheating per year. In the first year the honor code was in place, students reported twenty-one cases of cheating; five years later, this figure had dropped to fourteen. Moreover, in a recent survey, a majority of Groveton students said that they would be less likely to cheat with an honor code in place than without.

Write a response in which you discuss one or more alternative explanations that could rival the proposed explanation and explain how your explanation(s) can plausibly account for the facts presented in the argument.

120、Several years ago, Groveton College adopted an honor code, which calls for students to agree not to cheat in their academic endeavors and to notify a faculty member if they suspect that others have cheated. Groveton's honor code replaced a system in which teachers closely monitored students. Under that system, teachers reported an average of thirty cases of cheating per year. The honor code has proven far more successful: in the first year it was in place, students reported twenty-one cases of cheating; five years later, this figure had dropped to fourteen. Moreover, in a recent survey, a majority of Groveton students said that they would be less likely to cheat with an honor code in place than without. Such evidence suggests that all colleges and universities should adopt honor codes similar to Groveton's. This change is sure to result in a dramatic decline in cheating among college students.

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation is likely to have the predicted result. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

121、The following appeared in a memo from the director of a large group of hospitals.

"In a controlled laboratory study of liquid hand soaps, a concentrated solution of extra strength UltraClean hand soap produced a 40 percent greater reduction in harmful bacteria than did the liquid hand soaps currently used in our hospitals. During our recent test of regular-strength UltraClean with doctors, nurses, and visitors at our hospital in Worktown, the hospital reported significantly fewer cases of patient infection (a 20 percent reduction) than did any of the other hospitals in our group. Therefore, to prevent serious patient infections, we should supply UltraClean at all hand-washing stations, including those used by visitors, throughout our hospital system."

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

122、The following appeared in a memo from the director of a large group of hospitals.

"In a controlled laboratory study of liquid hand soaps, a concentrated solution of extra strength UltraClean hand soap produced a 40 percent greater reduction in harmful bacteria than did the liquid hand soaps currently used in our hospitals. During our recent test of regular-strength UltraClean with doctors, nurses, and visitors at our hospital in Worktown, the hospital reported significantly fewer cases of patient infection (a 20 percent reduction) than did any of the other hospitals in our group. The explanation for the 20 percent reduction in patient infections is the use of UltraClean soap."

Write a response in which you discuss one or more alternative explanations that could rival the proposed explanation and explain how your explanation(s) can plausibly account for the facts presented in the argument.

123、The following appeared in a health newsletter.

"A ten-year nationwide study of the effectiveness of wearing a helmet while bicycling indicates that ten years ago, approximately 35 percent of all bicyclists reported wearing helmets, whereas today that number is nearly 80 percent. Another study, however, suggests that during the same ten-year period, the number of accidents caused by bicycling has increased 200 percent. These results demonstrate that bicyclists feel safer because they are wearing helmets, and they take more risks as a result. Thus, there is clearly a call for the government to strive to reduce the number of serious injuries from bicycle accidents by launching an education program that concentrates on the factors other than helmet use that are necessary for bicycle safety."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

124、The following appeared in a memo from the director of a large group of hospitals.

"In a controlled laboratory study of liquid hand soaps, a concentrated solution of extra strength UltraClean hand soap produced a 40 percent greater reduction in harmful bacteria than did the liquid hand soaps currently used in our hospitals. During our recent test of regular-strength UltraClean with doctors, nurses, and visitors at our hospital in Worktown, the hospital reported significantly fewer cases of patient infection (a 20 percent reduction) than did any of the other hospitals in our group. Therefore, to prevent serious patient infections, we should supply UltraClean at all hand-washing stations, including those used by visitors, throughout our hospital system."

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

125、The following appeared in a health newsletter.

"A ten-year nationwide study of the effectiveness of wearing a helmet while bicycling indicates that ten years ago, approximately 35 percent of all bicyclists reported wearing helmets, whereas today that number is nearly 80 percent. Another study, however, suggests that during the same ten-year period, the number of accidents caused by bicycling has increased 200 percent. These results demonstrate that bicyclists feel safer because they are wearing helmets, and they take more risks as a result. Thus there is clearly a call for the government to strive to reduce the number of serious injuries from bicycle accidents by launching an education program that concentrates on the factors other than helmet use that are necessary for bicycle safety."

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

126、The following is a recommendation from the personnel director to the president of Acme Publishing Company.

"Many other companies have recently stated that having their employees take the Easy Read Speed-Reading Course has greatly improved productivity. One graduate of the course was able to read a 500-page report in only two hours; another graduate rose from an assistant manager to vice president of the company in under a year. Obviously, the faster you can read, the more information you can absorb in a single workday. Moreover, Easy Read would cost Acme only $500 per employee—a small price to pay when you consider the benefits. Included in this fee is a three-week seminar in Spruce City and a lifelong subscription to the Easy Read newsletter. Clearly, Acme would benefit greatly by requiring all of our employees to take the Easy Read course."

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

127、The following is a recommendation from the personnel director to the president of Acme Publishing Company.

"Many other companies have recently stated that having their employees take the Easy Read Speed-Reading Course has greatly improved productivity. One graduate of the course was able to read a 500-page report in only two hours; another graduate rose from an assistant manager to vice president of the company in under a year. Obviously, the faster you can read, the more information you can absorb in a single workday. Moreover, Easy Read would cost Acme only $500 per employee—a small price to pay when you consider the benefits. Included in this fee is a three-week seminar in Spruce City and a lifelong subscription to the Easy Read newsletter. Clearly, to improve overall productivity, Acme should require all of our employees to take the Easy Read course."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

128、The following appeared in a letter from the owner of the Sunnyside Towers apartment complex to its manager.

"One month ago, all the showerheads in the first three buildings of the Sunnyside Towers complex were modified to restrict maximum water flow to one-third of what it used to be. Although actual readings of water usage before and after the adjustment are not yet available, the change will obviously result in a considerable savings for Sunnyside Corporation, since the corporation must pay for water each month. Except for a few complaints about low water pressure, no problems with showers have been reported since the adjustment. Clearly, modifying showerheads to restrict water flow throughout all twelve buildings in the Sunnyside Towers complex will increase our profits further."

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

129、The following appeared in a letter from the owner of the Sunnyside Towers apartment complex to its manager.

"Last week, all the showerheads in the first three buildings of the Sunnyside Towers complex were modified to restrict maximum water flow to one-third of what it used to be. Although actual readings of water usage before and after the adjustment are not yet available, the change will obviously result in a considerable savings for Sunnyside Corporation, since the corporation must pay for water each month. Except for a few complaints about low water pressure, no problems with showers have been reported since the adjustment. Clearly, modifying showerheads to restrict water flow throughout all twelve buildings in the Sunnyside Towers complex will increase our profits further."

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

130、The following memorandum is from the business manager of Happy Pancake House restaurants.

"Butter has now been replaced by margarine in Happy Pancake House restaurants throughout the southwestern United States. Only about 2 percent of customers have filed a formal complaint, indicating that an average of 98 people out of 100 are happy with the change. Furthermore, many servers have reported that a number of customers who ask for butter do not complain when they are given margarine instead. Clearly, either these customers cannot distinguish butter from margarine or they use the term 'butter' to refer to either butter or margarine. Thus, to avoid the expense of purchasing butter, the Happy Pancake House should extend this cost-saving change to its restaurants throughout the rest of the country."

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

131、The following memorandum is from the business manager of Happy Pancake House restaurants.

"Butter has now been replaced by margarine in Happy Pancake House restaurants throughout the southwestern United States. Only about 2 percent of customers have complained, indicating that an average of 98 people out of 100 are happy with the change. Furthermore, many servers have reported that a number of customers who ask for butter do not complain when they are given margarine instead. Clearly, either these customers cannot distinguish butter from margarine or they use the term 'butter' to refer to either butter or margarine. Thus, we predict that Happy Pancake House will be able to increase profits dramatically if we extend this cost-saving change to all our restaurants in the southeast and northeast as well."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the prediction and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the prediction.

132、The following appeared in a letter to the school board in the town of Centerville.

"All students should be required to take the driver's education course at Centerville High School. In the past two years, several accidents in and around Centerville have involved teenage drivers. Since a number of parents in Centerville have complained that they are too busy to teach their teenagers to drive, some other instruction is necessary to ensure that these teenagers are safe drivers. Although there are two driving schools in Centerville, parents on a tight budget cannot afford to pay for driving instruction. Therefore an effective and mandatory program sponsored by the high school is the only solution to this serious problem."

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

133、The following memorandum is from the business manager of Happy Pancake House restaurants.

"Butter has now been replaced by margarine in Happy Pancake House restaurants throughout the southwestern United States. Only about 2 percent of customers have complained, indicating that an average of 98 people out of 100 are happy with the change. Furthermore, many servers have reported that a number of customers who ask for butter do not complain when they are given margarine instead. Clearly, either these customers cannot distinguish butter from margarine or they use the term 'butter' to refer to either butter or margarine. Thus, to avoid the expense of purchasing butter and to increase profitability, the Happy Pancake House should extend this cost-saving change to its restaurants in the southeast and northeast as well."

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

134、The following appeared in a letter to the school board in the town of Centerville.

"All students should be required to take the driver's education course at Centerville High School. In the past two years, several accidents in and around Centerville have involved teenage drivers. Since a number of parents in Centerville have complained that they are too busy to teach their teenagers to drive, some other instruction is necessary to ensure that these teenagers are safe drivers. Although there are two driving schools in Centerville, parents on a tight budget cannot afford to pay for driving instruction. Therefore an effective and mandatory program sponsored by the high school is the only solution to this serious problem."

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

135、The data from a survey of high school math and science teachers show that in the district of Sanlee many of these teachers reported assigning daily homework, whereas in the district of Marlee, most science and math teachers reported assigning homework no more than two or three days per week. Despite receiving less frequent homework assignments, Marlee students earn better grades overall and are less likely to be required to repeat a year of school than are students in Sanlee. These results call into question the usefulness of frequent homework assignments. Most likely the Marlee students have more time to concentrate on individual assignments than do the Sanlee students who have homework every day. Therefore teachers in our high schools should assign homework no more than twice a week.

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

136、The following appeared in a letter to the school board in the town of Centerville.

"All students should be required to take the driver's education course at Centerville High School. In the past two years, several accidents in and around Centerville have involved teenage drivers. Since a number of parents in Centerville have complained that they are too busy to teach their teenagers to drive, some other instruction is necessary to ensure that these teenagers are safe drivers. Although there are two driving schools in Centerville, parents on a tight budget cannot afford to pay for driving instruction. Therefore an effective and mandatory program sponsored by the high school is the only solution to this serious problem."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

137、While the Department of Education in the state of Attra recommends that high school students be assigned homework every day, the data from a recent statewide survey of high school math and science teachers give us reason to question the usefulness of daily homework. In the district of Sanlee, 86 percent of the teachers reported assigning homework three to five times a week, whereas in the district of Marlee, less than 25 percent of the teachers reported assigning homework three to five times a week. Yet the students in Marlee earn better grades overall and are less likely to be required to repeat a year of school than are the students in Sanlee. Therefore, all teachers in our high schools should assign homework no more than twice a week.

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

138、The following appeared as an editorial in the student newspaper of Groveton College.

"To combat the recently reported dramatic rise in cheating among college students, colleges and universities should adopt honor codes similar to Groveton's, which calls for students to agree not to cheat in their academic endeavors and to notify a faculty member if they suspect that others have cheated. Groveton's honor code replaced an old-fashioned system in which teachers closely monitored students. Under that system, teachers reported an average of thirty cases of cheating per year. The honor code has proven far more successful: in the first year it was in place, students reported twenty-one cases of cheating; five years later, this figure had dropped to fourteen. Moreover, in a recent survey conducted by the Groveton honor council, a majority of students said that they would be less likely to cheat with an honor code in place than without."

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

139、The following appeared in a memo from a budget planner for the city of Grandview.

"Our citizens are well aware of the fact that while the Grandview Symphony Orchestra was struggling to succeed, our city government promised annual funding to help support its programs. Last year, however, private contributions to the symphony increased by 200 percent, and attendance at the symphony's concerts-in-the-park series doubled. The symphony has also announced an increase in ticket prices for next year. Such developments indicate that the symphony can now succeed without funding from city government and we can eliminate that expense from next year's budget. Therefore, we recommend that the city of Grandview eliminate its funding for the Grandview Symphony from next year's budget. By doing so, we can prevent a city budget deficit without threatening the success of the symphony."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation is likely to have the predicted result. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

140、While the Department of Education in the state of Attra suggests that high school students be assigned homework every day, the data from a recent statewide survey of high school math and science teachers give us reason to question the usefulness of daily homework. In the district of Sanlee, 86 percent of the teachers reported assigning homework three to five times a week, whereas in the district of Marlee, less than 25 percent of the teachers reported assigning homework three to five times a week. Yet the students in Marlee earn better grades overall and are less likely to be required to repeat a year of school than are the students in Sanlee. Therefore, we recommend that all teachers in our high schools should assign homework no more than twice a week.

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

141、The following appeared in a memo to the board of the Grandview Symphony.

"The city of Grandview has provided annual funding for the Grandview Symphony since the symphony's inception ten years ago. Last year the symphony hired an internationally known conductor, who has been able to attract high-profile guest musicians to perform with the symphony. Since then, private contributions to the symphony have doubled and attendance at the symphony's concerts-in-the-park series has reached new highs. Now that the Grandview Symphony is an established success, it can raise ticket prices. Increased revenue from larger audiences and higher ticket prices will enable the symphony to succeed without funding from the city government."

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

142、Hospital statistics regarding people who go to the emergency room after roller-skating accidents indicate the need for more protective equipment. Within that group of people, 75 percent of those who had accidents in streets or parking lots had not been wearing any protective clothing (helmets, knee pads, etc.) or any light-reflecting material (clip-on lights, glow-in-the-dark wrist pads, etc.). Clearly, the statistics indicate that by investing in high-quality protective gear and reflective equipment, roller skaters will greatly reduce their risk of being severely injured in an accident.

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

143、The following appeared in a memo from a budget planner for the city of Grandview.

"When the Grandview Symphony was established ten years ago, the city of Grandview agreed to provide the symphony with annual funding until the symphony became self-sustaining. Two years ago, the symphony hired an internationally known conductor, who has been able to attract high-profile guest musicians to perform with the symphony. Since then, private contributions to the symphony have tripled and attendance at the symphony's outdoor summer concert series has reached record highs. Now that the symphony has succeeded in finding an audience, the city can eliminate its funding of the symphony."

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

144、The citizens of Forsythe have adopted more healthful lifestyles. Their responses to a recent survey show that in their eating habits they conform more closely to government nutritional recommendations than they did ten years ago. Furthermore, there has been a fourfold increase in sales of food products containing kiran, a substance that a scientific study has shown reduces cholesterol. This trend is also evident in reduced sales of sulia, a food that few of the healthiest citizens regularly eat.

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

145、The following appeared in a memo to the board of directors of a company that specializes in the delivery of heating oil.

"Most homes in the northeastern United States, where winters are typically cold, have traditionally used oil as their major fuel for heating. Last heating season, that region experienced 90 days with below-normal temperatures, and climate forecasters predict that this weather pattern will continue for several more years. Furthermore, many new homes are being built in the region in response to recent population growth. Because of these trends, we can safely predict that this region will experience an increased demand for heating oil during the next five years."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the prediction and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the prediction.

146、The following appeared in a memo to the board of directors of a company that specializes in the delivery of heating oil.

"Most homes in the northeastern United States, where winters are typically cold, have traditionally used oil as their major fuel for heating. Last heating season, that region experienced 90 days with below-normal temperatures, and climate forecasters predict that this weather pattern will continue for several more years. Furthermore, many new homes are being built in the region in response to recent population growth. Because of these trends, we can safely predict that this region will experience an increased demand for heating oil during the next five years."

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

147、The following recommendation was made by the president and administrative staff of Grove College, a private institution, to the college's governing committee.

"We recommend that Grove College preserve its century-old tradition of all-female education rather than admit men into its programs. It is true that a majority of faculty members voted in favor of coeducation, arguing that it would encourage more students to apply to Grove. But 80 percent of the students responding to a survey conducted by the student government wanted the school to remain all female, and over half of the alumnae who answered a separate survey also opposed coeducation. Keeping the college all female will improve morale among students and convince alumnae to keep supporting the college financially."

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

148、The following recommendation was made by the president and administrative staff of Grove College, a private institution, to the college's governing committee.

"We recommend that Grove College preserve its century-old tradition of all-female education rather than admit men into its programs. It is true that a majority of faculty members voted in favor of coeducation, arguing that it would encourage more students to apply to Grove. But 80 percent of the students responding to a survey conducted by the student government wanted the school to remain all female, and over half of the alumnae who answered a separate survey also opposed coeducation. Keeping the college all female will improve morale among students and convince alumnae to keep supporting the college financially."

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

149、The following recommendation was made by the president and administrative staff of Grove College, a private institution, to the college's governing committee.

"We recommend that Grove College preserve its century-old tradition of all-female education rather than admit men into its programs. It is true that a majority of faculty members voted in favor of coeducation, arguing that it would encourage more students to apply to Grove. But 80 percent of the students responding to a survey conducted by the student government wanted the school to remain all female, and over half of the alumnae who answered a separate survey also opposed coeducation. Keeping the college all female will improve morale among students and convince alumnae to keep supporting the college financially."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation is likely to have the predicted result. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

150、The following appeared in a letter from a firm providing investment advice to a client.

"Homes in the northeastern United States, where winters are typically cold, have traditionally used oil as their major fuel for heating. Last year that region experienced 90 days with below-average temperatures, and climate forecasters at Waymarsh University predict that this weather pattern will continue for several more years. Furthermore, many new homes have been built in this region during the past year. Because these developments will certainly result in an increased demand for heating oil, we recommend investment in Consolidated Industries, one of whose major business operations is the retail sale of home heating oil."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

151、Benton City residents have adopted healthier lifestyles. A recent survey of city residents shows that the eating habits of city residents conform more closely to government nutritional recommendations than they did ten years ago. During those ten years, local sales of food products containing kiran, a substance that a scientific study has shown reduces cholesterol, have increased fourfold, while sales of sulia, a food rarely eaten by the healthiest residents, have declined dramatically. Because of these positive changes in the eating habits of Benton City residents, we predict that the obesity rate in the city will soon be well below the national average.

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the prediction and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the prediction.

152、The following appeared in a memo to the board of directors of Bargain Brand Cereals.

"One year ago we introduced our first product, Bargain Brand breakfast cereal. Our very low prices quickly drew many customers away from the top-selling cereal companies. Although the companies producing the top brands have since tried to compete with us by lowering their prices and although several plan to introduce their own budget brands, not once have we needed to raise our prices to continue making a profit. Given our success in selling cereal, we recommend that Bargain Brand now expand its business and begin marketing other low-priced food products as quickly as possible."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

153、The following appeared in a memo to the board of directors of Bargain Brand Cereals.

"One year ago we introduced our first product, Bargain Brand breakfast cereal. Our very low prices quickly drew many customers away from the top-selling cereal companies. Although the companies producing the top brands have since tried to compete with us by lowering their prices and although several plan to introduce their own budget brands, not once have we needed to raise our prices to continue making a profit. Given our success in selling cereal, we recommend that Bargain Brand now expand its business and begin marketing other low-priced food products as quickly as possible."

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

154、The following appeared in a letter from a firm providing investment advice to a client.

"Homes in the northeastern United States, where winters are typically cold, have traditionally used oil as their major fuel for heating. Last year that region experienced twenty days with below-average temperatures, and local weather forecasters throughout the region predict that this weather pattern will continue for several more years. Furthermore, many new homes have been built in this region during the past year. Based on these developments, we predict a large increase in the demand for heating oil. Therefore, we recommend investment in Consolidated Industries, one of whose major business operations is the retail sale of home heating oil."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

155、The following appeared in a letter from a firm providing investment advice to a client.

"Homes in the northeastern United States, where winters are typically cold, have traditionally used oil as their major fuel for heating. Last year that region experienced twenty days with below-average temperatures, and local weather forecasters throughout the region predict that this weather pattern will continue for several more years. Furthermore, many new homes have been built in this region during the past year. Because of these developments, we predict an increased demand for heating oil and recommend investment in Consolidated Industries, one of whose major business operations is the retail sale of home heating oil."

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

156、The following recommendation was made by the president and administrative staff of Grove College, a private institution, to the college's governing committee.

"Recently, there have been discussions about ending Grove College's century-old tradition of all-female education by admitting male students into our programs. At a recent faculty meeting, a majority of faculty members voted in favor of coeducation, arguing that it would encourage more students to apply to Grove. However, Grove students, both past and present, are against the idea of coeducation. Eighty percent of the students responding to a survey conducted by the student government wanted the school to remain all female, and over half of the alumnae who answered a separate survey also opposed coeducation. Therefore, we recommend maintaining Grove College's tradition of all-female education. We predict that keeping the college all-female will improve morale among students and convince alumnae to keep supporting the college financially."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation is likely to have the predicted result. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

157、The following appeared in a memo from the marketing director of Top Dog Pet Stores.

"Five years ago Fish Emporium started advertising in the magazine *Exotic Pets Monthly*. Their stores saw sales increase by 15 percent after their ads began appearing in the magazine. The three Fish Emporium stores in Gulf City saw an even greater increase than that. Because Top Dog Pet Stores is based in Gulf City, it seems clear that we should start placing our own ads in *Exotic Pets Monthly*. If we do so, we will be sure to reverse the recent trend of declining sales and start making a profit again."

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

158、The following appeared in a memo from the marketing director of Top Dog Pet Stores.

"Five years ago, Fish Emporium started advertising in the magazine *Exotic Pets Monthly*. Their stores saw sales increase by 15 percent. The three Fish Emporium stores in Gulf City saw an even greater increase than that. Because Top Dog has some of its largest stores in Gulf City, it seems clear that we should start placing our own ads in *Exotic Pets Monthly*. If we do so, we will be sure to reverse the recent trend of declining sales and start making a profit again."

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

159、The following appeared in a letter to the editor of the *Balmer Island Gazette*.

"The population on Balmer Island increases to 100,000 during the summer months. To reduce the number of accidents involving mopeds and pedestrians, the town council of Balmer Island plans to limit the number of mopeds rented by each of the island's six moped rental companies from 50 per day to 30 per day during the summer season. Last year, the neighboring island of Torseau enforced similar limits on moped rentals and saw a 50 percent reduction in moped accidents. We predict that putting these limits into effect on Balmer Island will result in the same reduction in moped accidents."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the prediction and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the prediction.

160、The following appeared in a recommendation from the President of the Amburg Chamber of Commerce.

"Last October, the city of Belleville installed high-intensity lighting in its central business district, and vandalism there declined almost immediately. The city of Amburg, on the other hand, recently instituted police patrols on bicycles in its business district. However, the rate of vandalism here remains constant. Since high-intensity lighting is clearly the most effective way to combat crime, we recommend using the money that is currently being spent on bicycle patrols to install such lighting throughout Amburg. If we install this high-intensity lighting, we will significantly reduce crime rates in Amburg."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation is likely to have the predicted result. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

161、The following is a recommendation from the personnel director to the president of Acme Publishing Company.

"Many other companies have recently stated that having their employees take the Easy Read Speed-Reading Course has greatly improved productivity. One graduate of the course was able to read a 500-page report in only two hours; another graduate rose from an assistant manager to vice president of the company in under a year. Obviously, the faster you can read, the more information you can absorb in a single workday. Moreover, Easy Read would cost Acme only $500 per employee—a small price to pay when you consider the benefits. Included in this fee is a three-week seminar in Spruce City and a lifelong subscription to the Easy Read newsletter. Clearly, Acme would benefit greatly by requiring all of our employees to take the Easy Read course."

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

162、The following appeared in a memo from a budget planner for the city of Grandview.

"It is time for the city of Grandview to stop funding the Grandview Symphony Orchestra. It is true that the symphony struggled financially for many years, but last year private contributions to the symphony increased by 200 percent and attendance at the symphony's concerts-in-the-park series doubled. In addition, the symphony has just announced an increase in ticket prices for next year. For these reasons, we recommend that the city eliminate funding for the Grandview Symphony Orchestra from next year's budget. We predict that the symphony will flourish in the years to come even without funding from the city."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation is likely to have the predicted result. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

163、The following memo appeared in the newsletter of the West Meria Public Health Council.

"An innovative treatment has come to our attention that promises to significantly reduce absenteeism in our schools and workplaces. A study reports that in nearby East Meria, where consumption of the plant beneficia is very high, people visit the doctor only once or twice per year for the treatment of colds. Clearly, eating a substantial amount of beneficia can prevent colds. Since colds are the reason most frequently given for absences from school and work, we recommend the daily use of nutritional supplements derived from beneficia. We predict this will dramatically reduce absenteeism in our schools and workplaces."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation is likely to have the predicted result. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

164、The following was written by a group of developers in the city of Monroe.

"A jazz music club in Monroe would be a tremendously profitable enterprise. At present, the nearest jazz club is over 60 miles away from Monroe; thus, our proposed club, the C Note, would have the local market all to itself. In addition, there is ample evidence of the popularity of jazz in Monroe: over 100,000 people attended Monroe's jazz festival last summer, several well-known jazz musicians live in Monroe, and the highest-rated radio program in Monroe is 'Jazz Nightly.' Finally, a nationwide study indicates that the typical jazz fan spends close to $1,000 per year on jazz entertainment. We therefore predict that the C Note cannot help but make money."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the prediction and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the prediction.

165、Humans arrived in the Kaliko Islands about 7,000 years ago, and within 3,000 years most of the large mammal species that had lived in the forests of the Kaliko Islands were extinct. Previous archaeological findings have suggested that early humans generally relied on both fishing and hunting for food; since archaeologists have discovered numerous sites in the Kaliko Islands where the bones of fish were discarded, it is likely that the humans also hunted the mammals. Furthermore, researchers have uncovered simple tools, such as stone knives, that could be used for hunting. The only clear explanation is that humans caused the extinction of the various mammal species through excessive hunting.

Write a response in which you discuss one or more alternative explanations that could rival the proposed explanation and explain how your explanation(s) can plausibly account for the facts presented in the argument.

166、The following memo appeared in the newsletter of the West Meria Public Health Council.

"An innovative treatment has come to our attention that promises to significantly reduce absenteeism in our schools and workplaces. A study reports that in nearby East Meria, where fish consumption is very high, people visit the doctor only once or twice per year for the treatment of colds. This shows that eating a substantial amount of fish can clearly prevent colds. Furthermore, since colds are the reason most frequently given for absences from school and work, attendance levels will improve. Therefore, we recommend the daily use of a nutritional supplement derived from fish oil as a good way to prevent colds and lower absenteeism."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

167、The following appeared in a memo from a vice president of Alta Manufacturing.

"During the past year, Alta Manufacturing had thirty percent more on-the-job accidents than nearby Panoply Industries, where the work shifts are one hour shorter than ours. Experts believe that a significant contributing factor in many accidents is fatigue caused by sleep deprivation among workers. Therefore, to reduce the number of on-the-job accidents at Alta, we recommend shortening each of our three work shifts by one hour. If we do this, our employees will get adequate amounts of sleep."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

168、The following is a letter that recently appeared in the *Oak City Gazette*, a local newspaper.

"The primary function of the Committee for a Better Oak City is to advise the city government on how to make the best use of the city's limited budget. However, at some of our recent meetings we failed to make important decisions because of the foolish objections raised by committee members who are not even residents of Oak City. People who work in Oak City but who live elsewhere cannot fully understand the business and politics of the city. After all, only Oak City residents pay city taxes, and therefore only residents understand how that money could best be used to improve the city. We recommend, then, that the Committee for a Better Oak City vote to restrict its membership to city residents only. We predict that, without the interference of non-residents, the committee will be able to make Oak City a better place in which to live and work."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation is likely to have the predicted result. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

169、The following appeared in a memo from the mayor of Brindleburg to the city council.

"Two years ago, the town of Seaside Vista opened a new municipal golf course and resort hotel. Since then, the Seaside Vista Tourism Board has reported a 20% increase in visitors. In addition, local banks reported a steep rise in the number of new business loan applications they received this year. The amount of tax money collected by Seaside Vista has also increased, allowing the town to announce plans to improve Seaside Vista's roads and bridges. We recommend building a similar golf course and resort hotel in Brindleburg. We predict that this project will generate additional tax revenue that the city can use to fund much-needed public improvements."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation is likely to have the predicted result. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

170、The following appeared in a memo from the vice president of a company that builds shopping malls around the country.

"The surface of a section of Route 101, paved just two years ago by Good Intentions Roadways, is now badly cracked with a number of dangerous potholes. In another part of the state, a section of Route 40, paved by Appian Roadways more than four years ago, is still in good condition. In a demonstration of their continuing commitment to quality, Appian Roadways recently purchased state-of-the-art paving machinery and hired a new quality-control manager. Therefore, I recommend hiring Appian Roadways to construct the access roads for all our new shopping malls. I predict that our Appian access roads will not have to be repaired for at least four years."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation is likely to have the predicted result. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

171、The following appeared as a letter to the editor from the owner of a skate shop in Central Plaza.

"Two years ago the city voted to prohibit skateboarding in Central Plaza. They claimed that skateboard users were responsible for the litter and vandalism that were keeping other visitors from coming to the plaza. In the past two years, however, there has only been a small increase in the number of visitors to Central Plaza, and litter and vandalism are still problematic. Skateboarding is permitted in Monroe Park, however, and there is no problem with litter or vandalism there. In order to restore Central Plaza to its former glory, then, we recommend that the city lift its prohibition on skateboarding in the plaza."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

172、The following appeared in a recommendation from the president of Amburg's Chamber of Commerce.

"Last October the city of Belleville installed high-intensity lighting in its central business district, and vandalism there declined within a month. The city of Amburg has recently begun police patrols on bicycles in its business district, but the rate of vandalism there remains constant. We should install high-intensity lighting throughout Amburg, then, because doing so is a more effective way to combat crime. By reducing crime in this way, we can revitalize the declining neighborhoods in our city."

Write a response in which you discuss what specific evidence is needed to evaluate the argument and explain how the evidence would weaken or strengthen the argument.

173、The following appeared in a letter to the editor of the *Balmer Island Gazette*.

"The population on Balmer Island doubles during the summer months. During the summer, then, the town council of Balmer Island should decrease the maximum number of moped rentals allowed at each of the island's six moped and bicycle rental companies from 50 per day to 30 per day. This will significantly reduce the number of summertime accidents involving mopeds and pedestrians. The neighboring island of Torseau actually saw a 50 percent reduction in moped accidents last year when Torseau's town council enforced similar limits on moped rentals. To help reduce moped accidents, therefore, we should also enforce these limitations during the summer months."

Write a response in which you examine the stated and/or unstated assumptions of the argument. Be sure to explain how the argument depends on these assumptions and what the implications are for the argument if the assumptions prove unwarranted.

174、A recent sales study indicates that consumption of seafood dishes in Bay City restaurants has increased by 30 percent during the past five years. Yet there are no currently operating city restaurants whose specialty is seafood. Moreover, the majority of families in Bay City are two-income families, and a nationwide study has shown that such families eat significantly fewer home-cooked meals than they did a decade ago but at the same time express more concern about healthful eating. Therefore, the new Captain Seafood restaurant that specializes in seafood should be quite popular and profitable.

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be addressed in order to decide whether the conclusion and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to the questions would help to evaluate the conclusion.

175. （本题为重复已有题，只在已有题 city 后面加了一个 council，写作指令仍旧不变。）、The following appeared as a letter to the editor from the owner of a skate shop in Central Plaza.

"Two years ago the city council voted to prohibit skateboarding in Central Plaza. They claimed that skateboard users were responsible for litter and vandalism that were keeping other visitors from coming to the plaza. In the past two years, however, there has been only a small increase in the number of visitors to Central Plaza, and litter and vandalism are still problematic. Skateboarding is permitted in Monroe Park, however, and there is no problem with litter or vandalism there. In order to restore Central Plaza to its former glory, then, we recommend that the city lift its prohibition on skateboarding in the plaza."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation and the argument on which it is based are reasonable. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

176、The following appeared as part of an article in a Dillton newspaper.

"In an effort to bring new jobs to Dillton and stimulate the city's flagging economy, Dillton's city council voted last year to lower the city's corporate tax rate by 15 percent; at the same time, the city began offering generous relocation grants to any company that would move to Dillton. Since these changes went into effect, two new factories have opened in Dillton. Although the two factories employ more than 1,000 people, the unemployment rate in Dillton remains unchanged. The only clear explanation for this is that the new factories are staffed with out-of-town workers rather than Dillton residents."

Write a response in which you discuss one or more alternative explanations that could rival the proposed explanation and explain how your explanation(s) can plausibly account for the facts presented in the argument.

177、The following appeared in a memo from New Ventures Consulting to the president of HobCo, Inc., a chain of hobby shops.

"Our team has completed its research on suitable building sites for a new HobCo hobby Shop in the city of Grilldon. We discovered that there are currently no hobby shops in southeastern Grilldon. When our researchers conducted a poll of area residents, 88 percent of those who responded indicated that they would welcome the opening of a hobby shop in southeastern Grilldon. Grilldon is in a region of the nation in which the hobby business has increased by 300 percent during the past decade. In addition, Grilldon has a very large population of retirees, a demographic with ample time to devote to hobbies. We therefore recommend that you choose southeastern Grilldon as the site for your next HobCo Hobby Shop. We predict that a shop in this area will draw a steady stream of enthusiastic new HobCo customers."

Write a response in which you discuss what questions would need to be answered in order to decide whether the recommendation is likely to have the predicted result. Be sure to explain how the answers to these questions would help to evaluate the recommendation.

**Issue部分**

1、As people rely more and more on technology to solve problems, the ability of humans to think for themselves will surely deteriorate.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the statement and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should consider ways in which the statement might or might not hold true and explain how these considerations shape your position.

2、To understand the most important characteristics of a society, one must study its major cities.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the statement and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should consider ways in which the statement might or might not hold true and explain how these considerations shape your position.

3、Educational institutions have a responsibility to dissuade students from pursuing fields of study in which they are unlikely to succeed.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the claim. In developing and supporting your position, be sure to address the most compelling reasons and/or examples that could be used to challenge your position.

4、Scandals are useful because they focus our attention on problems in ways that no speaker or reformer ever could.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the claim. In developing and supporting your position, be sure to address the most compelling reasons and/or examples that could be used to challenge your position.

5、Claim: Governments must ensure that their major cities receive the financial support they need in order to thrive.

Reason: It is primarily in cities that a nation's cultural traditions are preserved and generated.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the claim and the reason on which that claim is based.

6、A nation should require all of its students to study the same national curriculum until they enter college.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the recommendation and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, describe specific circumstances in which adopting the recommendation would or would not be advantageous and explain how these examples shape your position.

7、Some people believe that government funding of the arts is necessary to ensure that the arts can flourish and be available to all people. Others believe that government funding of the arts threatens the integrity of the arts.

Write a response in which you discuss which view more closely aligns with your own position and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should address both of the views presented.

8、Claim: In any field—business, politics, education, government—those in power should step down after five years.

Reason: The surest path to success for any enterprise is revitalization through new leadership.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the claim and the reason on which that claim is based.

9、In any field of endeavor, it is impossible to make a significant contribution without first being strongly influenced by past achievements within that field.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the statement and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should consider ways in which the statement might or might not hold true and explain how these considerations shape your position.

10、Nations should pass laws to preserve any remaining wilderness areas in their natural state, even if these areas could be developed for economic gain.

Write a response in which you discuss your views on the policy and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should consider the possible consequences of implementing the policy and explain how these consequences shape your position.

11、People's behavior is largely determined by forces not of their own making.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the statement and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should consider ways in which the statement might or might not hold true and explain how these considerations shape your position.

12、Governments should offer a free university education to any student who has been admitted to a university but who cannot afford the tuition.

Write a response in which you discuss your views on the policy and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should consider the possible consequences of implementing the policy and explain how these consequences shape your position.

13、Universities should require every student to take a variety of courses outside the student's field of study.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the claim. In developing and supporting your position, be sure to address the most compelling reasons and/or examples that could be used to challenge your position.

14、A nation should require all of its students to study the same national curriculum until they enter college.

Write a response in which you discuss your views on the policy and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should consider the possible consequences of implementing the policy and explain how these consequences shape your position.

15、Educational institutions should actively encourage their students to choose fields of study that will prepare them for lucrative careers.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the claim. In developing and supporting your position, be sure to address the most compelling reasons and/or examples that could be used to challenge your position.

16、Some people believe that in order to be effective, political leaders must yield to public opinion and abandon principle for the sake of compromise. Others believe that the most essential quality of an effective leader is the ability to remain consistently committed to particular principles and objectives.

Write a response in which you discuss which view more closely aligns with your own position and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should address both of the views presented.

17、Formal education tends to restrain our minds and spirits rather than set them free.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the statement and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should consider ways in which the statement might or might not hold true and explain how these considerations shape your position.

18、The well-being of a society is enhanced when many of its people question authority.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the statement and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should consider ways in which the statement might or might not hold true and explain how these considerations shape your position.

19、Governments should focus on solving the immediate problems of today rather than on trying to solve the anticipated problems of the future.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the recommendation and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, describe specific circumstances in which adopting the recommendation would or would not be advantageous and explain how these examples shape your position.

20、Some people believe that college students should consider only their own talents and interests when choosing a field of study. Others believe that college students should base their choice of a field of study on the availability of jobs in that field.

Write a response in which you discuss which view more closely aligns with your own position and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should address both of the views presented.

21、Laws should be flexible enough to take account of various circumstances, times, and places.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the statement and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should consider ways in which the statement might or might not hold true and explain how these considerations shape your position.

22、Claim: The best way to understand the character of a society is to examine the character of the men and women that the society chooses as its heroes or its role models.

Reason: Heroes and role models reveal a society's highest ideals.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the claim and the reason on which that claim is based.

23、Governments should place few, if any, restrictions on scientific research and development.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the recommendation and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, describe specific circumstances in which adopting the recommendation would or would not be advantageous and explain how these examples shape your position.

24、The best way to teach is to praise positive actions and ignore negative ones.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the statement and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should consider ways in which the statement might or might not hold true and explain how these considerations shape your position.

25、Governments should offer college and university education free of charge to all students.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the recommendation and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, describe specific circumstances in which adopting the recommendation would or would not be advantageous and explain how these examples shape your position.

26、The luxuries and conveniences of contemporary life prevent people from developing into truly strong and independent individuals.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the statement and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should consider ways in which the statement might or might not hold true and explain how these considerations shape your position.

27、In any field of inquiry, the beginner is more likely than the expert to make important contributions.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the statement and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should consider ways in which the statement might or might not hold true and explain how these considerations shape your position.

28、The surest indicator of a great nation is represented not by the achievements of its rulers, artists, or scientists, but by the general welfare of its people.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the statement and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should consider ways in which the statement might or might not hold true and explain how these considerations shape your position.

29、The best way to teach—whether as an educator, employer, or parent—is to praise positive actions and ignore negative ones.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the claim. In developing and supporting your position, be sure to address the most compelling reasons and/or examples that could be used to challenge your position.

30、Teachers' salaries should be based on their students' academic performance.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the claim. In developing and supporting your position, be sure to address the most compelling reasons and/or examples that could be used to challenge your position.

31、Society should make efforts to save endangered species only if the potential extinction of those species is the result of human activities.

Write a response in which you discuss your views on the policy and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should consider the possible consequences of implementing the policy and explain how these consequences shape your position.

32、College students should base their choice of a field of study on the availability of jobs in that field.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the claim. In developing and supporting your position, be sure to address the most compelling reasons and/or examples that could be used to challenge your position.

33、As we acquire more knowledge, things do not become more comprehensible, but more complex and mysterious.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the statement and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should consider ways in which the statement might or might not hold true and explain how these considerations shape your position.

34、In any situation, progress requires discussion among people who have contrasting points of view.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the statement and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should consider ways in which the statement might or might not hold true and explain how these considerations shape your position.

35、Educational institutions should dissuade students from pursuing fields of study in which they are unlikely to succeed.

Write a response in which you discuss your views on the policy and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should consider the possible consequences of implementing the policy and explain how these consequences shape your position.

36、Governments should not fund any scientific research whose consequences are unclear.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the recommendation and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, describe specific circumstances in which adopting the recommendation would or would not be advantageous and explain how these examples shape your position.

37、Society should identify those children who have special talents and provide training for them at an early age to develop their talents.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the recommendation and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, describe specific circumstances in which adopting the recommendation would or would not be advantageous and explain how these examples shape your position.

38、It is primarily through our identification with social groups that we define ourselves.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the statement and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should consider ways in which the statement might or might not hold true and explain how these considerations shape your position.

39、College students should be encouraged to pursue subjects that interest them rather than the courses that seem most likely to lead to jobs.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the recommendation and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, describe specific circumstances in which adopting the recommendation would or would not be advantageous and explain how these examples shape your position.

40、Claim: When planning courses, educators should take into account the interests and suggestions of their students.

Reason: Students are more motivated to learn when they are interested in what they are studying.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the claim and the reason on which that claim is based.

41、The greatness of individuals can be decided only by those who live after them, not by their contemporaries.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the statement and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should consider ways in which the statement might or might not hold true and explain how these considerations shape your position.

42、Students should always question what they are taught instead of accepting it passively.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the statement and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should consider ways in which the statement might or might not hold true and explain how these considerations shape your position.

43、The increasingly rapid pace of life today causes more problems than it solves.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the statement and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should consider ways in which the statement might or might not hold true and explain how these considerations shape your position.

44、Claim: It is no longer possible for a society to regard any living man or woman as a hero.

Reason: The reputation of anyone who is subjected to media scrutiny will eventually be diminished.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the claim and the reason on which that claim is based.

45、Competition for high grades seriously limits the quality of learning at all levels of education.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the statement and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should consider ways in which the statement might or might not hold true and explain how these considerations shape your position.

46、Universities should require every student to take a variety of courses outside the student's field of study.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the recommendation and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, describe specific circumstances in which adopting the recommendation would or would not be advantageous and explain how these examples shape your position.

47、Educators should find out what students want included in the curriculum and then offer it to them.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the recommendation and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, describe specific circumstances in which adopting the recommendation would or would not be advantageous and explain how these examples shape your position.

48、Educators should teach facts only after their students have studied the ideas, trends, and concepts that help explain those facts.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the recommendation and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, describe specific circumstances in which adopting the recommendation would or would not be advantageous and explain how these examples shape your position.

49、Claim: We can usually learn much more from people whose views we share than from those whose views contradict our own.

Reason: Disagreement can cause stress and inhibit learning.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the claim and the reason on which that claim is based.

50、Government officials should rely on their own judgment rather than unquestioningly carry out the will of the people they serve.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the recommendation and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, describe specific circumstances in which adopting the recommendation would or would not be advantageous and explain how these examples shape your position.

51、Young people should be encouraged to pursue long-term, realistic goals rather than seek immediate fame and recognition.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the recommendation and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, describe specific circumstances in which adopting the recommendation would or would not be advantageous and explain how these examples shape your position.

52、The best way to teach is to praise positive actions and ignore negative ones.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the recommendation and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, describe specific circumstances in which adopting the recommendation would or would not be advantageous and explain how these examples shape your position.

53、If a goal is worthy, then any means taken to attain it are justifiable.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the statement and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should consider ways in which the statement might or might not hold true and explain how these considerations shape your position.

54、In order to become well-rounded individuals, all college students should be required to take courses in which they read poetry, novels, mythology, and other types of imaginative literature.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the recommendation and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, describe specific circumstances in which adopting the recommendation would or would not be advantageous and explain how these examples shape your position.

55、In order for any work of art—for example, a film, a novel, a poem, or a song—to have merit, it must be understandable to most people.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the statement and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should consider ways in which the statement might or might not hold true and explain how these considerations shape your position.

56、Many important discoveries or creations are accidental: it is usually while seeking the answer to one question that we come across the answer to another.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the statement and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should consider ways in which the statement might or might not hold true and explain how these considerations shape your position.

57、The main benefit of the study of history is to dispel the illusion that people living now are significantly different from people who lived in earlier times.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the statement and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should consider ways in which the statement might or might not hold true and explain how these considerations shape your position.

58、Learning is primarily a matter of personal discipline; students cannot be motivated by school or college alone.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the statement and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should consider ways in which the statement might or might not hold true and explain how these considerations shape your position.

59、Scientists and other researchers should focus their research on areas that are likely to benefit the greatest number of people.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the recommendation and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, describe specific circumstances in which adopting the recommendation would or would not be advantageous and explain how these examples shape your position.

60、Politicians should pursue common ground and reasonable consensus rather than elusive ideals.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the recommendation and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, describe specific circumstances in which adopting the recommendation would or would not be advantageous and explain how these examples shape your position.

61、People should undertake risky action only after they have carefully considered its consequences.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the recommendation and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, describe specific circumstances in which adopting the recommendation would or would not be advantageous and explain how these examples shape your position.

62、Leaders are created by the demands that are placed on them.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the statement and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should consider ways in which the statement might or might not hold true and explain how these considerations shape your position.

63、There is little justification for society to make extraordinary efforts—especially at a great cost in money and jobs—to save endangered animal or plant species.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the statement and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should consider ways in which the statement might or might not hold true and explain how these considerations shape your position.

64、The human mind will always be superior to machines because machines are only tools of human minds.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the statement and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should consider ways in which the statement might or might not hold true and explain how these considerations shape your position.

65、Every individual in a society has a responsibility to obey just laws and to disobey and resist unjust laws.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the claim. In developing and supporting your position, be sure to address the most compelling reasons and/or examples that could be used to challenge your position.

66、People who are the most deeply committed to an idea or policy are also the most critical of it.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the statement and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should consider ways in which the statement might or might not hold true and explain how these considerations shape your position.

67、Some people believe that society should try to save every plant and animal species, despite the expense to humans in effort, time, and financial well-being. Others believe that society need not make extraordinary efforts, especially at a great cost in money and jobs, to save endangered species.

Write a response in which you discuss which view more closely aligns with your own position and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should address both of the views presented.

68、Some people believe that the purpose of education is to free the mind and the spirit. Others believe that formal education tends to restrain our minds and spirits rather than set them free.

Write a response in which you discuss which view more closely aligns with your own position and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should address both of the views presented.

69、Some people believe it is often necessary, even desirable, for political leaders to withhold information from the public. Others believe that the public has a right to be fully informed.

Write a response in which you discuss which view more closely aligns with your own position and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should address both of the views presented.

70、Claim: Universities should require every student to take a variety of courses outside the student's major field of study.

Reason: Acquiring knowledge of various academic disciplines is the best way to become truly educated.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the claim and the reason on which that claim is based.

71、Young people should be encouraged to pursue long-term, realistic goals rather than seek immediate fame and recognition.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the statement and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should consider ways in which the statement might or might not hold true and explain how these considerations shape your position.

72、Governments should not fund any scientific research whose consequences are unclear.

Write a response in which you discuss your views on the policy and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should consider the possible consequences of implementing the policy and explain how these consequences shape your position.

73、Colleges and universities should require all faculty to spend time working outside the academic world in professions relevant to the courses they teach.

Write a response in which you discuss your views on the policy and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should consider the possible consequences of implementing the policy and explain how these consequences shape your position.

74、Knowing about the past cannot help people to make important decisions today.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the statement and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should consider ways in which the statement might or might not hold true and explain how these considerations shape your position.

75、In this age of intensive media coverage, it is no longer possible for a society to regard any living man or woman as a hero.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the statement and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should consider ways in which the statement might or might not hold true and explain how these considerations shape your position.

76、We can usually learn much more from people whose views we share than from people whose views contradict our own.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the statement and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should consider ways in which the statement might or might not hold true and explain how these considerations shape your position.

77、The most effective way to understand contemporary culture is to analyze the trends of its youth.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the statement and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should consider ways in which the statement might or might not hold true and explain how these considerations shape your position.

78、People's attitudes are determined more by their immediate situation or surroundings than by society as a whole.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the statement and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should consider ways in which the statement might or might not hold true and explain how these considerations shape your position.

79、Claim: The best test of an argument is its ability to convince someone with an opposing viewpoint.

Reason: Only by being forced to defend an idea against the doubts and contrasting views of others does one really discover the value of that idea.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the claim and the reason on which that claim is based.

80、Nations should suspend government funding for the arts when significant numbers of their citizens are hungry or unemployed.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the recommendation and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, describe specific circumstances in which adopting the recommendation would or would not be advantageous and explain how these examples shape your position.

81、All parents should be required to volunteer time to their children's schools.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the recommendation and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, describe specific circumstances in which adopting the recommendation would or would not be advantageous and explain how these examples shape your position.

82、Colleges and universities should require their students to spend at least one semester studying in a foreign country.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the recommendation and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, describe specific circumstances in which adopting the recommendation would or would not be advantageous and explain how these examples shape your position.

83、Teachers' salaries should be based on the academic performance of their students.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the recommendation and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, describe specific circumstances in which adopting the recommendation would or would not be advantageous and explain how these examples shape your position.

84、It is no longer possible for a society to regard any living man or woman as a hero.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the claim. In developing and supporting your position, be sure to address the most compelling reasons and/or examples that could be used to challenge your position.

85、Some people believe that in order to thrive, a society must put its own overall success before the well-being of its individual citizens. Others believe that the well-being of a society can only be measured by the general welfare of all its people.

Write a response in which you discuss which view more closely aligns with your own position and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should address both of the views presented.

86、Some people believe that government officials must carry out the will of the people they serve. Others believe that officials should base their decisions on their own judgment.

Write a response in which you discuss which view more closely aligns with your own position and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should address both of the views presented.

87、Claim: Any piece of information referred to as a fact should be mistrusted, since it may well be proven false in the future.

Reason: Much of the information that people assume is factual actually turns out to be inaccurate.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the claim and the reason on which that claim is based.

88、Claim: Nations should suspend government funding for the arts when significant numbers of their citizens are hungry or unemployed.

Reason: It is inappropriate—and, perhaps, even cruel—to use public resources to fund the arts when people's basic needs are not being met.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the claim and the reason on which that claim is based.

89、Claim: Many problems of modern society cannot be solved by laws and the legal system.

Reason: Laws cannot change what is in people's hearts or minds.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the claim and the reason on which that claim is based.

90、Educators should take students' interests into account when planning the content of the courses they teach.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the recommendation and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, describe specific circumstances in which adopting the recommendation would or would not be advantageous and explain how these examples shape your position.

91、The primary goal of technological advancement should be to increase people's efficiency so that they have more leisure time.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the statement and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should consider ways in which the statement might or might not hold true and explain how these considerations shape your position.

92、Educators should base their assessment of students' learning not on students' grasp of facts but on the ability to explain the ideas, trends, and concepts that those facts illustrate.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the recommendation and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, describe specific circumstances in which adopting the recommendation would or would not be advantageous and explain how these examples shape your position.

93、Unfortunately, in contemporary society, creating an appealing image has become more important than the reality or truth behind that image.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the statement and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should consider ways in which the statement might or might not hold true and explain how these considerations shape your position.

94、The effectiveness of a country's leaders is best measured by examining the well-being of that country's citizens.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the claim. In developing and supporting your position, be sure to address the most compelling reasons and/or examples that could be used to challenge your position.

95、All parents should be required to volunteer time to their children's schools.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the claim. In developing and supporting your position, be sure to address the most compelling reasons and/or examples that could be used to challenge your position.

96、A nation should require all of its students to study the same national curriculum until they enter college.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the claim. In developing and supporting your position, be sure to address the most compelling reasons and/or examples that could be used to challenge your position.

97、Colleges and universities should require their students to spend at least one semester studying in a foreign country.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the claim. In developing and supporting your position, be sure to address the most compelling reasons and/or examples that could be used to challenge your position.

98、Educational institutions should actively encourage their students to choose fields of study in which jobs are plentiful.

Write a response in which you discuss your views on the policy and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should consider the possible consequences of implementing the policy and explain how these consequences shape your position.

99、People's behavior is largely determined by forces not of their own making.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the claim. In developing and supporting your position, be sure to address the most compelling reasons and/or examples that could be used to challenge your position.

100、Colleges and universities should require their students to spend at least one semester studying in a foreign country.

Write a response in which you discuss your views on the policy and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should consider the possible consequences of implementing the policy and explain how these consequences shape your position.

101、Although innovations such as video, computers, and the Internet seem to offer schools improved methods for instructing students, these technologies all too often distract from real learning.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the statement and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should consider ways in which the statement might or might not hold true and explain how these considerations shape your position.

102、Universities should require every student to take a variety of courses outside the student's field of study.

Write a response in which you discuss your views on the policy and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should consider the possible consequences of implementing the policy and explain how these consequences shape your position.

103、The best ideas arise from a passionate interest in commonplace things.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the statement and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should consider ways in which the statement might or might not hold true and explain how these considerations shape your position.

104、To be an effective leader, a public official must maintain the highest ethical and moral standards.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the claim. In developing and supporting your position, be sure to address the most compelling reasons and/or examples that could be used to challenge your position.

105、Claim: Imagination is a more valuable asset than experience.

Reason: People who lack experience are free to imagine what is possible without the constraints of established habits and attitudes.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the claim and the reason on which that claim is based.

106、In most professions and academic fields, imagination is more important than knowledge.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the statement and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should consider ways in which the statement might or might not hold true and explain how these considerations shape your position.

107、To be an effective leader, a public official must maintain the highest ethical and moral standards.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the statement and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should consider ways in which the statement might or might not hold true and explain how these considerations shape your position.

108、Critical judgment of work in any given field has little value unless it comes from someone who is an expert in that field.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the statement and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should consider ways in which the statement might or might not hold true and explain how these considerations shape your position.

109、Some people believe that scientific discoveries have given us a much better understanding of the world around us. Others believe that science has revealed to us that the world is infinitely more complex than we ever realized.

Write a response in which you discuss which view more closely aligns with your own position and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should address both of the views presented.

110、Critical judgment of work in any given field has little value unless it comes from someone who is an expert in that field.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the claim. In developing and supporting your position, be sure to address the most compelling reasons and/or examples that could be used to challenge your position.

111、In any profession—business, politics, education, government—those in power should step down after five years.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the claim. In developing and supporting your position, be sure to address the most compelling reasons and/or examples that could be used to challenge your position.

112、Requiring university students to take a variety of courses outside their major fields of study is the best way to ensure that students become truly educated.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the statement and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should consider ways in which the statement might or might not hold true and explain how these considerations shape your position.

113、Claim: The surest indicator of a great nation is not the achievements of its rulers, artists, or scientists.

Reason: The surest indicator of a great nation is actually the welfare of all its people.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the claim and the reason on which that claim is based.

114、Any leader who is quickly and easily influenced by shifts in popular opinion will accomplish little.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the statement and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should consider ways in which the statement might or might not hold true and explain how these considerations shape your position.

115、Government officials should rely on their own judgment rather than unquestioningly carry out the will of the people whom they serve.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the statement and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should consider ways in which the statement might or might not hold true and explain how these considerations shape your position.

116、A nation should require all of its students to study the same national curriculum until they enter college.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the statement and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should consider ways in which the statement might or might not hold true and explain how these considerations shape your position.

117、It is primarily in cities that a nation's cultural traditions are generated and preserved.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the statement and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should consider ways in which the statement might or might not hold true and explain how these considerations shape your position.

118、We can learn much more from people whose views we share than from people whose views contradict our own.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the statement and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should consider ways in which the statement might or might not hold true and explain how these considerations shape your position.

119、When old buildings stand on ground that modern planners feel could be better used for modern purposes, modern development should be given precedence over the preservation of historic buildings.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the statement and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should consider ways in which the statement might or might not hold true and explain how these considerations shape your position.

120、Claim: The surest indicator of a great nation must be the achievements of its rulers, artists, or scientists.

Reason: Great achievements by a nation's rulers, artists, or scientists will ensure a good life for the majority of that nation's people.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the claim and the reason on which that claim is based.

121、Some people claim that you can tell whether a nation is great by looking at the achievements of its rulers, artists, or scientists. Others argue that the surest indicator of a great nation is, in fact, the general welfare of all its people.

Write a response in which you discuss which view more closely aligns with your own position and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should address both of the views presented.

122、The best way to understand the character of a society is to examine the character of the men and women that the society chooses as its heroes or its role models.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the claim. In developing and supporting your position, be sure to address the most compelling reasons and/or examples that could be used to challenge your position.

123、The best way for a society to prepare its young people for leadership in government, industry, or other fields is by instilling in them a sense of cooperation, not competition.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the claim. In developing and supporting your position, be sure to address the most compelling reasons and/or examples that could be used to challenge your position.

124、All college and university students would benefit from spending at least one semester studying in a foreign country.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the statement and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should consider ways in which the statement might or might not hold true and explain how these considerations shape your position.

125、Some people claim that a nation's government should preserve its wilderness areas in their natural state. Others argue that these areas should be developed for potential economic gain.

Write a response in which you discuss which view more closely aligns with your own position and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should address both of the views presented.

126、In most professions and academic fields, imagination is more important than knowledge.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the claim. In developing and supporting your position, be sure to address the most compelling reasons and/or examples that could be used to challenge your position.

127、The surest indicator of a great nation is not the achievements of its rulers, artists, or scientists, but the general well-being of all its people.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the claim. In developing and supporting your position, be sure to address the most compelling reasons and/or examples that could be used to challenge your position.

128、Some people argue that successful leaders in government, industry, or other fields must be highly competitive. Other people claim that in order to be successful, a leader must be willing and able to cooperate with others.

Write a response in which you discuss which view more closely aligns with your own position and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should address both of the views presented.

129、College students should base their choice of a field of study on the availability of jobs in that field.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the recommendation and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, describe specific circumstances in which adopting the recommendation would or would not be advantageous and explain how these examples shape your position.

130、Some people believe that corporations have a responsibility to promote the well-being of the societies and environments in which they operate. Others believe that the only responsibility of corporations, provided they operate within the law, is to make as much money as possible.

Write a response in which you discuss which view more closely aligns with your own position and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should address both of the views presented.

131、Claim: Researchers should not limit their investigations to only those areas in which they expect to discover something that has an immediate, practical application.

Reason: It is impossible to predict the outcome of a line of research with any certainty.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the claim and the reason on which that claim is based.

132、Some people believe that our ever-increasing use of technology significantly reduces our opportunities for human interaction. Other people believe that technology provides us with new and better ways to communicate and connect with one another.

Write a response in which you discuss which view more closely aligns with your own position and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should address both of the views presented.

133、Claim: Knowing about the past cannot help people to make important decisions today.

Reason: The world today is significantly more complex than it was even in the relatively recent past.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the claim and the reason on which that claim is based.

134、Claim: Knowing about the past cannot help people to make important decisions today.

Reason: We are not able to make connections between current events and past events until we have some distance from both.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the claim and the reason on which that claim is based.

135、Educational institutions should actively encourage their students to choose fields of study that will prepare them for lucrative careers.

Write a response in which you discuss your views on the policy and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should consider the possible consequences of implementing the policy and explain how these consequences shape your position.

136、Educational institutions should actively encourage their students to choose fields of study in which jobs are plentiful.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the claim. In developing and supporting your position, be sure to address the most compelling reasons and/or examples that could be used to challenge your position.

137、Educational institutions have a responsibility to dissuade students from pursuing fields of study in which they are unlikely to succeed.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the statement and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should consider ways in which the statement might or might not hold true and explain how these considerations shape your position.

138、Some people believe that competition for high grades motivates students to excel in the classroom. Others believe that such competition seriously limits the quality of real learning.

Write a response in which you discuss which view more closely aligns with your own position and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should address both of the views presented.

139、Claim: Major policy decisions should always be left to politicians and other government experts.

Reason: Politicians and other government experts are more informed and thus have better judgment and perspective than do members of the general public.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the claim and the reason on which that claim is based.

140、Some people believe that universities should require every student to take a variety of courses outside the student's field of study. Others believe that universities should not force students to take any courses other than those that will help prepare them for jobs in their chosen fields.

Write a response in which you discuss which view more closely aligns with your own position and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should address both of the views presented.

141、It is more harmful to compromise one's own beliefs than to adhere to them.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the statement and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should consider ways in which the statement might or might not hold true and explain how these considerations shape your position.

142、Claim: Colleges and universities should specify all required courses and eliminate elective courses in order to provide clear guidance for students.

Reason: College students—like people in general—prefer to follow directions rather than make their own decisions.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the claim and the reason on which that claim is based.

143、No field of study can advance significantly unless it incorporates knowledge and experience from outside that field.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the statement and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should consider ways in which the statement might or might not hold true and explain how these considerations shape your position.

144、True success can be measured primarily in terms of the goals one sets for oneself.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the statement and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should consider ways in which the statement might or might not hold true and explain how these considerations shape your position.

145、The general welfare of a nation's people is a better indication of that nation's greatness than are the achievements of its rulers, artists, or scientists.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the claim. In developing and supporting your position, be sure to address the most compelling reasons and/or examples that could be used to challenge your position.

145、The best test of an argument is the argument's ability to convince someone with an opposing viewpoint.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the statement and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should consider ways in which the statement might or might not hold true and explain how these considerations shape your position.

147、The effectiveness of a country's leaders is best measured by examining the well-being of that country's citizens.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the statement and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should consider ways in which the statement might or might not hold true and explain how these considerations shape your position.

148、Nations should pass laws to preserve any remaining wilderness areas in their natural state.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the claim. In developing and supporting your position, be sure to address the most compelling reasons and/or examples that could be used to challenge your position.

149、In any field—business, politics, education, government—those in power should be required to step down after five years.

Write a response in which you discuss your views on the policy and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should consider the possible consequences of implementing the policy and explain how these consequences shape your position.

150、Some people believe that corporations have a responsibility to promote the well-being of the societies and environments in which they operate. Others believe that the only responsibility of corporations, provided they operate within the law, is to make as much money as possible.

Write a response in which you discuss which view more closely aligns with your own position and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should address both of the views presented.

151、Some people claim that the goal of politics should be the pursuit of an ideal. Others argue that the goal should be finding common ground and reaching reasonable consensus.

Write a response in which you discuss which view more closely aligns with your own position and explain your reasoning for the position you take. In developing and supporting your position, you should address both of the views presented.

152、The best way to solve environmental problems caused by consumer-generated waste is for towns and cities to impose strict limits on the amount of trash they will accept from each household.

Write a response in which you discuss the extent to which you agree or disagree with the claim. In developing and supporting your position, be sure to address the most compelling reasons and/or examples that could be used to challenge your position.