These are the comments we received as feedback from our mock class presentation, and how we incorporated it into our lesson.

“You should go more into the environmental aspects of the lesson. You really only give a page on the luxury and legacy affects and redlining. You should also look into re-arranging these sections to set up the student with redlining knowledge first, as that is more history.”

“You should also consider changing the way the student interacts with the focal paper. As of now, there is no real interaction, as you have summarized it for us. Consider providing some of the real text”

We now guide the students to the focal paper to read the background in redlining history, and the luxury and legacy hypothesis. We also have a bigger section dedicated to avian ecology and a simplified version of the methods used in the paper.

“You should provide more guidance for the instructor - include the time the lesson takes and maybe how to answer additional questions that are likely to be asked.”

Information of the time the lesson might take was added, as well as answers to every question. These answers are all in red in the instruction version.

“Apply some visuals so students have something to go off it will also allow some break up between the heavy text”

Pictures of birds, maps and interactive graphs were added throughout the lesson.

“Organization could use some work as some things are not defined before going into the analysis such as the HOLC grades were not defined before the analysis and seemed random in the paper when we didn’t know what it was referring to”

Students now have to read the background information given in the focal paper, and their knowledge on it is later tested.

“There is a lot of information where I think it can be broken down a bit more or simplified for easier understanding for students”

A lot of effort was made to simplify every section and make it as beginner friendly as possible. Additional resources were added like a link to a YouTube video explaining point counts.

“Possibly list out all of the variables that you are going to use in the analysis”

Variables are listed in both the PDF and the code.

In response to more feedback given during our presentation,  some changes have been made to the statistics part of the lesson as well. Specifically, the interactions section has been expanded to more clearly define what a statistical interaction is. Additionally, the ANCOVA/Interpreting your ANCOVA has been reworked. Rather than introducing a different analysis that is only tangentially related to the overall lesson, students will learn ANCOVA through the model that they will later recreate. The model now looks at synanthropic bird abundance as a function of land value and HOLC grade. This has a couple of benefits. It makes the overall narrative clearer and gives students something with which they can compare their own work. A paragraph has been added to describe the analysis in a bigger picture kind of way. That is, it connects the technical ANCOVA lesson with the larger narrative of the ecological lesson. Lastly, a knowledge check has been added that asks students to make inferences from a partially unlabeled graph. Students will be able to test their interpretation when they recreate the very same graph.