

Country: Pakistan

Years: 1947 - 1950

Head of government: Liaquat Ali Khan

Ideology: center

Description: HoG does not identify ideology. CHISOLS identifies party affiliation as Muslim League (ML). DPI does not identify ML's ideology. Paracha (2017) identifies ML as centrist, writing that "the All India Muslim League (AIML) became the Muslim League in 1947 and then began to splinter" and that "the AIML was a centrist party" that "emerged as an early political expression of the gradual growth of a Muslim middle-class in India". Patil (2016: 605) confirms ML to be centrist, writing that "the following are religion-based political parties: the BJP represents Hindutva; the SAD represents Sikhism and the Punjabi language; the AIML represents Islam and the interests of Indian Muslims. These are centrist parties as far as economic policies are concerned".

Years: 1951 - 1952

Head of government: Khawaja Nazimuddin

Ideology: center

Description: HoG does not identify ideology. CHISOLS identifies party affiliation as Muslim League (ML). DPI does not identify ML's ideology. Paracha (2017) identifies ML as centrist, writing that "the All India Muslim League (AIML) became the Muslim League in 1947 and then began to splinter" and that "the AIML was a centrist party" that "emerged as an early political expression of the gradual growth of a Muslim middle-class in India". Patil (2016: 605) confirms ML to be centrist, writing that "the following are religion-based political parties: the BJP represents Hindutva; the SAD represents Sikhism and the Punjabi language; the AIML represents Islam and the interests of Indian Muslims. These are centrist parties as far as economic policies are concerned".

Years: 1953 - 1954

Head of government: Mohammad Ali Bogra

Ideology: center

Description: HoG does not identify ideology. CHISOLS identifies party affiliation as Muslim League (ML). DPI does not identify ML's ideology. Paracha (2017) identifies ML as centrist, writing that "the All India Muslim League (AIML) became the Muslim League in 1947 and then began to splinter" and that "the AIML was a centrist party" that "emerged as an early political expression of the gradual growth of a Muslim middle-class in India". Patil (2016: 605) confirms ML to be centrist,

writing that “the following are religion-based political parties: the BJP represents Hindutva; the SAD represents Sikhism and the Punjabi language; the AIML represents Islam and the interests of Indian Muslims. These are centrist parties as far as economic policies are concerned”.

Year: 1955

Head of government: Chaudhry Muhammad Ali

Ideology: center

Description: HoG does not identify ideology. CHISOLS identifies party affiliation as Muslim League (ML). DPI does not identify ML’s ideology. Paracha (2017) identifies ML as centrist, writing that “the All India Muslim League (AIML) became the Muslim League in 1947 and then began to splinter” and that “the AIML was a centrist party” that “emerged as an early political expression of the gradual growth of a Muslim middle-class in India”. Patil (2016: 605) confirms ML to be centrist, writing that “the following are religion-based political parties: the BJP represents Hindutva; the SAD represents Sikhism and the Punjabi language; the AIML represents Islam and the interests of Indian Muslims. These are centrist parties as far as economic policies are concerned”.

Year: 1956

Head of government: Hussain Shaheed Suharwardi

Ideology: left

Description: HoG does not identify ideology. CHISOLS identifies party affiliation as Awami League (AL). DPI does not identify AL’s ideology. AL originated in East Pakistan, a region that eventually became independent Bangladesh: Uttom and Rozario (2019) write that “a group of disgruntled politicians formed the Awami League in what was then East Pakistan”. *Political Handbook of the World* (2015: 113) identifies the Awami League as leftist: “On January 25, 1975, the Constituent Assembly revised the constitution to provide for a presidential form of government and the adoption of a one-party system under the rubric of the Bangladesh Krishak Sramik Awami League (Baksal), a socialist political platform.” In the Global Party Survey 2019, 12 experts identify the average left-right (0-10) score of Bangladesh Awami League (AL) as 3.8. In V-Party (2020), 4 experts identify head of government party’s ideology as “Center-left” (-0.939) in 1970.

Year: 1957

Head of government: Malik Firoz Khan Noon

Ideology: right

Description: World Statesmen (2020) and Rulers (2020) identify Mohammad Ayub Khan instead of Malik Firoz Khan Noon as head of government on December 31,

1958. HoG does not identify ideology. CHISOLS identifies party affiliation as Republican Party (RP). DPI does not identify RP's ideology. Paracha (2017) identifies the Republican Party as rightist, writing that "in 1955, veteran ML man Iskander Mirza helped shape a secular centre-right party, the Republican Party" and that "the Republican Party was conservative". Ali (2018: 106) confirms RP to be rightist, writing that "while the bulk of [landlords] remained loyal to the League, others have supported right-wing deviations and set up independent formations, the most prominent of which was the former Republican Party."

Years: 1958 - 1968

Head of government: Mohammad Ayub Khan

Ideology: right

Description: World Statesmen (2020) and Rulers (2020) identify Mohammad Ayub Khan instead of Malik Firoz Khan Noon as head of government on December 31, 1958. HoG does not identify ideology. CHISOLS identifies party affiliation as none. Manzano (2017) identifies ideology of Ayub Khan as right. Burki (1991) writes "the swift turn toward a prominent economic role for the state [under Bhutto] was not especially appealing to the important economic interests in Pakistan who were the product of the capitalist approach followed by the earlier regimes, in particular those of Ayub Khan and Yahya Khan." Khan (1967) himself states, "'In our approach to economic planning. . . most of the administrative and bureaucratic controls which previously hampered the progress of the private sector have been gradually removed. . . "The ultimate aim of all our efforts in economic and social spheres is to move speedily towards the attainment of an Islamic social order. This term is almost inter-changeable with a "welfare state" . . . What is basic to the establishment of this order of society is the creation of equal opportunities for all, rather than an equal distribution of wealth. The important thing is that every individual must be given the fullest opportunity to develop his natural talents, and that he should not be inhibited by any oppressive economic and social framework."

Years: 1969 - 1970

Head of government: Agha Mohammad Yahya Khan

Ideology: right

Description: HoG does not identify ideology. CHISOLS identifies party affiliation as none. Manzano (2017) identifies ideology of Yahya Khan as right. Burki (1991) writes "the swift turn toward a prominent economic role for the state [under Bhutto] was not especially appealing to the important economic interests in Pakistan who were the product of the capitalist approach followed by the earlier regimes, in particular those of Ayub Khan and Yahya Khan."

Years: 1971 - 1976

Head of government: Zulfikar Ali Bhutto

Ideology: left

Description: World Statesmen (2020) and Rulers (2020) identify Mohammad Zia-ul-Haq instead of Zulfikar Ali Bhutto as head of government on December 31, 1977. HoG does not identify ideology; CHISOLS identifies party affiliation as Pakistan People's Party (PPP). Manzano (2017) identifies Bhutto as right, but only in 1971. DPI identifies PPP's ideology as left. Political Handbook (2015) confirms PPP to be leftist, writing that it is "an Islamic socialist party founded in 1967 by Zulfikar Ali Bhutto". Perspective monde (2020) identifies Bhutto's ideology as centrist, writing "Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto | 1971 (24 décembre) | 1977 (5 juillet) | Parti du peuple pakistanais | [...] | Centre." In the Global Party Survey 2019, 16 experts identify the average left-right (0-10) score of Pakistan People's Party (PPP) as 3.7. World Statesmen (2020) identifies Bhutto's party as PPP, and PPP's ideology as leftist, writing "14 Aug 1973 - 5 Jul 1977 Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto (s.a.) PPP" and "PPP = Pakistan Peoples Party (Islamic socialist, populist, est.30 Nov 1967)." The leftist Socialist International (2020) identifies Pakistan People's Party as one of its members. In V-Party (2020), 4 experts identify head of government party's ideology as "Left" (-1.84) in 1970.

Years: 1977 - 1984

Head of government: Mohammad Zia-ul-Haq

Ideology: right

Description: World Statesmen (2020) and Rulers (2020) identify Mohammad Zia-ul-Haq instead of Zulfikar Ali Bhutto as head of government on December 31, 1977. HoG does not identify ideology. CHISOLS identifies party affiliation as none. Manzano (2017) identifies ideology of Zia-ul-Haq as right. Burki (1988) writes "President Zia openly admitted to little knowledge of, or interest in economic management. . . Zia left economic management initially to a team of technocrats. . . [Zia stated] 'I really don't care what [my advisors] do as long as the economy continues to function smoothly and the poor and the lower middle classes continue to see some hope for them.'" It also states, "Ultimately, Ghulam Ishaq Khan was entrusted with the task of managing the economy. . . Ishaq Khan's firm but conservative management of the economy yielded impressive dividends for the government."

Years: 1985 - 1987

Head of government: Mohammad Khan Junejo

Ideology: right

Description: HoG does not identify ideology. CHISOLS does not identify party affiliation. *Political Handbook of the World* (2015: 1114-15) identifies affiliation as Pakistan Muslim League (PML-Q): “Pakistan Muslim League (PML-Q). Officially registered in 2004 as the PML, the current party continues to be interchangeably identified as the Pakistan Muslim League–Qaid-i-Azam (“Father of the Nation,” a reference to Mohammad Ali Jinnah) or PML-Q. The complicated history of the PML began in 1962 when it was launched as successor to the pre-independence All-India Muslim League. Long riven by essentially personalist factions, it split over participation in the February 1985 election. A Chatta Group, led by Kawaja KHAIRUDDIN, joined the MRD's boycott call, while the mainstream, led by Pir Sahib PAGARO, participated in the election “under protest” and won 27 seats. Mohammad Khan Junejo, a longtime party member, became prime minister.” Mujtaba (2018: 85) identifies PML-Q as rightist, writing that the PML-Q was “formed with the ideologies of nationalism, libertarianism, liberalism, and progressivism at heart”. Shah (2013: 1013) also identifies PML-Q as rightist, writing that “the ISI created a new right-wing political party, the Pakistan Muslim League (Quaid-e Azam, PML-Q) to act as the civilian face of the military government. The PML-Q mainly comprised of disaffected, coerced, or bribed defectors from the PML-N”. CNN (2008) identifies PML-Q as rightist, writing that “the largely center-conservative PML-Q party has seen its power base dented”. Al Jazeera (2013) also identifies PML-Q as rightist, writing that “PML-Q is a centre-right party drawn primarily from defectors from the rival PML-N”. Brookings (2010) describes PML(Q) as “conservative”. Baxter et. al (2002) writes that PML-Q “favors policies followed by Musharraf”, whom Manzano (2017) identifies as rightist. *Political Handbook of the World* (2015) identifies PML’s ideology as rightist, writing “the president dissolved the cabinet and designated Mohammad Khan JUNEJO, of the center-right Pakistan Muslim League (PML), as the country’s first prime minister in eight years.”

Years: 1988 - 1989

Head of government: Benazir Bhutto

Ideology: left

Description: HoG does not identify ideology; CHISOLS identifies party affiliation as Pakistan People’s Party (PPP). DPI identifies PPP’s ideology as left. *Political Handbook* (2015) confirms PPP to be leftist, writing that it is “an Islamic socialist party founded in 1967 by Zulfikar Ali Bhutto”. *Perspective monde* (2020) identifies Bhutto’s ideology as centrist, writing “Benazir Bhutto | 1988 (2 décembre) | 1990 (6 août) | Parti du peuple pakistanais | [...] | Centre.” In the *Global Party Survey 2019*, 16 experts identify the average left-right (0-10) score of Pakistan People’s Party (PPP) as 3.7. *World Statesmen* (2020) identifies Bhutto's party as PPP, and PPP's

ideology as leftist, writing "2 Dec 1988 - 6 Aug 1990 Benazir Bhutto (f) (1st time) (b. 1953 - d. 2007) PPP" and "PPP = Pakistan Peoples Party (Islamic socialist, populist, est.30 Nov 1967)." The leftist Socialist International (2020) identifies Pakistan People's Party as one of its members. In V-Party (2020), 4 experts identify head of government party's ideology as "Center-left" (-0.654) in 1988.

Years: 1990 - 1992

Head of government: Mian Muhammad Nawaz Sharif

Ideology: right

Description: HoG does not identify ideology. CHISOLS identifies party affiliation as Pakistan Muslim League - Nawaz (PML-N). DPI does not identify PML-N's ideology. *Keesing's Record of World Events* (2012) identifies PML-N as right: "The Supreme Court also on Feb. 29 revived an investigation into allegations that the ISI donated some US\$6.5 million to conservative opposition parties in advance of 1990 legislative elections, in which the right-wing Pakistan Muslim League led by Nawaz Sharif defeated the Pakistan People's Party, led by former Prime Minister Benazir Bhutto." *Perspective monde* (2020) identifies Nawaz Sharif's ideology as centrist, writing "Mian Mohammad Nawaz Sharif | 1990 (6 novembre) | 1993 (18 avril) | Ligue musulmane du Pakistan - Nawaz Sharif | [...] | Centre." In the Global Party Survey 2019, 16 experts identify the average left-right (0-10) score of Pakistan Muslim League, Nawaz Sharif faction (PML-N) as 5.8. *Political Handbook of the World* (2015) identifies PML's ideology as rightist, writing "the president dissolved the cabinet and designated Mohammad Khan JUNEJO, of the center-right Pakistan Muslim League (PML), as the country's first prime minister in eight years." *World Statesmen* (2020) identifies Sharif's party as PML-N, and PML-N's ideology as rightist, writing "6 Nov 1990 - 18 Apr 1993 Mohammad Nawaz Sharif (1st time) (b. 1949) PML-N" and "PML-N = Pakistani Muslim League-Nawaz (center-right, conservative, PML Nawaz Sharif faction, split from PML, est.1988)." In V-Party (2020), 4 experts identify head of government party's ideology as "Center" (0.319) in 1993.

Years: 1993 - 1995

Head of government: Benazir Bhutto

Ideology: left

Description: HoG does not identify ideology; CHISOLS identifies party affiliation as Pakistan People's Party (PPP). DPI identifies PPP's ideology as left. *Political Handbook* (2015) confirms PPP to be leftist, writing that it is "an Islamic socialist party founded in 1967 by Zulfikar Ali Bhutto". *Perspective monde* (2020) identifies Bhutto's ideology as centrist, writing "Benazir Bhutto | 1993 (19 octobre) | 1996 (5 novembre) | Parti du peuple pakistanais | [...] | Centre." In the Global Party Survey

2019, 16 experts identify the average left-right (0-10) score of Pakistan People's Party (PPP) as 3.7. World Statesmen (2020) identifies Bhutto's party as PPP, and PPP's ideology as leftist, writing "19 Oct 1993 - 5 Nov 1996 Benazir Bhutto (f) (2nd time) (s.a.) PPP" and "PPP = Pakistan Peoples Party (Islamic socialist, populist, est.30 Nov 1967)." The leftist Socialist International (2020) identifies Pakistan People's Party as one of its members. In V-Party (2020), 4 experts identify head of government party's ideology as "Center-left" (-0.516) in 1988.

Year: 1996

Head of government: Malik Meraj Khalid

Ideology: left

Description: HoG does not identify ideology. CHISOLS identifies party affiliation as non-party. The Guardian (2003) identifies Khalid's earlier party affiliation as the Pakistan People's Party (PPP), writing that "he quit that party in 1968 and later, as a member of the left leaning PPP ... was elected to the National Assembly". An obituary in the Pride of Pakistan (2003) confirms him to be ideologically leftist, writing that Meraj was "a left-wing statesman and Marxist philosopher". In the Global Party Survey 2019, 16 experts identify the average left-right (0-10) score of Pakistan People's Party (PPP) as 3.7.

Years: 1997 - 1998

Head of government: Mian Muhammad Nawaz Sharif

Ideology: right

Description: HoG does not identify ideology. CHISOLS identifies party affiliation as Pakistan Muslim League - Nawaz (PML-N). *Keesing's Record of World Events* (2012) identifies PML-N as right: "The Supreme Court also on Feb. 29 revived an investigation into allegations that the ISI donated some US\$6.5 million to conservative opposition parties in advance of 1990 legislative elections, in which the right-wing Pakistan Muslim League led by Nawaz Sharif defeated the Pakistan People's Party, led by former Prime Minister Benazir Bhutto." Perspective monde (2020) identifies Nawaz Sharif's ideology as centrist, writing "Mian Mohammad Nawaz Sharif | 1997 (17 février) | 1999 (12 octobre) | Ligue musulmane du Pakistan - Nawaz Sharif | [...] | Centre." In the Global Party Survey 2019, 16 experts identify the average left-right (0-10) score of Pakistan Muslim League, Nawaz Sharif faction (PML-N) as 5.8. Political Handbook of the World (2015) identifies PML's ideology as rightist, writing "the president dissolved the cabinet and designated Mohammad Khan JUNEJO, of the center-right Pakistan Muslim League (PML), as the country's first prime minister in eight years." World Statesmen (2020) identifies Sharif's party as PML-N, and PML-N's ideology as rightist, writing "17 Feb 1997 - 12 Oct 1999 Mohammad Nawaz Sharif (3rd time) (s.a.) PML-N" and "PML-N = Pakistani

Muslim League-Nawaz (center-right, conservative, PML Nawaz Sharif faction, split from PML, est.1988)." In V-Party (2020), 4 experts identify head of government party's ideology as "Center" (0.319) in 1997.

Years: 1999 - 2001

Head of government: General Pervez Musharraf

Ideology: right

Description: HoG does not identify ideology. CHISOLS identifies party affiliation as none. Manzano (2017) identifies ideology of Musharraf as right. World Encyclopedia identifies Musharraf's party affiliation as PML-Q, writing "the Pakistan Muslim League-Quaid-e-Azam group (PML-Q), which is Musharraf's chosen platform. Mujtaba (2018: 85) identifies PML-Q as rightist, writing that the PML-Q was "formed with the ideologies of nationalism, libertarianism, liberalism, and progressivism at heart". Shah (2013: 1013) also identifies PML-Q as rightist, writing that "the ISI created a new right-wing political party, the Pakistan Muslim League (Quaid-e Azam, PML-Q) to act as the civilian face of the military government. The PML-Q mainly comprised of disaffected, coerced, or bribed defectors from the PML-N". CNN (2008) identifies PML-Q as rightist, writing that "the largely center-conservative PML-Q party has seen its power base dented". Al Jazeera (2013) also identifies PML-Q as rightist, writing that "PML-Q is a centre-right party drawn primarily from defectors from the rival PML-N". Brookings (2010) describes PML(Q) as "conservative". Baxter et. al (2002) writes that PML-Q "favors policies followed by Musharraf", whom Manzano (2017) identifies as rightist. Perspective monde (2020) identifies Jamali's ideology as centrist, writing "Mir Zafarullah Khan Jamali | 2002 (23 novembre) | 2004 (30 juin) | Ligue musulmane du Pakistan - Quaid-e-Azam | [...] | Centre." Political Handbook of the World (2015) identifies PML's ideology as rightist, writing "the president dissolved the cabinet and designated Mohammad Khan JUNEJO, of the center-right Pakistan Muslim League (PML), as the country's first prime minister in eight years.

Years: 2002 - 2003

Head of government: Mir Zafarullah Khan Jamali

Ideology: right

Description: HoG does not identify ideology. CHISOLS does not identify party affiliation. *Political Handbook of the World* (2015: 1108) identifies affiliation as Pakistan Muslim League - Quaid e Azam (PML-Q): "The process culminated on November 21, 2002, when the National Assembly confirmed Zafarullah Khan JAMALI of the PML-Q as prime minister." Mujtaba (2018: 85) identifies PML-Q as rightist, writing that the PML-Q was "formed with the ideologies of nationalism, libertarianism, liberalism, and progressivism at heart". Shah (2013: 1013) also

identifies PML-Q as rightist, writing that “the ISI created a new right-wing political party, the Pakistan Muslim League (Quaid-e Azam, PML-Q) to act as the civilian face of the military government. The PML-Q mainly comprised of disaffected, coerced, or bribed defectors from the PML-N”. CNN (2008) identifies PML-Q as rightist, writing that “the largely center-conservative PML-Q party has seen its power base dented”. Al Jazeera (2013) also identifies PML-Q as rightist, writing that “PML-Q is a centre-right party drawn primarily from defectors from the rival PML-N”. Brookings (2010) describes PML(Q) as “conservative”. Baxter et. al (2002) writes that PML-Q “favors policies followed by Musharraf”, whom Manzano (2017) identifies as rightist. Perspective monde (2020) identifies Jamali’s ideology as centrist, writing “Mir Zafarullah Khan Jamali | 2002 (23 novembre) | 2004 (30 juin) | Ligue musulmane du Pakistan - Quaid-e-Azam | [...] | Centre.” Political Handbook of the World (2015) identifies PML’s ideology as rightist, writing "the president dissolved the cabinet and designated Mohammad Khan JUNEJO, of the center-right Pakistan Muslim League (PML), as the country’s first prime minister in eight years." In V-Party (2020), 4 experts identify head of government party’s ideology as “Center” (0.46) in 2002.

Years: 2004 - 2006

Head of government: Shaukat Aziz

Ideology: right

Description: HoG does not identify ideology. CHISOLS does not identify party affiliation. *Keesing’s Record of World Events* (2004) identifies affiliation as Pakistan Muslim League - Quaid e Azam (PML-Q): “Aziz contested the elections as a candidate for the ruling Pakistan Muslim League—Qaid-i-Azam (PML—QA).” Mujtaba (2018: 85) identifies PML-Q as rightist, writing that the PML-Q was “formed with the ideologies of nationalism, libertarianism, liberalism, and progressivism at heart”. Shah (2013: 1013) also identifies PML-Q as rightist, writing that “the ISI created a new right-wing political party, the Pakistan Muslim League (Quaid-e Azam, PML-Q) to act as the civilian face of the military government. The PML-Q mainly comprised of disaffected, coerced, or bribed defectors from the PML-N”. CNN (2008) identifies PML-Q as rightist, writing that “the largely center-conservative PML-Q party has seen its power base dented”. Al Jazeera (2013) also identifies PML-Q as rightist, writing that “PML-Q is a centre-right party drawn primarily from defectors from the rival PML-N”. Brookings (2010) describes PML(Q) as “conservative”. Baxter et. al (2002) writes that PML-Q “favors policies followed by Musharraf”, whom Manzano (2017) identifies as rightist. Perspective monde (2020) identifies Aziz’s ideology as centrist, writing “Shaukat Aziz | 2004 (28 août) | 2007 (16 novembre) | Ligue musulmane du Pakistan - Quaid-e-Azam | [...] | Centre.” Political Handbook of the World (2015) identifies PML’s ideology

as rightist, writing "the president dissolved the cabinet and designated Mohammad Khan JUNEJO, of the center-right Pakistan Muslim League (PML), as the country's first prime minister in eight years." In V-Party (2020), 4 experts identify head of government party's ideology as "Center" (0.46) in 2002.

Year: 2007

Head of government: Mohammadmian Soomro

Ideology: right

Description: HoG does not identify ideology. CHISOLS does not identify party affiliation. World Statesmen (2019) identifies party as the Pakistan Muslim League Quaid-e-Azam (*PML-Q*). Mujtaba (2018: 85) identifies PML-Q as rightist, writing that the PML-Q was "formed with the ideologies of nationalism, libertarianism, liberalism, and progressivism at heart". Shah (2013: 1013) also identifies PML-Q as rightist, writing that "the ISI created a new right-wing political party, the Pakistan Muslim League (Quaid-e Azam, PML-Q) to act as the civilian face of the military government. The PML-Q mainly comprised of disaffected, coerced, or bribed defectors from the PML-N". CNN (2008) identifies PML-Q as rightist, writing that "the largely center-conservative PML-Q party has seen its power base dented". Al Jazeera (2013) also identifies PML-Q as rightist, writing that "PML-Q is a centre-right party drawn primarily from defectors from the rival PML-N". Brookings (2010) describes PML(Q) as "conservative". Baxter et. al (2002) writes that PML-Q "favors policies followed by Musharraf", whom Manzano (2017) identifies as rightist. Perspective monde (2020) identifies Soomro's ideology as centrist, writing "Mohammad Mian Soomro | 2007 (16 novembre) | 2008 (25 mars) | Ligue musulmane du Pakistan - Quaid-e-Azam | [...] | Centre." Political Handbook of the World (2015) identifies PML's ideology as rightist, writing "the president dissolved the cabinet and designated Mohammad Khan JUNEJO, of the center-right Pakistan Muslim League (PML), as the country's first prime minister in eight years." In V-Party (2020), 4 experts identify head of government party's ideology as "Center" (0.46) in 2002.

Years: 2008 - 2011

Head of government: Yousaf Raza Gillani

Ideology: left

Description: HoG does not identify ideology. CHISOLS does not identify party affiliation. *Political Handbook of the World* (2015: 1109) identifies affiliation as Pakistan People's Party (PPP): "On March 25 a PPP vice chair, Syed Yousaf Raza GILANI, was sworn in as prime minister of a multiparty government led by the PPP and PML-N." DPI identifies PPP's ideology as left. Political Handbook (2015) confirms PPP to be leftist, writing that it is "an Islamic socialist party founded in

1967 by Zulfikar Ali Bhutto”. Perspective monde (2020) identifies Gilani’s ideology as centrist, writing “Mohammad Mian Soomro | 2007 (16 novembre) | 2008 (25 mars) | Ligue musulmane du Pakistan - Quaid-e-Azam | [...] | Centre.” In the Global Party Survey 2019, 16 experts identify the average left-right (0-10) score of Pakistan People’s Party (PPP) as 3.7. World Statesmen (2020) identifies Gillani's party as PPP, and PPP's ideology as leftist, writing "25 Mar 2008 - 19 Jun 2012 Yousaf Raza Gillani (b. 1952) PPP" and "PPP = Pakistan Peoples Party (Islamic socialist, populist, est.30 Nov 1967)." The leftist Socialist International (2020) identifies Pakistan People's Party as one of its members. In V-Party (2020), 4 experts identify head of government party’s ideology as “Center-left” (-0.469) in 2008.

Years: 2012

Head of government: Raja Pervez Ashraf

Ideology: left

Description: HoG does not identify ideology. CHISOLS does not identify party affiliation. *Political Handbook of the World* (2015: 1114) identifies affiliation as Pakistan People’s Party (PPP): “Following the dismissal of Gilani as prime minister in June, PPP member Raja Pervaiz ASHRAF succeeded him.” DPI identifies PPP’s ideology as left. Political Handbook (2015) confirms PPP to be leftist, writing that it is “an Islamic socialist party founded in 1967 by Zulfikar Ali Bhutto”. Perspective monde (2020) identifies Ashraf’s ideology as centrist, writing “Raja Pervez Ashraf | 2012 (22 juin) | 2013 (25 mars) | Parti du peuple pakistanais | [...] | Centre.” In the Global Party Survey 2019, 16 experts identify the average left-right (0-10) score of Pakistan People’s Party (PPP) as 3.7. World Statesmen (2020) identifies Ashraf's party as PPP, and PPP's ideology as leftist, writing "22 Jun 2012 - 25 Mar 2013 Raja Pervez Ashraf (b. 1950) PPP" and "PPP = Pakistan Peoples Party (Islamic socialist, populist, est.30 Nov 1967)." The leftist Socialist International (2020) identifies Pakistan People's Party as one of its members. In V-Party (2020), 4 experts identify head of government party’s ideology as “Center-left” (-0.469) in 2008.

Years: 2013 - 2016

Head of government: Mohammad Nawaz Sharif

Ideology: right

Description: HoG does not identify ideology. CHISOLS does not identify party affiliation. *Political Handbook of the World* (2015: 1105) identifies affiliation as Pakistan Muslim League – Nawaz (PML-N): “Prime Minister: Muhammad Nawaz SHARIF (Pakistan Muslim League–Nawaz).” *Keesing’s Record of World Events* (2012) identifies PML-N as right: “The Supreme Court also on Feb. 29 revived an investigation into allegations that the ISI donated some US\$6.5 million to conservative opposition parties in advance of 1990 legislative elections, in which the

right-wing Pakistan Muslim League led by Nawaz Sharif defeated the Pakistan People's Party, led by former Prime Minister Benazir Bhutto.” Perspective monde (2020) identifies Sharif’s ideology as centrist, writing “Nawaz Sharif | 2013 (5 juin) | 2017 (1 août) | Ligue musulmane du Pakistan - Nawaz Sharif | [...] | Centre.” In the Global Party Survey 2019, 16 experts identify the average left-right (0-10) score of Pakistan Muslim League, Nawaz Sharif faction (PML-N) as 5.8. Political Handbook of the World (2015) identifies PML’s ideology as rightist, writing "the president dissolved the cabinet and designated Mohammad Khan JUNEJO, of the center-right Pakistan Muslim League (PML), as the country’s first prime minister in eight years." World Statesmen (2020) identifies Sharif's party as PML-N, and PML-N's ideology as rightist, writing "5 Jun 2013 - 28 Jul 2017 Mohammad Nawaz Sharif (4th time) (s.a.) PML-N" and "PML-N = Pakistani Muslim League-Nawaz (center-right, conservative, PML Nawaz Sharif faction, split from PML, est.1988)." In V-Party (2020), 4 experts identify head of government party’s ideology as “Center” (0.287) in 2013.

Year: 2017

Head of government: Shahid Khaqan Abbasi

Ideology: right

Description: HoG does not identify ideology. CHISOLS does not identify party affiliation. *Keesing’s Record of World Events* (2008) identifies party affiliation as Pakistan Muslim League – Nawaz (PML-N): “Shahid Khaqan Abbasi (PML—N) Commerce.” *Keesing’s Record of World Events* (2012) identifies PML-N as right: “The Supreme Court also on Feb. 29 revived an investigation into allegations that the ISI donated some US\$6.5 million to conservative opposition parties in advance of 1990 legislative elections, in which the right-wing Pakistan Muslim League led by Nawaz Sharif defeated the Pakistan People's Party, led by former Prime Minister Benazir Bhutto.” Perspective monde (2020) identifies Abbasi’s ideology as centrist, writing “Shahid Khaqan Abbasi | 2017 (1 août) | 2018 (31 mai) | Ligue musulmane du Pakistan - Nawaz Sharif | [...] | Centre.” In the Global Party Survey 2019, 16 experts identify the average left-right (0-10) score of Pakistan Muslim League, Nawaz Sharif faction (PML-N) as 5.8. Political Handbook of the World (2015) identifies PML’s ideology as rightist, writing "the president dissolved the cabinet and designated Mohammad Khan JUNEJO, of the center-right Pakistan Muslim League (PML), as the country’s first prime minister in eight years." In V-Party (2020), 4 experts identify head of government party’s ideology as “Center” (0.287) in 2013. DPI does not identify PML-N’s ideology.

Year: 2018 - 2020

Head of government: Imran Khan

Ideology: center

Description: Perspective monde (2020) identifies Khan's party affiliation as Pakistan Tehreek-e-Insaf, and PTI's ideology as rightist: "Imran Khan | 2018 (18 août) | | Mouvement du Pakistan pour la justice (Pakistan Tehreek-e-Insaf) | [...] | Centre droit." World Statesmen (2020) identifies Khan's affiliation as PTI and PTI's ideology as centrist: "18 Aug 2018 - Imran Ahmad Khan Niazi (b. 1952) PTI", "**PTI** = Pakistan Tehreek-e-Insaf (Pakistan Movement for Justice, centrist, nationalist, populist, Imran Khan personalist, est.25 Apr 1996)" In the Global Party Survey 2019, 16 experts identify the average left-right (0-10) score of Movement for Justice (PTI) as 4.4. Political Handbook of the World (2015) identifies PTI's ideology as centrist, writing "The PTI is a centrist grouping founded by popular cricket captain Imran Khan in 1996." In V-Party (2020), 4 experts identify head of government party's ideology as "Center-right" (0.707) in 2018. Varieties of Democracy identifies party affiliation as Pakistan Movement for Justice. DPI identifies PTI's ideology as centrist. The Pakistan TKI official website quotes Khan in its manifesto, "For PTI, it is not just "politics": it is a commitment to building a welfare state where the rule of law, meritocracy and transparency are guaranteed to all citizens—where a social welfare safety net is provided to the marginalised and the elderly." Global Village Space (2020) writes "In order to fix this direction, we must first fix our mindset. We need to tell our government departments to help and aid whoever wants to increase the wealth of the nation, and whoever wants to industrialise and grow. We need to get rid of this socialist mindset," stated Khan, who criticised how profit making was considered to be a crime in Pakistan. [...] I still remember, the politicians of the 70s would start their speeches criticising the businessmen and industrialists. If there is no industrialism and no investment, how will the country move forward?"

References:

- Ali, Tariq. 2018. *Uprising in Pakistan: How to Bring down a Dictatorship*. New York: Verso.
- Amjad-Ali, C., & Toffolo, C. (2006). *World encyclopedia of political systems and parties* (969494150 752868525 J. Weisblatt & 969494151 752868525 N. Schlager, Authors). New York, NY: Facts On File.
- Azad, Arif. 2013. "Obituary: Malik Meraj Khalid". The Guardian.
- Baxter, Craig, Robert Oberst, Yogendra Kumar Malik, and Charles Henry Kennedy. 2002. *Government and Politics in South Asia*. Boulder, Colorado: Westview Press.
- Burki. 1988. Pakistan under Zia, 1977-1988. *Asian Survey* 28(10): 1082-1100.

- Burki, Shahid Javed, Craig Baxter, Robert LaPorte, and Kamal Azfar. *Pakistan Under the Military: Eleven Years of Zia Ul-Haq*. Boulder : Lahore: Westview Press ; Pak Book Corp., 1991.
- Chaudhry, Mariam. "Pakistan's Political Parties Explained." CNN. Cable News Network. February 18, 2008.
- "Contempt of court charge against prime minister." In *Keesing's Record of World Events* (Formerly *Keesing's Contemporary Archives* 1931-2015) Volume 58 (2012), Issue No. 2 (February), Page 50927
- "Election of Prime Minister." In *Keesing's Record of World Events* (Formerly *Keesing's Contemporary Archives* 1931-2015) Volume 54 (2008), Issue No. 3 (March), Page 48470
- "Explainer: Pakistan's Main Political Parties." Al Jazeera, May 6, 2013.
- Global Village Space. 2020. 'Get rid of socialist mindest': PM Imran urges youth not to shy away from profit-making.
<https://www.globalvillagespace.com/get-rid-of-socialist-mindset-pm-imran-urges-youth-not-to-shy-away-from-profit-making/> (last accessed November 18, 2021).
- Khan, Mohammed Ayub. 1967. "Pakistan's Economic Progress." *International Affairs* (Royal Institute of International Affairs 1944-) 43, no. 1 (1967): 1-11. doi:10.2307/2612510.
- Livingston, Ian and Michael O'Hanlon. 2010. "Pakistan Index: Tracking Variables of Reconstruction and Security". Brookings.
- Manzano, Dulce. 2017. *Bringing Down the Educational Wall: Political Regimes, Ideology, and the Expansion of Education*. Cambridge.
- Mujtaba, Gholam. 2018. *Political Ecology of Pakistan*. Friesenpress.
- "Obituary: Malik Meraj Khalid". Pride of Pakistan. 2003.
- "Pakistan Elections: Politicians and Parties to Watch." BBC News. BBC, May 12, 2013.
- "Pakistan." In *Keesing's Record of World Events* (Formerly *Keesing's Contemporary Archives* 1931-2015) Volume 50 (2004), Issue No. 8 (August), Page 46156
- "Pakistan." In *Political Handbook of the World 2015*, edited by Thomas Lansford, 1105-20. Washington, DC: CQ Press, 2015.
- Pakistan Tehreek-e-Insaf Official Website. 2020. "PTI Manifesto."
<https://www.insaf.pk/content/manifesto>
- Paracha, Nadeem. 2017. "The Muslim League: A Factional History". Dawn.
- Patil, S.H. 2016. *The Constitution, Government And Politics In India*. Vikas Publishing.
- Perspective monde. 2020. *Various entries*.

- <http://perspective.usherbrooke.ca/bilan/servlet/BMGvt?codePays=AFG&ani=1945&moi=1&anf=2019&mof=7>
- Rulers. 2020. Pakistan. <http://rulers.org/rulp1.html#pakistan> (last checked on January 9, 2020).
- Shah, Aqil. 2013. "Constraining consolidation: military politics and democracy in Pakistan". *Democratization* 21:6, 1007-1033.
- Uttom, Stephan and Rock Rozario. 2019. "Rise of Bangladesh's Awami League". UCA News.
- World Statesmen. 2020. Pakistan. <https://www.worldstatesmen.org/Pakistan.htm> (last checked on January 9, 2020).