

Country: Rwanda

Years: 1962 – 1972

Head of government: President Grégoire Kayibanda

Ideology: Left

Description: HoG does not identify ideology. CHISOLS identifies Kayibanda's party as MDR-PARMEH. Childress (2015) suggests that Kayibanda is Left: "Kayibanda's rhetoric from the first years as president follow more nearly the stereotypical social-communist lines rather than any kind of social-democratic leaning: as paraphrased by Paternostre, 'all the citizens must collect very concrete fruits *from the common weal* . . . by the interplay of the different forms of cooperatives, by genuine *social solidarity*, by the participation of the *employees in ownership of enterprises*. Thus, this "third way" [between socialism and liberalism], was an argument of unity. It would become integrated one day, thought Kayibanda, into the '*new world economic order*', taking into account *all the aspects of human life*, not just the economic aspect.' [my italics]" (223-4).

Years: 1973 – 1990

Head of government: President Juvénal Habyarimana

Ideology: Left

Description: HoG does not identify ideology. CHISOLS identifies Habyarimana's party as MRND (from 1976 to 1990). Lansford (2017) suggests that Habyarimana was non-party from 1973 to 1975, writing that though Habyarimana began his regime affiliated only with the military, he later founded the MRND party: "The new government, under Maj. Gen. Juvénal HABYARIMANA, moved quickly to dissolve the legislature, ban political organizations, and suspend portions of the constitution. A civilian-military government, composed largely of young technocrats, was subsequently installed, and it established a more centralized administrative system. A regime- supportive National Revolutionary Movement for Development (Mouvement Républicain National pour le Développement—MRND) was organized in mid-1976 and was accorded formal status as the sole legal party under a new constitution adopted by referendum on December 17, 1978." Verwimp (2000: 30) indicates a leftist agenda under Habyarimana: "Rwanda is a prime example of state-run, state-controlled, top-down development. All development initiatives in Rwanda were controlled by the regime, especially by the MRND party." Bonner (2018) indicates that MRND's ideology is left: "The genocide had its roots in the formation of the Parmehutu Party founded in the 1960s. That party expounded an ideology of Hutu racial supremacy and agrarian socialism...Despite this, the Parmehutu movement and its successor party, the National Republican

Movement for Democracy and Development (NRMD), found nothing but support from the United Nations and most European powers.” Childress (2015) suggests that MRND is left: “And interwoven into the MRND framework was the African socialism which Auma-Osolo and Osolo-Nasubo describe in their 1971 treatise.” (274) Macdonald (2001) suggests that Habyarimana is left: “In 1981 he made Rwanda into a one-party, socialist state.” (416) In V-Party (2020), 3 experts identify head of government party’s ideology as “Center” (0.281) in 1975, as “Center” (0.307) in 1981, as “Center” (0.274) in 1983, and as “Center” (0.206) in 1988.

Year: 1991

Head of government: Prime Minister Sylvestre Nsanzimana

Ideology: Left

Description: HoG does not identify ideology. CHISOLS does not identify head of government. *The New Times* (2014) identifies Nsanzimana’s party as MRND: “Between January 8-15, 1992, opposition parties stormed public buildings, damaged Onatracom buses, burnt car tyres to block roads in protest over the nomination of Sylvestre Nsanzimana as prime minister (from MRND).” van der Lijn (2006) suggests that the Prime Minister did not hold real power under Habyarimana’s 1991 constitution, and that Habyarimana did instead: “However, under the constitution of June 1991 real power remained with the president of the republic, Habyarimana, who controlled the army and the police. Consequently, many actions of the prime minister and his ministers were obstructed by the MRNDD.” (196) Habyarimana is coded as Left. In V-Party (2020), 3 experts identify head of government party’s ideology as “Center” (0.206) in 1988.

Year: 1992

Head of government: Prime Minister Dismas Nsengiyaremye

Ideology: Left

Description: HoG does not identify ideology. CHISOLS does not identify head of government. Lansford (2017) identifies Nsengiyaremye’s party as MDR, referring to the “expanded five-party administration headed by the MDR's Dismas NSENGIYAREMYE.” van der Lijn (2006) suggests that the Prime Minister did not hold real power under Habyarimana’s 1991 constitution, and that Habyarimana did instead: “However, under the constitution of June 1991 real power remained with the president of the republic, Habyarimana, who controlled the army and the police. Consequently, many actions of the prime minister and his ministers were obstructed by the MRNDD.” (196) Habyarimana is coded as Left.

Year: 1993

Head of government: Prime Minister Agathe Uwilingiyimana

Ideology: Left

Description: HoG does not identify ideology. CHISOLS does not identify head of government. Lansford (2017) identifies Uwilingiyimana's party as MDR, writing "Habyarimana was able in July to appoint a new coalition government of the same five internal parties, although this time with a more accommodating faction of the MDR, headed by Agathe UWILINGIYIMANA as prime minister." van der Lijn (2006) suggests that the Prime Minister did not hold real power under Habyarimana's 1991 constitution, and that Habyarimana did instead: "However, under the constitution of June 1991 real power remained with the president of the republic, Habyarimana, who controlled the army and the police. Consequently, many actions of the prime minister and his ministers were obstructed by the MRNDD." (196) Kayihura & Zukus (2014) corroborate that Uwilingiyimana did not hold real power: "She was in a politically tenuous position from the start, having been placed as more of a figurehead than someone with a significant power base. She was, in fact, what one would call a 'lame duck' or caretaker[.]" (47) Habyarimana is coded as Left.

Years: 1994

Head of government: Prime Minister Faustin Twagiramungu

Ideology: Left

Description: HoG does not identify ideology. CHISOLS does not identify head of government. Dorsey (1994: 299) identifies Twagiramungu's party as MDR: "Because of its political base, MDR was successful at the polls in September 1992. Its victory at the polls left the liberal faction in control of the party, but it was able to preserve its radical power base as well. Faustus [sic] Twagiramungu, who is perceived as a liberal, was elected president of the party." van der Lijn (2006) suggests that the Prime Minister did not hold real power under Habyarimana's 1991 constitution, and that Habyarimana did instead: "However, under the constitution of June 1991 real power remained with the president of the republic, Habyarimana, who controlled the army and the police. Consequently, many actions of the prime minister and his ministers were obstructed by the MRNDD." (196) Peace Accords Matrix (2015) corroborates that Twagiramungu did not hold real power: "As a matter of fact, a new government was named on August 31, 1995 after five Hutu ministers, including Prime Minister Twagiramungu, resigned in protest over their lack of real power." Habyarimana is coded as Left

Years: 1995 – 1999

Head of government: Prime Minister Pierre-Célestin Rwigema

Ideology: Right

Description: HoG does not identify ideology. CHISOLS does not identify head of

government. Waldorf (2011: 33) identifies Rwigema's party as MDR: "Within three months, Prime Minister Pierre- Celestin Rwigema, a Hutu from the MDR, and President Bizimungu of the RPF were also forced from office." Encyclopedia Britannica (2019) corroborates that Kagame held real power after ending the civil war: "The FPR set up a new government that had for its president a Hutu, Pasteur Bizimungu, but the real power appeared to rest with Kagame, who, at the age of 37, assumed the titles of vice president and minister of defense." Donovan (2012) corroborates that Kagame holds real power: "Since the end of the civil war in Rwanda in 1994, Paul Kagame has been the real power inside the government, operating more as a dictator than a democratically elected president." Holland (2010) corroborates that Kagame personally holds real power: "Rwanda is nominally a multiparty democracy but in practice analysts say the real power lies in the hands of Kagame." Crisafulli & Redmond (2014) suggest that Kagame is Right: "During our meetings at the presidential offices, which were simply decorated and unimposing, Kagame demonstrated his passion for private-sector development, free markets, and capitalism, which have earned him comparisons to a corporate CEO." (16) Matfess (2015) indicates that Kagame is Right: "Paul Kagame, in particular, has been praised for the opening of Rwandan markets and the liberalization of the economy. Indeed, Kagame's speeches and official statements often make him sound like a veritable Chicago Boy." (188) However, Morrock (2010) identifies Kagame as Left: "Although he had trained at the U.S. Army General Staff College, RPA commander Paul Kagame had leftist leanings." (68)

Years: 2000 – 2010

Head of government: Prime Minister Bernard Makuza

Ideology: Right

Description: HoG does not identify ideology. CHISOLS does not identify head of government. East and Thomas (2003: 437) identify Makuza's party as MDR: "Bernard Makuza, who was born on 30 September 1961, is a member of the Hutu-dominated Democratic Republican Movement (Mouvement Démocratique Républicain—MDR)." Refugee Law Project (2011) suggests that Habumuremyi does not hold real power, and rather that Kagame does: "Habumuremyi Pierre Damien: the current Prime Minister, a Hutu. He ostensibly occupies the 2<sup>nd</sup> most powerful position in Rwandan government. Like his predecessor, Mr. Benard MAKUZA, HABUMUREMYI defers in all matter, small and great, to General Kagame." (10) Holland (2010) indicates that Kagame personally holds real power: "Rwanda is nominally a multiparty democracy but in practice analysts say the real power lies in the hands of Kagame." Crisafulli & Redmond (2014) suggest that Kagame is Right: "During our meetings at the presidential offices, which were simply decorated and unimposing, Kagame demonstrated his passion for private-

sector development, free markets, and capitalism, which have earned him comparisons to a corporate CEO.” (16) Matfess (2015) indicates that Kagame is Right: “Paul Kagame, in particular, has been praised for the opening of Rwandan markets and the liberalization of the economy. Indeed, Kagame’s speeches and official statements often make him sound like a veritable Chicago Boy.” (188) However, Morrock (2010) identifies Kagame as Left: “Although he had trained at the U.S. Army General Staff College, RPA commander Paul Kagame had leftist leanings.” (68)

Years: 2011 – 2013

Head of government: Prime Minister Pierre Damien Habumuremyi

Ideology: Right

Description: HoG does not identify ideology. CHISOLS does not identify head of government. Lansford (2017) identifies Habumuremyi’s party as FPR/RPF, writing “Anastase MUREKEZI (Social Democratic Party); appointed by the president on July 23, 2014, to replace Pierre Damien HABUMUREMYI (Rwandan Patriotic Front).” Twagiramungu (2016) suggests that FPR does not have an economic ideology: “First, unlike what the much-vaunted from-Marxism-to-Neo-liberalism metamorphosis may suggest, NRM and RPF have excelled, on their roads to and exercise of power, in the art of mastering, embracing, and generally paying lip service to any ideology in tune with their ad-hoc needs, interests and positions. Their respective skills and abilities to work hand in hand with Chinese Communists, Russian Marxists and anti-Western leaders like Muammar Qaddafi and Fidel Castro, and then manage to win the hearts and generous funds of both Western conservative regimes, like Thatcher’s government in Britain and Reagan’s government in the US; and their counterparts, the Liberal governments, like Blair’s and Clinton’s, underscore this point.” Refugee Law Project (2011) suggests that Habumuremyi does not hold real power, and rather that Kagame does: “Habumuremyi Pierre Damien: the current Prime Minister, a Hutu. He ostensibly occupies the 2<sup>nd</sup> most powerful position in Rwandan government. Like his predecessor, Mr. Benard MAKUZA, HABUMUREMYI defers in all matter, small and great, to General Kagame.” (10) Holland (2010) indicates that Kagame personally holds real power: “Rwanda is nominally a multiparty democracy but in practice analysts say the real power lies in the hands of Kagame.” Crisafulli & Redmond (2014) suggest that Kagame is Right: “During our meetings at the presidential offices, which were simply decorated and unimposing, Kagame demonstrated his passion for private-sector development, free markets, and capitalism, which have earned him comparisons to a corporate CEO.” (16) Matfess (2015) indicates that Kagame is Right: “Paul Kagame, in particular, has been praised for the opening of Rwandan markets and the liberalization of the economy. Indeed, Kagame’s speeches and

official statements often make him sound like a veritable Chicago Boy.” (188) However, Morrock (2010) identifies Kagame as Left: “Although he had trained at the U.S. Army General Staff College, RPA commander Paul Kagame had leftist leanings.” (68) World Statesmen (2020) identifies Habumuremyi’s ideology as leftist, writing “Pierre Damien Habumuremyi... FPR... FPR = Front Patriotique Rwandais (Rwandan Patriotic Front, social-democratic”. In V-Party (2020), 4 experts identify head of government party’s ideology as “Center” (-0.008) in 2008 and as “Center” (0.01) in 2013.

Years: 2014 – 2016

Head of government: Prime Minister Anastase Murekezi

Ideology: left

Description: HoG does not identify ideology. CHISOLS does not identify head of government. Lansford (2017) identifies Murekezi’s party as PSD, writing “Anastase MUREKEZI (Social Democratic Party); appointed by the president on July 23, 2014, to replace Pierre Damien HABUMUREMYI (Rwandan Patriotic Front).” DPI identifies PSD as left. Political Handbook of the World does not provide any information on party’s ideology. Perspective Monde (2020) identifies Nurekezi as left. In the Global Party Survey 2019, 5 experts identify the average left-right (0-10) score of Social Democratic Party (PSD) as 3.3. World Statesmen (2020) identifies Murekezi’s ideology as leftist, writing “Anastase Murekezi... PSD... PSD = Parti Social Démocrate (Social Democratic Party, social democratic, center-left”. In V-Party (2020), 4 experts identify head of government party’s ideology as “Center-left” (-1.268) in 2013.

Year: 2017-2019

Head of government: Prime Minister Edouard Ngirente

Ideology: Left

Description: HoG does not identify ideology. CHISOLS does not identify head of government. Perspective monde (2019) indicates that Ngirente’s party is PSD and that PSD is left. DPI also identifies PSD as left. Political Handbook of the World does not provide any information on party’s ideology. In the Global Party Survey 2019, 5 experts identify the average left-right (0-10) score of Social Democratic Party (PSD) as 3.3. World Statesmen (2020) identifies Ngirente’s ideology as leftist, writing “Édouard Ngirente... PSD... PSD = Parti Social Démocrate (Social Democratic Party, social democratic, center-left”. In V-Party (2020), 4 experts identify head of government party’s ideology as “Center-left” (-1.268) in 2013 and as “Center-left” (-1.201) in 2018.

## References:

Bonner, Michael. "The Lessons of Rwanda Seem Lost on Canadians." *Troy Media*, March 21, 2018. <https://troymedia.com/2018/03/21/lessons-rwanda-genocide-mugesera/>.

Schemmel, B, ed. "Index: Ka." Rulers.org. Accessed August 19, 2019. <http://rulers.org/indexk1.html>.

Childress, Stephen E. "From Revolution To Ruin: A Preliminary Look at Rwandas First Two Presidents, Grégoire Kayibanda and Juvénal Habyarimana, and Their Administrations." PhD diss., University of Missouri-Kansas City, 2015.

Crisafulli, Patricia, and Andrea Redmond. *Rwanda, Inc: How a Devastated Nation Became an Economic Model for the Developing World*. Basingstoke, Hampshire: Palgrave Macmillan, 2014.

Donovan, Daniel. "The U.S. Maintains a Mediocre Record of Promoting Democracy in Africa." Foreign Policy Blogs. Foreign Policy Asociation, November 2, 2012. <https://foreignpolicyblogs.com/2012/11/02/the-u-s-maintains-a-mediocre-record-of-promoting-democracy-in-africa/>.

Dorsey, Learthen. 1994. *Historical Dictionary of Rwanda*. African Historical Dictionaries. Metuchen, NJ: Scarecrow Press.

East, Roger, and Richard Thomas. 2003. *Profiles of People in Power : The World's Government Leaders*. London: Routledge.

Holland, Hereward. "Rwanda Says Genocide Law Fair, Not Stifling Opposition." Reuters Africa. Thomson Reuters, February 19, 2010. <https://af.reuters.com/article/topNews/idAFJOE61I09B20100219>.

Kayihura, Edouard, and Kerry Zukus. *Inside the Hotel Rwanda: the Surprising True Story ... and Why It Matters Today*. Dallas, TX: BenBella Books, 2014.

Macdonald, Fiona. *Peoples of Africa, Volume 8*. Vol. 8. New York: Marshall Cavendish, 2001.

Matfess, Hilary. "Rwanda and Ethiopia: Developmental Authoritarianism and the New Politics of African Strong Men." *African Studies Review* 58, no. 2 (2015): 181–204. <https://doi.org/10.1017/asr.2015.43>.

Morrock, Richard. *The Psychology of Genocide and Violent Oppression: A Study of Mass Cruelty from Nazi Germany to Rwanda*. Jefferson, N.C: McFarland & Co, 2010.

Norris, Pippa. 2020. Global Party Survey dataset. <https://dataverse.harvard.edu/dataverse/GlobalPartySurvey>

"Parties and Manipulation of Youth in the Genocide." *The New Times*, May 28, 2014.

"Paul Kagame." In *Encyclopædia Britannica*. Chicago, IL: Encyclopædia Britannica, inc., 2019.

Peace Accords Matrix. "Powersharing Transitional Government: Arusha Accord - 4 August 1993." Database. Kroc Institute for International Peace Studies, University of Notre Dame. 2015.

Perspective monde. 2019. *Rwanda, dirigeants politiques*.  
<http://perspective.usherbrooke.ca/bilan/servlet/BMGvt?codePays=RWA>

Political Handbook of the World Online Edition. 2018. *Various entries*.  
<https://library.cqpress.com/phw>.

Refugee Law Project. "Petition of Rwandan Refugees and Asylum Seekers Living in Uganda to UNHCR Over the Premature and Ungrounded Invocation of the Cessation Clause." *Makerere University*, 2011.

Twagiramungu, Noel. "Embracing Neo-Liberalism in Uganda and Rwanda." In *African Frontiers: Insurgency, Governance and Peacebuilding in Post-Colonial States*. London: Ashgate, 2016.

Verwimp, Philip. "Development Ideology, the Peasantry and Genocide: Rwanda Represented in Habyarimanas Speeches." *Journal of Genocide Research*, vol. 2, no. 3, 2000, pp. 325–361., doi:10.1080/713677617.



van der Lijn Jaïr. *Walking the Tightrope: Do UN Peacekeeping Operations Actually Contribute to Durable Peace?* Amsterdam: Rozenberg Publishers, 2006.

Waldorf, Lars. "Instrumentalizing Genocide: The RPF's Campaign against 'Genocide Ideology.'" In *Remaking Rwanda: State Building and Human Rights after Mass Violence*, edited by Scott Straus and Lars Waldorf, 48-66. Madison, WI: University of Wisconsin Press, 2011.

World Statesmen. 2020. Rwanda. [www.worldstatesmen.org/Rwanda.htm](http://www.worldstatesmen.org/Rwanda.htm)