

Country: Kazakhstan

Years: 1990-2018

Leader: Nursultan Nazarbayev

Ideology: left

Description: CHISOLS identifies Nazarbayev's party affiliation as none from 1991 to 1994, PUKU from 1995 to 1998, and Nur-Otan from 1998 to 2018. World Statesmen (2019) identifies the party as Communist Party of Kazakhstan (KPK) from 1990-1991. Manzano (2017) identifies ideology as leftist. DPI identifies Otan's ideology as rightist. Political Handbook of the World does not provide any information on the party's ideology. Almaty-Club (2016:10) writes that "the administrative measures employed during [Otan's] establishment were prioritized over the ideological platform, as a consequence of which the party members found themselves heavily dependent on the president and were deprived of all political autonomy. It is logical that the party still stands by its centrist position to this day, which is characteristic of many state-subsidized parties in the post-Soviet landscape". In the Global Party Survey 2019, 4 experts identify the average left-right (0-10) score of the Nur Otan (NO) as 5. Frye (2010: 67) writes that "one difficult case is Nursultan Nazarbayev in Kazakhstan" but "given Nazarbayev's occupational past and his constituency within the party and state apparatus, it is best to categorize Nazarbayev as old left." In V-Party (2020) 3 experts identify head of government party's ideology as "Left" (-3.352) in 1999, "Center" (0.072) in 1995, "Center" (0.078) in 2004, "Center" (-0.142) in 2007, "Center" (0.084) in 2012, and "Center" (0.084) in 2016. In V-Party (2020), 3 experts identify leader party's cohesion as "almost complete disagreement" in 1999, "negligible visible disagreement" in 1995, 2004, 2007, and 2012. DPI identifies Otan as rightist. Isaacs (2013) writes, "*Nur Otan*'s close relationship with its patron, the President of Kazakhstan [Nazarbayev], illustrates that the dividing line between what we understand as formal and informal is not so clear cut. *Nur Otan* is a party which lacks agency from the personalized rule of Nazarbayev and its preeminent position in Kazakh party politics stems from the informal preference it receives due to this position. . . Nazarbayev presides over a political system where personal loyalty is fundamental. . . in effect, it is the person of the president which is important, not the impersonal office of the presidency. . . power and decision making neither lies with the party nor with the legislature but with the presidential administration," and "*Nur Otan* does not possess the autonomy or agency to offer policy concessions to opposition elites. . . the party as a formal institution exists to institutionalise elite support for the president and to mitigate the unstable effects of competition between informal political networks."

Years: 2019-2020

Leader: Kasym-Zhomart Kemelevich Tokayev

Ideology:

Description: World Statesmen (2021) identifies Tokayev's party as Nur Otan. Reuters (2019) identifies Tokayev's party as Nur Otan, writing, "Nazarbayev, who leads the oil-rich Central Asian nation's biggest political party, Nur Otan, asked party members at a pre-election congress on Tuesday to officially nominate Tokayev, a 65-year-old former diplomat." DPI identifies Otan as rightist.

#### References:

- Frye, Timothy. 2010. *Building States and Markets after Communism: The Perils of Polarized Democracy*. Cambridge.
- Ibraimov, Tamerlan. 2016. "Central Asia: The 'Silk Democracy' Region, Political Parties". Almaty-Club.
- Isaacs, Rico. 2013. "Nur Otan, Informal Networks and the Countering of Elite Instability in Kazakhstan: Bringing the 'Formal' Back In." *Europe-Asia Studies*, 65, no. 6 (2013): 1055-1079. <https://www.jstor.org/stable/26593824>.
- Manzano, Dulce. 2017. *Bringing Down the Educational Wall: Political Regimes, Ideology, and the Expansion of Education*. Cambridge.
- Mattes, Michaela, Leeds, Brett, and Naoko Matsumura. 2016. Measuring change in source of leader support: The CHISOLS dataset. *Journal of Peace Research* 53(2): 259-267.
- Norris, Pippa. 2020. Global Party Survey dataset. <https://dataverse.harvard.edu/dataverse/GlobalPartySurvey>
- Reuters Staff. 2019. "Kazakhstan's Tokayev gets veteran leader's backing for presidency." *Reuters*. April 23, 2019. <https://www.reuters.com/article/us-kazakhstan-president-election/kazakhstans-tokayev-gets-veteran-leaders-backing-for-presidency-idUSKCN1RZ0DY>