

Country: India

Years: 1947-1963

Head of government: Pandit Jawaharlal Nehru

Ideology: left

Description: HoG does not identify ideology. CHISOLS identifies party affiliation as Indian National Congress (INC). DPI identifies INC's ideology as left. In the Global Party Survey 2019, 43 experts identify the average left-right (0-10) score of Indian National Congress (INC) as 4.6. Political Handbook of the World (2015) identifies Nehru's ideology as leftist, writing "Nehru enunciated India's basic principles of democracy, secularism, socialism, and nonalignment." Perspective monde (2020) identifies Nehru's ideology as centrist, writing "Jawaharlal Nehru | 1947 (15 août) | 1964 (27 mai) | Congrès national indien | [...] | Centre." World Statesmen (2020) identifies Nehru's party as INC, and INC's ideology as leftist, writing "15 Aug 1947 - 27 May 1964 Jawaharlal Nehru (s.a.) INC" and "INC = Indian National Congress ("Congress Party", populist, social-democratic, est.1885)." The leftist Socialist International (2020) identifies Indian National Congress as one of its members. Encyclopaedia Britannica identifies Nehru's ideology as leftist, writing: "Nehru's real interest in Marxism and his socialist pattern of thought stemmed from that tour... from then on, the yardstick of his economic thinking remained Marxist, adjusted, where necessary, to Indian conditions." In V-Party (2020), 7 experts identify head of government party's ideology as "Center-left" (-0.683) in 1971. Gupta (2021) writes "Indian politics, generally since 1947 but particularly since Indira Gandhi's hard Left-turn in 1969, has been unipolar economically. First, Nehru serendipitously got rid of the Right in his party... There was little scope left for an ideological polarisation in India's political economy. It was essentially a challenge of which side could be more socialist... For five decades, each side fired at the other from its own socialist trenches. Meanwhile, they all talked of reform. Reform with a human touch, inclusive reform, reform with a socialist flavour".

Years: 1964-1965

Head of government: Lal Bahadur Shastri

Ideology: left

Description: HoG does not identify ideology. CHISOLS identifies party affiliation as Indian National Congress (INC). DPI identifies INC's ideology as left. Perspective monde (2020) identifies Shastri's ideology as centrist, writing "Lal Bahadur Shastri | 1964 (2 juin) | 1966 (11 janvier) | Congrès national indien | [...] | Centre." In the Global Party Survey 2019, 43 experts identify the average left-right

(0-10) score of Indian National Congress (INC) as 4.6. World Statesmen (2020) identifies Shastri's party as INC, and INC's ideology as leftist, writing " 9 Jun 1964 - 11 Jan 1966 Lal Bahadur Shastri (b. 1904 - d. 1966) INC " and "INC = Indian National Congress ("Congress Party", populist, social-democratic, est.1885)." The leftist Socialist International (2020) identifies Indian National Congress as one of its members. World Encyclopedia identifies INC's ideology as leftist, writing "Until Rao's economic reforms of 1991, Congress (I) had espoused moderate socialism and a planned mixed economy aimed a rapid economic growth, self-sufficiency, and industrialisation." In V-Party (2020), 7 experts identify head of government party's ideology as "Center-left" (-0.683) in 1971. Gupta (2021) writes "Indian politics, generally since 1947 but particularly since Indira Gandhi's hard Left-turn in 1969, has been unipolar economically. First, Nehru serendipitously got rid of the Right in his party... There was little scope left for an ideological polarisation in India's political economy. It was essentially a challenge of which side could be more socialist... For five decades, each side fired at the other from its own socialist trenches. Meanwhile, they all talked of reform. Reform with a human touch, inclusive reform, reform with a socialist flavour".

Years: 1966-1976

Head of government: Indira Priyadarshini Gandhi

Ideology: left

Description: HoG does not identify ideology. CHISOLS identifies party affiliation as Indian National Congress (INC). DPI identifies INC's ideology as left.

Perspective monde (2020) identifies Gandhi's ideology as centrist, writing "Indira Gandhi | 1966 (19 janvier) | 1977 (24 mars) | Congrès national indien | [...] |

Centre." In the Global Party Survey 2019, 43 experts identify the average left-right (0-10) score of Indian National Congress (INC) as 4.6. World Statesmen (2020) identifies Gandhi's party as INC, and INC's ideology as leftist, writing "19 Jan 1966 - 24 Mar 1977 Indira Priyadarshini Gandhi (f) (b. 1917 - d. 1984) INC " and "INC = Indian National Congress ("Congress Party", populist, social-democratic, est.1885)." The leftist Socialist International (2020) identifies Indian National Congress as one of its members. Encyclopaedia Britannica suggests that Gandhi's ideology was centrist, writing: "Gandhi was named leader of the Congress Party—and thus also became prime minister—in a compromise between the party's right and left wings." World Encyclopedia identifies INC's ideology as leftist, writing "Until Rao's economic reforms of 1991, Congress (I) had espoused moderate socialism and a planned mixed economy aimed a rapid economic growth, self-sufficiency, and industrialisation." In V-Party (2020), 7 experts identify head of government party's ideology as "Center-left" (-0.683) in 1971. Gupta (2021) identifies Gandhi's ideology as leftist, writing "Indian politics, generally since

1947 but particularly since Indira Gandhi's hard Left-turn in 1969, has been unipolar economically. First, Nehru serendipitously got rid of the Right in his party, and then his daughter carried out a full purge. In the same period, using her brand of social-populism soaked in nationalism, she destroyed the one opposition party of the libertarian Right, Swatantra. Her most vocal rivals since were also various socialists, Lohiaites and Communists... There was little scope left for an ideological polarisation in India's political economy. It was essentially a challenge of which side could be more socialist... For five decades, each side fired at the other from its own socialist trenches. Meanwhile, they all talked of reform. Reform with a human touch, inclusive reform, reform with a socialist flavour. Mostly reform by stealth." Funke et al. (2020) identifies Gandhi as a "left-wing populist". Jaffrelot and Tillin (2017) write "Mrs Gandhi hijacked socialism by claiming "Indira is India"... Things changed in the 1960s, primarily because of the political strategy of Indira Gandhi, whose version of populism took a left-leaning, socialist hue."

Years: 1977-1978

Head of government: Morarji Ranchhodji Desai

Ideology: right

Description: HoG does not identify ideology. CHISOLS identifies party affiliation as Janata Party (JP). DPI identifies JP's ideology as left. The Political Handbook (2015) however, writes "the Janata Dal (People's Party) formed the core of a seven-party centrist National Front—NF (Rashtriya Morcha) alliance".

Perspective monde (2020) identifies Desai's ideology as centrist: "Morarji Desai | 1977 (24 mars) | 1979 (28 juillet) | Parti du peuple (Janata Party) | [...] | Centre." In V-Party (2020), 7 experts identify head of government party's ideology as "Center-right" (0.8) in 1977. Gupta (2021) identifies Gandhi's ideology as leftist, writing "Indian politics, generally since 1947 but particularly since Indira Gandhi's hard Left-turn in 1969, has been unipolar economically. First, Nehru serendipitously got rid of the Right in his party, and then his daughter carried out a full purge. In the same period, using her brand of social-populism soaked in nationalism, she destroyed the one opposition party of the libertarian Right, Swatantra. Her most vocal rivals since were also various socialists, Lohiaites and Communists... There was little scope left for an ideological polarisation in India's political economy. It was essentially a challenge of which side could be more socialist... For five decades, each side fired at the other from its own socialist trenches. Meanwhile, they all talked of reform. Reform with a human touch, inclusive reform, reform with a socialist flavour. Mostly reform by stealth." Bradlee (1977) writes "Desai said tonight that the four groups that came together to form the People's Party would formally merge soon. The four are the Opposition Congress Party, a splinter

of the ruling Congress Party; the Indian People's Party, the Hindu nationalist Jan Sangh Party and the Socialists. All but the Socialists have been regarded as being to the right of center, but ideological lines have blurred in India particularly since the declaration of a state of emergency in June 1975.” Asian Affairs (1977) writes “Morarji Desai, for all his Gandhian asceticism and his appeal to preindustrial Indian village values, is a believer in liberal Western capitalism. He and his Finance Minister, H. M. Patel, a former Indian Civil Service officer under the British, were well-known for their opposition to the march toward state capitalism which Nehru embarked upon in the 1950s, and his daughter perpetuated. Desai and his main supporters, including Jayaprakash Narayan and J. B. Kripalani, represent the liberal capitalist mood of Bombay.”

Years: 1979

Head of government: Choudhary Charan Singh

Ideology: right

Description: HoG does not identify ideology. CHISOLS identifies party affiliation as Indian National Congress - Organization (INC-O). However, Perspective monde identifies party affiliation as Janata Party (secular), writing “Charan Singh | 1979 (28 juillet) | 1980 (14 janvier) | Janata Party (séculier).” DPI identifies INC’s ideology as left. In the Global Party Survey 2019, 43 experts identify the average left-right (0-10) score of Indian National Congress (INC) as 4.6. The leftist Socialist International (2020) identifies Indian National Congress as one of its members. Perspective monde identifies the ideology of INC as centrist, writing: “Congrès national indien | [...] | Centre.” World Encyclopedia identifies INC’s ideology as leftist, writing “Until Rao’s economic reforms of 1991, Congress (I) had espoused moderate socialism and a planned mixed economy aimed a rapid economic growth, self-sufficiency, and industrialisation.” In V-Party (2020), 7 experts identify head of government party’s ideology as “Center-right” (0.619) in 1971 with “Some visible disagreement”. World Statesmen (2020) writes “JP-S” is “JP-S = Janata Party-Secular (anti-INC-I, split from JP, est.1979)” where INC-I is “INC-I = Congress Party-Indira (INC Indira Gandhi faction, populist, socialist, split from INC, 1977-1996)”. Britannica (2020b) writes “In 1977 he [Singh] allied his peasant- and agricultural-based Indian Revolutionary Party with the Janata Party of Morarji Desai and subsequently served as minister of home affairs (1977–78) and deputy prime minister (1979) in Desai’s coalition government. Factional quarreling broke apart the Janata coalition in 1979, and in July of that year Singh became prime minister with the support of his former political enemy, Indira Gandhi, who had imprisoned him during the state of emergency of 1975–77. Within a month Gandhi withdrew her support from Singh, who thenceforth headed a caretaker government until Gandhi was returned to power in the elections of

January 1980.” Gupta (2021) identifies Gandhi’s ideology as leftist, writing “Indian politics, generally since 1947 but particularly since Indira Gandhi’s hard Left-turn in 1969, has been unipolar economically. First, Nehru serendipitously got rid of the Right in his party, and then his daughter carried out a full purge. In the same period, using her brand of social-populism soaked in nationalism, she destroyed the one opposition party of the libertarian Right, Swatantra. Her most vocal rivals since were also various socialists, Lohiaites and Communists... There was little scope left for an ideological polarisation in India’s political economy. It was essentially a challenge of which side could be more socialist... For five decades, each side fired at the other from its own socialist trenches. Meanwhile, they all talked of reform. Reform with a human touch, inclusive reform, reform with a socialist flavour. Mostly reform by stealth.” Brass (1993) writes “Although Charan Singh's economic ideas are complex and scholarly, he did not present them for the edification of economists. In fact, he several times condensed them and presented them as the central sections of the manifestoes of the political parties he led. As such, these manifestoes are by far the most sophisticated ever issued in India... [including] Lok Dal, *Election Manifesto*, 1979.” According to the “Lok Dal Election Manifesto 1979”, “the Lok Dal does not believe either in a system under which individuals enjoy an unrestricted freedom to exploit the economic needs of other or under which the state possesses an unlimited and absolute power to curb or take away the economic freedom of an entire people... The Lok Dal believes in the middle... this is the only way to steer clear of the evils of private capitalism, on one hand, and state capitalism, on the other”.

Years: 1980-1983

Head of government: Indira Priyadarshini Gandhi

Ideology: left

Description: HoG does not identify ideology. CHISOLS identifies party affiliation as Indian National Congress - Requisitionist (INC-R/INC-I). DPI identifies INC’s ideology as left. Perspective monde (2020) identifies Gandhi’s ideology as centrist, writing “Indira Gandhi | 1980 (14 janvier) | 1984 (31 octobre) | Congrès national indien (Indira) | [...] | Centre.” In the Global Party Survey 2019, 43 experts identify the average left-right (0-10) score of Indian National Congress (INC) as 4.6. World Statesmen (2020) identifies Gandhi's party as INC, and INC's ideology as leftist, writing "14 Jan 1980 - 31 Oct 1984 Indira Priyadarshini Gandhi (f) (s.a.) INC-I" and "INC = Indian National Congress ("Congress Party", populist, social-democratic, est.1885)." The leftist Socialist International (2020) identifies Indian National Congress as one of its members. Encyclopaedia Britannica suggests that Gandhi’s ideology was centrist, writing: “Gandhi was named leader of the Congress Party—and thus also became prime minister—in a compromise between

the party's right and left wings." World Encyclopedia identifies INC's ideology as leftist, writing "Until Rao's economic reforms of 1991, Congress (I) had espoused moderate socialism and a planned mixed economy aimed a rapid economic growth, self-sufficiency, and industrialisation." In V-Party (2020), 7 experts identify head of government party's ideology as "Center" (-0.157) in 1980 with "Some visible disagreement". Gupta (2021) identifies Gandhi's ideology as leftist, writing "Indian politics, generally since 1947 but particularly since Indira Gandhi's hard Left-turn in 1969, has been unipolar economically. First, Nehru serendipitously got rid of the Right in his party, and then his daughter carried out a full purge. In the same period, using her brand of social-populism soaked in nationalism, she destroyed the one opposition party of the libertarian Right, Swatantra. Her most vocal rivals since were also various socialists, Lohiaites and Communists... There was little scope left for an ideological polarisation in India's political economy. It was essentially a challenge of which side could be more socialist... For five decades, each side fired at the other from its own socialist trenches. Meanwhile, they all talked of reform. Reform with a human touch, inclusive reform, reform with a socialist flavour. Mostly reform by stealth." Funke et al. (2020) identifies Gandhi as a "left-wing populist". Jaffrelot and Tillin (2017) write "Mrs Gandhi hijacked socialism by claiming "Indira is India"... Things changed in the 1960s, primarily because of the political strategy of Indira Gandhi, whose version of populism took a left-leaning, socialist hue."

Years: 1984-1988

Head of government: Rajiv Gandhi

Ideology: left

Description: HoG does not identify ideology. CHISOLS identifies party affiliation as Indian National Congress - Requisitionist (INC-R/INC-I). DPI identifies INC's ideology as left. Perspective monde (2020) identifies Gandhi's ideology as centrist, writing "Rajiv Gandhi | 1984 (31 octobre) | 1989 (2 décembre) | Congrès national indien (Indira) | [...] | Centre." In the Global Party Survey 2019, 43 experts identify the average left-right (0-10) score of Indian National Congress (INC) as 4.6. World Statesmen (2020) identifies Gandhi's party as INC-I, and INC-I's ideology as leftist, writing "31 Oct 1984 - 2 Dec 1989 Rajiv Gandhi (b. 1944 - d. 1991) INC-I" and "INC = Indian National Congress ("Congress Party", populist, social-democratic, est.1885)." The leftist Socialist International (2020) identifies Indian National Congress as one of its members. World Encyclopedia identifies INC's ideology as leftist, writing "Until Rao's economic reforms of 1991, Congress (I) had espoused moderate socialism and a planned mixed economy aimed a rapid economic growth, self-sufficiency, and industrialisation." In V-Party (2020), 7 experts identify head of government party's ideology as "Center" (-0.157) in 1984

with “Some visible disagreement”. Gupta (2021) identifies Gandhi’s ideology as leftist, writing “Indian politics, generally since 1947 but particularly since Indira Gandhi’s hard Left-turn in 1969, has been unipolar economically. First, Nehru serendipitously got rid of the Right in his party, and then his daughter carried out a full purge. In the same period, using her brand of social-populism soaked in nationalism, she destroyed the one opposition party of the libertarian Right, Swatantra. Her most vocal rivals since were also various socialists, Lohiaites and Communists... There was little scope left for an ideological polarisation in India’s political economy. It was essentially a challenge of which side could be more socialist... For five decades, each side fired at the other from its own socialist trenches. Meanwhile, they all talked of reform. Reform with a human touch, inclusive reform, reform with a socialist flavour. Mostly reform by stealth.”

Years: 1989

Head of government: Vishwanath Pratap Singh

Ideology: left

Description: HoG does not identify ideology. CHISOLS identifies party affiliation as National Front - Janata Dal (NF-JD). DPI identifies National Front’s and Janata Dal’s ideology as left. The Political Handbook (2015) however, writes “the Janata Dal (People’s Party) formed the core of a seven-party centrist National Front—NF (Rashtriya Morcha) alliance”. Perspective monde (2020) identifies Singh’s ideology as centrist, writing “Vishwanath Pratap Singh | 1989 (2 décembre) | 1990 (10 novembre) | Parti du peuple (Janata Dal) | [...] | Centre.” World Statesmen (2020) identifies Singh's party as JD, and JD's ideology as leftist, writing "2 Dec 1989 - 10 Nov 1990 Vishwanath Pratap Singh (b. 1931 - d. 2008) JD" and "JD = Janata Dal (People's Party, social-democratic, 1988-2004, merged with SP as JD-U)." Encyclopedia Britannica identifies Janata Dal’s ideology as centrist, writing “Singh was the principal founder in 1988 of the Janata Dal (JD), a merger of three small centrist opposition parties.” In V-Party (2020), 7 experts identify head of government party’s ideology as “Center” (0.348) in 1989 with “A high level of visible disagreement”. Gupta (2021) identifies Gandhi’s ideology as leftist, writing “Indian politics, generally since 1947 but particularly since Indira Gandhi’s hard Left-turn in 1969, has been unipolar economically. First, Nehru serendipitously got rid of the Right in his party, and then his daughter carried out a full purge. In the same period, using her brand of social-populism soaked in nationalism, she destroyed the one opposition party of the libertarian Right, Swatantra. Her most vocal rivals since were also various socialists, Lohiaites and Communists... There was little scope left for an ideological polarisation in India’s political economy. It was essentially a challenge of which side could be more socialist... For five decades, each side fired at the other from its own socialist trenches. Meanwhile,

they all talked of reform. Reform with a human touch, inclusive reform, reform with a socialist flavour. Mostly reform by stealth.” Ghosh (1986) writes “The Finance Minister has, through the last two budgets, given a clear, undoubtedly rightist slant to the present government's economic policies. This is not a mere matter of individual value judgment. The Finance Minister may not himself deny this, except that he is likely to say that he is a pragmatist rather than an armchair socialist. But there is no denying the unmistakable bias in all economic policies in favour of the affluent sections of the population. And in a country where a large section of the people lives in conditions of abject poverty, this is a definite minus point, and a long-term liability even for the government. Any policy that may lead to increased social tensions can be stated to be undesirable, no matter what one's political philosophy is. Indeed, such a policy is likely to be counter-productive in the sense that it may not subserve the ends for which it has been devised. The Finance Minister has, of course, claimed on several occasions to be pragmatic rather than doctrinaire in his approach. One might infer from this statement that V P Singh's is a pragmatic leftist policy. Unfortunately, the Finance Minister has given no indication of any leftist bias in any of his overt action... It is not that V P Singh's is necessarily anti-Plan; perhaps he just does not care. Perhaps this is part of his overall approach, and reflects his innate Hayekian frame of mind. He appears to be more concerned with providing stimuli to private initiative and enterprise”. India Today (1987) writes “V.P. Singh implemented Rajiv's tax policies so effectively that he should go down in modern Indian history as the most rightist finance minister of them all. Both, it must be remembered, were criticised at a 1985 session of the All India Congress(I) Committee, when there was vociferous criticism from party delegates because the economic resolution did not once mention the word 'socialism'. Indeed, if there was ever a period when leftism took a back seat in Indian politics, it was when the Rajiv-Singh duo was riding high in '85 and most of '86... V.P. Singh did one better, hastily summoning a press conference to declare that the left parties were his "natural allies" and that he was going to "build bridges" with them. At another press conference, Singh confessed to having seen the light of leftism some time ago”.

Years: 1990

Head of government: Chandra Shekhar

Ideology: left

Description: HoG does not identify ideology. CHISOLS identifies party affiliation as Janata Dal - Secular (JD-S). DPI identifies JD-S's ideology as left. Perspective monde (2020) identifies Shekhar's ideology as leftist, writing “Chandra Shekhar | 1990 (10 novembre) | 1991 (21 juin) | Samajwadi Janata Party (Rashtriya) | [...] | Gauche moderee.” Gupta (2021) identifies Gandhi's ideology as leftist, writing

“Indian politics, generally since 1947 but particularly since Indira Gandhi’s hard Left-turn in 1969, has been unipolar economically. First, Nehru serendipitously got rid of the Right in his party, and then his daughter carried out a full purge. In the same period, using her brand of social-populism soaked in nationalism, she destroyed the one opposition party of the libertarian Right, Swatantra. Her most vocal rivals since were also various socialists, Lohiaites and Communists... There was little scope left for an ideological polarisation in India’s political economy. It was essentially a challenge of which side could be more socialist... For five decades, each side fired at the other from its own socialist trenches. Meanwhile, they all talked of reform. Reform with a human touch, inclusive reform, reform with a socialist flavour. Mostly reform by stealth.”

Years: 1991-1995

Head of government: Pamulaparthi Venkata Narasimha Rao

Ideology: center

Description: HoG does not identify ideology. CHISOLS identifies party affiliation as Indian National Congress - Requisitionist (INC-R/INC-I). DPI identifies INC’s ideology as left. Perspective monde (2020) identifies Rao’s ideology as centrist, writing “Ramulaparti Venkata Narasimha Rao | 1991 (21 juin) | 1996 (16 mai) | Congrès national indien (Indira) | [...] | Centre.” In the Global Party Survey 2019, 43 experts identify the average left-right (0-10) score of Indian National Congress (INC) as 4.6. World Statesmen (2020) identifies Rao's party as INC, and INC's ideology as leftist, writing "21 Jun 1991 - 16 May 1996 Pamulaparthi Venkata Narasimha Rao (b. 1921 - d. 2004) INC" and "INC = Indian National Congress ("Congress Party", populist, social-democratic, est.1885)." The leftist Socialist International (2020) identifies Indian National Congress as one of its members. Encyclopedia of the World suggests that Rao’s ideology is rightist, writing “Until Rao’s economic reforms of 1991, Congress (I) had espoused moderate socialism and a planned mixed economy aimed a rapid economic growth, self-sufficiency, and industrialisation. It now supports liberalisation, deregulation, privatisation, and opening up of the Indiana economy to foreign direct investment and trade.” In V-Party (2020), 7 experts identify head of government party’s ideology as “Center” (-0.003) in 1991 with “Some visible disagreement”. Gupta (2021) identifies Gandhi’s ideology as leftist, writing “Indian politics, generally since 1947 but particularly since Indira Gandhi’s hard Left-turn in 1969, has been unipolar economically. First, Nehru serendipitously got rid of the Right in his party, and then his daughter carried out a full purge. In the same period, using her brand of social-populism soaked in nationalism, she destroyed the one opposition party of the libertarian Right, Swatantra. Her most vocal rivals since were also various socialists, Lohiaites and Communists... There was little scope left for an

ideological polarisation in India's political economy. It was essentially a challenge of which side could be more socialist... For five decades, each side fired at the other from its own socialist trenches. Meanwhile, they all talked of reform. Reform with a human touch, inclusive reform, reform with a socialist flavour. Mostly reform by stealth."

Years: 1996

Head of government: Haradanahalli Dodde Gowda Deve

Ideology: center

Description: HoG does not identify ideology. CHISOLS identifies party affiliation as United Front - Janata Dal (UF-JD). *Political Handbook of the World* (2015: 636) identifies party affiliation as Janata Dal (JD): "'The president then turned to the UF, which had selected the Karnataka chief minister, H. D. DEVE GOWDA (Janata Dal)." DPI identifies JD's ideology as left. The Political Handbook (2015) however, writes "the Janata Dal (People's Party) formed the core of a seven-party centrist National Front—NF (Rashtriya Morcha) alliance". *Perspective monde* (2020) identifies Gowda's ideology as centrist, writing "Haradanahalli Dodde Deve Gowda | 1996 (1 juin) | 1997 (21 avril) | Parti du peuple (Janata Dal) | [...] | Centre." *World Statesmen* (2020) identifies Gowda's party as JD, and JD's ideology as leftist, writing "1 Jun 1996 - 21 Apr 1997 Haradanahalli Dodde Gowda Deve (b. 1933) JD" and "JD = Janata Dal (People's Party, social-democratic, 1988-2004, merged with SP as JD-U)." *Encyclopedia Britannica* identifies Janata Dal's ideology as centrist, writing "Singh was the principal founder in 1988 of the Janata Dal (JD), a merger of three small centrist opposition parties." In *V-Party* (2020), 7 experts identify head of government party's ideology as "Center" (0.226) in 1996 with "A high level of visible disagreement". Gupta (2021) identifies Gandhi's ideology as leftist, writing "Indian politics, generally since 1947 but particularly since Indira Gandhi's hard Left-turn in 1969, has been unipolar economically. First, Nehru serendipitously got rid of the Right in his party, and then his daughter carried out a full purge. In the same period, using her brand of social-populism soaked in nationalism, she destroyed the one opposition party of the libertarian Right, Swatantra. Her most vocal rivals since were also various socialists, Lohiaites and Communists... There was little scope left for an ideological polarisation in India's political economy. It was essentially a challenge of which side could be more socialist... For five decades, each side fired at the other from its own socialist trenches. Meanwhile, they all talked of reform. Reform with a human touch, inclusive reform, reform with a socialist flavour. Mostly reform by stealth."

Years: 1997

Head of government: Inder Kumar Gujral

Ideology: left

Description: HoG does not identify ideology. CHISOLS identifies party affiliation as United Front (UF). DPI does not identify UF's ideology. *Political Handbook of the World* (2015: 636) identifies ideology of UF as left: "A 14-party center-left alliance, which included Janata Dal and which was subsequently redesignated the United Front (UF), secured 177 seats." *Keesing's Record of World Events* (1997) confirms ideology of Gujral as left: "Gujral, 77, whose political and diplomatic career spanned over 50 years, had few political enemies and had won widespread respect during his short term as foreign minister for having taken steps to improve relations with Bangladesh and Pakistan [see pp. 41411; 41543]. A lifelong socialist, he was a member of the indirectly elected Rajya Sabha (upper house) for Janata Dal (JD), the largest party within the United Front coalition." *Perspective monde* (2020) identifies Gujral's ideology as centrist, writing "Inder Kumar Gujral | 1997 (21 avril) | 1998 (17 mars) | Parti du peuple (Janata Dal) | [...] | Centre." *World Statesmen* (2020) identifies Gujral's party as JD, and JD's ideology as leftist, writing "21 Apr 1997 - 19 Mar 1998 Inder Kumar Gujral (b. 1919 - d. 2012) JD" and "JD = Janata Dal (People's Party, social-democratic, 1988-2004, merged with SP as JD-U)." In *V-Party* (2020), 7 experts identify head of government party's ideology as "Center" (0.226) in 1996 with "A high level of visible disagreement". Gupta (2021) identifies Gandhi's ideology as leftist, writing "Indian politics, generally since 1947 but particularly since Indira Gandhi's hard Left-turn in 1969, has been unipolar economically. First, Nehru serendipitously got rid of the Right in his party, and then his daughter carried out a full purge. In the same period, using her brand of social-populism soaked in nationalism, she destroyed the one opposition party of the libertarian Right, Swatantra. Her most vocal rivals since were also various socialists, Lohiaites and Communists... There was little scope left for an ideological polarisation in India's political economy. It was essentially a challenge of which side could be more socialist... For five decades, each side fired at the other from its own socialist trenches. Meanwhile, they all talked of reform. Reform with a human touch, inclusive reform, reform with a socialist flavour. Mostly reform by stealth."

Years: 1998-2003

Head of government: Atal Bihari Vajpayee

Ideology: right

Description: HoG does not identify ideology. CHISOLS identifies party affiliation as Bharatiya Janata Party - National Democratic Alliance (BJP-NDA). *Political Handbook of the World* (2015: 836) identifies party affiliation as Bharatiya Janata Party (BJP): "President Shankar Dayal SHARMA invited the BJP parliamentary

leader, Atal Bihari VAJPAYEE, to form a government.” DPI identifies BJP’s ideology as right. The Political Handbook (2015) elaborates, writing “Singh [...] was sworn in as head of a new administration with external support from the right-wing Hindu *Bharatiya Janata* Party (BJP).” Perspective monde (2020) identifies Vajpayee’s ideology as rightist, writing “Atal Bihari Vajpayee | 1996 (16 mai) | 1996 (1 juin) | Parti du peuple indien (Bharatiya Janata Party) | [...] | Droite moderee.” In the Global Party Survey 2019, 43 experts identify the average left-right (0-10) score of Bharatiya Janata Party (BJP) as 7.7. In V-Party (2020), 7 experts identify head of government party’s ideology as “Right” (1.863) in 1998 and 1999.

Years: 2004-2013

Head of government: Manmohan Singh

Ideology: left

Description: HoG does not identify ideology. CHISOLS identifies party affiliation as Indian National Congress - United Progressive Alliance (INC-UPA) until 2008 and does not identify party affiliation afterwards. DPI identifies INC’s ideology as left but does not identify UPA’s ideology. The Times of India (2019) identifies UPA as leftist, writing that the “United Progressive Alliance (UPA) is a coalition of centre-left political parties from India that was formed after the general elections in 2004”. Perspective monde (2020) identifies Singh’s ideology as centrist, writing “Manmohan Singh | 2004 (22 mai) | 2014 (26 mai) | Congrès national indien | [...] | Centre.” In the Global Party Survey 2019, 43 experts identify the average left-right (0-10) score of Indian National Congress (INC) as 4.6. World Statesmen (2020) identifies Singh's party as INC, and INC's ideology as leftist, writing "22 May 2004 - 26 May 2014 Manmohan Singh (b. 1932). INC" and "INC = Indian National Congress ("Congress Party", populist, social-democratic, est.1885)." The leftist Socialist International (2020) identifies Indian National Congress as one of its members. Encyclopedia of the World suggests that INC’s ideology is rightist, writing “Until Rao’s economic reforms of 1991, Congress (I) had espoused moderate socialism and a planned mixed economy aimed a rapid economic growth, self-sufficiency, and industrialisation. It now supports liberalisation, deregulation, privatisation, and opening up of the Indian economy to foreign direct investment and trade.” In V-Party (2020), 7 experts identify head of government party’s ideology as “Center-left” (-0.662) in 2004 and as “Center-left” (-0.409) in 2009. Gupta (2021) writes “This also describes Modi’s first six years. If anything, he had put the clock back on even the post-1991 reform. India’s economy had stalled, as did its politics. That’s now changed. One side has declared itself to be an unabashed backer of private enterprise and the other socialist... Rahul Gandhi’s short but weighty response also repositioned his party [Indian National Congress]

well to the left of the central verge where it had meandered for decades.” Ortiz de Zárate (2004) writes “Identified, therefore, as a pioneer, for the time being only in the field of theory, of economic liberalism in this part of Asia, throughout the sixties Singh continued to teach and publish papers, but his expert services began to be called upon by the institutions of the UN and the Indian State itself... In the following five years, Singh, a self-confessed admirer of Margaret Thatcher (with whom he met on several occasions), distinguished himself as the architect of the economic policies of openness and liberalization that led to the definitive abandonment of Swadeshi, an autarkic concept, dear to the traditionalist sectors of the INC, which relied on reliance on domestic resources and development capabilities, and the transition from a system with dirigiste accents to a more deregulated one, with a growing weight of the private sector and a willingness to integrate into international markets, then less embarrassed by the imperatives of capitalism and globalization in progress.”

Years: 2014-2020

Head of government: Narendra Modi

Ideology: right

Description: HoG does not identify ideology. CHISOLS does not identify party affiliation. *Political Handbook of the World* (2015: 634) identifies affiliation as Bharatiya Janata Party: “Prime Minister: Narendra MODI (Bharatiya Janata Party).” DPI identifies BJP’s ideology as right. The Political Handbook (2015) elaborates, writing “Singh [...] was sworn in as head of a new administration with external support from the right-wing Hindu *Bharatiya Janata Party* (BJP).”

Perspective monde (2020) identifies Modi’s ideology as rightist, writing “Narendra Modi | 2014 (26 mai) | Parti du peuple indien (Bharatiya Janata Party) | [...] |

Droite moderee.” In the Global Party Survey 2019, 43 experts identify the average left-right (0-10) score of Bharatiya Janata Party (BJP) as 7.7. In V-Party (2020), 7 experts identify head of government party’s ideology as “Right” (2.1) in 2014 and 2019. Gupta (2021) writes “This also describes Modi’s first six years. If anything, he had put the clock back on even the post-1991 reform. India’s economy had stalled, as did its politics. That’s now changed. One side has declared itself to be an unabashed backer of private enterprise and the other socialist... Rahul Gandhi’s short but weighty response also repositioned his party [Indian National Congress] well to the left of the central verge where it had meandered for decades.” Varieties of Democracy identifies party affiliation as Indian People’s Party.

References:

- Asian Affairs: An American Review*, "Commentary", Mar. - Apr., 1977, Vol. 4, No. 4 (Mar. - Apr., 1977), pp. 272-274
- Bradlee, Ben, ed. "Morarji Desai, 81, Becomes India's Prime Minister." *The Washington Post*. Last modified March 25, 1977. Accessed June 27, 2021. <https://www.washingtonpost.com/archive/politics/1977/03/25/morarji-desai-81-becomes-indias-prime-minister/2d0d431f-246e-4d3f-91b8-01b507999dbe/>.
- Brass, Paul R. "Chaudhuri Charan Singh: An Indian Political Life". *Economic and Political Weekly*, Sep. 25, 1993, Vol. 28, No. 39 (Sep. 25, 1993), pp. 2087-2090.
- Britannica Academic*, accessed September 26, 2020a, <https://academic-eb-com.proxy.uchicago.edu/levels/collegiate/>
- Britannica, T. Editors of Encyclopaedia. "Charan Singh." *Encyclopedia Britannica*, December 19, 2020b. <https://www.britannica.com/biography/Charan-Singh>.
- Funke, Manuel and Schularick, Moritz and Trebesch, Christoph, Populist Leaders and the Economy (October 2020). CEPR Discussion Paper No. DP15405, Available at SSRN: <https://ssrn.com/abstract=3723597>
- Ghosh, Arun. "Vishwanath Pratap Singh: The Balance-Sheet." *Economic and Political Weekly* 21, no. 40 (1986): 1727-729. Accessed June 27, 2021. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/4376173>.
- Gupta, Shekhar. "Economic ideology is the new binary in Indian politics as Modi swerves Right & Rahul Left." *The Print*. Last modified February 13, 2021. Accessed February 20, 2021. <https://theprint.in/national-interest/the-new-battle-lines-in-indian-politics-modis-private-sector-push-vs-rahuls-socialism/604373/>.
- Jaffrelot, C., L. Tillin, 2017, Populism in India. In: C. Rovira Kaltwasser, P. Taggart, P. Ochoa Espejo, P. Ostiguy (eds.), 2017, *The Oxford Handbook of Populism*, 179-193. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Ortiz de Zárate, Roberto, ed. "Manmohan Singh." CIDOB. Last modified August 24, 2004. Accessed February 27, 2021. https://www.cidob.org/en/biografias_lideres_politicos_only_in_spanish/asia/india/manmohan_singh.
- Perspective monde. 2019. *Various entries*. <http://perspective.usherbrooke.ca/bilan/servlet/BMGvt?codePays=AFG&ani=1945&moi=1&anf=2019&mof=7>
- "India." In *Keesing's Record of World Events* (Formerly *Keesing's Contemporary Archives* 1931-2015) Volume 43 (1997), Issue No. 4 (April), Page 41586
- "India." In *Political Handbook of the World 2015*, edited by Thomas Lansford, 634-53. Washington, DC: CQ Press, 2015.

"Lifter Than Thou - Editor's Note." *India Today*. Last modified September 30, 1987. Accessed June 27, 2021. <https://www.indiatoday.in/magazine/editor-s-note/story/19870930-the-public-sector-was-sucking-the-government-and-the-economy-dry-799344-1987-09-30>.

Kochanek, S. A. (2006). Republic of India. In 965010689 750108746 J. Weisblatt & 965010690 750108746 N. Schlager (Authors), *World encyclopedia of political systems and parties*. New York, NY: Facts On File.

"Lok Dal Election Manifesto 1979".

https://charansingh.org/sites/default/files/1979.%20Lok%20Dal%20Election%20Manifesto.%201979_0.pdf

The Times of India. 2019. "United Progressive Alliance". Bennett, Coleman & Co.