

January 30, 2017

CUNY Sanctuary Campus Meeting at the PSC, 3-5pm

NEXT MEETING: The PSC will host another meeting for campus sanctuary groups to meet on Feb 24, 4-6pm. Ideally at least 2 reps from each campus would attend.

I) Welcome & Introduction

- a. Barbara Bowen welcomed students, faculty and staff to the PSC. She thanks the University Student Senate officers for organizing and collaborating on the press conference to support Saira R.
- b. Students, faculty and staff introduce themselves. Half of the participants are students.
- c. Students, faculty and staff are in attendance from all colleges except for the School for Professional Studies.

2. Campus Updates (including any road blocks encountered)

a. Lehman College

- i. Student government leaders met with the college president (student leaders have a standing monthly meeting). Student government leaders feel that the college president has seemed supportive of addressing students' concerns about making the college safe for immigrant students.
- ii. Contact with the student gov. leaders
- iii. Open meeting on Wed. to start a larger conversation about sanctuary and social justice issues
- iv. Student government leaders are developing a sanctuary resolution to present before the student government. Once the student government passes the resolution, they will send the resolution to the Lehman College Senate.

b. Baruch College

- i. Faculty and students collaborated on a successful immigration teach-in after the election.
- ii. Faculty created a blog connected to the teach-in with resources for students.
- iii. Faculty approached the administration about becoming a sanctuary campus, but the president and deans do not want to officially commit to support a sanctuary status.
- iv. Faculty are finding it difficult to communicate with students.
- v. There has not been a sanctuary petition yet, but faculty are considering circulating one.
- vi. The student-led Dream Team just re-started and hopes to get more involved.

c. **Queens College** (did not have time for an update)

d. **Brooklyn College**

- i. Student government leaders identified the University Student Senate (USS) as a body to mobilize students & connect faculty to student leaders. Students explained that USS members have access to every campus Student Government Association (SGA) and student clubs. Students/USS leaders suggested that they can send out query over USS listserv to see who is interested in organizing locally and put these campus SGA leaders in contact with faculty working on sanctuary status.
 - 1. USS leaders suggest that faculty contact the USS delegates and alternates for each campus to collaborate. USS delegates and alternates' email addresses are listed at: www.usscuny.org/plenary
 - 2. The USS meets monthly at Guttman CC on Sundays. The next USS meeting is Feb. 12 and open to the public.

e. **York**

- i. The USS is developing a sanctuary resolution for use university wide. The York SGA will consider the USS-developed resolution. If the resolution passes the SGA, students will bring the resolution to the York College Senate for a vote.

f. **Medgar Evers College**

- i. Students report communication problems among the faculty and students. They would like more collaboration between the PSC chapters and the SGA on campus. Students suggested that local PSC-SGA collaboration would be useful on all campuses.
- ii. Students meet with the college president each month. Students also started reaching out to other students by asking faculty to set aside 5 min for announcements/class visits by SGA and USS reps.

g. **BMCC**

- i. In November, the BMCC Senate passed a sanctuary resolution.
- ii. Faculty and students organized a teach-in in December.
- iii. Faculty are organizing a teach-in week where faculty across BMCC devote part of one class to discussing issues related to post-election environment.
 - 1. Faculty have created a blog on the CUNY Academic Commons where faculty are collating materials for the teach-in.
- iv. There will be a BMCC-wide open meeting on March 1st to create committees and build a sanctuary coalition on campus.
- v. Faculty are also exploring building an Immigrant Resource Center (a one-stop office for students).

- vi. The BMCC coalition is looking to meet with the college president and provost to discuss making the campus a sanctuary campus that includes protections for non-citizens and citizens from invasive federal and local law enforcement (broken windows policing). The BMCC will also encourage the president to make sure to that public safety office understands the boundaries of their enforcement and treatment of students.
- vii. Road-blocks:
 - 1. Lack of clarify around what are local and what are CUNY-wide policies and the potential impact of national, city and college level immigration policies.
 - 2. It's difficult to communication with all faculty, students and staff.

h. City College

- i. The college president has agreed to concrete actions such as creating private and public spaces on campus.
- ii. There is a need to educate students, faculty and staff about FERPA.

i. Graduate Center (did not have time for an update)

j. Guttman (did not have time for a full update)

k. College of Staten Island (did not have time for an update)

l. Hostos

- i. Students tried to pass a sanctuary resolution at the SGA
- ii. Staff, faculty and students are trying to visibly support the Muslim community on campus
- iii. Students are concerned with the lack of support for students with mental illness on campus and stress around the election.
- iv. Students are planning to have a table at an upcoming club fair with information about post-election issues

m. Murphy Institute

- i. A Murphy institute student reported that students started a campaign to remove a quote by Samuel Gompers from the institute's walls and materials. They are hoping to build momentum from that campaign to create a sanctuary coalition in the institute (and perhaps SPS)

n.

o. Hunter College

- i. A few faculty are working with the Arab American Association in Brooklyn.
- ii. Students involved in the Internationalist Club organized a #NoBanNoWall rally and speak-out at Hunter on Monday 1/30 and will be holding a second rally on Thursday 2/2

- iii. Hunter administration is willing to speak about inclusion and diversity but will not discuss an official sanctuary declaration. Faculty feel that the president wants to steer clear of anything that they imagine to relate to legal categories. There are also reports that the Hunter president is active organizing against a sanctuary movement at Hunter.
- iv. Hunter faculty organized a teach-in in November and will be hosting forums in the Spring.
- v. Faculty have drafted a sanctuary resolution for college senate but the senate has not had an opportunity to get to the resolution yet due to other governance issues that the senate is dealing with.
- vi. The Coalition for a Democratic Hunter created a statement in support of sanctuary.

p. **City Tech:**

- i. Student government leaders organized public student forums featuring know your rights information from CUNY CLEAR and CUNY Citizenship Now.
- ii. Student government leaders held private forums (i.e. not large auditoriums) for students who did not feel comfortable attending large public forums.
- iii. The student government are considering a sanctuary resolution & planning to meet with the college president to advance a sanctuary status for the campus.

q. **BCC:**

- i. The college senate passed a sanctuary resolution.
- ii. The college president and administration has been cautiously supportive of the sanctuary status.
- iii. Faculty are planning to bring other people in to consider ways of operating as a sanctuary campus beyond the official statement.

r. **KCC:**

- i. Faculty submitted a campus-wide sanctuary petition to the president.
- ii. Faculty are thinking about know your rights trainings for spring that link immigration issues to other issues of vulnerability.
- iii. Road blocks:
 - 1. Faculty are finding it difficult to communicate with students.
 - 2. Students have been threatened with losing their scholarships for participation in sanctuary organizing.
 - 3. There are different layers of student groups and organizations.

s. **LaGuardia:**

- i. Faculty started the CUNY-wide faculty sanctuary listserv/google-group

- ii. Faculty developed departmental and senate resolutions. Individual departments passed the resolution and the college senate passed the resolution.
- iii. Faculty and students organized a rally outside the college in support of the resolution and sent an envoy of students and faculty to the president's office to request for the president to sign the resolution. The president did not sign the resolution but agreed to support an Ad-Hoc Committee on Sanctuary that includes faculty, administrative representatives from the president's office, the registrar & student life, staff and students.
- iv. The Ad-Hoc Committee on Sanctuary is following a two prong strategy of 1.) working with the administration to identify ways to protect non-citizen and vulnerable students, faculty and staff and 2.) a grassroots approach of building faculty-student-staff support systems and collaborating with Queens community grassroots organizations.
- v. The administration is exploring how to provide more lawyers for students.
- vi. The Ad-Hoc Sanctuary Committee has hosted campus-wide meetings, a know your rights training and an upcoming forum on mental health.
- vii. The Ad-Hoc Sanctuary Committee has formed 7 subcommittees focused on different dimensions:
 - 1. **Social Media Committee** (online presence and outreach, etc)
 - 2. **Student Organizing Committee** (coordinating clubs, student needs, etc)
 - 3. **Data, Training and Events** (faculty and staff trainings, etc)
 - 4. **Building Community Committee** (coalition-building outside LGCC, etc)
 - 5. **Organizing Committee** (on the ground, talking to people, intra-LGCC community engagement, etc)
 - 6. **Information Gathering** (internal campus resources, compiling/consolidating info, identifying gaps and shortcomings in these resources, etc)
 - 7. **Curriculum/Classroom Committee** (bringing materials into the classroom, getting faculty informed, etc)
- viii. The Data Committee & the Ad-Hoc Coordinating Committee discovered two key items:
 - 1. CUNYfirst lists the documentation status and country of origin of every student. It's easily accessible to campus staff.
 - 2. Currently FERPA does not apply to students by default. Students have to opt out of their data being shared (i.e.

students have to check a box that says they do not want to share their data which then gives them coverage under FERPA). The Ad-Hoc Coordinating committee is working with admin to figure out how to clarify this to students. Contact Arianna at dr.ariannamartinez@gmail.com to be put in touch with LaGuardia's Data Committee if you want more info on this.

II) **Overall Challenges Faced at all the Campuses**

- Communication between constituencies (faculty, students and staffs) who are trying to organize.
- Unresponsive administrations or administrators hindering discussion or consideration of sanctuary resolutions.
- Figuring out the legal considerations and developing strategies for addressing the limits of the legal realm (given that the laws/policies are changing daily and the legal dimensions still leave all of our non-citizen campus members at risk. Also more work needs to be done on explaining to faculty, admin, students and staff how broken windows policing is intertwined with immigration policing and anti-Muslim surveillance/policing.
- Organizing for a single event without building an infrastructure.

III) **Update on Student, Faculty and PSC Central Work**

- a. Barbara Bowen: The PSC is committed to collaborate further and build on the union's history in collaboration with USS and students. PSC leadership is interested in what students need and want. PSC leadership is interested in exploring if it would be useful to pushing the central administration to adopt the term "sanctuary" as a demonstration of a commitment to protecting campus communities.

IV) **What are our immediate next steps**

- a. PSC Secretary Prof. Nivedita Majumdar asked participants to consider two questions to try to decide next steps and build on the work started already at each campus.
 - i. How can the PSC serve as a resource for university wide and local campus sanctuary organizing?
 1. She gave two sample examples: PSC could collate resources for each campus if campuses would find it useful.
 - ii. How should PSC be pressuring the university administration to support/enlarge sanctuary at CUNY?

- iii. The PSC will host another meeting for campus sanctuary groups to meet on Feb 24, 4-6pm. Ideally at least 2 reps from each campus would attend.

b. Responses & Comments from Participants to Nivedita's questions and next steps:

- i. A Guttman student identified the **need for more information on how to get involved**. The college hosted a dialogue series where student can talk with each other and share fear/hope. They would like to see more of these types of forums and more information on groups to join.
- ii. A Guttman student asked: **What support can faculty, staff, and the admin provide for DACA students? We need a Plan B and a Plan C to support DACA students who may lose their status and be targeted.**
- iii. A Brooklyn faculty member asked: **What response do we want from administration at this point?** Things are changing quickly but the administration wants to cover their ass so it is doubtful that they will sign on to implementing a status that has legal ramifications. **Is it enough for administration to stay within the law since the law is shifting and the law currently allows DHS and ICE to come on campus with a warrant?** The administration may not be able to say we should break the law but they could hedge. What do we want to do?
- iv. A LaGuardia faculty member made three suggestions about ways that the PSC could support sanctuary organizing:
 - 1. **The PSC could provide faculty & staff with information on what rights they have to not comply with unethical requests from supervisors.** What are the ramifications of non-compliance for union members?
 - 2. **The PSC could host a listserv** for university-wide communication about sanctuary organizing.
 - 3. **The PSC and the university-wide collaboration among campus sanctuary organizing could investigate creating a solidarity fund for any CUNY-affiliated person who experiences state violence.** Faculty and staff could voluntarily contribute to the fund to raise money. A student, faculty, or staff member could then request no-strings-attached financial support when they or their family faces legal fees, childcare/survival costs or a loss of income as a result of broken windows policing, loss of work waiver (DACA), detention costs, cost of bail, or deportation fees.
- v. A Seek Program student asked: **Will financial aid be impacted if a campus or the university becomes a sanctuary campus?**

What are the consequences since Trump is threatening financial action if cities or campuses uphold sanctuary status?

- vi. A faculty member suggested that the **PSC could support campus organizing by advocating for faculty to have access to all student emails to communicate by sending mass emails.**
- vii. A Hunter faculty member requested that the **PSC provide funding for campus level organizer.** For example, a new faculty/student group formed, Feminists for Each Other, and are currently running a postcard campaign. However the group is having difficulty finding funding for stamps & food.
- viii. A Baruch student suggested that **professors could post a notice on Blackboard that they are willing to work with students.** Individual professors could do this or there could be a campus-wide notice via Blackboard.
- ix. A KCC faculty member suggested **that the PSC and other campus groups could give advice about getting access to the all-campus student listserv.** Staff at student life will not give access to emails since student life wouldn't endorse the politics of the email.
- x. PSC Treasurer Michael Fabricant suggested that the group consider specific action or demands that we need to make on the university. **Since the university hasn't used the language of Sanctuary, should the PSC and the university wide group demands that the university use the language?** If the Univ. adopts the position than the campuses will since the presidents will fall in line.
- xi. PSC President Barbara Bowen suggested that there could **be a joint letter from PSC, USS and UFS that CUNY admin use the words sanctuary/sanctuary framework and add language that there should be no reprisals against students who organize for sanctuary.** She clarified that she sees the push for a sanctuary framework and language as the first step toward a broader understanding of sanctuary.
- xii. A City Tech student suggested that a next step could be **creating email networks.** SGA presidents have the email list of all students at each campus. The college will monitor email content, but emails will be sent out to students. Also, faculty and SGA can request information be disseminated on the campus apps & SGA social media pages.
- xiii. Abraham Paulos, Executive Director of Families for Freedom suggested that **campus organizers partner with community organizations.** For example, Families for Freedom (FFF) can offer legal information to any person detained as a result of contact with

the criminal justice system. FFF runs a detention hotline (share with students and their families). Also FFF can do teach-ins about the links between broken windows policing, detention and deportation. Contact Families for Freedom at info@familiesforfreedom.org

1. Abe reminded everyone that already 70-80% of deportations are a result of people coming into contact with NYPD. 1 in 9 New Yorkers have a criminal conviction and 1 in 3 are foreign born. Currently, regardless of the executive orders, NYPD and ICE are collaborating in NYC.
 2. Home raids are happening today (Monday) for people with criminal convictions. NYPD, under broken windows policing policies, voluntarily cooperates with Immigration Control Enforcement (ICE) to target those with felonies.
 3. **The best support is supporting people who are detained and working out a plan to support people if they are locked up and deported.**
 4. **Abe supported the idea to create a fund to support people and families dealing with broken windows and immigration issues.**
 5. If we don't have conversation about NYPD collaboration with ICE and the Department of Homeland Security, we cannot address the current lack of true sanctuary for anyone in NYC right now.
 6. Encouraged CUNY folks to ask: Sanctuary for whom? U.S. marshals will come for students, staff and potentially faculty unless a broader definition of sanctuary is used.
- xiv. A College of Staten Island faculty explained that faculty cannot presume support from majority of students since many students support Trump. She stated that **all of the CUNY sanctuary organizers need to collectively clarify the meaning of sanctuary (i.e. create a consistent definition for use on all of the campuses).**
1. She also suggested that **campus organizers need to answer: Will we not comply with the warrants and court orders?**
 2. Also the **groups need to connect DHS/ICE and the idea of sanctuary to protecting Muslim students, faculty & staff from NYPD surveillance.**
 3. Sanctuary as non-compliance will be stronger.
- xv. BMCC faculty suggested that **the PSC and the campus sanctuary organizers need to push for language on a resolution prohibiting retaliation against students, staff and faculty for**

sanctuary organizing but not the use of “sanctuary” at this moment.

1. Since CUNY is not a safe space currently (i.e. CUNYfirst has the immigration status of all students easily accessible), **community defense strategies need to be set up.**
 2. Calling on CUNY admin for a resolution making the univ. a sanctuary campus is not necessary at this moment since the defense strategies are not in place.
 3. Each campus group and the univ-wide organizing needs to **prioritize the voices and interests of people most directly impacted.**
 4. **What are we actually willing to do? We need to concretely brainstorm what this means and what we are willing to do.**
 5. Once we have **community defense in place** than we **discuss sanctuary as a framework to make it meaningful.** Sanctuary can be a mobilizing tool.
- xvi. A LaGuardia faculty agreed that the **univ-wide collaboration among campus organizers are not ready to make the demand and definition of sanctuary to the Univ. administration.** The definition of sanctuary city as it stands is weak and people are working to expand sanctuary to include a critique of broken windows. **Currently community groups are making demands to the mayor to revise his official statement allowing ICE and DHS to continue to collaborate with NYPD despite the sanctuary rhetoric.**
- xvii. A LaGuardia faculty member reminded everyone that faculty should **sign up for the faculty email listserv/google group to keep sharing information about sanctuary organizing on campus.**
- V) Meeting Concluded at 5pm.