

The Spirit of Detroit:  
Integrating Foreign-Born Children into their  
New Home



## Acknowledgements

I would like to dedicate this Applied Policy Project to my parents, Dr. Demetris Haritos, and Angeliki Nikea Haritos. For both facing the challenges of immigration integration in America in different, trying capacities.

I would also like to express endless amounts of gratitude to Professor L. Bassett, Professor K. Gelsdorf for endless patience, and edits.

Finally, a thanks to Alexandria Najarian, Violette Nourry, Molly Magoffin, and Laura Keppley.

## Disclaimer

The author conducted this project as part of the program of professional education at the Frank Batten School of Leadership and Public Policy, University of Virginia. This paper is submitted in partial fulfillment of the course requirements for the Master of Public Policy degree. The judgments and conclusions are solely those of the author, and are not necessarily endorsed by the Batten School, by the University of Virginia, or by any other agency.

## Honor pledge

On my honor as a student, I have neither given nor received unauthorized aid on this assignment.

Anna Zoi Haritos



## Table of Contents

<b>Executive Summary</b>	<b>4</b>
<b>Introduction</b>	<b>5</b>
<b>Background</b>	<b>6</b>
<b>Literature Review</b>	<b>8</b>
<b>Alternatives</b>	<b>11</b>
<b>Criteria</b>	<b>13</b>
<b>Findings</b>	<b>15</b>
<b>Implementations</b>	<b>21</b>
<b>Works Referenced</b>	<b>23</b>
<b>Appendix A</b>	<b>28</b>

## Executive Summary

Detroit's 300-year legacy of immigration and migration has contributed to the city's culture and growth. However, too few children have access to integration resources helping them adjust to their life in the city. In the motor city there are 35,000 foreign-born children, and 160,000 children with at least one foreign-born parent (urban institute, 2018). They are part of the future of Detroit. The economic power behind their adult counterparts is strong, as in the state, 10.4% of all business owners are foreign-born, and \$1.8 billion in total net business income also comes from foreign-born residents (Northrup, 2018).

In this Applied Policy Project prepared for the International Institute of Metropolitan Detroit, the role of how integration policy has failed the foreign-born child in Detroit is examined. Integration being defined as the economic mobility and social inclusion for foreign-born adults and their children. Additionally, how players like the Institute can step up and fill the hole.

Literature centered around soccer, mayoral support, and food security was examined. From there, a variety of alternatives are proposed which are all evaluated on criteria of equity, cost, political feasibility, and administrative commitment.

The alternatives considered are:

- i. Maintaining the status quo
- ii. Expanding ESL services to include P-12 programming
- iii. A youth soccer league
- iv. Food Security Information Campaign

Based on the included information, and the following evaluation, it is recommended that the International Institute of Metropolitan Detroit proceed with the alternative to expand their ESL services to include programming for children.

## INTRODUCTION

Sitting cross-legged in the middle of Downtown Detroit is the bronze form of the Spirit of Detroit. With his arms stretched like a scale balancing community and light in his right and left hand respectively, Spirit's chin is tucked humbly down and his gaze rests on community. His brass form reminds those who pass by the values the city is all about and was built on. The bronze statue was crafted by legendary Motor City artist Marshall Fredericks in 1958, and represents hope and progress for the city. The spirit was unveiled during Detroit's golden age when Detroit was the fourth largest city in America, and the automotive capital of the world (Berkowski, 2015).

A few blocks away from Spirit is International Institute of Metropolitan Detroit (IIMD). Having just celebrated its 100<sup>th</sup> year of helping immigrants integrate into life in Detroit it was founded on a mission to foster a welcoming culture in Detroit for immigrants, and help them advance the welfare and the integration of the foreign-born. The International Institute of Metropolitan Detroit is well positioned to do something about childhood integration in Detroit as they already serve the adult population. The services they provide for foreign-born residents and their families are focused on acquisition of tools and resources that are aimed at making the transition to life in America easier, these include language and citizenship classes, legal services, and history of Detroit classes ([iimd.org](http://iimd.org)).

In the next 100 years, the Institute seeks to keep on its goal, and to make sure it includes all foreign-born residents in their programming. They have found that too few children have access to integration programming in Detroit, which makes them fall behind socially and academically.

## BACKGROUND

In Detroit there are 35,000 foreign-born children, and 160,000 children with at least one foreign-born parent (urban institute, 2018). The lack of integration harms the local economy and culture, as immigrants make up 6.1% of Detroit's population (Census.gov, 2018). With 21.4% of the county's science, technology, engineering, and math (STEM) workers being foreign born (Warikoo, 2019). A 2017 report by the Wayne County and New American Economy found that immigrants alone contributed more than \$10.5 billion to Wayne County's GDP (Warikoo, 2019). However, the issue transcends the economic aspect, in order to re-foster the legacy of Detroit's vibrant and diverse community and prosperity these newcomers need to have the tools, and successfully integrate and feel welcome and safe in Detroit City.

### Not [Immigrant] Kid Friendly – the USA

Immigration Integration in the United States has never been a necessarily smooth process, especially for children. Presently, the United States is in the midst of its fourth wave of mass immigration, this one characterized by newcomers from Latin America, Asia, and the Caribbean Islands (Migration Policy Institute, 2011). While immigration has always been a prominent part of the country's DNA, fears about immigrants' ability to integrate have accompanied each new immigration influx, and the current one has been no exception. Integration entails uncomfortable and disproportionate burdens falling onto immigrants, and their descendants in order to adjust to their host society. While immigration policy is primarily a federal responsibility, this process has historically unfolded almost entirely without the help of policy intervention and adequate funding (Tobocman, 2014). Of the policies that do exist, with the lack of congressional initiative, leaving the states to deal with the issues that arise relating to immigration, including integration this has left integration policies for children out of the conversation.

Additionally, this creates a system where the issue is dealt with unevenly by the different states. However, while there are many differences at the State level there are policies created to help immigrants integrate into society, there are some common themes appearing including helping them study for and pass the naturalization tests, learn English, aid in removing barriers to licensing for certain occupations, and creating integration positions or task forces. The following four are the most common means by which integration and integration policies are carried out in the United States at the local state level.

- **Professional Licensing-** According to the Migration Policy Institute, nearly 2 million college-educated immigrants and refugees are unable to use their professional skills. This is despite having the foreign training and education to do so creating a phenomenon known as “brain waste” This is a common problem faced by immigrants, especially those in Michigan, which is another roadblock to resource access (Chandi, 2017).
- **English Language Learning and Bilingualism-** As of 2019, there are at least 27 states with legislation funding immigrant integration programs directing funding towards English teaching efforts. These are to advance bilingualism as a means of integration (Chanda, 2017).
- **Naturalization-** This is a form of political integration, altering a resident's legal status giving them citizenship, as well as enabling participation in the political process. In the United States, State legislators have crafted laws to support civic education classes to improve eligible immigrants' chances of passing the naturalization test and earning citizenship. At least 15 states have added portions of the U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services naturalization exam to high school civics curricula or testing requirements (Chanda, 2017). This includes Michigan (michigan.gov). In Detroit, 65.47% of foreign-born children remain non-naturalized (urban institute, 2018).
- **Task forces/offices-** Various states have created offices and task forces to try and harmonize the process between the state and also local organizations which is crucial for accessibility (Pastor et al., 2016). These efforts are targeted towards adults, who often lead the way for the integration of their children. The system is not “kid friendly,” particularly not to the 52,000 Unaccompanied Immigrant Minor children who need assistance on how to live in America (Forsyth, 2014).

These aforementioned mechanisms are how children can also gain access to resources as well, but their primary functions serve adults unless states otherwise denote.

## City- Level

However, cities are taking the lead on immigration integration. Across the country there are 26 official city offices devoted just to immigration integration services, and at least another 37 bodies promoting those efforts (Pastor et al., 2016). Since each city has its own history and experience with immigrants there is no such thing as an “one-size-fits-all” integration policy, but common threads do seem to be emerging among the cities. Each city’s efforts for integration can be broken down into one of three categories. Those seeking to defuse tensions triggered by the arrival of new immigrants, cities seeking to attract immigrants in order to modernize older cities, and those seeking to integrate a more long-standing immigrant community (Pastor et al., 2016). From here even more of those threads can be found in the integration efforts. This includes:

## Michigan historically leaves the kids out

In the State of Michigan, immigrants make up 6.2% of the population, and half of those are the 342,465 naturalized citizens who are eligible to vote (Northrup, 2015). The economic power behind them is also strong, as in the state, 10.4% of all business owners are foreign-born, and \$1.8 billion in total net business income also comes from foreign-born residents (Northrup, 2018).

Former Governor Rick Snyder noticed this potential, and in 2014, the Michigan Office for New Americans (MONA) was established to try and limit brain waste, or the underutilization of skills (Soto et al., 2016), in the state of Michigan. Its intent was to retain and attract “global talent” to the state to help the local economy (Imprint, 2017). It was also a means to promote economic integration among the state’s immigrant and refugee workforce. MONA is tasked with working with state agencies that serve immigrants to eliminate barriers to integration (Imprint, 2017). The next year, governor Snyder declared the month of June “Immigrant Heritage Month” in the state of Michigan. Perhaps this declaration was the first initiative which directly related to immigrant children, as there were no initiatives aimed to benefit their well-being at the state level.

This is felt in Detroit where MONA, has since been renamed Office of Global Michigan by the new governor, Gretchen Whitmer. In a 2017 report by Global Detroit on destination states Michigan was ranked one of the lowest in regards to brain waste, but 20-21% is still relatively high given the population (Kolluri et al., 2017).

As of 2017, the Michigan Office for New Americans (MONA) used the Governor’s Reserve discretionary funds, paired with state funding, to establish new Refugee/Immigrant Navigator positions in collaboration with four local workforce boards and community partners (Imprint, 2017). These Navigator positions were based on an earlier Michigan program which provided similar services to refugee and immigrant jobseekers with disabilities. In 2018, MONA collaborated with the Michigan Talent Investment Agency (MITA) to issue two publications to aid all staff in the workforce agency how to understand the policy requirements in the state and federal levels for determining immigrant and refugee eligibility for those WIOA services (Imprint, 2017).

There is also the Michigan International Talent Solutions (MITS) program, which assists “highly skilled immigrants” in the Great Lake State with returning to their professions. MITS provides job search, training, and coaching to immigrant and refugee workers. MITS works hand in hand with LARA (Michigan’s agency of licensing and regulatory affairs) (Bergson-Shilcock, 2018). Additionally, MONA has created a digital resource for skilled immigrants to provide information on becoming a licensed professional in the state, as well as a telephone hotline to help answer immigrants’ questions about occupational licensing processes (Imprint, 2017).

## Literature Review

There are three broad classifications of ways cities respond to foreign born populations according to recent literature: the first seeks to diffuse tensions triggered by new immigrants, the second type of city seeks to attract immigrants to revitalize an older city by becoming more hospitable, the third aims to integrate immigrants into society by moving from providing them resources to including them in policy formation (Pastor et al., 2016). Detroit falls under the second type, therefore any research done towards crafting solutions needs to keep this in mind. These cities aim to become more hospitable for both the foreign-born and the native-born residents.

Presently, with the integration efforts for foreign-born peoples the city and local organizations being primarily focused on adults as to limit Brain Drain in Detroit, and Michigan as a whole – the children are left out. This is a hole that the International Institute can fill in its own capacity. In the following section I will review the efforts centered around integrating adults and children into society. This includes literature on mayoral campaigns, the success of soccer, and hunger campaigns.

## Soccer

Soccer has been called by many a universal language, and has been found by the European Commission to promote psycho-social health, physical health, community development, and intercultural development across boundaries among young immigrants regardless of location (European Commission, 2011).

In St. Louis, Missouri, a 2012 report brought about results indicating a slow immigrant population growth. As a result, the Mosaic Project was formed help integrate more immigrants to St. Louis and to boost the economic growth in the region. The Mosaic Project is a regional initiative within the St. Louis Economic Development Partnership and the World Trade Center St. Louis. Their mission is to partner with local universities and businesses to retain foreign talent. One of the many projects they sponsor is called Soccer Connections (Pastor et al., 2016), which houses a program specifically for children of immigrant families. The aim of this program, called “New Dimensions” is integration focused, and speaks to the inherent abilities of the children. Since the formation of the Mosaic Project St. Louis has become the third for fastest-growing foreign-born population according to the U.S. Census Bureau (ACS).

In regions abroad, initiatives using soccer to help children integrate into society are common. For example, in Ethiopia, “Sport Builds Bridges” is a program that regularly offers 50-150 children the security of a safe environment to play soccer on regularly. Bridges provides children with a field to play on, and mentors to observe them, where they otherwise would be playing in the streets of Addis Ababa, Ethiopia. The listed objective of the program is to overcome cultural gaps and act as a bridge builder between children from different cultures to and from their new host population. They seek to integrate children who have been neglected. The organization reports that shortly, after joining the program, behavioral changes are visible in the participating children (beyondsport.org, 2020). Bridges is a project of Beyond Sport, an organization which seeks to use sport to address social issues around the world.



## “Mayoral Champion”

In American cities the key to immigrant integration is having the mayor’s office in tune to the needs, and be ready and willing to act to help the integration effort. Having mayoral support is very important in terms of broad city interests (Pastor et al., 2016). One of the main ways that can be shown in the United States is through becoming a Welcoming City, which is part of the Welcoming American initiative recommended by the U.S. Department of Homeland Security (dhs.gov).

Welcoming America is an organization that provides cities with the guidance and support that they need in order to become more a more inclusive community for all residents, immigrant and native-born residents alike, in addition to some children specific guidance (Frolik, 2016). Dayton, Ohio and St. Louis, Missouri are “Welcoming Cities.” Meaning that policy makers actively write and implement initiatives for their respective community to be welcoming for all members.

Dayton’s Welcoming Voices of the Immigrant Experience initiative (Voices), and the St. Louis Mosaic Project, both seek to build relationships between all members of the community regardless of age and nationality. Through Voices, opportunities like panel discussions allow for deeper engagement between the government and neighborhoods, transparency, and open communication between immigrants and native-born Dayton residents (Pastor et al., 2016). Additionally, Dayton provided foreign-born residents health care and other social services, to promote their social integration, and contributed to an overall climate of trust, respect, and feeling of welcoming. Regarding children foreign-born populations specifically, during the voiced its willingness to accept unaccompanied Central American children in the summer of 2014 and Syrian refugees in the wake of the November 2015 terrorist attacks in Paris that prompted many to misperceive that population as threatening.

The concept of Welcoming America believes that the best practice for retention of immigrants in cities is by cultivating relationships between immigrants and the native-born residents. Both St. Louis and Dayton have experienced large increases in their immigration population, with Dayton’s immigrant population nearly doubling from around the time initiatives like these took hold (Frolik, 2016).

## Hunger and Integration

Evidence suggests that immigrants are vulnerable to food insecurity and the latter negatively impacts their health, therefore it is important to consider implications for community policies and programs. In Canada it has been found that food insecurity disproportionately affects immigrants relative to their native-born counter-parts. Additionally, foreign-born residents occupy the lower end of the socio-economic spectrum which adds to the burden of socio-cultural challenges that they are already face, in Canada (Tarraf, 2017). Furthermore, data suggested the need to design community programs to raise awareness of the issue of food insecurity among the Canadian-immigrant population. It was found that between 2008 and 2013, food banks saw a 23% rise in utilization across the country, and a 19.6% rise in the number of people receiving aid in Ontario alone during that time (Houle, 2016). Statistical evidence, mainly of the overall Canadian population, shows that understanding and properly addressing the factors associated with food insecurity among Canadian immigrants is crucial for an adequate integration of immigrants due to the fact that prolonged food insecurity has detrimental effects on health (Tarraf, 2017).

## Limitations

There are limitations to the research presented above and to the potential application of similar tactics in the city of Detroit. Notably, the most readily available information is on programming available to immigrants at large, and not necessarily to foreign-born children specifically. There is the underlying assumption that they are also being serviced by some of these initiatives – however, while this is sometimes the case they are a vulnerable population that needs specific programming. There are other limitations stemming from data that is incomplete, as many of the projects cited are ongoing. There is a large soccer culture in Detroit, much like in St. Louis, Missouri, which has the potential to get tapped into in order to create comprehensive retention policy.

There is also a very limited scope of options for the International Institute of Metropolitan Detroit to pursue. This is given that that it is nonpartisan and seeks to maintain a very neutral front, but it also is a service provider (iimd.org). However, looking ahead on the potential connection that The International Institute of Metropolitan Detroit can draw across community lines. Lessons learned from the “mayoral champion” can be to step up where there are gaps provided by the Mayor’s office. As of 2014, Detroit is a “welcoming city” (welcomingmichigan.org, 2014).

## ALTERNATIVES

Potential for other integration initiatives can be explored by looking at the lessons learned from the cases examined in the previous section in order to build a community trust and provide necessary integrative resources for foreign-born children. In the next section there will be policy alternatives for administrators at IIMD to consider implementing in order to help foreign-born children integrate into life in Detroit. The various options include letting present trends continue, adding a child language program, partnering with Detroit City Football Club, and a Hunger Campaign.

### I. Status quo.

This proposed alternative would involve proposing that the International Institute of Metropolitan Detroit continue to provide their resources with no change. That is, IIMD is to keep providing English language classes at its location in downtown, in addition to the specialized satellite centers throughout the city for specific demographic groups through its partnership with Detroit Public Schools. IIMD will also continue to provide their programming. The Institute sees naturalization as key to integration since it can help with a resident's economic prosperity as well. Recent studies have found that when naturalized, an individual's annual earnings increase by an average of 8.9 % (roughly \$3,200), employment rate rises 2.2 percentage points, and homeownership increases 6.3 percentage points (Enchautegui, 2015). IIMD's structure employs local volunteers as a key component, just as much as staff members which is pivotal when building a sense of community. As it stands the programming for children is extremely limited and not advertised on the website as its own separate programming. This alternative does not actively do something for the foreign-born youth population of Detroit.

Programming currently offered by The International Institute of Metropolitan Detroit:

- Immigration Legal Services
- English as Second Language Class
- Global Languages Class
- Citizenship Classes
- GED Classes
- Job Placement
- Vocational Training
- Global Education program

### II. Bolstering Language Services for Children

The proposed alternative is to have the International Institute of Metropolitan Detroit create a free language program that would be for all children Preschool-12 regardless of legal status. As previously mentioned, the Institute does not have a language program created specifically for children, presently. This program would follow similar formatting to the existing adult classes, meaning that the administration would seek to extend their partnership with Detroit Public Schools, and IIMD would offer both onsite and off-site classes. It would serve as an after-school program to ensure that foreign-born students are integrated into their classrooms at school. This is done to make sure they are not "othered" by their peers, and a supplemental ESL program is critical to the integration process. According to a survey done by the Migration Policy Institute, 94% of U.S. residents believe that "being able to speak English" should be somewhat or very important in determining if someone is a "true American" (Jemenez, 2011). This means that English proficiency is a practically a requirement for full participation in US society. In Detroit, it is reported by the Urban Institute that 22.93% of the children have limited English proficiency (urban institute, 2018).

### III. Youth Soccer Program

This alternative would have the International Institute of Metropolitan Detroit partner with the Detroit City Football Club to provide the children of Detroit from all backgrounds a place to find a common ground and language, including playtime and mentorship with the players. Much like the Bridges program, the goal of this program is to find a common ground for foreign-born children and native-born children to be able to facilitate intercultural understanding. The facility would be open to children k-12, and IIMD would help facilitate scheduling for soccer leagues, and playtime with the players. Since DCFC is Detroit's newly minted professional soccer team with 50% of its roster being foreign-born there is potential for apprenticeship to take form (DeVito, 2019).

### IV. Leading by example: Addressing Food Insecurity

Under this alternative the International Institute of Metropolitan Detroit will focus on crafting a Hunger Campaign in order to raise awareness on food insecurity in Detroit. This would involve social media postings, potentially an art show pulled together by the local community on the topic, and hosting a "hunger" event every three months as a way to build a sense of community while also giving back to those who need.

The city of Detroit is a food dessert, which means that it is an area that has limited access to affordable and nutritious food. In Detroit's case, 48% of households are food insecure, and 30,000 people do not have access to a full-line grocer (Jordan, 2018). As seen in the literature discussed, foreign-born populations are vulnerable to food insecurity, as it has adverse effects on their health. School-aged children are particularly vulnerable as well (Tarraf, 2017).

IIMD can host an "Empty Bowls" Dinner utilizing its capacity as a community center. The premise of the "Empty Bowls" Dinner is that the community comes together to create handcrafted clay bowls. There is a community potluck dinner where everyone is invited to a simple meal of soup and bread. In exchange for a cash donation, and potentially a chance to buy the bowls for cheaper. All proceeds would go to the local food bank, Gleaners Community Food Bank of Southeastern Michigan.

Another part of this alternative is to become a "Blessings in a Backpack" packing site. "Blessings in a Backpack" is a nonprofit and non-religious organization which mobilizes communities, individuals, and resources to provide food on the weekends for elementary school children across America who might otherwise go hungry ([blessingsinabackpack.org](http://blessingsinabackpack.org)). Due to IIMD's position as a community center every week members of the community are to pack back packs for a different elementary school in the area.

The Institute is to host events and all of the preparation needed for events. Utilizing IIMD volunteers to facilitate the hosting and general administrative duties, the Institute will aim to bring together both foreign-born and native-born residents of all ages and socio-economic statuses with the common purpose of feeding and bonding the community. This alternative aims to lead by example for the rest of the city by setting food security as a priority, and making it visible. In numerous studies eating regularly increases a child's academic performance (Figlio, 2002). In some cases, children who eat lunch score 18% higher in reading tests than those of students with less than a year of school lunches (Rajshri, 2019).

## Criteria:

This section seeks to describe the criteria by which each alternative will be examined.

IIMD seeks to promote the integration of the foreign-born children in Detroit, who are historically forgotten in policy decisions. As IIMD is a jack-of-all-trades in the realm of foreign-born integration, the aforementioned alternatives vary greatly from one another. Therefore, it is imperative that the criteria used to evaluate them apply to them all.

Each alternative is ranked on a low-medium-high scale, aside from direct cost which will be an estimate of direct and indirect costs with info on possibility of raising additional funds.

### Equity: Low-Medium-High

The goal of this criteria would be to ensure that both foreign-born and native Detroiters are being treated the same under each of the alternatives. Additionally, that all respective populations that the alternative could apply to has equal access to the program regardless of legal status. This, of course, includes making sure that no discrimination occurs on the basis of race, ethnicity, sex, social economic status, nationality, education level, or home ownership status (etc.). Equity is important for the International Institute of Metropolitan Detroit, as accessibility and fairness are two values that they were founded upon.

Equity would ensure that no burden falls onto vulnerable populations. Many of the foreign-born populations before arriving in the United States undergo extremely stressful situations, and should not bear the burden of revitalizing an entire community. Equity begs the question of where does the social allocation of burdens and benefits fall.

### Cost: Annual Cost

This criterion is one that would examine the direct cost if implementation of each alternative. This would be attempting to monetize all costs by looking at personnel, space rental, materials, training, outreach and publicity that will be needed in order to make each alternative a reality. Additionally, this could include room to apply for more grants, or other methods to raise money to expand the pool of resources. Under costs, I will try to account for indirect costs such as start-up costs that will arise as well.

### Administrative Commitment: Low-Medium-High

I will use this criterion to evaluate IIMD's administrative capacity to implement the alternative within the organization. Trying to answer the question if it is possible to actually implement the proposed policy/event. This involves finding out who or what is present within the organization in order to support the proposed alternative. This includes top managers, field staff, and support staff, and the facilities, and general equipment. This will involve compiling a list of the resources needed and available, and assessing the practicality of the proposed policy alternative.

## Political Feasibility

I will use Political feasibility to evaluate to what extent the proposed alternative will be acceptable to the different stakeholders in Detroit, the administrators/decision makers, community, unions, other stakeholders. I will do this by seeking to make sure that policy alternatives will be acceptable in terms of political and cultural sensitivity, and is appropriate to the values of the community and to the values of the institute. I will address how possible it would be to engage other nonprofits, NGOs, or the groups in the community that are Stakeholders in the issues that we are tackling with the Institute. Measuring this criterion would look like creating a shortlist of “who,” and assessing the practicality of their role in the proposed policy alternative.

## Findings and Recommendation

### Option 1: Maintaining the Status Quo

#### Equity: Medium-low

In 2018, The International Institute of Metropolitan Detroit provided 97,120 hours of the ESL program to Detroit residents, serving about 300 individuals. Of these 300 people, roughly 80% were foreign-born and 20% were native-Detroiters. This option scores Medium-low on equity because of the demographic break down. There are presently no ESL services for children offered through the institute. From the services that IIMD provides there are only two resources open to children. In Detroit 14% of children claim English as their second language (urban institute, 2018). Therefore, the allocation of the benefits of these language classes is not available to all those in need.

#### Direct Costs: No Additional Costs

Another important criterion to assess the practicality of this alternative is the cost of its implementation. Due to “Status Quo” being leaving the policy that is currently implemented by IIMD alone, the economic and human costs, as well as opportunity costs, are low and already accounted for compared to other alternatives. The Institute has been implementing this alternative, and does not require new infrastructure, training sessions, or new workers to be hired.

#### Political Feasibility: High

As this alternative has been in implementation already – this option rates high in political feasibility. IIMD offers both on-site classes in their building through their partnership with Detroit Public schools, and also off-site services for requests made by special arrangements. The classes have historically been offered off-site to businesses, the government, religious groups, or community in peoples’ homes throughout the metro-Detroit area. Administrators at IIMD are politically and culturally sensitive and take the values and customs of the community seriously when teaching both on-site and off-site classes. They show cultural sensitivity by selecting instructors that will be effective with certain groups, and wearing appropriate clothing as needed. Additionally, the city of Detroit supports the Institute’s endeavors financially. In 2018 the city allocated \$107,554 to IIMD programming, and the next year \$85,000 was granted by the city.

#### Administrative Commitment: High

This option scores high in Administrative Commitment, as it does not require any change from IIMD’s administrative standpoint. The institute already has a partnership with Detroit Public Schools in place. In addition to having relationships with community organizations.

## Option 2: Bolster Children Language Services

### Equity: High

This option scores high for equity because it is expected to reach the children who do not have mastery of English as their first language, while continuing the services they provided to adults. By expanding the program to include children there is the expectation that the uptake of adults may increase – if children are enrolled in ESL classes then their adult counterparts may have the availability to enroll if need be.

Additionally, this alternative ranks high because the proposed resource is to be made accessible to children regardless of their legal status or background for free. By giving a specialized program outside of school it allows children to spend more classroom time and integrate with their peers. Lowering the language barrier, and allowing the ability for ESL children to integrate meaningfully into their community and peer group.

### Cost: \$100,000 [See Appendix A]

In comparison to the other programming this event is relatively expensive, as it involves hiring new staff and start-up costs for a new language program. the first year of implementation it will cost IIMD approximately \$100,000 to hire three additional part-time licensed ESL teachers at a salary of \$32,000, which is approximately \$20/hour – in addition to supplies and administrative start-up costs. The classes for the students are to be free to participants. This alternative is to be paid for by the City of Detroit, donors, and additional grants which the institute receives in addition to its annual budget. Classes will be held within IIMD so there is no need to rent space. Class sizes will vary depending on the number of students, language of origin breakdown, and the starting levels of the students; they can be divided into small groups of 2~6 students, or Large groups of 20~25. While not charging a fee might seem costly, IIMD will see a return on investment in the long-term in terms of successful integration. By not charging for their ESL classes they lower the barrier of entry for families to integrate into their communities. Additionally, the money they raise from other foreign language classes that they provide such as Arabic and Spanish could help defray these costs.

### Political Feasibility: Medium-High

This option scores medium-high on feasibility because IIMD has community support and respect, which will aid in the difficult task of acquiring the additional funding. There is proven commitment from the city of Detroit, and local donors. Additionally, when assessing political feasibility, we look at a policy alternative's acceptability in regards to the stakeholders. Administrators at IIMD have a commitment to take matters of political and cultural sensitivity seriously when teaching both on-site and off-site classes. This lines up with the mission statement of IIMD which seeks not to assimilate foreign-born residents, but to integrate them into their community.

### Administrative Commitment: Medium-High

Based off of the success of the existing adult ESL trainings already in place – this option rates medium-high in administrative commitment. It entails the creation of administrative team, hiring of licensed teachers, a significant commitment, and the implementation process. Similar programs already exist within the Institute and therefore administrative commitment ranks medium-high because it is not starting completely from scratch. IIMD estimates that it can accomplish the setup of this program in four to six months assuming budget reallocation.



## Option 3: Youth Soccer League

### Equity: High

This alternative is for IIMD to form a partnership with Detroit City Football League to begin programming with the DCFC players and staff. It rates high in equity as it offers both children in the foreign-born population and the native-born population an opportunity to connect and develop through sport. The alternative is available to both populations equally.

### Cost: No additional costs

This alternative has no direct financial burden falling upon IIMD. The proposed partnership would have the financial costs fall on DCFC, and all administrative burden fall onto IIMD.

### Political Feasibility: High

Based on research done by the European Union on multiculturalism, and a case study in Australia, and St. Louis Missouri this option rates high. Soccer transcends cultural differences in a friendly and competitive way. In order to cultivate an international welcoming city, Detroit must embrace soccer's inclusive nature. This alternative would benefit both the community and stakeholders. DCFC is a newly professional team and is likely looking for good press. Additionally, the team is 50% foreign born players, and would be good role models for the children to play with. The scrimmages would reinforce language skills, help make cross-cultural connections, provide an outlet for athleticism, and an opportunity to grow as leaders.

### Administrative Commitment: Low-Medium

This alternative rates low-medium because it has the administrative burden fall on the Institute and has to set up a partnership from scratch. The institute would have to organize a soccer league for youths 12 and under, schedule open scrimmages with DCFC players, and coordinating with the schedule of DCFC. IIMD would need to hire and orient a staff of volunteers to address the needs that come with the aforementioned commitment including advertising and public relations. There is also the added complication of IIMD being a nonprofit partnering with a for profit firm, DCFC – this was into the commitment on the administrative end.

## Option 4: Hunger Campaign/Detroit is Hungry

### Equity: High

This option would have the Institute launch a food security awareness campaign, which includes hunger events such as an Empty Bowls Dinner, an art show, and becoming a packing site for Blessings in a Backpack. This rates high because food insecurity is something common among 30,000 Detroiters who are food insecure. 1 in 5 children in Detroit are fed through government assistance, and with events like these it draws both attention and a solution to the issue. It is done in a creative manner while also engaging community members in activities that bring them together. As discussed in the above literature review, foreign-born populations are vulnerable to food insecurity and the latter negatively impacts their health (Tarraf, 2017).

### Cost: \$13,290

This alternative would cost a total of 13,290. It would cost an estimate of \$290 to provide supplies for the Empty Bowls Dinner, which would seek to unite foreign-born and native-born populations. With Blessings in a Backpack, the International Institute of Metropolitan Detroit would start by seeking to sponsor 100 children in the Detroit public School system. This would amount to \$13,000. According to the Blessings website, \$130 will feed one child on the weekends for one 38-week school year.

### Political Feasibility: Medium-High

This alternative ranks medium-high in terms of political feasibility. There is already a similar movement downtown turning boxing gyms into soup kitchens on the weekends. This alternative is very on par with what the community of Detroit is aiming for, one of cultural inclusivity and where no one is left behind. Politically, in order to gain support from the mayor's office IIMD's hunger campaign will attract attention to the cause and aid in the difficult task of finances. This campaign might also be a weakness, only reason it is medium instead of high is due to the fact that local policy makers are not keen to drawing attention to what's ugly. This angle, no matter how optimistic, may cause hiccups in acquiring funding.

### Administrative Commitment: Medium

Administrative commitment is medium here because managing this campaign and subsequent events would be a great deal of work for the existing staff of IIMD. It would require the onboarding of new volunteers to aid in the administrative planning. Additionally, to put on consistent events it would require diligent event management and execution – this might run into hiccups during the pilot year.

Outcome Matrix for IIMD				
Alternatives	Equity	Cost	Political Feasibility	Administrative Commitment
Status Quo	Medium-Low	No additional	High	High
Childhood Language Services	High	\$100,000	High	Medium-High
DCFC Partnership	High	No additional	High	Low-Medium
Hunger Campaign	High	\$13,290	Medium-High	Medium

### Recommendation:

The recommendation that the Institute should take is to implement the expansion of the Language Services to offer classes for children at the center and off-site as well. Based on the analysis, it appears that an expansion of the program to include children will potentially allow not just more children to receive IIMD's resources, but it will allow more adults to be exposed to them as well. Since data suggests that of foreign-born children in Detroit, 46.56% report that both parents are limited English proficiency (urban institute, 2018). This statistic proves that this alternative is the best way to reach a large group of children and adults. Additionally, it will act as a supplement to those already enrolled in schools. This alternative will ensure that the curriculum will maximize focus on the individual's needs to successfully teach the English language, and help the 22.93% of foreign-born children in Detroit who have a limited proficiency with English (urban institute, 2018). Due to the resources the Institute already provides residents including language classes, this type of programming is one that

### Limitations:

I recognize that this policy recommendation has a few limitations. For instance, given the current pandemic, COVID-19, IIMD's priorities in supporting Detroiters may change after it reopens in the foreseeable future. When it does, it will most likely face major budget constraints and potentially cuts. Therefore, the capacity in which it will be able to serve its community will change, making any programming, like this ESL proposal, difficult to achieve or moved to the back-burner.

Additionally, it is hard to predict the cost for this specific option due to an inability to anticipate the need of the community, and the true indirect costs which will emerge as a result of the implementation. There is also the potential accessibility limitation that is not directly addressed in this project relating to transportation. Offering off-site lessons is meant to curb the effect of leaving children behind who do not access a way to get to the Institute.

## Implementation

The only way for the language expansion program to be successful is if it is implemented effectively. The following are considerations that need to be regarded during the implementation process. This includes various stakeholders and a description of next steps.

### Stakeholders

There are many stakeholders with a variety of interests regarding expanding the ESL option to include children in the city of Detroit. First, IIMD's staff, including teachers, all volunteers (from social workers to administrative) and the administration, will be involved in implementing each of the following steps. During the acquisition of funds stage, IIMD budgeting office will work closely with the city of Detroit, donors, and other community organizations. During the creation of the curriculum IIMD staff will be in contact with the Michigan Department of Education (MDE) to ensure that it is up to spec.

### Next Steps

#### ***Step 1: Acquisition of funds***

The first step will be to acquire funds for the expansion of the language services to include the ESL program for children. Potential sources of funding would include the city of Detroit, Grants, and donations. These funds will be used to pay for new teachers, supplies, and for the hours it takes to get the program started. Due to financial issues in Detroit, bureaucratic constraints, and the inconsistent flow of money from grants year-to-year this is projected to be a challenge. This might take four to six months before completion.

#### ***Step 1.5: Gaging of interest***

After the funds have been acquired IIMD will distribute a survey to the city of Detroit and the outer-limits it will serve. The survey will gage the interest of the target population and garner commitment of students, and collect data of what the families need and expect from a program like this, and what they expect to be the biggest hurdles.

#### ***Step 2: Hiring of teachers and onboarding of volunteers***

Based upon the amount of money received, and the interest level/community commitment IIMD will hire teachers and onboard volunteers accordingly. If there are limited funds there will be an emphasis on unpaid internships and volunteers.

#### ***Step 3: Organization of classes and curriculum***

This step will have the staff create a curriculum and schedule tailored to teaching ESL to P-12 children that meets the Michigan English Language Proficiency Standards and is provided to students year-round. This is to ensure that students maximize time spent in the class room with their native-born peers Once created all

students take a TOEFL test to test the proficiency/level of performance in English. Following the collection and interpretation of this data the students will be sorted into their respected classes.

#### ***Step 4: Documenting the pilot year***

During implementation, performance of all students needs to be quantified by taking the TOEFL (every 6 months, or at the start and end of every year depending on cost). Additionally, all challenges and successes in the program need to be recorded in a seasonal report. The students are a part of the pilot program are just as much part of the implementation process as the staff, their feedback matters, and should be recorded in “teacher logs.”

#### ***Step 5: Year One, reevaluate and reassess***

After the first year is completed all staff relating to the new ESL program are to gather and debrief the last year. They are to review the reports, TOEFL scores, the “teacher logs,” and administrators are to listen to the first-hand accounts from teachers and volunteers about what did and did not work. Following this, administrators are to go previous steps in the implementation process and adjust where need be.

## References

- Austin, J., Kolluri, A., Tobocman, S., Global Detroit, & Michigan Economic Center. (2017). *Michigan: We Are All Migrants Here* [Scholarly project]. In *Global Detroit*. Retrieved 2019, from [http://www.globaldetroit.com/wp-content/uploads/2017/07/Michigan-We-Are-All-Migrants-Here\\_2017.pdf](http://www.globaldetroit.com/wp-content/uploads/2017/07/Michigan-We-Are-All-Migrants-Here_2017.pdf)
- Bergson-Shilcock, A. (2018, September). *At the intersection of immigration and skills policy A roadmap to smart policies for state and local leaders* [Scholarly project]. Retrieved from [https://m.nationalskillscoalition.org/resources/publications/file/At-the-intersection-of-immigration-and-skills-policy\\_web.pdf](https://m.nationalskillscoalition.org/resources/publications/file/At-the-intersection-of-immigration-and-skills-policy_web.pdf)
- Berkowski, N. (2015, February 1). Detroit's culture and growth shaped by immigrant communities. Retrieved from <https://www.michigandaily.com/news/detroits-immigration>
- Blessings in a Backpack: How it works. (n.d.). Retrieved 2019, from <https://www.blessingsinabackpack.org/about/how-it-works/>
- Chanda, I. (2017, December). State Efforts to Help Immigrants Integrate. Retrieved from <http://www.ncsl.org/research/immigration/state-efforts-to-help-immigrants-integrate.aspx>
- Civitillo, J. (2014, March). <https://digital.library.adelaide.edu.au/dspace/bitstream/2440/85189/8/02whole.pdf>. Retrieved from <https://digital.library.adelaide.edu.au/dspace/bitstream/2440/85189/8/02whole.pdf>
- Cruz, J., & G. (2014, March 3). Metro Detroit's Foreign-Born Populations. Retrieved from [http://www.globaldetroit.com/wp-content/uploads/2014/10/Global\\_Detroit\\_MetoDetroitForeignbornmar2014full.pdf](http://www.globaldetroit.com/wp-content/uploads/2014/10/Global_Detroit_MetoDetroitForeignbornmar2014full.pdf)
- Detroit Children Foreign-born data set. (2019, May 15). Retrieved from <https://educationdata.urban.org/data-explorer/schools/>
- DeVito. (2019, October 05). It looks like Detroit City FC is going pro after all. Retrieved from <https://www.metrotimes.com/the-scene/archives/2019/08/15/it-looks-like-detroit-city-fc-is-going-pro-after-all>

- Enchautegui, M., & Giannarelli, L. (2015, December). The Economic Impact of Naturalization on Immigrants and Cities. Retrieved from <https://www.urban.org/sites/default/files/publication/76241/2000549-The-Economic-Impact-of-Naturalization-on-Immigrants-and-Cities.pdf>
- Figlio, D., & Winicki, J. (2002, November). FOOD FOR THOUGHT: THE EFFECTS OF SCHOOL ACCOUNTABILITY PLANS ON SCHOOL NUTRITION. Retrieved from <https://www.nber.org/papers/w9319.pdf>
- Forsyth. (2014, June 20). Homeland Security says 52,000 minors at U.S. borders since October. Retrieved from <https://www.reuters.com/article/us-usa-immigration-children/homeland-security-says-52000-minors-at-u-s-borders-since-october-idUSKBN0EV24E20140620>
- Frolik, C. (2014, April 26). Measuring the success of Welcome Dayton. Retrieved from <https://www.daytondailynews.com/news/measuring-the-success-welcome-dayton/AAdSVtqSmj3M0DL8ehcWQJ/>
- Houle, R., & Pereira, D. (2014, June). Statistical Portrait of the Frenchspeaking Immigrant Population Outside Quebec (1991-2011). Retrieved from [http://bc.p2pcanada.ca/wp-content/blogs.dir/1/files/2015/05/R8-2014\\_FrenchPop-outsideQC\\_ENG.pdf](http://bc.p2pcanada.ca/wp-content/blogs.dir/1/files/2015/05/R8-2014_FrenchPop-outsideQC_ENG.pdf)
- Immigrants in Michigan: Fact Sheet. (2017, October 13). Retrieved from <https://www.americanimmigrationcouncil.org/research/immigrants-in-michigan>
- Imprint Staff. (2017, May 23). Michigan: Promoting New Pathways for Immigrant Integration. Retrieved from [https://www.imprintproject.org/michigan\\_promoting\\_new\\_pathways/](https://www.imprintproject.org/michigan_promoting_new_pathways/)
- International Institute of Metropolitan Detroit: Programs and Services. (n.d.). Retrieved from <http://www.iimd.org/programs-services/>
- Jiménez, T. (2015, August 12). Immigrants in the United States: How Well Are They Integrating into Society? Retrieved from <https://www.migrationpolicy.org/research/immigrants-united-states-how-well-are-they-integrating-society>
- Jordan. (2019, December 02). New report reveals 30,000 detroiters do not have access to healthy food. Retrieved from <https://www.metrotimes.com/news-hits/archives/2018/03/08/new-report-reveals-30000-detroiters-do-not-have-access-to-healthy-food>



- K. (2018). Children in immigrant families in Detroit. Retrieved from <https://datacenter.kidscount.org/data/tables/115-children-in-immigrant-families?loc=1&loct=3#detailed/3/58/false/37,871,870,573,869,36,868,867,133,38/any/445,446>
- Keeping the American Dream Alive. (2018, September 21). Retrieved from <https://www.dhs.gov/blog/2015/12/16/keeping-american-dream-alive>
- Mohdin A. (2015, October 16). "Here to stay, here to play:" The soccer teams in Europe composed entirely of refugees. Retrieved from <https://qz.com/521980/here-to-stay-here-to-play-the-soccer-teams-in-europe-composed-entirely-of-refugees/>
- Nagel, M. (2014). Gateways KC: Becoming a Welcoming Community. Retrieved from [https://www.marc.org/Data-Economy/Workforce-Development/GradForce-KC/Gateways-for-Growth/Assets/GatewaysKC\\_ToolkitforLocalCommunities.aspx](https://www.marc.org/Data-Economy/Workforce-Development/GradForce-KC/Gateways-for-Growth/Assets/GatewaysKC_ToolkitforLocalCommunities.aspx)
- Northrop, A. (2015, June 17). New Americans in Michigan. Retrieved from [https://www.canr.msu.edu/news/new\\_americans\\_in\\_michigan](https://www.canr.msu.edu/news/new_americans_in_michigan)
- Northrop, A. (2018, March 26). "Brain Waste" in the United States. Retrieved from [https://www.canr.msu.edu/news/brain\\_waste\\_in\\_the\\_united\\_states](https://www.canr.msu.edu/news/brain_waste_in_the_united_states)
- Northrop. (2018, March 26). Michigan navigates immigrant brain waste well compared to other states. Retrieved from [https://www.canr.msu.edu/news/michigan\\_navigates\\_immigrant\\_brain\\_waste\\_well\\_compared\\_to\\_other\\_states](https://www.canr.msu.edu/news/michigan_navigates_immigrant_brain_waste_well_compared_to_other_states)
- O'Dea. (2019, October 10). St. Louis third for fastest-growing foreign-born population, new Census data shows. Retrieved from [https://www.stltoday.com/news/local/metro/st-louis-third-for-fastest-growing-foreign-born-population-new/article\\_cf256c4c-2a18-5dbd-ad40-863192b46bf6.html](https://www.stltoday.com/news/local/metro/st-louis-third-for-fastest-growing-foreign-born-population-new/article_cf256c4c-2a18-5dbd-ad40-863192b46bf6.html)
- P. (2004, August). EUROPEAN COMMISSION DG EDUCATION & CULTURE STUDIES ON EDUCATION AND SPORT SPORT AND MULTICULTURALISM (LOT 3) FINAL REPORT. Retrieved from <http://isca-web.org/files/Sport%20and%20Multiculturalism%20EU%202004.pdf>
- Pastor M., Ortiz R., & Graauw E. (2016). *OPENING MINDS, OPENING DOORS, OPENING COMMUNITIES: CITIES LEADING FOR IMMIGRANT INTEGRATION* [Scholarly project]. In *The*

- USC Center for the Study of Immigrant Integration*. Retrieved from [https://www.welcomingamerica.org/sites/default/files/USC\\_Report\\_Final.pdf](https://www.welcomingamerica.org/sites/default/files/USC_Report_Final.pdf)
- Rajshri. (2019, February 13). Children who eat lunch score 18 percent higher in reading tests. Retrieved from <https://www.sciencedaily.com/releases/2019/02/190213081640.htm>
- S. (n.d.). Regional Prosperity Through Immigration and Innovation. Retrieved from <http://www.stlmosaicproject.org/>
- S. (n.d.). Who We Are: Welcoming America. Retrieved from <https://www.welcomingamerica.org/about/who-we-are>
- Sport Builds Bridges. (2018). Retrieved from <https://www.beyondsport.org/project/s/sport-builds-bridges/>
- State of Michigan. (n.d.). Office of Global Michigan. Retrieved from <https://www.michigan.gov/ogm>
- Szurpicki, S. (2013). Global Detroit: Welcoming immigrants equals economic impact. Retrieved from <https://www.modeldmedia.com/features/globaldetroit212.aspx>
- Tanner, K. (2015, November 14). Database: Which languages are spoken in your community? Retrieved 2020, from <https://www.freep.com/story/opinion/contributors/raw-data/2015/11/14/database-which-languages-spoken-your-community/75657226/>
- Tarraf, Sanou, D., & Giroux, I. (2017, February 15). Immigration and Food Insecurity: The Canadian Experience-A Literature Review. Retrieved from <https://www.intechopen.com/books/people-s-movements-in-the-21st-century-risks-challenges-and-benefits/immigration-and-food-insecurity-the-canadian-experience-a-literature-review>
- Tobocman, S. (2014, August). Revitalizing Detroit, Is There a Role for Integration? Retrieved from [file:///Users/annaharitos/Downloads/TCM\\_CitiesDetroit.pdf](file:///Users/annaharitos/Downloads/TCM_CitiesDetroit.pdf)
- U. (2019, September 25). American Community Survey (ACS). Retrieved from <https://www.census.gov/programs-surveys/acs/>
- Valencia R. (2009, October 26). It's All About Fútbol. Retrieved from <https://www.americanprogress.org/issues/immigration/news/2009/10/07/6747/its-all-about-futbol/>

Warikoo, N. (2019, October 22). 'Immigrants are helping Michigan,' nonprofit founder says at Detroit conference. Retrieved from <https://www.freep.com/story/news/local/michigan/2019/10/22/national-immigration-conference-detroit/4056911002/>

Welcome to Welcoming Michigan: Welcoming Michigan. (2014). Retrieved from <https://welcomingmichigan.org/>

## Appendix A

### Cost Analysis

#### Alternative 2: ESL Program

Cost of hiring 1 English-Second-Language (ESL) teacher part-time for 1-year school program to develop and implement an after-school program:

Teacher annual salary (part time/Low) = \$32,000

The International Institute of Metropolitan Detroit would seek to hire three additional teachers at this salary.

$\$32,000 \times 3 = \$96,000$

An additional **\$4,000** would be appointed for supplies and start-up costs for the program.

Total Policy Cost =  $\$96,000 + \$4,000 = \mathbf{\$100,000}$  for year one

#### Alternative 4: Hunger Campaign

Cost of Art Supplies for empty bowls Dinner: \$290

Cost of 50 pounds of clay, makes 40 bowls (3 packs):  $\$20 \times 3 = \mathbf{\$60}$

Cost of Stain for Bowls (12 bottles, large): **\$200**

Cost of paint brushes (120):  $10 \times 3 = \mathbf{\$30}$

**Total: Approximately \$290 for supplies alone**

The cost to sponsor one student for one calendar year is \$130

IIMD to sponsor 100 students locally:  $\$130 \times 100 = \mathbf{\$13,000}$

Total Policy Cost =  $\$290 + \$13,000 = \mathbf{\$13,290}$