**Yuqing Huang**

Notes on report:

Provided a good introduction into the subject matter of the paper and the necessity for studying phonons to evaluate thermal conductivity in various systems.

Good quick description of harmonic and anharmonic theory.

Very thorough description of the normal mode analysis techniques.

Very good critical analysis of the paper.

There are a number of typos in the manuscript that make for tedious reading. Proofreading (and potentially English language skills) must improve for publication quality technical writing.

Yuqing clearly has a strong grasp of the literature surrounding this manuscript, likely through previous reading, her studies, and through a thorough researching of the topic material. She has demonstrated the ability to research and critically analyze a technical manuscript and provide constructive feedback.

Notes on presentation:

Going very quickly. Perhaps nerves.

Very proficient at technical aspects, but still can struggle with practical application of theory.

Questions:

What are the crystal systems where this does not apply?

Benefits of one method over the other? Computational expense associated with obtaining eigenvectors?

How do these temperatures compare to the melting point? Is there a point in temperature where eigenvectors should become important?

How sensitive would something like calculation of tau be to simulation parameters?

Evaluation:

Good answers to my questions. Did an ok job answering other’s questions, but still struggled a bit with either understanding or being able to grasp what others were asking.