Reviews and their reconciliation for manuscript submitted to Transactions of the American Fisheries Society, Meyer et al. 2022

11/17/2022

Hello Dr. Sutton,

In October 2022 the manuscript, “Landscape characteristics influence projected growth rates of stream-resident juvenile salmon in the face of climate change in the Kenai River watershed, southcentral Alaska" was submitted to Transactions of the American Fisheries Society (TAFS) by Meyer et al. The manuscript was returned for minor revisions. The reviews from one peer reviewer and one associate editor were received by email on November 10, 2022.

The reviews and recommended edits are listed in the attached document, “Response to Decision Letter,” in black text, along with responses and reconciliations below each subject in red text. We appreciate the guidance and are grateful for the opportunity to provide TAFS editors with a manuscript incorporating the recommended revisions.

Sincerely,

Benjamin Meyer

From: **Trent Sutton** <onbehalfof@manuscriptcentral.com>
Date: Thu, Nov 10, 2022 at 9:24 AM
Subject: Transactions of the American Fisheries Society - Decision on Manuscript ID TAFS-2022-0081
To: <benjamin.meyer.ak@gmail.com>
CC: <tmsutton@alaska.edu>

10 November 2022

Dear Mr. Meyer:

Thank you for submitting your manuscript entitled "Landscape characteristics influence projected growth rates of stream-resident juvenile salmon in the face of climate change in the Kenai River watershed, southcentral Alaska" to Transactions of the American Fisheries Society (TAFS). Comments on your manuscript were received the Associate Editor (AE) assigned to your manuscript.

The AE and I agree that subject to a revision, your study and resulting revised manuscript could provide a useful contribution to the fisheries literature that is of interest to the readership of this journal. The AE provided several comments that will serve you and your co-authors well in guiding your revision. An additional edit is that most of your figures do not have a figure number (e.g., figure 1, figure 2, etc.). Please be sure to include that information in your revision.

The revised submission includes figure numbers.

For us to evaluate your revision, I highlight the requirement to prepare a point-by-point response to the comments and questions. It is important to note that to be considered for publication in TAFS, the manuscript will need to meet each of these stipulations. To start the revision, please click on the link below:

*** PLEASE NOTE: This is a two-step process. After clicking on the link, you will be directed to a webpage to confirm. ***

https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/tafs?URL_MASK=48b63243cb2143b091e97657a98ae48a

This will take you directly to the section of the site where you can submit your revision. Please (1) update the information provided as needed, (2) upload the file(s) containing your revised manuscript, and (3) upload a separate file containing detailed, point-by-point responses to the reviewers' and editors' comments. Using the drop-down menu, designate the manuscript files according to type ("Main Document," and so forth); designate the file containing your responses as "Response to Decision Letter."

This link will remain active until you have submitted your revised manuscript. If you begin a revision and intend to finish it at a later time, please note that your draft will appear in the "Revised Manuscripts in Draft" queue in your Author Center.

If the link above does not work, please log into your author center at https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/tafs and click on "Manuscripts Awaiting Revision" to submit your revision.

IMPORTANT: Your original files are available to you when you upload your revised manuscript. Please delete any redundant files before completing the submission.

Because we are trying to facilitate timely publication of manuscripts submitted to Transactions of the American Fisheries Society, your revised manuscript must be uploaded within 30 days (no later than 10 December 2022). If it is not possible for you to submit your revision by this date, we may have to consider your paper as a new submission.

Once again, thank you for submitting your manuscript to Transactions of the American Fisheries Society. I look forward to receiving your revision of this manuscript.

Sincerely,
Trent Sutton
Editor, Transactions of the American Fisheries Society
tmsutton@alaska.edu

Reviewer(s)' Comments to Author:

Associate Editor
Comments to the Author:
I read the responses to the comments on the previous version and the revised manuscript (ID TAFS-2022-0081) entitled "Landscape characteristics influence projected growth rates of stream-resident juvenile salmon in the face of climate change in the Kenai River watershed, southcentral Alaska." I think the major point of reducing the length of the manuscript, moving text to the supplemental text, and reducing the references has been addressed by the authors. In the editing of the revised manuscript, however, there are a few sections that now need an improved presentation.

In the Impact Statement, I suggest using a different phrase than 'eat less food' and replacing it with details that more accurate describe the inference from the modeling on feeding rate.

We have revised "eats less food" to "lower feeding rate."

In the Discussion, the sentence on lines 492-496 is long and hard to follow. It is not clear how a limited ability to forecast is a justification for the time scale being an appropriate choice. I also do not think the two sentences from lines 492-498 form a standalone paragraph and the ideas should be incorporated elsewhere.

I have revised this section and combined it with the prior paragraph. The content is now found in lines 491-496.

In the text discussing the influence of glaciers, I was wondering whether glaciers are expected to still be present in these watersheds in the future during the periods (2060-2069) assessed in the modeling and I think this should be mentioned. The idea of glacial retreat is mentioned for sensitivity, but I think it would be good to mention related to growth outcomes.

We have revised the sentence at line 497 to clarify that glaciers are projected to still be influencing the Kenai River watershed in the 2060-2069 period (McGrath et al. 2017). The section directly following, “Juvenile Salmon Growth Under Future Warming Scenarios,” discusses implications.