

Guidelines for IEEE-CS EIC Search Committees

Benjamin W. Wah

First Vice President for Publications
IEEE Computer Society

Drafted: March 1998; Revised: September 1998, May 1999, December 1999

The following is a set of guidelines that a search committee should follow in recommending an editor-in-chief for a Computer Society (CS) journal. This document supplements the statements in Section 10.2.7 of the *CS Policy and Procedures Manual (PPM): Editor-in-Chief Search Committees* (see Appendix A). In case of inconsistencies between the guidelines and the PPM, the PPM takes precedence over the guidelines.

The CS bylaws provide that editors-in-chief shall be appointed by the CS President, upon recommendation of the Publications Board, with the advice and consent of the Board of Governors. Section 3, Article IX of the new Bylaw provisions approved by the Board of Governors in 1999 reads as follows:

1. *There shall be an editor-in-chief appointed for each periodical publication. There shall be one or more editors-in-chief appointed for the Computer Society Press, as provided in the IEEE Computer Society Policies and Procedures Manual.*
2. *The Publications Board shall recommend to the President two or more candidates for each editor-in-chief position at various times as required.*
3. *The President, with the advice and consent of the Board of Governors, shall appoint each editor-in-chief for a term not to exceed two years. In the case of a new periodical, the initial appointment may be for a maximum of three years.*
4. *Editors-in-chief may serve a maximum of two consecutive terms in a given position.*

The search committee reports to the Publications Board and recommends two or more qualified candidates to the Publications Board. The President then makes his/her selection from among the two or more candidates recommended by the Publications Board. Section 10.2.7.3 of the PPM states:

“ The functions of each body and officer need to be well understood by all involved: the search committee’s function is to identify and recommend candidates; the Publications Board reviews those candidates and makes its recommendations to the President; the President selects and appoints the EIC; and the Board of Governors reviews and consents to the appointment.”

1 The Search Committee

The role of the search committee is to seek potential candidates, collect necessary supporting documents from the candidates, evaluate them for suitability of appointment, and recommend to the Publications Board possible candidates for appointment. The committee is appointed by the Vice President for Publications. Section 10.2.7.1 of the PPM states:

“ The Publications Board chair shall establish an ad hoc EIC Search Committee for the open position, consisting of at least three members, at least nine months in advance of the known vacancy. The process would be expedited in the case of extraordinary vacancies (e.g., the resignation, severe or prolonged illness, or death of an EIC). In such extraordinary situations, the Vice President for Publications, in concurrence with the Publications Board, would, as expeditiously as possible, recommend to the President for appointment, an ‘acting’ EIC, while the EIC search is conducted.”

The search committee should consist of the following voting members:

- The chair, an expert in the area of the search who is not closely associated with the journal currently. The chair is excluded from voting except in cases of ties, according to Robert’s rules of order.
- The current EIC. However, the current EIC should be excluded from the committee if he/she is seeking reappointment.
- A representative from the current editorial board.
- Several members not involved with day-to-day operations of the journal. Chairs of related technical committees may be invited to join the search committee, or to nominate members, but the appointment of such individuals shall be at the discretion of the Vice President for Publications.

The non-voting ex-officio members are:

- Vice President for Publications or a member of the Publications Board.
- President of Computer Society or his/her designate.
- One or two members of the staff with knowledge of the publication to be appointed by the Executive Director and CEO of the Society.

Care should be taken in selecting members of the committee to avoid any bias.

2 Search Schedule

For a new appointment, the search committee should be formed preferably twelve months prior to the beginning of the appointment. The committee should adhere to the following schedule in order to meet the meeting schedule of the IEEE-CS Board of Governors.

October 1	• Formation of the search committee and solicitation of potential candidates
November 1	• Publication of a journal-specific announcement in the CS home page
November 15	• Status report to the CS Publications Board
January 1	• Publication of a generic announcement in <i>IEEE Computer</i>
February 15	• Initial candidates identified
	• Status report to the CS Publications Board
March 15	• Deadline for candidates to submit applications
April 1	• Deadline for candidates to submit vision statements
May 1	• Written report on the search process, candidates evaluated, and vision statements from all the candidates to VP for Publications
	• Recommended EIC candidate(s) to VP for Publications
June 1	• Presentation to the CS Pubs. Board (only the candidate(s) recommended by the search committee will be discussed in executive session). The search committee chair does not have to present the report in person to the Pubs. Board.

The above schedule may be different when seeking a new EIC of a magazine. In that case, the search may be started 24 months prior to the appointment date so that the search can be concluded one year ahead of time. This allows the new appointee to have one-year overlap with the current EIC and to learn the operations of the magazine before assuming full responsibility.

When an existing EIC can be reappointed, the search committee should be formed approximately fourteen months prior to the beginning of the appointment. The committee should initially evaluate the current EIC to determine whether reappointment is recommended. This process should be completed in two months, since a regular search must be conducted in case that the current EIC is not seeking reappointment or the committee does not recommend reappointment.

3 Identifying Candidates

There is no single best procedure that will yield good EIC candidates. Search committees have considerable flexibility in their approach to this task so that they may adapt the unique circumstances of each publication, technical field, and time. Section 10.2.7.2 of the PPM states:

“ The search committee should develop a list of candidates through open solicitation, including recommendations from the corresponding operations committee.

The candidates are most likely to be drawn from the pool of people being mentored for EIC positions, from former or present associate editors, and from the pool of people who have editorial experience outside of the CS. Recommendations for candidates should be sought from technical committees, conferences, and other editorial boards.”

A successful search depends heavily on personal contacts and working experience with present and past editorial-board members, authors, and reviewers. A candidate normally should have ample prior experience with the journal in order to be considered. Such experience may include, but not limited to, serving as past/present editors of the editorial board, active publication of papers in the journal (presently or in the past), and service as responsible reviewers of the journal. If the search is for a new EIC, then the current EIC, the CS managing editor, and officers of related technical committees may be able to provide names of potential candidates to be considered.

The EIC position should be publicized adequately in order to give a fair chance for everyone interested to apply. The CS Publisher is responsible for publishing an announcement in the January issue of *IEEE Computer* that contains a generic announcement of all ongoing EIC searches that year. More specific announcements for each journal should be drafted by the search committee chairs and published in each journal and in the CS home page. An example announcement for *IEEE Software* is attached in Appendix B.

It is important that the search be conducted fairly and be open to all. Further, according to Section 10.2.7.3 of the PPM,

“ It is important that the search committee keeps the Vice President for Publications and the President of the society aware of the candidates being considered.”

4 Information Needed from Each Candidate

Each EIC candidate, including those seeking reappointment, should provide the following information, according to Section 10.2.7.4 of the PPM.

“ Early in the search process the committee should ask each candidate to prepare and provide a plan that details the prospective course of action that the candidate projects to take with respect to the publication. This plan should include: (1) the candidate’s perspective of the publication to include challenges and opportunities, (2) the tasks of the EIC to meet the challenges and to exploit the opportunities, (3) the objective milestones associated with the intermediate and final accomplishment of these tasks, (4) the projected schedules for the accomplishment of these milestones, (5) the projected organization which will accomplish these tasks, and (6) the funding requirements to accomplish these tasks. These are necessary conditions for consideration as a candidate.”

The vision statement should detail the candidate’s plan for the journal. It should include, but not limited to, the following:

- Candidate's editorial experience;
- Reasons why this candidate is specially qualified as EIC of this journal;
- Candidate's vision of the field of the journal: the directions it should take; its hot, warm, and cold areas;
- Current issues with the journal: backlog, special issues, etc.;
- Ways to improve the readability of the journal: special initiatives, survey articles, etc.;
- Methods to shorten reviewing time;
- Other plans for improvement.

In addition, if the candidate is the current EIC seeking reappointment, he/she should provide the following:

- Candidate's accomplishments as EIC in the past year.

The candidate may be allowed to revise his/her vision statement (given enough time) according to the comments provided by the search committee.

Each candidate must provide at the time of application a letter of support from his/her institution detailing (if any) release time, and supports for secretaries, computers, telephone calls, and postage. Since the Computer Society does not provide stipend and release-time support, it is important that all candidates secure such supports from their institutions before submitting their applications.

Each candidate must also provide a detailed resume, listing all past and present affiliations, editorial positions held, and activities in professional societies and technical conferences. Further, each candidate should provide a complete list of publications, honors and awards received, and other information deemed relevant to the EIC position.

5 Evaluating the Candidates

The vision statement and the candidate's qualifications should be used as a basis for evaluating a candidate. The search committee is also encouraged to seek comments from others outside the committee with respect to the candidate's capability, personality, and qualifications.

The evaluations of candidates should be based on the following ten criteria:

1. Candidate's overall technical achievements and reputation,
2. Candidate's overall experience in serving as an (associate) editor,
3. Candidate's vision for the journal (based on his/her (revised) vision statement),

4. Candidate's experience with IEEE-CS journals,
5. Potential conflicts of interest between the candidate and the journal (e.g. as an editor of a competing journal),
6. Candidate's organizational/leadership skills as demonstrated in his/her past experience,
7. Candidate's personality that is amenable to the EIC job (e.g. being too strict or too lenient),
8. Level of support from the candidate's institution,
9. Candidate's job stability during the two-year appointment term,
10. Candidate's networking with technical peers and with industry.

In addition, if a candidate is the current EIC seeking reappointment, the search committee should poll existing members of the editorial board (and the advisory board if one exists), authors, reviewers, etc. to find out the candidate's performance as EIC. The following two criteria should be considered:

11. Candidate's interactions with authors in the past year: timeliness, fairness, etc.;
12. Candidate's interactions with CS staff, editors, reviewers, advisory board members, etc.

Based on the above criteria, each committee member should indicate for each candidate and each criterion a score between -5 and 5, where higher scores (5 being the highest) are more favorable to the candidate and lower scores (-5 being the lowest) indicate concerns. Use 0 to denote a neutral position or not known.

Criterion	Candidate 1	Candidate 2	Candidate 3
Achievements and Reputation			
Editorship Experience			
Vision of the Journal			
IEEE-CS Journal Experience			
Conflicts of Interest			
Leadership Skills			
Personality			
Institutional Support			
Job Stability			
Networking with Community			
EIC's Past Performance			
EIC's CS Interactions			
Average Score			

6 Committee Recommendations and Reports

Each search committee should recommend two or more qualified candidates to the Publications Board. In exceptional cases in which it is difficult to find more than one candidate, only one candidate may be recommended. It is important that all search committee members maintain strict confidentiality on the candidates recommended by and the deliberations in the search committee. Discussions in the search process should not be disclosed to people who do not participate in the search process.

Each search committee is required to submit a final report by the deadline to the Vice President for Publications detailing the search process, the candidates evaluated, their vision statements, their resumes, their institutions' letters of support, the committee's votes, and the committee's comments. The table in Section 5 summarizing the scores should also be submitted. The report will be for internal use only, and care should be exercised in its preparation. It will also be submitted to the President together with the recommendations of the search committee and the Publications Board.

Sections 10.2.7.5-10.2.7.6 of the PPM state:

“ After the search committee recommends¹ its top candidate(s), the chair should discuss the committee's recommendations with the Vice President for Publications and the President.”

“ The search committee reports its finding and recommendations to the Publications Board in executive session. The Publications Board should make its recommendation to the President in confidence. No public disclosure of the candidates' identities should be made until after the President has agreed to the appointment.”

Section 10.2.7.7 of the PPM states:

“ As provided in the bylaws, the final step in the process occurs when the President presents the appointment to the Board of Governors for concurrence as provided in the bylaws. This should include a copy of the successful candidate's plans.”

After the President has made the appointment (normally one to two weeks after the June Board of Governors meeting) and after the Vice President for Publications has indicated that the appointment is final, the search committee chair can inform all the candidates of the outcome of the search. This should be done in a timely manner. The chair may send a summary of the comments by the reviewers and the committee members to the candidates, provided that the comments are presented in a manner to protect the identity of the reviewers. The chair's report to the Publications Board *should not* be distributed to the candidates.

¹A change to the language in the PPM will be made in 2000.

Appendix A: Section 10.2.7 of CS Policy and Procedures Manual: Editor-in-Chief Search Committees

The editor-in-chief (EIC) Search Committees shall function as follows:

1. The Publications Board chair shall establish an *ad hoc* EIC Search Committee for the open position, consisting of at least three members, at least nine months in advance of the known vacancy. The process would be expedited in the case of extraordinary vacancies (e.g., the resignation, severe or prolonged illness, or death of an EIC). In such extraordinary situations, the Vice President for Publications, in concurrence with the Publications Board, would, as expeditiously as possible, recommend to the President for appointment, an “acting” EIC, while the EIC search is conducted.
2. The search committee should develop a list of candidates through open solicitation, including recommendations from the corresponding operations committee. The candidates are most likely to be drawn from the pool of people being mentored for EIC positions, from former or present associate editors, and from the pool of people who have editorial experience outside of the CS. Recommendations for candidates should be sought from technical committees, conferences, and other editorial boards.
3. As the search progresses, the search committee should keep the Vice President for Publications and President of the society aware of the candidates being considered. The functions of each body and officer need to be well understood by all involved: the search committee’s function is to identify and recommend candidates; the Publications Board reviews those candidates and makes its recommendations to the President; the President selects and appoints the EIC; and the Board of Governors reviews and consents to the appointment.
4. Early in the search process the committee should ask each candidate:
 - a) To obtain a letter of institutional/employer support for this editorship should it be offered.
 - b) To prepare and provide a plan that details the prospective course of action that the candidate projects to take with respect to the publication. This plan should include: (1) the candidate’s perspective of the publication to include challenges and opportunities, (2) the tasks of the EIC to meet the challenges and to exploit the opportunities, (3) the objective milestones associated with the intermediate and final accomplishment of these tasks, (4) the projected schedules for the accomplishment of these milestones, (5) the projected organization which will accomplish these tasks, and (6) the funding requirements to accomplish these tasks. These are necessary conditions for consideration as a candidate.

5. After the search committee recommends its top candidate(s), the chair should discuss the committee's recommendations with the Vice President for Publications and the President.
6. The search committee reports its finding and recommendations to the Publications Board in executive session. The Publications Board should make its recommendation to the President in confidence. No public disclosure of the candidates' identities should be made until after the President has agreed to the appointment.
7. As provided in the bylaws, the final step in the process occurs when the President presents the appointment to the Board of Governors for concurrence as provided in the bylaws. This should include a copy of the successful candidate's plans.
8. Editors-in-chief may be appointed for a maximum of two consecutive terms for a given position. The total time shall not exceed four years, except for an initial EIC of a new publication. At the discretion of the Vice President for Publications, the two-year term of office of the first editor-in-chief shall begin with the publication of the first issue of that periodical.

Appendix B: An Example of Call for Nomination of IEEE Software

The IEEE Computer Society is seeking applicants for the position of Editor-in-Chief (EIC) of *IEEE Software* for the publication years 1999 and 2000. The EIC position is a two-year appointment by the President of the Computer Society.

Publications are one of the most tangible services that the Computer Society provides its members. Therefore, EICs play a critical role in the success of the Computer Society.

Scope of IEEE Software

IEEE Software stimulates and tracks advances in software technology and transfers that technology to the software professionals who define the core technologies on which so much commercial software is based. *IEEE Software* does this with its unique combination of research articles, case studies, tutorials, and regular department coverage of critical enabling disciplines such as quality assurance, human factors, management, and government and social policy. It also does this through announcements of products and reviews of books that software practitioners use and read. The readers of *IEEE Software* are the industry's leaders—the software practitioners responsible for doing, managing, or teaching the development and implementation of software, as well as engineers and managers of systems that include software. (Computer Society Policies and Procedures Manual; section 10.5.5)

Qualifications and Requirements of Candidates

Key qualities of the EIC are a good understanding of industry, academic, and government needs, plus the managerial skills to manage the editorial cycle in a timely fashion. The Computer Society is consolidating all of the manuscript tracking process in its Los Alamitos, California, Publications Office. Therefore, in the future new EICs will be able to concentrate their energy on content development and manuscript solicitation. The EIC must also be able to attract respected experts to his/her editorial board.

Major responsibilities of the future EIC of *IEEE Software* include:

- Actively solicit high-quality manuscripts from potential authors, and (with the help of the IEEE-CS staff) assist these authors in getting their manuscripts published.
- Identify and appoint editorial board members with the concurrence of the Publications Board.
- Select competent reviewers, in cooperation with the IEEE-CS publications staff and the Manuscripts Management System, to reach conclusions and make decisions on manuscripts in a timely fashion.
- Direct editorial board members to seek special-issue proposals and manuscripts in specific areas.
- Interact with an industrial advisory board to strengthen the links between *IEEE Software* and the practitioner's world.

- Provide a clear board focus through promotion of personal vision and guidance where appropriate.
- Resolve conflicts or problems as necessary.
- Applicants should have recognized expertise in the computer science and software engineering community, possess editorial experience, and be able to lead an active editorial board and an existing industrial advisory board to work effectively with technical and publishing professionals. Applicants must have clear employer support for this activity.

Search Procedure

Prospective candidates are requested to provide a complete CV, a vision statement describing the candidate's vision of the future of *IEEE Software*, and a letter of support from the candidate's employer by DATE.

Interested applicants are encouraged to submit vision statements and CVs electronically. Letters of support from individual organizations should be mailed via regular mail to Carl Chang.

Each vision statement should include but is not limited to the following: candidate's experience as editor, assessment of recently published issues, future directions, an approach to improve readability, and a plan to streamline the review process.

The search committee consists of

Mark Christensen	Northrop Grumman	chrisma@mail.northgrum.com
William W. Everett	Software Process and Reliability Engineering	w.w.everett@computer.org
Michael Hinchey	New Jersey Inst. of Technology	b.hinchey@computer.org
Ted Lewis	Naval Postgraduate School	t.lewis@computer.org
Alan Davis	University of Colorado at Colorado Springs	a.davis@computer.org
	Current Editor-in-Chief, <i>IEEE Software</i>	
Dale Strok	IEEE Computer Society	d.strok@computer.org
	Managing Editor, <i>IEEE Software</i>	
Roger Pressman	R.S. Pressman and Asso., Inc.	r.pressman@computer.org
	Editorial Board representative, <i>IEEE Software</i>	
Melissa Murphy	Sandia National Laboratories	m.murphy@computer.org
	Chair, Industrial Advisory Board of <i>IEEE Software</i>	

For further information, please contact:

Carl K. Chang, Chair
IEEE Software EIC Search Committee
 Department of EECS (M/C 154)
 The University of Illinois at Chicago
 Chicago, IL 60607
 Tel: 312/996-4860 or 996-2603
 Fax: 312/413-1386 or 413-0024
 Internet: ckchang@uic.edu
 URL: <http://www.icse.eecs.uic.edu>