

Q : Suppose there're 25 students in your discussion .

Which one is more likely ?

- ① there're two students with the same birthday .
- ② everyone has different birthdays .

A proof is a finite list of logical deductions which establishes the truth of a statement .

## 1. Direct Proof

Goal: Prove  $P \Rightarrow Q$ .

Method: Assume  $P$ .

Deduce  $Q$ .

E.g. **Def.** Given  $a, b \in \mathbb{Z}$ ,  $a \neq 0$ , we say  $a$  divides  $b$ ,  
written  $a|b$ , if  $\exists d \in \mathbb{Z}$ ,  $ad = b$ .

**Prop**  $\forall a, b_1, b_2 \in \mathbb{Z}$ , if  $a|b_1$  and  $a|b_2$ , then  $a|b_1 - b_2$ .

Pf: Let  $a, b_1, b_2 \in \mathbb{Z}$ .

Assume  $a|b_1$  and  $a|b_2$ .

By definition,  $\exists d_1, d_2 \in \mathbb{Z}$  such that

$$ad_1 = b_1, ad_2 = b_2.$$

$$\text{Then, } b_1 - b_2 = ad_1 - ad_2 = a(d_1 - d_2).$$

By definition,  $a|b_1 - b_2$ . □

Rem. To prove  $\forall x, P(x)$ ,



pick an arbitrary  $c$  in the domain, and prove  $P(c)$ .

• To prove  $\exists x, P(x)$ ,

find one element  $d$  in the domain and show  $P(d)$ .

## 2. Proof by Contraposition

Recall the contrapositive of  $P \Rightarrow Q$  is  $\neg Q \Rightarrow \neg P$ .

Goal: Prove  $P \Rightarrow Q$ .

Method: Prove  $\neg Q \Rightarrow \neg P$ .

E.g. **Prop** Let  $n \in \mathbb{Z}$ .

Prove that if  $n^2$  is even, then  $n$  is even.

attempt direct proof:  $n^2$  is even  $\Rightarrow \exists k \in \mathbb{Z}, n^2 = 2k$

$$\Rightarrow n = \pm\sqrt{2k}$$

???

Pf: Equivalent, we'll prove

$n$  is odd  $\Rightarrow n^2$  is odd.

Assume  $n$  is odd.

Then  $n = 2k+1$  for some  $k \in \mathbb{Z}$ .

$$\begin{aligned} \text{Thus, } n^2 &= (2k+1)^2 = \underline{4k^2 + 4k + 1} \\ &= 2(2k^2 + 2k) + 1 \end{aligned}$$

By definition,  $n^2$  is odd.  $\square$

### 3. Proof by Contradiction

Goal: Prove P

Method: Assume  $\neg P$ .

Deduce  $R \wedge \neg R$  for some  $R$ .

E.g. **Def**: A real number  $r$  is rational if there exist  $p, q \in \mathbb{Z}$  with  $q \neq 0$ , such that  $r = \frac{p}{q}$ .

**Prop**: Let  $\sqrt{2}$  be a solution to  $x^2 = 2$ .  
Then  $\sqrt{2}$  is irrational.

**Pf**: Assume  $\sqrt{2}$  is rational.

Let  $p, q \in \mathbb{Z}, q \neq 0$ , be such that  $\sqrt{2} = \frac{p}{q}$ .

Notice that we can pick  $p, q$  such that  $p, q$  don't have common divisors.

By the definition of  $\sqrt{2}$ ,

$$(\sqrt{2})^2 = \left(\frac{p}{q}\right)^2 = \frac{p^2}{q^2} = 2$$

$$\Rightarrow p^2 = 2q^2 \Rightarrow p^2 \text{ is even} \Rightarrow p \text{ is even.}$$

By definition,  $p = 2k$  for some  $k \in \mathbb{Z}$ .

$$\text{Then } p^2 = (2k)^2 = 4k^2 = 2q^2$$

$$\Rightarrow 2k^2 = q^2$$

$$\Rightarrow q^2 \text{ is even} \Rightarrow q \text{ is even.}$$

Contradict with  $p, q$  having no common divisor,

$\Rightarrow \sqrt{2}$  must be irrational.

□

E.g. **Def.** A prime number is a natural number greater than 1 whose only positive divisors are 1 and itself.

**Prop.** There are infinite many prime numbers.

**Pf.** Assume there are finitely many primes  $p_1, \dots, p_n$ .

Consider  $q = p_1 \cdots p_n + 1 \Rightarrow 1 = q - p_1 \cdots p_n$ .  
Since  $q \neq p_i$  for  $i = 1, \dots, n$ ,  $q$  is not prime.  
Suppose  $p$  is a prime divisor of  $q$ .  
Since  $p | q$ ,  $p | p_1 \cdots p_n$ , thus  $p | q - p_1 \cdots p_n$ ,  
i.e.  $p | 1$ , contradiction.

Thus, there are infinitely many primes.  $\square$

#### 4. Miscellaneous

- To prove equivalence, i.e.  $P \Leftrightarrow Q$ , we show  $P \Rightarrow Q$  and  $Q \Rightarrow P$ .

Oftentimes, proof of equivalence is phrased as "if and only if" (iff).

↙ WLOG

- "without loss of generality, [assumption]" means the assumption that follows is chosen arbitrarily, narrowing down the statement to a particular case, but does not affect the validity of the proof in general.

E.g. **Prop** Let  $x, y \in \mathbb{Z}$ . If (both  $xy$  and  $x+y$  are even), then both  $x$  and  $y$  are even.

Pf: (contrapositive : either  $x$  is odd or  $y$  is odd  
 $\Rightarrow$  either  $xy$  is odd or  $x+y$  is odd)

WLOG, assume  $x$  is odd, i.e.  $x = 2m+1$   
for some  $m \in \mathbb{Z}$ .

Sometimes it's useful to divide up proof into exhaustive cases.

Pf (cont.): We want show either  $xy$  is odd or  $x+y$  is odd.

Case 1:  $y$  is even

Then  $y = 2n$  for some  $n \in \mathbb{Z}$ .

Hence  $x+y = 2m+1 + 2n = 2(m+n) + 1$   
is odd.

Case 2:  $y$  is odd

Then  $y = 2n+1$  for some  $n \in \mathbb{Z}$ .

$$\begin{aligned} \text{Hence } xy &= (2m+1)(2n+1) \\ &= \underline{4mn + 2m + 2n + 1} \\ &= 2(2mn + m + n) + 1 \end{aligned}$$

is odd.

This proves the statement by contraposition.  $\square$

- Constructive Existence Proofs :

Recall that to show " $\exists x P(x)$ ", find an element  $a$  such that  $P(a)$  is true.

E.g. **Prop** There exist irrational  $x, y$  such that  $x^y$  is rational.

Pf: Let  $x = e$ ,  $y = \ln 2$ . Then  $x^y = e^{\ln 2} = 2$ .  $\square$

- Nonconstructive Existence Proof.

E.g. **Prop** [There exist irrational  $x, y$  such that  $x^y$  is rational.]  $\square$ .

Pf: ① Assume  $\sqrt{2}^{\sqrt{2}}$  is rational.  $\leftarrow P$ .

Then let  $x = y = \sqrt{2}$  and we're done.

② Assume  $\sqrt{2}^{\sqrt{2}}$  is irrational.  $\neg P$ .

Then  $(\sqrt{2}^{\sqrt{2}})^{\sqrt{2}} = \sqrt{2}^2 = 2$  is rational.

we're done.  $\square$ .

$$\begin{array}{l} P \Rightarrow Q, \\ \neg P \Rightarrow Q. \end{array} \quad \left. \begin{array}{l} \neg P \vee P \\ \neg P \end{array} \right\} \neg P \vee P \Rightarrow Q$$

Since implication is correct, and hypothesis is correct, we know the conclusion is correct

NTS  $P \Rightarrow Q$

Assume  $P$ .

Goal : Prove  $Q$ .