MSD 2019 Final Project

A replication of Greed and Grievance in Civil War by Paul Collier and Anke Hoeffler, 2000 Kiran Ramesh (kr2789), Sai Srujan Chinta (sc4401), Bhavya Shahi (bs3118) 2019-05-13 05:59:23

Contents

Reading Data	1
Helper Functions	1
Opportunity Models	2
Grievance Models	4
Combined Model	6
Robustness Check	9

Reading Data

```
setwd(".")
options(scipen = 100, digits = 4)

data <- read.dta("data/G&G.dta")
# data_war_period <- data %>% filter(warsa == 1)
# subdata<- data %>% select(warsa, sxp, sxp2,
# coldwar, secm, lngdp_, gy1, peace, mount, geogia,
# lnpop, frac, elfo, rf, pol16, etdo4590, dem,
# ygini, grievxb, greedxb, oilsxp, oilsxp2)
```

Helper Functions

```
res <- res[-1, ]
res
}

comma_sep = function(x) {
    x = strsplit(x, "")
}</pre>
```

Opportunity Models

[1] "warsa"

"sxp"

"sxp2"

Generating the various opportunity models

```
# Opportunity Models
filtering_columns_list <- list("warsa,sxp,sxp2,coldwar,secm,gy1,peace,prevwara,mount,geogia,frac,lnpop"
    "warsa, sxp, sxp2, coldwar, secm, gy1, peace, mount, geogia, frac, lnpop",
    "warsa, sxp, sxp2, coldwar, lngdp_, gy1, peace, mount, geogia, frac, lnpop",
    "warsa,sxp,sxp2,lngdp_,peace,lnpop,diaspeaa", "warsa,sxp,sxp2,lngdp_,peace,lnpop,difdpeaa,diahpeaa"
regression_formula_list <- list("warsa ~ sxp + sxp2 + coldwar + secm + gy1 + peace + prevwara + mount
    "warsa ~ sxp + sxp2 + coldwar + secm + gy1 + peace + mount + geogia + frac + lnpop",
    "warsa ~ sxp + sxp2 + coldwar + lngdp_ + gy1 + peace + mount + geogia + frac + lnpop",
    "warsa ~ sxp + sxp2 + lngdp_ + peace + lnpop + diaspeaa",
    "warsa ~ sxp + sxp2 + lngdp_ + peace + lnpop + difdpeaa + diahpeaa")
for (i in c(1:5)) {
    print(paste0("Opportunity Model ", i))
    filtering_columns <- strsplit(filtering_columns_list[[i]],</pre>
        ",")[[1]]
    print(filtering_columns)
    opportunity.data <- data[, filtering_columns]</pre>
    opportunity.data <- na.omit(opportunity.data)</pre>
    print(paste0("N : ", nrow(opportunity.data)))
    print(paste0("No of wars : ", nrow(opportunity.data[opportunity.data$warsa ==
        1, ])))
    opportunity_fit <- glm(as.formula(regression_formula_list[[i]]),</pre>
        family = binomial(link = "logit"), data = opportunity.data)
    print(paste0("Pseudo R2 : ", round(PseudoR2(opportunity_fit),
        digits = 2)))
    print(paste0("Log likelihood : ", round(logLik(opportunity_fit),
        digits = 2)))
    print(summarize_into_table(summary(opportunity_fit)),
        quote = FALSE)
}
## [1] "Opportunity Model 1"
```

"coldwar" "secm"

"gy1"

```
## [7] "peace"
                   "prevwara" "mount"
                                         "geogia"
                                                    "frac"
                                                                "lnpop"
## [1] "N : 688"
## [1] "No of wars : 46"
## [1] "Pseudo R2 : 0.24"
## [1] "Log likelihood : -128.49"
##
           Estimate Std. Error z value Pr(>|z|) Signif
## sxp
            18.1486 6.0065
                                3.0215 0.0025
            -27.4453 11.9963
                                -2.2878 0.0221
                                                 **
## sxp2
## coldwar -0.3257 0.4695
                                -0.6937 0.4879
            -0.0248 0.0103
                                -2.4028 0.0163
## secm
                                                 **
## gy1
            -0.117
                     0.0437
                                -2.6782 0.0074
            -0.0025 0.0017
                                -1.5234 0.1277
## peace
                                0.8487 0.3961
## prevwara 0.4639
                     0.5467
                                1.3929 0.1636
                     0.0093
## mount
            0.0129
## geogia
            -2.2115 1.0377
                                -2.1311 0.0331
## frac
            -0.0002 0.0001
                                -1.6019 0.1092
           0.6688
                     0.1631
                                4.1016 0
## lnpop
## [1] "Opportunity Model 2"
## [1] "warsa"
                  "sxp"
                            "sxp2"
                                      "coldwar" "secm"
                                                          "gy1"
                                                                    "peace"
## [8] "mount"
                  "geogia"
                            "frac"
                                      "lnpop"
## [1] "N : 688"
## [1] "No of wars : 46"
## [1] "Pseudo R2 : 0.24"
## [1] "Log likelihood : -128.85"
##
           Estimate Std. Error z value Pr(>|z|) Signif
## sxp
           18.8998 5.9478
                               3.1776 0.0015
## sxp2
           -29.1226 11.9047
                               -2.4463 0.0144
                                                **
## coldwar -0.207
                    0.4496
                               -0.4605 0.6451
           -0.0239 0.0101
## secm
                               -2.3565 0.0184
                                                **
## gy1
           -0.1182 0.0438
                               -2.6967 0.007
                                                ***
## peace
           -0.0036 0.0011
                               -3.1021 0.0019
                                                ***
## mount
           0.0137
                    0.0091
                               1.5097 0.1311
## geogia -2.1291 1.0324
                               -2.0622 0.0392
           -0.0002 0.0001
                               -1.5449 0.1224
## frac
## lnpop
           0.6855 0.1617
                               4.2396 0
## [1] "Opportunity Model 3"
## [1] "warsa"
                  "sxp"
                            "sxp2"
                                      "coldwar" "lngdp " "gy1"
                                                                    "peace"
## [8] "mount"
                  "geogia"
                            "frac"
                                      "lnpop"
## [1] "N : 750"
## [1] "No of wars : 52"
## [1] "Pseudo R2 : 0.22"
## [1] "Log likelihood : -146.86"
           Estimate Std. Error z value Pr(>|z|) Signif
## sxp
           16.4757 5.2071
                               3.1641 0.0016
                                                ***
           -23.0168 9.9722
                               -2.3081 0.021
## sxp2
## coldwar -0.4543 0.4162
                               -1.0916 0.275
          -0.837
## lngdp_
                    0.2532
                               -3.3055 0.0009
                                                ***
## gy1
           -0.1051 0.0421
                               -2.4933 0.0127
                                                **
## peace
           -0.0035 0.0011
                               -3.3355 0.0009
                                                ***
                               0.9966 0.3189
## mount
           0.0084
                    0.0085
## geogia -0.8655 0.9482
                               -0.9127 0.3614
                               -1.9716 0.0487
## frac
           -0.0002 0.0001
## lnpop
           0.4927
                    0.1286
                               3.8308 0.0001
                                                ***
## [1] "Opportunity Model 4"
```

```
## [1] "warsa"
                  "sxp"
                            "sxp2"
                                       "lngdp "
                                                  "peace"
                                                             "lnpop"
## [7] "diaspeaa"
## [1] "N : 595"
## [1] "No of wars : 32"
## [1] "Pseudo R2 : 0.25"
## [1] "Log likelihood : -93.27"
           Estimate Std. Error z value Pr(>|z|) Signif
##
## sxp
           17.5671 6.7436
                               2.605
                                       0.0092
                               -1.8772 0.0605
## sxp2
           -28.8151 15.35
                               -4.3756 0
## lngdp_
           -1.2366 0.2826
## peace
           -0.002 0.0014
                               -1.4716 0.1411
## lnpop
           0.2949
                   0.1414
                               2.0859 0.037
## diaspeaa 700.9343 363.2903 1.9294 0.0537
## [1] "Opportunity Model 5"
## [1] "warsa"
                 "sxp"
                            "sxp2"
                                       "lngdp_"
                                                  "peace"
                                                             "lnpop"
## [7] "difdpeaa" "diahpeaa"
## [1] "N : 595"
## [1] "No of wars : 32"
## [1] "Pseudo R2 : 0.25"
## [1] "Log likelihood : -93.23"
##
           Estimate Std. Error z value Pr(>|z|) Signif
## sxp
           17.4034 6.7493 2.5785 0.0099
           -28.4562 15.3642
                               -1.8521 0.064
## sxp2
           -1.2426 0.2837
                               -4.37940
## lngdp_
           -0.002 0.0014
                               -1.4816 0.1385
## peace
## lnpop
           0.2962 0.1413
                               2.0959 0.0361
## difdpeaa 823.9412 556.0224
                               1.4818 0.1384
## diahpeaa 741.1547 387.6344
                                       0.0559
                              1.912
```

Grievance Models

Generating the various grievance models

```
print(paste0("N : ", nrow(grievance.data)))
    print(paste0("No of wars : ", nrow(grievance.data[grievance.data$warsa ==
        1, ])))
    grievance_fit <- glm(as.formula(regression_formula_list[[i]]),</pre>
        family = binomial(link = "logit"), data = grievance.data)
   print(paste0("Pseudo R2 : ", round(PseudoR2(grievance_fit),
        digits = 2)))
    print(paste0("Log likelihood : ", round(logLik(grievance_fit),
        digits = 2)))
    print(summarize_into_table(summary(grievance_fit)),
        quote = FALSE)
}
## [1] "Grievance Model 1"
  [1] "warsa"
                   "elfo"
                              "rf"
                                          "pol16"
                                                     "etdo4590" "dem"
   [7] "peace"
                   "mount"
                              "geogia"
                                          "lnpop"
## [1] "N : 850"
## [1] "No of wars : 59"
## [1] "Pseudo R2 : 0.13"
## [1] "Log likelihood : -185.57"
##
            Estimate Std. Error z value Pr(>|z|) Signif
## elfo
            0.0104
                     0.0057
                                1.8068 0.0708
            -0.0032 0.0067
                                -0.4723 0.6367
## rf
## pol16
            -3.0675 7.0207
                                -0.4369 0.6622
## etdo4590 0.4136
                     0.4958
                                0.8342 0.4042
## dem
            -0.1091 0.0445
                                -2.4552 0.0141
## peace
            -0.0037 0.001
                                -3.78
                                        0.0002
                                1.6033 0.1089
## mount
            0.0109
                     0.0068
## geogia
            -0.5092 0.8564
                                -0.5946 0.5521
                                2.3102 0.0209
            0.2215
                     0.0959
## lnpop
## [1] "Grievance Model 2"
                                                     "etdo4590" "dem"
## [1] "warsa"
                   "elfo"
                              "rf"
                                          "pol16"
## [7] "peace"
                   "mount"
                              "geogia"
                                          "lnpop"
                                                     "ygini"
## [1] "N : 604"
## [1] "No of wars : 41"
## [1] "Pseudo R2 : 0.11"
## [1] "Log likelihood : -133.46"
##
            Estimate Std. Error z value Pr(>|z|) Signif
## elfo
            0.0108
                     0.0067
                                1.6199 0.1053
## rf
            -0.0064 0.0082
                                -0.7851 0.4324
## pol16
            -4.6818 8.2671
                                -0.5663 0.5712
## etdo4590 0.5747
                     0.5863
                                0.9802 0.327
## dem
            -0.0834 0.0508
                                -1.6398 0.1011
## peace
            -0.0031 0.0012
                                -2.6649 0.0077
## mount
            0.007
                     0.0089
                                0.7911 0.4289
            -0.7632 1.0531
                                -0.7247 0.4686
## geogia
                                        0.0384
## lnpop
            0.2461
                     0.1188
                                2.071
            0.0153
                     0.0179
                                0.8543 0.393
## vgini
## [1] "Grievance Model 3"
## [1] "warsa"
                   "elfo"
                              "rf"
                                          "pol16"
                                                     "etdo4590" "dem"
## [7] "peace"
                   "mount"
                                          "lnpop"
                                                     "lgini"
                              "geogia"
```

```
## [1] "N : 603"
## [1] "No of wars : 38"
## [1] "Pseudo R2 : 0.17"
## [1] "Log likelihood : -117.12"
          Estimate Std. Error z value Pr(>|z|) Signif
## elfo
          0.0117 0.0084 1.3867 0.1655
## rf
          -0.0037 0.0094
                          -0.3992 0.6897
## pol16 -6.536 8.5782 -0.7619 0.4461
## etdo4590 1.0841 0.6285 1.7249 0.0846
## dem
         -0.1211 0.0533 -2.2728 0.023
                                           **
## peace
          -0.0044 0.0013
                           -3.4254 0.0006
         -0.0001 0.0093
                           -0.0083 0.9934
## mount
## geogia -1.2926 1.1016
                           -1.1734 0.2406
## lnpop 0.2991 0.1331
                          2.2465 0.0247
## lgini 0.4607 1.3052 0.353 0.7241
```

Combined Model

Generating the combined opportunity and grievance models

```
# Combined Models
filtering_columns_list <- list("warsa,sxp,sxp2,coldwar,secm,gy1,peace,mount,geogia,lnpop,frac,grievxb",
    "warsa, peace, mount, geogia, lnpop, elfo, rf, pol16, etdo4590, dem, greedxb",
    "warsa, sxp, sxp2, coldwar, secm, gy1, peace, mount, geogia, lnpop, frac, elfo, rf, pol16, etdo4590, dem, ygini",
    "warsa, sxp, sxp2, coldwar, secm, gy1, peace, mount, geogia, lnpop, frac, elfo, rf, pol16, etdo4590, dem",
    "warsa, sxp, sxp2, secm, gy1, peace, geogia, lnpop, frac, etdo4590",
    "warsa, sxp, sxp2, lngdp_, gy1, peace, geogia, lnpop, frac, etdo4590",
    "warsa,sxp,sxp2,secm,gy1,peace,geogia,lnpop,frac,etdo4590,oilsxp,oilsxp2")
regression_formula_list <- list("warsa ~ sxp + sxp2 + coldwar + secm + gy1 + peace + mount + geogia + 1:
    "warsa ~ peace + mount + geogia + lnpop + elfo + rf + pol16 + etdo4590 + dem + greedxb",
    "warsa ~ sxp + sxp2 + coldwar + secm + gy1 + peace + mount + geogia + lnpop + frac + elfo + rf + p
    "warsa ~ sxp + sxp2 + coldwar + secm + gy1 + peace + mount + geogia + lnpop + frac + elfo + rf + po
    "warsa ~ sxp + sxp2 + secm + gy1 + peace + geogia + lnpop + frac + etdo4590",
    "warsa ~ sxp + sxp2 + lngdp_ + gy1 + peace + geogia + lnpop + frac + etdo4590",
    "warsa ~ sxp + sxp2 + secm + gy1 + peace + geogia + lnpop + frac + etdo4590 + oilsxp + oilsxp2")
for (i in c(1:7)) {
    print(paste0("Combined Model ", i))
    filtering_columns <- strsplit(filtering_columns_list[[i]],</pre>
        ",")[[1]]
    print(filtering_columns)
    combined.data <- data[, filtering_columns]</pre>
    combined.data <- na.omit(combined.data)</pre>
    print(paste0("N : ", nrow(combined.data)))
    print(paste0("No of wars : ", nrow(combined.data[combined.data$warsa ==
    combined_fit <- glm(as.formula(regression_formula_list[[i]]),</pre>
```

```
family = binomial(link = "logit"), data = combined.data)
    print(paste0("Pseudo R2 : ", round(PseudoR2(combined_fit),
        digits = 2)))
    print(paste0("Log likelihood : ", round(logLik(combined_fit),
        digits = 2)))
   print(summarize into table(summary(combined fit)),
        quote = FALSE)
}
## [1] "Combined Model 1"
  [1] "warsa"
                  "sxp"
                            "sxp2"
                                       "coldwar" "secm"
                                                           "gy1"
                                                                      "peace"
## [8] "mount"
                  "geogia"
                            "lnpop"
                                       "frac"
                                                 "grievxb"
## [1] "N : 665"
## [1] "No of wars : 46"
## [1] "Pseudo R2 : 0.24"
## [1] "Log likelihood : -126.7"
##
           Estimate Std. Error z value Pr(>|z|) Signif
## sxp
           19.1073 5.9961
                               3.1866 0.0014
## sxp2
           -30.2619 12.0145
                               -2.5188 0.0118
## coldwar -0.2084 0.4572
                               -0.4559 0.6484
## secm
           -0.0212 0.0106
                               -1.9984 0.0457
                                                 **
## gy1
           -0.1084 0.0437
                               -2.4794 0.0132
## peace
           -0.0003 0.0021
                               -0.1381 0.8902
## mount
           0.0052
                    0.01
                               0.5198 0.6032
## geogia -1.9761 1.0495
                               -1.883 0.0597
## lnpop
           0.4886
                    0.1929
                               2.5329 0.0113
## frac
           -0.0002 0.0001
                               -2.0499 0.0404
                                                 **
## grievxb 0.7648
                    0.4129
                               1.8524 0.064
## [1] "Combined Model 2"
## [1] "warsa"
                   "peace"
                              "mount"
                                          "geogia"
                                                     "lnpop"
                                                                "elfo"
## [7] "rf"
                   "pol16"
                              "etdo4590" "dem"
                                                     "greedxb"
## [1] "N : 665"
## [1] "No of wars : 46"
## [1] "Pseudo R2 : 0.25"
## [1] "Log likelihood : -125.29"
            Estimate Std. Error z value Pr(>|z|) Signif
##
## peace
            0.0005
                     0.0014
                                0.3607 0.7183
## mount
            0.0009
                     0.008
                                0.1123 0.9106
## geogia
            0.0533
                     1.1006
                                0.0484 0.9614
## lnpop
            -0.022
                     0.1364
                                -0.1614 0.8718
            0.0083
## elfo
                     0.0071
                                1.1706 0.2418
## rf
            -0.0048 0.0081
                                -0.6005 0.5482
## pol16
            -9.3378 8.7336
                                -1.0692 0.285
## etdo4590 1.2103
                                1.8666 0.062
                     0.6484
## dem
            -0.0365 0.0537
                                -0.6791 0.4971
                                4.9546 0
## greedxb 1.0435
                     0.2106
## [1] "Combined Model 3"
  [1] "warsa"
                              "sxp2"
                                          "coldwar"
##
                   "sxp"
                                                     "secm"
                                                                "gy1"
## [7] "peace"
                   "mount"
                               "geogia"
                                          "lnpop"
                                                     "frac"
                                                                "elfo"
## [13] "rf"
                              "etdo4590" "dem"
                   "pol16"
                                                     "ygini"
## [1] "N : 479"
## [1] "No of wars : 32"
```

```
## [1] "Pseudo R2 : 0.24"
## [1] "Log likelihood : -89.55"
            Estimate Std. Error z value Pr(>|z|) Signif
##
            37.0716 10.2919
                                3.602
                                        0.0003
## sxp
                                                  ***
## sxp2
            -69.2696 21.6957
                                 -3.1928 0.0014
                                                  ***
## coldwar -0.873
                     0.6438
                                -1.356 0.1751
## secm
            -0.0288 0.0133
                                 -2.1632 0.0305
                                 -0.7352 0.4622
## gy1
            -0.0455
                     0.0619
                                -0.2283 0.8194
## peace
            -0.0003 0.0015
## mount
            0.0054
                     0.0116
                                0.4673 0.6403
## geogia
            -4.0317 1.4898
                                 -2.7061 0.0068
            0.9272
                     0.2501
                                 3.707
                                         0.0002
## lnpop
                                                  ***
## frac
            -0.0008 0.0004
                                 -2.2865 0.0222
                                                  **
            0.0412
                                 2.1902 0.0285
## elfo
                     0.0188
                                 0.7312 0.4647
## rf
            0.0148
                     0.0202
## pol16
            -25.2763 13.3891
                                 -1.8878 0.059
## etdo4590 2.0202
                                 2.2079 0.0273
                     0.915
## dem
            -0.0177 0.0618
                                 -0.2861 0.7748
            0.0252
                                1.0507 0.2934
## ygini
                     0.024
## [1] "Combined Model 4"
  [1] "warsa"
##
                   "sxp"
                               "sxp2"
                                          "coldwar"
                                                     "secm"
                                                                 "gy1"
## [7] "peace"
                   "mount"
                               "geogia"
                                          "lnpop"
                                                      "frac"
                                                                 "elfo"
## [13] "rf"
                   "pol16"
                               "etdo4590" "dem"
## [1] "N : 665"
## [1] "No of wars : 46"
## [1] "Pseudo R2 : 0.26"
## [1] "Log likelihood : -124.6"
            Estimate Std. Error z value Pr(>|z|) Signif
##
## sxp
            23.3851 6.6915
                                3.4947 0.0005
                                                  ***
## sxp2
            -36.3352 12.9976
                                 -2.7955 0.0052
                                                  ***
## coldwar
            -0.2811 0.459
                                 -0.6124 0.5403
## secm
            -0.022
                     0.0108
                                 -2.0372 0.0416
                                                  **
## gy1
            -0.1078 0.0446
                                 -2.4169 0.0157
            -0.0032 0.0012
                                 -2.7143 0.0066
## peace
                                                  ***
## mount
            0.015
                     0.0093
                                 1.6068 0.1081
            -1.9622 1.1491
                                -1.7076 0.0877
## geogia
## lnpop
            0.6974
                     0.1807
                                 3.8604 0.0001
## frac
            -0.0005 0.0003
                                 -1.5846 0.113
## elfo
            0.0228
                     0.0149
                                 1.5362 0.1245
                                0.7344 0.4627
## rf
                     0.0185
            0.0136
            -15.9917 10.5178
                                 -1.5204 0.1284
## pol16
                                 2.1338 0.0329
## etdo4590 1.5918
                     0.746
            -0.0418 0.0542
                                -0.7706 0.441
## dem
## [1] "Combined Model 5"
  [1] "warsa"
                   "sxp"
                               "sxp2"
                                          "secm"
                                                      "gy1"
                                                                 "peace"
## [7] "geogia"
                                          "etdo4590"
                   "lnpop"
                               "frac"
## [1] "N : 688"
## [1] "No of wars : 46"
## [1] "Pseudo R2 : 0.24"
## [1] "Log likelihood : -128.21"
            Estimate Std. Error z value Pr(>|z|) Signif
##
## sxp
            18.937
                     5.8651
                                3.2287 0.0012
                                                  ***
## sxp2
            -29.4432 11.7813
                                 -2.4992 0.0124
                                                  **
## secm
            -0.0316 0.0098
                                 -3.2252 0.0013
                                                  ***
```

```
## gv1
            -0.1152 0.0431
                                -2.6753 0.0075
            -0.0037 0.0011
                                -3.397 0.0007
## peace
                                                  ***
## geogia
            -2.487
                     1.0052
                                -2.4741 0.0134
                                4.6318 0
## lnpop
            0.7677
                     0.1658
                                                  ***
## frac
            -0.0002 0.0001
                                -2.3451 0.019
## etdo4590 0.6704
                     0.3535
                                1.8963 0.0579
## [1] "Combined Model 6"
## [1] "warsa"
                              "sxp2"
                                                     "gy1"
                   "sxp"
                                         "lngdp_"
                                                                "peace"
## [7] "geogia"
                   "lnpop"
                              "frac"
                                         "etdo4590"
## [1] "N : 750"
## [1] "No of wars : 52"
## [1] "Pseudo R2 : 0.22"
## [1] "Log likelihood : -146.84"
##
            Estimate Std. Error z value Pr(>|z|) Signif
## sxp
            16.7734 5.2064
                                3.2217 0.0013
                                                  ***
## sxp2
            -23.8005 10.0396
                                -2.3707 0.0178
                                                  **
            -0.9504 0.2454
                                -3.8723 0.0001
## lngdp_
                                                  ***
## gv1
            -0.098
                     0.0415
                                -2.3625 0.0182
                                                  **
            -0.0038 0.001
                                -3.8085 0.0001
## peace
                                                  ***
## geogia
            -0.9919 0.9093
                                -1.0909 0.2753
## lnpop
            0.5105
                     0.1284
                                3.9751 0.0001
                                                  ***
## frac
            -0.0002 0.0001
                                -2.6953 0.007
                                1.4625 0.1436
## etdo4590 0.4801
                     0.3283
## [1] "Combined Model 7"
## [1] "warsa"
                   "sxp"
                              "sxp2"
                                         "secm"
                                                     "gy1"
                                                                "peace"
  [7] "geogia"
                   "lnpop"
                              "frac"
                                         "etdo4590" "oilsxp"
                                                                "oilsxp2"
## [1] "N : 654"
## [1] "No of wars : 45"
## [1] "Pseudo R2 : 0.3"
## [1] "Log likelihood : -114.2"
##
            Estimate Std. Error z value Pr(>|z|) Signif
## sxp
            50.6076
                      13.0928
                                 3.8653 0.0001
                                                   ***
                                 -3.0514 0.0023
## sxp2
            -130.9982 42.9311
            -0.0343
                      0.0105
                                 -3.2697 0.0011
## secm
                                                   ***
            -0.1335
                      0.0464
                                 -2.8762 0.004
## gv1
            -0.0032
                     0.0012
                                 -2.8139 0.0049
## peace
## geogia
            -2.8712
                      1.1298
                                 -2.5415 0.011
## lnpop
            1.1235
                      0.2258
                                 4.9752 0
## frac
            -0.0003
                      0.0001
                                 -2.8706 0.0041
                                 2.0886 0.0367
## etdo4590 0.7688
                      0.3681
                                                   **
## oilsxp
            -28.2748 9.3506
                                 -3.0239 0.0025
## oilsxp2 106.4589
                      38.7041
                                 2.7506 0.0059
                                                   ***
```

Robustness Check

```
# Robustness Check 1
robustness.data <- data %>% select(warsa, country,
    year, sxp, sxp2, secm, gy1, peace, geogia, frac,
    etdo4590, lnpop)

for (i in c(1:6)) {
    print(paste0("Robustness Check ", i))
```

```
if (i == 1) {
   robustness.subdata <- robustness.data %>% filter(country !=
        "Iran") %>% filter(country != "Romania")
}
if (i == 2) {
   robustness.subdata <- robustness.data %>% filter(country !=
        "Iran") %>% filter(country != "Romania") %>%
        filter(!(country == "Angola" & year ==
            year == "1985")) %>% filter(!(country ==
        "Zaire" & year == "1995"))
}
if (i == 3) {
   robustness.subdata <- robustness.data %>% filter(!(country ==
        "Iran" & year == "1970")) %>% filter(!(country ==
        "Romania" & year == "1985")) %>% filter(!(country ==
        "Congo" & year == "1995"))
}
if (i == 4) {
   robustness.subdata <- robustness.data %>% filter(country !=
        "Saudi Arabia") %>% filter(country != "Guyana") %>%
        filter(country != "Oman") %>% filter(country !=
        "Trinidad and Tobago")
}
if (i == 5) {
   robustness.subdata <- robustness.data %>% filter(!(country ==
        "Angola" & year == "1975")) %>% filter(!(country ==
        "Somalia" & year == "1985"))
}
if (i == 6) {
    robustness.subdata <- robustness.data %>% filter(!(country ==
        "Angola" & year == "1975")) %>% filter(!(country ==
        "Somalia" & year == "1985")) %>% filter(!(country ==
        "Mozambique" & year == "1975")) %>% filter(!(country ==
        "Sierra Leone" & year == "1995")) %>% filter(!(country ==
        "Zaire" & year == "1995"))
}
robustness.1.data <- na.omit(robustness.subdata)</pre>
print(paste0("N : ", nrow(robustness.subdata)))
print(paste0("No of wars : ", nrow(robustness.subdata[robustness.subdata$warsa ==
    1, ])))
robustness.subdata <- glm(warsa ~ sxp + sxp2 +
    secm + gy1 + peace + geogia + frac + etdo4590 +
    lnpop, family = binomial(link = "logit"), data = robustness.1.data)
print(paste0("Pseudo R2 : ", round(PseudoR2(robustness.subdata),
```

```
digits = 2)))
    print(paste0("Log likelihood : ", round(logLik(robustness.subdata),
        digits = 2)))
    print(summarize_into_table(summary(robustness.subdata)),
        quote = FALSE)
}
## [1] "Robustness Check 1"
## [1] "N : 1272"
## [1] "No of wars : 195"
## [1] "Pseudo R2 : 0.25"
## [1] "Log likelihood : -118.4"
##
           Estimate Std. Error z value Pr(>|z|) Signif
            19.6965 6.6069
                                2.9812 0.0029
## sxp
## sxp2
           -34.0902 14.3523
                                -2.3752 0.0175
                                                 **
## secm
            -0.0345 0.0109
                                -3.1699 0.0015
## gy1
            -0.1398 0.0468
                                -2.9878 0.0028
                                                 ***
## peace
            -0.0037 0.0012
                                -3.1601 0.0016
## geogia
           -2.1135 1.0796
                               -1.9577 0.0503
                                -2.0407 0.0413
## frac
            -0.0002 0.0001
                                1.9766 0.0481
## etdo4590 0.727
                     0.3678
                                                 **
                                4.2968 0
## lnpop
            0.7472
                     0.1739
                                                 ***
## [1] "Robustness Check 2"
## [1] "N : 1269"
## [1] "No of wars : 192"
## [1] "Pseudo R2 : 0.22"
## [1] "Log likelihood : -116.17"
##
           Estimate Std. Error z value Pr(>|z|) Signif
## sxp
            19.0288 6.6699
                                2.8529 0.0043
           -33.2498 14.604
                                -2.2768 0.0228
## sxp2
                                                 **
## secm
            -0.0372 0.0112
                                -3.3188 0.0009
            -0.0996 0.0518
                                -1.9247 0.0543
## gy1
## peace
            -0.0032 0.0012
                                -2.6524 0.008
## geogia
           -2.2718 1.09
                                -2.0842 0.0371
            -0.0002 0.0001
                                -2.0445 0.0409
## frac
## etdo4590 0.7315
                                1.9797 0.0477
                     0.3695
                                                 **
            0.7429
                     0.175
                                4.2456 0
## lnpop
## [1] "Robustness Check 3"
## [1] "N : 1285"
## [1] "No of wars : 196"
## [1] "Pseudo R2 : 0.29"
## [1] "Log likelihood : -114.04"
##
           Estimate Std. Error z value Pr(>|z|) Signif
## sxp
            28.745
                     7.8622
                                3.6561 0.0003
           -54.818 17.7813
                                -3.0829 0.002
                                                 ***
## sxp2
## secm
            -0.0415 0.0114
                                -3.626 0.0003
                                                 ***
## gy1
            -0.1375 0.0459
                                -2.9965 0.0027
                                                 ***
            -0.0041 0.0012
                                -3.5129 0.0004
## peace
           -2.8902 1.1361
                                -2.5439 0.011
## geogia
## frac
            -0.0003 0.0001
                                -2.7478 0.006
## etdo4590 0.6554
                     0.3717
                                1.7633 0.0778
## lnpop
            0.8986
                     0.1955
                                4.5969 0
## [1] "Robustness Check 4"
```

```
## [1] "N : 1256"
## [1] "No of wars : 199"
## [1] "Pseudo R2 : 0.24"
## [1] "Log likelihood : -127.55"
##
            Estimate Std. Error z value Pr(>|z|) Signif
## sxp
            18.7714 6.0632
                                3.0959 0.002
            -28.4663 12.2989
## sxp2
                                -2.3145 0.0206
## secm
            -0.0312 0.0098
                                -3.1933 0.0014
                                                  ***
## gy1
            -0.1215 0.044
                                -2.7622 0.0057
                                                  ***
## peace
            -0.0036 0.0011
                                -3.2808 0.001
                                                  ***
## geogia
            -2.4491 1.0079
                                -2.4299 0.0151
            -0.0002 0.0001
                                -2.3871 0.017
## frac
                                                  **
## etdo4590 0.6468
                     0.3536
                                1.8293 0.0674
            0.7722
                                4.5904 0
## lnpop
                     0.1682
## [1] "Robustness Check 5"
## [1] "N : 1286"
## [1] "No of wars : 197"
## [1] "Pseudo R2 : 0.23"
## [1] "Log likelihood : -126.33"
##
            Estimate Std. Error z value Pr(>|z|) Signif
## sxp
            19.1466 5.9393
                                3.2237 0.0013
                                                  ***
            -30.1497 12.0316
                                -2.5059 0.0122
## sxp2
            -0.0306 0.0097
                                -3.1538 0.0016
## secm
                                                  ***
            -0.1024 0.0441
## gy1
                                -2.3198 0.0204
                                                  **
## peace
            -0.0034 0.0011
                                -3.0647 0.0022
                                                  ***
## geogia
            -2.5411 1.0115
                                -2.5121 0.012
                                                  **
            -0.0002 0.0001
                                -2.2107 0.0271
## frac
                                                  **
## etdo4590 0.7318
                     0.3573
                                2.0484 0.0405
                                                  **
            0.7822
                     0.167
                                4.6841 0
## lnpop
## [1] "Robustness Check 6"
## [1] "N : 1283"
## [1] "No of wars : 194"
## [1] "Pseudo R2 : 0.21"
## [1] "Log likelihood : -124.2"
##
            Estimate Std. Error z value Pr(>|z|) Signif
                                3.2962 0.001
## sxp
            19.7632 5.9958
                                                  ***
## sxp2
            -31.0063 12.0769
                                -2.5674 0.0102
## secm
            -0.0308 0.0097
                                -3.1734 0.0015
                                                  ***
            -0.0795 0.0458
                                -1.7345 0.0828
## gy1
            -0.0031 0.0011
                                -2.7503 0.006
## peace
            -2.7197 1.0203
                                -2.6656 0.0077
## geogia
            -0.0002 0.0001
                                -2.4131 0.0158
## frac
                                                  **
## etdo4590 0.6984
                     0.3602
                                1.9389 0.0525
## lnpop
            0.7949
                     0.1689
                                4.7069 0
                                                  ***
The following is a list of all packages used to generate these results. (Leave at very end of file.)
sessionInfo()
## R version 3.5.2 (2018-12-20)
## Platform: x86_64-apple-darwin17.7.0 (64-bit)
## Running under: macOS High Sierra 10.13.6
## Matrix products: default
## BLAS/LAPACK: /usr/local/Cellar/openblas/0.3.5/lib/libopenblasp-r0.3.5.dylib
```

```
##
## locale:
## [1] en_US.UTF-8/en_US.UTF-8/en_US.UTF-8/C/en_US.UTF-8/en_US.UTF-8
## attached base packages:
                 graphics grDevices utils
## [1] stats
                                               datasets methods
                                                                   base
## other attached packages:
## [1] lme4 1.1-21
                          Matrix_1.2-15
                                            DescTools_0.99.28
  [4] foreign_0.8-71
                                            stringr_1.4.0
                          forcats_0.3.0
## [7] dplyr_0.8.0
                          purrr_0.3.0
                                            readr_1.3.1
## [10] tidyr_0.8.2
                          tibble_2.0.1
                                            ggplot2_3.1.0
## [13] tidyverse_1.2.1
                          scales_1.0.0
                                            here_0.1
##
## loaded via a namespace (and not attached):
## [1] tidyselect_0.2.5 xfun_0.4
                                          splines_3.5.2
                                                           haven_2.0.0
## [5] lattice_0.20-38
                         expm_0.999-4
                                          colorspace_1.4-0 generics_0.0.2
## [9] htmltools 0.3.6
                         vaml 2.2.0
                                          rlang 0.3.1
                                                           nloptr 1.2.1
## [13] pillar_1.3.1
                         glue_1.3.0
                                          withr_2.1.2
                                                           modelr_0.1.3
                                          munsell 0.5.0
## [17] readxl 1.3.0
                         plyr_1.8.4
                                                           gtable 0.2.0
## [21] cellranger_1.1.0 rvest_0.3.2
                                          mvtnorm_1.0-10
                                                           evaluate_0.13
## [25] knitr 1.21
                         manipulate_1.0.1 broom_0.5.1
                                                           Rcpp_1.0.0
## [29] formatR_1.6
                         backports_1.1.3
                                                           hms_0.4.2
                                          jsonlite_1.6
## [33] digest 0.6.18
                         stringi_1.3.1
                                                           rprojroot_1.3-2
                                          grid_3.5.2
## [37] cli_1.0.1
                         tools_3.5.2
                                          magrittr_1.5
                                                           lazyeval_0.2.1
                         pkgconfig_2.0.2 MASS_7.3-51.1
## [41] crayon_1.3.4
                                                           xm12_1.2.0
## [45] lubridate_1.7.4
                        minqa_1.2.4
                                          assertthat_0.2.0 rmarkdown_1.11
## [49] httr_1.4.0
                         rstudioapi_0.9.0 R6_2.4.0
                                                           boot_1.3-20
## [53] nlme_3.1-137
                         compiler_3.5.2
```