Game Theory Assignment 1 Fictitious Play

Bo-Han Chen (陳柏翰) Student ID:312551074 bhchen312551074.cs12@nycu.edu.tw

Experiment Environment

The experiment environment is based on

- Windows 10 Education 22H2
- Python 3.12 with package
 - Numpy 1.26.0

Source Code Overview

Setup

The *FictitiousPlay* object will be constructed with *gameType* (which game does the user want to simulate by fictitious play model), *iterTime* (the number of game round), *numPrev* (the sum of prior belief, means how much rounds does two player already played before round 0), and *actionTh* (threshold for stopping the iteration if two players keep choosing the same best response).

```
class FictitiousPlay():
     def __init__(self, gameType, iterTime, numStrategy = 2, numPrev
     = 1000):
        self.gameType = gameType
        self.iterTime = iterTime
        # fictitious play is designed for games with 2 player
       self.numPlayer = 2
        # the threshold of repeated action
8
        # if two player repeat the same action for more than actionTh
     times, stop the iteration
        self.actionTh = 3000
9
        self.numStrategy = numStrategy
10
        self.numPrev = numPrev
11
        self.payoffMat = np.zeros([self.numPlayer * self.numStrategy,
12
     self.numStrategy])
        self.beliefMat = np.zeros([self.numPlayer, self.numStrategy])
        self.actionSet = np.zeros([self.numPlayer, iterTime + 1],
14
     dtype = np.uint8)
        self.payoffSet = np.zeros([self.numPlayer, iterTime,
15
     self.numStrategy])
```

After knowing the game type, game selection function will setup the payoff matrix.

```
def game_selection(self):
    # set the payoff matrix of each player
    if self.gameType == "Q1":
        self.payoffMat[:self.numStrategy, :] = [[-1, 1], [0, 3]]
        self.payoffMat[self.numStrategy:, :] = [[-1, 1], [0, 3]]
```

The initial belief can be defined by programmer or assigned randomly.

```
def init_belief(self):
    # setup the prior belief of each player
    if self.numPrev == -1:
        self.beliefMat = np.array([[500, 500], [500, 500]])

else:
    playTime = random.uniform(0, self.numPrev)
    self.beliefMat[0, :] = [playTime, (self.numPrev - playTime)]
    playTime = random.uniform(0, self.numPrev)
    self.beliefMat[1, :] = [playTime, (self.numPrev - playTime)]
```

The payoff cal function will calculate the payoff by player's belief and payoff.

```
def payoff_cal(self, belief, payoffMat):
    # calculate the payoff of player by belief
    payoff = np.zeros([self.numStrategy])
# beliefNor = belief / np.sum(belief)
beliefNor = belief
for idx in range(self.numStrategy):
    payoff[idx] = np.sum(np.multiply(beliefNor, payoffMat[idx]))
return payoff
```

For each iteration in *play_loop* function, the payoff of each player will be calculated to find the best response (randomly choose if the payoffs are same for each strategy), and the belief will be updated according to the other player's strategy. The iteration may be stopped due to the repeated selection of the same best response for two players.

```
def play_loop(self):
      pre_action1 = -1; pre_action2 = -1
2
      for iter in range(self.iterTime):
        # calculate the payoff to find the best response
        self.payoffSet[0, iter, :] = self.payoff_cal(self.beliefMat[0,
     :], self.payoffMat[:2, :])
        self.payoffSet[1, iter, :] = self.payoff_cal(self.beliefMat[1,
     :], self.payoffMat[2:, :])
        self.logger(iter, self.actionSet[:, iter], self.beliefMat,
8
     self.payoffSet[:, iter, :])
        # same payoff for each strategy --> choose randomly
10
        if self.payoffSet[0, iter, 0] == self.payoffSet[0, iter, 1]:
11
          action1 = randint(0, 1)
        # different payoff--> choose best response
13
        else:
14
          action1 = int(np.argmax(self.payoffSet[0, iter, :]))
15
        self.actionSet[0, iter + 1] = action1
16
        if self.payoffSet[1, iter, 0] == self.payoffSet[1, iter, 1]:
17
          action2 = randint(0, 1)
18
        else:
19
          action2 = int(np.argmax(self.payoffSet[1, iter, :]))
20
        self.actionSet[1, iter + 1] = action2
21
22
        # update the other player's belief
23
        self.beliefMat[1, self.actionSet[0, iter + 1]] += 1
24
        self.beliefMat[0, self.actionSet[1, iter + 1]] += 1
25
26
        if action1 == pre_action1 and action2 == pre_action2:
27
          self.actionTh -= 1
28
          if self.actionTh == 0:
29
            # print("early stop with repeated best response")
30
            self.logger(iter, self.actionSet[:, iter], self.beliefMat,
31
32
                         self.payoffSet[:, iter, :], last = True)
            break
33
        pre_action1, pre_action2 = action1, action2
34
```

Q1. One pure-strategy Nash Equilibrium

The following block shows the result of Q1 by fictitious play, for each iteration the program will print out the action, belief and payoff of each player. When the game end (or converge), the strategy distribution will be shown, which can be use to find the mixed or pure strategy of the game (the strategy distribution only considers the actions after round 0, which means the prior belief is ignored).

```
Round 0
  belief of player1: [264.93 735.07], player2: [231.05 768.95]
  payoff of player1: [ 470.15 2205.22], player2: [ 537.9 2306.86]
  ______
                  Round 1
  action of player1: 1, palyer2: 1
6
  belief of player1: [264.93 736.07], player2: [231.05 769.95]
  payoff of player1: [ 471.15 2208.22], player2: [ 538.9 2309.86]
  ______
10
11
  ______
                 Round 3000
  action of player1: 1, palyer2: 1
14
  belief of player1: [ 264.93 3736.07], player2: [ 231.05 3769.95]
15
  payoff of player1: [ 3470.15 11205.22], player2: [ 3537.9
   11306.86]
17
  ______
 strategy distribution of player1: [0. 1.], player2: [0. 1.]
```

The pure-strategy NE (r_2, c_2) can be found by fictitious paly. For player1, the best response will always be r_2 not matter what strategy player2 chooses, and vice versa.

Q2. Two or more pure-strategy NE

```
Round 0
  belief of player1: [637.08 362.92], player2: [551.77 448.23]
  payoff of player1: [1637.08 1088.77], player2: [1551.77 1344.7]
  ______
                 Round 1
  action of player1: 0, palyer2: 0
6
  belief of player1: [638.08 362.92], player2: [552.77 448.23]
  payoff of player1: [1639.08 1088.77], player2: [1553.77 1344.7]
  ______
10
11
  ______
                 Round 3000
13
  action of player1: 0, palyer2: 0
14
  belief of player1: [3638.08 362.92], player2: [3552.77 448.23]
15
  payoff of player1: [7637.08 1088.77], player2: [7551.77 1344.7]
  ______
17
  strategy distribution of player1: [1. 0.], player2: [1. 0.]
```

```
Round 0
  belief of player1: [297.91 702.09], player2: [487.34 512.66]
   payoff of player1: [1297.91 2106.28], player2: [1487.34 1537.97]
   ______
                   Round 1
   action of player1: 1, palyer2: 1
   belief of player1: [297.91 703.09], player2: [487.34 513.66]
  payoff of player1: [1298.91 2109.28], player2: [1488.34 1540.97]
10
11
12
   ______
                   Round 3000
13
  action of player1: 1, palyer2: 1
  belief of player1: [ 297.91 3703.09], player2: [ 487.34 3513.66]
  payoff of player1: [ 4297.91 11106.28], player2: [ 4487.34
16
   10537.97]
   ______
 strategy distribution of player1: [0. 1.], player2: [0. 1.]
```

The pure-strategy NE (r_1, c_1) and (r_2, c_2) can be found by fictitious paly. No matter what the initial belief is, at some point the game will lead the belief of both players to (x, y), x = y, and the result will have two situation:

- 1. Once the belief of both player are (x,y), x > y, player1 will keep choosing r_1 rather than r_2 , and player2 will keep choosing c_1 rather than c_2 , which result in pure-strategy NE (r_1, c_1) .
- 2. Once the belief of both player are (x,y), x < y, player1 will keep choosing r_2 rather than r_1 , and player2 will keep choosing c_2 rather than c_1 , which result in pure-strategy NE (r_2, c_2) .

Q3: Two or more pure-strategy NE (Conti.)

```
Round 0
  belief of player1: [179.43 820.57], player2: [741.07 258.93]
  payoff of player1: [179.43 0. ], player2: [741.07 0. ]
  ______
                   Round 1
  action of player1: 0, palyer2: 0
  belief of player1: [180.43 820.57], player2: [742.07 258.93]
  payoff of player1: [180.43 0. ], player2: [742.07 0. ]
  ______
  ______
12
                  Round 3000
13
  action of player1: 0, palyer2: 0
 belief of player1: [3180.43 820.57], player2: [3742.07 258.93] payoff of player1: [3179.43 0.], player2: [3741.07 0.]
15
16
  ______
strategy distribution of player1: [1. 0.], player2: [1. 0.]
```

Only one pure-strategy NE (r_1, c_1) can be found by fictitious paly. Defining $(b_{c1}, b_{c2}), b_{c1} > 0, b_{c2} > 0$ as player1's initial belief, $(b_{r1}, b_{r2}), b_{r1} > 0, b_{r2} > 0$ as player2's initial belief, the payoff of r_1 (c_1) will always be larger than r_2 (c_2) , so the result will only converge to NE (r_1, c_1) .

Q4: Mixed-Strategy Nash Equilibrium

```
Round 0
   belief of player1: [336.21 663.79], player2: [664.74 335.26]
   payoff of player1: [1327.58 672.42], player2: [ 664.74 1341.03]
   ______
                     Round 1
   action of player1: 0, palyer2: 1
   belief of player1: [336.21 664.79], player2: [665.74 335.26]
   payoff of player1: [1329.58 672.42], player2: [ 665.74 1341.03]
   ______
12
                    Round 4999
13
  action of player1: 0, palyer2: 1
  belief of player1: [2864.21 3134.79], player2: [4647.74 1351.26]
15
  payoff of player1: [6269.58 5728.42], player2: [4647.74 5405.03]
strategy distribution of player1: [0.8 0.2], player2: [0.51 0.49]
```

The mixed-strategy NE $P(r_1) = \frac{4}{5}$, $P(r_2) = \frac{1}{5}$, $P(c_1) = \frac{1}{2}$, $P(c_2) = \frac{1}{2}$ can be found by fictitious paly. The best response of two player can be analysis by four situation:

- 1. belief $b_{c1} > b_{c2}, b_{r1} > b_{r2}$, player1 will choose r_2 as best response, player2 will choose c_1 , which lead to situation 2
- 2. belief $b_{c1} > b_{c2}, b_{r1} < b_{r2}$, player1 will choose r_2 as best response, **player2 will choose** c_2 , which lead to situation 3
- 3. belief $b_{c1} < b_{c2}$, $b_{r1} < b_{r2}$, player1 will choose r_1 as best response, player2 will choose c_2 , which lead to situation 4
- 4. belief $b_{c1} < b_{c2}, b_{r1} > b_{r2}$, player1 will choose r_1 as best response, **player2 will choose** c_1 , which lead to back to situation 1

With large number of iteration and the best response cycle mentioned above, the mixed-strategy NE can be found by fictitious play.

Q5: Best-reply path

```
Round 0
   belief of player1: [846.93 153.07], player2: [768.67 231.33]
   payoff of player1: [153.07 846.93], player2: [768.67 231.33]
   ______
                       Round 1
   action of player1: 1, palyer2: 0
   belief of player1: [847.93 153.07], player2: [768.67 232.33]
   payoff of player1: [153.07 847.93], player2: [768.67 232.33]
11
12
                       Round 4999
   action of player1: 1, palyer2: 0
   belief of player1: [3380.93 2618.07], player2: [3235.67 2763.33]
15
   payoff of player1: [2618.07 3380.93], player2: [3235.67 2763.33]
16
17
   strategy distribution of player1: [0.49 0.51], player2: [0.51 0.49]
```

The mixed-strategy NE $P(r_1) = \frac{4}{5}$, $P(r_2) = \frac{1}{5}$, $P(c_1) = \frac{1}{2}$, $P(c_2) = \frac{1}{2}$ can be found by fictitious paly. The best response of two player can be analysis by four situation:

- 1. belief $b_{c1} > b_{c2}$, $b_{r1} > b_{r2}$, player1 will choose r_2 as best response, player2 will choose c_1 , which lead to situation 2
- 2. belief $b_{c1} > b_{c2}$, $b_{r1} < b_{r2}$, player1 will choose r_2 as best response, **player2 will choose** c_2 , which lead to situation 3
- 3. belief $b_{c1} < b_{c2}, b_{r1} < b_{r2}$, player1 will choose r_1 as best response, player2 will choose c_2 , which lead to situation 4
- 4. belief $b_{c1} < b_{c2}, b_{r1} > b_{r2}$, player1 will choose r_1 as best response, **player2 will choose** c_1 , which lead to back to situation 1

With large number of iteration and the best response cycle mentioned above, the mixed-strategy NE can be found by fictitious play.

Q6: Pure-Coordination Game

```
Round 0
  belief of player1: [859.82 140.18], player2: [814.87 185.13]
  payoff of player1: [8598.24 1401.76], player2: [8148.69 1851.31]
  ______
                  Round 1
  action of player1: 0, palyer2: 0
  belief of player1: [860.82 140.18], player2: [815.87 185.13]
  payoff of player1: [8608.24 1401.76], player2: [8158.69 1851.31]
  ______
10
11
  ______
12
                 Round 4999
13
  action of player1: 0, palyer2: 0
14
  belief of player1: [5858.82 140.18], player2: [5813.87 185.13]
15
  payoff of player1: [58588.24 1401.76], player2: [58138.69
16
   1851.31]
  ______
17
strategy distribution of player1: [1. 0.], player2: [1. 0.]
                  Round 0
1
  belief of player1: [224.77 775.23], player2: [ 57.43 942.57]
  payoff of player1: [2247.67 7752.33], player2: [ 574.34 9425.66]
  ______
                  Round 1
  action of player1: 1, palyer2: 1
  belief of player1: [224.77 776.23], player2: [ 57.43 943.57]
  payoff of player1: [2247.67 7762.33], player2: [ 574.34 9435.66]
  ______
10
11
  ______
12
                  Round 4999
13
  action of player1: 1, palyer2: 1
14
  belief of player1: [ 224.77 5774.23], player2: [ 57.43 5941.57]
15
payoff of player1: [ 2247.67 57742.33], player2: [ 574.34
  59415.66]
  ______
strategy distribution of player1: [0. 1.], player2: [0. 1.]
```

If the difference of initial payoff is larger than $10 (|payoff_{r1} - payoff_{r2}| > 10)$ and $|payoff_{c1} - payoff_{c2}| > 10)$ The pure-strategy NE (r_1, c_1) and (r_2, c_2) can be found by fictitious paly. The result will have two situation:

- 1. Once the belief of both players are (x,y), x > y, player1 will keep choosing r_1 rather than r_2 , and player2 will keep choosing c_1 rather than c_2 , which result in pure-strategy NE (r_1, c_1) .
- 2. Once the belief of both players are (x,y), x < y, player 1 will keep choosing r_2 rather than r_1 , and player 2 will keep choosing c_2 rather than c_1 , which result in pure-strategy NE (r_2, c_2) .

```
Round 0
  belief of player1: [500.01 499.99], player2: [499.96 500.04]
   payoff of player1: [5000.1 4999.9], player2: [4999.6 5000.4]
3
   ______
             Round 1
  action of player1: 0, palyer2: 1
  belief of player1: [500.01 500.99], player2: [500.96 500.04]
  payoff of player1: [5000.1 5009.9], player2: [5009.6 5000.4]
  ______
11
12
                  Round 4999
13
  action of player1: 0, palyer2: 1
  belief of player1: [2999.01 2999.99], player2: [2999.96 2999.04]
15
  payoff of player1: [29990.1 29999.9], player2: [29999.6 29990.4]
16
  ______
17
  strategy distribution of player1: [0.5 0.5], player2: [0.5 0.5]
```

If the difference of initial payoff is lower than 10 ($|payoff_{r1} - payoff_{r2}| < 10$ and $|payoff_{c1} - payoff_{c2}| < 10$) and initial strategy distribution of two player is $b_{r1} > b_{r2}, b_{c1} < b_{c2}$ or $b_{r1} < b_{r2}, b_{c1} > b_{c2}$, the mixed-strategy NE $P(r_1) = \frac{1}{2}, P(r_2) = \frac{1}{2}, P(c_1) = \frac{1}{2}, P(c_2) = \frac{1}{2}$ can be found by fictitious paly. Since the best response of each iteration will be lead to the cycle between (r_1, c_2) and (r_2, c_1) .

Q7: Anti-Coordination game

```
Round 0
  belief of player1: [179.25 820.75], player2: [559.01 440.99]
  payoff of player1: [820.75 179.25], player2: [440.99 559.01]
  ______
                  Round 1
  action of player1: 0, palyer2: 1
  belief of player1: [179.25 821.75], player2: [560.01 440.99]
  payoff of player1: [821.75 179.25], player2: [440.99 560.01]
  ______
10
11
  ______
12
                 Round 4999
13
  action of player1: 0, palyer2: 1
14
  belief of player1: [ 179.25 5819.75], player2: [5558.01 440.99]
15
 payoff of player1: [5819.75 179.25], player2: [ 440.99 5558.01]
17
  ______
strategy distribution of player1: [1. 0.], player2: [0. 1.]
```

```
Round 0
  belief of player1: [963.11 36.89], player2: [165.47 834.53]
  payoff of player1: [ 36.89 963.11], player2: [834.53 165.47]
  ______
                   Round 1
  action of player1: 1, palyer2: 0
  belief of player1: [964.11 36.89], player2: [165.47 835.53]
  payoff of player1: [ 36.89 964.11], player2: [835.53 165.47]
12
   ______
                   Round 4999
13
  action of player1: 1, palyer2: 0
  belief of player1: [5962.11 36.89], player2: [ 165.47 5833.53]
  payoff of player1: [ 36.89 5962.11], player2: [5833.53 165.47]
16
  ______
17
  strategy distribution of player1: [0. 1.], player2: [1. 0.]
```

If the difference of initial payoff is larger than 1 ($|payoff_{r1} - payoff_{r2}| > 1$ and $|payoff_{c1} - payoff_{c2}| > 1$) The pure-strategy NE (r_1, c_2) and (r_2, c_1) can be found by fictitious paly. The result will have two situation:

- 1. Once the belief $b_{r1} > b_{r2}, b_{c1} < b_{c2}$, player1 will keep choosing r_1 rather than r_2 , and player2 will keep choosing c_2 rather than c_1 , which result in pure-strategy NE (r_1, c_2) .
- 2. Once the belief $b_{r1} < b_{r2}, b_{c1} > b_{c2}$, player1 will keep choosing r_2 rather than r_1 , and player2 will keep choosing c_1 rather than c_2 , which result in pure-strategy NE (r_2, c_1) .

```
Round 0
  belief of player1: [500.01 499.99], player2: [500.01 499.99]
   payoff of player1: [499.99 500.01], player2: [499.99 500.01]
   ______
                   Round 1
   action of player1: 1, palyer2: 1
  belief of player1: [500.01 500.99], player2: [500.01 500.99]
  payoff of player1: [500.99 500.01], player2: [500.99 500.01]
  ______
10
11
  ______
                   Round 4999
13
  action of player1: 1, palyer2: 1
  belief of player1: [2999.01 2999.99], player2: [2999.01 2999.99]
  payoff of player1: [2999.99 2999.01], player2: [2999.99 2999.01]
16
17
 strategy distribution of player1: [0.5 0.5], player2: [0.5 0.5]
```

If the difference of initial payoff is lower than 1 ($|payoff_{r1} - payoff_{r2}| < 1$ and $|payoff_{c1} - payoff_{c2}| < 1$) and initial strategy distribution of two player is $b_{r1} > b_{r2}, b_{c1} > b_{c2}$ or $b_{r1} < b_{r2}, b_{c1} < b_{c2}$, the mixed-strategy NE $P(r_1) = \frac{1}{2}, P(r_2) = \frac{1}{2}, P(c_1) = \frac{1}{2}, P(c_2) = \frac{1}{2}$ can be found by fictitious paly. Since the best response of each iteration will be lead to the cycle between (r_1, c_1) and (r_2, c_2) .

Q8: Battle of the Sexes

```
Round 0
  belief of player1: [505.52 494.48], player2: [887.14 112.86]
  payoff of player1: [1516.57 988.96], player2: [1774.27 338.59]
   ______
                    Round 1
   action of player1: 0, palyer2: 0
   belief of player1: [506.52 494.48], player2: [888.14 112.86]
   payoff of player1: [1519.57 988.96], player2: [1776.27 338.59]
11
  ______
12
                   Round 4999
13
  action of player1: 0, palyer2: 0
  belief of player1: [5504.52 494.48], player2: [5886.14 112.86]
15
  payoff of player1: [16513.57 988.96], player2: [11772.27
   338.59]
  ______
strategy distribution of player1: [1. 0.], player2: [1. 0.]
                    Round 0
  belief of player1: [ 9.52 990.48], player2: [ 53.65 946.35]
  payoff of player1: [ 28.57 1980.95], player2: [ 107.29 2839.06]
3
   ______
                    Round 1
  action of player1: 1, palyer2: 1
  belief of player1: [ 9.52 991.48], player2: [ 53.65 947.35]
  payoff of player1: [ 28.57 1982.95], player2: [ 107.29 2842.06]
  ______
11
  ______
12
                   Round 4999
  action of player1: 1, palyer2: 1
 belief of player1: [ 9.52 5989.48], player2: [ 53.65 5945.35] payoff of player1: [ 28.57 11978.95], player2: [ 107.29
15
   17836.06]
 strategy distribution of player1: [0. 1.], player2: [0. 1.]
```

If the difference of initial payoff is larger than 2 ($|payoff_{r1} - payoff_{r2}| > 1$ and $|payoff_{c1} - payoff_{c2}| > 1$) The pure-strategy NE (r_1, c_2) and (r_2, c_1) can be found by fictitious paly. The result will have two situation:

- 1. Once the belief $b_{r1} > b_{r2}$, $b_{c1} < b_{c2}$, player1 will keep choosing r_1 rather than r_2 , and player2 will keep choosing c_2 rather than c_1 , which result in pure-strategy NE (r_1, c_2) .
- 2. Once the belief $b_{r1} < b_{r2}, b_{c1} > b_{c2}$, player1 will keep choosing r_2 rather than r_1 , and player2 will keep choosing c_1 rather than c_2 , which result in pure-strategy NE (r_2, c_1) .

```
Round 0

belief of player1: [399.99 600.01], player2: [600.01 399.99]

payoff of player1: [1199.97 1200.02], player2: [1200.02 1199.97]

Round 1

action of player1: 1, palyer2: 0

belief of player1: [400.99 600.01], player2: [600.01 400.99]

payoff of player1: [1202.97 1200.02], player2: [1200.02 1202.97]

Round 4999

action of player1: 1, palyer2: 0

belief of player1: [2399.99 3599.01], player2: [3599.01 2399.99]

payoff of player1: [7199.97 7198.02], player2: [7198.02 7199.97]

strategy distribution of player1: [0.6 0.4], player2: [0.4 0.6]
```

If the difference of initial payoff is lower than $2(|payoff_{r1} - payoff_{r2}| < 2$ and $|payoff_{c1} - payoff_{c2}| < 2)$ and initial strategy distribution of two player is $b_{r1} > b_{r2}, b_{c1} < b_{c2}$ or $b_{r1} < b_{r2}, b_{c1} > b_{c2}$, the mixed-strategy NE $P(r_1) = \frac{3}{5}, P(r_2) = \frac{2}{5}, P(c_1) = \frac{2}{5}, P(c_2) = \frac{3}{5}$ can be found by fictitious paly. Since the best response of each iteration will be lead to the cycle between (r_1, c_2) and (r_2, c_1) .

Q9: Stag Hunt Game

```
Round 0
  belief of player1: [642.99 357.01], player2: [903.66 96.34]
  payoff of player1: [1928.96 1642.99], player2: [2710.97 1903.66]
  ______
                 Round 1
  action of player1: 0, palyer2: 0
  belief of player1: [643.99 357.01], player2: [904.66 96.34]
  payoff of player1: [1931.96 1644.99], player2: [2713.97 1905.66]
  ______
11
  ______
12
                  Round 4999
  action of player1: 0, palyer2: 0
14
  belief of player1: [5641.99 357.01], player2: [5902.66 96.34]
15
  payoff of player1: [16925.96 11640.99], player2: [17707.97
   11901.66]
  ______
 strategy distribution of player1: [1. 0.], player2: [1. 0.]
```

```
Round 0
  belief of player1: [234.27 765.73], player2: [144.81 855.19]
  payoff of player1: [ 702.8 1234.27], player2: [ 434.42 1144.81]
  Round 1
  action of player1: 1, palyer2: 1
  belief of player1: [234.27 766.73], player2: [144.81 856.19]
  payoff of player1: [ 702.8 1235.27], player2: [ 434.42 1145.81]
  -----
10
11
  ______
                   Round 4999
13
  action of player1: 1, palyer2: 1
14
  belief of player1: [ 234.27 5764.73], player2: [ 144.81 5854.19]
15
  payoff of player1: [ 702.8 6233.27], player2: [ 434.42 6143.81]
  ______
17
strategy distribution of player1: [0. 1.], player2: [0. 1.]
```

If the difference of payoff during the iteration will always larger than 1 $(|payoff_{r1} - payoff_{r2}| > 1)$ and $|payoff_{c1} - payoff_{c2}| > 1)$ The pure-strategy NE (r_1, c_2) and (r_2, c_1) can be found by fictitious paly. The result will have two situation:

- 1. Once the belief $b_{r1} > b_{r2}, b_{c1} > b_{c2}$, player1 will keep choosing r_1 rather than r_2 , and player2 will keep choosing c_1 rather than c_2 , which result in pure-strategy NE (r_1, c_1) .
- 2. Once the belief $b_{r1} < b_{r2}, b_{c1} < b_{c2}$, player1 will keep choosing r_2 rather than r_1 , and player2 will keep choosing c_2 rather than c_1 , which result in pure-strategy NE (r_2, c_2) .

```
Round 0
   belief of player1: [500.01 499.99], player2: [499.99 500.01]
   payoff of player1: [1500.03 1500.01], player2: [1499.97 1499.99]
3
   ______
                     Round 1
   action of player1: 0, palyer2: 1
   belief of player1: [500.01 500.99], player2: [500.99 500.01]
   payoff of player1: [1500.03 1501.01], player2: [1502.97 1501.99]
11
  ______
12
                     Round 4999
13
  action of player1: 0, palyer2: 1
  belief of player1: [2999.01 2999.99], player2: [2999.99 2999.01]
15
  payoff of player1: [8997.03 8998.01], player2: [8999.97 8998.99]
16
17
 strategy distribution of player1: [0.5 0.5], player2: [0.5 0.5]
```

If the difference of initial payoff is lower than 1 ($|payoff_{r1} - payoff_{r2}| < 1$ and $|payoff_{c1} - payoff_{c2}| < 1$) and initial strategy distribution of two player is $b_{r1} > b_{r2}, b_{c1} < b_{c2}$ or $b_{r1} < b_{r2}, b_{c1} > b_{c2}$, the mixed-strategy NE $P(r_1) = \frac{1}{2}, P(r_2) = \frac{1}{2}, P(c_1) = \frac{1}{2}, P(c_2) = \frac{1}{2}$ can be found by fictitious paly. Since the best response of each iteration will be lead to the cycle between (r_1, c_2) and (r_2, c_1) .

Q10: Observation and Conclusion

to be continue...