

1. MHD EQUATIONS WITH KRAMERS OPACITY

Continuity equation:

$$\frac{\partial \rho}{\partial t} + \nabla \cdot \rho \mathbf{u} = 0 \quad (1)$$

$$\frac{\partial \rho}{\partial t} + \rho \nabla \cdot \mathbf{u} + \mathbf{u} \cdot \nabla \rho = 0 \quad (2)$$

Dividing by ρ , we have

$$\frac{\partial \ln \rho}{\partial t} + \nabla \cdot \mathbf{u} + \mathbf{u} \cdot \nabla \ln \rho = 0 \quad (3)$$

Momentum equation:

$$\frac{\partial \mathbf{u}}{\partial t} + (\mathbf{u} \cdot \nabla) \mathbf{u} = \frac{-\nabla P}{\rho} - \nabla \phi + \frac{1}{\rho} \nabla \cdot D \quad (4)$$

Here, $\mathbf{g} = -\nabla \phi$, and $D_{ik} = \mu(\partial_i u_k + \partial_k u_i - \frac{2}{3} \partial_l u_l \delta_{ik}) + \xi \partial_l u_l \nabla_{ik}$ is the viscous stress tensor. μ is the dynamic shear viscosity, and ξ is the bulk viscosity.

Transforming pressure to entropy and enthalpy definitions using

$$\nabla h = T \nabla s + \frac{\nabla P}{\rho} \text{ and } h = c_P T$$

$$\frac{\partial \mathbf{u}}{\partial t} + (\mathbf{u} \cdot \nabla) \mathbf{u} = T \nabla s - \nabla h - \nabla \phi + \frac{1}{\rho} \nabla \cdot D \quad (5)$$

$$\frac{\partial \mathbf{u}}{\partial t} + (\mathbf{u} \cdot \nabla) \mathbf{u} = -\nabla(h + \phi) + \frac{h}{c_P} \nabla s + \frac{1}{\rho} \nabla \cdot D \quad (6)$$

Entropy equation: From second law of thermodynamics, we have

$$\rho T ds = dq = \Phi - \nabla \cdot F \quad (7)$$

Here, dq is the heat transferred to the system, Φ is the viscous heating, and $\nabla \cdot F$ is the diffusive flux.

Sidenote: Second law of thermodynamics states that the entropy of a closed thermodynamic system either remains the same or increases over time.

Using, $h = c_P T$,

$$\frac{\partial s}{\partial t} + (\mathbf{u} \cdot \nabla) s = \frac{1}{\rho h} c_P \Phi - \frac{c_P}{\rho h} \nabla \cdot F \quad (8)$$

The generic form of F for diffusive fluxes is:

$$F = -K \nabla T \quad (9)$$

Here, in our case, with Kramers opacity, the radiative conductivity, K , is given by,

$$K(\rho, T) = \frac{16 \sigma_{SB} T^3}{3 \kappa \rho} \quad (10)$$

The opacity, κ , is given by,

$$\kappa = \kappa_0 \rho^a T^b \quad (11)$$

Here, a and b are free parameters. We then have,

$$K(\rho, T) = \frac{16\sigma_{SB}T^{3-b}}{3\kappa_0\rho^{1+a}} \quad (12)$$

Using, 9 and $h = c_P T$ in 8, we have

$$\frac{\partial s}{\partial t} + (\mathbf{u} \cdot \nabla)s = \frac{1}{\rho h} c_P \Phi + \frac{1}{\rho h} \nabla \cdot (K \nabla h) \quad (13)$$

Let's focus on the diffusive term and see if we can simplify it. First of all, we have

$$\nabla \cdot \left(\frac{\nabla h}{h} \right) = \frac{1}{h} \nabla \cdot \nabla h + \nabla h \cdot \nabla \left(\frac{1}{h} \right) \quad (14)$$

$$= \frac{1}{h} \nabla^2 h - \frac{(\nabla h)^2}{h^2} \quad (15)$$

$$\frac{1}{h} \nabla \cdot \nabla h = \nabla^2 \ln h + (\nabla \ln h)^2 \quad (16)$$

Now, the full diffusive term simplifies as,

$$\frac{1}{h} \nabla \cdot (K \nabla h) = \frac{1}{h} [(\nabla K) \cdot \nabla h + K \nabla^2 h] \quad (17)$$

$$= \nabla K \cdot \nabla \ln h + K \frac{\nabla^2 h}{h} \quad (18)$$

$$= \nabla K \cdot \nabla \ln h + K \nabla \cdot \left(\frac{\nabla h}{h} \right) + K \left(\frac{\nabla h}{h} \right)^2 \quad (19)$$

In $\ln h$ formalism, we have

$$\frac{1}{h} \nabla \cdot (K \nabla h) = \nabla K \cdot \nabla \ln h + K \nabla^2 \ln h + K (\nabla \ln h)^2 \quad (20)$$

Finally, the entropy equation 13 can be written as,

$$\frac{\partial s}{\partial t} + (\mathbf{u} \cdot \nabla)s = \frac{1}{\rho h} c_P \Phi + \frac{1}{\rho} (\nabla K \cdot \nabla \ln h + K \nabla^2 \ln h + K (\nabla \ln h)^2) \quad (21)$$

Further simplifying the above equation,

$$\frac{\partial s}{\partial t} + (\mathbf{u} \cdot \nabla)s = \frac{1}{\rho h} c_P \Phi + \frac{K}{\rho} (\nabla \ln K \cdot \nabla \ln h + \nabla^2 \ln h + (\nabla \ln h)^2) \quad (22)$$

Rewriting the final set of equations here,

$$\frac{\partial \ln \rho}{\partial t} + \nabla \cdot \mathbf{u} + \mathbf{u} \cdot \nabla \ln \rho = 0 \quad (23)$$

$$\frac{\partial \mathbf{u}}{\partial t} + (\mathbf{u} \cdot \nabla)\mathbf{u} = -\nabla(h + \phi) + \frac{h}{c_P} \nabla s + \frac{1}{\rho} \nabla \cdot D \quad (24)$$

$$\frac{\partial s}{\partial t} + \mathbf{u} \cdot \nabla s = \frac{1}{\rho h} c_P \Phi + \frac{K}{\rho} (\nabla \ln K \cdot \nabla \ln h + \nabla^2 \ln h + (\nabla \ln h)^2) \quad (25)$$

Here,

s = entropy

h = enthalpy

c_P = specific heat at constant pressure

Φ = viscous heating

K = radiative conductivity

ϕ = gravitational potential

D = viscous stress tensor

Let's non-dimensionalize these equations,

$$\bar{\rho} = \frac{\rho}{\rho_0}, \quad \bar{\mathbf{u}} = \frac{\mathbf{u}}{\mathbf{u}_0}, \quad \bar{x} = \frac{x}{L}, \quad \bar{t} = \frac{t}{T}, \quad \bar{h} = \frac{h}{h_0}, \quad \bar{s} = \frac{s}{s_0} \quad (26)$$

Here, the variables with the bar sign are non-dimensional. Subscripts 0 represent characteristic values of the quantities for the given system, L is the typical length scale, and T is the typical timescale.

Let's focus on equation 23. Note that while substituting the variables from equation 26, I'd be dropping the bar signs for convenience and clarity in writing.

$$\frac{1}{T} \frac{\partial \ln \rho}{\partial t} + \frac{u_0}{L} \nabla \cdot \mathbf{u} + \frac{u_0}{L} \mathbf{u} \cdot \nabla \ln \rho = 0 \quad (27)$$

For the characteristic velocity, time and length scales, we have the following relation, $L = u_0 T$. Also an important point to note is that while non-dimensionalizing $\partial \ln \rho$, we don't need to have ρ 's hanging around. The reason being derivative of $\ln \rho$ is of the form $\partial \rho / \rho$. Using all this information, we have, in non-dimensional form,

$$\partial_t \ln \rho + \nabla \cdot \mathbf{u} + \mathbf{u} \cdot \nabla \ln \rho = 0 \quad (28)$$

Now, for equation 24, we have

$$\frac{u_0}{T} \frac{\partial \mathbf{u}}{\partial t} + \frac{c_0^2}{L} (\mathbf{u} \cdot \nabla) \mathbf{u} = -\frac{1}{L} \nabla (h_0 h + \phi_0 \phi) + \frac{h_0}{c_P L} s_0 h \nabla s + \frac{1}{\rho_0 \rho} \frac{1}{L} \frac{\mu u_0}{L} \nabla \cdot D \quad (29)$$

$$\frac{u_0^2}{L} \left(\frac{\partial \mathbf{u}}{\partial t} + (\mathbf{u} \cdot \nabla) \mathbf{u} \right) = -\frac{h_0}{L} \nabla \left(h + \frac{\phi_0}{h_0} \phi \right) + \frac{h_0}{L} \frac{s_0}{c_P} h \nabla s + \frac{\nu u_0}{L^2} \frac{1}{\rho} \nabla \cdot D \quad (30)$$

Here, we have used $\nu = \mu / \rho_0$, where ν is the kinematic viscosity, and μ is the dynamic shear viscosity.

$$\frac{\partial \mathbf{u}}{\partial t} + (\mathbf{u} \cdot \nabla) \mathbf{u} = -\frac{h_0}{u_0^2} \nabla \left(h + \frac{\phi_0}{h_0} \phi \right) + \frac{h_0}{u_0^2} \frac{s_0}{c_P} h \nabla s + \frac{1}{L u_0 / \nu} \frac{1}{\rho} \nabla \cdot D \quad (31)$$

Finally, the above equation simplifies to,

$$\frac{\partial \mathbf{u}}{\partial t} + (\mathbf{u} \cdot \nabla) \mathbf{u} = -\frac{1}{\text{Ma}^2} \nabla \left(h + \frac{\phi_0}{h_0} \phi \right) + \frac{1}{\text{Ma}^2} h \nabla s + \frac{1}{\Re} \frac{1}{\rho} \nabla \cdot D \quad (32)$$

Here, $\text{Ma}^2 = \frac{u_0^2}{h_0}$, $\Re = \frac{L u_0}{\nu}$ and $s \equiv c_P$. Let's focus to non-dimensionalize the entropy equation 33 now,

$$\frac{\partial s}{\partial t} + \mathbf{u} \cdot \nabla s = \frac{1}{\rho h} c_P \Phi + \frac{K}{\rho} (\nabla \ln K \cdot \nabla \ln h + \nabla^2 \ln h + (\nabla \ln h)^2) \quad (33)$$

$$\frac{s_0}{T} \frac{\partial s}{\partial t} + \frac{u_0 s_0}{L} (\mathbf{u} \cdot \nabla) s = \frac{\mu}{\rho_0 h_0} \frac{u_0^2}{L^2} \frac{1}{\rho h} c_P \Phi + \frac{K}{\rho_0 L^2} \frac{1}{\rho} (\nabla \ln K \cdot \nabla \ln h + \nabla^2 \ln h + (\nabla \ln h)^2) \quad (34)$$

Here, the viscous heating has the dimensions, $[\Phi] = \mu u_0^2 / L^2$. Refer to the definition of the viscous stress tensor, D .

$$\frac{u_0 s_0}{L} \left(\frac{\partial s}{\partial t} + \mathbf{u} \cdot \nabla s \right) = \frac{u_0^2}{\rho_0 h_0 L^2} \frac{\mu}{\rho h} c_P \Phi + \frac{K}{\rho_0 L^2} \frac{1}{\rho} (\nabla \ln K \cdot \nabla \ln h + \nabla^2 \ln h + (\nabla \ln h)^2) \quad (35)$$

$$\frac{\partial s}{\partial t} + \mathbf{u} \cdot \nabla s = \left(\frac{u_0^2}{h_0} \right) \left(\frac{c_P}{s_0} \right) \left(\frac{\mu}{\rho_0 u_0 L} \right) \frac{1}{\rho h} c_P \Phi + \left(\frac{K}{L \rho_0 u_0 s_0} \right) \frac{1}{\rho} (\nabla \ln K \cdot \nabla \ln h + \nabla^2 \ln h + (\nabla \ln h)^2) \quad (36)$$

In the last term on the right-hand side, we multiply and divide by μc_P ,

$$\frac{\partial s}{\partial t} + \mathbf{u} \cdot \nabla s = \left(\frac{u_0^2}{h_0} \right) \left(\frac{c_P}{s_0} \right) \left(\frac{\mu / \rho_0}{u_0 L} \right) \frac{1}{\rho h} \Phi + \left(\frac{K}{\mu c_P} \right) \left(\frac{c_P}{s_0} \right) \left(\frac{\mu / \rho_0}{L u_0} \right) \frac{1}{\rho} (\nabla \ln K \cdot \nabla \ln h + \nabla^2 \ln h + (\nabla \ln h)^2) \quad (37)$$

Here, we have, $\text{Ma}^2 = \frac{u_0^2}{h_0}$, $\Re = \frac{Lu_0}{\nu}$, $s \equiv c_P$, and $Pr = \frac{\mu_{CP}}{K}$. The above equation can then be rewritten as,

$$\frac{\partial s}{\partial t} + \mathbf{u} \cdot \nabla s = \frac{\text{Ma}^2}{\Re} \frac{1}{\rho h} \Phi + \frac{1}{\Re Pr} \frac{1}{\rho} (\nabla \ln K \cdot \nabla \ln h + \nabla^2 \ln h + (\nabla \ln h)^2) \quad (38)$$

The final set of non-dimensional equations are

$$\partial_t \ln \rho + \nabla \cdot \mathbf{u} + \mathbf{u} \cdot \nabla \ln \rho = 0 \quad (39)$$

$$\frac{\partial \mathbf{u}}{\partial t} + (\mathbf{u} \cdot \nabla) \mathbf{u} = -\frac{1}{\text{Ma}^2} \nabla \left(h + \frac{\phi_0}{h_0} \phi \right) + \frac{1}{\text{Ma}^2} h \nabla s + \frac{1}{\Re} \frac{1}{\rho} \nabla \cdot D \quad (40)$$

$$\frac{\partial s}{\partial t} + \mathbf{u} \cdot \nabla s = \frac{\text{Ma}^2}{\Re} \frac{1}{\rho h} \Phi + \frac{1}{\Re Pr} \frac{1}{\rho} (\nabla \ln K \cdot \nabla \ln h + \nabla^2 \ln h + (\nabla \ln h)^2) \quad (41)$$

Along with this, we have the equation of state, in non-dimensionalized form,

$$\left[\frac{s_0}{c_P} \right] \gamma s = \ln h - (\gamma - 1) \ln \rho \quad (42)$$

For the reference values of h and s , we will use the hydrostatic state. Meaning that when the system is in hydrostatic equilibrium, we have $h = h_0$ and $s = s_0$. Now under this, using $h = h_0 + h_1$, $s = s_0 + s_1$, and $\phi = \phi_0$ (gravitational potential doesn't have a perturbation), we can rewrite equation 40 as,

$$\nabla h_0 + \frac{\phi_0}{h_0} \nabla \phi_0 = h_0 \nabla s_0 \quad (43)$$

Using this, the non-dimensionalized momentum equation becomes,

$$\frac{\partial \mathbf{u}}{\partial t} + (\mathbf{u} \cdot \nabla) \mathbf{u} = -\frac{1}{\text{Ma}^2} \nabla h_1 + \frac{1}{\text{Ma}^2} (h_0 \nabla s_1 + h_1 \nabla s_0 + h_1 \nabla s_1) + \frac{1}{\Re} \frac{1}{\rho} \nabla \cdot D \quad (44)$$

The above equation is a non-dimensionalized, fluctuating momentum equation. Now, let's focus on the non-dimensionalized entropy equation. We specifically are interested in the diffusive terms. Let's ignore the $\nabla \ln K \cdot \nabla \ln h$ term for now. We then have,

$$\frac{1}{\Re} \frac{K}{\mu_{CP} \rho} [\nabla^2 \ln h + (\nabla \ln h)^2] \quad (45)$$

Using $h = h_0 + h_1$ and $\theta \equiv \ln h = \theta_0 + \theta_1$, we have,

$$\nabla^2 \ln h + (\nabla \ln h)^2 = \nabla^2 \theta + 2 \nabla \ln h_0 \cdot \nabla \theta + (\nabla \theta)^2 \quad (46)$$

Also, we can write the radiative conductivity as,

$$K(\rho, T) = K_0(\rho_0, T_0) + K_1(\rho, T) \quad (47)$$

Using the above equation in equation 45,

$$\frac{1}{\Re} \frac{1}{\mu_{CP} \rho} [K_0 \nabla^2 \theta + 2 K_0 \nabla \ln h \cdot \nabla \theta + K_0 (\nabla \theta)^2 + K_1 \nabla^2 \theta + 2 K_1 \nabla \ln h \cdot \nabla \theta + K_1 (\nabla \theta)^2] \quad (48)$$

Using this, we have the entropy equation as,

$$\frac{\partial s}{\partial t} + \mathbf{u} \cdot \nabla s = \frac{\text{Ma}^2}{\Re} \frac{1}{\rho h} \Phi + \frac{1}{\Re} \frac{1}{\mu_{CP} \rho} [K_0 \nabla^2 \theta + 2 K_0 \nabla \ln h \cdot \nabla \theta + K_0 (\nabla \theta)^2 + K_1 \nabla^2 \theta + 2 K_1 \nabla \ln h \cdot \nabla \theta + K_1 (\nabla \theta)^2] \quad (49)$$

Finally, taking an assumption here. We assume that the evolving density and temperature have minimal effect on the radiative conductivity, K_1 . This should be true for most of the Sun except the near-surface layers. The reasoning being that we can describe most of the solar convection zone as a polytrope, and for a polytrope, the radiative conductivity under the Kramers formalism is constant. In the Dedalus form the above equation will then look like,

$$\frac{\partial s}{\partial t} - \frac{1}{\Re Pr_0} \frac{1}{\rho} [\nabla^2 \theta + 2 \nabla \ln h \cdot \nabla \theta] = \frac{\text{Ma}^2}{\Re} \frac{1}{\rho h} \Phi + \frac{1}{\Re Pr_0} \frac{1}{\rho} (\nabla \theta)^2 - \mathbf{u} \cdot \nabla s \quad (50)$$

Here, we have $Pr_0 = \frac{\mu_{CP}}{K_0}$. We are also ignoring the $\nabla \ln K \cdot \nabla \ln h$ term for now, this is also reasonably true for most of the convection zone except the near-surface layers.