Paper Review Form

English is strongly recommended but not required.

1. Paper summary. (30%)

Please write a paragraph (max 200 words) summarizing the paper with the following components:

- **Problem**: What is the problem this paper aims to address?
- **Related work**: What does prior work lack in solving the problem?
- **Methodology**: What is the proposed approach? What techniques do they use?
- **Result/Contribution**: What are the results? What have the authors demonstrated?

Try your best to make the summary easy to understand for someone like you who has a general engineering background but does not have expertise in the field.

	7.5	4	0
Problem **Related work** **Methodology** **Result/Contribution**	Complete and correct.	1) Incomplete, 2) Only partially correct, or 3) Too much jargon impedes understanding.	1) Missing, 2) Completely incorrect, or 3) Purely AI-generated.

Exceeding word limit, **-10** points.

2. Analyze the result figure(s). (30%) Analyze the specified figure.

- Paper 1 – OPTICS: Fig. 11.
- Paper 2 – ChORUS: Fig. 16.
- Paper 3 – MULoc: Fig. 11.
- Paper 4 – MetaMosaic: Fig. 11 & Fig. 12.

Your analysis should include the following:
(Please do not directly copy and paste sentences from the original paper.)

- **Problem/Hypothesis**: What is the goal of this specific experiment? What do the authors want to show?
- **Methodology**: What is the experimental setup?
- **Result**: Describe the result, i.e., the selected figure. Don't forget to describe the x-axis, y-axis, and the legend.
- **Analysis**: What does the result indicate or imply? Does the result prove the point the authors want to make? Do the authors overclaim or underclaim?

	7.5	4	0
Problem/Hypothesis **Methodology** **Result** **Analysis**	Complete and correct.	Incomplete or only partially correct.	Missing, completely incorrect, or a direct copy from the paper.

3. Strengths and weaknesses of this paper. (30%)

Please list at least one strength and at least one weakness of the paper (at most three strengths and three weaknesses). Please elaborate on your point while keeping it concise. These should be your best points if you were on the respective defense and offense teams.

Example strengths:

- This paper is the first to identify and address an important problem.
- While many people have investigated this problem, this paper is the first to demonstrate the idea in an experiment.
- This paper significantly improves detection accuracy from x% to y%.
- The idea of xx is novel and can inspire a new line of work.

Example weaknesses:

- The paper omits an important prior work that has demonstrated the same idea.
- The experimental design cannot validate their proposed idea.
- The authors mislead the readers by overclaiming.
- The system model considered in this paper does not accurately reflect the actual scenario.
- Weak validation due to unfit metrics chosen.

	15	10	5	0
Strength **Weakness**	Top 3~5 arguments chosen by the TA.	1) Has covered at least one important strength and weakness, and 2) Has sufficiently elaborated.	1) Has chosen secondary strengths and weaknesses, or 2) Has not sufficiently explained the reasoning, or 3) The argument is too lengthy.	The argument is missing or completely unfounded.

4. Recommendations. (5%) Please give your overall recommendation.

- Reject
- Weak reject
- Borderline
- Weak accept
- Strong accept

5. **ChatGPT**. **(5%)** Please indicate if you have used ChatGPT or other AI tools in this assignment. If yes, why and how do you use it? This is only for the survey purpose. No penalty for the use of ChatGPT.

	5	0
Recommendations **ChatGPT**	Information provided.	Missing.