



Schilder, Brian &lt;brian\_schilder@alumni.brown.edu&gt;

---

## HOMP Paper

5 messages

---

**Brian Richmond** <brich@gwu.edu>  
Reply-To: brich@gwu.edu  
To: Brian Schilder <schilder@gwmail.gwu.edu>  
Cc: Bernard Wood <bernardawood@gmail.com>

Mon, May 12, 2014 at 11:03 AM

Hi Brian,

Here are our comments on your research paper:

BR

- This paper presents a very creative analysis of a major question about what relationship, if any, exists between environmental factors and brain increase in the hominin clade as well as other mammalian clades. There are a few weaknesses that would improve it. For example, abstracts normally present the key results, and this abstract would be improved by doing so. Also, while it is appropriate to use some correction for multiple comparisons, the 'simple' Bonferroni method used is overly conservative and leads to loss of statistical power. Also, be careful about concluding that a correlation between a climatic variable and brain size indicates that one is "driving" the other.
- Overall, however, this is an excellent study. It could be publishable with more sophisticated statistical techniques. You might consider speaking with Mark G.
- Well done!

BW: A clear-headed analysis of the problem. The methods could be improved upon, but the presentation get high marks from me for being clear and concise. You write well.

Grade: A+

--

Brian G. Richmond

Department of Anthropology  
[Center for the Advanced Study of Hominid Paleobiology](#)  
The George Washington University  
Lab website: [Human Evolutionary Anatomy Lab](#)

Human Origins Program  
National Museum of Natural History, Smithsonian Institution

---

**Schilder, Brian** <schilder@gwmail.gwu.edu>  
To: Brian Richmond <brich@gwu.edu>  
Cc: Bernard Wood <bernardawood@gmail.com>

Mon, May 12, 2014 at 11:24 AM

Hi Brian & Bernard,

Thank you very much for all your extremely helpful feedback! I've recently had a chance to talk to Chet and others about what I could do to improve this study, and I definitely plan on incorporating more complex statistics and submitting it for publication. I'll be sure to keep you both updated as things progress.

Thanks again,  
Brian  
[Quoted text hidden]

--

~~~~~

**Brian Schilder**

Hominid Paleobiology Doctoral Program  
Center for the Advanced Study of Hominid Paleobiology  
The George Washington University  
Building BB, 2114 G Street NW  
Washington, DC 20052  
[202-994-3713](tel:202-994-3713) (Office)  
[202-994-5923](tel:202-994-5923) (Lab)

---

**Brian Richmond** <brich@gwu.edu>  
To: brian\_schilder@alumni.brown.edu

Mon, May 12, 2014 at 11:24 AM

I am on sabbatical writing and conducting research until January 2015, and may not be able to respond promptly.  
If it is urgent, please contact the Anthropology Department at [202-994-6075](tel:202-994-6075).

[Quoted text hidden]

---

**Brian Richmond** <brich@gwu.edu>  
Reply-To: brich@gwu.edu  
To: "Schilder, Brian" <schilder@gwmail.gwu.edu>

Mon, May 12, 2014 at 11:33 AM

I look forward to it. I'd enjoy reading a draft closer to publication.

B

[Quoted text hidden]

---

**Schilder, Brian** <schilder@gwmail.gwu.edu>  
To: Brian Richmond <brich@gwu.edu>

Mon, May 12, 2014 at 11:39 AM

Absolutely, I'll be sure to send you a copy.

[Quoted text hidden]