Draft Literature Review Section

PA 604: Methods of Analysis in Public and Urban Affairs (Fall 2022)

15 points

Due: November 11, 2022

Overview:

In this assignment, you'll be completing a draft version of your literature review section for your final proposal.

The literature review is where you're introducing the reader to how the relationship between your variables operates (e.g. how does it work in real life, why is there a relationship between the two variables, why it makes sense that these variables are related). To do this, you need to find academic literature (research articles) that discuss your two variables/concepts, and discuss the findings of those articles.

This assignment is designed to be edited, improved, and included as part of your final proposal. Since this assignment will be submitted for feedback, suggestions, and comments from me, you'll need to complete the assignment Google Docs, and follow these video instructions to submit your Doc on Canvas[1].

Requirements

Substance (10 pts)

- The literature review section should be no more than 1.5 pages double-spaced.
- The literature review should include these 3 main components (*brief examples below each item in red*):
  1. A **general statement** about how academic literature demonstrates the relationship between the variables

[1]You must share the document by granting editing permissions to anyone with the link, and copy and paste the sharing URL into Canvas

"*Scholars have demonstrated the relationship between social movement activity and policy change.*"

2. Discussion of **one or more academic articles' findings**, as they relate to your variables
   "*For example, Amenta (1989) shows that things like lobbying or maintaining connections to politicians had a positive effect on the passage of Old-Age policy in the United States. In addition, other work points to protest as being a more effective mobilizer of policy change (Piven and Cloward 1977; McAdam and Su 2002). McAdam and Su (2002) show that disruptive protest increased politicians attention to anti-war issues, which led to more Congressional anti-war legislation.*"

3. A **summary statement** that synthesizes the literature and relates to your research question
   "*This work demonstrates that not only do movement tactics influence policy change, but when those tactics are disruptive, they are more likely to lead policy changes that are beneficial to the movement and its constituents. For these reasons, I believe that college student protest operates in a similar way for educational policy.*"

Format & Clarity (5 pts)

- 12-point font
- 1-inch margins on all sides
- First and Last Name on the first line of the header
- "Literature Review" as the title, centered as the second line of your header or the first line of the paper
- Ensure that you're citations follow either ASA or APA format
- Clear grammar, punctuation, and flow of your writing

Grading

You will be graded on 1) the clarity and format of your writing (including the title, name, font, margins, grammar, flow, etc), as well as 2) the presence and clarity of the 3 main components listed above.

Example 1

In order to better understand why some museums are more proactive than others in regards to the process of repatriating Native American artifacts, I focus on how variation in museum mission statement language leads to variation in repatriation compliance. To first situate this hypothesis, one must consider the role of the mission statement in public agencies. Stoffle and Evans (1994) find that positive or negative outcomes in regards to repatriation are largely affected by whether museums choose to value an artifacts scientific importance or choose to emphasize their social and religious cultural values. As Weiss and Piderit (1999) demonstrate, mission statements are fruitful for determining the values of an organization. Weiss and Piderit (1999) analyzed the content and rhetorical style of mission statements from over three hundred public schools and concluded that mission statements provide opportunity for positive academic performance but is essentially an expression of the will of the upper-level managers of the organization. In addition, compliance may also have positive consequences for organizations.

Bradley (2018) finds that adherence and deliberate attention to NAGPRA repatriation requests can be used to elevate the credibility of a museum. Perezts and Picard (2015) illustrate the importance of managers' ethics when dealing with issues of compliance. Wright, Moynihan, and Pandey (2011) find that transformational leadership as an organizational principle influences mission valence - the reach and role of the organization's mission in attracting employees to the organization. This leaves us with the question: is the mission statement a more reliable indicator or positive repatriation requests or is it the discretion of the upper management? Measuring the 'performance' of museums under the Native America Graves Protection and Repatriation Act of 1990 (NAGPRA) stipulations by investigating their mission statements could provide insight as to how to understand the role of the mission statement in the reasoning behind an organization's cooperation, ambivalence, or recalcitrance toward repatriation.

Example 2

Scholars have demonstrated a relationship between academic and vocational correctional education programs, and reduced recidivism rates as well as increased employment opportunities. Recidivism includes, but is not limited to, reoffending, rearrests, reconviction, parole violation, and/or reincarceration. Here, I define recidivism as reincarceration. Correctional education refers to a variety of educational programs for incarcerated individuals, including but not limited to, Adult Basic Education (ABE) which offers basic skills training in math, reading, and writing, Vocational Education to help train or prepare individuals for general positions of employment or skills specific for employment in certain industries, Post-Secondary Correctional Education (PSCE) encompassing advanced college coursework, and even Arts-In-Corrections programs which include writing poetry, drawing, painting, and more.

Researchers at RAND Corporation found that inmates who participated in programs had 43 percent lower odds of recidivating and 13 percent higher odds in obtaining employment upon release than their counterparts (Davis, Lois, et al., 2013). One study found that correctional education participants had a 21 percent re-incarceration rate whereas non-participants had a 31 percent re-incarceration rate, and participants had significantly higher wages than non-participants (Steurer & Smith, 2003). Researchers found that participants in a postsecondary correctional education program were more likely to be employed upon release, and less likely to recidivate (Armstrong, et al., 2012). Additionally, WSD participants earned higher wages per quarter upon release than those who did not complete the vocational training program (Armstrong, et al., 2012).

The work demonstrates that employment upon release is a key component in the successful reintegration of offenders and that participation in these programs is key for lowering recidivism. By providing educational access to inmates, taxpayer dollars are saved, and recidivism rates are reduced (Davis, Lois, et al. 2013). The need for education amongst this population is transparent and correctional educational programs are important contributors in reducing recidivism.

(Long) Example 3

Whyte (1980) argued that the social life of public spaces such as parks can contribute to the quality of life of individuals and society. A study of park perception, by the National Recreation and Park Association (2015), confirms that American's find parks provide social as well as physical and mental health benefits. These sources demonstrate the need for quality public parks and park visitation in our cities. Yet, research has illustrated that parks are not used simply because they are available. A review of the literature of park use indicates that park characteristics such as crime, proximity, size, maintenance, as well as programming and outreach relate to park use (Baran et al. 2014; Banda et al, 2014; Cohen, Han, Derose et al, 2012; Loukaitou-sideris & Sideris, 2009).

Though much research has identified relationships between urban design, playgrounds, acreage and park use, evidence on the relationship between public restroom accessibility and park visitation is severely limited, especially in the United States. This research gap can be explained by the competing demands of the growing field of urban planning as well as our social taboos around bodily waste that prevent us from productively engaging on the topic in the country (Neuman and Smith, 2013; Greed, 2003; Kira, 1977). Anthony and Dufresne's (2007) research also suggests that the topic is understudied because representation of women, older people and people with disabilities in urban planning and architecture is inadequate. These representation issues allow inequities related to the needs of these special populations to persist. Greed (2003), Anthony, and Dufresne (2007) agree that the unavailability of public restrooms is a significant gender inequity because adult women not only have more biological needs or social expectations to use the restroom more than men, they are also more likely to be caregivers for children or older adults who have more biological needs as well.

Moreover, restroom scholars suggest that the number of toilets in public spaces control visitation and the amount of time that people can stay at a site, especially for young and adult women, children, individuals with disabilities, and older adults (Kitchin and Law, 2001; Greed, 2003; I'DGO, 2007). Studies conducted in Greater Manchester, Brecon and London found that good facilities, including the existence of toilets predicted the amount of time participants spent outdoors, either walking or pursuing other activities, such as gardening (I'DGO, 2007). Researchers in England have also concluded that public toilets are a missing link to increasing transit ridership there (Bichard, Hanson, & Greed, 2013). Scholars also agree that sanitary conditions and signage relate to the usage of a restroom and its associated public space, such as a park (Anthony and Dufresne, 2007; Ramster, Bichard, 2011). Issues regarding homelessness and street feces have renewed interest on the topic of public restroom availability (Los Angeles Central Providers Collaborative & Skid Row Community Residents and Partners, 2017; Smith, 2019). A San Francisco Pit Stop Restroom Program is successfully using paid attendants to monitor restrooms on city sidewalks. Though, numbers regarding usage of the associated public space were not gathered before and after pit stop implementation, the research suggests that its additions improved the neighborhoods by reducing feces from the street and making it a more enjoyable place to visit and spend longer periods of time (San Francisco Public Works, n.d),. The San Francisco program has become a national model for other cities such as Miami, Denver and Sacramento, Los Angeles (San Francisco Public Works, 2018).

In contrast, Mitchell's (2003) research on social justice and pubic space analyzes how increasing public restrooms access in parks could also trigger "broken window syndrome" for park users. Amenities that can be accessed by people experiencing homelessness such as park restrooms or benches have proven contentious local planning implementation activities because communities perceive that people experiencing homelessness will cause them "harm" or safety concerns. His research suggests that restroom availability that allows people experiencing homelessness to enter a park for restroom access may decrease parks users or the length of their stay due to perceived safety threats or comfortability.

(Longer) Example 4

As discussed above, this paper will examine the relationship between parking availability, as it relates to transit-oriented development (TOD), and public transit ridership. It will examine the extent to which parking supply in TOD undermines increasing public transit patronage through residential self-selection. To better understand the relationship between the two variables, it is important to review existing research on the concepts.

The literature on TOD focuses on its impact on ridership. As Chatman (2006) notes, the concentration of high-density, mixed-use development within a quarter-mile or half-mile of rail stops or bus transit centers is generally viewed as an effective mechanism to reduce auto use and increase the use of alternative modes of transportation, such as public transportation (p. i). The importance of proximity is expanded upon by Cervero (2007) who argues that "those with a predisposition for transit-oriented living. . . conscientiously [sic] sort themselves into housing within an easy walk of a rail stop" and that "high ridership is a manifestation of this lifestyle preference" (p. 2067). Kolko (2011), however, argues that commercial TOD and workplace proximity are more important because "employment density is more strongly associated with transit ridership than residential density is" (p. 2).

The ability of TOD to spur ridership, however, is not firmly established. Chatman (2006), for example, casts doubt on the efficacy of TOD given the convenience and near-universal access to destinations of automobiles in the United States (p. i). The relationship is further "complicated by other related variables such as growth of household income, vehicle availability, and the availability of free parking" (Mallet, 2018, p. 9). Consideration of the myriad components that affect ridership is critical in the development of effective public policy regarding TOD and transit ridership.

As mentioned before, the availability of parking contributes to the success or failure of TOD. Critical to a successful TOD strategy is the integration of a well-articulated parking policy. As Wilson (2005) argues, "Parking policy. . . shapes travel behavior, community design, and development economics; it can improve the performance of both rail transit and TOD" (p. 79). However, given the suburban bias of conventional parking standards, the application of conventional parking ratios to TOD projects undermines "the expected community benefits of TOD and could even cause the TOD initiative to fail" by generating a parking surplus (Zhang, 2012, p. 1). As Cervero (2007) suggests, "the prevalence of free parking and the absence of good sidewalk connections" makes the term "transit adjacent development (TAD)" a more apt descriptor for many transit-oriented developments in the United States (p. 2069). However, Wilson (2005) notes "the correlation between parking supply (spaces per unit) and the journey-to-work transit share is... not statistically significant" (p. 81). Like the relationship between the general TOD concept and ridership, the parking-ridership nexus is also not firmly established.

The relationship between parking availability and transit ridership is further complicated by cities with diffused employment and residential centers. As Haahs & Zullo (2009) point out, the tension between commuter parking and TOD objectives magnifies the parking challenge. The need to consider and potentially incorporate commuter parking into TOD projects can magnify the challenge as "commuter parking often needs to be replaced or even expanded to ensure that local and area residents have access to the transit system" (p. 66). Tumlin & Millard-Ball (2006) summarize the persistent need for commuter parking by noting that park-and-ride facilities provide access for transit riders who are not within walking distance or well-served by feeder bus service (p. 2).

Basic parking strategies to support successful TODs include: (1) reduce parking requirements and establish parking maximums over time near transit stations, (2) Minimize large surface parking lots for private development, (3) encourage shared parking facilities, (4) build in transit demand management (TDM) strategies to complement parking and transit programs, (5) promote "unbundling" of parking, (6) promote car-sharing programs, (7) tie parking to overall district management, (8) effectively manage on-street parking (including implementation of paid parking if it does not already exist), (9) provide effective parking and transportation information and wayfinding (Kimley-Horn, 2016), and (10) provide high quality bicycle and pedestrian infrastructure to reduce the need for parking.