

Theravāda Collection on Monastic Law

Bhikkhu Brahmali

THE RAVĀDA COLLECTION ON MONASTIC LAW

A translation of the Pali Vinaya Piṭaka into English



translated and introduced by

BHIKKHU BRAHMALI

VOLUME 1

Bu Vb

ANALYSIS OF RULES FOR MONKS (1)

BHIKKHU VIBHAṄGA

❁ SUTTACENTRAL

Theravāda Collection on Monastic Law is a translation of the Theravāda Vinayaṭṭaka by Bhikkhu Brahmali.

Creative Commons Zero (CC0)

To the extent possible under law, Bhikkhu Brahmali has waived all copyright and related or neighboring rights to *Theravāda Collection on Monastic Law*.

This work is published from Australia.

This translation is an expression of an ancient spiritual text that has been passed down by the Buddhist tradition for the benefit of all sentient beings. It is dedicated to the public domain via Creative Commons Zero (CC0). You are encouraged to copy, reproduce, adapt, alter, or otherwise make use of this translation. The translator respectfully requests that any use be in accordance with the values and principles of the Buddhist community.

Web publication date 2021

This edition 2023-12-11 01:26:03

Publication type paperback

Edition ed5

Number of volumes 6

Publication ISBN 978-1-76132-017-0

Volume ISBN 978-1-76132-018-7

Publication URL <https://suttacentral.net/editions/pli-tv-vi/en/brahmali>

Source URL <https://github.com/suttacentral/bilara-data/tree/published/translation/en/brahmali/vinaya>

Publication number scpub8

Map of Jambudipa is by Jonas David Mitja Lang, and is released by him under Creative Commons Zero (CC0).

Published by SuttaCentral

*SuttaCentral,
c/o Alwis & Alwis Pty Ltd
Kaurana Country,
Suite 12,
198 Greenhill Road,
Eastwood,
SA 5063,
Australia*

Contents

Publisher's Foreword	vii
Preface to Vinaya	ix
The Monastic Law: how monastic communities should live	xii

ANALYSIS OF RULES FOR MONKS (1)

Expulsion

Bu Pj 1	The first training rule on expulsion (<i>Methunadhamma</i>)	3
Bu Pj 2	The second training rule on expulsion (<i>Adinnādāna</i>)	51
Bu Pj 3	The third training rule on expulsion (<i>Manussaviggaha</i>)	93
Bu Pj 4	The fourth training rule on expulsion (<i>Uttarimanussadhamma</i>)	121

Suspension

Bu Ss 1	The training rule on emission of semen (<i>Sukkavisatṭhi</i>)	168
Bu Ss 2	The training rule on physical contact (<i>Kāyasamsagga</i>)	194
Bu Ss 3	The training rule on indecent speech (<i>Duṭṭhullavācā</i>)	213

Bu Ss 4	The training rule on satisfying one's own desires (<i>Attakāmpāricariya</i>)	220
Bu Ss 5	The training rule on matchmaking (<i>Sañcaritta</i>)	226
Bu Ss 6	The training rule on building huts (<i>Kuṭṭikāra</i>)	255
Bu Ss 7	The training rule on building dwellings (<i>Vihārakāra</i>)	278
Bu Ss 8	The training rule on anger (<i>Duṭṭhadosa</i>)	288
Bu Ss 9	The second training rule on anger (<i>Aññabhāgiya</i>)	302
Bu Ss 10	The training rule on schism in the Sangha (<i>Saṅghabheda</i>)	312
Bu Ss 11	The training rule on supporting a schism (<i>Bhedānuvattaka</i>)	318
Bu Ss 12	The training rule on being difficult to correct (<i>Dubbaca</i>)	322
Bu Ss 13	The training rule on corrupters of families (<i>Kuladūsaka</i>)	326
<i>Undetermined</i>		
Bu Ay 1	The first undetermined training rule (<i>Paṭhamaaniyata</i>)	336
Bu Ay 2	The second undetermined training rule (<i>Dutiyaaniyata</i>)	341
Colophon		346

Publisher's Foreword

Bhikkhu Sujato, 25 October 2023

Ajahn Brahmā's translation of the Pali Vinaya Piṭaka is the culmination of work that began in 2013 as a revision of the standard translation by I.B. Horner for the Pali Text Society. As these things go, he rapidly found that more revisions were required, and the project became a new translation independent of Horner's.

I have been honored to support Ven. Brahmāli through this process as I was meanwhile developing my Sutta translations. We have discussed points of translation on many occasions, but the reader should be aware that this is a distinct work of his. We have not attempted to make the translations consistent, as there are only a few passages that directly overlap. I have, however, adopted Brahmāli's renderings for most Vinaya terms on the few occasions they appear in the Suttas.

Details aside, one of the great advantages Brahmāli brings to his work is the wisdom of experience. He has lived and practiced for many years in a community that lives by the Vinaya. This brings a whole wealth of perspective and clarity to his work, as issues that are debated theoretically in academic circles are a part of daily life in a community. Through this whole process, he has been deeply contemplating the meaning of the Pali text and its expression in English, creating a living document that speaks to both letter and spirit.

Since 2005 SuttaCentral has provided access to the texts, translations, and parallels of early Buddhist texts. In 2018 we started

creating and publishing our translations of these seminal spiritual classics. The “Editions” series now makes selected translations available as books in various forms, including print, PDF, and EPUB.

Editions are selected from our most complete, well-crafted, and reliable translations. They aim to bring these texts to a wider audience in forms that reward mindful reading. Care is taken with every detail of the production, and we aim to meet or exceed professional best standards in every way. These are the core scriptures underlying the entire Buddhist tradition, and we believe that they deserve to be preserved and made available in the highest quality without compromise.

SuttaCentral is a charitable organization. Our work is accomplished by volunteers and through the generosity of our donors. Everything we create is offered to all of humanity free of any copyright or licensing restrictions.

Preface to Vinaya

Ajahn Brahmali, 25 October 2023

Voila! Welcome to the first absolutely complete translation into English of the Vinaya Piṭaka, the Monastic Law! It has been over ten years in the making, with the actual beginnings of the process no more than a hazy memory. When I started out, I had no clear sense that this would ever get published, and so it is especially satisfying to have reached this point.

The purpose of this translation has been to produce an accurate, clear, and accessible rendering of the Monastic Law into English. I have tried, throughout, to have the true users of the Vinaya in mind, that is, the monastics who live their lives according to these scriptures. To this end, I have attempted to make the text both meaningful and easy to read, with the objective of producing an easy-to-use guide that can readily be applied to one's monastic life. I have endeavored to find a balance between formality and natural spoken language. My aim has been to give the reader a sense that the most important parts of the Vinaya consists of real teachings, often spoken by the Buddha himself.

A secondary purpose has been to improve on I. B. Horner's incomplete and at times inaccurate translation. Despite her admirable and careful work as a pioneer, Horner's translation suffers from a number of shortcomings. Especially problematic is her failure to translate the more risqué parts of the Vinaya, of which there are quite a few. It so happens, unfortunately, that these parts can be of critical importance to a monastic trying to understand

the details of their training rules. Further, Horner's translation is often inaccurate, and occasionally outright wrong. At times it is impossible to understand her renderings, giving the impression that she did not properly grasp the meaning of the underlying Pali. I have tried to avoid such issues by always translating clearly, even in case where the meaning was in doubt. In my view, it is better to translate meaningfully, even if sometimes wrongly, than to leave the reader bewildered. At least a text with a clear meaning can be duly criticized.

This first edition is complete as far as the translation is concerned, but it is still lacking in detailed introductions, indices, and other aids to the reader. The footnotes regularly refer to an Appendix of Technical Terms, which unfortunately is not ready for this edition. All this ancillary material will be added over the course of the next year or two, when I will also add a proper acknowledgments page. For now, I will just say that I have been the recipient of much kindness and generosity from many people, without whose help this work might never have got published. A special thanks is nevertheless due to Ajahn Brahm who has taught me Vinaya over several decades, continuing into the present day! His pragmatic approach to the Vinaya, combined with his clarity on details and his ability to see the big picture, is in a class of its own. More immediately, I have received careful and indefatigable help from Tracy Lau, now an Anagarika at Dhammasara Monastery. It is a great blessing to have such dedicated and intelligent support. Last but not least, I need to mention my good friend and sometimes mentor, Bhante Sujato, who is ultimately responsible for this whole project. It is truly astonishing what he has been able to achieve as an extended result of his work on SuttaCentral.

The Vinaya Piṭaka is a specialist's corner of the Pali Canonical texts, and the readership will inevitably be limited. In fact, the Vinaya is really a kind of support literature, with the suttas being at the core of the Buddhist tradition. Never mind, I shall rest con-

tent with the tiniest of readership. At least one person has already benefitted. May you enjoy it too!

The Monastic Law: how monastic communities should live

Bhikkhu Brahmali

The Vinaya Piṭaka, “The Basket of Monastic Law,” contains the rules that are binding on monastics and the regulations that apply to monastic communities. The Monastic Law is available in more recensions than any other part of the Tipiṭaka. There is a full version in Pali, and four complete versions extant in Chinese translation, all belonging to different schools of early Buddhism: Mahāsāṅghika, Dharmaguptaka, Mahīśāsaka, and Sarvāstivāda. The Chinese Tipiṭaka also preserves other Vinaya related texts, such as an independent *bhikkhu pātimokkha* of the Kāśyapīya School and several more or less school-specific Vinaya texts. The Vinaya of the Mūlasarvāstivāda school exists in three versions: a complete text in Tibetan translation, a mostly complete version in Chinese, and substantial portions in Sanskrit. There are also several Vinaya texts, as well as a large number of fragments, in Sanskrit and other Indic languages, mostly of Mahāsāṅghika, Sarvāstivāda, and Mūlasarvāstivāda provenance.

Origin

The word *vinaya*, here translated as “Monastic Law,” originally probably meant “training,” as can be seen from its usage in the Sutta Piṭaka, “the Basket of Discourses.” In this sense it complements the Dhamma, the doctrine or teaching, which provides the instructions on how the training is to be achieved. The compound *dhamma-vinaya* is a common one in the earliest literature and might be rendered as “theory and practice.” Gradually the meaning shifted to refer to the rules of conduct instead, thus referring to the training in a narrower sense. Although the former usage is more common in the *suttas*, it is this latter usage of *vinaya* which has become the dominant one and which has prevailed to the present day.

The Monastic Law developed over a period of several centuries after the Buddha’s passing away. Yet given the close agreement on some of the most fundamental aspects of the Vinaya across all surviving scriptures, it seems likely that the earliest parts originated in the lifetime of the Buddha. This includes the rules of conduct binding on all monastics, known as the *pātimokkha*, and several of the most important procedures that regulate the proper functioning of the monastic communities. It is only these parts of the Vinaya that are part of the Early Buddhist Texts in the strictest sense.

Around this kernel the Vinaya gradually expanded. Over time, the *pātimokkha* rules gained a canonical commentary that included origin stories, word analyses, detailed permutation series on the applicability of the rules, non-offense clauses, and case studies. For the rest of the Vinaya, known as the *Khandhakas*, the expansion was less structured, with minor rules, stories, and procedures apparently being added as the need arose. It has been shown by Frauwallner (1956) that, despite a significant common core, many of the details of this part of the Vinaya vary between the schools.

The exact cut-of-point after which no new material was added to the Canonical Vinaya is impossible to pin down and it would have varied from school to school. On linguistic grounds, it seems likely that the majority of additions to the Pali Vinaya, with the

exception of the Parivāra, were done prior to its arrival in Sri Lanka in the third century BCE. After this point new material was added to the commentarial literature, which, despite its likely origin in the mainland, was greatly expanded and developed in Sri Lanka.

The Vinaya was not established as part of an overall plan to provide the monastic community with a legal structure, but was laid down rule by rule in response to problems as they arose in the monastic Order. It is the Dhamma, the teaching, that guided the laying down of the Vinaya, and the Vinaya is subsidiary to and bound up with the broader concerns of the proper practice of the Buddhist path. A large number of rules were laid down in response to the lay people's criticism of the monastic Order.

Textual Transmission and the Schools

The number of extant Vinaya texts is quite large and the process of transmission and translation into various Indic languages and especially into Chinese and Tibetan is quite complex. In what follows I give an outline of how the main Vinaya texts were transmitted to China and Tibet.

The first split in the monastic Order occurred between the Mahāsāṅghikas and the Sthaviras, very roughly around 200 BCE. Each of these branches subsequently split into a number of sub-schools. Of the six complete Vinayas still extant, only one belongs to the Mahāsāṅghika group and the remaining five to sub-schools of the Sthaviras. We should therefore expect to find shared qualities between the Vinayas of the Sthavira schools that are lacking in the Mahāsāṅghika Vinaya. Indeed, the Khandhakas of the Mahāsāṅghika Vinaya are structured differently from those of all the other Vinayas.

The sub-schools of the Sthavira branch for which we still have complete Vinayas fall into two sub-groups: the Sarvāstivāda and the Mūlasarvāstivāda on the one hand, and the Dharmaguptaka, the Mahīśāsaka, and the Theravāda on the other. First the Sarvā-

stivādins split from the rest of the Sthaviras. Over time the Mūlasarvāstivāda emerged as a sub-school of the Sarvāstivāda, and for this reason the Vinayas of these two schools share certain characteristics (Frauwallner, 1956: 194). After the Sarvāstivādin split, the remainder of the Sthaviras divided further, including into the Dharmaguptaka, the Mahīśāsaka, and the Theravāda. Yet these three schools were probably no more than regional variations of each other (Sujato, 2012: 102) and consequently their Vinayas have much in common (Frauwallner, 1956: 181).

Apart from the Theravāda Vinaya, the following are the main Canonical Vinayas still extant:

- A complete Mahāsāṅghika Vinaya, found in the Chinese Tīpīṭaka at T 1425, was translated into Chinese by Faxian and Buddhābhaddra in 416-418 CE. Although its section of Khandhakas is structured differently from that of the other schools, the content appears to largely overlap. Further study is required to clarify the degree of divergence. Substantial parts of this Vinaya has also been preserved in Buddhist Hybrid Sanskrit, including the Mahāvastu, a large work mostly concerned with the biography of the Buddha, as well as the Suttavibhaṅga for the nuns and the monks' *pātimokkha*.
- A complete Sarvāstivāda Vinaya is preserved in Chinese at T 1435, translated by Kumārajīva in 404-409 CE. There are also a number of surviving fragments in Sanskrit.
- A full translation of the Mūlasarvāstivāda Vinaya into Tibetan, found in the Kanjur at D 1-7/P 1030-1036, was completed in first decade of 9th century CE by Jinamitra of Kashmir and various others. There is a version of this Vinaya in Chinese at T 1441-1457, largely translated by Yijing in 703-710 CE. This translation is incomplete and full of gaps (Frauwallner, 1956: 195). In addition to this, approximately 80 percent of the Khandhakas exist in Sanskrit (Clarke, 2015: 75).
- Apart from a few fragments in Sanskrit and Gāndhārī, a full Dharmaguptaka Vinaya is only preserved in Chinese at T 1428,

translated by Buddhayaśas and Zhu Fonian in 410-412 CE. Of all the extant Vinayas, this is the one normally regarded as closest to the Theravāda Vinaya (Clarke, 2015: 69).

- The Mahīśāsaka Vinaya is only extant in Chinese at T 1421, translated by Buddhajīva from Kashmir and others in 423-424 CE from a manuscript brought from Sri Lanka by Faxian. According to Frauwallner (1956: 183-84), this Vinaya is full of gaps. It is closely related to the Dharmaguptaka Vinaya (Frauwallner, 1956: 181).
- Apart from the full Vinayas listed above, there are a variety of Canonical Vinaya texts and fragments in different languages. One significant text is the monks' *pātimokkha* of the Kāśyapiya School, available at T 1460 and translated into Chinese by Gautama Prajñāruci in 543 CE.

Content

The Vinaya Piṭaka is divided into two main parts: the Suttavibhaṅga, “The Analysis of the Rules,” and The Khandhakas, “the Chapters.” The individual schools sometimes have additional texts, such as the Parivāra, “The Compendium,” belonging to the Theravāda tradition, and the Uttaragrantha belonging to the Mūlasarvāstivādins.

Suttavibhaṅga

Suttavibhaṅga means “Analysis of the *sutta*.” *Sutta* here does not refer to the discourses, but rather to the *pātimokkha* rules as a complete set.

The Suttavibhaṅga consists of the *pātimokkha* rules embedded in a commentary that analyses each rule in detail. The Suttavibhaṅga is divided into two parts, the 227 rules for the monks and the 311 rules for the nuns. The majority of rules are the same for the two Orders, but 130 rules are specific to the nuns and 46 specific to the monks. The greater number of rules for the nuns is in large part

due to the subdivision of individual monks' rules into multiple rules for the nuns and to the fact that the nuns have rules in their *pātimokkha* that the monks have in the Khandhakas.

The rules are categorised according to the penalty incurred for breaching them. The heaviest penalty, expulsion from the monastic Order, is incurred only for conduct that is fundamentally opposed to monastic life, such a sexual intercourse or murder. There are 4 such rules for the monks and 8 for the nuns. The second heaviest penalty consists of a period of suspension and probation during which time one is not a full member of the monastic Order. There are 13 such rules for the monks and 17 for the nuns. The vast majority of offenses, however, are cleared simply by confession. These rules are subdivided into a number of categories dependent on factors such as the severity of the breach, the sort of confession that is required, and additional requirements such as relinquishment of wrongly acquired requisites. The last seven rules of the Suttavibhaṅga are principles for resolving "legal" issues. Most of the material connected with these principles is now found in the Khandhakas.

Within the Suttavibhaṅga, each rule is largely self-contained and forms its own subsection. These sections begin with one or more origin stories that relate the incident that led the Buddha to lay down a particular rule. Many of these are no more than brief accounts of a stereotypical monk or nun who is simply stated to have done something inappropriate. A few are elaborate narratives that may include sub-rules or important procedures for the monastic Order, and occasionally even *sutta*-type material or Jātaka-type stories. The majority of origin stories fall somewhere in between these two extremes.

Following the origin story is the actual rule. In a number of cases the original rule is later amended by the Buddha, sometimes several times, before it reaches its final form. The rule is then analysed in detail in a word commentary, in which each significant word of the rule is defined. These definitions range from merely supplying a

synonym to large sections with a detailed exposition. The word commentary is always technical in nature.

After the word commentary, many rules are further analysed as to their applicability given a number of general scenarios. These sections normally take the form of a permutation series in which a certain number of factors are varied in all possible combinations with each other. These sections, too, are highly technical.

Next comes a non-offense clause, which sets out important exemptions for each rule. The non-offense clause is sometimes followed by a set of case studies. These concern specific instances where a monastic acts in such a way that it is not clear-cut whether they have committed an offense. The incident is related and the Buddha then decides on the matter. This section is similar in content to the origin stories. Only the first nine rules of the monks' *pātimokkha* have this section.

Comparative study of the various *pātimokkhas* makes it clear that these texts in large part go back to the pre-sectarian period of Buddhism (Pachow, 2000). As for the rest of the material in the Suttavibhaṅga, academics normally consider this material to be significantly younger than the *pātimokkha* rules (v. Hinüber, 2000: 13f), but it is nevertheless likely that some of it goes back to the earliest period (Pachow, 2000: 14ff). In the absence of more detailed research, it seems prudent to regard the *pātimokkha* as the only part of the Suttavibhaṅga that belongs to the Early Buddhist Texts.

But even this overstates the case, for it is clear that not even all the *pātimokkha* rules belong to the earliest period (Pachow, 2000). This is true of many, perhaps all, of the most minor rules of the monks' *pātimokkha*, the *sekhiyas*, but especially of the rules for the nuns, many of which vary considerably between the different schools, making it likely that they stem from the sectarian period.

Khandhakas

The other main part of the Vinaya, the Khandhakas, is a group of sections that each discuss a major area of monastic law, such as a section on ordination, several sections on allowable requisites, and a number of sections that deal with technical matters. The Theravāda Khandhakas is a set of 22 sections, all of which are matched by equivalent sections in the other existing Vinaya recensions, with the partial exception of the Mahāsāṅghikas. The Khandhakas of the Mahāsāṅghikas, although containing much of the same material as the other Vinaya recensions, are structured differently. There is as yet no scholarly consensus as to why this is the case and what might be the implications for the historical evolution of the Khandhakas.

The Khandhakas lack the close unifying principle found in the Suttavibhaṅga, which, as we have seen, is organised as a commentary and analysis of the *pātimokkha* rules. This makes the Khandhakas less integrated and more diverse than the Suttavibhaṅga.

In place of the rigid structure of the Suttavibhaṅga, the Khandhakas are loosely structured around the life story of the Buddha. After the Buddha's awakening, he set out to teach others about his discovery. As he started to gain a monastic following, the need for rules and procedures gradually arose. This need continued throughout the Buddha's life. It is this process that furnishes the framework for the Khandhakas as a whole.

The "biography" of the Buddha is in fact largely considered part of the Vinaya in all Buddhist schools. (Some schools even include their version of the Mahāparinibbāna Sutta in the Vinaya, rather than among the *suttas*, as with the Theravādins.) The Khandhakas show ordinary interactions of the Buddha with monastics and lay people, and we get a glimpse of the Buddha as real person, not just as the distant teacher and leader of a large religious organisation. We see him walking around the Ganges plain, meeting a variety of people. We see him in close contact with his monastic disciples, criticising their misdeeds, but also praising them when they get it

right. The touching story of the Buddha and Ven. Ānanda cleaning up a monk suffering from dysentery is found in the Khandhakas. This close and almost personal view of the Buddha is one factor that makes the Khandhakas a particularly interesting collection.

One of the main functions of the Khandhakas is to present the procedures by which the monastic Orders conduct their business. These include the ordination procedure and the *uposatha* ceremony, but also a number of other procedures that enable the Orders to function properly. These procedures are governed by precise rules, especially regarding democratic participation and decentralised decision making. They allow for effective and harmonious dispatch of monastic business.

The Khandhakas include a large number of minor rules not found in the *pātimokkha*. These rules are diverse, but can broadly be summarised as prohibiting luxuries and sensual behaviour, both of which are incompatible with the renunciant life.

The Khandhakas also include background stories of some of the Buddha's most well-known lay disciples, such as Anāthapiṇḍika, Visākhā, and Jīvaka. There are also stories about monastic disciples, such as the remarkable story of Pilindavaccha, the inspiring stories of Soṇa Kolivisa and Soṇa Kuṭikaṇṇa, as well as the downfall of Devadatta. Then there are several Jātaka-type stories, some of which are also found in the Jātaka collection. On top of this, each section often has its own origin story, similar to those found in the Suttavibhaṅga. But apart from the origin stories, the Khandhakas lack the detailed exegetical material found in the Suttavibhaṅga.

The third last chapter of the Khandhakas deals with rules and procedures that are specific to the nuns, including their ordination procedure. Unless specifically stated or implied, the rest of Khandhakas are equally valid for both Orders.

The Khandhakas end with a description of the first *saṅgīti*, the first "communal recitation" of the teachings after the Buddha's passing away, as well as the famous Vesālī affair, sometimes known as the Second Council, where the Order with difficulty resolved a

disagreement over issues of Vinaya. The Vesāli affair is said to have happened around one hundred years after the Buddha passed away. It is around this time that sectarian tendencies are starting to form in the monastic Order, and this is roughly the cut-off point for the common heritage of all Buddhists.

Other Texts

The Theravāda tradition includes the Parivāra in its Vinaya Piṭaka. Oskar von Hinüber (2000: 22) suggests it was completed no later than the first century AD. The Parivāra is an analytical summary of the first two parts of the Vinaya. In style and method it is sometimes compared to the Abhidhamma.

Other schools, too, have Vinaya summaries and addenda that may or may not share material with the Parivāra. Because of a lack of research, not much is known about these texts. It seems clear, however, that none of them is part of the Early Buddhist Texts.

Modern Perspectives

Most of the early schools of Buddhism have long since disappeared, but three Vinaya traditions are still alive: the Dharmaguptaka, practiced in East Asia, including China and Korea; the Mūlasarvāstivāda, practiced in Tibet and Mongolia; and the Theravāda, practiced in South and Southeast Asia.

In practice, it is rare for monastics to follow all the stipulations of their chosen Vinaya lineage. For instance, although the use of money is prohibited by the *pātimokkha* rules of all schools, it is nevertheless used by the vast majority of monastics. The extent to which the rules are followed varies enormously, but most monastic do at least follow the most important rules, that is, the rules entailing expulsion and those entailing suspension. A similar situation holds for the procedures that govern the Orders. Sometimes they are practiced to the letter, such as most ordination ceremonies in the Theravāda tradition. At other times the procedures are misin-

terpreted or simply disregarded, such as the procedures for choosing the officials of the Order.

Over the course of Buddhist history, there have been periodic reform movements and irregular attempts at purifying the monastic Order. Typically the Order gradually degenerates until a charismatic leader starts a reform movement aimed at the proper practice of the Buddhist path, including the Vinaya. These reform movements sometimes manifest as “forest traditions,” whereby monastics establish forest monasteries in conformity with the ideals of early Buddhism. Over the last three decades, one controversial and ongoing reform has been the reestablishment of an Order of nuns, *bhikkhunīs*, in the Theravāda tradition.

Commentaries

Another important component of the monastic Vinaya is the vast commentarial literature that has gradually evolved over the centuries and millennia, and continues to do so to the present day. All three of the living Vinaya traditions have such a commentarial literature.

The commentarial literature begins with the *Suttavibhaṅga*, which, although it is now part of the Canon, is an early commentary on the *pātimokkha* rules. Next we have other Canonical commentaries or summaries, such as the *Parivāra* of the Theravādins. Beyond these, we come to the commentaries proper, the *atthakathās*, “The Discussion on Meaning.”

The most important non-canonical commentary on the Theravādin Vinaya Piṭaka is the *Samantapāsādikā*, composed in Sri Lanka by Buddhaghosa in the fifth century CE based on pre-existing commentaries that probably originated in India. There is also another important commentary from this period, the *Kaṅkhāvitaraṇī*, also composed by Buddhaghosa. The next layer of commentaries are the *ṭīkā*s, the sub-commentaries, of which there are over a dozen, including highly specialised literature, such as

handbooks on monastery boundaries (*sīmās*). *Ṭīkās* continue to be composed to the present day. The extent to which the Canonical Vinaya needs to be interpreted in line with this commentarial tradition is typically controversial, and practices vary widely.

To navigate this vast literature, many Theravāda monasteries rely on modern summaries for their practice of the Vinaya. Examples include the Vinayamukha in Thai and Ajahn Ṭhānissaro's The Buddhist Monastic Code in English.

In addition to the above, most Theravāda monasteries follow a number of rules that are more informal in nature. These include rules used to distinguish individual sects (*nikāyas*), such as rules on the style of robes and on the manner of wearing them. Then there are rules that pertain to particular teacher traditions, such as those that often form around especially charismatic and famous teachers. The final set of rules are those laid down at individual monasteries. These regulate the daily schedule and other aspects of monastic life that are monastery specific. Although all these rules are sometimes called Vinaya and therefore assumed to stem from the Vinaya Piṭaka or at least the commentaries, in reality few of them have any Canonical basis.

References and Further Reading

- Clarke, Shayne; *Vinaya Mātrikā – Mother of the Monastic Codes, or just Another Set of Lists?*; Indo-Iranian Journal 47: 77–120, 2004
- Clarke, Shayne; *Vinayas*; in Brill's Encyclopaedia of Buddhism; Leiden, 2015; vol. I, pp. 60-87.
- Frauwallner, Erich; *The Earliest Vinaya and the Beginnings of Buddhist Literature*; Rome, 1956
- v. Hinüber, Oskar; *A Handbook of Pāli Literature*; Walter de Gruyter, Berlin, 2000
- Kabilsingh, Chatsumarn (trans.); *The Bhikkhunī Patimokkha of the Six Schools*; Bangkok, 1991

- Norman, K.R.; *Pāli Literature*; Otto Harrassowitz, Wiesbaden, 1983
- Ñāṇatusita, Bhikkhu; *A Translation and Analysis of the Pātimokkha*; Kandy, 2008
- Pachow, W; *A Comparative Study of the Prātimokṣa*; Motilal Banarsidass, Delhi, 2000
- Sujato, Bhikkhu; *Sects and Sectarianism*; Santipada, 2012
- Sujato, Bhikkhu; *Bhikkhuni Vinaya Studies*; Santipada, 2009

ANALYSIS OF RULES FOR MONKS (1)

Expulsion

The first training rule on expulsion

Methunadhamma

Homage to the Buddha, the Perfected One, the fully Awakened One

At Verañjā: the origin of Monastic Law

At one time the Buddha was staying at Verañjā at the foot of Naleru's Nimba tree with a large Sangha of five hundred monks. A brahmin in Verañjā was told: 1.1.1

“Sir, the ascetic Gotama, the Sakyan, who has gone forth from the Sakyan clan, is staying at Verañjā at the foot of Naleru's Nimba tree with a large sangha of five hundred monks. That good Gotama has a fine reputation: ‘He is a Buddha, perfected and fully awakened, complete in insight and conduct, happy, knower of the world, supreme leader of trainable people, teacher of gods and humans, awakened, a Buddha. With his own insight he has seen this world with its gods, its lords of death, and its supreme beings, this society with its monastics and brahmins, its gods and humans, and he makes it known to others. He has a Teaching that’s good in the beginning, good in the middle, and good in the end. It has a true goal and is well articulated. He sets out a perfectly complete and pure spiritual life.’ It’s good to see such perfected ones.” 1.1.3

That brahmin then went to the Buddha, exchanged pleasantries with him, sat down, and said, 1.2.1

“I’ve heard, good Gotama, that you don’t bow down to old brahmins, stand up for them, or offer them a seat. I’ve now seen that this is indeed the case. This isn’t right.” 1.2.2

“Brahmin, in the world with its gods, lords of death, and supreme beings, in this society with its monastics and brahmins, its gods and humans, I don’t see anyone I should bow down to, rise up for, or offer a seat. If I did, their head would explode.” 1.2.6

“Good Gotama lacks taste.” 1.3.1

- 1.3.2 “There’s a way you could rightly say that I lack taste. For I’ve abandoned the taste for forms, sounds, smells, flavors, and touches. I’ve cut it off at the root, made it like a palm stump, eradicated it, and made it incapable of reappearing in the future. But that’s not what you had in mind.”
- 1.3.5 “Good Gotama has no enjoyment.”
- 1.3.6 “There’s a way you could rightly say that I have no enjoyment. For I’ve abandoned the enjoyment of forms, sounds, smells, flavors, and touches. I’ve cut it off at the root, made it like a palm stump, eradicated it, and made it incapable of reappearing in the future. But that’s not what you had in mind.”
- 1.3.9 “Good Gotama teaches inaction.”
- 1.3.10 “There’s a way you could rightly say that I teach inaction. For I teach the non-doing of misconduct by body, speech, and mind. I teach the non-doing of the various kinds of bad, unwholesome actions. But that’s not what you had in mind.”
- 1.3.14 “Good Gotama is an annihilationist.”
- 1.3.15 “There’s a way you could rightly say that I’m an annihilationist. For I teach the annihilation of sensual desire, ill will, and confusion. I teach the annihilation of the various kinds of bad, unwholesome qualities. But that’s not what you had in mind.”
- 1.3.19 “Good Gotama is disgusting.”¹
- 1.3.20 “There’s a way you could rightly say that I’m disgusting. For I am disgusted by misconduct by body, speech, and mind. I am disgusted by the various kinds of bad, unwholesome qualities. But that’s not what you had in mind.”
- 1.3.24 “Good Gotama is an exterminator.”
- 1.3.25 “There’s a way you could rightly say that I’m an exterminator. For I teach the extermination of sensual desire, ill will, and confusion. I teach the extermination of the various kinds of bad, unwholesome qualities. But that’s not what you had in mind.”

1. The literal meaning is “Good Gotama is disgusted,” but I am taking a bit of literary licence to make it more meaningful and punchy. It may well be that this was implied by the speaker.

“Good Gotama is austere.”

1.3.29

“There’s a way you could rightly say that I’m austere. For I say that bad, unwholesome qualities—misconduct by body, speech, and mind—are to be disciplined. One who has abandoned them, cut them off at the root, made them like a palm stump, eradicated them, and made them incapable of reappearing in the future—such a one I call austere. Now I’ve abandoned the bad, unwholesome qualities that are to be disciplined. I’ve cut them off at the root, made them like a palm stump, eradicated them, and made them incapable of reappearing in the future. But that’s not what you had in mind.”

1.3.30

“Good Gotama is an abortionist.”

1.3.35

“There’s a way you could rightly say that I’m an abortionist. For one who has abandoned any future conception in a womb, any rebirth in a future life, who has cut it off at the root, made it like a palm stump, eradicated it, and made it incapable of reappearing in the future—such a one I call an abortionist. Now I’ve abandoned any future conception in a womb, any rebirth in a future life. I’ve cut it off at the root, made it like a palm stump, eradicated it, and made it incapable of reappearing in the future. But that’s not what you had in mind.”

1.3.36

Suppose, brahmin, there was a hen with eight, ten, or twelve eggs, which she had properly covered, warmed, and incubated. The first chick that hatches safely—after piercing through the eggshell with its claw or its beak—is it to be called the eldest or the youngest?”

1.4.1

“It’s to be called the eldest, for it’s the eldest among them.”

1.4.4

“Just so, in this deluded society, enveloped like an egg, I alone in the world have cracked the shell of delusion and reached the supreme full awakening. I, brahmin, am the world’s eldest and best.

1.4.6

I was firmly energetic and had clarity of mindfulness; my body was tranquil and my mind stilled and unified. Fully secluded from the five senses, secluded from unwholesome mental qualities, I entered and remained in the first absorption, which has movement

1.5.1

of the mind, as well as the joy and bliss of seclusion. Through the stilling of the movement of the mind, I entered and remained in the second absorption, which has internal confidence and unification of mind, as well as the joy and bliss of stillness. Through the fading away of joy, I remained even-minded, mindful, and fully aware, experiencing bliss directly, and I entered and remained in the third absorption of which the noble ones declare: 'You are even-minded, mindful, and abide in bliss.' Through the abandoning of bliss and pain and the earlier ending of joy and aversion, I entered and remained in the fourth absorption, which has neither pain nor bliss, but consists of purity of mindfulness and even-mindedness.

- 1.6.1 Then, with my mind stilled, purified, cleansed, flawless, free from defilements, supple, wieldy, steady, and unshakable, I directed it to the knowledge that consists of recollecting past lives. I recollected many past lives, that is, one birth, two births, three births, four births, five births, ten births, twenty births, thirty births, forty births, fifty births, a hundred births, a thousand births, a hundred thousand births; many eons of world dissolution, many eons of world evolution, and many eons of both dissolution and evolution. And I knew: 'There I had such name, such family, such appearance, such food, such experience of pleasure and pain, and such a lifespan. Passing away from there, I was reborn elsewhere, and there I had such name, such family, such appearance, such food, such experience of pleasure and pain, and such a lifespan. Passing away from there, I was reborn here.' In this way I recollected many past lives with their characteristics and particulars. This was the first true insight, which I attained in the first part of the night. Delusion was dispelled and true insight arose, darkness was dispelled and light arose, as happens to one who is heedful, energetic, and diligent. This, brahmin, was my first breaking out, like a chick from an eggshell.

- 1.7.1 Then, with my mind stilled, purified, cleansed, flawless, free from defilements, supple, wieldy, steady, and unshakable, I directed it to the knowledge of the passing away and arising of beings. With

superhuman and purified clairvoyance, I saw beings passing away and getting reborn, inferior and superior, beautiful and ugly, gone to good destinations and to bad destinations, and I understood how beings pass on according to their actions: ‘These beings who engaged in misconduct by body, speech, and mind, who abused the noble ones, who had wrong views and acted accordingly, at the breaking up of the body after death, have been reborn in a lower realm, a bad destination, a world of misery, hell. But these beings who engaged in good conduct of body, speech, and mind, who did not abuse the noble ones, who held right view and acted accordingly, at the breaking up of the body after death, have been reborn in a good destination, a heaven world.’ In this way, with superhuman and purified clairvoyance, I saw beings passing away and getting reborn, inferior and superior, beautiful and ugly, gone to good destinations and to bad destinations, and I understood how beings pass on according to their actions. This was the second true insight, which I attained in the middle part of the night. Delusion was dispelled and true insight arose, darkness was dispelled and light arose, as happens to one who is heedful, energetic, and diligent. This, brahmin, was my second breaking out, like a chick from an eggshell.

Then, with my mind stilled, purified, cleansed, flawless, free from defilements, supple, wieldy, steady, and unshakable, I directed it to the knowledge of the ending of the corruptions. I knew according to reality: ‘This is suffering;’ ‘This is the origin of suffering;’ ‘This is the end of suffering;’ ‘This is the path leading to the end of suffering.’ I knew according to reality: ‘These are the corruptions;’ ‘This is the origin of the corruptions;’ ‘This is the end of the corruptions;’ ‘This is the path leading to the end of the corruptions.’ When I knew and saw this, my mind was freed from the corruption of sensual desire, from the corruption of desire to exist, from the corruption of views, and from the corruption of delusion. When it was freed, I knew it was freed. I understood that birth had come to an end, the spiritual life had been fulfilled, the job had been done, there was no further

1.8.1

state of existence. This was the third true insight, which I attained in the last part of the night. Delusion was dispelled and true insight arose, darkness was dispelled and light arose, as happens to one who is heedful, energetic, and diligent. This, brahmin, was my third breaking out, like a chick from an eggshell.”

- 1.9.1 That brahmin then said to the Buddha,
- 1.9.2 “Good Gotama is the eldest! Good Gotama is the best! Wonderful, good Gotama, wonderful! Just as one might set upright what’s overturned, or reveal what’s hidden, or show the way to one who’s lost, or bring a lamp into the dark so that one with eyes might see what’s there—just so has the Buddha made the Teaching clear in many ways. Good Gotama, I go for refuge to the Buddha, the Teaching, and the Sangha of monks. Please accept me as a lay follower who’s gone for refuge for life. And please consent to spend the rainy-season residence at Verañjā together with the Sangha of monks.” The Buddha consented by keeping silent, and the brahmin understood. He then got up from his seat, bowed down, circumambulated the Buddha with his right side toward him, and left.
- 2.1.1 At that time Verañjā was short of food and afflicted with hunger, with crops affected by whiteheads and turned to straw. It was not easy to get by on almsfood.² Just then some horse dealers from Uttarāpatha had entered the rainy-season residence at Verañjā with five hundred horses. In the horse pen they prepared portion upon portion of steamed grain for the monks.
- 2.1.4 Then, after robing up in the morning, the monks took their bowls and robes and entered Verañjā for alms. Not getting anything, they went to the horse pen. They then brought back many

2. “Whiteheads” renders *setaṭṭ(h)ikā*, lit. “white bones”. Sp 4.403: *Setaṭṭhikā nāma rogajāṭīti eko pāṇako nālimajjhagataṃ kaṇḍaṃ vijjhati, yena viddhattā nikkhantampi sālisisaṃ khīraṃ gaheṭuṃ na sakkoti*, “The disease called *setaṭṭhikā* means: an insect penetrates the stem, goes to the middle of the stalk, from the penetration of which the rice grains are not able to get sap.” This seems to be a description of so-called “whiteheads”, pale panicles without rice grains, caused by stem borers.

portions of steamed grain to the monastery, where they pounded and ate them. Venerable Ānanda crushed a portion on a stone, took it to the Buddha, and the Buddha ate it.

And the Buddha heard the sound of the mortar. When Buddhas 2.1.6 know what is going on, sometimes they ask and sometimes not. They know the right time to ask and when not to ask. Buddhas ask when it is beneficial, otherwise not, for Buddhas are incapable of doing what is unbeneficial.³ Buddhas question the monks for two reasons: to give a teaching or to lay down a training rule.

And so he said to Ānanda, “Ānanda, what’s this sound of a mor- 2.1.12 tar?” Ānanda told him what was happening.

“Well done, Ānanda. You’re all superior people who have con- 2.1.14 quered the problems of famine. Later generations will despise even meat and rice.”⁴

Then Venerable Mahāmoggallāna went to the Buddha, bowed, 2.2.1 sat down, and said,

“At present, Sir, Verañjā is short of food and afflicted with hunger, 2.2.2 with crops affected by whiteheads and turned to straw. It’s not easy to get by on almsfood. But the undersurface of this great earth abounds with food, tasting just like pure honey. Would it be good, Sir, if I inverted the earth so that the monks may enjoy the nutrition in that ground-fungus?”⁵

3. “Incapable of doing” renders *setughāta*, lit. “destroyed the bridge”. Sp 1.16: *Setu vuccati maggo, maggeneva tādisassa vacanassa ghāto, samucchodoti vuttam hoti*, “The path is called the bridge. What is said is that there is the destruction and cutting off of such speech by the path.” The commentary seems to take *setu*, “bridge”, as a reference to the eightfold path. According to this understanding, the Buddha has cut off access to bad qualities, including bad speech, by fulfilling the eightfold path. I prefer to understand “bridge” as a metaphor for access, that is, the Buddhas no longer have access to what is unbeneficial.

4. I have supplied “the problems of famine” from the commentary to bring out the meaning. Sp 1.16: *Dubbhikkhe dullabhapiṇḍe imāya sallahukavuttitāya iminā ca sallekhena vijitam*.

5. Sp 1.17: *Ettha sādhuṭi āyācanavacanametam*, “Here this *sādhu* is expressing a question.” And the same below. *Pappaṭaka*, according to DN 27, it is a kind of mushroom.

- 2.2.6 “But what will you do, Moggallāna, with the creatures that live there?”
- 2.2.7 “I’ll transform one hand to be like the great earth and make those creatures go there. I’ll then invert the earth with the other hand.”
- 2.2.9 “Let it be, Moggallāna, don’t invert the earth. Those creatures might lose their minds.”
- 2.2.11 “In that case, Sir, would it be good if the whole Sangha of monks could go to Uttarakuru for alms?”
- 2.2.12 “Let it be, Moggallāna, don’t pursue this.”
- 3.1.1 Soon afterwards, while reflecting in private, Venerable Sāriputta thought, “Which Buddhas had a long-lasting spiritual life, and which not?”
- 3.1.4 In the evening, after coming out of seclusion, Sāriputta went to the Buddha, bowed, sat down, and said, “Just now, Sir, while I was reflecting in private, I was wondering which Buddhas had a long-lasting spiritual life, and which not?”
- 3.1.7 “Sāriputta, the spiritual life established by the Buddhas Vipassī, Sikhī, and Vessabhū didn’t last long. But the spiritual life established by the Buddhas Kakusandha, Konāgamana, and Kassapa did.”
- 3.2.1 “And why did the spiritual life established by the former three Buddhas not last long?”
- 3.2.2 “They made no effort to give detailed teachings to their disciples. They gave few discourses in prose or in mixed prose and verse; few expositions, verses, heartfelt exclamations, quotations, birth stories, amazing accounts, and analyses. Nor did they lay down training rules or recite a monastic code. After the disappearance of those Buddhas and the disciples awakened under them, those who were the last disciples—of various names, families, and castes, who had gone forth from various households—allowed that spiritual life to disappear rapidly. It’s like flowers on a wooden plank. If they’re not held together with a string, they’re scattered about, whirled about, and destroyed by the wind. Why? Because they’re

not held together with a string. Just so, after the disappearance of those Buddhas and the disciples awakened under them, those who were the last disciples allowed that spiritual life to disappear rapidly.

Instead they were untiring at instructing their disciples by reading their minds. At one time, Sāriputta, the Buddha Vessabhū, the Perfected and the fully Awakened One, was staying in a certain frightening forest grove. He instructed a sangha of a thousand monks by reading their minds, saying, “Think like this, not like that; pay attention like this, not like that; abandon this and attain that.” When they had been instructed by Buddha Vessabhū, their minds were freed from the corruptions through letting go. But if anyone with sensual desire entered that frightening forest grove, they usually had goosebumps all over. This is why the spiritual life established by those Buddhas did not last long.” 3.2.10

“Why then did the spiritual life established by the latter three Buddhas last long?” 3.3.1

“The Buddhas Kakusandha, Konāgamana, and Kassapa were untiring in giving detailed teachings to their disciples. They gave many discourses in prose and in mixed prose and verse; many expositions, verses, heartfelt exclamations, quotations, birth stories, amazing accounts, and analyses. And they laid down training rules and recited a monastic code. After the disappearance of those Buddhas and the disciples awakened under them, those who were the last disciples—of various names, families, and castes, who had gone forth from various households—made that spiritual life last for a long time. It’s like flowers on a wooden plank. If they’re held together with a string, they’re not scattered about, whirled about, or destroyed by the wind. Why? Because they are held together with a string. Just so, after the disappearance of those Buddhas and the disciples awakened under them, those who were the last disciples made that spiritual life last for a long time. This is why the spiritual life established by those Buddhas lasted long.” 3.3.2

3.4.1 Sāriputta then got up from his seat, arranged his upper robe over one shoulder, raised his joined palms, and said, “This is the time, Venerable Sir, for laying down training rules and reciting a monastic code, so that this spiritual life may last for a long time.”

3.4.4 “Hold on, Sāriputta. The Buddha knows the appropriate time for this. The Teacher doesn’t lay down training rules or recite a monastic code until the causes of corruption appear in the Sangha.

3.4.7 And they don’t appear until the Sangha has attained long standing, great size, an abundance of the best material support, or great learning. When the causes of corruption appear for any of these reasons, then the Teacher lays down training rules for his disciples and recites a monastic code in order to counteract these causes.

3.4.15 Sāriputta, the Sangha of monks is free from cancer and danger, stainless, pure, and established in the essence. Even the least developed of these five hundred monks is a stream-enterer. They will not be reborn in the lower world, but are fixed in destiny and bound for awakening.”

4.1 Then the Buddha said to Ānanda, “Ānanda, it’s the custom for Buddhas not to go wandering the country without taking leave of those who invited them to spend the rainy-season residence. Let’s go to the brahmin of Verañjā and take leave.”

4.3 “Yes, Sir.”

4.4 The Buddha robed up, took his bowl and robe and, with Ānanda as his attendant, went to that brahmin’s house where he sat down on the prepared seat. The brahmin approached the Buddha, bowed, and sat down.

4.6 And the Buddha said, “Brahmin, we’ve completed the rains residence according to your invitation, and now we take leave of you. We wish to depart to wander the country.”

4.8 “It’s true, good Gotama, that you’ve completed the rains residence according to my invitation, but I haven’t given anything. That’s not good. It’s not because I didn’t want to, but because household life is so busy. Would you and the Sangha of monks please accept a meal from me tomorrow?”

The Buddha consented by keeping silent. Then, after instruct- 4.12
ing, inspiring, and gladdening that brahmin with a teaching, the
Buddha got up from his seat and left.

The following morning the brahmin prepared various kinds of 4.14
fine foods in his own house and then had the Buddha informed
that the meal was ready.

The Buddha robed up, took his bowl and robe and, together 4.15
with the Sangha of monks, he went to that brahmin's house where
he sat down on the prepared seat. And that brahmin personally
served and satisfied the Sangha of monks headed by the Buddha
with various kinds of fine foods. When the Buddha had finished
his meal, the brahmin gave him a set of three robes and to each
monk two pieces of cloth. The Buddha instructed, inspired, and
gladdened him with a teaching, and then got up from his seat and
left.

After remaining in Verañjā for as long as he liked, the Buddha 4.18
traveled to Payāgapatiṭṭhāna via Soreyya, Saṅkassa, and Kaṇṇa-
kujja. There he crossed the river Ganges and continued on to
Benares.⁶ After remaining at Benares for as long as he liked, he
set out wandering toward Vesālī. When he eventually arrived, he
stayed in the hall with the peaked roof in the Great Wood.

The section for recitation on Verañjā is finished.

6. Regarding these names, Ven. Shravasti Dhammika of Australia tells me (private communication) the following about the geographical situation of these places: "Verañjā is probably the huge mound at Atranji Khera, about 13 km. north of Etah in Uttar Pradesh; Soreyya is possibly Soron, directly south of Verañjā; Saṅkassa is the modern Sankisa; Kaṇṇakujja is the modern Kannauj; and Payāgapatiṭṭhāna is, as Horner correctly says, Allahabad, recently renamed Prayag, its original name. Except for the uncertain Soreyya, all these places are on a roughly west/east alignment, undoubtedly following the ancient Madhura to Payāga road." In a subsequent email he clarified that Soron is actually north of Atranji Khera or Verañjā. Following the modern road network, the total distance from Atranji Khera to Vaishali (Vesālī), according to Google maps, is in excess of 900 kilometers.

1. The first training rule on expulsion

First sub-story: the section for recitation on Sudinna

- 5.1.1 At that time Sudinna, the son of a wealthy merchant, lived in a village called Kalanda not far from Vesālī. On one occasion Sudinna went to Vesālī on some business together with a number of friends. Just then the Buddha was seated giving a teaching, surrounded by a large gathering of people. When Sudinna saw this, he thought, “Why don’t I listen to the Teaching?” He then approached that gathering and sat down.
- 5.1.6 As he was sitting there, he thought, “The way I understand the Buddha’s Teaching, it’s not easy for one who lives at home to lead the spiritual life perfectly complete and pure as a polished conch shell. Why don’t I cut off my hair and beard, put on the ocher robes, and go forth into homelessness?”
- 5.1.9 When those people had been instructed, inspired, and gladdened by the Buddha, they got up from their seats, bowed down, circumambulated him with their right sides toward him, and left.
- 5.1.10 Sudinna then approached the Buddha, bowed, sat down, and told him what he had thought, adding,
- 5.1.11 “Sir, please give me the going forth.”
- 5.1.14 “But, Sudinna, do you have your parents’ permission?”
- 5.1.15 “No.”
- 5.1.16 “Buddhas don’t give the going forth to anyone who hasn’t gotten their parents’ permission.”
- 5.1.17 “I’ll do whatever is necessary, Sir, to get my parents’ permission.”
- 5.2.1 After finishing his business in Vesālī, Sudinna returned to Kalanda. He then went to his parents and said, “Mom and dad, the way I understand the Buddha’s Teaching, it’s not easy for one who lives at home to lead the spiritual life perfectly complete and pure. I want to cut off my hair and beard, put on the ocher robes, and go forth into homelessness. Please give me permission to go forth.”
- 5.2.5 “But, Sudinna, you’re our only child, and we love you dearly. You live in comfort and we care for you. You don’t have any suffering.

Even if you died we wouldn't want to lose you. So how can we allow you to go forth into homelessness while you're still living?"

Sudinna asked his parents a second and a third time, but got the same reply. 5.2.9

He then lay down on the bare ground and said, "I'll either die right here or go forth!" And he did not eat at the next seven meals. 5.2.27

His parents repeated what they had said, adding, "Get up, Sudinna, eat, drink, and enjoy yourself! Enjoy the pleasures of the world and do acts of merit. We won't allow you to go forth." But Sudinna did not respond. 5.2.31

His parents said the same thing a second and a third time, but Sudinna remained silent. 5.2.39

Then Sudinna's friends went to him and repeated three times what his parents had said. When Sudinna still did not respond, 5.3.1

Sudinna's friends went to his parents and said, "Sudinna says he'll either die right there on the bare ground or go forth. If you don't allow him to go forth, he'll die there. But if you allow him to go forth, you'll see him again afterwards. And if he doesn't enjoy the going forth, what alternative will he have but to come back here? So please allow him to go forth." 5.4.1

"Alright, then." 5.4.8

And Sudinna's friends said to him, "Get up, Sudinna, your parents have given you permission to go forth." 5.4.9

When Sudinna heard this, he was excited and joyful, stroking his limbs with his hands as he got up. After spending a few days to regain his strength, he went to the Buddha, bowed, sat down, and said, "Sir, I've gotten my parents' permission to go forth. Please give me the going forth." 5.4.11

He then received the going forth and the full ordination in the presence of the Buddha. Not long afterwards he practiced these kinds of ascetic practices: he stayed in the wilderness, ate only alms-food, was a rag-robe wearer, and went on continuous almsround. And he lived supported by a certain Vajjian village. 5.4.15

5.5.1 Soon afterwards, the Vajjians were short of food and afflicted with hunger, with crops affected by whiteheads and turned to straw. It was not easy to get by on almsfood. Sudinna considered this and thought, “I have many wealthy relatives in Vesālī. Why don’t I get them to support me? My relatives will be able to make offerings and merit, the monks will get material support, and I’ll have no trouble getting almsfood.”

5.5.6 He then put his dwelling in order, took his bowl and robe, and set out for Vesālī. When he eventually arrived, he stayed in the hall with the peaked roof in the Great Wood. His relatives heard that he had arrived in Vesālī, and they presented him with an offering of sixty servings of food. Sudinna gave the sixty servings to the monks. He then took his bowl and robe and went to the village of Kalanda for alms. As he was going on continuous almsround, he came to his own father’s house.

5.6.1 Just then a female slave of Sudinna’s relatives was about to throw away the previous evening’s porridge. Sudinna said to her, “If that’s to be thrown away, sister, put it here in my almsbowl.”

5.6.4 As she was putting the porridge into his bowl, she recognized his hands, feet, and voice. She then went to his mother and said, “Please be aware, madam, that master Sudinna is back.”

5.6.8 “Gosh, if you’re telling the truth, you’re a free woman!”

5.6.9 As Sudinna was eating the previous evening’s porridge at the base of a certain wall, his father was coming home from work. When he saw him sitting there, he went up to him and said, “But, Sudinna, isn’t there ... What! You’re eating old porridge!⁷ Why don’t you go to your own house?”

5.6.14 “We went to your house, householder. That’s where we received this porridge.”

7. Sp 1.32: *Idaṇhi vuttam hoti – “atthi nu kho, tāta sudinna, amhākaṃ dhanam, na mayam niddhanāti”*; “For this is said: ‘Isn’t there, dear Sudinna, our wealth? We are not poor.’” The point, perhaps, is that the father meant to say much more, but was interrupted at the shock of seeing his son eating old porridge.

Sudinna's father took him by the arm and said, "Come, let's go home." 5.6.16

Sudinna went to his father's house and sat down on the prepared seat. His father said to him, "Please eat, Sudinna." 5.6.17

"There's no need. I'm done for today." 5.6.19

"Then come back for the meal tomorrow." 5.6.20

Sudinna consented by keeping silent, and he got up from his seat and left. 5.6.21

The next morning Sudinna's mother had the floor smeared with fresh cow-dung. She then piled up two heaps, one with money and one with gold.⁸ The heaps were so large that a man standing on one side could not see a man standing on the other. She hid the heaps behind screens, prepared a seat between them, and surrounded it all with a curtain. And she said to Sudinna's ex-wife, "Now please adorn yourself in the way our son Sudinna found you especially attractive." 5.6.22

"Yes, madam." 5.6.26

Then, after robing up, Venerable Sudinna took his bowl and robe and went to his father's house where he sat down on the prepared seat. His father went up to him, uncovered the heaps, and said, "This dowry, dear Sudinna, is the fortune from your mother. It's yours. Another is the fortune from your father and another the fortune from your ancestors. Please return to the lower life, enjoy wealth, and make merit." 5.7.1

"I can't, father. I'm enjoying the spiritual life." 5.7.6

Sudinna's father repeated his request and Sudinna replied as before. When Sudinna's father repeated his request a third time, Sudinna said, "If you wouldn't get offended, I could tell you what to do." 5.7.7

"Let's hear it." 5.7.13

"Well then, make some large hempen sacks, put all the money and gold inside, take it all away in carts, and dump it in the middle of the Ganges. And why? Because that way you will avoid the 5.7.14

8. For the rendering of *hirañña* as "money", see Appendix of Technical Terms.

danger, fear, and terror that it will otherwise cause you, as well as the trouble with protecting it.”

5.7.17 His father became upset, thinking, “How can our son Sudinna say such things?”

5.7.18 He then said to Sudinna’s ex-wife, “Well then, since you were so dear to him, perhaps our son Sudinna will listen to you?”

5.7.20 Sudinna’s ex-wife took hold of his feet and said, “What are these nymphs like, sir, for which you practice the spiritual life?”

5.7.22 “Sister, I don’t practice the spiritual life for the sake of nymphs.”

5.7.23 His ex-wife thought, “Sudinna is now calling me ‘sister,’” and she fainted right there.

5.8.1 Sudinna said to his father, “If there’s food to be given, householder, give it, but don’t annoy me.”

5.8.4 “Eat, Sudinna,” he said. And Sudinna’s mother and father personally served and satisfied him with various kinds of fine foods.

5.8.6 When Sudinna had finished his meal, his mother said to him: “Sudinna dear, our family is rich. Please return to the lower life, enjoy wealth, and make merit.”

5.8.10 “Mother, I can’t. I’m enjoying the spiritual life.”

5.8.11 His mother repeated her request a second time, but got the same reply. She then said, “Our family is wealthy, Sudinna. Please give us an offspring, so that the Licchavīs don’t take over our heirless property.”

5.8.16 “Yes, mother, I can do that.”

5.8.17 “But where are you staying?”

5.8.18 “In the Great Wood.” And he got up from his seat and left.

5.9.1 Sudinna’s mother then said to his ex-wife, “Well then, as soon as you reach your fertile period, please tell me.”

5.9.3 “Yes, madam.” Not long afterwards Sudinna’s ex-wife reached her fertile period, and she reported it to Sudinna’s mother.

5.9.6 “Now, please adorn yourself in the way that our son Sudinna found you especially attractive.”

5.9.7 “Yes.”

Then Sudinna's mother, together with his ex-wife, went to Sudinna in the Great Wood, and she said to him: "Our family, dear Sudinna, is rich. Please return to the lower life, enjoy wealth, and make merit." 5.9.8

"Mother, I can't. I'm enjoying the spiritual life." 5.9.12

His mother repeated her request a second time, but got the same reply. She then said this: "Well then, please give us an offspring. We don't want the Licchavis to take over our heirless property." 5.9.14

"Alright, mother." He then took his ex-wife by the arm, disappeared into the Great Wood and—there being no training rule and he seeing no danger—had sexual intercourse with her three times. As a result she conceived. 5.9.19

And the earth gods cried out: "Sirs, the Sangha of monks has been free from cancer and danger. But Sudinna of Kalanda has produced a cancer and endangered it." 5.9.22

Hearing the earth gods, the gods of the four great kings cried out ... the gods of the Thirty-three ... the Yāma gods ... the contented gods ... the gods who delight in creation ... the gods who control the creation of others ... the gods of the realm of the supreme beings cried out: "Sirs, the Sangha of monks has been free from cancer and danger. But Sudinna of Kalanda has produced a cancer and endangered it." Thus in that moment, in that instance, the news spread as far as the world of the supreme beings. 5.9.25

In the meantime, the pregnancy of Sudinna's ex-wife developed, and she eventually gave birth to a son. Sudinna's friends called him Offspring, while calling Sudinna's ex-wife Offspring's mother, and Venerable Sudinna Offspring's father. After some time, they both went forth into homelessness and realized perfection. 5.9.35

But Sudinna was anxious and remorseful, thinking, "This is truly bad for me, that after going forth on such a well-proclaimed spiritual path, I wasn't able to practice the perfectly complete and pure spiritual life to the end." And because of his anxiety and remorse, he became thin, haggard, and pale, with veins protruding all over his 5.10.1

body. He became sad, sluggish, miserable, and depressed, weighed down by remorse.

5.10.5 The monks who were Sudinna's friends said to him: "In the past, Sudinna, you had a good color, a bright face, clear skin, and sharp senses. But look at you now. Could it be that you are dissatisfied with the spiritual life?"

5.10.9 "I am not dissatisfied with the spiritual life, but I've done something bad. I've had sexual intercourse with my ex-wife. I'm anxious and remorseful because I wasn't able to practice the perfectly complete and pure spiritual life to the end."

5.10.14 "No wonder you're anxious, Sudinna, no wonder you have remorse. Hasn't the Buddha given many teachings for the sake of dispassion, not for the sake of lust; for the sake of freedom from bondage, not for the sake of bondage; for the sake of non-grasping, not for the sake of grasping? When the Buddha has taught in this way, how could you choose lust, bondage, and grasping? Hasn't the Buddha given many teachings for the fading away of lust, for the clearing away of intoxication, for the removal of thirst, for the uprooting of attachment, for the cutting off of the round of rebirth, for the stopping of craving, for fading away, for ending, for extinguishment? Hasn't the Buddha in many ways taught the abandoning of sensual pleasures, the full understanding of the perception of sensual pleasures, the removal of thirst for sensual pleasures, the elimination of thoughts of sensual pleasures, the stilling of the fever of sensual pleasures? This will affect people's confidence and cause some to lose it."

5.11.1 After rebuking Sudinna in many ways, they told the Buddha. The Buddha then had the Sangha of monks gathered and questioned Sudinna: "Is it true, Sudinna, that you had sexual intercourse with your ex-wife?"

5.11.4 "It's true, Sir."

5.11.5 The Buddha rebuked him, "Foolish man, it's not suitable, it's not proper, it's not worthy of a monastic, it's not allowable, it's not to be done. How could you go forth on such a well-proclaimed

spiritual path and not be able to practice the perfectly complete and pure spiritual life to the end? Haven't I given many teachings for the sake of dispassion, not for the sake of lust; for the sake of freedom from bondage, not for the sake of bondage; for the sake of non-grasping, not for the sake of grasping? When I have taught in this way, how could you choose lust, bondage, and grasping? Haven't I given many teachings for the fading away of lust, for the clearing away of intoxication, for the removal of thirst, for the uprooting of attachment, for the cutting off of the round of rebirth, for the stopping of craving, for fading away, for ending, for extinguishment? Haven't I in many ways taught the abandoning of sensual pleasures, the full understanding of the perceptions of sensual pleasure, the removal of thirst for sensual pleasure, the elimination of thoughts of sensual pleasure, the stilling of the fevers of sensual pleasure? It would be better, foolish man, for your penis to enter the mouth of a highly venomous snake than to enter a woman. It would be better for your penis to enter the mouth of a black snake than to enter a woman. It would be better for your penis to enter a blazing charcoal pit than to enter a woman. Why is that? For although it might cause death or death-like suffering, it would not cause you to be reborn in a bad destination. But *this* might. Foolish man, you have practiced what is contrary to the true Teaching, the common practice, the low practice, the coarse practice, that which ends with a wash, that which is done in private, that which is done wherever there are couples. You are the forerunner, the first performer of many unwholesome things. This will affect people's confidence, and cause some to lose it."

Then the Buddha spoke in many ways in dispraise of being difficult to support and maintain, in dispraise of great desires, discontent, socializing, and laziness; but he spoke in many ways in praise of being easy to support and maintain, of fewness of wishes, contentment, self-effacement, ascetic practices, serenity, reduction in things, and being energetic. After giving a teaching on what is right and proper, he addressed the monks: 5.11.29

- 5.11.31 “Well then, monks, I will lay down a training rule for the following ten reasons: for the well-being of the Sangha, for the comfort of the Sangha, for the restraint of bad people, for the ease of good monks, for the restraint of the corruptions relating to the present life, for the restraint of the corruptions relating to future lives, to give rise to confidence in those without it, to increase the confidence of those who have it, for the longevity of the true Teaching, and for supporting the training. And, monks, this training rule should be recited like this:

First preliminary ruling

‘If a monk has sexual intercourse, he is expelled and excluded from the community.’”

- 5.11.35 In this way the Buddha laid down this training rule for the monks.

The section for recitation on Sudinna is finished.

Second sub-story: the account of the female monkey

- 6.1 Sometime later, in the Great Wood near Vesālī, a certain monk befriended a female monkey by giving her food. He then had sexual intercourse with her. Soon afterwards, after robing up in the morning, he took his bowl and robe and entered Vesālī for alms.
- 6.3 Just then a number of monks who were walking about the dwellings came to the one belonging to this monk. The female monkey saw those monks coming. She went up to them, shook her buttocks in front of them, wagged her tail, presented her backside, and made a gesture. The monks thought, “This monk must be having sexual intercourse with this monkey,” and they hid to one side. Then, when that monk had finished his almsround in Vesālī and had returned with his almsfood, he ate one part himself and gave the rest to that female monkey. After eating the food, the monkey presented her buttocks to the monk, and he had sexual intercourse with her.

The other monks said to him, “Hasn’t a training rule been laid 6.11
down by the Buddha? Why then do you have sexual intercourse
with a monkey?”

“It’s true that a training rule has been laid down by the Buddha, 6.13
but it concerns women, not animals.”

“But that’s just the same. It’s not suitable, it’s not proper, it’s not 6.14
worthy of a monastic, it’s not allowable, it’s not to be done. How
could you go forth on such a well-proclaimed spiritual path and
not be able to practice the perfectly complete and pure spiritual
life to the end? Hasn’t the Buddha given many teachings for the
sake of dispassion ... the stilling of the fevers of sensual pleasure?
This will affect people’s confidence, and cause some to lose it.”

After rebuking that monk in many ways, they told the Buddha. 6.21

The Buddha then had the Sangha of monks gathered and ques- 6.22
tioned that monk: “Is it true, monk, that you did this?”

“It’s true, Sir.” 6.24

The Buddha rebuked him, “Foolish man, it’s not suitable, it’s 6.25
not proper, it’s not worthy of a monastic, it’s not allowable, it’s not
to be done. How could you go forth on such a well-proclaimed
spiritual path and not be able to practice the perfectly complete
and pure spiritual life to the end? Haven’t I given many teachings
for the sake of dispassion ... for the stilling of the fevers of sensual
desire? It would be better, foolish man, for your penis to enter the
mouth of a highly venomous snake than to enter a female monkey.
It would be better for your penis to enter the mouth of a black snake
than to enter a female monkey. It would be better for your penis to
enter a blazing charcoal pit than to enter a female monkey. Why
is that? For although it might cause death or death-like suffering,
it would not cause you to be reborn in a bad destination. But
this might. Foolish man, you’ve practiced what is contrary to the
true Teaching, the common practice, the low practice, the coarse
practice, that which ends with a wash, that which is done in private,
that which is done wherever there are couples. This will affect
people’s confidence ...” ...

6.39 “And so, monks, this training rule should be recited like this:

Second preliminary ruling

‘If a monk has sexual intercourse, even with a female animal, he is expelled and excluded from the community.’”

6.41 In this way the Buddha laid down this training rule for the monks.

The account of the female monkey is finished.

Third sub-story: the section for recitation on covering

7.1.1 Soon afterwards there were a number of Vajjian monks from Vesālī who ate, slept, and bathed as much as they liked. Then, not reflecting properly and without first renouncing the training and revealing their weakness, they had sexual intercourse. After some time they were affected by loss of relatives, loss of property, and loss of health. They then went to Venerable Ānanda and said,

7.1.4 “Venerable Ānanda, we don’t blame the Buddha, the Teaching, or the Sangha; we only have ourselves to blame. We were unfortunate and had little merit—after going forth on such a well-proclaimed spiritual path, we were unable to practice the perfectly complete and pure spiritual life to the end. If we were now to get the going forth and the full ordination in the presence of the Buddha, we would have clarity about wholesome qualities and be devoted day in and day out to developing the aids to awakening. Venerable Ānanda, please inform the Buddha.”

7.1.10 Saying, “Yes,” he went to the Buddha and told him.

7.1.11 “It’s impossible, Ānanda, that the Buddha should abolish a training rule that entails expulsion because of the Vajjians.”

7.1.12 The Buddha then gave a teaching and addressed the monks:

“Monks, if someone, without first renouncing the training and revealing their weakness, has sexual intercourse, they may not receive the full ordination once again. But, monks, if someone has sexual intercourse after first renouncing the training and

revealing their weakness, they may receive the full ordination once again.

And so, monks, this training rule should be recited like this: 7.1.15

Final ruling

‘If a monk, after taking on the monks’ training and way of life, without first renouncing the training and revealing his weakness, has sexual intercourse, even with a female animal, he is expelled and excluded from the community.’⁹

Definitions

A: whoever, of such a kind, of such activity, of such caste, of such name, of such family, of such conduct, of such behavior, of such association, who is senior, who is junior, or who is of middle standing—this is called “a”.

Monk: he is a monk because he lives on alms; a monk because he has gone over to living on alms; a monk because he wears a patchwork cloth; a monk by convention; a monk on account of his claim; a “come, monk” monk; a monk given the full ordination by taking the three refuges; a good monk; a monk of substance; a trainee monk; a fully trained monk; a monk who has been given the full ordination by a unanimous Sangha through a legal procedure consisting of one motion and three announcements that is irreversible and fit to stand. The monk who has been given the full ordination by a unanimous Sangha through a legal procedure consisting of one motion and three announcements, which is irreversible and fit to stand—this sort of monk is meant in this case.

Training: the three trainings: the training in the higher morality, the training in the higher mind, the training in the higher wis-

9. *Paccakkhāya* from *paccakkhāti* means to “speak against” or “renounce verbally”. To avoid clunkiness, I normally render this as “renounce”, except where the context requires the more complete formulation.

dom. The training in the higher morality is the training meant in this case.

Way of life: whatever training rule has been laid down by the Buddha—this is called “way of life”. One trains in this; therefore it is called “after taking on the way of life”.

Without first renouncing the training and revealing his weak-

8.2.2 **ness:** “There is, monks, a revealing of weakness without the training being renounced; and there is a revealing of weakness together with the training being renounced.

8.2.4 And how is there a revealing of weakness without the training being renounced?

8.2.5 It may be that a monk is dissatisfied, discontent, desiring to give up the monastic life; troubled, ashamed, and disgusted with the monkhood; longing to be a householder, longing to be a lay follower, longing to be a monastery worker, longing to be a novice, longing to be a monastic of another religion, longing to be a lay follower of another religion, longing to be a non-ascetic, longing to be a non-monastic, and he says and declares: ‘Why don’t I renounce the Buddha?’ In this way, monks, there’s a revealing of weakness without the training being renounced.

8.2.17 Or again, dissatisfied, discontent, desiring to give up the monastic life; troubled, ashamed, and disgusted with the monkhood; longing to be a householder ... longing to be a non-monastic, he says and declares: ‘Why don’t I renounce the Teaching?’ ... the Sangha?’ ... the practice?’ ... the training?’ ... the Monastic Code?’ ... the recitation?’ ... my preceptor?’ ... my teacher?’ ... my student?’ ... my pupil?’ ... my co-student?’ ... my co-pupil?’ ... he says and declares: ‘Why don’t I renounce my fellow monastics?’ ...¹⁰ ‘Why don’t I become a householder?’ ... ‘Why don’t I become a lay follower?’ ... ‘Why don’t I become a monastery worker?’ ... ‘Why don’t I become a novice?’ ... ‘Why don’t I become a monastic of another religion?’ ...

10. Here and in the next segment I have added ellipses points at the end. These ellipses points seem to have been omitted by mistake from the Pali.

‘Why don’t I become a lay follower of another religion?’ ...
 ‘Why don’t I become a non-ascetic?’ ... ‘Why don’t I become
 a non-monastic?’ In this way too, monks, there’s a revealing of
 weakness without the training being renounced.

Or again, dissatisfied, discontent, desiring to give up the monas- 8.2.43
 tic life; troubled, ashamed, and disgusted with the monkhood;
 longing to be a householder ... longing to be a non-monastic,
 he says and declares: ‘What if I renounced the Buddha?’ ... he
 says and declares: ‘What if I were a non-monastic?’ ... he says
 and declares: ‘Perhaps I should renounce the Buddha?’ ... he
 says and declares: ‘Perhaps I should be a non-monastic?’ ... he
 says and declares: ‘Well then, I should renounce the Buddha.’
 ... he says and declares: ‘Well then, I should be a non-monastic.’
 ... he says and declares: ‘I think I should renounce the Buddha.’
 ... he says and declares: ‘I think I should be a non-monastic.’ In
 this way too, monks, there’s a revealing of weakness without the
 training being renounced.

Or again, dissatisfied, discontent, desiring to give up the monas- 8.2.56
 tic life; troubled, ashamed, and disgusted with the monkhood;
 longing to be a householder ... longing to be a non-monastic, he
 says and declares: ‘I remember my mother.’ ... ‘I remember my
 father.’ ... ‘I remember my brother.’ ... ‘I remember my sister.’
 ... ‘I remember my son.’ ... ‘I remember my daughter.’ ... ‘I
 remember my wife.’ ... ‘I remember my relations.’ ... ‘I remem-
 ber my friends.’ ... ‘I remember my village.’ ... ‘I remember my
 town.’ ... ‘I remember my fields.’ ... ‘I remember my land.’ ... ‘I
 remember my money.’ ... ‘I remember my gold.’ ... ‘I remember
 my profession.’ ... he says and declares: ‘I remember my for-
 mer laughter, chatter, and play.’ In this way too, monks, there’s a
 revealing of weakness without the training being renounced.

Or again, dissatisfied, discontent, desiring to give up the monas- 8.2.78
 tic life; troubled, ashamed, and disgusted with the monkhood;
 longing to be a householder ... longing to be a non-monastic,
 he says and declares: ‘I have a mother who should be supported

by me.' ... 'I have a father ... 'I have a brother ... 'I have a sister ... 'I have a son ... 'I have a daughter ... 'I have a wife ... 'I have relations ... he says and declares: 'I have friends who should be supported by me.' In this way too, monks, there's a revealing of weakness without the training being renounced.

8.2.92 Or again, dissatisfied, discontent, desiring to give up the monastic life; troubled, ashamed, and disgusted with the monkhood; longing to be a householder ... longing to be a non-monastic, he says and declares: 'I have a mother; she'll support me.' ... 'I have a father; he'll support me.' ... 'I have a brother; he'll support me.' ... 'I have a sister; she'll support me.' ... 'I have a son; he'll support me.' ... 'I have a daughter; she'll support me.' ... 'I have a wife; she'll support me.' ... 'I have relations; they'll support me.' ... 'I have friends; they'll support me.' ... 'I have a village; I'll live by means of it.' ... 'I have a town; I'll live by means of it.' ... 'I have fields; I'll live by means of them.' ... 'I have land; I'll live by means of it.' ... 'I have money; I'll live by means of it.' ... 'I have gold; I'll live by means of it.' ... he says and declares: 'I have a profession; I'll live by means of it.' In this way too, monks, there's a revealing of weakness without the training being renounced.

8.2.113 Or again, dissatisfied, discontent, desiring to give up the monastic life; troubled, ashamed, and disgusted with the monkhood; longing to be a householder ... longing to be a non-monastic, he says and declares: 'This is difficult to do.' ... 'This isn't easy to do.' ... 'This is difficult.' ... 'This isn't easy.' ... 'I can't endure.' ... 'I'm unable.' ... 'I don't enjoy myself.' ... 'I take no delight.' In this way too, monks, there's a revealing of weakness without the training being renounced.

8.3.1 And how is there a revealing of weakness together with the training being renounced?

8.3.2 It may be that a monk is dissatisfied, discontent, desiring to give up the monastic life; troubled, ashamed, and disgusted with the monkhood; longing to be a householder ... longing to be a non-

monastic, and he says and declares: 'I renounce the Buddha.' In this way, monks, there's a revealing of weakness together with the training being renounced.

Or again, dissatisfied, discontent, desiring to give up the monastic life; troubled, ashamed, and disgusted with the monkhood; longing to be a householder ... longing to be a non-monastic, he says and declares: 'I renounce the Teaching.' ... 'I renounce the Sangha.' ... 'I renounce the practice.' ... 'I renounce the training.' ... 'I renounce the Monastic Code.' ... 'I renounce the recitation.' ... 'I renounce my preceptor.' ... 'I renounce my teacher.' ... 'I renounce my student.' ... 'I renounce my pupil.' ... 'I renounce my co-student.' ... 'I renounce my co-pupil.' ... 'I renounce my fellow monastics.' ... 'Consider me a householder.' ... 'Consider me a lay follower.' ... 'Consider me a monastery worker.' ... 'Consider me a novice monk.' ... 'Consider me a monastic of another religion.' ... 'Consider me a lay follower of another religion.' ... 'Consider me a non-ascetic.' ... 'Consider me a non-monastic.' In this way too, monks, there's a revealing of weakness together with the training being renounced.

Or again, dissatisfied, discontent, desiring to give up the monastic life; troubled, ashamed, and disgusted with the monkhood; longing to be a householder ... longing to be a non-monastic, he says and declares: 'I'm done with the Buddha.' ... 'I'm done with my fellow monastics.' In this way too, monks, there's a revealing of weakness together with the training being renounced.

Or again ... he says and declares: 'No more of the Buddha for me.' ... 'No more of my fellow monastics for me.' ...

'The Buddha is of no use to me.' ... 'My fellow monastics are of no use to me.'

'I'm well freed from the Buddha.' ... 'I'm well freed from my fellow monastics.' In this way too, monks, there's a revealing of weakness together with the training being renounced.

Or whatever other synonyms there are for the Buddha, for the Teaching, for the Sangha, for the practice, for the training, for the

Monastic Code, for the recitation, for a preceptor, for a teacher, for a student, for a pupil, for a co-student, for a co-pupil, for a fellow monastic, for a householder, for a lay follower, for a monastery worker, for a novice monk, for a monastic of another religion, for a lay follower of another religion, for a non-ascetic, or for a non-monastic—he speaks and declares by way of these indications, by way of these marks, by way of these signs. In this way, monks, there’s a revealing of weakness together with the training being renounced.

8.4.1 And how is the training not renounced?

8.4.2 If you renounce the training by way of these indications, by way of these marks, by way of these signs, but you’re insane, then the training isn’t renounced. If you renounce the training to one who’s insane, the training isn’t renounced. If you renounce the training when you’re deranged, the training isn’t renounced. If you renounce the training to one who’s deranged, the training isn’t renounced. If you renounce the training when you’re overwhelmed by pain, the training isn’t renounced. If you renounce the training to one who’s overwhelmed by pain, the training isn’t renounced. If you renounce the training to a god, the training isn’t renounced. If you renounce the training to an animal, the training isn’t renounced. If an Indo-Aryan renounces the training to a non-Indo-Aryan who doesn’t understand, the training isn’t renounced. If a non-Indo-Aryan renounces the training to an Indo-Aryan who doesn’t understand, the training isn’t renounced. If an Indo-Aryan renounces the training to an Indo-Aryan who doesn’t understand, the training isn’t renounced. If a non-Indo-Aryan renounces the training to a non-Indo-Aryan who doesn’t understand, the training isn’t renounced. If you renounce the training as a joke, the training isn’t renounced. If you renounce the training because of speaking too fast, the training isn’t renounced. If you announce what you don’t wish to announce, the training isn’t renounced. If you don’t announce what you wish to announce, the training isn’t renounced. If

you announce to one who doesn't understand, the training isn't renounced. If you don't announce to one who understands, the training isn't renounced. Or if you don't make a full announcement, the training isn't renounced. In this way, monks, the training isn't renounced."

Sexual intercourse: what is contrary to the true Teaching, the common practice, the low practice, the coarse practice, that which ends with a wash, that which is done in private, that which is done wherever there are couples—this is called "sexual intercourse".

Has: whoever makes an organ enter an organ, a genital enter a genital, even to the depth of a sesame seed—this is called "has".

Even with a female animal: even having had sexual intercourse with a female animal, he is not an ascetic, not a Sakyan monastic, let alone with a woman—therefore it is called "even with a female animal".

He is expelled: just as a man with his head cut off is unable to continue living by reconnecting it to the body, so too is a monk who has had sexual intercourse not an ascetic, not a Sakyan monastic. Therefore it is said, "he is expelled."

Excluded from the community: Community: joint legal procedures, a joint recitation, the same training—this is called "community". He does not take part in this—therefore it is called "excluded from the community".

Permutations

Permutations part 1

Summary

There are three kinds of females: a human female, a female spirit, a female animal. There are three kinds of hermaphrodites: a human hermaphrodite, a hermaphrodite spirit, a hermaphrodite animal. There are three kinds of *paṇḍakas*: a human *paṇḍaka*, a *paṇḍaka* 9.1.1

spirit, a *paṇḍaka* animal. There are three kinds of males: a human male, a male spirit, a male animal.

Exposition part 1

- 9.1.9.1 He commits an offense entailing expulsion if he has sexual intercourse with a human female through three orifices: the anus, the vagina, or the mouth. ... with a female spirit ... He commits an offense entailing expulsion if he has sexual intercourse with a female animal through three orifices: the anus, the vagina, or the mouth. ... with a human hermaphrodite ... with a hermaphrodite spirit ... He commits an offense entailing expulsion if he has sexual intercourse with a hermaphrodite animal through three orifices: the anus, the vagina, or the mouth. He commits an offense entailing expulsion if he has sexual intercourse with a human *paṇḍaka* through two orifices: the anus or the mouth. ... with a *paṇḍaka* spirit ... with a *paṇḍaka* animal ... with a human male ... with a male spirit ... He commits an offense entailing expulsion if he has sexual intercourse with a male animal through two orifices: the anus or the mouth.

Exposition part 2

Voluntary sexual intercourse

- 9.2.1 If a monk has the intention of sexual relations and he makes his penis enter the anus of a human female ...¹¹ the vagina of a human female ... the mouth of a human female, he commits an offense entailing expulsion. If a monk has the intention of sexual relations and he makes his penis enter the anus of a female spirit ... the anus of a female animal ... the anus of a human hermaphrodite ... the anus of a hermaphrodite spirit ... the anus of a hermaphrodite animal ... the vagina of a hermaphrodite animal ... the mouth of a hermaphrodite animal, he commits an offense entailing expulsion.

11. "Intention of sexual relations" renders *sevanacitta*, lit. "intention of association". The kind of association applicable to this rule, however, is sexual intercourse.

If a monk has the intention of sexual relations and he makes his penis enter the anus of a human *paṇḍaka* ... the anus of a *paṇḍaka* spirit ... the anus of a *paṇḍaka* animal ... the anus of a human male ... the anus of a male spirit ... the anus of a male animal ... the mouth of a male animal, he commits an offense entailing expulsion.

Forced sexual intercourse: bringing the partner to the monk

Enemy monks bring a human female to a monk and make her sit down so that his penis enters her anus.¹² If he consents to the entry, and he consents to having entered, and he consents to the remaining, and he consents to the taking out, he commits an offense entailing expulsion.¹³ Enemy monks bring a human female to a monk and make her sit down so that his penis enters her anus. If he does not consent to the entry, but he consents to having entered, and he consents to the remaining, and he consents to the taking out, he commits an offense entailing expulsion. Enemy monks bring a human female to a monk and make her sit down so that his penis enters her anus. If he does not consent to the entry, nor to having entered, but he consents to the remaining, and he consents to the taking out, he commits an offense entailing expulsion. Enemy monks bring a human female to a monk and make her sit down so that his penis enters her anus. If he does not consent to the entry, nor to having entered, nor to the remaining, but he consents to the taking out, he commits an offense entailing expulsion. Enemy monks bring a human female to a monk and make her sit down so that his penis enters her anus. If he does not

12. “Enemy monks” renders *bhikkhupaccatthikā*, translated as “opponents of monks” by I.B. Horner, which seems to be incorrect. Below we find parallel compounds with other kinds of people, for instance *corapaccatthikā*, which in the context must mean “enemy criminals”, not “enemies of criminals”. Moreover, all these other people would already be accounted for if *bhikkhupaccatthikā* meant “enemies of monks”. There would be no need to mention them separately.

13. That is, he consents to the sexual intercourse at each of these points.

consent to the entry, nor to having entered, nor to the remaining, nor to the taking out, there is no offense.

9.3.11 Enemy monks bring a human female to a monk and make her sit down so that his penis enters her vagina ... her mouth. If he consents to the entry, and he consents to having entered, and he consents to the remaining, and he consents to the taking out, he commits an offense entailing expulsion. ... If he does not consent to the entry, nor to having entered, nor to the remaining, nor to the taking out, there is no offense.

9.3.15 Enemy monks bring a human female who is awake ... asleep ... intoxicated ... insane ... heedless ... dead but undecomposed ... dead and mostly undecomposed ... he commits an offense entailing expulsion. They bring one who is dead and mostly decomposed to a monk and make her sit down so that his penis enters her anus ... her vagina ... her mouth. If he consents to the entry, and he consents to having entered, and he consents to the remaining, and he consents to the taking out, he commits a serious offense. ... If he does not consent ... there is no offense.

9.3.28 Enemy monks bring a female spirit ... a female animal ... a human hermaphrodite ... a hermaphrodite spirit ... a hermaphrodite animal to a monk and make it sit down so that his penis enters its anus ... its vagina ... its mouth. If he consents to the entry, and he consents to having entered, and he consents to the remaining, and he consents to the taking out, he commits an offense entailing expulsion. ... If he does not consent ... there is no offense.

9.3.37 Enemy monks bring a hermaphrodite animal that is awake ... asleep ... intoxicated ... insane ... heedless ... dead but undecomposed ... dead and mostly undecomposed ... he commits an offense entailing expulsion. They bring one that is dead and mostly decomposed to a monk and make it sit down so that his penis enters its anus ... its vagina ... its mouth. If he consents to the entry, and he consents to having entered, and he consents to the remaining, and he consents to the taking out, he commits a serious offense. ... If he does not consent ... there is no offense.

Enemy monks bring a human *paṇḍaka* ... a *paṇḍaka* spirit ... a 9.3.50
paṇḍaka animal to a monk and make it sit down so that his penis
 enters its anus ... its mouth. If he consents to the entry, and he
 consents to having entered, and he consents to the remaining, and
 he consents to the taking out, he commits an offense entailing
 expulsion. ... If he does not consent ... there is no offense.

Enemy monks bring a *paṇḍaka* animal that is awake ... asleep ... 9.3.56
 intoxicated ... insane ... heedless ... dead but undecomposed ...
 dead and mostly undecomposed ... he commits an offense entail-
 ing expulsion. They bring one that is dead and mostly decomposed
 to a monk and make it sit down so that his penis enters its anus ...
 its mouth. If he consents to the entry, and he consents to having
 entered, and he consents to the remaining, and he consents to the
 taking out, he commits a serious offense. ... If he does not consent
 ... there is no offense.

Enemy monks bring a human male ... a male spirit ... a male 9.3.68
 animal to a monk and make it sit down so that his penis enters its
 anus ... its mouth. If he consents to the entry, and he consents to
 having entered, and he consents to the remaining, and he consents
 to the taking out, he commits an offense entailing expulsion. ... If
 he does not consent ... there is no offense.

Enemy monks bring a male animal that is awake ... asleep ... 9.3.74
 intoxicated ... insane ... heedless ... dead but undecomposed ...
 dead and mostly undecomposed ... he commits an offense entail-
 ing expulsion. They bring one that is dead and mostly decomposed
 to a monk and make it sit down so that his penis enters its anus ...
 its mouth. If he consents to the entry, and he consents to having
 entered, and he consents to the remaining, and he consents to the
 taking out, he commits a serious offense ... If he does not consent
 ... there is no offense.

Forced sexual intercourse with cover: bringing the partner to the monk

Enemy monks bring a human female to a monk and make her sit 9.4.1
 down so that his penis enters her anus ... her vagina ... her mouth,

the female covered and the monk uncovered; the female uncovered and the monk covered; the female covered and the monk covered; the female uncovered and the monk uncovered. If he consents to the entry, and he consents to having entered, and he consents to the remaining, and he consents to the taking out, he commits an offense entailing expulsion. ... If he does not consent ... there is no offense.

9.4.10 Enemy monks bring a human female who is awake ... asleep ... intoxicated ... insane ... heedless ... dead but undecomposed ... dead and mostly undecomposed ... he commits an offense entailing expulsion. They bring one who is dead and mostly decomposed to a monk and make her sit down so that his penis enters her anus ... her vagina ... her mouth, the female covered and the monk uncovered; the female uncovered and the monk covered; the female covered and the monk covered; the female uncovered and the monk uncovered. If he consents to the entry, and he consents to having entered, and he consents to the remaining, and he consents to the taking out, he commits a serious offense. ... If he does not consent ... there is no offense.

9.4.27 Enemy monks bring a female spirit ... a female animal ... a human hermaphrodite ... a hermaphrodite spirit ... a hermaphrodite animal to a monk and make it sit down so that his penis enters its anus ... its vagina ... its mouth, the animal covered and the monk uncovered; the animal uncovered and the monk covered; the animal covered and the monk covered; the animal uncovered and the monk uncovered. If he consents to the entry, and he consents to having entered, and he consents to the remaining, and he consents to the taking out, he commits an offense entailing expulsion. ... If he does not consent ... there is no offense.

9.4.40 Enemy monks bring a hermaphrodite animal that is awake ... asleep ... intoxicated ... insane ... heedless ... dead but undecomposed ... dead and mostly undecomposed ... he commits an offense entailing expulsion. They bring one that is dead and mostly decomposed to a monk and make it sit down so that his penis en-

ters its anus ... its vagina ... its mouth, the animal covered and the monk uncovered; the animal uncovered and the monk covered; the animal covered and the monk covered; the animal uncovered and the monk uncovered. If he consents to the entry, and he consents to having entered, and he consents to the remaining, and he consents to the taking out, he commits a serious offense. ... If he does not consent ... there is no offense.

Enemy monks bring a human *paṇḍaka* ... a *paṇḍaka* spirit ... a 9.4.57
paṇḍaka animal ... a human male ... a male spirit ... a male animal to a monk and make it sit down so that his penis enters its anus ... its mouth, the animal covered and the monk uncovered; the animal uncovered and the monk covered; the animal covered and the monk covered; the animal uncovered and the monk uncovered. If he consents to the entry, and he consents to having entered, and he consents to the remaining, and he consents to the taking out, he commits an offense entailing expulsion. ... If he does not consent ... there is no offense.

Enemy monks bring a male animal that is awake ... asleep ... 9.4.70
 intoxicated ... insane ... heedless ... dead but undecomposed ... dead and mostly undecomposed ... he commits an offense entailing expulsion. They bring one that is dead and mostly decomposed to a monk and make it sit down so that his penis enters its anus ... its mouth, the animal covered and the monk uncovered; the animal uncovered and the monk covered; the animal covered and the monk covered; the animal uncovered and the monk uncovered. If he consents to the entry, and he consents to having entered, and he consents to the remaining, and he consents to the taking out, he commits a serious offense. ... If he does not consent ... there is no offense.

Forced sexual intercourse: bringing the monk to the partner

Enemy monks bring a monk to a human female and make him sit 9.5.1
 down so that his penis enters her anus ... her vagina ... her mouth. If he consents to the entry, and he consents to having entered, and

he consents to the remaining, and he consents to the taking out, he commits an offense entailing expulsion. ... If he does not consent ... there is no offense.

9.5.6 Enemy monks bring a monk to a human female who is awake ... asleep ... intoxicated ... insane ... heedless ... dead but undecomposed ... dead and mostly undecomposed ... he commits an offense entailing expulsion. They bring a monk to one who is dead and mostly decomposed and make him sit down so that his penis enters her anus ... her vagina ... her mouth. If he consents to the entry, and he consents to having entered, and he consents to the remaining, and he consents to the taking out, he commits a serious offense. ... If he does not consent ... there is no offense.

9.5.19 Enemy monks bring a monk to a female spirit ... a female animal ... a human hermaphrodite ... a hermaphrodite spirit ... a hermaphrodite animal ... a human *paṇḍaka* ... a *paṇḍaka* spirit ... a *paṇḍaka* animal ... a human male ... a male spirit ... a male animal and make him sit down so that his penis enters its anus ... its mouth. If he consents to the entry, and he consents to having entered, and he consents to the remaining, and he consents to the taking out, he commits an offense entailing expulsion. ... If he does not consent ... there is no offense.

9.5.33 Enemy monks bring a monk to a male animal that is awake ... asleep ... intoxicated ... insane ... heedless ... dead but undecomposed ... dead and mostly undecomposed ... he commits an offense entailing expulsion. They bring a monk to one that is dead and mostly decomposed and make him sit down so that his penis enters its anus ... its mouth. If he consents to the entry, and he consents to having entered, and he consents to the remaining, and he consents to the taking out, he commits a serious offense ... If he does not consent ... there is no offense.

Forced sexual intercourse with cover: bringing the monk to the partner

Enemy monks bring a monk to a human female and make him sit down so that his penis enters her anus ...¹⁴ her vagina ... her mouth, the monk covered and the female uncovered; the monk uncovered and the female covered; the monk covered and the female covered; the monk uncovered and the female uncovered. If he consents to the entry, and he consents to having entered, and he consents to the remaining, and he consents to the taking out, he commits an offense entailing expulsion. ... If he does not consent ... there is no offense. 9.6.1

Enemy monks bring a monk to a human female who is awake ... asleep ... intoxicated ... insane ... heedless ... dead but undecomposed ... dead and mostly undecomposed ... he commits an offense entailing expulsion. They bring a monk to a human female who is dead and mostly decomposed and make him sit down so that his penis enters her anus ... her vagina ... her mouth, the monk covered and the female uncovered; the monk uncovered and the female covered; the monk covered and the female covered; the monk uncovered and the female uncovered. If he consents to the entry, and he consents to having entered, and he consents to the remaining, and he consents to the taking out, he commits a serious offense. ... If he does not consent ... there is no offense. 9.6.10

Enemy monks bring a monk to a female spirit ... a female animal ... a human hermaphrodite ... a hermaphrodite spirit ... a hermaphrodite animal ... a human *paṇḍaka* ... a *paṇḍaka* spirit ... a *paṇḍaka* animal ... a human male ... a male spirit ... a male animal and make him sit down so that his penis enters its anus ... its mouth, the monk covered and the animal uncovered; the monk 9.6.27

14. The Pali phrase *āṅgajātena vaccamaggaṃ abhinisīdenti* could be rendered, “They make (the monk) sit down with his penis in the anus.” Above we find the inverse expression, *vaccamaggena āṅgajātaṃ abhinisīdenti*, which could be rendered, “They make (the woman) sit on his penis with her anus.” The effect is the same, but the agent in the two cases is different. Since the agent is clear from the context, I have rendered the two expressions in the same way.

uncovered and the animal covered; the monk covered and the animal covered; the monk uncovered and the animal uncovered. If he consents to the entry, and he consents to having entered, and he consents to the remaining, and he consents to the taking out, he commits an offense entailing expulsion. ... If he does not consent ... there is no offense.

9.6.45 Enemy monks bring a monk to a male animal that is awake ... asleep ... intoxicated ... insane ... heedless ... dead but undecomposed ... dead and mostly undecomposed ... he commits an offense entailing expulsion. They bring a monk to one that is dead and mostly decomposed and make him sit down so that his penis enters its anus ... its mouth, the monk covered and the animal uncovered; the monk uncovered and the animal covered; the monk covered and the animal covered; the monk uncovered and the animal uncovered. If he consents to the entry, and he consents to having entered, and he consents to the remaining, and he consents to the taking out, he commits a serious offense. ... If he does not consent ... there is no offense.

9.7.1 As “enemy monks” has been explained in detail, so should the following categories be explained:

9.7.2 Enemy kings ... enemy bandits ... enemy scoundrels ... “lotus-scent” enemies. The section in brief is finished.

Permutations part 2

9.7.7.1 If he makes a private part enter a private part, there is an offense entailing expulsion.¹⁵ If he makes the mouth enter a private part, there is an offense entailing expulsion. If he makes a private part enter the mouth, there is an offense entailing expulsion. If he makes the mouth enter the mouth, there is a serious offense.

15. For an explanation of the words *magga* and *amagga* as used here, see Appendix of Technical Terms. In this section, as above, the instrumental case signifies the orifice that is entered. This may seem unusual, but it follows the pattern found elsewhere where the gateway through which anything (such as a house, a village, or a cul-de-sac) is entered is in the instrumental case.

A monk rapes a sleeping monk: if he wakes up and consents, 9.7.11
both should be expelled; if he wakes up but does not consent, the
rapist should be expelled. A monk rapes a sleeping novice: if he
wakes up and consents, both should be expelled; if he wakes up
but does not consent, the rapist should be expelled. A novice rapes
a sleeping monk: if he wakes up and consents, both should be
expelled; if he wakes up but does not consent, the rapist should
be expelled. A novice rapes a sleeping novice: if he wakes up and
consents, both should be expelled; if he wakes up but does not
consent, the rapist should be expelled.

Non-offenses

There is no offense: if he does not know; if he does not consent; if 9.7.23.1
he is insane; if he is deranged; if he is overwhelmed by pain; if he
is the first offender.

The section for recitation on covering is finished.

Summary verses of case studies

“The female monkey, and the Vajjians, 9.7.32
Householder, and a naked one, monastics of other religions;
The girl, and Uppalavaṇṇā,
Two others with characteristics.

Mother, daughter, and sister, 9.7.36
And wife, supple, with long;
Two on wounds, and a picture,
And a wooden doll.

Five with Sundara, 9.7.40
Five about charnel grounds, bones;
A female dragon, and a female spirit, and a female ghost,
A *paṇḍaka*, impaired, should touch.

The sleeping Perfected One in Bhaddiya, 9.7.44
Four others in Sāvattī;
Three in Vesālī, garlands,
The one from Bharukaccha in his dream.

Supabbā, Saddhā, a nun, 9.7.48
A trainee nun, and a novice nun;

A sex worker, a *paṇḍaka*, a female householder,
Each other, gone forth in old age, a deer.”

Case studies

- 10.1.1 At one time a monk had sexual intercourse with a female monkey. He became anxious, thinking, “The Buddha has laid down a training rule. Could it be that I’ve committed an offense entailing expulsion?” He told the Buddha. “You’ve committed an offense entailing expulsion.”
- 10.2.1 At one time a number of Vajjian monks from Vesālī had sexual intercourse without first renouncing the training and revealing their weakness. They became anxious, thinking, “The Buddha has laid down a training rule. Could it be that we’ve committed an offense entailing expulsion?” They told the Buddha. “You’ve committed an offense entailing expulsion.”
- 10.3.1 At one time a monk had sexual intercourse while dressed like a householder, thinking he would avoid an offense. He became anxious, thinking, “The Buddha has laid down a training rule. Could it be that I’ve committed an offense entailing expulsion?” He told the Buddha. “You’ve committed an offense entailing expulsion.”
- 10.3.9 At one time a monk had sexual intercourse while naked, thinking he would avoid an offense. He became anxious ... “You’ve committed an offense entailing expulsion.”
- 10.3.14 At one time a monk had sexual intercourse while dressed in a grass sarong ... while dressed in a bark sarong ... while dressed in a sarong made of bits of wood ...¹⁶ while dressed in a sarong made of human hair ... while dressed in a sarong made of horse-hair ... while dressed in a sarong of owls’ wings ... while dressed in a sarong of antelope hide, thinking he would avoid an offense. He became anxious ... “You’ve committed an offense entailing expulsion.”

16. Sp 1.67: *Phalakacīraṇaṃ nāma phalakasaṇṭhānāni phalakāni sibbitvā katacīraṇaṃ*, “*Phalakacīra*: a robe made by sewing together bits of wood or what has the appearance of wood.”

At one time a monk who was an alms-collector saw a little girl 10.4.1
lying on a bench. Being lustful, he inserted his thumb into her
vagina. She died. He became anxious ... “There’s no offense en-
tailing expulsion, but there’s an offense entailing suspension.”

At one time a young brahmin had fallen in love with the nun 10.5.1
Uppalavaṇṇā. When Uppalavaṇṇā had gone to the village for alms,
he entered her hut and hid himself. When she had eaten her meal
and returned from alms round, Uppalavaṇṇā washed her feet, en-
tered her hut, and sat down on the bed. Then that young brahmin
grabbed hold of her and raped her. She told the nuns what had
happened. The nuns told the monks, who in turn told the Buddha.
“There’s no offense for one who doesn’t consent.”

At one time female characteristics appeared on a monk. They 10.6.1
told the Buddha.

**“Monks, I allow that discipleship, that ordination, those years
as a monk, to be transferred to the nuns. The monks’ offenses
that are in common with the nuns are to be cleared with the
nuns. For the monks’ offenses that are not in common with the
nuns, there’s no offense.”**

At one time male characteristics appeared on a nun. They told 10.6.6
the Buddha.

**“Monks, I allow that discipleship, that ordination, those years
as a nun, to be transferred to the monks. The nuns’ offenses that
are in common with the monks are to be cleared with the monks.
For the nuns’ offenses that are not in common with the monks,
there’s no offense.”**

At one time a monk had sexual intercourse with his mother ... 10.7.1
had sexual intercourse with his daughter ... had sexual intercourse
with his sister, thinking he would avoid an offense. ... He became
anxious ... “You’ve committed an offense entailing expulsion.”

At one time a monk had sexual intercourse with his ex-wife. 10.7.8
He became anxious ... “You’ve committed an offense entailing
expulsion.”

- 10.8.1 At one time there was a monk with a supple back who was plagued by lust. He inserted his penis into his own mouth. He became anxious ... "You've committed an offense entailing expulsion."
- 10.8.5 At one time there was a monk with a long penis who was plagued by lust. He inserted his penis into his own anus. He became anxious ... "You've committed an offense entailing expulsion."
- 10.9.1 At one time a monk saw a dead body with a wound next to the genitals. Thinking he would avoid an offense, he inserted his penis into the genitals and exited through the wound. He became anxious ... "You've committed an offense entailing expulsion."
- 10.9.7 At one time a monk saw a dead body with a wound next to the genitals. Thinking he would avoid an offense, he inserted his penis into the wound and exited through the genitals. He became anxious ... "You've committed an offense entailing expulsion."
- 10.10.1 At one time a lustful monk touched the genitals in a picture with his penis. He became anxious ... "There's no offense entailing expulsion, but there's an offense of wrong conduct."
- 10.10.5 At one time a lustful monk touched the genitals of a wooden doll with his penis. He became anxious ... "There's no offense entailing expulsion, but there's an offense of wrong conduct."
- 10.11.1 At one time a monk called Sundara who had gone forth in Rājagaha was walking along a street.¹⁷ A woman said to him, "Please wait, Sir, I'll pay respect to you." As she was paying respect, she held up his sarong and inserted his penis into her mouth. He became anxious ... "Monk, did you consent?"
- 10.11.7 "I didn't consent, Sir."
- 10.11.8 "There's no offense for one who doesn't consent."
- 10.12.1 At one time a woman saw a monk and said, "Sir, come and have sexual intercourse."
- 10.12.3 "It's not allowable."

17. Sp 1.73 explains the ablative Rājagahā as a locative Rājagahe.

“I’ll make the effort, not you. In this way there won’t be any offense for you.” The monk acted accordingly. He became anxious ... “You’ve committed an offense entailing expulsion.” 10.12.4

At one time a woman saw a monk and said, “Sir, come and have sexual intercourse.” 10.12.9

“It’s not allowable.” 10.12.11

“You make the effort, not I. In this way there won’t be any offense for you.” The monk acted accordingly. He became anxious ... “You’ve committed an offense entailing expulsion.” 10.12.12

At one time a woman saw a monk and said, “Sir, come and have sexual intercourse.” 10.12.17

“It’s not allowable.” 10.12.19

“Rub inside but discharge outside. ... Rub outside but discharge inside. In this way there won’t be any offense for you.” The monk acted accordingly. He became anxious ... “You’ve committed an offense entailing expulsion.” 10.12.20

At one time a monk went to a charnel ground where he saw an undecomposed corpse. He had sexual intercourse with it. He became anxious ... “You’ve committed an offense entailing expulsion.” 10.13.1

At one time a monk went to a charnel ground where he saw a mostly undecomposed corpse. He had sexual intercourse with it. He became anxious ... “You’ve committed an offense entailing expulsion.” 10.13.4

At one time a monk went to a charnel ground where he saw a mostly decomposed corpse. He had sexual intercourse with it. He became anxious ... “There’s no offense entailing expulsion, but there’s a serious offense.” 10.13.7

At one time a monk went to a charnel ground where he saw a decapitated head. He inserted his penis into the open mouth, making contact as he entered.¹⁸ He became anxious ... “You’ve committed an offense entailing expulsion.” 10.13.12

18. Sp-t 2.73: *Vaṭṭakateti imassa attham dassento “vivaṭe”ti āha, “Vaṭṭakate: to show the meaning of this, they say ‘open.’”*

- 10.13.15 At one time a monk went to a charnel ground where he saw a decapitated head. He inserted his penis into the open mouth, without making contact as he entered. He became anxious ... “There’s no offense entailing expulsion, but there’s an offense of wrong conduct.”
- 10.13.19 At one time a monk was in love with a certain woman. When she died, the body was dumped on a charnel ground. After some time only scattered bones remained. The monk went to the charnel ground, collected the bones, and brought his penis into the genital area. He became anxious ... “There’s no offense entailing expulsion, but there’s an offense of wrong conduct.”
- 10.14.1 At one time a monk had sexual intercourse with a female dragon ... had sexual intercourse with a female spirit ... had sexual intercourse with a female ghost ... had sexual intercourse with a *paṇḍaka*. He became anxious ... “You’ve committed an offense entailing expulsion.”
- 10.15.1 At one time there was a monk with impaired faculties. Thinking he would avoid an offense because he felt neither pleasure nor pain, he had sexual intercourse. ... They told the Buddha. “Whether or not that fool felt anything, there’s an offense entailing expulsion.”
- 10.16.1 At one time a monk who intended to have sexual intercourse with a woman felt remorse at the mere touch. He became anxious ... “There’s no offense entailing expulsion, but there’s an offense entailing suspension.”
- 10.17.1 At one time a monk was lying down in the Jātiyā Grove at Bhaddiya, having gone there for the day’s meditation. He had an erection because of wind.¹⁹ A certain woman saw him and sat down on his penis. Having taken her pleasure, she left. Seeing the moisture, the monks told the Buddha. “Monks, an erection occurs for five reasons: because of sensual desire, feces, urine, or wind, or because

19. *Āṅgamaṅgāni* literally means, “various bodily parts”. The point is perhaps that the wind element caused stiffness throughout the body. Sp-t 2.74: *Āṅgamaṅgāni vātupatthaddhāni hontīti evaṃ vuttavātupatthambhena*, “*Āṅgamaṅgāni vātupatthaddhāni honti*: in this way erection due to wind is spoken of.” See Bu Ss 1:3.2.15 for the expression *vātupatthambha*.

of being stung by caterpillars. It's impossible that that monk had an erection because of sensual desire. That monk is a perfected one. There's no offense for that monk."

At one time a monk was lying down in the Dark Wood at Sāvattḥī, having gone there for the day's meditation. A woman cowherd saw him and sat down on his penis. The monk consented to the entry, to having entered, to the remaining, and to the taking out. He became anxious ... "You've committed an offense entailing expulsion." 10.18.1

At one time a monk was lying down in the Dark Wood at Sāvattḥī, having gone there for the day's meditation. A woman goatherd saw him ... A woman gathering fire-wood saw him ... A woman gathering cow-dung saw him and sat down on his penis. The monk consented to the entry, to having entered, to the remaining, and to the taking out. He became anxious ... "You've committed an offense entailing expulsion." 10.18.6

At one time a monk was lying down in the Great Wood at Vesālī, having gone there for the day's meditation. A woman saw him and sat down on his penis. Having taken her pleasure, she stood laughing nearby. The monk woke up and said, "Did you do this?" 10.19.1

"Yes." 10.19.5

He became anxious ... 10.19.6

"Did you consent?" 10.19.7

"I didn't even know, Sir." 10.19.8

"There's no offense for one who doesn't know." 10.19.9

At one time a monk went to the Great Wood at Vesālī for the day's meditation. He lay down, resting his head against a tree. A woman saw him and sat down on his penis. The monk got up quickly. He became anxious ... "Did you consent?" 10.20.1

"I didn't consent, Sir." 10.20.6

"There's no offense for one who doesn't consent." 10.20.7

At one time a monk went to the Great Wood at Vesālī for the day's meditation. He lay down, resting his head against a tree. A 10.20.8

woman saw him and sat down on his penis. The monk kicked her off. He became anxious ... “Did you consent?”

10.20.13 “I didn’t consent, Sir.”

10.20.14 “There’s no offense for one who doesn’t consent.”

10.21.1 At one time a monk went to the hall with the peaked roof in the Great Wood near Vesālī for the day’s meditation. He opened the door, lay down, and had an erection because of wind. Just then a number of women came to the monastery to look at the dwellings, bringing scents and garlands. They saw that monk and sat down on his penis. Having taken their pleasure, they said, “What a bull of a man.” They then put up their scents and garlands and left. The monks saw the moisture and told the Buddha.

10.21.6 “Monks, an erection occurs for five reasons: because of sensual desire, feces, urine, or wind, or because of being stung by caterpillars. It’s impossible that that monk had an erection because of sensual desire. That monk is a perfected one. There’s no offense for that monk.

But, monks, you should close the door when you are in seclusion during the day.”

10.22.1 At one time a monk from Bharukaccha dreamed that he had sexual intercourse with his ex-wife. He thought he was no longer a monastic and that he would have to disrobe. While on his way to Bharukaccha, he saw Venerable Upālī and told him what had happened. Venerable Upālī said, “There’s no offense when it occurs while dreaming.”

10.23.1 At one time in Rājagaha there was a female lay follower called Supabbā who had misplaced faith.²⁰ She had the view that a woman who gives sexual intercourse gives the highest gift. She saw a monk and said, “Sir, come and have sexual intercourse.”

10.23.6 “It’s not allowable.”

20. *Mudhappasannā* is not directly defined in the commentaries, but we do find indications of its meaning. Sp-t 2.165: *Balavasaddho hi mandapañño mudhappasanno hoti, avatthusmim pasīdati*, “One who has strong faith and weak wisdom is called *mudhappasanna*. Their confidence is without basis.”

“Then rub between the thighs. In this way there won’t be any offense for you. ... Then rub against the navel. ... Then rub against the stomach. ... Then rub in the armpit. ... Then rub against the throat. ... Then rub against the ear-hole. ... Then rub against a coil of hair. ... Then rub between the fingers. ... Then I’ll make you discharge with my hand. In this way there won’t be any offense for you.” The monk acted accordingly. He became anxious ... “There’s no offense entailing expulsion, but there’s an offense entailing suspension.” 10.23.7

At one time in Sāvattthī there was a female lay follower called Saddhā who had misplaced faith. She had the view that a woman who gives sexual intercourse gives the highest gift. She saw a monk and said, “Sir, come and have sexual intercourse.” 10.24.1

“It’s not allowable.” 10.24.6

“Then rub between the thighs. ... Then I’ll make you discharge with my hand. In this way there won’t be any offense for you.” The monk acted accordingly. He became anxious ... “There’s no offense entailing expulsion, but there’s an offense entailing suspension.” 10.24.7

At one time in Vesālī some Licchavī youths grabbed a monk and made him commit misconduct with a nun. ... made him commit misconduct with a trainee nun. ... made him commit misconduct with a novice nun. Both consented: both should be expelled. Neither consented: there is no offense for either. 10.25.1

At one time in Vesālī some Licchavī youths grabbed a monk and made him commit misconduct with a sex worker. ... made him commit misconduct with a *paṇḍaka*. ... made him commit misconduct with a female householder. The monk consented: he should be expelled. The monk did not consent: there is no offense. 10.25.8

At one time in Vesālī some Licchavī youths grabbed two monks and made them commit misconduct with each other. Both consented: both should be expelled. Neither consented: there is no offense for either. 10.25.15

At one time a monk who had gone forth in old age went to see his ex-wife. Saying, “Come and disrobe,” she grabbed him. Stepping 10.26.1

backward, the monk fell on his back. She pulled up his robe and sat down on his penis. He became anxious ... “Did you consent, monk?”

10.26.7 “I didn’t consent, Sir.”

10.26.8 “There’s no offense for one who doesn’t consent.”

10.27.1 At one time a certain monk was staying in the wilderness. A young deer came to his place of urination, drank the urine, and took hold of his penis with its mouth. The monk consented. He became anxious ... “You’ve committed an offense entailing expulsion.”

The first offense entailing expulsion is finished.

The second training rule on expulsion

Adinnādāna

Origin story

First sub-story

At one time the Buddha was staying on the Vulture Peak at Rājagaha. At that time a number of monks who were friends had made grass huts on the slope of Mount Isigili and had entered the rainy-season residence there. Among them was Venerable Dhaniya the potter. When the three months were over and they had completed the rainy-season residence, the monks demolished their grass huts, put away the grass and sticks, and left to wander the country. But Venerable Dhaniya spent the winter and the summer right there. 1.1.1

Then, on one occasion, while Dhaniya was in the village to collect almsfood, some women gathering grass and firewood demolished his grass hut and took away the grass and sticks. A second time Dhaniya collected grass and sticks and made a grass hut, and again the hut was demolished in the same way. The same thing happened a third time. 1.1.6

Dhaniya thought, “Three times this has happened. But I’m well-trained and experienced in my own craft of pottery. Why don’t I knead mud myself and make a hut entirely of clay?” 1.1.11

And he did just that. He then collected grass, sticks, and cowdung, and he baked his hut. It was a pretty and attractive little hut, red in color like a scarlet rain-mite. And when struck, it sounded just like a bell. 1.1.15

Soon afterwards the Buddha was descending from the Vulture Peak with a number of monks when he saw that hut. He said to the monks, “What’s this pretty and attractive thing that’s red in color like a scarlet rain-mite?” The monks told the Buddha, who then rebuked Dhaniya: 1.2.1

1.2.6 “It’s not suitable for that foolish man, it’s not proper, it’s not worthy of a monastic, it’s not allowable, it’s not to be done. How could he make a hut entirely of clay? Doesn’t he have any consideration, compassion, and mercy for living beings? Go, monks, and demolish this hut, so that future generations don’t follow his example.

And, monks, you shouldn’t make a hut entirely of clay. If you do, you commit an offense of wrong conduct.”

1.2.13 Saying, “Yes, Sir,” they went to demolish it.

1.2.14 And Dhaniya said to them, “Why are you demolishing my hut?”

1.2.16 “The Buddha has asked us to.”

1.2.17 “Demolish it then, if the Lord of the Truth has said so.”

1.3.1 Dhaniya thought, “Three times, while I was in the village to collect almsfood, women gathering grass and firewood demolished my hut and took away the grass and sticks. And now my hut made entirely of clay has been demolished at the Buddha’s request. Now, the caretaker of the woodyard is a friend of mine. Why don’t I ask him for timber and make a hut out of that?”

1.3.6 Dhaniya then went to the caretaker of the woodyard and told him what had happened, adding, “Please give me some timber, I want to make a wooden hut.”

1.3.11 “There’s no timber, Sir, that I could give you. This timber is held by the King. It’s meant for repairs of the town and put aside in case of an emergency. You can only have it if the King gives it away.”

1.3.14 “Actually, it’s been given by the King.”

1.3.15 The caretaker of the woodyard thought, “These Sakyan monastics have integrity. They are celibate and their conduct is good, and they are truthful, moral, and have a good character. Even the King has faith in them. These venerables wouldn’t say something is given if it wasn’t.” And he said to Dhaniya, “You may take it, Sir.” Dhaniya then had that timber cut into pieces, took it away on carts, and made a wooden hut.

1.4.1 Soon afterwards the brahmin Vassakāra, the chief minister of Magadha, was inspecting the public works in Rājagaha when he

went to the caretaker of the woodyard and said, “What’s going on? Where’s the timber held by the King that’s meant for repairs of the town and put aside in case of an emergency?”

“The King has given it to Venerable Dhaniya.” 1.4.4

Vassakāra was upset and thought, “How could the King give away this timber to Dhaniya the potter?” 1.4.5

He then went to King Seniya Bimbisāra of Magadha and said, “Is it true, sir, that you have given away to Dhaniya the potter the timber that was held for repairs of the town and put aside in case of an emergency?” 1.4.7

“Who said that?” 1.4.9

“The caretaker of the woodyard.” 1.4.10

“Well then, brahmin, summon the caretaker of the woodyard.” 1.4.11
And Vassakāra had the caretaker of the woodyard bound and taken by force.

Dhaniya saw this and said to him, “Why is this happening to you?” 1.4.13

“Because of the timber, Sir.” 1.4.16

“Go then, and I’ll come too.” 1.4.17

“Please come before I’m done for.” 1.4.18

Dhaniya then went to King Bimbisāra’s house and sat down on the prepared seat. The King approached Dhaniya, bowed, sat down, and said, “Is it true, Venerable, that I have given to you the timber held for repairs of the town and put aside in case of an emergency?” 1.5.1

“Yes, great king.” 1.5.5

“We kings are very busy—we may give and not remember. Please remind me.” 1.5.6

“Do you remember, great king, when you were first anointed, speaking these words: ‘I give the grass, sticks, and water for the monastics and brahmins to enjoy’?” 1.5.9

“I remember. There are monastics and brahmins who have a sense of conscience, who are afraid of wrongdoing and fond of the training. They are afraid of wrongdoing even in regard to small 1.5.11

matters. When I spoke, I was referring to them, and it concerned what's ownerless in the wilderness. Yet you imagine that you can take timber not given to you by means of this pretext? Even so, I cannot beat, imprison, or banish a monastic or brahmin living in my own kingdom. Go, you're free because of your status, but don't do such a thing again."

1.6.1 But people complained and criticized him: "These Sakyan monastics are shameless and immoral liars. They claim to have integrity, to be celibate and of good conduct, to be truthful, moral, and good. But they don't have the good character of a monastic or a brahmin. They've lost the plot! They even deceive the King, never mind other people."

1.6.9 The monks heard the complaints of those people. The monks of few desires, who had a sense of conscience, and who were contented, afraid of wrongdoing, and fond of the training, complained and criticized Venerable Dhaniya, "How could he take the King's timber without it being given to him?"

1.6.12 After rebuking Dhaniya in many ways, they told the Buddha. The Buddha then had the Sangha of monks gathered and questioned Venerable Dhaniya: "Is it true, Dhaniya, that you did this?"

1.6.15 "It's true, Sir."

1.6.16 The Buddha rebuked him, "Foolish man, it's not suitable, it's not proper, it's not worthy of a monastic, it's not allowable, it's not to be done. How could you do this? This will affect people's confidence and cause some to lose it."

1.6.21 Just then a former judge who had gone forth with the monks was sitting near the Buddha. The Buddha said to him, "For stealing how much does King Bimbisāra beat, imprison, or banish a thief?"

1.6.24 "For stealing a *pāda* coin, Sir, or the value of a *pāda*." At that time in Rājagaha a *pāda* coin was worth five *māsaka* coins.

1.6.26 After rebuking Venerable Dhaniya in many ways, the Buddha spoke in dispraise of being difficult to support ... "And, monks, this training rule should be recited like this:

Preliminary ruling

‘If a monk, intending to steal, takes what has not been given to him—the sort of stealing for which kings, having caught a thief, would beat, imprison, or banish him, saying, “You’re a bandit, you’re a fool, you’ve gone astray, you’re a thief”—he too is expelled and excluded from the community.’”

In this way the Buddha laid down this training rule for the monks. 1.6.31

Second sub-story

At one time the monks from the group of six went to the dyers, stole their stock of cloth, brought it back to the monastery, and shared it out.²¹ The other monks said to them, “You have great merit, seeing that you’ve gotten so much robe-cloth.”²² 2.1

“How is it that we have merit? Just now we went to the dyers and stole their cloth.” 2.5

“But hasn’t the Buddha laid down a training rule? Why then do you steal the dyers’ cloth?” 2.7

“It’s true that the Buddha has laid down a training rule, but it concerns inhabited areas, not the wilderness.” 2.9

“But that’s just the same. It’s not suitable, it’s not proper, it’s not worthy of a monastic, it’s not allowable, it’s not to be done. How could you steal the dyers’ cloth? This will affect people’s confidence, and cause some to lose it.” 2.11

After rebuking those monks in many ways, they told the Buddha. 2.16

The Buddha had the Sangha of monks gathered and questioned those monks: “Is it true, monks, that you did this?” 2.17

“It’s true, Sir.” 2.19

The Buddha rebuked them, “It’s not suitable, foolish men, it’s not proper, it’s not worthy of a monastic, it’s not allowable, it’s 2.20

21. The text literally says “the dyers’ spread”, *rajakattharaṇaṃ*, but the commentary at Sp 1.90 qualifies that this refers to their spread of “cloth”, *vatthāṇi*.

22. For the rendering of *cīvara* as “robe-cloth”, see Appendix of Technical Terms.

not to be done. How could you do this? This will affect people's confidence, and cause some to lose it." Then, after rebuking the monks from the group of six in many ways, the Buddha spoke in dispraise of being difficult to support ... but he spoke in praise of ... being energetic. Having given a teaching on what is right and proper, he addressed the monks ... "And so, monks, this training rule should be recited like this:

Final ruling

'If a monk, intending to steal, takes from an inhabited area or from the wilderness what has not been given to him—the sort of stealing for which kings, having caught a thief, would beat, imprison, or banish him, saying, "You're a bandit, you're a fool, you've gone astray, you're a thief"—he too is expelled and excluded from the community.'"

Definitions

A: whoever ...

Monk: ... The monk who has been given the full ordination by a unanimous Sangha through a legal procedure consisting of one motion and three announcements that is irreversible and fit to stand—this sort of monk is meant in this case.

An inhabited area: an inhabited area of one hut, an inhabited area of two huts, an inhabited area of three huts, an inhabited area of four huts, an inhabited area with people, an inhabited area without people, an enclosed inhabited area, an unenclosed inhabited area, a disorganized inhabited area, and even a caravan settled for more than four months is called "an inhabited area".

The access to an inhabited area: of an enclosed inhabited area: the stone-throw of a man of average height standing at the threshold of the gateway to the inhabited area; of an unenclosed inhabited area: the stone-throw of a man of average height standing at the access to a house.

The wilderness: apart from inhabited areas and the access to inhabited areas, the remainder is called “the wilderness”.

What has not been given: what has not been given, what has not been let go of, what has not been relinquished; what is guarded, what is protected, what is regarded as “mine”, what belongs to someone else. This is called “what has not been given”.

Intending to steal: the thought of theft, the thought of stealing.

Takes: takes, carries off, steals, interrupts the movement of, moves from its base, does not stick to an arrangement.

The sort: a *pāda* coin, the value of a *pāda*, or more than a *pāda*.

Kings: kings of the earth, kings of a region, rulers of islands, rulers of border areas, judges, government officials, or whoever metes out physical punishment—these are called “kings”.

A thief: whoever, intending to steal, takes anything that has not been given, having a value of five *māsaka* coins or more—he is called “a thief”.

Would beat: would beat with the hand, the foot, a whip, a cane, a cudgel, or by mutilation.

Would imprison: would imprison by constricting with a rope, by constricting with shackles, by constricting with chains, by constricting to a house, by constricting to a city, by constricting to a village, by constricting to a town, or by guarding.

Would banish: would banish from a village, from a town, from a city, from a country, or from a district.

You’re a bandit, you’re a fool, you’ve gone astray, you’re a thief: this is a rebuke.

²³ this is said with reference to the preceding offense entailing expulsion.

23. Because I have not tried to replicate the structure of the Pali—in this case the subordinate/demonstrative clause structure and the resulting repetitiveness—the next two terms defined in the Pali have no counterpart in my translation. But no information is lost since both terms have already been defined earlier. The two terms in question are *tathārūpaṃ*, which is defined in the same way as *yathārūpaṃ*, “the sort”, and secondly, *ādiyamāno*, which is defined in the same way as *ādiyeyya*, “takes”.

He too: just as a fallen, withered leaf is incapable of becoming green again, so too is a monk who, intending to steal, takes an ungiven *pāda* coin, the value of a *pāda*, or more than a *pāda* not an ascetic, not a Sakyan monastic. Therefore it is said, “he is expelled.”

Is expelled: Community: joint legal procedures, a joint recitation, the same training—this is called “community”. He does not take part in this—therefore it is called “excluded from the community”.

Permutations

Permutations part 1

Summary

- 4.1.1 Being underground, being on the ground, being in the air, being above ground, being in water, being in a boat, being in a vehicle, carried as a load, being in a park, being in a monastic dwelling, being in a field, being on a site, being in an inhabited area, being in the wilderness, water, tooth cleaner, forest tree, that which is carried, that which is deposited, customs station, a living being, footless, two-footed, four-footed, many-footed, a spy, a keeper of entrusted property, mutually agreed stealing, acting by arrangement, making a sign.

Exposition

- 4.2.2 **Being underground:** the goods have been placed underground, buried, concealed. If, intending to steal, he thinks, “I’ll steal the underground goods,” and he seeks for a companion, seeks for a spade or a basket, or goes there, he commits an offense of wrong conduct.²⁴ If he breaks a twig or a creeper growing

24. “Goes there” renders *gacchati*. Sp 1.94: *Gacchati vā āpatti dukkaṭassāti evaṃ pariyiṭṭhasahāyakudālapīṭako nidhiṭṭhānaṃ gacchati*, “*Gacchati vā āpatti dukkaṭassa*: in this way he goes with the sought friend, with the spade and basket, to the place of the goods.”

there, he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If he digs the soil or heaps it up or removes it, he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If he touches the container, he commits an offense of wrong conduct.²⁵ If he makes it stir, he commits a serious offense. If he moves it from its base, he commits an offense entailing expulsion.

If, intending to steal, he puts his own vessel into the container and touches something worth five *māsaka* coins or more, he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If he makes it stir, he commits a serious offense. If he makes it enter his own vessel or takes it with his fist, there is an offense entailing expulsion. 4.2.9

If, intending to steal, he touches goods made of string—an ornamental hanging string, a necklace, an ornamental girdle, a wrap garment, or a turban—he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If he makes it stir, he commits a serious offense. If he grasps it at the top and pulls it, he commits a serious offense. If he rubs it while lifting it, he commits a serious offense. If he removes the goods even as much as a hair's breadth over the rim of the container, he commits an offense entailing expulsion. 4.2.12

If, intending to steal, he drinks—in a single action—ghee, oil, honey, or syrup having a value of five *māsaka* coins or more, he commits an offense entailing expulsion. If he destroys it, throws it away, burns it, or renders it useless, he commits an offense of wrong conduct. 4.2.17

Being on the ground: the goods have been placed on the ground.

If, intending to steal, he thinks, “I’ll steal the goods on the ground,” and he either searches for a companion or goes there, he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If he touches them, he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If he makes them stir, he commits a serious offense. If he moves them from their base, he commits an offense entailing expulsion.

25. “Container” renders *kumbhi*, which actually is a pot or cooking vessel. In the present context, however, the pot is used as a container for goods.

Being in the air: the goods are in the air—a peacock, a partridge, or a quail; or a wrap garment or a turban; or money or gold that falls after being cut loose.²⁶ If, intending to steal, he thinks, “I’ll steal the goods in the air,” and he either searches for a companion or goes there, he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If he cuts off their course of movement, he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If he touches them, he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If he makes them stir, he commits a serious offense. If he moves them from their base, he commits an offense entailing expulsion.

Being above ground: the goods are above ground—on a bed, on a bench, on a bamboo robe rack, on a clothesline, on a wall peg, in a tree, or even just on a bowl rest.²⁷ If, intending to steal, he thinks, “I’ll steal the goods that are above ground,” and he either searches for a companion or goes there, he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If he touches them, he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If he makes them stir, he commits a serious offense. If he moves them from their base, he commits an offense entailing expulsion.

4.6.2 **Being in the water:** the goods have been placed in water. If, intending to steal, he thinks, “I’ll steal the goods in the water,” and he either searches for a companion or goes there, he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If he either dives into the water or floats on the surface, he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If he touches the goods, he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If he makes them stir, he commits a serious offense. If he moves them from their base, he commits an offense entailing expulsion.

4.6.8 If, intending to steal, he touches either a blue, red, or white lotus growing there, or a lotus root, or a fish, or a turtle having a value of five *māsaka* coins or more, he commits an offense of wrong

26. For a discussion of *hirañña*, see Appendix of Technical Terms.

27. *Bhittikhilepi nāgadantakepi*, lit. “wall pegs and elephant tusks”. These are different kinds of pegs and I have not tried to differentiate between them.

conduct. If he makes them stir, he commits a serious offense. If he moves them from their base, he commits an offense entailing expulsion.

A boat: that by means of which one crosses.

Being in a boat: the goods have been placed in a boat. If, intending to steal, he thinks, “I’ll steal the goods in the boat,” and he either searches for a companion or goes there, he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If he touches them, he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If he makes them stir, he commits a serious offense. If he moves them from their base, he commits an offense entailing expulsion. 4.7.4

If, intending to steal, he thinks, “I’ll steal the boat,” and he either searches for a companion or goes there, he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If he touches it, he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If he makes it stir, he commits a serious offense. If he loosens the moorings, he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If, after loosening the moorings, he touches it, he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If he makes it stir, he commits a serious offense. If he makes it move upstream or downstream or across the water, even as much as a hair’s breadth, he commits an offense entailing expulsion. 4.7.9

A vehicle: a wagon, a carriage, a cart, a chariot.

Being in a vehicle: the goods have been placed in a vehicle. If, intending to steal, he thinks, “I’ll steal the goods in the vehicle,” and he either searches for a companion or goes there, he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If he touches them, he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If he makes them stir, he commits a serious offense. If he moves them from their base, he commits an offense entailing expulsion. 4.8.4

If, intending to steal, he thinks, “I’ll steal the vehicle,” and he either searches for a companion or goes there, he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If he touches it, he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If he makes it stir, he commits a serious 4.8.9

offense. If he moves it from its base, he commits an offense entailing expulsion.

A load: a load carried on the head, a load carried on the shoulder, a load carried on the hip, one hanging down. If, intending to steal, he touches the load on the head, he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If he makes it stir, he commits a serious offense. If he lowers it to the shoulder, he commits an offense entailing expulsion. If, intending to steal, he touches the load on the shoulder, he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If he makes it stir, he commits a serious offense. If he lowers it to the hip, he commits an offense entailing expulsion. If, intending to steal, he touches the load on the hip, he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If he causes it to stir, he commits a serious offense. If he takes it with the hand, there is an offense entailing expulsion. If, intending to steal a load in the hand, he places it on the ground, he commits an offense entailing expulsion. If, intending to steal, he picks it up from the ground, he commits an offense entailing expulsion.

A park: a garden, an orchard.²⁸

4.10.4 **Being in a park:** the goods have been placed in a park in four locations: underground, on the ground, in the air, above the ground. If, intending to steal, he thinks, “I’ll steal the goods in the park,” and he either searches for a companion or goes there, he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If he touches them, he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If he makes them stir, he commits a serious offense. If he moves them from their base, he commits an offense entailing expulsion.

4.10.9 If, intending to steal, he touches something growing there—a root, a piece of bark, a leaf, a flower, or a fruit—having a value of five *māsaka* coins or more, he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If he makes it stir, he commits a serious offense. If he

28. Since *ārāma* is a standard term for a monastery in the Vinaya Piṭaka, monasteries are presumably included under this heading.

moves it from its base, he commits an offense entailing expulsion.

If he claims the park, he commits an offense of wrong conduct. 4.10.12

If he evokes doubt in the owner as to his ownership, he commits a serious offense. If the owner thinks, “I won’t get it back,” and he gives up the effort of reclaiming it, he commits an offense entailing expulsion. If he resorts to the law and defeats the owner, he commits an offense entailing expulsion.²⁹ If he resorts to the law but is defeated, he commits a serious offense.

Being in a monastic dwelling: the goods have been placed in a monastic dwelling in four locations: underground, on the ground, in the air, above the ground. If, intending to steal, he thinks, “I’ll steal the goods in the monastic dwelling,” and he either searches for a companion or goes there, he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If he touches them, he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If he makes them stir, he commits a serious offense. If he moves them from their base, he commits an offense entailing expulsion. 4.11.2

If he claims the monastic dwelling, he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If he evokes doubt in the owner as to his ownership, he commits a serious offense. If the owner thinks, “I won’t get it back,” and he gives up the effort of reclaiming it, he commits an offense entailing expulsion. If he resorts to the law and defeats the owner, he commits an offense entailing expulsion. If he resorts to the law but is defeated, he commits a serious offense. 4.11.7

A field: where grain or vegetables grow.

Being in a field: the goods have been placed in a field in four locations: underground, on the ground, in the air, above the ground. If, intending to steal, he thinks, “I’ll steal the goods in 4.12.4

29. Sp 1.102: *Sāmikaṃ parājetīti vinicchayikānaṃ ukkocaṃ datvā kūṭasakkhiṃ otāretvā ārāmasāmikaṃ jinātīti attho*, “‘He defeats the owner’: having given a bribe to those deciding (the legal case), having brought a false witness, he defeats the owner of the park. This is the meaning.” In other word, the lawsuit is illegitimate.

the field,” and he either searches for a companion or goes there, he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If he touches them, he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If he makes them stir, he commits a serious offense. If he moves them from their base, he commits an offense entailing expulsion.

4.12.9 If, intending to steal, he touches grain or vegetables that grow there, having a value of five *māsaka* coins or more, he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If he makes them stir, he commits a serious offense. If he moves them from their base, he commits an offense entailing expulsion.

4.12.12 If he claims the field, he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If he evokes doubt in the owner as to his ownership, he commits a serious offense. If the owner thinks, “I won’t get it back,” and he gives up the effort of reclaiming it, he commits an offense entailing expulsion. If he resorts to the law and defeats the owner, he commits an offense entailing expulsion. If he resorts to the law but is defeated, he commits a serious offense.

4.12.17 If he moves a post, a rope, a fence, or a boundary, he commits an offense of wrong conduct. When one action of the moving remains, he commits a serious offense. When the last action of the moving is completed, he commits an offense entailing expulsion.

A site: the site of a park or a monastery, the site of a monastic dwelling.³⁰

4.13.4 **Being on a site:** the goods have been placed on a site in four locations: underground, on the ground, in the air, above the ground. If, intending to steal, he thinks, “I’ll steal the goods on the site,” and he either searches for a companion or goes there, he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If he touches them, he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If he makes them stir, he commits a serious offense. If he moves them from their base, he commits an offense entailing expulsion.

30. Again, *ārāma* means both park and monastery.

If he claims the site, he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If 4.13.9
he evokes doubt in the owner as to his ownership, he commits a
serious offense. If the owner thinks, “I won’t get it back,” and he
gives up the effort of reclaiming it, he commits an offense entail-
ing expulsion. If he resorts to the law and defeats the owner, he
commits an offense entailing expulsion. If he resorts to the law
but is defeated, he commits a serious offense.

If he moves a post, a rope, a fence, or a boundary, he commits 4.13.14
an offense of wrong conduct. When one action of the moving
remains, he commits a serious offense. When the last action
of the moving is completed, he commits an offense entailing
expulsion.

Being in an inhabited area: the goods have been placed in an
inhabited area in four locations: underground, on the ground,
in the air, above the ground. If, intending to steal, he thinks,
“I’ll steal the goods in the inhabited area,” and he either searches
for a companion or goes there, he commits an offense of wrong
conduct. If he touches them, he commits an offense of wrong
conduct. If he makes them stir, he commits a serious offense. If
he moves them from their base, he commits an offense entailing
expulsion.

The wilderness: any wilderness which is owned by people.

Being in the wilderness: the goods have been placed in the 4.15.4
wilderness in four locations: underground, on the ground, in
the air, above the ground. If, intending to steal, he thinks, “I’ll
steal the goods in the wilderness,” and he either searches for
a companion or goes there, he commits an offense of wrong
conduct. If he touches them, he commits an offense of wrong
conduct. If he makes them stir, he commits a serious offense. If
he moves them from their base, he commits an offense entailing
expulsion.

If, intending to steal, he touches something that belongs there— 4.15.9
a twig, a creeper, or grass—having a value of five *māsaka* coins
or more, he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If he makes

it stir, he commits a serious offense. If he moves it from its base, he commits an offense entailing expulsion.

4.16.2 **Water:** in a vessel, in a pond, or in a reservoir. If, intending to steal, he touches it, he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If he makes it stir, he commits a serious offense. If he moves it from its base, he commits an offense entailing expulsion.

4.16.6 If, intending to steal, he puts his own vessel into the container holding the water, and he touches water having a value of five *māsaka* coins or more, he commits an offense of wrong conduct.³¹ If he makes it stir, he commits a serious offense. If he puts it into his own vessel, he commits an offense entailing expulsion.

4.16.9 If he breaks the embankment, he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If, after breaking the embankment, he allows water to escape that has a value of five *māsaka* coins or more, he commits an offense entailing expulsion. If he allows water to escape that has a value of more than one *māsaka* but less than five *māsakas*, he commits a serious offense. If he allows water to escape that has a value of one *māsaka* or less, he commits an offense of wrong conduct.

Tooth cleaner: either ready for use or not. If, intending to steal, he touches what has a value of five *māsaka* coins or more, he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If he makes it stir, he commits a serious offense. If he moves it from its base, he commits an offense entailing expulsion.

Forest tree: whatever useful tree is owned by people. If, intending to steal, he fells it, then for each blow he commits an offense of wrong conduct. When one blow remains before the tree is felled, he commits a serious offense. When the last blow is completed, he commits an offense entailing expulsion.

4.19.2 **Goods being carried:** the goods of another are being carried. If, intending to steal, he touches them, he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If he makes them stir, he commits a serious

31. The Pali text just says “into”, and I have added “the container holding the water” for clarity.

offense. If he moves them from their base, he commits an offense entailing expulsion.

If he thinks, “Together with the carrier I’ll carry off the goods,” 4.19.6 and he makes the carrier move one foot, he commits a serious offense. If he makes him move the second foot, he commits an offense entailing expulsion.

If he thinks, “I’ll take the fallen goods,” and he makes them fall, 4.19.8 he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If, intending to steal, he touches fallen goods having a value of five *māsaka* coins or more, he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If he makes them stir, he commits a serious offense. If he moves them from their base, he commits an offense entailing expulsion.

Deposit: goods deposited with a monk. If the monk is told, “Give me my goods,” and he says, “I won’t get them for you,” he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If he evokes doubt in the mind of the owner as to whether he will get them back, he commits a serious offense.³² If the owner thinks, “He won’t give them to me,” and he gives up the effort of getting them back, he commits an offense entailing expulsion. If he resorts to the law and defeats the owner, he commits an offense entailing expulsion. If he resorts to the law but is defeated, he commits a serious offense.

Customs station: it is established by a king in a mountain-pass, 4.21.2 at a ford in a river, or at the gateway of a village so that tax can be collected from any person passing through. If, intending to steal and having entered the customs station, he touches goods that have a tax value to the king of five *māsaka* coins or more, he commits an offense of wrong conduct.³³ If he makes them stir,

32. The Pali text just says that he evokes doubt in the mind of the owner, *sāmikassa vimatiṃ uppādeti*. That the doubt refers to the possibility of getting the goods back is supplied from the commentary. Sp 1.112: “*Dassati nu kho me no”ti sāmiko vimatiṃ uppādeti*, “He evokes doubt in the mind of the owner in this way, ‘Will he give it or not?’”

33. Although not explicitly stated in the Canonical text, the commentary confirms that the value meant is the tax value. Sp 1.113: *Rājaggaṃ bhaṇḍanti*:

he commits a serious offense. If he goes beyond the customs station with one foot, he commits a serious offense. If he goes beyond the customs station with the second foot, he commits an offense entailing expulsion.

4.21.8 If, standing within the customs station, he makes the goods fall outside the customs station, he commits an offense entailing expulsion.

4.21.9 If he avoids the customs station altogether, he commits an offense of wrong conduct.

4.22.2 **Creature:** a human being is what is meant. If, intending to steal, he touches the person, he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If he makes the person stir, he commits a serious offense. If he moves the person from their base, he commits an offense entailing expulsion.

4.22.6 If he thinks, “I’ll take the person away on foot,” and he makes them move the first foot, he commits a serious offense. If he makes them move the second foot, he commits an offense entailing expulsion.

Footless: snakes and fish. If, intending to steal, he touches what has a value of five *māsaka* coins or more, he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If he makes it stir, he commits a serious offense. If he moves it from its base, he commits an offense entailing expulsion.

4.24.2 **Two-footed:** humans and birds. If, intending to steal, he touches it, he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If he makes it stir, he commits a serious offense. If he moves it from its base, he commits an offense entailing expulsion.

4.24.6 If he thinks, “I’ll take it away on foot,” and he makes it move the first foot, he commits a serious offense. If he makes it move the second foot, he commits an offense entailing expulsion.

rājārahaṃ bhaṇḍaṃ; yato rañño pañcamāsakaṃ vā atirekapañcamāsakaṃ vā agghanakaṃ suñkaṃ dātabbaṃ hoti, taṃ bhaṇḍanti attho, “Goods having a value to the king means: goods having a worth to the king. The meaning is: the goods for which a tax having a value of five *māsaka* coins or more is to be given to the king.”

Four-footed: elephants, horses, camels, cattle, donkeys, domesticated animals. If, intending to steal, he touches it, he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If he makes it stir, he commits a serious offense. If he moves it from its base, he commits an offense entailing expulsion. 4.25.2

If he thinks, “I’ll take it away on foot,” and he makes it move the first foot, he commits a serious offense. If he makes it move the second foot, he commits a serious offense. If he makes it move the third foot, he commits a serious offense. If he makes it move the fourth foot, he commits an offense entailing expulsion. 4.25.6

Many-footed: scorpions, centipedes, caterpillars. If, intending to steal, he touches what has a value of five *māsaka* coins or more, he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If he makes it stir, he commits a serious offense. If he moves it from its base, he commits an offense entailing expulsion. 4.26.2

If he thinks, “I’ll take it away on foot,” and he makes it move, he commits a serious offense for each leg that moves. When the last leg moves, he commits an offense entailing expulsion. 4.26.6

A spy: having spied out goods. If he describes them, saying, “Steal such-and-such goods,” he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If he steals those goods, there is an offense entailing expulsion for both.

A protector of goods: a monk who guards goods that have been brought to him. If, intending to steal, he touches what has a value of five *māsaka* coins or more, he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If he makes them stir, he commits a serious offense. If he moves them from their base, he commits an offense entailing expulsion.

Mutually agreed stealing: a number have agreed together. If only one steals the goods, there is an offense entailing expulsion for all of them.

Acting by arrangement: one makes an arrangement for before the meal or for after the meal, for the night or for the day. If he says, “Steal those goods according to this arrangement,” he com-

mits an offense of wrong conduct. If the other steals those goods according to that arrangement, there is an offense entailing expulsion for both. If he steals those goods before or after the time of the arrangement, there is no offense for the instigator, but an offense entailing expulsion for the thief.

Making a sign: he makes a sign. If he says, “When I wink, at that sign steal the goods,” or, “When I raise an eyebrow, at that sign steal the goods,” or, “When I nod, at that sign steal the goods,” he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If, at that sign, the other steals the goods, there is an offense entailing expulsion for both. If he steals the goods before or after the sign, there is no offense for the instigator, but an offense entailing expulsion for the thief.

Permutations part 2

- 5.1.1 If a monk tells a monk, “Steal such-and-such goods,” he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If the other monk steals them, thinking they are the ones he was told to steal, there is an offense entailing expulsion for both.
- 5.1.4 If a monk tells a monk, “Steal such-and-such goods,” he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If the other monk steals other goods, thinking they are the ones he was told to steal, there is no offense for the instigator, but there is an offense entailing expulsion for the thief.
- 5.1.9 If a monk tells a monk, “Steal such-and-such goods,” he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If the other monk steals them, thinking they are other than what he was told to steal, there is an offense entailing expulsion for both.
- 5.1.13 If a monk tells a monk, “Steal such-and-such goods,” he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If the other monk steals other goods, thinking they are other than what he was told to steal, there is no offense for the instigator, but there is an offense entailing expulsion for the thief.

If a monk tells a monk, “Tell so-and-so to tell so-and-so to steal such-and-such goods,” he commits an offense of wrong conduct. In telling the next person, there is an offense of wrong conduct. If the potential thief agrees, there is a serious offense for the instigator. If he steals those goods, there is an offense entailing expulsion for all of them. 5.2.1

If a monk tells a monk, “Tell so-and-so to tell so-and-so to steal such-and-such goods,” he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If the other monk tells someone else than the one he was told to tell, he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If the potential thief agrees, there is an offense of wrong conduct. If he steals those goods, there is no offense for the instigator, but there is an offense entailing expulsion for the messenger and for the thief. 5.2.7

If a monk tells a second monk, “Steal such-and-such goods,” he commits an offense of wrong conduct. He goes, but returns, saying, “I’m not able to steal those goods.” If the first monk tells him again, “When you’re able, then steal those goods,” he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If the second monk steals the goods, there is an offense entailing expulsion for both. 5.3.1

If a monk tells a second monk, “Steal such-and-such goods,” he commits an offense of wrong conduct. He then he regrets it, but does not say, “Don’t steal them.” If the second monk then steals those goods, there is an offense entailing expulsion for both. 5.4.1

If a monk tells a second monk, “Steal such-and-such goods,” he commits an offense of wrong conduct. He then regrets it and says, “Don’t steal them.” If the second monk replies, “I’ve been told by you to do so,” and he then steals those goods, there is no offense for the instigator, but an offense entailing expulsion for the thief. 5.4.8

If a monk tells a second monk, “Steal such-and-such goods,” he commits an offense of wrong conduct. He then regrets it and says, “Don’t steal them.” If the second monk replies, “Fine,” and desists, there is no offense for either. 5.4.16

Permutations part 3

- 6.1.1 For one who steals there is an offense entailing expulsion when five factors are fulfilled: it is the possession of another; he perceives it as such; it is a valuable possession worth five *māsaka* coins or more; he has the intention to steal it; if he touches it, he commits an offense of wrong conduct; if he makes it stir, he commits a serious offense; if he moves it from its base, he commits an offense entailing expulsion.
- 6.1.9 For one who steals there is a serious offense when five factors are fulfilled: it is the possession of another; he perceives it as such; it is an ordinary possession worth more than one *māsaka* coin, but less than five; he has the intention to steal it; if he touches it, he commits an offense of wrong conduct; if he makes it stir, he commits an offense of wrong conduct; if he moves it from its base, he commits a serious offense.
- 6.1.17 For one who steals there is an offense of wrong conduct when five factors are fulfilled: it is the possession of another; he perceives it as such; it is an ordinary possession worth one *māsaka* coin or less; he has the intention to steal it; if he touches it, he commits an offense of wrong conduct; if he makes it stir, he commits an offense of wrong conduct; if he moves it from its base, he commits an offense of wrong conduct.
- 6.2.1 For one who steals there is an offense entailing expulsion when six factors are fulfilled: he does not perceive it as his own; he does not take it on trust; he does not borrow it; it is a valuable possession worth five *māsaka* coins or more; he has the intention to steal it; if he touches it, he commits an offense of wrong conduct; if he makes it stir, he commits a serious offense; if he moves it from its base, he commits an offense entailing expulsion.
- 6.2.10 For one who steals there is a serious offense when six factors are fulfilled: he does not perceive it as his own; he does not take it on trust; he does not borrow it; it is an ordinary possession worth more than one *māsaka* coin, but less than five; he has the intention to steal it; if he touches it, he commits an offense of wrong conduct;

if he makes it stir, he commits an offense of wrong conduct; if he moves it from its base, he commits a serious offense.

For one who steals there is an offense of wrong conduct when six 6.2.19 factors are fulfilled: he does not perceive it as his own; he does not take it on trust; he does not borrow it; it is an ordinary possession worth one *māsaka* coin or less; he has the intention to steal it; if he touches it, he commits an offense of wrong conduct; if he makes it stir, he commits an offense of wrong conduct; if he moves it from its base, he commits an offense of wrong conduct.

For one who steals there is an offense of wrong conduct when 6.3.1 five factors are fulfilled: it is not the possession of another; but he perceives it as the possession of another; it is a valuable possession worth five *māsaka* coins or more; he has the intention to steal it; if he touches it, he commits an offense of wrong conduct; if he makes it stir, he commits an offense of wrong conduct; if he moves it from its base, he commits an offense of wrong conduct.

For one who steals there is an offense of wrong conduct when 6.3.9 five factors are fulfilled: it is not the possession of another; but he perceives it as the possession of another; it is an ordinary possession worth more than one *māsaka* coin, but less than five; he has the intention to steal it; if he touches it, he commits an offense of wrong conduct; if he makes it stir, he commits an offense of wrong conduct; if he moves it from its base, he commits an offense of wrong conduct.

For one who steals there is an offense of wrong conduct when 6.3.17 five factors are fulfilled: it is not the possession of another; but he perceives it as the possession of another; it is an ordinary possession worth one *māsaka* coin or less; he has the intention to steal it; if he touches it, he commits an offense of wrong conduct; if he makes it stir, he commits an offense of wrong conduct; if he moves it from its base, he commits an offense of wrong conduct.

Non-offenses

- 6.4.1 There is no offense: if he perceives it as his own; if he takes it on trust;³⁴ if he borrows it; if it is the possession of a ghost; if it is the possession of an animal; if he perceives it as discarded; if he is insane; if he is deranged; if he is overwhelmed by pain; if he is the first offender.

The first section for recitation on stealing is finished.

Summary verses of case studies

- 6.4.14 “Five are told with dyers,
 And four with bedspreads;
 Five with darkness,
 And five with a carrier.
- 6.4.18 Five are told with ways of speaking,
 Another two with wind;
 Fresh, drawing lots,
 With the sauna it is ten.
- 6.4.22 Five are told with animal kills,
 And five on without proper reason;
 Boiled rice during a shortage of food, and meat,
 Pastries, cookies, cakes.
- 6.4.26 Six on requisites, and bag,
 Mattress, bamboo, on not coming out;
 And taking fresh food on trust,
 Another two on perceiving as one’s own.
- 6.4.30 Seven on ‘We didn’t steal,’
 And seven where they did steal;
 Seven where they stole from the Sangha,
 Another two with flowers.
- 6.4.34 And three on taking messages,
 Three on taking gems past;
 And pigs, deer, fish,
 And he set a vehicle in motion.

34. This refers to a situation where you have an agreement with a close friend that you may take their belongings on trust. The conditions for taking on trust are set out at Kd 8:19.1.5.

Two on a piece, two on wood, 6.4.38
Discarded, two on water;
Step by step, by arrangement,
Another did not amount to it.

Four handfuls at Sāvathī, 6.4.42
Two on kills, two about grass;
Seven where they divided the belongings of the Sangha,
And seven on non-owners.

Wood, water, clay, two on grass, 6.4.46
Seven on stealing the Sangha's bedding;
And one should not take away what has an owner,
One may borrow what has an owner.

Campā, and in Rājagaha, 6.4.50
And Ajjuka at Vesālī;
And Benares, Kosambī,
And Sāgalā with Dalhika."

Case studies

On one occasion the monks from the group of six went to the dyers 7.1.1
and stole their collection of cloth. They became anxious, thinking,
"The Buddha has laid down a training rule. Could it be that we've
committed an offense entailing expulsion?" They told the Buddha.
"Monks, you have committed an offense entailing expulsion."

On one occasion a monk went to the dyers, saw a valuable cloth, 7.2.1
and had the intention to steal it. He became anxious ... "The Bud-
dha has laid down a training rule. Could it be that I've committed
an offense entailing expulsion?" He told the Buddha. "There's no
offense for the arising of a thought."

On one occasion a monk went to the dyers, saw a valuable cloth, 7.2.7
and touched it, intending to steal it. He became anxious ... "There's
no offense entailing expulsion, but there's an offense of wrong
conduct."

On one occasion a monk went to the dyers, saw a valuable 7.2.11
cloth, and made it stir, intending to steal it. He became anxious

... “There’s no offense entailing expulsion, but there’s a serious offense.”

7.2.15 On one occasion a monk went to the dyers, saw a valuable cloth, and moved it from its base, intending to steal it. He became anxious ... “You have committed an offense entailing expulsion.”

7.3.1 On one occasion an alms-collecting monk saw a valuable bedspread and had the intention to steal it. ... “There’s no offense for the arising of a thought.” ... and touched it, intending to steal it. ... “There’s no offense entailing expulsion, but there’s an offense of wrong conduct.” ... and made it stir, intending to steal it. ... “There’s no offense entailing expulsion, but there’s a serious offense.” ... and moved it from its base, intending to steal it. ... “You have committed an offense entailing expulsion.”

7.4.1 On one occasion a monk saw some goods during the day. He took note of them with the thought, “I’ll steal them at night.” And he stole them, thinking they were the ones he had seen. ... But he stole other goods, thinking they were the ones he had seen. ... And he stole them, thinking they were other than the ones he had seen. ... But he stole other goods, thinking they were other than the ones he had seen. He became anxious ... “You have committed an offense entailing expulsion.”

7.4.9 On one occasion a monk saw some goods during the day. He took note of them with the thought, “I’ll steal them at night.” But he stole his own goods, thinking they were the ones he had seen. He became anxious ... “There’s no offense entailing expulsion, but there’s an offense of wrong conduct.”

7.5.1 On one occasion a monk who was carrying the goods of another on his head touched the load, intending to steal it. ... “There’s no offense entailing expulsion, but there’s an offense of wrong conduct.” ... made it stir, intending to steal it. ... “There’s no offense entailing expulsion, but there’s a serious offense.” ... lowered it onto his shoulder, intending to steal it. ... “You have committed an offense entailing expulsion.” ...

touched the load on the shoulder, intending to steal it. ... 7.5.4
 “There’s no offense entailing expulsion, but there’s an offense of wrong conduct.” ... made it stir, intending to steal it. ... “There’s no offense entailing expulsion, but there’s a serious offense.” ... lowered it onto his hip, intending to steal it. ... “You have committed an offense entailing expulsion.” ...

touched the load on the hip, intending to steal it. ... 7.5.7
 “There’s no offense entailing expulsion, but there’s an offense of wrong conduct.” ... made it stir, intending to steal it. ... “There’s no offense entailing expulsion, but there’s a serious offense.” ... took hold of it with his hand, intending to steal it. ... “You have committed an offense entailing expulsion.” ...

placed the load in his hand on the ground, intending to steal 7.5.10
 it. ... “You have committed an offense entailing expulsion.” ... picked it up from the ground, intending to steal it. ... “You have committed an offense entailing expulsion.” ...

On one occasion a monk spread out his robe outside and entered 7.6.1
 his dwelling. A second monk, thinking, “Let me look after it,” put it away. The first monk came out of his dwelling and asked the monks, “Who’s stolen my robe?” The second monk said, “I’ve ‘stolen’ it.” The first monk took hold of him and said, “You’re not a monastic anymore!” The second monk became anxious ... He told the Buddha. “What were you thinking?”

“Sir, it was just a way of speaking.” 7.6.9

“If it was just a way of speaking, there’s no offense.” 7.6.10

On one occasion a monk placed his robe on a bench ... ³⁵ placed 7.6.11
 his sitting mat on a bench ... put his almsbowl under a bench and entered his dwelling. A second monk, thinking, “Let me look after it,” put it away. The first monk came out and asked the monks, “Who’s stolen my bowl?” The second monk said, “I’ve ‘stolen’ it.” The first monk took hold of him and said, “You’re not a monastic

35. I have added one set of ellipses points at the end of the sentence. They seem to have been omitted by mistake from the Pali.

anymore!” The second monk became anxious ... “If it was just a way of speaking, there’s no offense.”

7.6.20 On one occasion a nun spread out her robe on a fence and entered her dwelling. A second nun, thinking, “Let me look after it,” put it away. The first nun came out and asked the nuns, “Venerables, who’s stolen my robe?” The second nun said, “I’ve ‘stolen’ it.” The first nun took hold of her and said, “You’re not a monastic anymore!” The second nun became anxious ... She told the nuns, who in turn told the monks, who in turn told the Buddha. ... “If it was just a way of speaking, there’s no offense.”

7.7.1 On one occasion a monk saw a wrap garment blown up by a whirlwind. He took hold of it, thinking, “I’ll give it to the owners.” But the owners accused him, saying, “You’re not a monastic anymore!” He became anxious ... “What were you thinking, monk?”

7.7.6 “I didn’t intend to steal it, Sir.”

7.7.7 “There’s no offense for one who doesn’t intend to steal.”

7.7.8 On one occasion a monk took hold of a turban that had been blown up by a whirlwind, intending to steal it before the owners found out. The owners accused him, saying, “You’re not a monastic anymore!” He became anxious ... “You have committed an offense entailing expulsion.”

7.8.1 On one occasion a monk went to a charnel ground and took the rags from a fresh corpse. The ghost was still dwelling in that body, and it said to the monk, “Sir, don’t take my wrap.” The monk took no notice and left. Then the corpse got up and followed behind that monk. The monk entered his dwelling and closed the door, and the corpse collapsed right there. He became anxious ... “There’s no offense entailing expulsion.

But a monk shouldn’t take rags from a fresh corpse. If he does, he commits an offense of wrong conduct.”

7.9.1 On one occasion robe-cloth belonging to the Sangha was being distributed. A monk disregarded the draw and took the robe-cloth,

intending to steal it.³⁶ He became anxious ... “You have committed an offense entailing expulsion.”

On one occasion when Venerable Ānanda was in a sauna, he 7.10.1
thought the sarong of another monk was his own and put it on.
The other monk said, “Ānanda, why did you put on my sarong?”

“I thought it was my own.” 7.10.4

They told the Buddha. “There’s no offense for one who perceives 7.10.5
it as his own.”

On one occasion a number of monks were descending from the 7.11.1
Vulture Peak when they saw the remains of a lion’s kill. They had
it cooked and ate it. They became anxious ... “There’s no offense
when it’s the remains of a lion’s kill.”

On one occasion a number of monks were descending from the 7.11.4
Vulture Peak when they saw the remains of a tiger’s kill ... saw the
remains of a panther’s kill ... saw the remains of a hyena’s kill ...
saw the remains of a wolf’s kill. They had it cooked and ate it. They
became anxious ... “There’s no offense when it’s the possession of
an animal.”

On one occasion, when rice belonging to the Sangha was be- 7.12.1
ing distributed, a monk said without grounds, “Please give me a
portion for one more,” and he took it away. He became anxious
... “There’s no offense entailing expulsion, but there’s an offense
entailing confession for lying in full awareness.”

On one occasion, when fresh food belonging to the Sangha was 7.12.6
being distributed ... when pastries belonging to the Sangha were
being distributed ... when sugarcane belonging to the Sangha was
being distributed ... when gaub fruits belonging to the Sangha were
being distributed, a monk said without grounds, “Please give me
a portion for one more,” and he took it away. He became anxious
... “There’s no offense entailing expulsion, but there’s an offense
entailing confession for lying in full awareness.”

36. “Disregarded the draw” renders *kusaṃ saṅkāmetvā*. *Kusa*-grass was used to draw lots when distributing robe-cloth, see Kd 8:9.4.4.

- 7.13.1 On one occasion during a shortage of food, a monk entered a rice kitchen and took a bowlful of boiled rice, intending to steal it. He became anxious ... “You have committed an offense entailing expulsion.”
- 7.13.4 On one occasion during a shortage of food, a monk entered a slaughterhouse and took a bowlful of meat, intending to steal it. He became anxious ... “You have committed an offense entailing expulsion.”
- 7.13.7 On one occasion during a shortage of food, a monk entered a bakery and took a bowlful of pastries, intending to steal it. ... took a bowlful of cookies, intending to steal it. ... took a bowlful of cakes, intending to steal it. He became anxious ... “You have committed an offense entailing expulsion.”
- 7.14.1 On one occasion a certain monk saw a requisite during the day. He took note of it with the thought, “I’ll steal it at night.” He then stole it, thinking it was what he had seen ... He then stole something else, thinking it was what he had seen ... He then stole it, thinking it was something other than what he had seen ... He then stole something else, thinking it was something other than what he had seen. He became anxious ... “You have committed an offense entailing expulsion.”
- 7.14.9 On one occasion a certain monk saw a requisite during the day. He took note of it with the thought, “I’ll steal it at night.” But he stole his own requisite, thinking it was what he had seen. He became anxious ... “There’s no offense entailing expulsion, but there’s an offense of wrong conduct.”
- 7.15.1 On one occasion a monk saw a bag on a bench. He thought, “If I take it from there I shall be expelled,” and so he took it by moving the bench. He became anxious ... “You have committed an offense entailing expulsion.”
- 7.16.1 On one occasion a monk took a mattress from the Sangha, intending to steal it. He became anxious ... “You have committed an offense entailing expulsion.”

On one occasion a monk took a robe from a bamboo robe rack, 7.17.1
intending to steal it. He became anxious ... “You have committed
an offense entailing expulsion.”

On one occasion a monk stole a robe in a dwelling. He thought, 7.18.1
“If I come out from here, I shall be expelled,” and he remained in
that dwelling. They told the Buddha. “Whether that fool comes
out or not, he has committed an offense entailing expulsion.”

At one time there were two monks who were friends. One of 7.19.1
them went into the village for almsfood. When fresh food belong-
ing to the Sangha was being distributed, the second monk took
his friend’s portion. Taking it on trust, he ate it. When he found
out about this, the first monk accused him, saying, “You’re not a
monastic anymore!” He became anxious ...

“What were you thinking, monk?” 7.19.8

“I took it on trust, Sir.” 7.19.9

“There’s no offense for one who takes on trust.” 7.19.10

On one occasion a number of monks were making robes. When 7.20.1
fresh food belonging to the Sangha was being distributed, they took
their shares and put them aside. A certain monk ate another monk’s
portion, thinking it was his own. When the other monk found
out about this, he accused him, saying, “You’re not a monastic
anymore!” He became anxious ...

“What were you thinking, monk?” 7.20.7

“I thought it was my own, Sir.” 7.20.8

“There’s no offense for one who perceives it as his own.” 7.20.9

On one occasion a number of monks were making robes. When 7.20.10
fresh food belonging to the Sangha was being distributed, they
brought a certain monk’s share in another monk’s almsbowl and
put it aside. The monk who was the owner of the bowl ate the
food, thinking it was his own. When he found out about this, the
owner of the food accused him ... “There’s no offense for one who
perceives it as his own.”

On one occasion mango thieves cut down some mangoes, col- 7.21.1
lected them in a bundle, and left. The owners pursued them. When

they saw the owners, the thieves dropped the bundle and ran away. Some monks perceived those mangoes as discarded, had them offered, and ate them. But the owners accused them, saying, “You’re not monastics anymore!” They became anxious ... They told the Buddha.

7.21.9 “What were you thinking, monks?”

7.21.10 “Sir, we perceived them as discarded.”

7.21.11 “There’s no offense for one who perceives something as discarded.”

7.21.12 On one occasion black plum thieves ... bread-fruit thieves ... jack-fruit thieves ... palm-fruit thieves ... sugarcane thieves ... gaub fruit thieves picked some fruit, collected them in a bundle, and left. The owners pursued them. When they saw the owners, the thieves dropped the bundle and ran away. Some monks perceived those gaub fruit as discarded, had them offered, and ate them. But the owners accused them, saying, “You’re not monastics anymore!” They became anxious ... “There’s no offense for one who perceives something as discarded.”

7.22.1 On one occasion mango thieves cut down some mangoes, collected them in a bundle, and left. The owners pursued them. When they saw the owners, the thieves dropped the bundle and ran away. Some monks ate them, intending to steal them before the owners found them. The owners accused those monks, saying, “You’re not monastics anymore!” They became anxious ... “You have committed an offense entailing expulsion.”

7.22.9 On one occasion black plum thieves ... bread-fruit thieves ... jack-fruit thieves ... palm-fruit thieves ... sugarcane thieves ... gaub fruit thieves picked some fruit, collected them in a bundle, and left. The owners pursued them. When they saw the owners, the thieves dropped the bundle and ran away. Some monks ate them, intending to steal them before the owners found them. The owners accused those monks, saying, “You’re not monastics anymore!” They became anxious ... “You have committed an offense entailing expulsion.”

On one occasion a monk took a mango from the Sangha, intending to steal it. ... a black plum ... a bread-fruit ... a jack-fruit ... a palm-fruit ... a sugarcane ... a gaub fruit from the Sangha, intending to steal it. He became anxious ... “You have committed an offense entailing expulsion.” 7.23.1

On one occasion a monk went to a garden and took a cut flower worth five *māsaka* coins, intending to steal it. He became anxious ... “You have committed an offense entailing expulsion.” 7.24.1

On one occasion a monk went to a garden, picked a flower worth five *māsaka* coins, and took it away, intending to steal it. He became anxious ... “You have committed an offense entailing expulsion.” 7.24.4

On one occasion a certain monk who was going to the village said to another monk, “I can take a message to the family that supports you.”³⁷ He went there and brought back a wrap garment that he used himself. When the other monk found out about this, he accused him, saying, “You’re not a monastic anymore!” He became anxious ... “There’s no offense entailing expulsion.” 7.25.1

But you shouldn’t say, ‘I can take a message.’ If you do, you commit an offense of wrong conduct.”

On one occasion a certain monk was going to the village. Another monk said to him, “Please take a message to the family that supports me.” He went there and brought back a pair of wrap garments. He used one himself and gave the other to the other monk. When the other monk found out about this, he accused him, saying, “You’re not a monastic anymore!” He became anxious ... “There’s no offense entailing expulsion.” 7.25.10

But you shouldn’t say, ‘Please take a message.’ If you do, you commit an offense of wrong conduct.”

37. The unusual expression *vutto vajjemi* recurs in the next two cases. *Vajjemi* is apparently an optative formation from *vadāmi*, “I could say”, whereas *vutto* is the past participle of *vuccati*, “spoken to”, the overall meaning being, “I, (having been) spoken to, could say to the family that supports you.” The idea conveyed seems to be the taking of a message. Sp 1.150: *Tava vacanena vadāmīti attho*, “The meaning is, ‘I will speak your statement.’”

7.25.20 On one occasion a monk who was going to the village said to another monk, “I can take a message to the family that supports you.” He replied, “Please do.” He went there and brought back an *ālḥaka* measure of ghee, a *tulā* measure of sugar, and a *doṇa* measure of husked rice, which he ate himself.³⁸ When the other monk found out about this, he accused him, saying, “You’re not a monastic anymore!” He became anxious ... “There’s no offense entailing expulsion.

But you shouldn’t say, ‘I can take a message;’ nor should you say, ‘Please do.’ If you do, you commit an offense of wrong conduct.”

7.26.1 At one time a man who was traveling with a monk was carrying a valuable gem. When the man saw a customs station, he put the gem into the monk’s bag without his knowing. When they had gone past the customs station, he retrieved it. The monk was anxious ...

7.26.4 “What were you thinking, monk?”

7.26.5 “I didn’t know, Sir.”

7.26.6 “There’s no offense for one who doesn’t know.”

7.26.7 At one time a man who was traveling with a monk was carrying a valuable gem. When the man saw a customs station, he pretended to be sick, and gave his own bag to the monk. When they had passed the customs station, he said to the monk, “Please give me my bag, Sir, I’m not sick.”

7.26.11 “Then why did you say so?”

7.26.12 The man told the monk. He became anxious ... “What were you thinking, monk?” “I didn’t know, Sir.” “There’s no offense for one who doesn’t know.”

7.26.17 At one time a monk was traveling with a group. A man bribed that monk by giving him food. Seeing a customs station, he gave the monk a valuable gem, saying, “Sir, please take this gem past the customs,” which the monk did. He became anxious ... “You have committed an offense entailing expulsion.”

38. According to ACMC, p.18, one *doṇa* is equivalent to 64 handfuls.

On one occasion a monk, feeling compassion, released a pig 7.27.1
trapped in a snare. He became anxious ... “What were you think-
ing, monk?”

“I was motivated by compassion, Sir.” 7.27.4

“There’s no offense for one who is motivated by compassion.” 7.27.5

On one occasion a monk released a pig trapped in a snare, in- 7.27.6
tending to steal it before the owners found it. He became anxious
... “You have committed an offense entailing expulsion.”

On one occasion a monk, feeling compassion, released a deer 7.27.10
trapped in a snare. ... “There’s no offense for one who is motivated
by compassion.” ... released a deer trapped in a snare, intending
to steal it before the owners found it. ... “You have committed
an offense entailing expulsion.” ... feeling compassion, released
fish trapped in a fish-net ... “There’s no offense for one who is
motivated by compassion.” ... released fish trapped in a fish-net,
intending to steal them before the owners found them. He became
anxious ... “You have committed an offense entailing expulsion.”

On one occasion a monk saw some goods in a vehicle. He 7.28.1
thought, “If I take them from there, I’ll be expelled.” So he took
them by setting the vehicle in motion. He became anxious ... “You
have committed an offense entailing expulsion.”

On one occasion a monk seized a piece of meat picked up by a 7.29.1
hawk, intending to give it to the owners. But the owners accused
him, saying, “You’re not a monastic anymore!” He became anxious
... “There’s no offense for one who doesn’t intend to steal.”

On one occasion a monk seized a piece of meat picked up by a 7.29.7
hawk, intending to steal it before the owners found out. The owners
accused him, saying, “You’re not a monastic anymore!” He became
anxious ... “You have committed an offense entailing expulsion.”

At one time some men made a raft that they put on the river 7.30.1
Aciravatī. Because the binding ropes snapped, the sticks were scat-
tered about. Some monks removed them from the water, perceiv-
ing them as discarded. The owners accused those monks, saying,

“You’re not monastics anymore!” They became anxious ... “There’s no offense for one who perceives something as discarded.”

7.30.8 At one time some men made a raft, which they put on the river Aciravati. Because the binding ropes snapped, the sticks were scattered about. Some monks removed them from the water, intending to steal them before the owners found them. The owners accused those monks, saying, “You’re not monastics anymore!” They became anxious ... “You have committed an offense entailing expulsion.”

7.31.1 On one occasion a cowherd hung his wrap garment on a tree and went to relieve himself. A monk thought it had been discarded and took it. The cowherd accused him, saying, “You’re not a monastic anymore!” He became anxious ... “There’s no offense for one who perceives something as discarded.”

7.32.1 On one occasion, a wrap garment that had escaped from the hands of a dyer stuck to a monk’s foot as he was crossing a river. The monk took hold of it, thinking, “I’ll give it to its owners.” But the owners accused him, saying, “You’re not a monastic anymore!” He became anxious ... “There’s no offense for one who doesn’t intend to steal.”

7.32.7 On one occasion, a wrap garment that had escaped from the hands of a dyer stuck to a monk’s foot as he was crossing a river. The monk took hold of it, intending to steal it before the owners found it. The owners accused him, saying, “You’re not a monastic anymore!” He became anxious ... “You have committed an offense entailing expulsion.”

7.33.1 On one occasion a monk saw a pot of ghee and ate it little by little. He became anxious ... “There’s no offense entailing expulsion, but there’s an offense of wrong conduct.”

7.34.1 At one time a number of monks made an arrangement and then left, thinking, “We’ll steal these goods.” One of them stole the goods. The others said, “We’re not expelled. He who stole them is expelled.” They told the Buddha. “You’ve all committed an offense entailing expulsion.”

At one time a number of monks made an arrangement, stole some goods, and shared them out. Each one of them received a share worth less than five *māsaka* coins. They said, “We’re not expelled.” They told the Buddha. “You have committed an offense entailing expulsion.” 7.34.9

On one occasion when Sāvattthī was short of food, a monk took a handful of rice from a shopkeeper, intending to steal it. He became anxious ... “You have committed an offense entailing expulsion.” 7.35.1

On one occasion when Sāvattthī was short of food, a monk stole a handful of mung beans from a shopkeeper, intending to steal it. ... a handful of black gram ... a handful of sesame from a shopkeeper, intending to steal it. He became anxious ... “You have committed an offense entailing expulsion.” 7.35.4

At one time in the Dark Wood near Sāvattthī, thieves killed a cow, ate some of the flesh, put the remainder aside, and went away. Some monks had it offered and ate it, perceiving it as discarded. The thieves accused those monks, saying, “You’re not monastics anymore!” They became anxious ... “There’s no offense for one who perceives something as discarded.” 7.36.1

At one time in the Dark Wood near Sāvattthī, thieves killed a pig, ate some of the flesh, put the remainder aside, and went away. Some monks had it offered and ate it, perceiving it as discarded. The thieves accused those monks, saying, “You’re not monastics anymore!” They became anxious ... “There’s no offense for one who perceives something as discarded.” 7.36.7

On one occasion a monk went to a meadow and took cut grass worth five *māsaka* coins, intending to steal it. He became anxious ... “You have committed an offense entailing expulsion.” 7.37.1

On one occasion a monk went to a meadow, cut grass worth five *māsaka* coins, and took it away, intending to steal it. He became anxious ... “You have committed an offense entailing expulsion.” 7.37.4

On one occasion some newly arrived monks shared out the mangoes belonging to the Sangha and ate them. The resident monks 7.38.1

accused those monks, saying, “You’re not monastics anymore!” They became anxious ... They told the Buddha.

7.38.6 “What were you thinking, monks?”

7.38.7 “We thought they were meant for eating, Sir.”

7.38.8 “There’s no offense for one who thinks it is meant for eating.”

7.38.9 On one occasion some newly arrived monks shared out the black plums belonging to the Sangha ... the bread-fruit belonging to the Sangha ... the jack-fruit belonging to the Sangha ... the palm fruits belonging to the Sangha ... the sugarcane belonging to the Sangha ... the gaub fruit belonging to the Sangha and ate them. The resident monks accused those monks, saying, “You’re not monastics anymore!” They became anxious ... “There’s no offense for one who thinks it is meant for eating.”

7.39.1 On one occasion the keepers of a mango-grove gave a mango to some monks. The monks, thinking, “They have the authority to guard, but not to give away,” were afraid of wrongdoing and did not accept it. They told the Buddha. “There’s no offense if it’s a gift from a guardian.”

7.39.6 On one occasion the keepers of a black plum grove ... the keepers of a bread-fruit grove ... the keepers of a jack-fruit grove ... the keepers of a palm grove ... the keepers of a sugarcane field ... the keepers of a gaub fruit grove gave a gaub fruit to some monks. The monks, thinking, “They have the authority to guard, but not to give away,” were afraid of wrongdoing and did not accept it. They told the Buddha. “There’s no offense if it’s a gift from a guardian.”

7.40.1 On one occasion a monk borrowed a piece of wood belonging to the Sangha and used it to support the wall of his own dwelling. The monks accused him, saying, “You’re not a monastic anymore!” He became anxious and told the Buddha. “What were you thinking, monk?”

7.40.7 “I was borrowing it, Sir.”

7.40.8 “There’s no offense for one who is borrowing.”

7.41.1 On one occasion a monk took water from the Sangha, intending to steal it. ... took clay from the Sangha, intending to steal it.

... took a pile of grass from the Sangha, intending to steal it. ... He became anxious ... “You have committed an offense entailing expulsion.”

On one occasion a monk set fire to a pile of grass belonging to the Sangha, intending to steal. He became anxious ... “There’s no offense entailing expulsion, but there’s an offense of wrong conduct.” 7.41.6

On one occasion a monk took a bed from the Sangha, intending to steal it. ... He became anxious ... “You have committed an offense entailing expulsion.” 7.42.1

On one occasion a monk took a bench from the Sangha, intending to steal it ... a mattress from the Sangha ... a pillow from the Sangha ... a door from the Sangha ... a window from the Sangha ... took a rafter from the Sangha, intending to steal it. ... He became anxious ... “You have committed an offense entailing expulsion.” 7.42.4

At one time the monks used elsewhere the equipment belonging to a certain lay follower. That lay follower complained and criticized them, “How can the venerables use equipment where it doesn’t belong?” They told the Buddha. 7.43.1

“You shouldn’t use equipment where it doesn’t belong. If you do, you commit an offense of wrong conduct.”

Soon afterwards, being afraid of wrongdoing, the monks did not take any furniture to the observance-day hall or to meetings, and they sat down on the bare ground. They became dirty, as did their robes. They told the Buddha. 7.44.1

“I allow you to borrow.”

On one occasion at Campā, a nun who was a pupil of the nun Thullanandā went to a family that supported Thullanandā and said, “The Venerable wants to drink the triple pungent congee.” When it was ready, she took it away and ate it herself. When Thullanandā found out about this, she accused her, saying, “You’re not a monastic anymore!” She became anxious ... She then told the nuns, who in turn told the monks, who then told the Buddha. “There’s no 7.45.1

offense entailing expulsion, but there's an offense entailing confession for lying in full awareness."

7.45.12 On one occasion in Rājagaha, a nun who was a pupil of the nun Thullanandā went to a family that supported Thullanandā and said, "The Venerable wants a honey-ball." When it was ready, she took it away and ate it herself. When Thullanandā found out about this, she accused her, saying, "You're not a monastic anymore!" She became anxious ... "There's no offense entailing expulsion, but there's an offense entailing confession for lying in full awareness."

7.46.1 At that time there was a householder in Vesālī who was a supporter of Venerable Ajjuka and who had two children living with him, a son and a nephew. He said to Ajjuka,³⁹ "Sir, please assign my property to the one of these two boys who has faith and confidence."

7.46.4 It turned out that the householder's nephew had faith and confidence, and so Ajjuka assigned the property to him. He then established a household with that wealth and made a gift.

7.46.6 The householder's son then said to Venerable Ānanda, "Who is the father's heir, Venerable Ānanda, the son or the nephew?"

7.46.8 "The son is the father's heir."

7.46.9 "Sir, Venerable Ajjuka has assigned our wealth to our housemate."

7.46.10 "Venerable Ajjuka is not a monastic anymore."

7.46.11 Ajjuka then said to Ānanda, "Ānanda, please do a proper investigation."

7.46.13 On that occasion Venerable Upāli was siding with Ajjuka, and he said to Ānanda, "Ānanda, when one is asked by the owner to assign a property to so-and-so and one does as asked, what has one committed?"

7.46.16 "One hasn't committed anything, Sir, not even an act of wrong conduct."

39. Sp 1.158: *Etadavocāti gilāno hutvā avoca*, "'He said': he said it because of illness."

“Venerable Ajjuka was asked by the owner to assign his property to so-and-so, which he did. There’s no offense for Venerable Ajjuka.” 7.46.17

At that time a family in Benares that supported Venerable Pilindavaccha was harassed by criminals. Two of their children were kidnapped. Soon afterwards Pilindavaccha brought those children back by his supernormal powers and put them in a stilt house. 7.47.1

When people saw those children, they said, “This is the greatness of Venerable Pilindavaccha’s supernormal powers,” and they gained confidence in him. 7.47.4

But the monks complained and criticized him, “How could Venerable Pilindavaccha bring back children who had been kidnapped by criminals?” They told the Buddha. 7.47.7

“There’s no offense for someone who uses their supernormal powers.”

At that time the two monks Paṇḍaka and Kapila were friends. One was staying in a village and one at Kosambī. Then, while one of them was traveling from that village to Kosambī, he had to cross a river. As he did so, a lump of fat that had escaped from the hands of a pork-butcher stuck to his foot. He grabbed it, thinking, “I’ll give it to the owners.” But the owners accused him, saying, “You’re not a monastic anymore!” 7.48.1

Just then a woman cowherd who had seen him crossing said, “Come, Sir, have sexual intercourse.” Thinking he was no longer a monastic, he had sexual intercourse with her. 7.48.7

When he arrived at Kosambī, he told the monks, who in turn told the Buddha. “There’s no offense entailing expulsion for stealing, but there’s an offense entailing expulsion for having sexual intercourse.” 7.48.10

At that time a monk at Sāgalā who was a student of Venerable Daḷhika was plagued by lust. He stole a turban from a shopkeeper and said to Daḷhika, “Sir, I’m not a monastic anymore. I’ll disrobe.” 7.49.1

“But what have you done?” He told him. Venerable Daḷhika had the turban brought and valued. It was worth less than five *māsaka* 7.49.3

coins. Saying, “There’s no offense entailing expulsion,” he gave a teaching. And that monk was delighted.

The second offense entailing expulsion is finished.

The third training rule on expulsion

Manussaviggaha

Origin story

First sub-story

At one time the Buddha was staying in the hall with the peaked roof 1.1.1
in the Great Wood near Vesālī. At that time the Buddha spoke to the
monks in many ways about unattractiveness—he spoke in praise
of unattractiveness, of developing the mind in unattractiveness,
and of the attainment of unattractiveness.

The Buddha then addressed the monks: “Monks, I wish to go 1.1.3
into solitary retreat for half a month. No one should visit me except
the one who brings me almsfood.”

“Yes, Venerable Sir.” 1.1.6

Soon afterwards the monks reflected that the Buddha had 1.1.7
praised unattractiveness in many ways, and they devoted them-
selves to developing the mind in unattractiveness in its many
different facets. As a consequence, they became troubled by
their own bodies, ashamed of and disgusted with them. Just as a
young woman or man—someone fond of adornments, with freshly
washed hair—would be ashamed, humiliated, and disgusted if the
carcass of a snake, dog, or man was hung around her neck, just so
those monks were troubled by their own bodies. They took their
own lives, took the lives of one another, and they went to Migala-
ṇḍika, the monastic lookalike, and said, “Please kill us. You will get
our bowl and robes.” And hired for a bowl and robes, Migalaṇḍika
killed a number of monks. He then took his blood-stained knife to
the river Vaggumudā.

While washing it, he became anxious and remorseful, thinking, 1.1.17
“What the heck have I done? I’ve made so much demerit by killing
good monks.”

- 1.1.20 Then a god from the realm of the Lord of Death, coming across the water, said to Migalaṇḍika, “Well done, superior man, you’re truly fortunate. You’ve made much merit by helping across those who hadn’t yet crossed.”
- 1.1.23 Migalaṇḍika thought, “So it seems that I’m fortunate, that I’ve made much merit!” He then went from dwelling to dwelling, from yard to yard, and said, “Who hasn’t crossed yet? Who can I help across?” The monks who still had worldly attachments became fearful and terrified, with goosebumps all over. Only those who were free from worldly attachments were unaffected.
- 1.1.29 Then, on a single day, Migalaṇḍika killed one monk, two monks, three, four, five, ten, twenty, thirty, forty, fifty, even sixty monks.
- 1.2.1 At the end of that half-month, when the Buddha came out of seclusion, he said to Venerable Ānanda, “Ānanda, why is the Sangha of monks so reduced?”
- 1.2.3 Ānanda told him what had happened, adding, “Please give another instruction, Sir, for the Sangha of monks to become established in perfect insight.”
- 1.2.14 “Well then, Ānanda, bring together in the assembly hall all the monks who live supported by Vesālī.” “Yes.” When he had done so, he went to the Buddha and said, “Sir, the Sangha of monks is gathered. Please do as you think appropriate.”
- 1.2.19 The Buddha then went to the assembly hall, sat down on the prepared seat, and addressed the monks:
- 1.3.1 “Monks, when stillness by mindfulness of breathing is developed and cultivated, it is peaceful and sublime, and a satisfying state of bliss. And it removes bad and unwholesome qualities on the spot, whenever they arise. Just as a great, unseasonal storm in the last month of summer removes the dust and dirt from the air, just so, when stillness by mindfulness of breathing is developed and cultivated, it is peaceful and sublime, and it removes bad and unwholesome qualities on the spot, whenever they arise.
- 1.3.4 And how is stillness by mindfulness of breathing developed and cultivated in this way?

A monk sits down in the wilderness, at the foot of a tree, or in an empty hut. He crosses his legs, straightens his body, and sets up mindfulness in front of him. Simply mindful, he breathes in; mindful, he breathes out. 1.3.5

When he breathes in long, he knows it; and when he breathes out long, he knows that. When he breathes in short, he knows it; and when he breathes out short, he knows that. When breathing in, he trains in fully experiencing the breath; when breathing out, he trains in fully experiencing the breath.⁴⁰ When breathing in, he trains in calming the activity of the body; when breathing out, he trains in calming the activity of the body. 1.3.7

When breathing in, he trains in experiencing joy; when breathing out, he trains in experiencing joy. When breathing in, he trains in experiencing bliss; when breathing out, he trains in experiencing bliss. When breathing in, he trains in experiencing the activity of the mind; when breathing out, he trains in experiencing the activity of the mind. When breathing in, he trains in calming the activity of the mind; when breathing out, he trains in calming the activity of the mind. 1.3.11

When breathing in, he trains in experiencing the mind; when breathing out, he trains in experiencing the mind. When breathing in, he trains in gladdening the mind; when breathing out, he trains in gladdening the mind. When breathing in, he trains in stilling the mind; when breathing out, he trains in stilling the mind. When breathing in, he trains in freeing the mind; when breathing out, he trains in freeing the mind. 1.3.15

When breathing in, he trains in contemplating impermanence; when breathing out, he trains in contemplating impermanence. When breathing in, he trains in contemplating fading away; when 1.3.19

40. I have here translated *kāya* as breath in accordance with the usage in the *Ānāpānasati Sutta* (MN 118:24.6) where the breath is specifically said to be a body among bodies. Sp 1.165: *Sakalassa assāsakāyassa ādimajjhapariyosānam viditaṃ karonto pākaṭaṃ karonto “assasissāmi”ti sikkhati*, “He trains, ‘I will breathe in’, producing knowledge of and familiarity with the beginning, the middle, and the end of the whole body of the breath.”

breathing out, he trains in contemplating fading away. When breathing in, he trains in contemplating ending; when breathing out, he trains in contemplating ending. When breathing in, he trains in contemplating relinquishment; when breathing out, he trains in contemplating relinquishment.

1.3.23 Monks, when stillness by mindfulness of breathing is developed and cultivated like this, it is peaceful and sublime, and a satisfying state of bliss. And it removes bad and unwholesome qualities on the spot, whenever they arise.”

1.4.1 The Buddha then had the Sangha gathered and questioned the monks: “Is it true, monks, that there are monks who have taken their own lives, who have killed one another, and who have said to Migalaṇḍika, ‘Please kill us. You will get our bowl and robes’?”

1.4.4 “It’s true, Sir.”

1.4.5 The Buddha rebuked them, “Monks, it’s not suitable for these monks, it’s not proper, it’s not worthy of a monastic, it’s not allowable, it should not be done. How could those monks do this? This will affect people’s confidence ...” ... “And, monks, this training rule should be recited like this:

Preliminary ruling

‘If a monk intentionally kills a human being or seeks an instrument of death for them, he too is expelled and excluded from the community.’”

1.4.13 In this way the Buddha laid down this training rule for the monks.

Second sub-story

2.1 At one time a certain lay follower was sick. He had a beautiful and pleasant wife, who the monks from the group of six had fallen in love with. They said to each other, “If this lay follower recovers, we won’t get her. Come, let’s praise death to him.”

2.7 They then went to that lay follower and said, “You’ve done what’s good and wholesome; you’ve made a shelter against fear. You

haven't done anything bad; you haven't been greedy or immoral. So why carry on with this miserable and difficult life? Death is better for you. When you've passed away, you'll be reborn in a happy place, in heaven. There you'll be able to enjoy the pleasures of heaven."

That lay follower thought, "The venerables have spoken the truth, for I've done what's good and avoided what's bad, and after death I'll be reborn in a happy place." 2.14

From then on he ate various kinds of detrimental food and drank detrimental drinks, and as a consequence, he became very ill and died. 2.22

But his wife complained and criticized those monks, "These Sakyan monastics are shameless and immoral liars. They claim to have integrity, to be celibate and of good conduct, to be truthful, moral, and good. But they don't have the good character of a monastic or brahmin. They've lost the plot! They praised death to my husband, and as a result my husband is dead." 2.25

And other people complained and criticized them in the same way. 2.32

The monks heard the criticism of those people. Those monks who had few desires and a sense of conscience, who were contented, afraid of wrongdoing, and fond of the training, complained and criticized those monks, "How could they praise death to that lay follower?" 2.38

After rebuking those monks in many ways, they told the Buddha ... 2.41

"Is it true, monks, that you did this?" 2.42

"It's true, Sir." 2.43

The Buddha rebuked them, "Foolish men, it's not suitable, it's not proper, it's not worthy of a monastic, it's not allowable, it should not be done. How could you do this? This will affect people's confidence ..." ... "And so, monks, this training rule should be recited like this: 2.44

Final ruling

‘If a monk intentionally kills a human being or seeks an instrument of death for him or praises death or incites someone to die, saying,⁴¹ “My friend, what’s the point of this miserable and difficult life? Death is better for you than life!”—thinking and intending thus, if he praises death in many ways or incites someone to die—he too is expelled and excluded from the community.’”

Definitions

A: whoever ...

Monk: ... The monk who has been given the full ordination by a unanimous Sangha through a legal procedure consisting of one motion and three announcements that is irreversible and fit to stand—this sort of monk is meant in this case.

Intentionally: knowing, perceiving, having intended, having decided, he transgresses.

A human being: from the mind’s first appearance in the mother’s womb, from the first manifestation of consciousness, until the time of death: in between these—this is called “a human being”.

Kills: cuts off the life faculty, brings it to an end, interrupts its continuation.

Or seeks an instrument of death for him: a sword, a dagger, an arrow, a club, a rock, a knife, poison, or a rope.

Or praises death: he shows the drawbacks of living and speaks in praise of death.

Or incites someone to die: he says, “Kill yourself with a knife,” “Eat poison,” “Die by hanging yourself with a rope.”

My friend: this is a form of address.

What’s the point of this miserable and difficult life: Miserable life: the life of the poor is miserable compared to the life of the

41. “An instrument of death” renders *satthahāraka*. I follow Richard Gombrich’s interpretation of this word. See “The Mass Suicide of Monks in Discourse and Vinaya Literature”, by Analayo, *Journal of the Oxford Centre for Buddhist Studies*, 7: 11–55, 2014.

rich; the life of the impoverished is miserable compared to the life of the wealthy; the life of humans is miserable compared to the life of the gods.

Difficult life: the life of one whose hands are cut off, whose feet are cut off, whose hands and feet are cut off, whose ears are cut off, whose nose is cut off, whose ears and nose are cut off. Because of this sort of miserableness and this sort of difficult life, one says, “Death is better for you than life!”

Thinking: mind and thought are equivalent.

Intending: perceiving death, intending death, aiming at death.

In many ways: in various manners.

He praises death: he shows the drawbacks of living and speaks in praise of death, saying, “When you’ve passed away, you’ll be reborn in a happy destination, in heaven. There you’ll be able to enjoy the pleasures of heaven.”

Or incites someone to die: he says, “Kill yourself with a knife,” “Eat poison,” “Die by hanging yourself with a rope,” “Jump into a chasm,” “Jump into a pit,” “Jump off a cliff.”

He too: this is said with reference to the preceding offenses entailing expulsion.

Is expelled: just as an ordinary stone that has broken in half cannot be put back together again, so too is a monk who has intentionally killed a human being not an ascetic, not a Sakyan monastic. Therefore it is said, “he is expelled.”

Excluded from the community: Community: joint legal procedures, a joint recitation, the same training—this is called “community”. He does not take part in this—therefore it is called “excluded from the community”.

Permutations

Summary

Oneself, having made a determination, by messenger, by a series of messengers, by a messenger who does not follow instructions, by a messenger gone and returned again. 4.1.1

- 4.1.2 Not in private, but perceiving it as private. In private, but perceiving it as not private. Not in private, and perceiving it as not private. In private, and perceiving it as private.
- 4.1.6 He praises by means of the body. He praises by means of speech. He praises by means of both the body and speech. He praises by means of a messenger. He praises by means of writing.
- 4.1.11 A pit, a piece of furniture, placing near, tonic, arranging a sight, arranging a sound, arranging a smell, arranging a taste, arranging a touch, arranging a mental quality, information, instruction, acting by arrangement, making a sign.

Exposition

Oneself: one oneself kills by means of the body or by means of something connected to the body or by means of something released.

Having made a determination: having made a determination, he tells someone, “Hit thus, strike thus, kill thus.”

- 4.2.5 **By messenger:** If a monk tells a second monk, “Kill so-and-so,” he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If the second monk kills that person, thinking it is the one he was told to kill, there is an offense entailing expulsion for both.
- 4.2.7 If a monk tells a second monk, “Kill so-and-so,” he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If the second monk kills another person, thinking it is the one he was told to kill, there is no offense for the instigator, but there is an offense entailing expulsion for the murderer.
- 4.2.9 If a monk tells a second monk, “Kill so-and-so,” he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If the second monk kills that person, thinking it is someone other than the one he was told to kill, there is an offense entailing expulsion for both.
- 4.2.11 If a monk tells a second monk, “Kill so-and-so,” he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If the second monk kills another person, thinking it is someone other than the one he was told to

kill, there is no offense for the instigator, but there is an offense entailing expulsion for the murderer.

By a series of messengers: If a monk tells a second monk, “Tell so-and-so to tell so-and-so to kill so-and-so,” he commits an offense of wrong conduct. In telling the next person, there is an offense of wrong conduct. If the potential murderer agrees, there is a serious offense for the instigator. If he kills that person, there is an offense entailing expulsion for all of them.

By a messenger who does not follow instructions: If a monk tells a second monk, “Tell so-and-so to tell so-and-so to kill so-and-so,” he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If the other monk tells another person than the one he was told to tell, he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If the potential murderer agrees, there is an offense of wrong conduct. If he kills that person, there is no offense for the instigator, but there is an offense entailing expulsion for the messenger and for the murderer.

By a messenger gone and returned again: If a monk tells a 4.2.22
second monk, “Kill so-and-so,” he commits an offense of wrong conduct. He goes, but returns, saying, “I wasn’t able to kill them.” If the first monk tells him again, “When you’re able, then kill them,” he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If the second monk kills that person, there is an offense entailing expulsion for both.

If a monk tells a second monk, “Kill so-and-so,” he commits an 4.2.26
offense of wrong conduct. He then regrets it, but does not say, “Don’t kill them.” If the second monk then kills that person, there is an offense entailing expulsion for both.

If a monk tells a second monk, “Kill so-and-so,” he commits 4.2.29
an offense of wrong conduct. He then regrets and says, “Don’t kill them.” If the second monk replies, “I’ve been told by you to do so,” and then kills that person, there is no offense for the instigator, but there is an offense entailing expulsion for the murderer.

4.2.32 If a monk tells a second monk, “Kill so-and-so,” he commits an offense of wrong conduct. He then regrets it and says, “Don’t kill them.” If the second monk replies, “Fine,” and desists, there is no offense for either.

Not in private, but perceiving it as private: if he says aloud, “I wish so-and-so was killed,” he commits an offense of wrong conduct.

In private, but perceiving it as not private: if he says aloud, “I wish so-and-so was killed,” he commits an offense of wrong conduct.

Not in private, and perceiving it as not private: if he says aloud, “I wish so-and-so was killed,” he commits an offense of wrong conduct.

In private, and perceiving it as private: if he says aloud, “I wish so-and-so was killed,” he commits an offense of wrong conduct.

He praises by means of the body: if a monk makes a gesture with the body, indicating, “Whoever dies thus, receives wealth,” or, “Whoever dies thus, becomes famous,” or, “Whoever dies thus, goes to heaven,” he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If, because of that praise, the target person thinks, “I shall die,” and they do something painful, the monk commits a serious offense. If the person dies, the monk commits an offense entailing expulsion.

He praises by means of speech: if a monk says, “Whoever dies thus, receives wealth,” or, “Whoever dies thus, becomes famous,” or, “Whoever dies thus, goes to heaven,” he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If, because of that praise, the target person thinks, “I shall die,” and they do something painful, the monk commits a serious offense. If the person dies, the monk commits an offense entailing expulsion.

He praises by means of the body and speech: if a monk makes a gesture with the body and says, “Whoever dies thus, receives wealth,” or, “Whoever dies thus, becomes famous,” or, “Whoever dies thus, goes to heaven,” he commits an offense of wrong

conduct. If, because of that praise, the target person thinks, “I shall die,” and they do something painful, the monk commits a serious offense. If the person dies, the monk commits an offense entailing expulsion.

He praises by means of a messenger: if a monk gives instructions to a messenger, saying, “Whoever dies thus, receives wealth,” or, “Whoever dies thus, becomes famous,” or, “Whoever dies thus, goes to heaven,” he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If, after hearing the messenger’s instruction, the target person thinks, “I shall die,” and they do something painful, the monk commits a serious offense. If the person dies, the monk commits an offense entailing expulsion.

He praises by means of writing: if a monk writes, “Whoever dies thus, receives wealth,” or, “Whoever dies thus, becomes famous,” or, “Whoever dies thus, goes to heaven,” he commits an offense of wrong conduct for each character he writes. If, after seeing the writing, the target person thinks, “I shall die,” and they do something painful, the monk commits a serious offense. If the person dies, the monk commits an offense entailing expulsion.

A pit: if a monk digs a pit for a human being, thinking, “Falling 4.5.2 into it, they will die,” he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If a person falls into it and experiences pain, the monk commits a serious offense.⁴² If the person dies, the monk commits an offense entailing expulsion.

42. Sp 1.176: *Yam uddissa khanati, tassa dukkhupattiyā thullaccayam, maraṇena pārājikam. Aññasmim patitvā mate anāpatti*, “If the person he dug the pit for experiences pain, there is a serious offense. If he dies, there is an offense entailing expulsion. If someone else falls in and dies, there is no offense.” The commentary makes a point that goes beyond what is found in the Canonical text. According to the Canonical text, if you dig a pit for any human being to fall into, then the offense occurs when any human being falls into it. The commentary, however, makes the additional point that if you dig a pit for a specific human to fall into, you only commit an offence if that same human being falls into it.

4.5.5 If a monk digs a non-specific pit, thinking, “Whatever falls into it, will die,” he commits an offense of wrong conduct.⁴³ If a person falls into it, the monk commits an offense of wrong conduct. If they experience pain after falling in, the monk commits a serious offense. If they die, the monk commits an offense entailing expulsion. If a spirit, ghost, or animal in human form falls into it, the monk commits an offense of wrong conduct.⁴⁴ If it experiences pain after falling in, the monk commits an offense of wrong conduct. If it dies, the monk commits a serious offense. If an animal falls into it, the monk commits an offense of wrong conduct. If it experiences pain after falling in, the monk commits an offense of wrong conduct. If it dies, the monk commits an offense entailing confession.

A piece of furniture: if a monk places a dagger in a piece of furniture, smears the furniture with poison, or makes it weak, or if he places it near a lake, a pit, or a cliff, thinking, “Falling down, they’ll die,” he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If the target person experiences pain because of the dagger, the poison, or the fall, the monk commits a serious offense. If the person dies, the monk commits an offense entailing expulsion.

Placing near: if a monk places a knife, a dagger, an arrow, a club, a rock, a sword, poison, or a rope near a person, thinking, “Using this, they’ll die,” he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If the target person thinks, “Using that, I shall die,” and he does something painful, the monk commits a serious offense. If the person dies, the monk commits an offense entailing expulsion.

43. Sp 1.176: *Sace anuddissa “yo koci marissati”ti khato hoti, yattakā patitvā maranti, tattakā pāṇātipātā*, “If it is not dug for a specific person or being, but with the thought, ‘Whatever dies’, then, to the extent that a being falls in and dies, there is killing.” And therefore an offense entailing expulsion if that being is human.

44. Kkh-pt: *Manussaviggaho nāgasupaṇṇādisadiso tiracchānagato tiracchānagatamanussaviggaho*, “*Tiracchānagatamanussaviggaha*: an animal like a dragon or a *garuda*, etc., in human form.”

Tonics: if a monk gives a person ghee, butter, oil, honey, or syrup, thinking, “After tasting this, they’ll die,” he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If the target person tastes it and experiences pain, the monk commits a serious offense. If the person dies, the monk commits an offense entailing expulsion.

Arranging a sight: if a monk arranges a dreadful and terrifying sight, thinking, “Seeing this and becoming terrified, they’ll die,” he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If the target person sees it and becomes terrified, the monk commits a serious offense. If the person dies, the monk commits an offense entailing expulsion. If a monk arranges a lovely sight, thinking, “Seeing this and then being unable to get hold of it, they’ll wither and die,” he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If the target person sees it and then withers because of not getting hold of it, the monk commits a serious offense. If the person dies, the monk commits an offense entailing expulsion.

Arranging a sound: if a monk arranges a dreadful and terrifying sound, thinking, “Hearing this and becoming terrified, they’ll die,” he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If the target person hears it and becomes terrified, the monk commits a serious offense. If the person dies, the monk commits an offense entailing expulsion. If a monk arranges a lovely and heart-stirring sound, thinking, “Hearing this and then being unable to get hold of it, they’ll wither and die,” he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If the target person hears it and then withers because of not getting hold of it, the monk commits a serious offense. If the person dies, the monk commits an offense entailing expulsion.

Arranging a smell: if a monk arranges a disgusting and repulsive smell, thinking, “Smelling this, they’ll die from disgust and repulsion,” he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If the target person smells it and experiences suffering because of disgust and revulsion, the monk commits a serious offense. If the person dies, the monk commits an offense entailing expulsion. If a monk arranges a fragrant scent, thinking, “Smelling this and

then being unable to get hold of it, they'll wither and die," he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If the target person smells it and then withers because of not getting hold of it, the monk commits a serious offense. If the person dies, the monk commits an offense entailing expulsion.

Arranging a taste: if a monk arranges a disgusting and repulsive flavor, thinking, "Tasting this, they'll die from disgust and repulsion," he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If the target person tastes it and experiences suffering because of disgust and repulsion, the monk commits a serious offense. If the person dies, the monk commits an offense entailing expulsion. If a monk arranges a delicious flavor, thinking, "Tasting this and then being unable to get hold of it, they'll wither and die," he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If the target person tastes it and then withers because of not getting hold of it, the monk commits a serious offense. If the person dies, the monk commits an offense entailing expulsion.

Arranging a touch: if a monk arranges a painful and harsh physical contact, thinking, "Touched by this, they'll die," he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If the target person makes contact with it and experiences pain, the monk commits a serious offense. If the person dies, the monk commits an offense entailing expulsion. If a monk arranges a pleasant and soft physical contact, thinking, "Touched by this and then being unable to get hold of it, they'll wither and die," he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If the target person is touched by it and then withers because of not getting hold of it, the monk commits a serious offense. If the person dies, the monk commits an offense entailing expulsion.

Arranging a mental quality: if a monk talks about hell to someone bound for hell, thinking, "Hearing this and becoming terrified, they'll die," he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If the target person hears it and becomes terrified, the monk commits a serious offense. If the person dies, the monk commits

an offense entailing expulsion. If a monk talks about heaven to someone of good behavior, thinking, “Hearing this and being keen on it, they’ll die,” he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If the target person hears it, becomes keen on it, and thinks, “I shall die,” and they do something painful, the monk commits a serious offense. If the person dies, the monk commits an offense entailing expulsion.

Information: if, being asked, a monk says, “Die like this. Anyone who does receives wealth,” or, “Die like this. Anyone who does becomes famous,” or, “Die like this. Anyone who does goes to heaven,” he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If, because of that information, the target person thinks, “I shall die,” and they do something painful, the monk commits a serious offense. If the person dies, the monk commits an offense entailing expulsion.

Instruction: if, without being asked, a monk says, “Die like this. Anyone who does receives wealth,” or, “Die like this. Anyone who does becomes famous,” or, “Die like this. Anyone who does goes to heaven,” he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If, because of that instruction, the target person thinks, “I shall die,” and they do something painful, the monk commits a serious offense. If the person dies, the monk commits an offense entailing expulsion.

Acting by arrangement: if a monk makes an arrangement for before the meal or for after the meal, for the night or for the day, telling another person, “Kill that person according to this arrangement,” he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If the other person kills that person according to that arrangement, there is an offense entailing expulsion for both. If he kills him before or after the time of the arrangement, there is no offense for the instigator, but there is an offense entailing expulsion for the murderer.

Making a sign: a monk makes a sign. If he says to another person, “When I wink, at that sign kill that person,” “When I raise an

eyebrow, at that sign kill that person,” or, “When I nod, at that sign kill that person,” he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If, at that sign, the other person kills that person, there is an offense entailing expulsion for both. If he kills him before or after the sign, there is no offense for the instigator, but there is an offense entailing expulsion for the murderer.

Non-offenses

- 4.11.1 There is no offense: if it is unintentional; if he does not know; if he is not aiming at death; if he is insane; if he is the first offender.

The first section for recitation on expulsion in relation to human beings is finished.

Summary verses of case studies

- 4.11.9 “Praising, sitting down,
And with pestle, with mortar;
Gone forth when old, flowing out,
First, experimental poison.
- 4.11.13 And three with making sites,
Another three with bricks;
And also machete, and rafter.
An elevated platform, coming down, fell down.
- 4.11.17 Sweating, and nose treatment, massage,
By bathing, and by rubbing;
Making get up, making lie down,
Death through food, death through drink.
- 4.11.21 Child by a lover, and co-wives;
mother, child, he killed both,
he killed neither; crushing,
Heating, barren, fertile.
- 4.11.25 Tickling, in taking hold of, a spirit,
And predatory spirits, sending;
Thinking it was them, he gave a blow,
In talking about heaven, and about hell.
- 4.11.29 Three trees at Āḷavi,
Three others with forest groves;

Don't torture, no I can't,
Buttermilk, and salty purgative."

Case studies

On one occasion a certain monk was sick. Out of compassion, the monks praised death to him. He died. They became anxious and said, "The Buddha has laid down a training rule. Could it be that we've committed an offense entailing expulsion?" They told the Buddha. "You've committed an offense entailing expulsion." 5.1.1

On one occasion an alms-collecting monk sat down on a bench, crushing a boy who was concealed by an old cloth. The boy died. The monk became anxious and thought, "The Buddha has laid down a training rule. Could it be that I've committed an offense entailing expulsion?" He told the Buddha. "There's no offense entailing expulsion." 5.2.1

But you shouldn't sit down on a seat without checking it. If you do, you commit an offense of wrong conduct."

On one occasion a monk was preparing a seat in a dining hall in an inhabited area. When he took hold of a pestle high up, a second pestle fell down, hitting a boy, who died. The monk became anxious ... "What were you thinking?" 5.3.1

"I didn't intend it, Sir." 5.3.6

"There's no offense when it's unintentional." 5.3.7

On one occasion a monk was preparing a seat in a dining hall in an inhabited area when he forcefully kicked the implements belonging to a mortar.⁴⁵ They crushed a boy, who died. He became anxious ... "There's no offense when it's unintentional." 5.3.8

At one time a father and son had gone forth with the monks. When the time was announced for a certain event, the son said to 5.4.1

45. Sp-t 1.180: *Udukkhalabhaṇḍikanti udukkhalatthāya ānītaṃ dārubhaṇḍaṃ*, "Udukkhalabhaṇḍika: wooden goods brought for the sake of a mortar." That *akkamati* can mean "kick" can be seen from Bu Pj 1:10.20.9: *Aññatarā itthi passitvā āṅgajāte abhinisīdi*, "The monk kicked her off."

his father,⁴⁶ “Go, Sir, the Sangha is waiting for you,” and seizing him by the back, he pushed him. The father fell and died. The son became anxious ... “What were you thinking?”

5.4.8 “I didn’t mean to kill him, Sir.”

5.4.9 “There’s no offense for one who isn’t aiming at death.”

5.4.10 At one time a father and son had gone forth with the monks. When the time was announced for a certain event, the son said to his father, “Go, Sir, the Sangha is waiting for you,” and seizing him by the back, he pushed him, aiming to kill him. The father fell and died. The son became anxious ... “You have committed an offense entailing expulsion.”

5.4.17 At one time a father and son had gone forth with the monks. When the time was announced for a certain event, the son said to his father, “Go, Sir, the Sangha is waiting for you,” and seizing him by the back, he pushed him, aiming to kill him. The father fell, but did not die. The son became anxious ... “There’s no offense entailing expulsion, but there’s a serious offense.”

5.5.1 On one occasion a monk got meat stuck in his throat while eating. A second monk hit him on the neck. The meat was expelled together with blood, and the monk died. The second monk became anxious ... “There’s no offense for one who isn’t aiming at death.”

5.5.7 On one occasion a monk got meat stuck in his throat while eating. Another monk hit him on the neck, aiming to kill him. The meat was expelled together with blood, and the monk died. The second monk became anxious ... “You have committed an offense entailing expulsion.”

5.5.13 On one occasion a monk got meat stuck in his throat while eating. Another monk hit him on the neck, aiming to kill him. The meat was expelled together with blood, but the monk did not die.

46. “For a certain event” is not found in the Pali, but has been added to make the Pali idiom clearer. Sp 2.108: *Kāle ārociteti yāgubhattādisu yassa kassaci kāle ārocite*, “*Kāle ārocite*: when the time is announced for whatever, such as rice porridge, a meal, etc.”

He became anxious ... “There’s no offense entailing expulsion, but there’s a serious offense.”

On one occasion an alms-collecting monk received poisoned almsfood. He brought it back and gave the first portion to other monks. They died. He became anxious ... “What were you thinking, monk?” 5.6.1

“I didn’t know, Sir.” 5.6.5

“There’s no offense for one who doesn’t know.” 5.6.6

On one occasion a monk gave poison to a second monk with the purpose of investigating it. That monk died. The first monk became anxious ... “What were you thinking, monk?” 5.6.7

“My purpose was to investigate it, Sir.” 5.6.11

“There’s no offense entailing expulsion, but there’s a serious offense.” 5.6.12

On one occasion the monks of Āḷavī were preparing a site for a dwelling when a monk lifted up a stone to another monk above him. As the second monk did not grasp it properly, it fell on the head of the monk below, who died. The second monk became anxious ... “There’s no offense when it’s unintentional.” 5.7.1

On one occasion the monks of Āḷavī were preparing a site for a dwelling when a monk lifted up a stone to another monk above him. The second monk dropped the stone on his head, aiming to kill him. He died. ...⁴⁷ He did not die. The second monk became anxious ... “There’s no offense entailing expulsion, but there’s a serious offense.” 5.7.7

On one occasion the monks of Āḷavī were building a wall for a dwelling when a monk lifted up a brick to another monk above him. As the second monk did not grasp it properly, it fell on the head of the monk below, who died. The second monk became anxious ... “There’s no offense when it’s unintentional.” 5.8.1

On one occasion the monks of Āḷavī were building a wall for a dwelling when a monk lifted up a brick to another monk above him. The second monk dropped the brick on his head, aiming to 5.8.7

47. This is to be expanded as in segments 5.5.7 – 5.5.19 above.

kill him. He died. ... He did not die. The second monk became anxious ... “There’s no offense entailing expulsion, but there’s a serious offense.”

5.9.1 On one occasion the monks of Ālavī were doing building work when a monk lifted up a machete to another monk above him. As the second monk did not grasp it properly, it fell on the head of the monk below, who died. The second monk became anxious ... “There’s no offense when it’s unintentional.”

5.9.7 On one occasion the monks of Ālavī were doing building work when a monk lifted up a machete to another monk above him. The second monk dropped the machete on his head, aiming to kill him. He died. ... He did not die. The second monk became anxious ... “There’s no offense entailing expulsion, but there’s a serious offense.”

5.10.1 On one occasion the monks of Ālavī were doing building work when a monk lifted up a rafter to another monk above him. As the second monk did not grasp it properly, it fell on the head of the monk below, who died. The second monk became anxious ... “There’s no offense when it’s unintentional.”

5.10.7 On one occasion the monks of Ālavī were doing building work when a monk lifted up a rafter to another monk above him. The second monk dropped the rafter on his head, aiming to kill him. He died. ... He did not die. The second monk became anxious ... “There’s no offense entailing expulsion, but there’s a serious offense.”

5.11.1 On one occasion the monks of Ālavī were putting together an elevated platform while doing building work. A monk said to another monk, “Put it together while standing here.” He did, and he fell down and died. The first monk became anxious ... “What were you thinking, monk?”

5.11.7 “I didn’t mean to kill him, Sir.”

5.11.8 “There’s no offense for one who isn’t aiming at death.”

5.11.9 On one occasion the monks of Ālavī were putting together an elevated platform while doing building work. A monk said to an-

other monk, “Put it together while standing here,” aiming to kill him. He did, and he fell down and died. ... he fell down, but did not die. The first monk became anxious ... “There’s no offense entailing expulsion, but there’s a serious offense.”

On one occasion a monk was coming down after roofing a dwelling. A second monk said to him, “Come down here.” He did, and he fell down and died. The second monk became anxious ... “There’s no offense for one who isn’t aiming at death.” 5.12.1

On one occasion a monk was coming down after roofing a dwelling. A second monk said to him, “Come down here,” aiming to kill him. He did, and he fell down and died. ... he fell down, but did not die. The first monk became anxious ... “There’s no offense entailing expulsion, but there’s a serious offense.” 5.12.7

On one occasion a monk who was plagued by lust climbed the Vulture Peak, jumped off the cliff, and hit a basket-maker. The basket-maker died,⁴⁸ and the monk became anxious ... “There’s no offense entailing expulsion.” 5.13.1

But, monks, you shouldn’t jump off anything. If you do, you commit an offense of wrong conduct.”

On one occasion the monks from the group of six climbed the Vulture Peak and threw down a stone for fun. It hit a cowherd, who died. They became anxious ... “There’s no offense entailing expulsion.” 5.13.5

But, monks, you shouldn’t throw down stones for fun. If you do, you commit an offense of wrong conduct.”

On one occasion a certain monk was sick. The monks made him sweat by heating him. He died. They became anxious ... “There’s no offense for one who isn’t aiming at death.” 5.14.1

On one occasion a certain monk was sick. The monks made him sweat by heating him, aiming to kill him. He died. ... He did not 5.14.6

48. The Pali seem to say that he simply fell off the cliff, *papatanto*, but the context seems to require something more deliberate. Perhaps it is just an idiom.

die. The monks became anxious ... “There’s no offense entailing expulsion, but there’s a serious offense.”

5.15.1 On one occasion a monk had a severe headache. The monks gave him medical treatment through the nose. He died. They became anxious ... “There’s no offense for one who isn’t aiming at death.”

5.15.6 On one occasion a certain monk had a severe headache. The monks gave him medical treatment through the nose, aiming to kill him. He died. ... He did not die. The monks became anxious ... “There’s no offense entailing expulsion, but there’s a serious offense.”

5.16.1 On one occasion a certain monk was sick. The monks massaged him. He died. They became anxious ... “There’s no offense for one who isn’t aiming at death.”

5.16.6 On one occasion a certain monk was sick. The monks massaged him, aiming to kill him. He died. ... He did not die. The monks became anxious ... “There’s no offense entailing expulsion, but there’s a serious offense.”

5.16.13 On one occasion a certain monk was sick. The monks bathed him. He died. They became anxious ... “There’s no offense for one who isn’t aiming at death.”

5.16.18 On one occasion a certain monk was sick. The monks bathed him, aiming to kill him. He died. ... He did not die. The monks became anxious ... “There’s no offense entailing expulsion, but there’s a serious offense.”

5.16.25 On one occasion a certain monk was sick. The monks rubbed him with oil. He died. They became anxious ... “There’s no offense for one who isn’t aiming at death.”

5.16.30 On one occasion a certain monk was sick. The monks rubbed him with oil, aiming to kill him. He died. ... He did not die. The monks became anxious ... “There’s no offense entailing expulsion, but there’s a serious offense.”

On one occasion a certain monk was sick. The monks made him get up. He died. They became anxious ... “There’s no offense for one who isn’t aiming at death.” 5.16.37

On one occasion a certain monk was sick. The monks made him get up, aiming to kill him. He died. ... He did not die. The monks became anxious ... “There’s no offense entailing expulsion, but there’s a serious offense.” 5.16.42

On one occasion a certain monk was sick. The monks made him lie down. He died. They became anxious ... “There’s no offense for one who isn’t aiming at death.” 5.16.49

On one occasion a certain monk was sick. The monks made him lie down, aiming to kill him. He died. ... He did not die. The monks became anxious ... “There’s no offense entailing expulsion, but there’s a serious offense.” 5.16.54

On one occasion a certain monk was sick. The monks gave him food. He died. They became anxious ... “There’s no offense for one who isn’t aiming at death.” 5.16.61

On one occasion a certain monk was sick. The monks gave him food, aiming to kill him. He died. ... He did not die. The monks became anxious ... “There’s no offense entailing expulsion, but there’s a serious offense.” 5.16.66

On one occasion a certain monk was sick. The monks gave him a drink. He died. They became anxious ... “There’s no offense for one who isn’t aiming at death.” 5.16.73

On one occasion a certain monk was sick. The monks gave him a drink, aiming to kill him. He died. ... He did not die. The monks became anxious ... “There’s no offense entailing expulsion, but there’s a serious offense.” 5.16.78

At one time a woman whose husband was living away from home became pregnant by a lover. She said to a monk who associated with her family, “Venerable, please help me have an abortion.” “Alright,” he said, and he helped her have an abortion. The child died. The monk became anxious ... “You have committed an offense entailing expulsion.” 5.17.1

5.18.1 At one time a certain man had two wives, one barren and one fertile. The barren one said to a monk who associated with her family, "If the other wife gives birth to a son, Venerable, she'll become the head wife. Please make her have an abortion." "Alright," he said, and he did so. The child died, but the mother did not die. The monk became anxious ... "You have committed an offense entailing expulsion."

5.18.12 At one time a certain man had two wives, one barren and one fertile. The barren one said to a monk who associated with her family, "If the other wife gives birth to a son, Venerable, she'll become the head wife. Please make her have an abortion." "Alright," he said, and he did so. The mother died, but the child did not die. The monk became anxious ... "There's no offense entailing expulsion,⁴⁹ but there's a serious offense."

5.18.24 At one time a certain man had two wives, one barren and one fertile. The barren one said to a monk who associated with her family, "If the other wife gives birth to a son, Venerable, she'll become the head wife. Please make her have an abortion." "Alright," he said, and he did so. Both died. ... Neither died. The monk became anxious ... "There's no offense entailing expulsion, but there's a serious offense."

5.19.1 On one occasion a woman who was pregnant said to a monk who associated with her family, "Venerable, please help me have an abortion." "Well then, crush it," he said. She crushed it and had an abortion. The monk became anxious ... "You have committed an offense entailing expulsion."

5.19.7 On one occasion a woman who was pregnant said to a monk who associated with her family, "Venerable, please help me have an abortion." "Well then, heat yourself," he said. She heated herself and had an abortion. The monk became anxious ... "You have committed an offense entailing expulsion."

49. It is not an offense entailing expulsion because he was aiming to kill the child, not the mother.

On one occasion a barren woman said to a monk who associated 5.20.1
with her family, “Please find some medicine, Venerable, to help
me become pregnant.” “Alright,” he said, and he gave her some
medicine. She died. He became anxious ... “There’s no offense
entailing expulsion, but there’s an offense of wrong conduct.”

On one occasion a fertile woman said to a monk who associated 5.21.1
with her family, “Please find some medicine, Venerable, to help me
not become pregnant.” “Alright,” he said, and he gave her some
medicine. She died. He became anxious ... “There’s no offense
entailing expulsion, but there’s an offense of wrong conduct.”

On one occasion the monks from the group of six tickled a monk 5.22.1
from the group of seventeen to make him laugh. Being unable to
catch his breath, he died. They became anxious ... “There’s no
offense entailing expulsion.”

On one occasion the monks from the group of seventeen over- 5.23.1
powered a monk from the group of six, intending to do a legal pro-
cedure against him. He died.⁵⁰ They became anxious ... “There’s
no offense entailing expulsion.”

On one occasion an exorcist monk killed a spirit. He became 5.24.1
anxious ... “There’s no offense entailing expulsion, but there’s a
serious offense.”

On one occasion a monk sent a second monk to a dwelling 5.25.1
inhabited by predatory spirits. The spirits killed him. The first
monk became anxious ... “There’s no offense for one who isn’t
aiming at death.”

On one occasion a monk sent a second monk to a dwelling 5.25.5
inhabited by predatory spirits, aiming to kill him. The spirits killed
him. ... The spirits did not kill him. The first monk became anxious

50. The text doesn’t say what the legal procedure, the (*saṅgha*-)*kamma*, was about, but it seems implied that it was against that monk. This is also the position of the sub-commentary at Sp-t 2.187: *Kammādhippāyāti: tajjanīyādi-kammakaraṇādhippāyā*, “Aiming at a legal procedure: aiming at doing a legal procedure of censure, etc.” The monks from the group of seventeen were in regular conflict with the monks from the group of six.

... “There’s no offense entailing expulsion, but there’s a serious offense.”

5.26.1 On one occasion a monk sent a second monk to a wilderness inhabited by predatory animals. The predatory animals killed him. The first monk became anxious ... “There’s no offense for one who isn’t aiming at death.”

5.26.5 On one occasion a monk sent a second monk to a wilderness inhabited by predatory animals, aiming to kill him. The predatory animals killed him. ... The predatory animals did not kill him. The first monk became anxious ... “There’s no offense entailing expulsion, but there’s a serious offense.”

5.26.11 On one occasion a monk sent a second monk to a wilderness inhabited by criminals. The criminals killed him. The first monk became anxious ... “There’s no offense for one who isn’t aiming at death.”

5.26.15 On one occasion a monk sent a second monk to a wilderness inhabited by criminals, aiming to kill him. The criminals killed him. ... The criminals did not kill him. The first monk became anxious ... “There’s no offense entailing expulsion, but there’s a serious offense.”

5.27.1 On one occasion a monk killed a person, thinking it was them ... killed another person, thinking it was them ... killed a person, thinking they were another ... killed another person, thinking they were another. That monk became anxious ... “You have committed an offense entailing expulsion.”

5.28.1 At one time a monk was possessed by a spirit. Another monk gave him a blow. He died. The other monk became anxious ... “There’s no offense for one who isn’t aiming at death.”

5.28.6 At one time a monk was possessed by a spirit. A second monk gave him a blow, aiming to kill him. He died. ... He did not die. The second monk became anxious ... “There’s no offense entailing expulsion, but there’s a serious offense.”

On one occasion a monk gave a talk about heaven to a man of 5.29.1
good behavior. He became keen on it and died. The monk became
anxious ... “There’s no offense for one who isn’t aiming at death.”

On one occasion a monk gave a talk about heaven to a man 5.29.5
of good behavior, aiming to kill him. He became keen on it and
died. ... He became keen on it, but did not die. The monk became
anxious ... “There’s no offense entailing expulsion, but there’s a
serious offense.”

On one occasion a monk gave a talk about hell to a man bound 5.29.11
for hell. He became terrified and died. The monk became anxious
... “There’s no offense for one who isn’t aiming at death.”

On one occasion a monk gave a talk about hell to a man bound 5.29.15
for hell, aiming to kill him. He became terrified and died. ... He
became terrified, but did not die. The monk became anxious ...
“There’s no offense entailing expulsion, but there’s a serious offense.”

On one occasion the monks of Āḷavī were felling a tree while 5.30.1
doing building work. A monk said to a second monk, “Fell it while
standing here.” He did. The tree fell on him, and he died. The first
monk became anxious ... “There’s no offense for one who isn’t
aiming at death.”

On one occasion the monks of Āḷavī were felling a tree while 5.30.7
doing building work. A monk said to a second monk, “Fell it while
standing here,” aiming to kill him. He did. The tree fell on him,
and he died. ... The tree fell on him, but he did not die. The first
monk became anxious ... “There’s no offense entailing expulsion,
but there’s a serious offense.”

On one occasion the monks from the group of six set fire to a 5.31.1
forest grove. People were burned and died. The monks became
anxious ... “There’s no offense for one who isn’t aiming at death.”

On one occasion the monks from the group of six set fire to 5.31.5
a forest grove, aiming to cause death. People were burned and
died. ... People were burned, but did not die. The monks became
anxious ... “There’s no offense entailing expulsion, but there’s a
serious offense.”

5.32.1 On one occasion a monk went to a place of execution and said to the executioner, "Don't torture him. Kill him with a single blow." "Alright, Sir," he said, and he killed him with a single blow. The monk became anxious ... "You have committed an offense entailing expulsion."

5.32.8 On one occasion a monk went to a place of execution and said to the executioner, "Don't torture him. Kill him with a single blow." Saying, "No, I can't," he executed him. The monk became anxious ... "There's no offense entailing expulsion, but there's an offense of wrong conduct."

5.33.1 On one occasion a man whose hands and feet had been cut off was at his relatives' house, surrounded by his relations. A monk said to those people, "Do you want to euthanize him?"

5.33.4 "Yes, Sir."

5.33.5 "Then give him buttermilk."

5.33.6 They gave him buttermilk and he died. The monk became anxious ... "You have committed an offense entailing expulsion."

5.33.10 On one occasion a man whose hands and feet had been cut off was at home, surrounded by his relations. A nun said to those people, "Do you want to euthanize him?"

5.33.13 "Yes, Venerable."

5.33.14 "Then give him salty purgative."

5.33.15 They gave him salty purgative and he died. The nun became anxious ... She then told the nuns, who in turn told the monks, who then told the Buddha. "Monks, that nun has committed an offense entailing expulsion."

The third offense entailing expulsion is finished.

The fourth training rule on expulsion

Uttarimanussadhamma

Origin story

First sub-story

At one time when the Buddha was staying in the hall with the peaked roof in the Great Wood near Vesālī, a number of monks who were friends had entered the rainy-season residence on the banks of the river Vaggumudā. At that time Vajji was short of food and afflicted with hunger, with crops affected by whiteheads and turned to straw.⁵¹ It was not easy to get by on almsfood. 1.1.1

The monks considered the difficult circumstances, and they thought, “How can we have a comfortable rains, live in peace and harmony, and get almsfood without trouble?” 1.1.5

Some said, “We could work for the householders, and they’ll support us in return.” 1.1.8

Others said, “There’s no need to work for the householders. Let’s instead take messages for them, and they’ll support us in return.” 1.1.13

Still others said, “There’s no need to work or take messages for them. Let’s instead talk up one another’s superhuman qualities to the householders: ‘That monk has the first absorption, that monk the second absorption, that monk the third, that monk the fourth; that monk is a stream-enterer, that monk a once-returner, that a non-returner, that a perfected one; that monk has the three true insights, and that the six direct knowledges.’ Then they’ll support us. In this way we’ll have a comfortable rains, live together in peace 1.1.19

51. “Whiteheads” renders *setaṭṭhikā(h)ikā*, lit. “white bones”. Sp 4.403: *Setaṭṭhikā nāma rogajātīti eko pāṇako nālimajjhagataṃ kaṇḍaṃ vijjhati, yena viddhattā nikkhantampi sālisasā khīraṃ gaheṭum na sakkoti*, “The disease called *setaṭṭhikā* means: an insect penetrates the stem, goes to the middle of the stalk, from the penetration of which the rice grains are not able to get sap.” This seems to be a description of so-called “whiteheads”, pale panicles without rice grains, caused by stem borers.

and harmony, and get almsfood without trouble. This is the way to go.”

- 1.1.37 Then those monks did just that. And the people there thought, “We’re so fortunate that such monks have come to us for the rainy-season residence. Such virtuous and good monks have never before entered the rains residence with us.” And they gave such food and drink to those monks that they did not even eat and drink themselves, or give to their parents, to their wives and children, to their slaves, servants, and workers, to their friends and companions, or to their relatives. Soon those monks had a good color, bright faces, clear skin, and sharp senses.

- 1.2.1 Now it was the custom for monks who had completed the rainy-season residence to go and visit the Buddha. And so, when the three months were over and they had completed the rains residence, those monks put their dwellings in order, took their bowls and robes, and set out for Vesālī. When they eventually arrived, they went to the hall with the peaked roof in the Great Wood. There they approached the Buddha, bowed, and sat down.

- 1.2.4 At that time the monks who had completed the rains residence in that region were thin, haggard, and pale, with veins protruding all over their bodies. Yet the monks from the banks of the Vaggumudā had a good color, bright faces, clear skin, and sharp senses. Since it is the custom for Buddhas to greet newly arrived monks, the Buddha said to them, “I hope you’re keeping well, monks, I hope you’re getting by?”

- 1.2.9 I hope you had a comfortable and harmonious rains, and got almsfood without trouble?”

- 1.2.10 “We’re keeping well, Sir, we’re getting by. We had a comfortable and harmonious rains, and got almsfood without trouble.” When Buddhas know what is going on, sometimes they ask and sometimes not. They know the right time to ask and when not to ask. Buddhas ask when it is beneficial, otherwise not, for Buddhas are

incapable of doing what is unbeneficial.⁵² Buddhas question the monks for two reasons: to give a teaching or to lay down a training rule.

And the Buddha said to those monks, “In what way, monks, did you have a comfortable and harmonious rains? And how did you get almsfood without trouble?” 1.2.14

They then told him. 1.2.16

“But did you really have those superhuman qualities?” 1.2.17

“No, Sir.” 1.2.18

The Buddha rebuked them, “It’s not suitable, foolish men, it’s not proper, it’s not worthy of a monastic, it’s not allowable, it’s not to be done. How could you for the sake of your stomachs talk up one another’s superhuman qualities to householders? It would be better for your bellies to be cut open with a sharp butcher’s knife than for you to talk up one another’s superhuman qualities to householders. Why is that? For although it might cause death or death-like suffering, it would not cause you to be reborn in a bad destination. But *this* might. This will affect people’s confidence ...” After rebuking them and giving a teaching, he addressed the monks: 1.2.19

“Monks, there are these five notorious gangsters to be found in the world. What five? There are notorious gangsters who think like this: ‘When the heck will I walk about in villages, towns, and royal capitals, with a following of a hundred or a thousand men, killing, destroying, and torturing?’ Then after some time, he does just that. Just so, monks, a bad monk thinks like this: ‘When the heck will I 1.3.1

52. “Incapable of doing” renders *setughāta*, lit. “destroyed the bridge”. Sp 1.16: *Setu vuccati maggo, maggeneva tādisassa vacanassa ghāto, samucchediti vuttam hoti*, “The path is called the bridge. What is said is that there is the destruction and cutting off of such speech by the path.” The commentary seems to take *setu*, “bridge”, as a reference to the eightfold path. According to this understanding, the Buddha has cut off access to bad qualities, including bad speech, by fulfilling the eightfold path. I prefer to understand “bridge” as a metaphor for access, that is, the Buddhas no longer have access to what is unbeneficial.

walk about in villages, towns, and royal capitals, with a following of a hundred or a thousand people, being honored, respected, and revered by both lay people and those gone forth, getting robes, almsfood, dwellings, and medicinal supplies?’ Then after some time, he does just that. This is the first notorious gangster to be found in the world.

1.3.12 Or a bad monk learns the spiritual path proclaimed by the Buddha and takes it as his own. This is the second notorious gangster to be found in the world.

1.3.14 Or a bad monk groundlessly charges someone living a pure spiritual life with a sexual offense. This is the third notorious gangster to be found in the world.

1.3.16 Or a bad monk takes valuable goods and requisites from the Sangha—a monastery, the land of a monastery, a dwelling, the site of a dwelling, a bed, a bench, a mattress, a pillow, a metal pot, a metal jar, a metal bucket, a metal bowl, a machete, a hatchet, an ax, a spade, a chisel, a creeper, bamboo, a reed, grass, clay, wooden goods, earthenware goods—⁵³ and uses them to bribe and create a following among householders. This is the fourth notorious gangster to be found in the world.

1.3.20 But in this world with its gods, lords of death, and supreme beings, in this society with its monastics and brahmins, its gods and humans, this is the most notorious gangster of all: one who claims to have a non-existent superhuman quality. Why is that? Monks, you’ve eaten the country’s almsfood by theft.”

1.3.23 “Whoever should declare himself
To be other than he truly is,
Has eaten this by theft,
Like a cheater who has deceived.

1.3.27 Many ocher-necks of bad qualities,
Uncontrolled and wicked—

53. I have rendered *muñja*-reed and *pabbaja*-reed with the single word “reed”. I am not aware that these two kinds of reed can be distinguished in English.

By their wicked deeds,
They are reborn in hell.

It's better to eat an iron ball, 1.3.31
As hot as a licking flame,
Than for the immoral and uncontrolled
To eat the country's alms."

After rebuking the monks from the banks of the Vaggumudā in 1.3.35
many ways for being difficult to maintain, difficult to support ...
"And, monks, this training rule should be recited like this:

Preliminary ruling

'If a monk falsely claims for himself a superhuman quality, a knowledge and vision worthy of the noble ones, saying, "This I know, this I see," but after some time—whether questioned or not, but having committed the offense and seeking purification—should say: "Not knowing I said that I know, not seeing that I see; what I said was empty and false," he too is expelled and excluded from the community.'"

In this way the Buddha laid down this training rule for the 1.3.40
monks.

Second sub-story

Soon afterwards a number of monks, thinking they had seen and re- 2.1
alized what in fact they had not, declared final knowledge because of overestimation. After some time, their minds inclined to sensual desire, ill will, and confusion. They became anxious, thinking, "The Buddha has laid down a training rule, yet we declared final knowledge because of overestimation. Could it be that we've committed an offense entailing expulsion?" They told Venerable Ānanda, who told the Buddha. He said, "This is negligible, Ānanda.

And so, monks, this training rule should be recited like this: 2.11

Final ruling

‘If a monk falsely claims for himself a superhuman quality, a knowledge and vision worthy of the noble ones, saying, “This I know, this I see,” but after some time—whether he is questioned or not, but having committed the offense and seeking purification—should say: “Not knowing I said that I know, not seeing that I see; what I said was empty and false,” then, except if it is due to overestimation, he too is expelled and excluded from the community.’”

Definitions

A: whoever ...

Monk: ... The monk who has been given the full ordination by a unanimous Sangha through a legal procedure consisting of one motion and three announcements that is irreversible and fit to stand—this sort of monk is meant in this case.

Falsely: although a certain wholesome quality is non-existent in himself, not real, not to be found, and he does not see it or know it, he says, “I have this wholesome quality.”

A superhuman quality: absorption, release, stillness, attainment, knowledge and vision, development of the path, realization of the fruits, abandoning the defilements, a mind without hindrances, delighting in solitude.⁵⁴

For himself: either he presents those good qualities as in himself, or he presents himself as among those good qualities.

Knowledge: the three true insights.

Vision: knowledge and vision are equivalent.

54. “Delighting in solitude” renders *suññāgāra abhirati*, lit. “delighting in an empty dwelling”. According to the commentaries, this is often an idiom for solitude. MN-a 1.88: *Tattha ca rukkhamūlānīti iminā rukkhamūlasenāsanam dasseti. Suññāgārānīti iminā janavivittatṭhānam*; “And there *rukkhamūlāni*: by this is shown dwellings at the foot of a tree; *suññāgārāni*: by this (is shown) a place free from people.”

Claims: announces to a woman or a man, to a lay person or one gone forth.

This I know, this I see: “I know these qualities,” “I see these qualities,” “These qualities are found in me and I conform to them.”

After some time: the moment, the second, the instant after he has made the claim.

He is questioned: he is questioned in regard to what he has claimed: “What did you attain?” “How did you attain it?” “When did you attain it?” “Where did you attain it?” “Which defilements did you abandon?” “Which qualities did you gain?”

Not: he is not spoken to by anyone.

Having committed the offense: having bad desires, overcome by desire, claiming to have a non-existent, unreal superhuman quality, he has committed an offense entailing expulsion.

Seeking purification: he desires to be a householder, a lay follower, a monastery worker, or a novice monk.

Not knowing I said that I know, not seeing that I see: “I don’t know these qualities,” “I don’t see these qualities,” “These qualities aren’t found in me and I don’t conform to them.”

What I said was empty and false: “What I said was empty,” “What I said was false,” “What I said was unreal,” “I said it without knowing.”

Except if it is due to overestimation: unless it is due to overestimation.

He too: this is said with reference to the preceding offenses entailing expulsion.

Is expelled: just as a palm tree with its crown cut off is incapable of further growth, so too is a monk with bad desires, overcome by desire, who claims to have a non-existent superhuman quality not an ascetic, not a Sakyan monastic. Therefore it is said, “he is expelled.”

Excluded from the community: Community: joint legal procedures, a joint recitation, the same training—this is called “com-

munity”. He does not take part in this—therefore it is called “excluded from the community”.

Permutations

Summary

- 4.1.1 A superhuman quality: absorption, release, stillness, attainment, knowledge and vision, development of the path, realization of the fruits, abandoning the defilements, a mind without hindrances, delighting in solitude.

Definitions

Absorption: the first absorption, the second absorption, the third absorption, the fourth absorption.

Release: emptiness release, signless release, desireless release.

Stillness: emptiness stillness, signless stillness, desireless stillness.

Attainment: emptiness attainment, signless attainment, desireless attainment.

Knowledge and vision: the three true insights.

Development of the path: the four applications of mindfulness, the four right efforts, the four foundations for supernormal power, the five spiritual faculties, the five spiritual powers, the seven factors of awakening, the noble eightfold path.

Realization of the fruits: realization of the fruit of stream-entry, realization of the fruit of once-returning, realization of the fruit of non-returning, realization of perfection.

Abandoning the defilements: the abandoning of sensual desire, the abandoning of ill will, the abandoning of confusion.

A mind without hindrances: a mind without sensual desire, a mind without ill will, a mind without confusion.

Delighting in solitude: because of the first absorption, there is delight in solitude; because of the second absorption, there is delight in solitude; because of the third absorption, there is

delight in solitude; because of the fourth absorption, there is delight in solitude.

Exposition

First absorption

If he lies in full awareness, saying, “I attained the first absorption,” 4.2.1 he commits an offense entailing expulsion when three conditions are fulfilled: before he has lied, he knows he is going to lie; while lying, he knows he is lying; after he has lied, he knows he has lied.

If he lies in full awareness, saying, “I attained the first absorption,” 4.2.5 he commits an offense entailing expulsion when four conditions are fulfilled: before he has lied, he knows he is going to lie; while lying, he knows he is lying; after he has lied, he knows he has lied; he misrepresents his view of what is true.⁵⁵

If he lies in full awareness, saying, “I attained the first absorption,” 4.2.10 he commits an offense entailing expulsion when five conditions are fulfilled: before he has lied, he knows he is going to lie; while lying, he knows he is lying; after he has lied, he knows he has lied; he misrepresents his view of what is true; he misrepresents his belief of what is true.

If he lies in full awareness, saying, “I attained the first absorption,” 4.2.15 he commits an offense entailing expulsion when six conditions are fulfilled: before he has lied, he knows he is going to lie; while lying, he knows he is lying; after he has lied, he knows he has lied; he misrepresents his view of what is true; he misrepresents his belief of what is true; he misrepresents his acceptance of what is true.

If he lies in full awareness, saying, “I attained the first absorption,” 4.2.22 he commits an offense entailing expulsion when seven conditions are fulfilled: before he has lied, he knows he is going to lie; while lying, he knows he is lying; after he has lied, he knows he has lied; he misrepresents his view of what is true; he misrepresents his belief of what is true; he misrepresents his acceptance of what is true; he misrepresents his sentiment of what is true.

55. “Of what is true” is not in the Pali, but has been added for clarity.

- 4.3.1 If he lies in full awareness, saying, “I’m attaining the first absorption,” he commits an offense entailing expulsion when three conditions are fulfilled: before he has lied, he knows he is going to lie; while lying, he knows he is lying; after he has lied, he knows he has lied.
- 4.3.5 If he lies in full awareness, saying, “I’m attaining the first absorption,” he commits an offense entailing expulsion when four conditions are fulfilled: before he has lied, he knows he is going to lie; while lying, he knows he is lying; after he has lied, he knows he has lied; he misrepresents his view of what is true.
- 4.3.10 If he lies in full awareness, saying, “I’m attaining the first absorption,” he commits an offense entailing expulsion when five conditions are fulfilled: before he has lied, he knows he is going to lie; while lying, he knows he is lying; after he has lied, he knows he has lied; he misrepresents his view of what is true; he misrepresents his belief of what is true.
- 4.3.16 If he lies in full awareness, saying, “I’m attaining the first absorption,” he commits an offense entailing expulsion when six conditions are fulfilled: before he has lied, he knows he is going to lie; while lying, he knows he is lying; after he has lied, he knows he has lied; he misrepresents his view of what is true; he misrepresents his belief of what is true; he misrepresents his acceptance of what is true.
- 4.3.23 If he lies in full awareness, saying, “I’m attaining the first absorption,” he commits an offense entailing expulsion when seven conditions are fulfilled: before he has lied, he knows he is going to lie; while lying, he knows he is lying; after he has lied, he knows he has lied; he misrepresents his view of what is true; he misrepresents his belief of what is true; he misrepresents his acceptance of what is true; he misrepresents his sentiment of what is true.
- 4.3.31 If he lies in full awareness, saying, “I’ve attained the first absorption,” he commits an offense entailing expulsion when three conditions are fulfilled: before he has lied, he knows he is going to

lie; while lying, he knows he is lying; after he has lied, he knows he has lied.

If he lies in full awareness, saying, “I’ve attained the first absorption,” he commits an offense entailing expulsion when four conditions are fulfilled: before he has lied, he knows he is going to lie; while lying, he knows he is lying; after he has lied, he knows he has lied; he misrepresents his view of what is true. 4.3.35

If he lies in full awareness, saying, “I’ve attained the first absorption,” he commits an offense entailing expulsion when five conditions are fulfilled: before he has lied, he knows he is going to lie; while lying, he knows he is lying; after he has lied, he knows he has lied; he misrepresents his view of what is true; he misrepresents his belief of what is true. 4.3.40

If he lies in full awareness, saying, “I’ve attained the first absorption,” he commits an offense entailing expulsion when six conditions are fulfilled: before he has lied, he knows he is going to lie; while lying, he knows he is lying; after he has lied, he knows he has lied; he misrepresents his view of what is true; he misrepresents his belief of what is true; he misrepresents his acceptance of what is true. 4.3.46

If he lies in full awareness, saying, “I’ve attained the first absorption,” he commits an offense entailing expulsion when seven conditions are fulfilled: before he has lied, he knows he is going to lie; while lying, he knows he is lying; after he has lied, he knows he has lied; he misrepresents his view of what is true; he misrepresents his belief of what is true; he misrepresents his acceptance of what is true; he misrepresents his sentiment of what is true. 4.3.53

If he lies in full awareness, saying, “I obtain the first absorption,” he commits an offense entailing expulsion when three conditions are fulfilled: before he has lied, he knows he is going to lie; while lying, he knows he is lying; after he has lied, he knows he has lied. 4.3.61

If he lies in full awareness, saying, “I obtain the first absorption,” he commits an offense entailing expulsion when four conditions are fulfilled: before he has lied, he knows he is going to lie; while 4.3.65

lying, he knows he is lying; after he has lied, he knows he has lied; he misrepresents his view of what is true.

4.3.70 If he lies in full awareness, saying, "I obtain the first absorption," he commits an offense entailing expulsion when five conditions are fulfilled: before he has lied, he knows he is going to lie; while lying, he knows he is lying; after he has lied, he knows he has lied; he misrepresents his view of what is true; he misrepresents his belief of what is true.

4.3.76 If he lies in full awareness, saying, "I obtain the first absorption," he commits an offense entailing expulsion when six conditions are fulfilled: before he has lied, he knows he is going to lie; while lying, he knows he is lying; after he has lied, he knows he has lied; he misrepresents his view of what is true; he misrepresents his belief of what is true; he misrepresents his acceptance of what is true.

4.3.83 If he lies in full awareness, saying, "I obtain the first absorption," he commits an offense entailing expulsion when seven conditions are fulfilled: before he has lied, he knows he is going to lie; while lying, he knows he is lying; after he has lied, he knows he has lied; he misrepresents his view of what is true; he misrepresents his belief of what is true; he misrepresents his acceptance of what is true; he misrepresents his sentiment of what is true.

4.3.91 If he lies in full awareness, saying, "I master the first absorption," he commits an offense entailing expulsion when three conditions are fulfilled: before he has lied, he knows he is going to lie; while lying, he knows he is lying; after he has lied, he knows he has lied.

4.3.95 If he lies in full awareness, saying, "I master the first absorption," he commits an offense entailing expulsion when four conditions are fulfilled: before he has lied, he knows he is going to lie; while lying, he knows he is lying; after he has lied, he knows he has lied; he misrepresents his view of what is true.

4.3.100 If he lies in full awareness, saying, "I master the first absorption," he commits an offense entailing expulsion when five conditions are fulfilled: before he has lied, he knows he is going to lie; while lying, he knows he is lying; after he has lied, he knows he has lied; he

misrepresents his view of what is true; he misrepresents his belief of what is true.

If he lies in full awareness, saying, “I master the first absorption,” 4.3.106 he commits an offense entailing expulsion when six conditions are fulfilled: before he has lied, he knows he is going to lie; while lying, he knows he is lying; after he has lied, he knows he has lied; he misrepresents his view of what is true; he misrepresents his belief of what is true; he misrepresents his acceptance of what is true.

If he lies in full awareness, saying, “I master the first absorption,” 4.3.113 he commits an offense entailing expulsion when seven conditions are fulfilled: before he has lied, he knows he is going to lie; while lying, he knows he is lying; after he has lied, he knows he has lied; he misrepresents his view of what is true; he misrepresents his belief of what is true; he misrepresents his acceptance of what is true; he misrepresents his sentiment of what is true.

If he lies in full awareness, saying, “I’ve realized the first absorption,” 4.3.121 he commits an offense entailing expulsion when three conditions are fulfilled: before he has lied, he knows he is going to lie; while lying, he knows he is lying; after he has lied, he knows he has lied.

If he lies in full awareness, saying, “I’ve realized the first absorption,” 4.3.125 he commits an offense entailing expulsion when four conditions are fulfilled: before he has lied, he knows he is going to lie; while lying, he knows he is lying; after he has lied, he knows he has lied; he misrepresents his view of what is true.

If he lies in full awareness, saying, “I’ve realized the first absorption,” 4.3.130 he commits an offense entailing expulsion when five conditions are fulfilled: before he has lied, he knows he is going to lie; while lying, he knows he is lying; after he has lied, he knows he has lied; he misrepresents his view of what is true; he misrepresents his belief of what is true.

If he lies in full awareness, saying, “I’ve realized the first absorption,” 4.3.136 he commits an offense entailing expulsion when six conditions are fulfilled: before he has lied, he knows he is going to lie;

while lying, he knows he is lying; after he has lied, he knows he has lied; he misrepresents his view of what is true; he misrepresents his belief of what is true; he misrepresents his acceptance of what is true.

- 4.3.143 If he lies in full awareness, saying, “I’ve realized the first absorption,” he commits an offense entailing expulsion when seven conditions are fulfilled: before he has lied, he knows he is going to lie; while lying, he knows he is lying; after he has lied, he knows he has lied; he misrepresents his view of what is true; he misrepresents his belief of what is true; he misrepresents his acceptance of what is true; he misrepresents his sentiment of what is true.

Other individual attainments

- 4.3.151.1 As the first absorption has been expanded in detail, so should all be expanded:

- 4.4.1 If he lies in full awareness, saying, “I attained the second absorption,” ... “I attained the third absorption,” ... “I attained the fourth absorption,” ... “I’m attaining ... “I’ve attained ... “I obtain ... “I master ... “I’ve realized the fourth absorption,” he commits an offense entailing expulsion when three conditions are fulfilled ... when seven conditions are fulfilled: before he has lied, he knows he is going to lie; while lying, he knows he is lying; after he has lied, he knows he has lied; he misrepresents his view of what is true; he misrepresents his belief of what is true; he misrepresents his acceptance of what is true; he misrepresents his sentiment of what is true.

- 4.5.1 If he lies in full awareness, saying, “I attained the emptiness release,” ... “I attained the signless release,” ... “I attained the desireless release,” ... “I’m attaining ... “I’ve attained ... “I obtain ... “I master ... “I’ve realized the desireless release,” he commits an offense entailing expulsion when three conditions are fulfilled: ...

- 4.5.9 If he lies in full awareness, saying, “I attained the emptiness stillness,” ... “I attained the signless stillness,” ... “I attained the desireless stillness,” ... “I’m attaining ... “I’ve attained ... “I obtain

... “I master ... “I’ve realized the desireless stillness,” he commits an offense entailing expulsion when three conditions are fulfilled.

If he lies in full awareness, saying, “I attained the emptiness attainment,” ... “I attained the signless attainment,” ... “I attained the desireless attainment,” ... “I’m attaining ... “I’ve attained ... “I obtain ... “I master ... “I’ve realized the desireless attainment,” he commits an offense entailing expulsion when three conditions are fulfilled. 4.5.17

If he lies in full awareness, saying, “I attained the three true insights,” ... “I’m attaining ... “I’ve attained ... “I obtain ... “I master ... “I’ve realized the three true insights,” he commits an offense entailing expulsion when three conditions are fulfilled. 4.5.25

If he lies in full awareness, saying, “I attained the four applications of mindfulness,” ... “I attained the four right efforts,” ... “I attained the four foundations for supernormal power,” ... “I’m attaining ... “I’ve attained ... “I obtain ... “I master ... “I’ve realized the four foundations for supernormal power,” he commits an offense entailing expulsion when three conditions are fulfilled. 4.5.31

If he lies in full awareness, saying, “I attained the five spiritual faculties,” ... “I attained the five spiritual powers,” ... “I’m attaining ... “I’ve attained ... “I obtain ... “I master ... “I’ve realized the five spiritual powers,” he commits an offense entailing expulsion when three conditions are fulfilled. 4.5.39

If he lies in full awareness, saying, “I attained the seven factors of awakening,” ... “I’m attaining ... “I’ve attained ... “I obtain ... “I master ... “I’ve realized the seven factors of awakening,” he commits an offense entailing expulsion when three conditions are fulfilled. 4.5.46

If he lies in full awareness, saying, “I attained the noble eightfold path,” ... “I’m attaining ... “I’ve attained ... “I obtain ... “I master ... “I’ve realized the noble eightfold path,” he commits an offense entailing expulsion when three conditions are fulfilled. 4.5.52

If he lies in full awareness, saying, “I attained the fruit of stream-entry,” ... “I attained the fruit of once-returning,” ... “I attained 4.5.58

the fruit of non-returning,” ... “I attained perfection ... “I’m attaining ... “I’ve attained ... “I obtain ... “I master ... “I’ve realized perfection,” he commits an offense entailing expulsion when three conditions are fulfilled.

4.5.65 If he lies in full awareness, saying, “I’ve given up sensual desire, renounced it, let it go, abandoned it, relinquished it, forsaken it, thrown it aside,” he commits an offense entailing expulsion when three conditions are fulfilled.

4.5.66 If he lies in full awareness, saying, “I’ve given up ill will, renounced it, let it go, abandoned it, relinquished it, forsaken it, thrown it aside,” he commits an offense entailing expulsion when three conditions are fulfilled.

4.5.67 If he lies in full awareness, saying, “I’ve given up confusion, renounced it, let it go, abandoned it, relinquished it, forsaken it, thrown it aside,” he commits an offense entailing expulsion when three conditions are fulfilled.

4.5.68 If he lies in full awareness, saying, “My mind is free from the hindrance of sensual desire,” he commits an offense entailing expulsion when three conditions are fulfilled.

4.5.69 If he lies in full awareness, saying, “My mind is free from the hindrance of ill will,” he commits an offense entailing expulsion when three conditions are fulfilled.

4.5.70 If he lies in full awareness, saying, “My mind is free from the hindrance of confusion,” he commits an offense entailing expulsion when three conditions are fulfilled ... when seven conditions are fulfilled: before he has lied, he knows he is going to lie; while lying, he knows he is lying; after he has lied, he knows he has lied; he misrepresents his view of what is true; he misrepresents his belief of what is true; he misrepresents his acceptance of what is true; he misrepresents his sentiment of what is true.

*The basic series is finished.*⁵⁶

56. For an explanation of these sectional summaries, see Appendix of Technical Terms.

Combinations of two attainments

If he lies in full awareness, saying, “I attained the first absorption and the second absorption,” ... “I’m attaining ... “I’ve attained ... “I obtain ... “I master ... “I’ve realized the first absorption and the second absorption,” he commits an offense entailing expulsion when three conditions are fulfilled: before he has lied, he knows he is going to lie; while lying, he knows he is lying; after he has lied, he knows he has lied. 4.6.1

If he lies in full awareness, saying, “I attained the first absorption and the third absorption,” ... “I’m attaining ... “I’ve attained ... “I obtain ... “I master ... “I’ve realized the first absorption and the third absorption,” he commits an offense entailing expulsion when three conditions are fulfilled. 4.6.7

If he lies in full awareness, saying, “I attained the first absorption and the fourth absorption,” ... “I’m attaining ... “I’ve attained ... “I obtain ... “I master ... “I’ve realized the first absorption and the fourth absorption,” he commits an offense entailing expulsion when three conditions are fulfilled. 4.6.13

If he lies in full awareness, saying, “I attained the first absorption and the emptiness release,” ... “I attained the first absorption and the signless release,” ... “I attained the first absorption and the desireless release,” ... “I’m attaining ... “I’ve attained ... “I obtain ... “I master ... “I’ve realized the first absorption and the desireless release,” he commits an offense entailing expulsion when three conditions are fulfilled. 4.6.19

If he lies in full awareness, saying, “I attained the first absorption and the emptiness stillness,” ... “I attained the first absorption and the signless stillness,” ... “I attained the first absorption and the desireless stillness,” ... “I’m attaining ... “I’ve attained ... “I obtain ... “I master ... “I’ve realized the first absorption and the desireless stillness,” he commits an offense entailing expulsion when three conditions are fulfilled. 4.6.27

If he lies in full awareness, saying, “I attained the first absorption and the emptiness attainment,” ... “I attained the first absorption 4.6.35

and the signless attainment,” ... “I attained the first absorption and the desireless attainment,” ... “I’m attaining ... “I’ve attained ... “I obtain ... “I master ... “I’ve realized the first absorption and the desireless attainment,” he commits an offense entailing expulsion when three conditions are fulfilled.

4.6.43 If he lies in full awareness, saying, “I attained the first absorption and the three true insights,” ... “I’m attaining ... “I’ve attained ... “I obtain ... “I master ... “I’ve realized the first absorption and the three true insights,” he commits an offense entailing expulsion when three conditions are fulfilled.

4.6.49 If he lies in full awareness, saying, “I attained the first absorption and the four applications of mindfulness,” ... “I attained the first absorption and the four right efforts,” ... “I attained the first absorption and the four foundations for supernormal power,” ... “I’m attaining ... “I’ve attained ... “I obtain ... “I master ... “I’ve realized the first absorption and the four foundations for supernormal power,” he commits an offense entailing expulsion when three conditions are fulfilled.

4.6.57 If he lies in full awareness, saying, “I attained the first absorption and the five spiritual faculties,” ... “I attained the first absorption and the five spiritual powers,” ... “I’m attaining ... “I’ve attained ... “I obtain ... “I master ... “I’ve realized the first absorption and the five spiritual powers,” he commits an offense entailing expulsion when three conditions are fulfilled.

4.6.64 If he lies in full awareness, saying, “I attained the first absorption and the seven factors of awakening,” ... “I’m attaining ... “I’ve attained ... “I obtain ... “I master ... “I’ve realized the first absorption and the seven factors of awakening,” he commits an offense entailing expulsion when three conditions are fulfilled.

4.6.70 If he lies in full awareness, saying, “I attained the first absorption and the noble eightfold path,” ... “I’m attaining ... “I’ve attained ... “I obtain ... “I master ... “I’ve realized the first absorption and the noble eightfold path,” he commits an offense entailing expulsion when three conditions are fulfilled.

If he lies in full awareness, saying, “I attained the first absorption and the fruit of stream-entry,” ... “I attained the first absorption and the fruit of once-returning,” ... “I attained the first absorption and the fruit of non-returning,” ... “I attained the first absorption and perfection,” ... “I’m attaining ... “I’ve attained ... “I obtain ... “I master ... “I’ve realized the first absorption and perfection,” he commits an offense entailing expulsion when three conditions are fulfilled. 4.6.76

If he lies in full awareness, saying, “I attained the first absorption and I’ve given up sensual desire,” ... “I’m attaining ... “I’ve attained ... “I obtain ... “I master ... “I’ve realized the first absorption and I’ve given up sensual desire ... and I’ve given up ill will ... and I’ve given up confusion, renounced it, let it go, abandoned it, relinquished it, forsaken it, thrown it aside,” he commits an offense entailing expulsion when three conditions are fulfilled. 4.6.85

If he lies in full awareness, saying, “I attained the first absorption and my mind is free from the hindrance of sensual desire,” ... “I’m attaining ... “I’ve attained ... “I obtain ... “I master ... “I’ve realized the first absorption and my mind is free from the hindrance of sensual desire,” ... and my mind is free from the hindrance of ill will,” ... and my mind is free from the hindrance of confusion,” he commits an offense entailing expulsion when three conditions are fulfilled ... when seven conditions are fulfilled: before he has lied, he knows he is going to lie; while lying, he knows he is lying; after he has lied, he knows he has lied; he misrepresents his view of what is true; he misrepresents his belief of what is true; he misrepresents his acceptance of what is true; he misrepresents his sentiment of what is true. 4.6.93

The unconnected permutation series is finished.

If he lies in full awareness, saying, “I attained the second absorption and the third absorption,” ... “I’m attaining ... “I’ve attained ... “I obtain ... “I master ... “I’ve realized the second absorption and the third absorption,” he commits an offense entailing expulsion when three conditions are fulfilled. 4.7.1

- 4.7.7 If he lies in full awareness, saying, “I attained the second absorption and the fourth absorption,” ... “I’m attaining ... “I’ve attained ... “I obtain ... “I master ... “I’ve realized the second absorption and the fourth absorption,” he commits an offense entailing expulsion when three conditions are fulfilled.
- 4.7.13 If he lies in full awareness, saying, “I attained the second absorption and the emptiness release,” ... and the signless release,” ... and the desireless release,” ... and the emptiness stillness,” ... and the signless stillness,” ... and the desireless stillness,” ... and the emptiness attainment,” ... and the signless attainment,” ... and the desireless attainment,” ... and the three true insights,” ... and the four applications of mindfulness,” ... and the four right efforts,” ... and the four foundations for supernormal power,” ... and the five spiritual faculties,” ... and the five spiritual powers,” ... and the seven factors of awakening,” ... and the noble eightfold path,” ... and the fruit of stream-entry,” ... and the fruit of once-returning,” ... and the fruit of non-returning,” ... and perfection,” ... “I’m attaining ... “I’ve attained ... “I obtain ... “I master ... “I’ve realized the second absorption and perfection,” he commits an offense entailing expulsion when three conditions are fulfilled.
- 4.7.39 If he lies in full awareness, saying, “I attained the second absorption and I’ve given up sensual desire ... “I’m attaining ... “I’ve attained ... “I obtain ... “I master ... “I’ve realized the second absorption and I’ve given up sensual desire ... and I’ve given up ill will ... and I’ve given up confusion, renounced it, let it go, abandoned it, relinquished it, forsaken it, thrown it aside,” ... and my mind is free from the hindrance of sensual desire,” ... and my mind is free from the hindrance of ill will,” ... and my mind is free from the hindrance of confusion,” he commits an offense entailing expulsion when three conditions are fulfilled.
- 4.7.50 If he lies in full awareness, saying, “I attained the second absorption and the first absorption,” ... “I’m attaining ... “I’ve attained ... “I obtain ... “I master ... “I’ve realized the second absorption and the first absorption,” he commits an offense entailing expulsion

when three conditions are fulfilled ... when seven conditions are fulfilled ... he misrepresents his sentiment of what is true.

The linked permutation series is finished.

In this way each section is to be dealt with as in the linked permutation series. 4.8.1

Here it is in brief: 4.8.2

If he lies in full awareness, saying, “I attained the third absorption and the fourth absorption,” ... the third absorption and perfection,” ... “I’m attaining ... “I’ve attained ... “I obtain ... “I master ... “I’ve realized the third absorption and perfection,” he commits an offense entailing expulsion when three conditions are fulfilled. 4.8.3

If he lies in full awareness, saying, “I attained the third absorption and I’ve given up sensual desire ... “I’m attaining ... “I’ve attained ... “I obtain ... “I master ... “I’ve realized the third absorption and I’ve given up sensual desire ... and I’ve given up ill will ... and I’ve given up confusion, renounced it, let it go, abandoned it, relinquished it, forsaken it, thrown it aside,” ...⁵⁷ and my mind is free from the hindrance of sensual desire,” ... and my mind is free from the hindrance of ill will,” ... and my mind is free from the hindrance of confusion,” he commits an offense entailing expulsion when three conditions are fulfilled. 4.8.10

If he lies in full awareness, saying, “I attained the third absorption and the first absorption,” ... “I attained the third absorption and the second absorption,” ... “I’m attaining ... “I’ve attained ... “I obtain ... “I master ... “I’ve realized the third absorption and the second absorption,” he commits an offense entailing expulsion when three conditions are fulfilled. ...⁵⁸ 4.8.21

If he lies in full awareness, saying, “My mind is free from the hindrance of confusion and I attained the first absorption,” ... the second absorption,” ... the third absorption,” ... the fourth absorption,” ... “I’m attaining ... “I’ve attained ... “I obtain ... “I master ... “My mind is free from the hindrance of confusion 4.8.28

57. It seems the Pali has left the ellipses points out by mistake.

58. It seems ellipses points are missing from the end of the Pali segment.

and I've realized the fourth absorption," he commits an offense entailing expulsion when three conditions are fulfilled.

4.8.37 If he lies in full awareness, saying, "My mind is free from the hindrance of confusion and I attained the emptiness release," ... and I attained the signless release," ... and I attained the desireless release," ... "I'm attaining ... "I've attained ... "I obtain ... "I master ... "My mind is free from the hindrance of confusion and I've realized the desireless release," he commits an offense entailing expulsion when three conditions are fulfilled.

4.8.45 If he lies in full awareness, saying, "My mind is free from the hindrance of confusion and I attained the emptiness stillness," ... and I attained the signless stillness," ... and I attained the desireless stillness," ... "I'm attaining ... "I've attained ... "I obtain ... "I master ... "My mind is free from the hindrance of confusion and I've realized the desireless stillness," he commits an offense entailing expulsion when three conditions are fulfilled.

4.8.53 If he lies in full awareness, saying, "My mind is free from the hindrance of confusion and I attained the emptiness attainment," ... and I attained the signless attainment," ... and I attained the desireless attainment," ... "I'm attaining ... "I've attained ... "I obtain ... "I master ... "My mind is free from the hindrance of confusion and I've realized the desireless attainment," he commits an offense entailing expulsion when three conditions are fulfilled.

4.8.61 If he lies in full awareness, saying, "My mind is free from the hindrance of confusion and I attained the three true insights," ... "I'm attaining ... "I've attained ... "I obtain ... "I master ... "My mind is free from the hindrance of confusion and I've realized the three true insights," he commits an offense entailing expulsion when three conditions are fulfilled.

4.8.67 If he lies in full awareness, saying, "My mind is free from the hindrance of confusion and I attained the four applications of mindfulness," ... and I attained the four right efforts," ... and I attained the four foundations for supernormal power," ... "I'm attaining ... "I've attained ... "I obtain ... "I master ... "My mind is free from the

hindrance of confusion and I've realized the four foundations for supernormal power," he commits an offense entailing expulsion when three conditions are fulfilled.

If he lies in full awareness, saying, "My mind is free from the hindrance of confusion and I attained the five spiritual faculties," ... and I attained the five spiritual powers," ... "I'm attaining ... "I've attained ... "I obtain ... "I master ... "My mind is free from the hindrance of confusion and I've realized the five spiritual powers," he commits an offense entailing expulsion when three conditions are fulfilled. 4.8.75

If he lies in full awareness, saying, "My mind is free from the hindrance of confusion and I attained the seven factors of awakening," ... "I'm attaining ... "I've attained ... "I obtain ... "I master ... "My mind is free from the hindrance of confusion and I've realized the seven factors of awakening," he commits an offense entailing expulsion when three conditions are fulfilled. 4.8.82

If he lies in full awareness, saying, "My mind is free from the hindrance of confusion and I attained the noble eightfold path," ... "I'm attaining ... "I've attained ... "I obtain ... "I master ... "My mind is free from the hindrance of confusion and I've realized the noble eightfold path," he commits an offense entailing expulsion when three conditions are fulfilled. 4.8.88

If he lies in full awareness, saying, "My mind is free from the hindrance of confusion and I attained the fruit of stream-entry," ... and I attained the fruit of once-returning," ... and I attained the fruit of non-returning," ... and I attained perfection," ... and I'm attaining ... and I've attained ... and I obtain ... and I master ... "My mind is free from the hindrance of confusion and I've realized perfection," he commits an offense entailing expulsion when three conditions are fulfilled. 4.8.94

If he lies in full awareness, saying, "My mind is free from the hindrance of confusion and I've given up sensual desire ... and I've given up ill will ... and I've given up confusion, renounced it, let it go, abandoned it, relinquished it, forsaken it, thrown it aside," he 4.8.103

commits an offense entailing expulsion when three conditions are fulfilled.

- 4.8.106 If he lies in full awareness, saying, “My mind is free from the hindrance of confusion and my mind is free from the hindrance of sensual desire,” ... and my mind is free from the hindrance of ill will,” he commits an offense entailing expulsion when three conditions are fulfilled ... when seven conditions are fulfilled: before he has lied, he knows he is going to lie; while lying, he knows he is lying; after he has lied, he knows he has lied; he misrepresents his view of what is true; he misrepresents his belief of what is true; he misrepresents his acceptance of what is true; he misrepresents his sentiment of what is true.

*The section based on one item is finished.*⁵⁹

Combinations of more than two attainments

- 4.9.1 The sections based on two items, etc., are to be given in detail in the same way as the section based on one item.

Combination of all attainments

- 4.9.2.1 This is the section based on all items:

- 4.9.3 If he lies in full awareness, saying, “I attained the first absorption and the second absorption and the third absorption and the fourth absorption and the emptiness release and the signless release and the desireless release and the emptiness stillness and the signless stillness and the desireless stillness and the emptiness attainment and the signless attainment and the desireless attainment and the three true insights and the four applications of mindfulness and the four right efforts and the four foundations for supernormal power and the five spiritual faculties and the five spiritual powers and the seven factors of awakening and the noble eightfold path and the fruit of stream-entry and the fruit of once-returning and the fruit

59. Although two attainments are given in each case of the above permutation series, it seems that only the one which remains unchanged within each subsection is considered the “one item”.

of non-returning and perfection ... and I'm attaining ... and I've attained ... etc. ... and I've given up sensual desire, renounced it, let it go, abandoned it, relinquished it, forsaken it, thrown it aside; and I've given up ill will, renounced it, let it go, abandoned it, relinquished it, forsaken it, thrown it aside; and I've given up confusion, renounced it, let it go, abandoned it, relinquished it, forsaken it, thrown it aside; and my mind is free from the hindrance of sensual desire and my mind is free from the hindrance of ill will and my mind is free from the hindrance of confusion," he commits an offense entailing expulsion when three conditions are fulfilled ... when seven conditions are fulfilled: before he has lied, he knows he is going to lie; while lying, he knows he is lying; after he has lied, he knows he has lied; he misrepresents his view of what is true; he misrepresents his belief of what is true; he misrepresents his acceptance of what is true; he misrepresents his sentiment of what is true.

The section based on all items is finished.

The exposition of the section on the basic series is finished.

Meaning to say first absorption, but saying something else

If he lies in full awareness, meaning to say, "I attained the first absorption," while actually saying, "I attained the second absorption," then, if the listener understands, he commits an offense entailing expulsion when three conditions are fulfilled;⁶⁰ if the listener does

60. "If the listener understands" renders *paṭivijānantassa*. This is in accordance with Sp 1.219, which has this to say: *Atha pana yassa āroceti, so na jānāti "ki ayam bhaṇāti"ti, samsayam vā āpajjati, ciraṃ vimamsitvā vā pacchā jānāti, appaṭivijānanto icceva saṅkhyam gacchati*, "When he who is informed does not understand, thinking, 'What does he say?' or he has doubt, or he understands after reflecting for a long time, then it is considered 'one who does not understand.'" Grammatically *paṭivijānantassa* could refer to either the speaker or the listener (it can be regarded as a genitive agreeing with *bhaṇantassa*, thus referring to the speaker, or it can be regarded as a dative of the person spoken to, that is, the listener), but logically it seems it must refer to the listener. In accordance with common usage, "understanding" (*paṭivijānantassa*) must refer to understanding the overall meaning of what is said, not to knowing

not understand, he commits a serious offense when three conditions are fulfilled.

- 5.1.3 If he lies in full awareness, meaning to say, “I attained the first absorption,” while actually saying, “I attained the third absorption,” then, if the listener understands, he commits an offense entailing expulsion when three conditions are fulfilled; if the listener does not understand, he commits a serious offense when three conditions are fulfilled.
- 5.1.5 If he lies in full awareness, meaning to say, “I attained the first absorption,” while actually saying, “I attained the fourth absorption,” then, if the listener understands, he commits an offense entailing expulsion when three conditions are fulfilled; if the listener does not understand, he commits a serious offense when three conditions are fulfilled.
- 5.1.7 If he lies in full awareness, meaning to say, “I attained the first absorption,” while actually saying, “I attained the emptiness release,” ... the signless release,” ... the desireless release,” ... the emptiness stillness,” ... the signless stillness,” ... the desireless stillness,” ... the emptiness attainment,” ... the signless attainment,” ... the desireless attainment,” ... the three true insights,” ... the four applications of mindfulness,” ... the four right efforts,” ... the four foundations for supernormal power,” ... the five spiritual faculties,” ... the five spiritual powers,” ... the seven factors of awakening,” ... the noble eightfold path,” ... the fruit of stream-entry,” ... the fruit of once-returning,” ... the fruit of non-returning,” ... perfection,” ... “I’ve given up sensual desire ... “I’ve given up ill will ... “I’ve given up confusion, renounced it, let it go, abandoned

the exact words that have been spoken. Since the speaker knows he is lying, he understands the overall meaning. It follows that the understanding here must refer to the listener. A parallel construction is found at Bu Pj 1:8.4.10 where *paṭivijānāti* is used in connection with giving up the monastic training. Here the verb clearly refers to understanding on the part of the listener, that is, one has only succeeded in renouncing the training if the listener understands what one is saying. At Bu Ss 3:4.1.4 the same verb, this time in the aorist form *paṭivijāni*, again refers to the listener.

it, relinquished it, forsaken it, thrown it aside,” “My mind is free from the hindrance of sensual desire,” ... “My mind is free from the hindrance of ill will,” ... “My mind is free from the hindrance of confusion,” then, if the listener understands, he commits an offense entailing expulsion when three conditions are fulfilled; if the listener does not understand, he commits a serious offense when three conditions are fulfilled ... when seven conditions are fulfilled: before he has lied, he knows he is going to lie; while lying, he knows he is lying; after he has lied, he knows he has lied; he misrepresents his view of what is true; he misrepresents his belief of what is true; he misrepresents his acceptance of what is true; he misrepresents his sentiment of what is true.

*The unconnected permutation series based on one item with a speech extension is finished.*⁶¹

Meaning to say second absorption, but saying something else

If he lies in full awareness, meaning to say, “I attained the second absorption,” while actually saying, “I attained the third absorption,” then, if the listener understands, he commits an offense entailing expulsion when three conditions are fulfilled; if the listener does not understand, he commits a serious offense when three conditions are fulfilled. 5.2.1

If he lies in full awareness, meaning to say, “I attained the second absorption,” while actually saying, “I attained the fourth absorption,” ... “My mind is free from the hindrance of confusion,” then, if the listener understands, he commits an offense entailing expulsion when three conditions are fulfilled; if the listener does not understand, he commits a serious offense when three conditions are fulfilled. 5.2.3

If he lies in full awareness, meaning to say, “I attained the second absorption,” while actually saying, “I attained the first absorption,” 5.2.6

61. The Pali text reads *vatthu*, “basis”, rather than *vattu*, “speech”. However, I have chosen to follow the alternative reading of *vattu*, found in the PTS edition, since this seems more reasonable to me given the context.

then, if the listener understands, he commits an offense entailing expulsion when three conditions are fulfilled; if the listener does not understand, he commits a serious offense when three conditions are fulfilled ... when seven conditions are fulfilled ... he misrepresents his sentiment of what is true.

The linked permutation series based on one item with a speech extension is finished.

The basis in brief is finished.

Meaning to say he is free from confusion, but saying something else

5.3.1 If he lies in full awareness, meaning to say, "My mind is free from the hindrance of confusion," while actually saying, "I attained the first absorption," then, if the listener understands, he commits an offense entailing expulsion when three conditions are fulfilled; if the listener does not understand, he commits a serious offense when three conditions are fulfilled.

5.3.3 If he lies in full awareness, meaning to say, "My mind is free from the hindrance of confusion," while actually saying, "My mind is free from the hindrance of ill will," then, if the listener understands, he commits an offense entailing expulsion when three conditions are fulfilled; if the listener does not understand, he commits a serious offense when three conditions are fulfilled ... when seven conditions are fulfilled ... he misrepresents his sentiment of what is true.

The section based on one item with a speech extension is finished.

Meaning to say any particular combination of individual attainments, but saying something else

5.4.1 The sections based on two items, etc., are to be given in detail in the same way as the section based on one item.

Meaning to say all the attainments but one, and instead saying the remaining one

5.4.2.1 This is the section based on all items:

5.4.3 If he lies in full awareness, meaning to say, "I attained the first absorption and the second absorption and the third absorption and

the fourth absorption and the emptiness release and the signless release and the desireless release and the emptiness stillness and the signless stillness and the desireless stillness and the emptiness attainment and the signless attainment and the desireless attainment and the three true insights and the four applications of mindfulness and the four right efforts and the four foundations for supernormal power and the five spiritual faculties and the five spiritual powers and the seven factors of awakening and the noble eightfold path and the fruit of stream-entry and the fruit of once-returning and the fruit of non-returning and perfection ... and I've given up sensual desire ... and I've given up ill will ... and I've given up confusion, renounced it, let it go, abandoned it, relinquished it, forsaken it, thrown it aside; and my mind is free from the hindrance of sensual desire and my mind is free from the hindrance of ill will," while actually saying, "My mind is free from the hindrance of confusion," then, if the listener understands, he commits an offense entailing expulsion when three conditions are fulfilled; if the listener does not understand, he commits a serious offense when three conditions are fulfilled ... when seven conditions are fulfilled.

If he lies in full awareness, meaning to say, "I attained the second 5.4.8 absorption and the third absorption and the fourth absorption and the emptiness release and the signless release and the desireless release and the emptiness stillness and the signless stillness and the desireless stillness and the emptiness attainment and the signless attainment and the desireless attainment and the three true insights and the four applications of mindfulness and the four right efforts and the four foundations for supernormal power and the five spiritual faculties and the five spiritual powers and the seven factors of awakening and the noble eightfold path and the fruit of stream-entry and the fruit of once-returning and the fruit of non-returning and perfection ... and I've given up sensual desire ... and I've given up ill will ... and I've given up confusion, renounced it, let it go, abandoned it, relinquished it, forsaken it, thrown it aside; and my mind is free from the hindrance of sensual desire and my

mind is free from the hindrance of ill will and my mind is free from the hindrance of confusion,” while actually saying, “I attained the first absorption,” then, if the listener understands, he commits an offense entailing expulsion when three conditions are fulfilled; if the listener does not understand, there is a serious offense when three conditions are fulfilled.

5.4.13 If he lies in full awareness, meaning to say, “I attained the third absorption and the fourth absorption ... and my mind is free from the hindrance of confusion and I attained the first absorption,” while actually saying, “I attained the second absorption,” then, if the listener understands, he commits an offense entailing expulsion when three conditions are fulfilled; if the listener does not understand, he commits a serious offense when three conditions are fulfilled.

5.4.16 If he lies in full awareness, meaning to say, “My mind is free from the hindrance of confusion and I attained the first absorption and the second absorption and the third absorption and the fourth absorption ... and my mind is free from the hindrance of sensual desire,” while actually saying, “My mind is free from the hindrance of ill will,” then, if the listener understands, he commits an offense entailing expulsion when three conditions are fulfilled; if the listener does not understand, he commits a serious offense when three conditions are fulfilled ... when seven conditions are fulfilled: before he has lied, he knows he is going to lie; while lying, he knows he is lying; after he has lied, he knows he has lied; he misrepresents his view of what is true; he misrepresents his belief of what is true; he misrepresents his acceptance of what is true; he misrepresents his sentiment of what is true.

The section based on all items with a speech extension is finished.

The successive permutation series with a speech extension is finished.

The exposition of the section on “meaning to say” is finished.

Gross hinting: in regard to dwellings

6.1.1 If he lies in full awareness, saying, “The monk who stayed in your dwelling attained the first absorption,” ... is attaining ... has at-

tained ... obtains ... masters ... has realized the first absorption," then, if the listener understands, he commits a serious offense when three conditions are fulfilled; if the listener does not understand, he commits an offense of wrong conduct when three conditions are fulfilled: before he has lied, he knows he is going to lie; while lying, he knows he is lying; after he has lied, he knows he has lied.

If he lies in full awareness, saying, "The monk who stayed in your dwelling attained the first absorption," ... is attaining ... has attained ... obtains ... masters ... has realized the first absorption," then, if the listener understands, he commits a serious offense when four ... five ... six ... seven conditions are fulfilled; if the listener does not understand, he commits an offense of wrong conduct when seven conditions are fulfilled: before he has lied, he knows he is going to lie; while lying, he knows he is lying; after he has lied, he knows he has lied; he misrepresents his view of what is true; he misrepresents his belief of what is true; he misrepresents his acceptance of what is true; he misrepresents his sentiment of what is true. 6.1.11

If he lies in full awareness, saying, "The monk who stayed in your dwelling attained the second absorption," ... the third absorption," ... the fourth absorption," ... the emptiness release," ... the signless release," ... the desireless release," ... the emptiness stillness," ... the signless stillness," ... the desireless stillness," ... the emptiness attainment," ... the signless attainment," ... the desireless attainment," ... the three true insights," ... the four applications of mindfulness," ... the four right efforts," ... the four foundations for supernormal power," ... the five spiritual faculties," ... the five spiritual powers," ... the seven factors of awakening," ... the noble eightfold path," ... the fruit of stream-entry," ... the fruit of once-returning," ... the fruit of non-returning," ... perfection," ... is attaining ... has attained ... obtains ... masters ... has realized perfection," then, if the listener understands, he commits a serious offense when three conditions are fulfilled; if the listener does not 6.1.25

understand, he commits an offense of wrong conduct when three conditions are fulfilled.

6.1.55 If he lies in full awareness, saying, “The monk who stayed in your dwelling has given up sensual desire ... has given up ill will ... has given up confusion, renounced it, has let it go, has abandoned it, has relinquished it, has forsaken it, has thrown it aside,” then, if the listener understands, he commits a serious offense when three conditions are fulfilled; if the listener does not understand, he commits an offense of wrong conduct when three conditions are fulfilled.

6.1.59 If he lies in full awareness, saying, “The monk who stayed in your dwelling has a mind free from the hindrance of sensual desire,” ... a mind free from the hindrance of ill will,” ... a mind free from the hindrance of confusion,” then, if the listener understands, he commits a serious offense when three conditions are fulfilled; if the listener does not understand, he commits an offense of wrong conduct when three conditions are fulfilled ... when seven conditions are fulfilled: before he has lied, he knows he is going to lie; while lying, he knows he is lying; after he has lied, he knows he has lied; he misrepresents his view of what is true; he misrepresents his belief of what is true; he misrepresents his acceptance of what is true; he misrepresents his sentiment of what is true.

6.1.70 If he lies in full awareness, saying, “The monk who stayed in your dwelling attained the first absorption in solitude,” ... the second absorption ... the third absorption ... the fourth absorption ... is attaining ... has attained ... obtains ... masters ... has realized the fourth absorption in solitude,” then, if the listener understands, he commits a serious offense when three conditions are fulfilled; if the listener does not understand, he commits an offense of wrong conduct when three conditions are fulfilled ... when seven conditions are fulfilled: before he has lied, he knows he is going to lie; while lying, he knows he is lying; after he has lied, he knows he has lied; he misrepresents his view of what is true; he misrepresents

his belief of what is true; he misrepresents his acceptance of what is true; he misrepresents his sentiment of what is true.

Gross hinting: in regard to any requisite

The remainder should be given in detail in the same way: 6.1.87.1

If he lies in full awareness, saying, “The monk who made use of your robe-cloth ... who made use of your almsfood ... who made use of your furniture ... who made use of your medicinal supplies attained the fourth absorption in solitude,” ... is attaining ... has attained ... obtains ... masters ... has realized the fourth absorption in solitude,” then, if the listener understands, he commits a serious offense when three conditions are fulfilled; if the listener does not understand, he commits an offense of wrong conduct when three conditions are fulfilled ... when seven conditions are fulfilled ... he misrepresents his sentiment of what is true. 6.2.1

If he lies in full awareness, saying, “The monk who has made use of your dwelling ... who has made use of your robe-cloth ... who has made use of your almsfood ... who has made use of your furniture ...⁶² who has made use of your medicinal supplies⁶³ attained the fourth absorption in solitude,” ... is attaining ... has attained ... obtains ... masters ... has realized the fourth absorption in solitude,” then, if the listener understands, he commits a serious offense when three conditions are fulfilled; if the listener does not understand, he commits an offense of wrong conduct when three conditions are fulfilled ... when seven conditions are fulfilled ... he misrepresents his sentiment of what is true. 6.2.12

If he lies in full awareness, saying, “The monk you gave a dwelling to ... you gave robe-cloth to ... you gave almsfood to ... you gave furniture to ... you gave medicinal supplies to, he attained the fourth absorption in solitude,” ... is attaining ... has attained ... obtains ... masters ... he has realized the fourth absorption in 6.2.25

62. Because *vihāra*, “dwelling”, is mentioned just before, I here render *senāsana* as furniture.

63. The Pali has a set of ellipses points at the end of this segment. This seems to be a mistake.

solitude,” then, if the listener understands, he commits a serious offense when three conditions are fulfilled; if the listener does not understand, he commits an offense of wrong conduct when three conditions are fulfilled . . . when seven conditions are fulfilled: before he has lied, he knows he is going to lie; while lying, he knows he is lying; after he has lied, he knows he has lied; he misrepresents his view of what is true; he misrepresents his belief of what is true; he misrepresents his acceptance of what is true; he misrepresents his sentiment of what is true.

The successive fifteen are finished.

The exposition of the section on that connected with requisites is finished.

The successive permutation series on superhuman qualities is finished.

Non-offenses

- 7.1 There is no offense: if he overestimates himself; if he does not intend to make a claim; if he is insane; if he is deranged; if he is overwhelmed by pain; if he is the first offender.

Summary verses of case studies

- 7.9 “About overestimation, in the wilderness,
Almsfood, preceptor, behavior;
Fetters, qualities in private,
Dwelling, supported.
- 7.13 Not difficult, and then energy, fear of death,
Remorseful friend, rightly;
To be reached by energy, to be reached by exertion,
Then two on the enduring of feeling.
- 7.17 Five cases of a brahmin,
Three on declaring final knowledge;
Home, rejected sense pleasures,
And delight, set out.
- 7.21 Bone, and lump—both are cattle butchers;
A morsel is a poultry butcher, a sheep butcher is flayed;
And a pig butcher and sword, a deer hunter and knife,
And a torturer and arrow, a horse trainer and needle.

And a slanderer is sewn, A corrupt magistrate had testicles as burden; An adulterer submerged in a pit, An eater of feces was a wicked brahmin.	7.25
A flayed woman was an adulteress, An ugly woman was a fortune-teller; A sweating woman poured coals on a co-wife, A beheaded man was an executioner.	7.29
A monk, a nun, a trainee nun, A novice monk, then a novice nun— These having gone forth in the training of Kassapa did bad deeds right there.	7.33
The Tapodā, battle in Rājagaha, And with the plunging in of elephants; The perfected monk Sobhita recalled five hundred eons.”	7.37

Case studies, part 1

At one time a monk declared final knowledge because of over- 8.1.1
estimation. He became anxious, thinking, “The Buddha has laid
down a training rule. Could it be that I’ve committed an offense
entailing expulsion?” He told the Buddha. “There’s no offense for
overestimates.”

At one time a monk lived in the wilderness because he wanted 8.2.1
people to esteem him. People esteemed him. He became anxious
... “There’s no offense entailing expulsion.

**But, monks, you should not live in the wilderness because of
a wish. If you do, you commit an offense of wrong conduct.”**

At one time a monk was walking for almsfood because he wanted 8.2.7
people to esteem him. People esteemed him. He became anxious
... “There’s no offense entailing expulsion.

**But, monks, you should not walk for almsfood because of a
wish. If you do, you commit an offense of wrong conduct.”**

8.3.1 At one time a monk said to another monk, “Those who are pupils of our preceptor are all perfected ones.” He became anxious ... “What were you thinking, monk?”

8.3.5 “I wanted to make a claim, Sir.”

8.3.6 “There’s no offense entailing expulsion, but there’s a serious offense.”

8.3.8 At one time a monk said to another monk, “Those who are pupils of our preceptor all have great supernormal power.” He became anxious ... “What were you thinking, monk?”

8.3.12 “I wanted to make a claim, Sir.”

8.3.13 “There’s no offense entailing expulsion, but there’s a serious offense.”

8.4.1 At one time a monk did walking meditation because he wanted people to esteem him ... stood because he wanted people to esteem him ... sat because he wanted people to esteem him ... lay down because he wanted people to esteem him. People esteemed him. He became anxious ... “There’s no offense entailing expulsion.

But, monks, you should not lie down because of a wish. If you do, you commit an offense of wrong conduct.”

8.5.1 At one time a monk claimed a superhuman quality to another monk, saying, “I’ve abandoned the fetters.” He became anxious ... “You’ve committed an offense entailing expulsion.”

8.6.1 At one time a monk claimed a superhuman quality in private. A monk who could read minds rebuked him, saying, “No, you haven’t got it.” He became anxious ... “There’s no offense entailing expulsion, but there’s an offense of wrong conduct.”

8.6.8 At one time a monk claimed a superhuman quality in private. A god rebuked him, saying, “No, Sir, you haven’t got it.” He became anxious ... “There’s no offense entailing expulsion, but there’s an offense of wrong conduct.”

8.7.1 At one time a monk said to a lay follower, “The monk living in your dwelling is a perfected one.” He was the one who lived in that dwelling. He became anxious ... “What were you thinking, monk?”

“I wanted to make a claim, Sir.” 8.7.6

“There’s no offense entailing expulsion, but there’s a serious offense.” 8.7.7

At one time a monk said to a lay follower, “The one you support with with robe-cloth, almsfood, a dwelling, and medicinal supplies, he’s a perfected one.” He was the one who was supported in that way. He became anxious ... “What were you thinking, monk?” 8.7.9

“I wanted to make a claim, Sir.” 8.7.14

“There’s no offense entailing expulsion, but there’s a serious offense.” 8.7.15

At one time a monk was ill. The monks said to him, “Venerable, do you have any superhuman qualities?” 8.8.1

“It’s not difficult to declare final knowledge.” 8.8.4

He became anxious and thought, “Those who are true disciples of the Buddha may say that, but I’m no such disciple. Could it be that I’ve committed an offense entailing expulsion?” He told the Buddha. “What were you thinking, monk?” 8.8.5

“I didn’t intend to make a claim, Sir.” 8.8.11

“There’s no offense for one who doesn’t intend to make a claim.” 8.8.12

At one time a monk was ill. The monks said to him, “Venerable, do you have any superhuman qualities?” 8.9.1

“Superhuman qualities are attained by those who are energetic.” He became anxious ... 8.9.4

“There’s no offense for one who doesn’t intend to make a claim.” 8.9.6

At one time a monk was ill. The monks said to him, “Don’t be afraid.” 8.9.7

“I’m not afraid of death.” He became anxious ... 8.9.10

“There’s no offense for one who doesn’t intend to make a claim.” 8.9.12

At one time a monk was ill. The monks said to him, “Don’t be afraid.” 8.9.13

“One who’s remorseful might be afraid.” He became anxious ... 8.9.16

“There’s no offense for one who doesn’t intend to make a claim.” 8.9.18

At one time a monk was ill. The monks said to him, “Venerable, do you have any superhuman qualities?” 8.9.19

- 8.9.22 “Superhuman qualities are attained by those who apply themselves rightly.” He became anxious ...
- 8.9.24 “There’s no offense for one who doesn’t intend to make a claim.”
- 8.9.25 At one time a monk was ill. The monks said to him, “Venerable, do you have any superhuman qualities?”
- 8.9.28 “Superhuman qualities are attained by those who are energetic.” He became anxious ...
- 8.9.30 “There’s no offense for one who doesn’t intend to make a claim.”
- 8.9.31 At one time a monk was ill. The monks said to him, “Venerable, do you have any superhuman qualities?”
- 8.9.34 “Superhuman qualities are attained by those who exert themselves.” He became anxious ...
- 8.9.36 “There’s no offense for one who doesn’t intend to make a claim.”
- 8.10.1 At one time a monk was ill. The monks said to him, “We hope you’re bearing up? We hope you’re comfortable?”
- 8.10.4 “It’s not possible for just anyone to endure this.” He became anxious ...
- 8.10.6 “There’s no offense for one who doesn’t intend to make a claim.”
- 8.10.7 At one time a monk was ill. The monks said to him, “We hope you’re bearing up? We hope you’re comfortable?”
- 8.10.10 “It’s not possible for an ordinary person to endure this.” He became anxious ...
- 8.10.12 “What were you thinking, monk?”
- 8.10.13 “I intended to make a claim, Sir.”
- 8.10.14 “There’s no offense entailing expulsion, but there’s a serious offense.”
- 8.11.1 At one time a brahmin invited the monks, saying, “Perfected sirs, please come.”
- 8.11.3 They became anxious and said, “We’re not perfected ones, and yet this brahmin speaks to us as if we are. What should we do?” They told the Buddha.
- 8.11.8 “There’s no offense when something is spoken in faith.”

At one time a brahmin invited the monks, saying, “Perfected sirs, please be seated.” ... “Perfected sirs, please eat.” ... “Perfected sirs, please be satisfied.” ... “Perfected sirs, please go.” 8.11.9

They became anxious and said, “We’re not perfected ones, and yet this brahmin speaks to us as if we are. What should we do?” They told the Buddha. 8.11.14

“There’s no offense when something is spoken in faith.” 8.11.19

At one time a monk claimed a superhuman quality to another monk, saying, “I’ve abandoned the corruptions.” He became anxious ... “You’ve committed an offense entailing expulsion.” 8.12.1

At one time a monk claimed a superhuman quality to another monk, saying, “I have these qualities.” He became anxious ... “You’ve committed an offense entailing expulsion.” 8.12.5

At one time a monk claimed a superhuman quality to another monk, saying, “I conform to these qualities.” He became anxious ... “You’ve committed an offense entailing expulsion.” 8.12.9

At one time the relatives of a certain monk said to him, “Come, Sir, live at home.” 8.13.1

“One like me is incapable of living at home.” He became anxious 8.13.3

...

“There’s no offense for one who doesn’t intend to make a claim.” 8.13.5

At one time the relatives of a certain monk said to him, “Come, Sir, enjoy worldly pleasures.” 8.13.6

“The pleasures of the world have been rejected by me.” He became anxious ... 8.13.8

“There’s no offense for one who doesn’t intend to make a claim.” 8.13.10

At one time the relatives of a certain monk said to him, “Come, Sir, enjoy yourself.” 8.13.11

“I’m enjoying myself with the highest enjoyment.” 8.13.13

He became anxious, thinking, “Those who are true disciples of the Buddha may say that, but I’m no such disciple. Could it be that I’ve committed an offense entailing expulsion?” He told the Buddha. 8.13.14

“What were you thinking, monk?” 8.13.19

- 8.13.20 “I didn’t intend to make a claim, Sir.”
- 8.13.21 “There’s no offense for one who doesn’t intend to make a claim.”
- 8.14.1 At one time a number of monks entered the rainy-season residence in a certain monastery, making this agreement: “Whoever sets out from this monastery first, we’ll know him as a perfected one.”
- 8.14.3 One of them thought, “Let them think I’m a perfected one,” and he set out first from that monastery. He became anxious . . .
- 8.14.7 “You’ve committed an offense entailing expulsion.”

Case studies, part 2

- 9.1.1 At one time when the Buddha was staying at Rājagaha in the Bamboo Grove, the squirrel sanctuary, Venerable Lakkhaṇa and Venerable Mahāmoggallāna were staying on the Vulture Peak. One morning Mahāmoggallāna robed up, took his bowl and robe, went to Lakkhaṇa, and said, “Lakkhaṇa, let’s enter Rājagaha for alms-food.”
- 9.1.5 “Yes.”
- 9.1.6 As they descended from the Vulture Peak, Mahāmoggallāna smiled at a certain place. Lakkhaṇa asked him why, and Mahāmoggallāna replied,
- 9.1.9 “This isn’t the right time to ask. Please ask me in the presence of the Buddha.”
- 9.2.1 Then, when they had eaten their meal and returned from alms-round, Lakkhaṇa and Mahāmoggallāna went to the Buddha, bowed, and sat down. And Lakkhaṇa said to Mahāmoggallāna,
- 9.2.4 “Earlier on, as we were descending from the Vulture Peak, you smiled at a certain place. Why was that?”
- 9.2.6 “As I was coming down from the Vulture Peak, I saw a skeleton flying through the air. Vultures, crows, and hawks were pursuing it, striking it between the ribs, while it uttered cries of distress. And I thought how amazing and astonishing it is that such a being should exist, such a spirit, such a state of existence.”

But the monks complained and criticized him, “He’s claiming a superhuman ability!” 9.2.13

The Buddha then said to them: 9.2.15

“There are disciples who have vision and knowledge, who can know, see, and witness such things. I too, monks, have seen that being, but I didn’t speak about it. If I had, others wouldn’t have believed me, which would have led to their harm and suffering for a long time. That being was a cattle butcher right here in Rājagaha. As a result of his deeds, he was tormented in hell for many hundreds of thousands of years. And now, because of the remaining result of his actions, he’s experiencing such an existence. Moggallāna spoke truthfully. There’s no offense for Moggallāna.” 9.2.16

“As I was coming down from the Vulture Peak, I saw a lump of flesh flying through the air. Vultures, crows, and hawks were pursuing it, tearing at it and pulling it to pieces, while it uttered cries of distress. ...” ... 9.3.1

“... That being, monks, was a cattle butcher right here in Rājagaha. ...” 9.3.4

“As I was coming down from the Vulture Peak, I saw a morsel of flesh flying through the air. Vultures, crows, and hawks were pursuing it, tearing at it and pulling it to pieces, while it uttered cries of distress. ...” ... 9.3.5

“... That being, monks, was a poultry butcher right here in Rājagaha. ...” 9.3.8

“As I was coming down from the Vulture Peak, I saw a flayed man flying through the air. Vultures, crows, and hawks were pursuing him, tearing at him and pulling him to pieces, while he uttered cries of distress. ...” ... 9.3.9

“... That being, monks, was a mutton butcher right here in Rājagaha. ...” 9.3.12

“As I was coming down from the Vulture Peak, I saw a man with swords for body hairs flying through the air. Again and again he was stabbed by those swords, while uttering cries of distress. ...” ... 9.3.13

- 9.3.16 “... That being, monks, was a pork butcher right here in Rājagaha. ...”
- 9.3.17 “As I was coming down from the Vulture Peak, I saw a man with knives for body hairs flying through the air. Again and again he was stabbed by those knives, while uttering cries of distress. ...” ...
- 9.3.20 “... That being, monks, was a deer hunter right here in Rājagaha. ...”
...
- 9.3.21 “As I was coming down from the Vulture Peak, I saw a man with arrows for body hairs flying through the air. Again and again he was pierced by those arrows, while uttering cries of distress. ...” ...
- 9.3.24 “... That being, monks, was a torturer right here in Rājagaha. ...”
...
- 9.3.25 “As I was coming down from the Vulture Peak, I saw a man with needles for body hairs flying through the air. Again and again he was pierced by those needles, while uttering cries of distress. ...”
...
- 9.3.28 “... That being, monks, was a horse trainer right here in Rājagaha. ...”
- 9.3.29 “As I was coming down from the Vulture Peak, I saw a man with needles for body hairs flying through the air. Those needles entered his head and came out through his mouth, entered his mouth and came out through his breast, entered his breast and came out through his stomach, entered his stomach and came out through his thighs, entered his thighs and came out through his calves, entered his calves and came out through his feet, as he uttered cries of distress. ...” ...
- 9.3.37 “... That being, monks, was a slanderer right here in Rājagaha. ...”
...
- 9.3.38 “As I was coming down from the Vulture Peak, I saw a man flying through the air with testicles like pots. When he moved, he lifted his testicles onto his shoulders; when he sat down, he sat on top of his testicles. Vultures, crows, and hawks were pursuing him, tearing at him and pulling him to pieces, while he uttered cries of distress. ...” ...

“... That being, monks, was a corrupt magistrate right here in Rājagaha. ...” 9.3.43

“As I was coming down from the Vulture Peak, I saw a man submerged in a cesspit ...” 9.3.44

“... That being, monks, was an adulterer right here in Rājagaha. ...” 9.3.45

“As I was coming down from the Vulture Peak, I saw a man submerged in a cesspit, eating feces with both hands ...” 9.3.46

“... That being, monks, was a wicked brahmin right here in Rājagaha. At the time of Kassapa, the fully Awakened One, he had invited the Sangha of monks to a meal. He filled a trough with feces, had them informed that the meal was ready, and said, ‘Sirs, eat as much as you like and take the leftovers with you.’ ...” 9.3.47

“As I was coming down from the Vulture Peak, I saw a flayed woman flying through the air. Vultures, crows, and hawks were pursuing her, tearing at her and pulling her to pieces, while she uttered cries of distress. ...” ... 9.3.50

“... That woman, monks, was an adulteress right here in Rājagaha. ...” 9.3.53

“As I was coming down from the Vulture Peak, I saw a foul-smelling and ugly woman flying through the air. Vultures, crows, and hawks were pursuing her, tearing at her and pulling her to pieces, while she uttered cries of distress. ...” ... 9.3.54

“... That woman, monks, was a fortune-teller right here in Rājagaha. ...” 9.3.57

“As I was coming down from the Vulture Peak, I saw a woman flying through the air, roasting, sweltering, and sooty. Vultures, crows, and hawks were pursuing her, tearing at her and pulling her to pieces, while she uttered cries of distress. ...” ... 9.3.58

“... That woman, monks, was the chief queen of the King of Kāliṅga. Overcome by jealousy, she poured a pan of burning coals over a rival. ...” 9.3.60

“As I was coming down from the Vulture Peak, I saw the headless trunk of a body flying through the air, with eyes and mouth on its 9.3.62

chest. Vultures, crows, and hawks were pursuing it, tearing at it and pulling it to pieces, while it uttered cries of distress. ...” ...

9.3.66 “... That being, monks, was an executioner called Hārika right here in Rājagaha. ...”

9.3.67 “As I was coming down from the Vulture Peak, I saw a monk flying through the air. His outer robe was ablaze and burning, as were his bowl, belt, and body.⁶⁴ He uttered cries of distress. ...” ...

9.3.70 “... During the time of the Buddha Kassapa’s dispensation, he was a bad monk.” ...

9.3.71 “As I was coming down from the Vulture Peak, I saw a nun ... I saw a trainee nun ... I saw a novice monk ... I saw a novice nun flying through the air. Her outer robe was ablaze and burning, as were her bowl, belt, and body. She uttered cries of distress. And I thought how amazing and astonishing it is that such a being should exist, such a spirit, such a state of existence.”

9.3.81 But the monks complained and criticized him, “He’s claiming a superhuman ability!”

9.3.83 The Buddha then said to them:

9.3.84 “There are disciples who possess vision and knowledge, who can see, know, and witness such things. I too, monks, have seen that novice nun, but I didn’t speak about it. If I had, others wouldn’t have believed me, which would have led to their harm and suffering for a long time. During the time of Buddha Kassapa’s dispensation, she was a bad novice nun. As a result of her deeds, she was tormented in hell for many hundreds of thousands of years. And now, because of the remaining result of her actions, she’s experiencing such an existence. Moggallāna spoke truthfully. There’s no offense for Moggallāna.”

9.4.1 Venerable Mahāmoggallāna said to the monks, “This stream, the Tapodā, flows from a lake with clear water—cool, sweet, and pure—with smooth and pleasant banks, with an abundance of fish and turtles, and with blooming lotuses the size of wheels.”

64. For the rendering of *saṅghāṭi* as “outer robe”, see Appendix of Technical Terms.

The monks complained and criticized him, “How can Venerable Mahāmoggallāna talk like this when the Tapodā is actually hot? He’s claiming a superhuman ability!” And they told the Buddha. 9.4.3

“Monks, the Tapodā does flow from a lake with clear water— cool, sweet, and pure—with smooth and pleasant banks, with an abundance of fish and turtles, and with blooming lotuses the size of wheels. But the Tapodā runs between two great hells. That’s why it’s hot. Moggallāna spoke truthfully. There’s no offense for Moggallāna.” 9.4.9

At one time King Seniya Bimbisāra of Magadha was defeated in battle by the Licchavīs. The King then rallied his army and beat the Licchavīs. People were delighted and the word spread that the Licchavīs had been defeated by the king. 9.5.1

But Venerable Mahāmoggallāna said to the monks, “The King was defeated by the Licchavīs.” 9.5.5

The monks complained and criticized him, “How can Venerable Moggallāna talk like this when people are delighted and the word is spreading that the Licchavīs have been defeated by the King? He’s claiming a superhuman ability!” They told the Buddha. 9.5.7

“Monks, first the King was defeated by the Licchavīs, but then he rallied his army and beat them. Moggallāna spoke truthfully. There’s no offense for Moggallāna.” 9.5.14

Venerable Mahāmoggallāna said to the monks, “After attaining an unshakable stillness on the banks of the river Sappinikā, I heard the sound of elephants plunging in and emerging from the water, and trumpeting too.” 9.6.1

The monks complained and criticized him, “How can Venerable Mahāmoggallāna talk like this? He’s claiming a superhuman ability!” They told the Buddha. 9.6.3

“Monks, there is such a stillness, but it’s not wholly purified. Moggallāna spoke truthfully. There’s no offense for Moggallāna.” 9.6.7

Venerable Sobhita said to the monks, “I can recall five hundred eons.” 9.7.1

9.7.3 The monks complained and criticized him, “How can Venerable Sobhita talk like this? He’s claiming a superhuman ability!” They told the Buddha.

9.7.8 “Monks, Sobhita has this ability, and that was just one birth. Sobhita spoke truthfully. There’s no offense for Sobhita.”

The fourth offense entailing expulsion is finished.

9.7.13 “Venerables, the four rules on expulsion have been recited. If a monk commits any one of them, he is no longer part of the community of monks. As before, so after: he’s expelled and excluded from the community. In regard to this I ask you, ‘Are you pure in this?’ A second time I ask, ‘Are you pure in this?’ A third time I ask, ‘Are you pure in this?’ You are pure in this and therefore silent. I’ll remember it thus.”

The offenses entailing expulsion are finished.

This is the summary:

9.7.26 “Sexual intercourse, and stealing,
Person, super—
The four offenses entailing expulsion,
Definitive grounds for cutting off.”

The chapter on offenses entailing expulsion is finished.

Suspension

The training rule on emission of semen

Sukkavisaṭṭhi

- 0.5 Venerables, these thirteen rules on suspension come up for recitation.

Origin story

First sub-story

- 1.1.1 At one time the Buddha was staying at Sāvattthī in the Jeta Grove, Anāthapiṇḍika's Monastery. At that time Venerable Seyyasaka was dissatisfied with the spiritual life. He became thin, haggard, and pale, with veins protruding all over his body. Venerable Udāyī saw him in this condition and said to him, "Seyyasaka, you're not looking well. You're not dissatisfied with the spiritual life, are you?"
- 1.1.7 "I am."
- 1.1.8 "Well then, eat , sleep, and bathe as much as you like. And whenever you become discontent and lust overwhelms you, just masturbate with your hand." "But is that allowable?"
- 1.1.11 "Yes, I do it too."
- 1.1.12 Then Seyyasaka ate, slept, and bathed as much as he liked, and whenever he became discontent and lust overwhelmed him, he masturbated with his hand. After some time Seyyasaka had a good color, a bright face, clear skin, and sharp senses. The monks who were his friends said to him, "Seyyasaka, you used to be thin, haggard, and pale, with veins protruding all over your body. But now you have a good color, a bright face, clear skin, and sharp senses. Have you been taking medicine?"
- 1.1.19 "No. I just eat, sleep, and bathe as much as I like, and whenever I become discontent and lust overwhelms me, I masturbate with my hand." "Do you eat the food given in faith with the same hand you use to masturbate?"
- 1.2.2 "Yes."

The monks of few desires complained and criticized him, “How 1.2.3
can Venerable Seyyasaka masturbate with his hand?”

They rebuked Seyyasaka in many ways and then told the Bud- 1.2.5
dha. The Buddha then had the Sangha gathered and questioned
Seyyasaka: “Is it true, Seyyasaka, that you do this?”

“Yes, Sir.” 1.2.8

The Buddha rebuked him, “Foolish man, it’s not suitable, it’s not 1.2.9
proper, it’s not worthy of a monastic, it’s not allowable, it’s not to be
done. How can you do this? Haven’t I given many teachings for the
sake of dispassion, not for the sake of passion; for freedom from
bondage, not for the sake of bondage; for the sake of non-grasping,
not for the sake of grasping? When I’ve taught like this, how can
you choose passion, bondage, and grasping? Haven’t I given many
teachings for the fading away of lust, for the clearing away of intoxi-
cation, for the removal of thirst, for the uprooting of attachment,
for the cutting off of the round of rebirth, for the stopping of crav-
ing, for fading away, for ending, for extinguishment? Haven’t I
given many teachings for the abandoning of sensual pleasures, for
the full understanding of the perceptions of sensual pleasure, for
the removal of thirst for sensual pleasure, for the elimination of
thoughts of sensual pleasure, for the stilling of the fevers of sensual
pleasure? Foolish man, this will affect people’s confidence, and
cause some to lose it.” Then, after rebuking Seyyasaka in many
ways, the Buddha spoke in dispraise of being difficult to support
... “And, monks, this training rule should be recited like this:

Preliminary ruling

**‘Intentional emission of semen is an offense entailing suspen-
sion.’”**

In this way the Buddha laid down this training rule for the 1.2.23
monks.

Second sub-story

- 2.1.1 Soon afterwards some monks ate fine foods, fell asleep absent-minded and heedless, and emitted semen while dreaming. They became anxious, thinking, “The Buddha has laid down a training rule that intentional emission of semen is an offense entailing suspension. We had an emission while dreaming, which is not without intention. Could it be that we’ve committed an offense entailing suspension?” They told the Buddha. “It’s true, monks, that a dream is not without intention, but it’s negligible. And so, monks, this training rule should be recited like this:

Final ruling

‘Intentional emission of semen, except while dreaming, is an offense entailing suspension.’”

Definitions

Intentional: knowing, perceiving, having intended, having decided, he transgresses.

Semen: there are ten kinds of semen: blue, yellow, red, white, the color of buttermilk, the color of water, the color of oil, the color of milk, the color of curd, the color of ghee.

Emission: making it move from its base—this is what is meant by “emission”.

Except while dreaming: apart from that which occurs while dreaming.

An offense entailing suspension: only the Sangha gives probation for that offense, sends back to the beginning, gives the trial period, and rehabilitates—not several monks, not an individual. Therefore it is called “an offense entailing suspension”.⁶⁵

65. “Gives the trial period” renders *mānattam deti*. For the meaning of *mānatta* see TAP, p.123. | The point here, which can only be understood from the Pali, is that the word *saṅghādisesa* (*saṅgha* + *ādisesa*) is derived from the fact

This is the name and designation of this class of offense. Therefore, too, it is called “an offense entailing suspension”.

Permutations

Permutations part 1

Summary

He emits by means of his own body. He emits by means of something external. He emits both by means of his own body and by means of something external. He emits shaking the pelvis in the air. 3.1.1

He emits because of stiffness due to sensual desire. He emits because of stiffness due to feces. He emits because of stiffness due to urine. He emits because of stiffness due to intestinal gas. He emits because of stiffness due to being stung by caterpillars. 3.1.5

He emits for the sake of health. He emits for the sake of pleasure. He emits for the sake of medicine. He emits for the sake of a gift. He emits for the sake of merit. He emits for the sake of sacrifice. He emits for the sake of heaven. He emits for the sake of seed. He emits for the sake of investigating. He emits for the sake of fun. 3.1.10

He emits blue. He emits yellow. He emits red. He emits white. He emits the color of buttermilk. He emits the color of water. He emits the color of oil. He emits the color of milk. He emits the color of curd. He emits the color of ghee. 3.1.20

Definitions

By means of his own body: by means of his own organic body.

By means of something external: by means of something organic or inorganic, externally.

Both by means of his own body and by means of something external: by means of both.

that only the *sangha* can do the legal procedures required when a monastic commits this offense.

Shaking the pelvis in the air: for one making an effort in the air,
the penis becomes erect.

Because of stiffness due to sensual desire: for one oppressed
by sensual desire, the penis becomes erect.

Because of stiffness due to feces: for one oppressed by feces,
the penis becomes erect.

Because of stiffness due to urine: for one oppressed by urine,
the penis becomes erect.

Because of stiffness due to intestinal gas: for one oppressed by
intestinal gas, the penis becomes erect.

Because of stiffness due to being bitten by caterpillars: for
one bitten by caterpillars, the penis becomes erect.

For the sake of health: thinking, “I’ll be healthy.”

For the sake of pleasure: thinking, “I’ll produce a pleasant feel-
ing.”

For the sake of medicine: thinking, “There will be medicine.”

For the sake of a gift: thinking, “I’ll give a gift.”

For the sake of merit: thinking, “There will be merit.”

For the sake of sacrifice: thinking, “I’ll offer a sacrifice.”

For the sake of heaven: thinking, “I’ll go to heaven.”

For the sake of seed: thinking, “There will be seed.”

For the sake of investigating: thinking, “Will it be blue?”, “Will
it be yellow?”, “Will it be red?”, “Will it be white?”, “Will it be
the color of buttermilk?”, “Will it be the color of water?”, “Will
it be the color of oil?”, “Will it be the color of milk?”, “Will it be
the color of curd?”, “Will it be the color of ghee?”

For the sake of fun: desiring to play.

Exposition part 1

3.3.1 If, by means of his own body, he intends and makes an effort, and
semen is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

3.3.2 If, by means of something external, he intends and makes an
effort, and semen is emitted, he commits an offense entailing sus-
pension.

If, both by means of his own body and by means of something external, he intends and makes an effort, and semen is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension. 3.3.3

If, shaking the pelvis in the air, he intends and makes an effort, and semen is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension. 3.3.4

If, when there is stiffness due to sensual desire, he intends and makes an effort, and semen is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension. 3.3.5

If, when there is stiffness due to feces, he intends and makes an effort, and semen is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension. 3.3.6

If, when there is stiffness due to urine, he intends and makes an effort, and semen is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension. 3.3.7

If, when there is stiffness due to intestinal gas, he intends and makes an effort, and semen is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension. 3.3.8

If, when there is stiffness due to being bitten by caterpillars, he intends and makes an effort, and semen is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension. 3.3.9

Exposition part 2

A single purpose

If, for the sake of health, he intends and makes an effort, and semen is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension. 3.3.10.1

If, for the sake of pleasure ... If, for the sake of medicine ... If, for the sake of a gift ... If, for the sake of merit ... If, for the sake of sacrifice ... If, for the sake of heaven ... If, for the sake of seed ... If, for the sake of investigating ... If, for the sake of fun, he intends and makes an effort, and semen is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension. 3.3.11

One kind of semen

- 3.3.20.1 If he intends blue, makes an effort, and semen is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension.
- 3.3.21 If he intends yellow ... If he intends red ... If he intends white ... If he intends the color of buttermilk ... If he intends the color of water ... If he intends the color of oil ... If he intends the color of milk ... If he intends the color of curd ... If he intends the color of ghee, makes an effort, and semen is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

*The basic series is finished.*⁶⁶

Two purposes

- 3.4.1.1 If, for the sake of health and for the sake of pleasure, he intends and makes an effort, and semen is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension.
- 3.4.2 If, for the sake of health and for the sake of medicine ... If, for the sake of health and for the sake of a gift ... If, for the sake of health and for the sake of merit ... If, for the sake of health and for the sake of sacrifice ... If, for the sake of health and for the sake of heaven ... If, for the sake of health and for the sake of seed ... If, for the sake of health and for the sake of investigating ... If, for the sake of health and for the sake of fun, he intends and makes an effort, and semen is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

*The unconnected permutation series based on one item is finished.*⁶⁷

- 3.5.1 If, for the sake of pleasure and for the sake of medicine, he intends and makes an effort, and semen is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension.
- 3.5.2 If, for the sake of pleasure and for the sake of a gift ... If, for the sake of pleasure and for the sake of merit ... If, for the sake of pleasure and for the sake of sacrifice ... If, for the sake of pleasure

66. For an explanation of these sectional summaries, see Appendix of Technical Terms.

67. See Glossary of Specialized Terms for these section-ending terms.

and for the sake of heaven ... If, for the sake of pleasure and for the sake of seed ... If, for the sake of pleasure and for the sake of investigating ... If, for the sake of pleasure and for the sake of fun, he intends and makes an effort, and semen is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

If, for the sake of pleasure and for the sake of health, he intends and makes an effort, and semen is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension. 3.5.9

If, for the sake of medicine and for the sake of a gift ... If, for the sake of medicine and for the sake of merit ... If, for the sake of medicine and for the sake of sacrifice ... If, for the sake of medicine and for the sake of heaven ... If, for the sake of medicine and for the sake of seed ... If, for the sake of medicine and for the sake of investigating ... If, for the sake of medicine and for the sake of fun, he intends and makes an effort, and semen is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension. 3.5.10

If, for the sake of medicine and for the sake of health ... If, for the sake of medicine and for the sake of pleasure, he intends and makes an effort, and semen is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension. 3.5.17

If, for the sake of a gift and for the sake of merit ... If, for the sake of a gift and for the sake of sacrifice ... If, for the sake of a gift and for the sake of heaven ... If, for the sake of a gift and for the sake of seed ... If, for the sake of a gift and for the sake of investigating ... If, for the sake of a gift and for the sake of fun, he intends and makes an effort, and semen is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension. 3.5.19

If, for the sake of a gift and for the sake of health ... If, for the sake of a gift and for the sake of pleasure ... If, for the sake of a gift and for the sake of medicine, he intends and makes an effort, and semen is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension. 3.5.25

If, for the sake of merit and for the sake of sacrifice ... If, for the sake of merit and for the sake of heaven ... If, for the sake of merit and for the sake of seed ... If, for the sake of merit and for the sake 3.5.28

of investigating ... If, for the sake of merit and for the sake of fun, he intends and makes an effort, and semen is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

3.5.33 If, for the sake of merit and for the sake of health ... If, for the sake of merit and for the sake of pleasure ... If, for the sake of merit and for the sake of medicine ... If, for the sake of merit and for the sake of a gift, he intends and makes an effort, and semen is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

3.5.37 If, for the sake of sacrifice and for the sake of heaven ... If, for the sake of sacrifice and for the sake of seed ... If, for the sake of sacrifice and for the sake of investigating ... If, for the sake of sacrifice and for the sake of fun, he intends and makes an effort, and semen is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

3.5.41 If, for the sake of sacrifice and for the sake of health ... If, for the sake of sacrifice and for the sake of pleasure ... If, for the sake of sacrifice and for the sake of medicine ... If, for the sake of sacrifice and for the sake of a gift ... If, for the sake of sacrifice and for the sake of merit, he intends and makes an effort, and semen is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

3.5.46 If, for the sake of heaven and for the sake of seed ... If, for the sake of heaven and for the sake of investigating ... If, for the sake of heaven and for the sake of fun, he intends and makes an effort, and semen is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

3.5.49 If, for the sake of heaven and for the sake of health ... If, for the sake of heaven and for the sake of pleasure ... If, for the sake of heaven and for the sake of medicine ... If, for the sake of heaven and for the sake of a gift ... If, for the sake of heaven and for the sake of merit ... If, for the sake of heaven and for the sake of sacrifice, he intends and makes an effort, and semen is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

3.5.55 If, for the sake of seed and for the sake of investigating ... If, for the sake of seed and for the sake of fun, he intends and makes an effort, and semen is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

If, for the sake of seed and for the sake of health ... If, for the sake of seed and for the sake of pleasure ... If, for the sake of seed and for the sake of medicine ... If, for the sake of seed and for the sake of a gift ... If, for the sake of seed and for the sake of merit ... If, for the sake of seed and for the sake of sacrifice ... If, for the sake of seed and for the sake of heaven, he intends and makes an effort, and semen is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension. 3.5.57

If, for the sake of investigating and for the sake of fun, he intends and makes an effort, and semen is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension. 3.5.64

If, for the sake of investigating and for the sake of health ... If, for the sake of investigating and for the sake of pleasure ... If, for the sake of investigating and for the sake of medicine ... If, for the sake of investigating and for the sake of a gift ... If, for the sake of investigating and for the sake of merit ... If, for the sake of investigating and for the sake of sacrifice ... If, for the sake of investigating and for the sake of heaven ... If, for the sake of investigating and for the sake of seed, he intends and makes an effort, and semen is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension. 3.5.65

If, for the sake of fun and for the sake of health ... If, for the sake of fun and for the sake of pleasure ... If, for the sake of fun and for the sake of medicine ... If, for the sake of fun and for the sake of a gift ... If, for the sake of fun and for the sake of merit ... If, for the sake of fun and for the sake of sacrifice ... If, for the sake of fun and for the sake of heaven ... If, for the sake of fun and for the sake of seed ... If, for the sake of fun and for the sake of investigating, he intends and makes an effort, and semen is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension. 3.5.73

*The linked permutation series based on one item is finished.*⁶⁸

Three purposes

If, for the sake of health and for the sake of pleasure and for the sake of medicine, he intends and makes an effort, and semen is 3.5.83.1

68. See Glossary of Specialized Terms for these section-ending terms.

emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension. ... If, for the sake of health and for the sake of pleasure and for the sake of fun, he intends and makes an effort, and semen is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

The unconnected permutation series based on two items is finished.

- 3.5.86 If, for the sake of pleasure and for the sake of medicine and for the sake of a gift, he intends and makes an effort, and semen is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension. ... If, for the sake of pleasure and for the sake of medicine and for the sake of fun ... If, for the sake of pleasure and for the sake of medicine and for the sake of health, he intends and makes an effort, and semen is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

The linked permutation series based on two items in brief is finished.

- 3.5.90 If, for the sake of investigating and for the sake of fun and for the sake of a health, he intends and makes an effort, and semen is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension. ... If, for the sake of investigating and for the sake of fun and for the sake of seed, he intends and makes an effort, and semen is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

The section based on two items is finished.

Four to nine purposes

- 3.5.93.1 Three items, four items, five items, six items, seven items, eight items, and nine items are to be expanded in the same way.

Ten purposes

- 3.5.94.1 This is the section based on all items:

- 3.5.95 If, for the sake of health and for the sake of pleasure and for the sake of medicine and for the sake of a gift and for the sake of merit and for the sake of sacrifice and for the sake of heaven and for the sake of seed and for the sake of investigating and for the sake of fun, he intends and makes an effort, and semen is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

The section based on all items is finished.

Two kinds of semen

If he intends blue and yellow, makes an effort, and semen is emitted, 3.6.1
he commits an offense entailing suspension.

If he intends blue and red ... If he intends blue and white ... If 3.6.2
he intends blue and the color of buttermilk ... If he intends blue
and the color of water ... If he intends blue and the color of oil ...
If he intends blue and the color of milk ... If he intends blue and
the color of curd ... If he intends blue and the color of ghee, makes
an effort, and semen is emitted, he commits an offense entailing
suspension.

The unconnected permutation series based on one item is finished.

If he intends yellow and red, makes an effort, and semen is emit- 3.6.11
ted, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

If he intends yellow and white ... If he intends yellow and the 3.6.12
color of buttermilk ... If he intends yellow and the color of water
... If he intends yellow and the color of oil ... If he intends yellow
and the color of milk ... If he intends yellow and the color of curd
... If he intends yellow and the color of ghee, makes an effort, and
semen is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

If he intends yellow and blue, makes an effort, and semen is 3.6.19
emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

The linked permutation series based on one item is finished.

If he intends red and white, makes an effort, and semen is emit- 3.6.21
ted, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

If he intends red and the color of buttermilk ... If he intends 3.6.22
red and the color of water ... If he intends red and the color of oil
... If he intends red and the color of milk ... If he intends red and
the color of curd ... If he intends red and the color of ghee, makes
an effort, and semen is emitted, he commits an offense entailing
suspension.

If he intends red and blue ... If he intends red and yellow, makes 3.6.28
an effort, and semen is emitted, he commits an offense entailing
suspension.

- 3.6.30 If he intends white and the color of buttermilk ... If he intends white and the color of water ... If he intends white and the color of oil ... If he intends white and the color of milk ... If he intends white and the color of curd ... If he intends white and the color of ghee, makes an effort, and semen is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension.
- 3.6.36 If he intends white and blue ... If he intends white and yellow ... If he intends white and red, makes an effort, and semen is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension.
- 3.6.39 If he intends the color of buttermilk and the color of water ... If he intends the color of buttermilk and the color of oil ... If he intends the color of buttermilk and the color of milk ... If he intends the color of buttermilk and the color of curd ... If he intends the color of buttermilk and the color of ghee, makes an effort, and semen is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension.
- 3.6.44 If he intends the color of buttermilk and blue ... If he intends the color of buttermilk and yellow ... If he intends the color of buttermilk and red ... If he intends the color of buttermilk and white, makes an effort, and semen is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension.
- 3.6.48 If he intends the color of water and the color of oil ... If he intends the color of water and the color of milk ... If he intends the color of water and the color of curd ... If he intends the color of water and the color of ghee, makes an effort, and semen is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension.
- 3.6.52 If he intends the color of water and blue ... If he intends the color of water and yellow ... If he intends the color of water and red ... If he intends the color of water and white ... If he intends the color of water and the color of buttermilk, makes an effort, and semen is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension.
- 3.6.57 If he intends the color of oil and the color of milk ... If he intends the color of oil and the color of curd ... If he intends the color of oil and the color of ghee, makes an effort, and semen is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

If he intends the color of oil and blue ... If he intends the color of oil and yellow ... If he intends the color of oil and red ... If he intends the color of oil and white ... If he intends the color of oil and the color of buttermilk ... If he intends the color of oil and the color of water, makes an effort, and semen is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension. 3.6.60

If he intends the color of milk and the color of curd ... If he intends the color of milk and the color of ghee, makes an effort, and semen is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension. 3.6.66

If he intends the color of milk and blue ... If he intends the color of milk and yellow ... If he intends the color of milk and red ... If he intends the color of milk and white ... If he intends the color of milk and the color of buttermilk ... If he intends the color of milk and the color of water ... If he intends the color of milk and the color of oil, makes an effort, and semen is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension. 3.6.68

If he intends the color of curd and the color of ghee, makes an effort, and semen is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension. 3.6.75

If he intends the color of curd and blue ... If he intends the color of curd and yellow ... If he intends the color of curd and red ... If he intends the color of curd and white ... If he intends the color of curd and the color of buttermilk ... If he intends the color of curd and the color of water ... If he intends the color of curd and the color of oil ... If he intends the color of curd and the color of milk, makes an effort, and semen is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension. 3.6.76

If he intends the color of ghee and blue, makes an effort, and semen is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension. 3.6.84

If he intends the color of ghee and yellow ... If he intends the color of ghee and red ... If he intends the color of ghee and white ... If he intends the color of ghee and the color of buttermilk ... If he intends the color of ghee and the color of water ... If he intends the color of ghee and the color of oil ... If he intends the color 3.6.85

of ghee and the color of milk ... If he intends the color of ghee and the color of curd, makes an effort, and semen is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

The linked permutation series based on one item is finished.

Three kinds of semen

- 3.6.94.1 If he intends blue and yellow and red, makes an effort, and semen is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension. ... If he intends blue and yellow and the color of ghee, makes an effort, and semen is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

The unconnected permutation series based on two items is finished.

- 3.6.97 If he intends yellow and red and white, makes an effort, and semen is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension. ... If he intends yellow and red and the color of ghee ... If he intends yellow and red and blue, makes an effort, and semen is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

The linked permutation series based on two items in brief is finished.

- 3.6.101 If he intends the color of curd and the color of ghee and blue, makes an effort, and semen is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension. ... If he intends the color of curd and the color of ghee and the color of milk, makes an effort, and semen is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

The section based on two items is finished.

Four to nine kinds of semen

- 3.6.104.1 The sections based on three items, four items, five items, six items, seven items, eight items, and nine items are to be expanded in the same way.

Ten kinds of semen

- 3.6.105.1 This is the section based on all items:
 3.6.106 If he intends blue and yellow and red and white and the color of buttermilk and the color of water and the color of oil and the color of milk and the color of curd and the color of ghee, makes

an effort, and semen is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

The section based on all items is finished.

Purposes combined with kinds of semen

If he intends for the sake of health and blue, makes an effort, and semen is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension. 3.7.1

If he intends for the sake of health and for the sake of pleasure and blue and yellow, makes an effort, and semen is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension. 3.7.2

If he intends for the sake of health and for the sake of pleasure and for the sake of medicine and blue and yellow and red, makes an effort, and semen is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension. 3.7.3

(In this way both aspects are to be expanded.) 3.7.4

If he intends for the sake of health and for the sake of pleasure and for the sake of medicine and for the sake of a gift and for the sake of merit and for the sake of sacrifice and for the sake of heaven and for the sake of seed and for the sake of investigating and for the sake of fun and blue and yellow and red and white and the color of buttermilk and the color of water and the color of oil and the color of milk and the color of curd and the color of ghee, makes an effort, and semen is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension. 3.7.5

The mixed permutation series is finished.

Intending one kind of semen, emitting another kind

If he intends, “I’ll emit blue,” makes an effort, and yellow is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension. 3.8.1

If he intends, “I’ll emit blue,” makes an effort, and red is emitted ... white ... the color of buttermilk ... the color of water ... the color of oil ... the color of milk ... the color of curd ... the color of ghee is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension. 3.8.2

The unconnected permutation series is finished.

3.8.11 If he intends, “I’ll emit yellow,” makes an effort, and red is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

3.8.12 If he intends, “I’ll emit yellow,” makes an effort, and white is emitted ... the color of buttermilk ... the color of water ... the color of oil ... the color of milk ... the color of curd ... the color of ghee ... blue is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

The basis of the linked permutation series in brief is finished.

3.8.21 ... If he intends, “I’ll emit the color of ghee,” makes an effort, and blue is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

3.8.22 If he intends, “I’ll emit the color of ghee,” makes an effort, and yellow is emitted ... red ... white ... the color of buttermilk ... the color of water ... the color of oil ... the color of milk ... the color of curd is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

The core permutation series is finished.⁶⁹

3.9.1 If he intends, “I’ll emit yellow,” makes an effort, and blue is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

3.9.2 If he intends, “I’ll emit red ... white ... the color of buttermilk ... the color of water ... the color of oil ... the color of milk ... the color of curd ... the color of ghee,” makes an effort, and blue is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

The first round of the additional permutation series is finished.⁷⁰

3.9.11 If he intends, “I’ll emit red,” makes an effort, and yellow is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

3.9.12 If he intends, “I’ll emit white ... the color of buttermilk ... the color of water ... the color of oil ... the color of milk ... the color of curd ... the color of ghee ... blue,” makes an effort, and yellow is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

The second round of the additional permutation series is finished.

3.9.21 If he intends, “I’ll emit white,” makes an effort, and red is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

69. See Glossary of Specialized Terms for these section-ending terms.

70. See Glossary of Specialized Terms for these section-ending terms.

If he intends, “I’ll emit the color of buttermilk ... the color of water ... the color of oil ... the color of milk ... the color of curd ... the color of ghee ... blue ... yellow,” makes an effort, and red is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension. 3.9.22

The third round of the additional permutation series is finished.

If he intends, “I’ll emit the color of buttermilk,” makes an effort, and white is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension. 3.9.31

If he intends, “I’ll emit the color of water ... the color of oil ... the color of milk ... the color of curd ... the color of ghee ... blue ... yellow ... red,” makes an effort, and white is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension. 3.9.32

The fourth round of the additional permutation series is finished.

If he intends, “I’ll emit the color of water,” makes an effort, and the color of buttermilk is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension. 3.9.41

If he intends, “I’ll emit the color of oil ... the color of milk ... the color of curd ... the color of ghee ... blue ... yellow ... red ... white,” makes an effort, and the color of buttermilk is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension. 3.9.42

The fifth round of the additional permutation series is finished.

If he intends, “I’ll emit the color of oil,” makes an effort, and the color of water is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension. 3.9.51

If he intends, “I’ll emit the color of milk ... the color of curd ... the color of ghee ... blue ... yellow ... red ... white ... the color of buttermilk,” makes an effort, and the color of water is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension. 3.9.52

The sixth round of the additional permutation series is finished.

If he intends, “I’ll emit the color of milk,” makes an effort, and the color of oil is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension. 3.9.61

If he intends, “I’ll emit the color of curd ... the color of ghee ... blue ... yellow ... red ... white ... the color of buttermilk ... the color of water,” makes an effort, and the color of oil is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension. 3.9.62

The seventh round of the additional permutation series is finished.

3.9.71 If he intends, “I’ll emit the color of curd,” makes an effort, and the color of milk is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

3.9.72 If he intends, “I’ll emit the color of ghee ... blue ... yellow ... red ... white ... the color of buttermilk ... the color of water ... the color of oil,” makes an effort, and the color of milk is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

The eighth round of the additional permutation series is finished.

3.9.81 If he intends, “I’ll emit the color of ghee,” makes an effort, and the color of curd is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

3.9.82 If he intends, “I’ll emit blue ... yellow ... red ... white ... the color of buttermilk ... the color of water ... the color of oil ... the color of milk,” makes an effort, and the color of curd is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

The ninth round of the additional permutation series is finished.

3.9.91 If he intends, “I’ll emit blue,” makes an effort, and the color of ghee is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

3.9.92 If he intends, “I’ll emit yellow ... red ... white ... the color of buttermilk ... the color of water ... the color of oil ... the color of milk ... the color of curd,” makes an effort, and the color of ghee is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

The tenth round of the additional permutation series is finished.

The additional permutation series is finished.

Permutations part 2

4.1 If he intends, makes an effort, and semen is emitted, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

4.2 If he intends, makes an effort, but semen is not emitted, he commits a serious offense.

4.3 If he intends, but does not make an effort, yet semen is emitted, there is no offense.

If he intends, but does not make an effort, nor is semen emitted, 4.4
there is no offense.

If he does not intend, but makes an effort, and semen is emitted, 4.5
there is no offense.

If he does not intend, but makes an effort, yet semen is not 4.6
emitted, there is no offense.

If he does not intend, nor makes an effort, yet semen is emitted, 4.7
there is no offense.

If he does not intend, nor makes an effort, nor is semen emitted, 4.8
there is no offense.

Non-offenses

There is no offense: if it is while dreaming; if he is not aiming at 4.9.1
emission; if he is insane; if he is deranged; if he is overwhelmed by
pain; if he is the first offender.

Summary verses of case studies

“Dream, feces, urine, 4.17
Thought, and with warm water;
Medicine, scratching, path,
Foreskin, sauna, massage.

Novice, and asleep, 4.21
Thigh, pressed with the fist;
In the air, rigid, staring,
Keyhole, rubbed with wood.

Current, mud, running, 4.25
Mud play, lotus;
Sand, mud, pouring,⁷¹
Bed, and with the thumb.”

Case studies

On one occasion a monk had an emission of semen while dream- 5.1.1
ing. He became anxious, thinking, “The Buddha has laid down a

71. “Pouring” renders *usseko*, which I take to be related to *seka*, perhaps via the prefix *ud*.

training rule. Could it be that I've committed an offense entailing suspension?" He told the Buddha, who said, "There's no offense when it occurs while dreaming."

5.2.1 On one occasion a monk was defecating, and semen was emitted. He became anxious ... "What were you thinking, monk?"

5.2.4 "I wasn't aiming at emission, Sir."

5.2.5 "There's no offense if one isn't aiming at emission."

5.2.6 On one occasion a monk was urinating, and semen was emitted. He became anxious ... "There's no offense if one isn't aiming at emission."

5.3.1 On one occasion a monk was thinking a sensual thought, and semen was emitted. He became anxious ... "There's no offense for one thinking a sensual thought."

5.4.1 On one occasion a monk was bathing in warm water, and semen was emitted. He became anxious ... "What were you thinking, monk?"

5.4.4 "I wasn't aiming at emission, Sir."

5.4.5 "There's no offense if one isn't aiming at emission."

5.4.6 On one occasion a monk bathed in warm water aiming at emission, and semen was emitted. He became anxious ... "You've committed an offense entailing suspension."

5.4.9 On one occasion a monk bathed in warm water aiming at emission, but semen was not emitted. He became anxious ... "There's no offense entailing suspension, but there's a serious offense."

5.5.1 At one time a monk had a sore on his penis. While he was applying medicine, semen was emitted. He became anxious ... "There's no offense if one isn't aiming at emission."

5.5.5 At one time a monk had a sore on his penis. He applied medicine aiming at emission, and semen was emitted. ... semen was not emitted. He became anxious ... "There's no offense entailing suspension, but there's a serious offense."

5.6.1 On one occasion a monk scratched his scrotum, and semen was emitted. He became anxious ... "There's no offense if one isn't aiming at emission."

On one occasion a monk scratched his scrotum aiming at emission, and semen was emitted. ... semen was not emitted. He became anxious ... “There’s no offense entailing suspension, but there’s a serious offense.” 5.6.4

On one occasion a monk was walking along a path, and semen was emitted. He became anxious ... “There’s no offense if one isn’t aiming at emission.” 5.7.1

On one occasion a monk walked along a path aiming at emission, and semen was emitted. ... semen was not emitted. He became anxious ... “There’s no offense entailing suspension, but there’s a serious offense.” 5.7.4

On one occasion a monk took hold of his foreskin, urinated, and semen was emitted.⁷² He became anxious ... “There’s no offense if one isn’t aiming at emission.” 5.8.1

On one occasion a monk, aiming at emission, took hold of his foreskin, urinated, and semen was emitted. ... semen was not emitted. He became anxious ... “There’s no offense entailing suspension, but there’s a serious offense.” 5.8.4

On one occasion a monk was having his belly heated in the sauna, and semen was emitted. He became anxious ... “There’s no offense if one isn’t aiming at emission.” 5.8.9

On one occasion a monk, aiming at emission, had his belly heated in the sauna, and semen was emitted. ... semen was not emitted. He became anxious ... “There’s no offense entailing suspension, but there’s a serious offense.” 5.8.12

On one occasion a monk massaged his preceptor’s back in the sauna, and semen was emitted. He became anxious ... “There’s no offense if one isn’t aiming at emission.” 5.8.17

On one occasion a monk, aiming at emission, massaged his preceptor’s back in the sauna, and semen was emitted. ... semen was not emitted. He became anxious ... “There’s no offense entailing suspension, but there’s a serious offense.” 5.8.20

72. Vmv 1.264: *Vatthinti āṅgajātasīśacchādakacammaṃ*, “*Vatthi*: the skin covering the head of the penis.”

- 5.8.25 On one occasion a monk was having his thigh massaged, and semen was emitted. He became anxious ... “There’s no offense if one isn’t aiming at emission.”
- 5.8.28 On one occasion a monk, aiming at emission, had his thigh massaged, and semen was emitted. ... semen was not emitted. He became anxious ... “There’s no offense entailing suspension, but there’s a serious offense.”
- 5.9.1 On one occasion a monk, aiming at emission, said to a novice, “Take hold of my penis.” The novice took hold of his penis, and the monk emitted semen. He became anxious ... “There’s an offense entailing suspension.”
- 5.9.7 On one occasion a monk took hold of the penis of a sleeping novice,⁷³ and the monk emitted semen. He became anxious ... “There’s no offense entailing suspension, but there’s an offense of wrong conduct.”
- 5.10.1 On one occasion a monk pressed his penis between his thighs aiming at emission, and semen was emitted. ... semen was not emitted. He became anxious ... “There’s no offense entailing suspension, but there’s a serious offense.”
- 5.10.6 On one occasion a monk pressed his penis with his fist aiming at emission, and semen was emitted. ... semen was not emitted. He became anxious ... “There’s no offense entailing suspension, but there’s a serious offense.”
- 5.10.11 On one occasion a monk shook his pelvis in the air aiming at emission, and semen was emitted. ... semen was not emitted. He became anxious ... “There’s no offense entailing suspension, but there’s a serious offense.”

73. Bhikkhu Ṭhānissaro argues in BMC I, page 105, that it was the novice monk who emitted semen. But these rules concern monks, not novices. In the present case the Buddha specifically says that there is no offense of *saṅghādisesa*, which would make no sense if it referred to the novice monk. Bhikkhu Ṭhānissaro argues that his reading is required, otherwise we are forced to conclude that *saṅghādisesa* offenses can be incurred by indirect stimulation. Yet the cases found here are widely diverging. It is not given that they must all, even potentially, give rise to a *saṅghādisesa*.

On one occasion a monk made his body rigid, and semen was emitted. He became anxious ... “There’s no offense if one isn’t aiming at emission.” 5.11.1

On one occasion a monk made his body rigid aiming at emission, and semen was emitted. ... semen was not emitted. He became anxious ... “There’s no offense entailing suspension, but there’s a serious offense.” 5.11.4

On one occasion a lustful monk stared at a woman’s genitals, and semen was emitted. He became anxious ... “There’s no offense entailing suspension. But you should not stare at a woman’s genitals motivated by lust. If you do, you commit an offense of wrong conduct.” 5.12.1

On one occasion a monk inserted his penis into a keyhole aiming at emission, and semen was emitted. ... semen was not emitted. He became anxious ... “There’s no offense entailing suspension, but there’s a serious offense.” 5.13.1

On one occasion a monk rubbed his penis with a piece of wood aiming at emission, and semen was emitted. ... semen was not emitted. He became anxious ... “There’s no offense entailing suspension, but there’s a serious offense.” 5.14.1

On one occasion a monk bathed against the current, and semen was emitted. He became anxious ... “There’s no offense if one isn’t aiming at emission.” 5.15.1

On one occasion a monk bathed against the current aiming at emission, and semen was emitted. ... semen was not emitted. He became anxious ... “There’s no offense entailing suspension, but there’s a serious offense.” 5.15.4

On one occasion a monk was playing in mud, and semen was emitted. He became anxious ... “There’s no offense if one isn’t aiming at emission.” 5.16.1

On one occasion a monk played in mud aiming at emission, and semen was emitted. ... semen was not emitted. He became anxious ... “There’s no offense entailing suspension, but there’s a serious offense.” 5.16.4

- 5.16.9 On one occasion a monk ran in water, and semen was emitted. He became anxious ... “There’s no offense if one isn’t aiming at emission.”
- 5.16.12 On one occasion a monk ran in water aiming at emission, and semen was emitted. ... semen was not emitted. He became anxious ... “There’s no offense entailing suspension, but there’s a serious offense.”
- 5.16.17 On one occasion a monk was playing by sliding in the mud, and semen was emitted.⁷⁴ He became anxious ... “There’s no offense if one isn’t aiming at emission.”
- 5.16.20 On one occasion a monk, aiming at emission, was playing by sliding in the mud, and semen was emitted. ... semen was not emitted. He became anxious ... “There’s no offense entailing suspension, but there’s a serious offense.”
- 5.16.25 On one occasion a monk was running in a lotus grove, and semen was emitted. He became anxious ... “There’s no offense if one isn’t aiming at emission.”
- 5.16.28 On one occasion a monk ran in a lotus grove aiming at emission, and semen was emitted. ... semen was not emitted. He became anxious ... “There’s no offense entailing suspension, but there’s a serious offense.”
- 5.17.1 On one occasion a monk inserted his penis into sand aiming at emission, and semen was emitted. ... semen was not emitted. He became anxious ... “There’s no offense entailing suspension, but there’s a serious offense.”
- 5.17.6 On one occasion a monk inserted his penis into mud aiming at emission, and semen was emitted. ... semen was not emitted. He became anxious ... “There’s no offense entailing suspension, but there’s a serious offense.”

74. Sp-t 2.267: *Pupphāvalīti kīlāvisesassādhivacanāṃ. Taṃ kīlantā nadiādīsu chinmataṭaṃ udakena cikkhallāṃ katvā tattha ubho pāde pasāretvā nisinnā papatanti*; “*Pupphāvalīti*: it is an expression for a kind of game. Playing it in rivers, etc., having made a muddy, steep slope with water, having extended both feet right there, they sit and slide down.”

On one occasion a monk poured water on his penis, and semen was emitted. He became anxious ... “There’s no offense if one isn’t aiming at emission.” 5.17.11

On one occasion a monk poured water on his penis aiming at emission, and semen was emitted. ... semen was not emitted. He became anxious ... “There’s no offense entailing suspension, but there’s a serious offense.” 5.17.14

On one occasion a monk rubbed his penis against his bed aiming at emission, and semen was emitted. ... semen was not emitted. He became anxious ... “There’s no offense entailing suspension, but there’s a serious offense.” 5.17.19

On one occasion a monk rubbed his penis with his thumb aiming at emission, and semen was emitted. ... semen was not emitted. He became anxious, thinking, “The Buddha has laid down a training rule. Could it be that I’ve committed an offense entailing suspension?” He told the Buddha, who said, “There’s no offense entailing suspension, but there’s a serious offense.” 5.17.24

The training rule on emission of semen, the first, is finished.

The training rule on physical contact

Kāyasamsagga

Origin story

- 1.1.1 At one time the Buddha was staying at Sāvattthī in the Jeta Grove, Anāthapiṇḍika’s Monastery. At that time Venerable Udāyī was staying in the wilderness. He had a beautiful dwelling with a room in the middle and corridors on all sides. The bed and bench were nicely made up, and the water for drinking and the water for washing were ready for use. The yards were well swept.⁷⁵ Many people came to see Udāyī’s dwelling,
- 1.1.8 among them a certain brahmin and his wife. They approached Udāyī and said, “Venerable, we would like to see your dwelling.”
- 1.1.10 “Well then, brahmin, please do.”
- 1.1.11 Udāyī took the key, lifted the latch, opened the door, and entered the dwelling. The brahmin entered after him and then the brahmin lady. Opening some windows and closing others, Udāyī walked around the inner room and came up behind the brahmin lady, touching her all over. Then the brahmin thanked Udāyī and left.
- 1.1.16 And he expressed his delight, “These Sakyan monastics who live in the wilderness are superb. Venerable Udāyī is superb!”
- 1.1.19 But the brahmin lady said, “What’s superb about him? He touched me all over just like you do.”
- 1.1.22 The brahmin then complained and criticized him, “These Sakyan monastics are shameless and immoral liars. They claim to have integrity, to be celibate and of good conduct, to be truthful, moral, and good. But they don’t have the good character of a monastic or a brahmin. They’ve lost the plot! How could the ascetic Udāyī touch my wife all over? It’s not possible to go to a monastery or a monk’s dwelling with a wife from a respectable family, or with a daughter,

75. For the rendering of *pariveṇa* as “yard”, see Appendix of Technical Terms.

a girl, a daughter-in-law, or a female slave from a respectable family. If you do, the Sakyan monastics might molest them.”

The monks heard the criticism of that brahmin. The monks of 1.2.1
few desires complained and criticized Udāyī, “How could Venerable Udāyī make physical contact with a woman?”

They told the Buddha. He then had the Sangha gathered and 1.2.4
questioned Udāyī:

“Is it true, Udāyī, that you did this?” 1.2.6

“It’s true, Sir.” 1.2.7

The Buddha rebuked him, “Foolish man, it’s not suitable, it’s not 1.2.8
proper, it’s not worthy of a monastic, it’s not allowable, it’s not to be done. How could you do this? Haven’t I given many teachings for the sake of dispassion, not for the sake of passion ... the stilling of the fevers of sensual pleasure? This will affect people’s confidence ...” ... “And, monks, this training rule should be recited like this:

Final ruling

‘If a monk, overcome by lust and with a distorted mind, makes physical contact with a woman—holding her hand or hair, or touching any part of her body—he commits an offense entailing suspension.’”

Definitions

A: whoever ...

Monk: ... The monk who has been given the full ordination by a unanimous Sangha through a legal procedure consisting of one motion and three announcements that is irreversible and fit to stand—this sort of monk is meant in this case.

Overcome by lust: having lust, longing for, in love with.

Distorted: a lustful mind is distorted; an angry mind is distorted; a confused mind is distorted. But in this case “distorted” refers to the lustful mind.

A woman: a human female, not a female spirit, not a female ghost, not a female animal; even a girl born on that very day, let alone an older one.

With: together.

Makes physical contact: misconduct is what is meant.

Hand: from the elbow to the tip of the nails.

Hair: just the hair; or the hair with strings in it, with a garland, with gold coins, with gold, with pearls, or with gems.

Any part of her body: anything apart from the hand and the hair is called “any part of her body”.

Sub-definitions

- 2.2.1 Physical contact, touching, stroking downwards, stroking upwards, pulling down, lifting up, pulling, pushing, squeezing, pressing, taking hold of, contacting.

Physical contact: mere physical contact.

Touching: touching here and there.

Stroking downwards: lowering down.

Stroking upwards: raising up.

Pulling down: bending down.

Lifting up: raising up.

Pulling: drawing to.

Pushing: sending away.

Squeezing: taking hold of a bodily part and then pressing.

Pressing: pressing with something.

Take hold of: mere taking hold of.

Contacting: mere contact.

He commits an offense entailing suspension: ... Therefore, too, it is called “an offense entailing suspension”.

Permutations

Permutations part 1

Making direct contact with a single person or animal: body to body

It is a woman, he perceives her as a woman, and he has lust. If the monk makes physical contact with the woman, body to body, if he touches her, strokes her downwards, strokes her upwards, pulls her down, lifts her up, pulls her, pushes her, squeezes her, presses her, takes hold of her, contacts her, he commits an offense entailing suspension. 3.1.1

It is a woman, but he is unsure of it, and he has lust. If the monk makes physical contact with the woman, body to body, if he touches her ... takes hold of her, contacts her, he commits a serious offense. 3.1.3

It is a woman, but he perceives her as a *paṇḍaka*, and he has lust. If the monk makes physical contact with the woman, body to body, if he touches her ... takes hold of her, contacts her, he commits a serious offense. 3.1.6

It is a woman, but he perceives her as a man, and he has lust. If the monk makes physical contact with the woman, body to body, if he touches her ... takes hold of her, contacts her, he commits a serious offense. 3.1.9

It is a woman, but he perceives her as an animal, and he has lust. If the monk makes physical contact with the woman, body to body, if he touches her ... takes hold of her, contacts her, he commits a serious offense. 3.1.12

It is a *paṇḍaka*, he perceives him as a *paṇḍaka*, and he has lust. If the monk makes physical contact with the *paṇḍaka*, body to body, if he touches him ... takes hold of him, contacts him, he commits a serious offense. 3.1.15

It is a *paṇḍaka*, but he is unsure of it, and he has lust. If the monk makes physical contact with the *paṇḍaka*, body to body, if he touches him ... takes hold of him, contacts him, he commits an offense of wrong conduct. 3.1.18

- 3.1.21 It is a *paṇḍaka*, but he perceives him as a man, and he has lust. If the monk makes physical contact with the *paṇḍaka*, body to body, if he touches him ... takes hold of him, contacts him, he commits an offense of wrong conduct.
- 3.1.24 It is a *paṇḍaka*, but he perceives him as an animal, and he has lust. If the monk makes physical contact with the *paṇḍaka*, body to body, if he touches him ... takes hold of him, contacts him, he commits an offense of wrong conduct.
- 3.1.27 It is a *paṇḍaka*, but he perceives him as a woman, and he has lust. If the monk makes physical contact with the *paṇḍaka*, body to body, if he touches him ... takes hold of him, contacts him, he commits an offense of wrong conduct.
- 3.1.30 It is a man, he perceives him as a man, and he has lust. If the monk makes physical contact with the man, body to body, if he touches him ... takes hold of him, contacts him, he commits an offense of wrong conduct.
- 3.1.33 It is a man, but he is unsure of it ... It is a man, but he perceives him as an animal ... It is a man, but he perceives him as a woman ... It is a man, but he perceives him as a *paṇḍaka*, and he has lust. If the monk makes physical contact with the man, body to body, if he touches him ... takes hold of him, contacts him, he commits an offense of wrong conduct.
- 3.1.39 It is an animal, he perceives it as an animal, and he has lust. If the monk makes physical contact with the animal, body to body, if he touches it ... takes hold of it, contacts it, he commits an offense of wrong conduct.
- 3.1.42 It is an animal, but he is unsure of it ... It is an animal, but he perceives it as a woman ... It is an animal, but he perceives it as a *paṇḍaka* ... It is an animal, but he perceives it as a man, and he has lust. If the monk makes physical contact with the animal, body to body, if he touches it ... takes hold of it, contacts it, he commits an offense of wrong conduct.

The section based on one item is finished.

Making direct contact with two beings of the same kind: body to body

It is two women, he perceives both as women, and he has lust. If the monk makes physical contact with the two women, body to body, if he touches them ... takes hold of them, contacts them, he commits two offenses entailing suspension. 3.2.1

It is two women, but he is unsure about both, and he has lust. If the monk makes physical contact with the two women, body to body, if he touches them ... takes hold of them, contacts them, he commits two serious offenses. 3.2.4

It is two women, but he perceives both as *paṇḍakas* ... but he perceives both as men ... but he perceives both as animals, and he has lust. If the monk makes physical contact with the two women, body to body, if he touches them ... takes hold of them, contacts them, he commits two serious offenses. 3.2.7

It is two *paṇḍakas*, he perceives both as *paṇḍakas*, and he has lust. If the monk makes physical contact with the two *paṇḍakas*, body to body, if he touches them ... takes hold of them, contacts them, he commits two serious offenses. 3.2.12

It is two *paṇḍakas*, but he is unsure about both ... but he perceives both as men ... but he perceives both as animals ... but he perceives both as women, and he has lust. If the monk makes physical contact with the two *paṇḍakas*, body to body, if he touches them ... takes hold of them, contacts them, he commits two offenses of wrong conduct. 3.2.14

It is two men, he perceives both as men, and he has lust. If the monk makes physical contact with the two men, body to body, if he touches them ... takes hold of them, contacts them, he commits two offenses of wrong conduct. 3.2.20

It is two men, but he is unsure about both ... but he perceives both as animals ... but he perceives both as women ... but he perceives both as *paṇḍakas*, and he has lust. If the monk makes physical contact with the two men, body to body, if he touches them ... takes hold of them, contacts them, he commits two offenses of wrong conduct. 3.2.22

3.2.28 It is two animals, he perceives both as animals, and he has lust. If the monk makes physical contact with the two animals, body to body, if he touches them ... takes hold of them, contacts them, he commits two offenses of wrong conduct.

3.2.31 It is two animals, but he is unsure about both ... but he perceives both as women ... but he perceives both as *paṇḍakas* ... but he perceives both as men, and he has lust. If the monk makes physical contact with the two animals, body to body, if he touches them ... takes hold of them, contacts them, he commits two offenses of wrong conduct.

Making direct contact with two beings of different kinds: body to body

3.3.1 It is a woman and a *paṇḍaka*, but he perceives both as women, and he has lust. If the monk makes physical contact with both, body to body, if he touches them ... takes hold of them, contacts them, he commits one offense entailing suspension and one offense of wrong conduct.

3.3.4 It is a woman and a *paṇḍaka*, but he is unsure about both, and he has lust. If the monk makes physical contact with both, body to body, if he touches them ... takes hold of them, contacts them, he commits one serious offense and one offense of wrong conduct.

3.3.7 It is a woman and a *paṇḍaka*, but he perceives both as *paṇḍakas*, and he has lust. If the monk makes physical contact with both, body to body, if he touches them ... takes hold of them, contacts them, he commits two serious offenses.

3.3.10 It is a woman and a *paṇḍaka*, but he perceives both as men, and he has lust. If the monk makes physical contact with both, body to body, if he touches them ... takes hold of them, contacts them, he commits one serious offense and one offense of wrong conduct.

3.3.13 It is a woman and a *paṇḍaka*, but he perceives both as animals, and he has lust. If the monk makes physical contact with both, body to body, if he touches them ... takes hold of them, contacts them, he commits one serious offense and one offense of wrong conduct.

It is a woman and a man, but he perceives both as women and 3.3.16
he has lust. If the monk makes physical contact with both, body
to body, if he touches them ... takes hold of them, contacts them,
he commits one offense entailing suspension and one offense of
wrong conduct.

It is a woman and a man, but he is unsure about both ... but he 3.3.19
perceives both as *paṇḍakas* ... but he perceives both as men ... but
he perceives both as animals, and he has lust. If the monk makes
physical contact with both, body to body, if he touches them ...
takes hold of them, contacts them, he commits one serious offense
and one offense of wrong conduct.

It is a woman and an animal, but he perceives both as women, 3.3.25
and he has lust. If the monk makes physical contact with both, body
to body, if he touches them ... takes hold of them, contacts them,
he commits one offense entailing suspension and one offense of
wrong conduct.

It is a woman and an animal, but he is unsure about both ... but 3.3.28
he perceives both as *paṇḍakas* ... but he perceives both as men ...
but he perceives both as animals, and he has lust. If the monk makes
physical contact with both, body to body, if he touches them ...
takes hold of them, contacts them, he commits one serious offense
and one offense of wrong conduct.

It is a *paṇḍaka* and a man, but he perceives both as *paṇḍakas*, 3.3.34
and he has lust. If the monk makes physical contact with both,
body to body, if he touches them ... takes hold of them, contacts
them, he commits one serious offense and one offense of wrong
conduct.

It is a *paṇḍaka* and a man, but he is unsure about both ... but he 3.3.37
perceives both as men ... but he perceives both as animals ... but
he perceives both as women, and he has lust. If the monk makes
physical contact with both, body to body, if he touches them ...
takes hold of them, contacts them, he commits two offenses of
wrong conduct.

- 3.3.43 It is a *paṇḍaka* and an animal, but he perceives both as *paṇḍakas*, and he has lust. If the monk makes physical contact with both, body to body, if he touches them ... takes hold of them, contacts them, he commits one serious offense and one offense of wrong conduct.
- 3.3.46 It is a *paṇḍaka* and an animal, but he is unsure about both ... but he perceives both as men ... but he perceives both as animals ... but he perceives both as women, and he has lust. If the monk makes physical contact with both, body to body, if he touches them ... takes hold of them, contacts them, he commits two offenses of wrong conduct.
- 3.3.52 It is a man and an animal, but he perceives both as men, and he has lust. If the monk makes physical contact with both, body to body, if he touches them ... takes hold of them, contacts them, he commits two offenses of wrong conduct.
- 3.3.55 It is a man and an animal, but he is unsure about both ... but he perceives both as animals ... but he perceives both as women ... but he perceives both as *paṇḍakas*, and he has lust. If the monk makes physical contact with both, body to body, if he touches them ... takes hold of them, contacts them, he commits two offenses of wrong conduct.

The section based on two items is finished.

Making indirect contact: body to what is connected to the body

- 3.4.1 It is a woman, he perceives her as a woman, and he has lust. If the monk, with his own body, makes physical contact with something connected to her body, if he touches it ... takes hold of it, contacts it, he commits a serious offense. ...
- 3.4.4 It is two women, he perceives both as women, and he has lust. If the monk, with his own body, makes physical contact with something connected to the body of both, if he touches it ... takes hold of it, contacts it, he commits two serious offenses. ...
- 3.4.7 It is a woman and a *paṇḍaka*, but he perceives both as women, and he has lust. If the monk, with his own body, makes physi-

cal contact with something connected to the body of both, if he touches it ... takes hold of it, contacts it, he commits one serious offense and one offense of wrong conduct. ...

It is a woman, he perceives her as a woman, and he has lust. 3.4.10
If the monk, with something connected to his own body, makes physical contact with her body, if he touches it ... takes hold of it, contacts it, he commits a serious offense. ...

It is two women, he perceives both as women, and he has lust. 3.4.13
If the monk, with something connected to his own body, makes physical contact with the body of both, if he touches them ... takes hold of them, contacts them, he commits two serious offenses. ...

It is a woman and a *paṇḍaka*, but he perceives both as women, 3.4.16
and he has lust. If the monk, with something connected to his own body, makes physical contact with the body of both, if he touches them ... takes hold of them, contacts them, he commits one serious offense and one offense of wrong conduct. ...

Making indirect contact: what is connected to the body to what is connected to the body

It is a woman, he perceives her as a woman, and he has lust. If the 3.4.19.1
monk, with something connected to his own body, makes physical contact with something connected to her body, if he touches it ... takes hold of it, contacts it, he commits an offense of wrong conduct. ...

It is two women, he perceives both as women, and he has lust. 3.4.22
If the monk, with something connected to his own body, makes physical contact with something connected to the body of both, if he touches those things ... takes hold of them, contacts them, he commits two offenses of wrong conduct. ...

It is a woman and a *paṇḍaka*, but he perceives both as women, 3.4.25
and he has lust. If the monk, with something connected to his own body, makes physical contact with something connected to the body of both, if he touches those things ... takes hold of them, contacts them, he commits two offenses of wrong conduct. ...

Making indirect contact: contact by releasing

- 3.4.28.1 It is a woman, he perceives her as a woman, and he has lust.⁷⁶ If the monk, with something released by him, makes physical contact with her body, he commits an offense of wrong conduct. ...
- 3.4.30 It is two women, he perceives both as women, and he has lust. If the monk, with something released by him, makes physical contact with the body of both, he commits two offenses of wrong conduct. ...
- 3.4.32 It is a woman and a *paṇḍaka*, but he perceives both as women, and he has lust. If the monk, with something released by him, makes physical contact with the body of both, he commits two offenses of wrong conduct. ...
- 3.4.34 It is a woman, he perceives her as a woman, and he has lust. If the monk, with something released by him, makes physical contact with something connected to her body, he commits an offense of wrong conduct. ...
- 3.4.36 It is two women, he perceives both as women, and he has lust. If the monk, with something released by him, makes physical contact with something connected to the body of both, he commits two offenses of wrong conduct. ...
- 3.4.38 It is a woman and a *paṇḍaka*, but he perceives both as women, and he has lust. If the monk, with something released by him, makes physical contact with something connected to the body of both, he commits two offenses of wrong conduct. ...
- 3.4.40 It is a woman, he perceives her as a woman, and he has lust. If the monk, with something released by him, makes physical contact with something released by her, he commits an offense of wrong conduct. ...
- 3.4.42 It is two women, he perceives both as women, and he has lust. If the monk, with something released by him, makes physical contact with something released by both, he commits two offenses of wrong conduct. ...

76. "Releasing" means throwing, dropping, etc.

It is a woman and a *paṇḍaka*, but he perceives both as women, 3.4.44
and he has lust. If the monk, with something released by him,
makes physical contact with something released by both, he com-
mits two offenses of wrong conduct. ...

The successive series on a monk is finished.

Others making direct contact with a monk: body to body

It is a woman, he perceives her as a woman, and he has lust. If the 3.5.1
woman makes physical contact with the monk, body to body, if
she touches him, strokes him downwards, strokes him upwards,
pulls him down, lifts him up, pulls him, pushes him, squeezes him,
presses him, takes hold of him, contacts him, and he, aiming at
connection, makes an effort with the body and experiences contact,
he commits an offense entailing suspension. ...

It is two women, he perceives both as women, and he has lust. If 3.5.3
the women make physical contact with the monk, body to body, if
they touch him, stroke him downwards, stroke him upwards, pull
him down, lift him up, pull him, push him, squeeze him, press him,
take hold of him, contact him, and he, aiming at connection, makes
an effort with the body and experiences contact, he commits two
offenses entailing suspension. ...

It is a woman and a *paṇḍaka*, but he perceives both as women, 3.5.5
and he has lust. If they both make physical contact with the monk,
body to body, if they touch him ... take hold of him, contact him,
and he, aiming at connection, makes an effort with the body and
experiences contact, he commits one offense entailing suspension
and one offense of wrong conduct. ...

Others making indirect contact with a monk: body to what is connected to the body

It is a woman, he perceives her as a woman, and he has lust. If the 3.5.8.1
woman, with her own body, makes physical contact with something
connected to his body, if she touches it ... takes hold of it, contacts
it, and he, aiming at connection, makes an effort with the body and
experiences contact, he commits a serious offense. ...

3.5.11 It is two women, he perceives both as women, and he has lust. If the women, with their own bodies, make physical contact with something connected to his body, if they touch it ... take hold of it, contact it, and he, aiming at connection, makes an effort with the body and experiences contact, he commits two serious offenses.

...

3.5.14 It is a woman and a *paṇḍaka*, but he perceives both as women, and he has lust. If they both, with their own bodies, make physical contact with something connected to his body, if they touch it ... take hold of it, contact it, and he, aiming at connection, makes an effort with the body and experiences contact, he commits one serious offense and one offense of wrong conduct. ...

3.5.17 It is a woman, he perceives her as a woman, and he has lust. If the woman, with something connected to her own body, makes physical contact with his body, if she touches him ... takes hold of him, contacts him, and he, aiming at connection, makes an effort with the body and experiences contact, he commits a serious offense. ...

3.5.20 It is two women, he perceives both as women, and he has lust. If the women, with something connected to their own bodies, make physical contact with his body, if they touch him ... take hold of him, contact him, and he, aiming at connection, makes an effort with the body and experiences contact, he commits two serious offenses. ...

3.5.23 It is a woman and a *paṇḍaka*, but he perceives both as women, and he has lust. If they both, with something connected to their own bodies, make physical contact with his body, if they touch him ... take hold of him, contact him, and he, aiming at connection, makes an effort with the body and experiences contact, he commits one serious offense and one offense of wrong conduct. ...

Others making indirect contact with a monk: what is connected to the body to what is connected to the body

3.5.26.1 It is a woman, he perceives her as a woman, and he has lust. If the woman, with something connected to her own body, makes physi-

cal contact with something connected to his body, if she touches it ... takes hold of it, contacts it, and he, aiming at connection, makes an effort with the body and experiences contact, he commits an offense of wrong conduct. ...

It is two women, he perceives both as women, and he has lust. If 3.5.29
the women, with something connected to their own bodies, make physical contact with something connected to his body, if they touch it ... take hold of it, contact it, and he, aiming at connection, makes an effort with the body and experiences contact, he commits two offenses of wrong conduct. ...

It is a woman and a *paṇḍaka*, but he perceives both as women, 3.5.32
and he has lust. If they both, with something connected to their own bodies, make physical contact with something connected to his body, if they touch it ... take hold of it, contact it, and he, aiming at connection, makes an effort with the body and experiences contact, he commits two offenses of wrong conduct. ...

Others making indirect contact with a monk: contact by releasing

It is a woman, he perceives her as a woman, and he has lust. If the 3.5.35.1
woman, with something released by her, makes physical contact with his body, and he, aiming at connection, makes an effort with the body and experiences contact, he commits an offense of wrong conduct. ...

It is two women, he perceives both as women, and he has lust. 3.5.38
If the women, with something released by both, make physical contact with his body, and he, aiming at connection, makes an effort with the body and experiences contact, he commits two offenses of wrong conduct. ...

It is a woman and a *paṇḍaka*, but he perceives both as women, 3.5.41
and he has lust. If they both, with something released by both, make physical contact with his body, and he, aiming at connection, makes an effort with the body and experiences contact, he commits two offenses of wrong conduct. ...

- 3.5.44 It is a woman, he perceives her as a woman, and he has lust. If the woman, with something released by her, makes physical contact with something connected to his body, and he, aiming at connection, makes an effort with the body and experiences contact, he commits an offense of wrong conduct. ...
- 3.5.47 It is two women, he perceives both as women, and he has lust. If the women, with something released by both, make physical contact with something connected to his body, and he, aiming at connection, makes an effort with the body and experiences contact, he commits two offenses of wrong conduct. ...
- 3.5.50 It is a woman and a *paṇḍaka*, but he perceives both as women, and he has lust. If they both, with something released by both, make physical contact with something connected to his body, and he, aiming at connection, makes an effort with the body and experiences contact, he commits two offenses of wrong conduct. ...
- 3.5.53 It is a woman, he perceives her as a woman, and he has lust. If the woman, with something released by her, makes physical contact with something released by him, and he, aiming at connection, makes an effort with the body, but does not experience contact, he commits an offense of wrong conduct. ...⁷⁷
- 3.5.56 It is two women, he perceives both as women, and he has lust. If the women, with something released by both, make physical contact with something released by him, and he, aiming at connection, makes an effort with the body, but does not experience contact, he commits two offenses of wrong conduct. ...

77. Sp 1.278: *Ettha ca kāyena vāyamati na ca phassaṃ paṭivijānāti attanā ni-saṭṭhaṃ pupphaṃ vā phalaṃ vā itthiṃ attano nissaggiyena pupphena vā phalena vā paharantiṃ disvā kāyena vikāraṃ karoti, aṅguliṃ vā cāleti, bhamukaṃ vā ukkhipati, akkhiṃ vā nikhaṇati, aññaṃ vā evarūpaṃ vikāraṃ karoti, ayaṃ vuccati “kāyena vāyamati na ca phassaṃ paṭivijānāti”ti*; “Here ‘makes an effort with the body, but does not experience contact’ means: having seen a flower or fruit released from oneself hitting a flower or fruit released from the woman, he makes a gesture with the body, wags a finger, raises an eyebrow, winks, or makes any similar gesture—this is called ‘makes an effort with the body, but does not experience contact’.”

It is a woman and a *paṇḍaka*, but he perceives both as women, 3.5.59
and he has lust. If they both, with something released by both,
make physical contact with something released by him, and he,
aiming at connection, makes an effort with the body, but does not
experience contact, he commits two offenses of wrong conduct.

...

Permutations part 2

If, aiming at connection, he makes an effort with the body and 3.6.1
experiences contact, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

If, aiming at connection, he makes an effort with the body, but 3.6.2
does not experience contact, he commits an offense of wrong con-
duct.

If, aiming at connection, he makes no effort with the body, but 3.6.3
experiences contact, there is no offense.

If, aiming at connection, he makes no effort with the body and 3.6.4
does not experience contact, there is no offense.

If, aiming to free himself, he makes an effort with the body and 3.6.5
experiences contact, there is no offense.

If, aiming to free himself, he makes an effort with the body, but 3.6.6
does not experience contact, there is no offense.

If, aiming to free himself, he makes no effort with the body, but 3.6.7
experiences contact, there is no offense.

If, aiming to free himself, he makes no effort with the body and 3.6.8
does not experience contact, there is no offense.

Non-offenses

There is no offense: if it is unintentional; if he is not mindful; if 3.7.1
he does not know; if he does not consent; if he is insane; if he is
deranged; if he is overwhelmed by pain; if he is the first offender.

Summary verses of case studies

“Mother, daughter, and sister, 3.7.11
Wife, and female spirit, *paṇḍaka*;
Asleep, dead, female animal,

And with a wooden doll.

- 3.7.15 About oppression, bridge, road,
Tree, and boat, and rope;
A staff, pushed with a bowl,
When paying respect, made an effort but did not touch.”

Case studies

- 4.1.1 At one time a monk touched his mother out of affection. He became anxious, thinking, “The Buddha has laid down a training rule. Could it be that I’ve committed an offense entailing suspension?” He told the Buddha, who said, “There’s no offense entailing suspension, but there’s an offense of wrong conduct.”
- 4.1.8 At one time a monk touched his daughter out of affection ... his sister out of affection. He became anxious ... “There’s no offense entailing suspension, but there’s an offense of wrong conduct.”
- 4.2.1 At one time a monk made physical contact with his ex-wife. He became anxious ... “You’ve committed an offense entailing suspension.”
- 4.3.1 At one time a monk made physical contact with a female spirit. He became anxious ... “There’s no offense entailing suspension, but there’s a serious offense.”
- 4.3.5 At one time a monk made physical contact with a *paṇḍaka*. He became anxious ... “There’s no offense entailing suspension, but there’s a serious offense.”
- 4.4.1 At one time a monk made physical contact with a sleeping woman. He became anxious ... “You’ve committed an offense entailing suspension.”
- 4.4.4 At one time a monk made physical contact with a dead woman. He became anxious ... “There’s no offense entailing suspension, but there’s a serious offense.”
- 4.4.8 At one time a monk made physical contact with a female animal. ... “There’s no offense entailing suspension, but there’s an offense of wrong conduct.”

At one time a monk made physical contact with a wooden doll. 4.4.12
 ... “There’s no offense entailing suspension, but there’s an offense of wrong conduct.”

At one time a number of women harassed a monk by leading 4.5.1
 him about arm in arm. He became anxious ... “Did you consent, monk?”

“No, Sir.” 4.5.4

“There’s no offense if one doesn’t consent.” 4.5.5

At one time a lustful monk shook the bridge that a woman was 4.6.1
 standing on. He became anxious ... “There’s no offense entailing suspension, but there’s an offense of wrong conduct.”

At one time a monk saw a woman coming in the opposite direc- 4.7.1
 tion, and being lustful, he struck her with his shoulder. He became anxious ... “You’ve committed an offense entailing suspension.”

At one time a lustful monk shook the tree that a woman had 4.8.1
 climbed. He became anxious ... “There’s no offense entailing suspension, but there’s an offense of wrong conduct.”

At one time a lustful monk shook the boat that a woman had 4.8.5
 boarded. He became anxious ... “There’s no offense entailing suspension, but there’s an offense of wrong conduct.”

At one time a lustful monk pulled the rope that a woman was 4.9.1
 holding. He became anxious ... “There’s no offense entailing suspension, but there’s a serious offense.”

At one time a lustful monk pulled the staff that a woman was 4.9.5
 holding. He became anxious ... “There’s no offense entailing suspension, but there’s a serious offense.”

At one time a lustful monk pushed a woman with his almsbowl. 4.10.1
 He became anxious ... “There’s no offense entailing suspension, but there’s a serious offense.”

At one time a lustful monk raised his foot as a woman was paying 4.11.1
 respect to him. He became anxious ... “You’ve committed an offense entailing suspension.”

At one time a monk, thinking, “I’ll take hold of a woman,” ex- 4.11.4
 erted himself, but did not make contact. He became anxious ...

“There’s no offense entailing suspension, but there’s an offense of wrong conduct.”

The training rule on physical contact, the second, is finished.

The training rule on indecent speech

Duṭṭhullavācā

Origin story

At one time the Buddha was staying at Sāvattthī in the Jeta Grove, 1.1.1
Anāthapiṇḍika’s Monastery. At that time Venerable Udāyī was
staying in a beautiful dwelling in the wilderness. On one occasion
a number of women came to the monastery to see the dwellings.
They approached Udāyī and said, “Venerable, we would like to see
your dwelling.”

Then, after showing them his dwelling, he praised and dispar- 1.1.8
aged their private parts; he requested and implored, asked and
enquired, described, instructed, and abused their private parts.⁷⁸
The shameless and indecent women flirted with Udāyī; they called
out to him, laughed with him, and teased him. But after leaving,
those of them who had a sense of shame complained to the monks,
“Venerables, this isn’t suitable or appropriate. We wouldn’t want to
hear such speech from our own husbands, let alone from Venerable
Udāyī.”

The monks of few desires complained and criticized him, “How 1.2.1
could Venerable Udāyī speak indecently to women?”

They rebuked Udāyī in many ways and told the Buddha. The 1.2.3
Buddha had the Sangha gathered and questioned Udāyī: “Is it true,
Udāyī, that you spoke like this?”

“It’s true, Sir.” 1.2.6

The Buddha rebuked him, “It’s not suitable, foolish man, it’s not 1.2.7
proper, it’s not worthy of a monastic, it’s not allowable, it should
not be done. How could you speak like this? Haven’t I given many
teachings for the sake of dispassion, not for the sake of passion
... the stilling of the fevers of sensual pleasure? This will affect

78. *Vaccamaggaṃ passāvamaggaṃ* refer respectively to the anus and the genitals.

people's confidence ..." ... "And, monks, this training rule should be recited like this:

Final ruling

'If a monk, overcome by lust and with a distorted mind, speaks indecent words to a woman, as a young man might to a young woman and referring to sexual intercourse, he commits an offense entailing suspension.'

Definitions

A: whoever ...

Monk: ... The monk who has been given the full ordination by a unanimous Sangha through a legal procedure consisting of one motion and three announcements that is irreversible and fit to stand—this sort of monk is meant in this case.

Overcome by lust: having lust, longing for, in love with.

Distorted: a lustful mind is distorted; an angry mind is distorted; a confused mind is distorted. But in this case "distorted" refers to the lustful mind.

A woman: a human female, not a female spirit, not a female ghost, not a female animal. She understands and is capable of discerning bad speech and good speech, what is decent and what is indecent.

Indecent words: speech connected with the anus, the vagina, or sexual intercourse.

Speaks: misconduct is what is meant.

As a young man might to a young woman: a male youth to a female youth, a boy to a girl, a male who indulges in worldly pleasures to a female who indulges in worldly pleasures.

Referring to sexual intercourse: connected with the sexual act.

He commits an offense entailing suspension: ... Therefore, too, it is called "an offense entailing suspension".

Permutations

Summary

Referring to the two private orifices, he praises, disparages, re- 3.1.1
quests, implores, asks, enquires, describes, instructs, abuses.

Sub-definitions

Praises: extols, praises, commends the two private orifices.

Disparages: despises, reviles, censures the two private orifices.

Requests: saying, “Give to me; you should give to me.”

Implores: saying, “When will you please your mother?” “When will you please your father?” “When will you please the gods?” “When will there be a good opportunity, a good time, a good moment?” “When will I have sexual intercourse with you?”

Asks: saying, “How do you give to your husband?” “How do you give to your lover?”

Enquires: saying, “So you give to your husband like this, and to your lover like this?”

Describes: when asked, he says, “Give like this. If you do, you’ll be dear and pleasing to your husband.”

Instructs: without being asked, he says, “Give like this. If you do, you’ll be dear and pleasing to your husband.”

Abuses: saying, “You lack genitals;” “You have incomplete genitals;” “You don’t menstruate;” “You menstruate continuously;” “You always wear a menstruation pad;” “You’re incontinent;” “You have genital prolapse;” “You lack sexual organs;” “You’re manlike;” “You have fistula;” “You’re a hermaphrodite.”

Exposition

Referring to the private parts of a single person or animal

It is a woman, he perceives her as a woman, and he has lust. If the 3.2.1
monk, referring to the anus or the vagina of the woman, praises, disparages, requests, implores, asks, enquires, describes, instructs, or abuses, he commits an offense entailing suspension. ... (To

be expanded as in Bu Ss 2:3.1.3–Bu Ss 2:3.1.49, with appropriate substitutions.) ...⁷⁹

Referring to the private parts of two beings of the same kind

- 3.2.4.1 It is two women, he perceives them both as women, and he has lust. If the monk, referring to the anus or the vagina of both women, praises, disparages ... or abuses, he commits two offenses entailing suspension. ... (To be expanded as in Bu Ss 2:3.2.4–Bu Ss 2:3.2.26, with appropriate substitutions.) ...

Referring to the private parts of two beings of different kinds

- 3.2.8.1 It is a woman and a *paṇḍaka*, but he perceives both as women, and he has lust. If the monk, referring to the anus or the vagina of both of them, praises, disparages ... or abuses, he commits one offense entailing suspension and one offense of wrong conduct. ... (To be expanded as in Bu Ss 2:3.3.4–Bu Ss 2:3.3.61, with appropriate substitutions.) ...

Referring to other parts of the body: below the collar bone and above the knees

- 3.3.1 It is a woman, he perceives her as a woman, and he has lust. If the monk, referring to any part of the woman below the collar bone but above the knees, apart from the anus or the vagina, praises, disparages ... or abuses, he commits a serious offense. ...
- 3.3.4 It is two women, he perceives them both as women, and he has lust. If the monk, referring to any part of both women below the collar bone but above the knees, apart from the anus or the vagina, praises, disparages ... or abuses, he commits two serious offenses. ...
- 3.3.7 It is a woman and a *paṇḍaka*, but he perceives both as women, and he has lust. If the monk, referring to any part of both of them below the collar bone but above the knees, apart from the anus

79. There are no instructions in the Pali or in the commentaries for how the expansion here or below is to be done. I therefore assume it is to be done in accordance with the previous rule.

or the vagina, praises, disparages ... or abuses, he commits one serious offense and one offense of wrong conduct. ...

Referring to other parts of the body: above the collar bone or below the knees

It is a woman, he perceives her as a woman, and he has lust. If the monk, referring to any part of the woman above the collar bone or below the knees, praises, disparages ... or abuses, he commits an offense of wrong conduct. ... 3.4.1

It is two women, he perceives them both as women, and he has lust. If the monk, referring to any part of both women above the collar bone or below the knees, praises, disparages ... or abuses, he commits two offenses of wrong conduct. ... 3.4.4

It is a woman and a *paṇḍaka*, but he perceives both as women, and he has lust. If the monk, referring to any part of both of them above the collar bone or below the knees, praises, disparages ... or abuses, he commits two offenses of wrong conduct. ... 3.4.7

Referring to anything connected to the body

It is a woman, he perceives her as a woman, and he has lust. If the monk, referring to anything connected to the woman's body, praises, disparages ... or abuses, he commits an offense of wrong conduct. ... 3.5.1

It is two women, he perceives them both as women, and he has lust. If the monk, referring to anything connected to the body of both women, praises, disparages ... or abuses, he commits two offenses of wrong conduct. ... 3.5.4

It is a woman and a *paṇḍaka*, but he perceives both as women, and he has lust. If the monk, referring to anything connected to the body of both of them, praises, disparages ... or abuses, he commits two offenses of wrong conduct. ... 3.5.7

Non-offenses

- 3.6.1 There is no offense: if he is aiming at something beneficial; if he is aiming at giving a teaching; if he is aiming at giving an instruction; if he is insane; if he is the first offender.

Summary verses of case studies

- 3.6.8 “Red, coarse, thick,
Rough, long, sown;
I hope the path has an end,
Faith, with a gift, with work.”

Case studies

- 4.1.1 At one time a certain woman was wearing a newly dyed woolen cloak. A lustful monk said to her, “Sister, is that red thing yours?” She did not understand and said, “Yes, Venerable, it’s a newly dyed woolen cloak.” He became anxious and thought, “The Buddha has laid down a training rule. Could it be that I’ve committed an offense entailing suspension?” He told the Buddha, who said, “There’s no offense entailing suspension, but there’s an offense of wrong conduct.”
- 4.2.1 At one time a certain woman was wearing a coarse woolen cloak. A lustful monk said to her, “Sister, is that rough hair yours?” She did not understand and said, “Yes, Venerable, it’s a coarse woolen cloak.” He became anxious ... “There’s no offense entailing suspension, but there’s an offense of wrong conduct.”
- 4.3.1 At one time a certain woman was wearing a newly woven woolen cloak. A lustful monk said to her, “Sister, is that thick hair yours?” She did not understand and said, “Yes, Venerable, it’s a newly woven woolen cloak.” He became anxious ... “There’s no offense entailing suspension, but there’s an offense of wrong conduct.”
- 4.4.1 At one time a certain woman was wearing a coarse woolen cloak. A lustful monk said to her, “Sister, is that coarse hair yours?” She did not understand and said, “Yes, Venerable, it’s a coarse woolen cloak.” He became anxious ... “There’s no offense entailing suspension, but there’s an offense of wrong conduct.”

At one time a certain woman was wearing a fleecy upper robe. 4.5.1
A lustful monk said to her, “Sister, is that long hair yours?” She did not understand and said, “Yes, Venerable, it’s a fleecy upper robe.” He became anxious ... “There’s no offense entailing suspension, but there’s an offense of wrong conduct.”

At one time a certain woman was returning after having had a 4.6.1
field sown. A lustful monk said to her, “Have you sown, Sister?” She did not understand and said, “Yes, Venerable, but the furrow isn’t yet closed yet.” He became anxious ... “There’s no offense entailing suspension, but there’s an offense of wrong conduct.”

At one time a lustful monk saw a female wanderer coming in the 4.7.1
opposite direction. He said to her, “Sister, I hope the path has an end?” She did not understand and said, “Yes, just keep going.” He became anxious ... “There’s no offense entailing suspension, but there’s a serious offense.”

At one time a lustful monk said to a woman, “You have faith, 4.8.1
Sister, yet you don’t give us what you give your husband.”

“What’s that, Venerable?” 4.8.4

“Sexual intercourse.” He became anxious ... “There’s an offense 4.8.5
entailing suspension.”

At one time a lustful monk said to a woman, “You have faith, 4.9.1
Sister, yet you don’t give us the highest gift.”

“What’s that, Venerable?” 4.9.4

“Sexual intercourse.” He became anxious ... “There’s an offense 4.9.5
entailing suspension.”

At one time a certain woman was doing some work. A lust- 4.10.1
ful monk said to her, “Stand, Sister, I’ll work.” ... “Sit, Sister, I’ll work.” ... “Lie down, Sister, I’ll work.” She did not understand. He became anxious ... “There’s no offense entailing suspension, but there’s an offense of wrong conduct.”

The training rule on indecent speech, the third, is finished.

The training rule on satisfying one's own desires

Attakāmpāricariya

Origin story

- 1.1.1 At one time the Buddha was staying at Sāvathī in the Jeta Grove, Anāthapiṇḍika's Monastery. At that time Venerable Udāyī was associating with and visiting a number of families in Sāvathī. One morning Udāyī robed up, took his bowl and robe, and went to the house of a beautiful widow where he sat down on the prepared seat. She then approached Udāyī, bowed, and sat down. And Udāyī instructed, inspired, and gladdened her with a teaching. She then said, "Venerable, please tell me what you need. I can give robe-cloth, almsfood, a dwelling, and medicinal supplies."
- 1.1.10 "It's not hard for us to get those requisites. Give instead what's hard for us to get."
- 1.1.12 "What's that, Venerable?"
- 1.1.13 "Sexual intercourse."
- 1.1.14 "Is it wanted now?"
- 1.1.15 "Yes."
- 1.1.16 Saying, "Come," she entered her bedroom, took off her wrap, and lay back on the bed. Udāyī went up to her and spat out, "Who would touch this stinking wretch!" and he left.
- 1.1.21 That woman then complained and criticized him, "These Sakyan monastics are shameless and immoral liars. They claim to have integrity, to be celibate and of good conduct, to be truthful, moral, and good. But they don't have the good character of a monastic or brahmin. They've lost the plot! How could the ascetic Udāyī ask for sexual intercourse from me, but then spit out, 'Who would touch this stinking wretch!' and leave? What's bad about me? How am I stinking? How am I inferior to anyone?"
- 1.2.1 Other women, too, criticized him in the same way,

The monks heard the criticism of those women, and the monks of few desires complained and criticized him, “How could Venerable Udāyī encourage a woman to satisfy his own desires?” 1.2.5

Those monks rebuked Udāyī in many ways and then told the Buddha. The Buddha had the Sangha gathered and questioned Udāyī: “Is it true, Udāyī, that you did this?” 1.2.8

“It’s true, Sir.” 1.2.11

The Buddha rebuked him, “It’s not suitable, foolish man, it’s not proper, it’s not worthy of a monastic, it’s not allowable, it’s not to be done. How could you do such a thing? Haven’t I given many teachings for the sake of dispassion, not for the sake of passion ... the stilling of the fevers of sensual pleasure? This will affect people’s confidence ...” ... “And, monks, this training rule should be recited like this: 1.2.12

Final ruling

‘If a monk, overcome by lust and with a distorted mind, encourages a woman to satisfy his own desires, saying, “Sister, she provides the highest service who in this way satisfies one like me, who is virtuous, celibate, and of good character,” and if it is a reference to sexual intercourse, he commits an offense entailing suspension.’”

Definitions

A: whoever ...

Monk: ... The monk who has been given the full ordination by a unanimous Sangha through a legal procedure consisting of one motion and three announcements that is irreversible and fit to stand—this sort of monk is meant in this case.

Overcome by lust: having lust, longing for, in love with.

Distorted: a lustful mind is distorted; an angry mind is distorted; a confused mind is distorted. But in this case “distorted” refers to the lustful mind.

A woman: a human female, not a female spirit, not a female ghost, not a female animal. She understands and is capable of discerning bad speech and good speech, what is decent and what is indecent.

A woman:⁸⁰ near a woman, close to a woman.

His own desires: his own sensual desires, for the sake of himself, aiming at himself, satisfying himself.

The highest: this is the highest, this is the best, this is the foremost, this is the utmost, this is the most excellent.

She: an aristocrat woman, a brahmin woman, a merchant woman, or a woman worker.

One like me: a male aristocrat, a male brahmin, a male merchant, or a male worker.

Who is virtuous: one who refrains from killing living beings, who refrains from stealing, who refrains from lying.

Celibate: one who refrains from sexual intercourse.

Of good character: he is one of good character because of that virtue and because of being celibate.

In this way: with sexual intercourse.

Satisfies: gives pleasure to.

If it is a reference to sexual intercourse: if it is connected with the sexual act.

He commits an offense entailing suspension: ... Therefore, too, it is called “an offense entailing suspension”.

Permutations

Encouraging sexual intercourse to a single person or animal

- 3.1.1 It is a woman, he perceives her as a woman, and he has lust. If the monk encourages the woman to satisfy his own desires, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

80. Because I have rendered *mātugāmassa santike* (literally “in the presence of a woman”) simply as “woman”, the English rendering of the word to be defined is the same here as in the previous definition.

It is a woman, but he is unsure of it ... It is a woman, but he perceives her as a *paṇḍaka* ... It is a woman, but he perceives her as a man ... It is a woman, but he perceives her as an animal, and he has lust. If the monk encourages the woman to satisfy his own desires, he commits a serious offense. 3.1.3

It is a *paṇḍaka*, he perceives him as a *paṇḍaka*, and he has lust. If the monk encourages the *paṇḍaka* to satisfy his own desires, he commits a serious offense. 3.1.8

It is a *paṇḍaka*, but he is unsure of it ... It is a *paṇḍaka*, but he perceives him as a man ... It is a *paṇḍaka*, but he perceives him as an animal ... It is a *paṇḍaka*, but he perceives him as a woman, and he has lust. If the monk encourages the *paṇḍaka* to satisfy his own desires, he commits an offense of wrong conduct. 3.1.10

It is a man ... (To be expanded as above with appropriate adjustments.) ... It is an animal, he perceives it as an animal ... It is an animal, but he is unsure of it ... It is an animal, but he perceives it as a woman ... It is an animal, but he perceives it as a *paṇḍaka* ... It is an animal, but he perceives it as a man, and he has lust. If the monk encourages the animal to satisfy his own desires, he commits an offense of wrong conduct. 3.1.15

Encouraging sexual intercourse to two beings of the same kind

It is two women, he perceives them both as women, and he has lust. If the monk encourages both women to satisfy his own desires, he commits two offenses entailing suspension. (To be expanded as in Bu Ss 2:3.2.4–Bu Ss 2:3.2.26, with appropriate substitutions.) 3.1.23.1

Encouraging sexual intercourse to two beings of different kinds

It is a woman and a *paṇḍaka*, but he perceives both as women, and he has lust. If the monk encourages both of them to satisfy his own desires, he commits one offense entailing suspension and one offense of wrong conduct. (To be expanded as in Bu Ss 2:3.3.4–Bu Ss 2:3.3.61, with appropriate substitutions.) 3.1.26.1

Non-offenses

- 3.2.1 There is no offense: if he says, “Support us with robe-cloth, alms-food, dwellings, and medicinal supplies;” if he is insane; if he is the first offender.

Summary verses of case studies

- 3.2.6 How a barren woman, may she have a child,
And dear to, may I be fortunate;
What may I give, how may I support,
How may I get a good rebirth.”

Case studies

- 4.1.1 On one occasion a barren woman said to a monk who associated with her family, “Sir, how can I get pregnant?”
- 4.1.3 “Well, Sister, give the highest gift.”
- 4.1.4 “What’s that?”
- 4.1.5 “Sexual intercourse.” He became anxious ... “You’ve committed an offense entailing suspension.”
- 4.2.1 On one occasion a fertile woman said to a monk who associated with her family, “Sir, how can I get a child?”
- 4.2.3 “Well, Sister, give the highest gift.”
- 4.2.4 “What’s that?”
- 4.2.5 “Sexual intercourse.” He became anxious ... “You’ve committed an offense entailing suspension.”
- 4.3.1 On one occasion a woman said to a monk who associated with her family, “Sir, how can I get my husband to love me?”
- 4.3.3 “Well, Sister, give the highest gift.”
- 4.3.4 “What’s that?”
- 4.3.5 “Sexual intercourse.” He became anxious ... “You’ve committed an offense entailing suspension.”
- 4.3.8 On one occasion a woman said to a monk who associated with her family, “Sir, how can I become more fortunate?”
- 4.3.10 “Well, Sister, give the highest gift.”
- 4.3.11 “What’s that?”
- 4.3.12 “Sexual intercourse.” He became anxious ... “You’ve committed an offense entailing suspension.”

On one occasion a woman said to a monk who associated with her family, "Sir, what may I give you?" 4.4.1

"The highest gift, Sister." 4.4.3

"What's that?" 4.4.4

"Sexual intercourse." He became anxious ... "You've committed an offense entailing suspension." 4.4.5

On one occasion a woman said to a monk who associated with her family, "Sir, how may I support you?" 4.5.1

"With the highest gift, Sister." 4.5.3

"What's that?" 4.5.4

"Sexual intercourse." He became anxious ... "You've committed an offense entailing suspension." 4.5.5

On one occasion a woman said to a monk who associated with her family, "Sir, how can I get a good rebirth?" 4.6.1

"Well, Sister, give the highest gift." 4.6.3

"What's that?" 4.6.4

"Sexual intercourse." He became anxious ... "You've committed an offense entailing suspension." 4.6.5

The training rule on satisfying one's own desires, the fourth, is finished.

The training rule on matchmaking

Saṅcaritta

Origin story

First sub-story

- 1.1.1 At one time when the Buddha was staying at Sāvattthī in Anāthapiṇḍika's Monastery, Venerable Udāyī was associating with and visiting a number of families in Sāvattthī.
- 1.1.3 When Udāyī saw a young man without a wife or a young woman without a husband, he would praise the young woman to the parents of a young man, "The young woman of such-and-such a family is beautiful, intelligent, skilled, and diligent. She's suitable for your son." They would reply, "They don't know who we are, Venerable. If you could persuade them to give the girl, we would take her for our son."
- 1.1.9 And he praised the young man to the parents of a young woman, "The young man of such-and-such a family is handsome, intelligent, skilled, and diligent. He's suitable for your daughter." They would reply, "They don't know who we are, Venerable, and we would be ashamed to speak to them for the sake of the girl. But if you could persuade them to ask us, we would give our girl to the young man." In this way he arranged for the taking of a bride, for the giving of a bride, and for marriage.
- 1.2.1 At that time there was a former courtesan who had a beautiful daughter. On one occasion some lay followers of the Ājīvaka religion came from another village and said to that courtesan, "Madam, please give your girl to our boy."
- 1.2.4 "I don't know who you are, Sirs, and I won't give my only daughter to be taken to another village."
- 1.2.6 People asked those Ājīvaka lay followers why they had come. They replied, "We came to ask that courtesan to give her daughter to our son, but she refused."

“But why did you ask the courtesan? You should speak to Venerable Udāyī. He’ll persuade her.” 1.2.11

They then went to Udāyī and said, “Venerable, we’ve asked that courtesan here to give her daughter to our son, but she refused. Would you please persuade her to give her daughter?” 1.2.14

Udāyī agreed. Soon afterwards he went to that courtesan and said, “Why didn’t you give them your daughter?” 1.2.19

“I don’t know who they are, Sir, and I won’t give my only daughter to be taken to another village.” 1.2.21

“Please give her to them. I know them.” 1.2.23

“If you know them, I’ll give her away.” 1.2.25

She then gave her daughter to those Ājīvaka followers, and they took her away. For a month they treated her like a daughter-in-law, but then like a slave. 1.3.1

The girl sent a message to her mother, saying, “Mom, I’m unhappy and miserable. For a month they treated me like a daughter-in-law, but then like a slave. Come, mom, and take me home.” 1.3.4

Soon afterwards the courtesan went to those Ājīvakas and said, “Please don’t treat my girl like a slave; treat her properly!” 1.3.9

They replied, “We deal with the monastic, not with you. Go away! We don’t want anything to do with you.”⁸¹ Being dismissed, she returned to Sāvattḥī. 1.3.12

A second time the girl sent the same message to her mother. That courtesan then went to Udāyī and said, “Venerable, my girl is unhappy and miserable. They treated her like a daughter-in-law for a month, but then like a slave. Please tell them to treat her properly.” 1.3.17

Udāyī went to the Ājīvakas and said, “Please don’t treat this girl like a slave; treat her properly.” 1.3.29

They replied, “We deal with the courtesan, not with you. A monastic shouldn’t get involved. You should behave like a proper monastic. So go away! We don’t want anything to do with you.” Being dismissed, he returned to Sāvattḥī. 1.3.32

81. Literally, “We don’t know you.”

- 1.3.39 A third time that girl sent the same message to her mother, and a second time the courtesan went to Udāyī and told him the same thing.
- 1.3.50 He replied, “When I first went, they just dismissed me. Go yourself; I’m not going.”
- 1.4.1 Then that courtesan complained and criticized him, “May Venerable Udāyī be miserable and unhappy, just as my girl is miserable and unhappy because of her nasty mother-in-law, father-in-law, and husband.”
- 1.4.3 The girl, too, complained and criticized him in the same way,
- 1.4.5 as did other women who were unhappy with their mothers-in-law, fathers-in-law, and husbands.
- 1.4.7 But those women who were happy with their in-laws wished him well, saying, “May Venerable Udāyī be happy and well, just as we are happy and well because of our good mothers-in-law, fathers-in-law, and husbands.”
- 1.5.1 The monks heard that some women were criticizing him whereas others were wishing him well. And the monks of few desires complained and criticized him, “How could Venerable Udāyī act as a matchmaker?”
- 1.5.4 They told the Buddha. The Buddha had the Sangha gathered and questioned Udāyī: “Is it true, Udāyī, that you do this?”
- 1.5.7 “It’s true, Sir.”
- 1.5.8 The Buddha rebuked him ... “Foolish man, how could you do this? This will affect people’s confidence ...” ... “And, monks, this training rule should be recited like this:

Preliminary ruling

‘If a monk acts as a matchmaker, conveying a man’s intention to a woman or a woman’s intention to a man, for marriage or for an affair, he commits an offense entailing suspension.’”

- 1.5.13 In this way the Buddha laid down this training rule for the monks.

Second sub-story

Soon afterwards a number of scoundrels who were enjoying themselves in a park sent a messenger to a sex worker, saying, “Please come, let’s enjoy ourselves in the park.” 2.1.1

She replied, “Sirs, I don’t know who you are. I’m wealthy. I don’t want to go outside the city.” 2.1.3

The messenger returned the message. A certain man then said to those men, “Why did you ask the sex worker? You should speak to Venerable Udāyī. He’ll persuade her.” 2.1.7

But a certain Buddhist lay follower said, “No way. That’s not allowable for the Sakyan monastics. He won’t do it.” And they made a bet on whether he would. 2.1.12

Those scoundrels then went to Udāyī and said, “Venerable, while we were enjoying ourselves in the park, we sent a message to such-and-such a sex worker, asking her to come, but she refused. Would you please persuade her?” 2.1.17

Udāyī agreed. He then went to that sex worker and said, “Why don’t you go to those men?” 2.1.24

She told him why. 2.1.26

“Please go. I know them.” 2.1.29

“If you know them, Sir, I’ll go.” And those men took her to the park. 2.1.30

Then that lay follower complained and criticized him, “How could Venerable Udāyī act as a matchmaker for a brief affair?” 2.2.1

The monks heard it, and the monks of few desires complained and criticized him, “How could Venerable Udāyī act as a matchmaker for a brief affair?” 2.2.3

They rebuked Udāyī in many ways and then told the Buddha. Soon afterwards he had the Sangha gathered and questioned Udāyī: “Is it true, Udāyī, that you did this?” 2.2.6

“It’s true, Sir.” 2.2.8

The Buddha rebuked him ... “Foolish man, how could you do this? This will affect people’s confidence ...” ... “And so, monks, this training rule should be recited like this: 2.2.9

Final ruling

‘If a monk acts as a matchmaker, conveying a man’s intention to a woman or a woman’s intention to a man, for marriage or for an affair, even if just a brief one, he commits an offense entailing suspension.’”

Definitions

A: whoever ...

Monk: ... The monk who has been given the full ordination by a unanimous Sangha through a legal procedure consisting of one motion and three announcements that is irreversible and fit to stand—this sort of monk is meant in this case.

Acts as a matchmaker, conveying: sent by a woman he goes to a man, or sent by a man he goes to a woman.

A man’s intention to a woman: he informs a woman of a man’s intention.

A woman’s intention to a man: he informs a man of a woman’s intention.

For marriage: “You should be his wife.”

For an affair: “You should be his mistress.”

Even if just a brief one: “You will have a short relationship.”

He commits an offense entailing suspension: ... Therefore, too, it is called “an offense entailing suspension”.

Permutations

Permutations part 1

Summary

- 4.1.1 There are ten kinds of women: the one protected by her mother, the one protected by her father, the one protected by her parents, the one protected by her brother, the one protected by her sister, the one protected by her relatives, the one protected by her family,

the one protected by her religion, the one otherwise protected, the one protected by the threat of punishment.

There are ten kinds of wives: the bought wife, the wife by choice, the wife through property, the wife through clothes, the wife through the bowl-of-water ritual, the wife through removing the head pad, the slave wife, the servant wife, the captured wife, the momentary wife. 4.1.2

Definitions

The one protected by her mother: her mother protects, guards, wields authority, controls.

The one protected by her father: her father protects, guards, wields authority, controls.

The one protected by her parents: her parents protect, guard, wield authority, control.

The one protected by her brother: her brother protects, guards, wields authority, controls.

The one protected by her sister: her sister protects, guards, wields authority, controls.

The one protected by her relatives: her relatives protect, guard, wield authority, control.

The one protected by her family: her family protects, guards, wields authority, controls.

The one protected by her religion: her fellow believers protect, guard, wield authority, control.

The one otherwise protected:⁸² even in the womb someone takes possession of her, thinking, “She is mine,” and so too for one engaged to be married.

The one protected by the threat of punishment: those who punish will punish anyone going to her with a fixed punishment.

The bought wife: after buying her with money, they live together.

82. Sp 1.303: *Saha ārakkenāti sārakkhā*; “*Sārakkha* means having protection.” Sp-t 1.303: *Sasāmikā sārakkhā*; “*Sārakkhā* means having a husband.” But it clearly does not mean marriage in a modern sense.

The wife by choice: being dear to each other, they live together.

The wife through property: after giving property, they live together.

The wife through clothes: after giving clothes, they live together.

The wife through the bowl-of-water ritual: after touching a bowl of water, they live together.⁸³

The wife through removing the head pad: after removing the head pad, they live together.⁸⁴

The slave wife: she is a slave and a wife.

The servant wife: she is a servant and a wife.

The captured wife: one brought back as a captive is what is meant.

The momentary wife: a wife for one occasion is what is meant.

Exposition

Acting as a matchmaker for a man and a single bought wife

4.4.1 A man sends a monk, saying, “Sir, go to so-and-so protected by her mother and say, ‘Please be the bought wife of so-and-so.’” If he accepts the mission, finds out the response, and reports back, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

4.4.5 A man sends a monk, saying, “Sir, go to so-and-so protected by her father and say ... so-and-so protected by her parents and say ... so-and-so protected by her brother and say ... so-and-so protected

83. Sp 1.303: *Odapattakinīti ubhinnaṃ ekissā udakapātiyā hatthe otāretvā “idaṃ udakaṃ viya samsaṭṭhā abhejjā hothā”ti vatvā pariggahitāya vo-hāranāmetam, niddesepissa “tāya saha udakapattam āmasitvā tam vāseti”ti evamattho veditabbo*; “*Odapattakinī*: this is an expression for both having entered their hand into a single bowl of water, saying, for the purpose of talking possession, ‘May you not be split but be together like this water. Also, it may be specified like this: ‘After touching the bowl of water with you, he lives with you. The meaning is to be understood in this way.’”

84. Sp 1.303: *Obhaṭam oropitaṃ cumbaṭamassāti obhaṭacumbaṭā, kaṭṭhahārikādīnaṃ aññatārā, yassā sisato cumbaṭam oropetvā ghare vāseti, tassā etaṃ adhivacanam*; “*Obhaṭacumbaṭā*: her head pad, which is for carrying sticks, etc., has been removed. This is a term for one who is made to live in a house (with another), after removing the cloth pad from her head.”

by her sister and say ... so-and-so protected by her relatives and say ... so-and-so protected by her family and say ... so-and-so protected by her religion and say ... so-and-so otherwise protected and say ... so-and-so protected by the threat of punishment and say, 'Please be the bought wife of so-and-so.'” If he accepts the mission, finds out the response, and reports back, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

The setting out of the steps is finished.

Acting as a matchmaker for a man and two bought wives

A man sends a monk, saying, “Sir, go to so-and-so protected by her mother and so-and-so protected by her father and say,⁸⁵ ‘Please be the bought wives of so-and-so.’” If he accepts the mission, finds out the response, and reports back, he commits an offense entailing suspension. 4.4.18.1

A man sends a monk, saying, “Sir, go to so-and-so protected by her mother and so-and-so protected by her parents ... so-and-so protected by her mother and so-and-so protected by her brother ... so-and-so protected by her mother and so-and-so protected by her sister ... so-and-so protected by her mother and so-and-so protected by her relatives ... so-and-so protected by her mother and so-and-so protected by her family ... so-and-so protected by her mother and so-and-so protected by her religion ... so-and-so protected by her mother and so-and-so otherwise protected ... so-and-so protected by her mother and so-and-so protected by the threat of punishment and say, ‘Please be the bought wives of so-and-so.’” If he accepts the mission, finds out the response, and reports back, he commits an offense entailing suspension. 4.4.22

85. At first glance the Pali seems to concern a single wife who is protected in two ways, not two separate wives. However, since the immediately following question is phrased in the plural, *hotha ... bhariyāyo dhanakkītā*, “please be the bought wives,” it is clear that this is about two wives. To bring this out in translation, I have added “so-and-so” to each potential wife.

*The unconnected permutation series is finished.*⁸⁶

4.4.34 A man sends a monk, saying, “Sir, go to so-and-so protected by her father and so-and-so protected by her parents and say, ‘Please be the bought wives of so-and-so.’” If he accepts the mission, finds out the response, and reports back, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

4.4.38 A man sends a monk, saying, “Sir, go to so-and-so protected by her father and so-and-so protected by her brother ... so-and-so protected by her father and so-and-so protected by her sister ... so-and-so protected by her father and so-and-so protected by her relatives ... so-and-so protected by her father and so-and-so protected by her family ... so-and-so protected by her father and so-and-so protected by her religion ... so-and-so protected by her father and so-and-so otherwise protected ... so-and-so protected by her father and so-and-so protected by the threat of punishment and say, ‘Please be the bought wives of so-and-so.’” If he accepts the mission, finds out the response, and reports back, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

4.4.48 A man sends a monk, saying, “Sir, go to so-and-so protected by her father and so-and-so protected by her mother and say, ‘Please be the bought wives of so-and-so.’” If he accepts the mission, finds out the response, and reports back, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

*The linked permutation series with the basis in brief is finished.*⁸⁷

4.4.53 ... A man sends a monk, saying, “Sir, go to so-and-so protected by the threat of punishment and so-and-so protected by her mother and say, ‘Please be the bought wives of so-and-so.’” If he accepts the mission, finds out the response, and reports back, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

86. For an explanation of these sectional summaries, see Appendix of Technical Terms.

87. Here the series is said to be linked because it ends where the previous series started. In effect the series forms a loop. “The basis in brief” refers to the fact that the series is heavily contracted, as indicated by the ellipses points at the start of the next series.

A man sends a monk, saying, “Sir, go to so-and-so protected by the threat of punishment and so-and-so protected by her father ... so-and-so protected by the threat of punishment and so-and-so protected by her parents ... so-and-so protected by the threat of punishment and so-and-so protected by her brother ... so-and-so protected by the threat of punishment and so-and-so protected by her sister ... so-and-so protected by the threat of punishment and so-and-so protected by her relatives ... so-and-so protected by the threat of punishment and so-and-so protected by her family ... so-and-so protected by the threat of punishment and so-and-so protected by her religion ... so-and-so protected by the threat of punishment and so-and-so otherwise protected and say, ‘Please be the bought wives of so-and-so.’” If he accepts the mission, finds out the response, and reports back, he commits an offense entailing suspension. 4.4.57

The section based on one item is finished.

Acting as a matchmaker for a man and three to nine bought wives

The sections based on two items, three items, up to nine items, are to be done in the same way. 4.4.69.1

Acting as a matchmaker for a man and ten bought wives

This is the section based on ten items: 4.4.70.1

A man sends a monk, saying, “Sir, go to so-and-so protected by her mother and so-and-so protected by her father and so-and-so protected by her parents and so-and-so protected by her brother and so-and-so protected by her sister and so-and-so protected by her relatives and so-and-so protected by her family and so-and-so protected by her religion and so-and-so otherwise protected and so-and-so protected by the threat of punishment and say, ‘Please be the bought wives of so-and-so.’” If he accepts the mission, finds out the response, and reports back, he commits an offense entailing suspension. 4.4.71

The permutation series on bought wives is finished.

Acting as a matchmaker for a man and other kinds of wives

- 4.5.1 A man sends a monk, saying, “Sir, go to so-and-so protected by her mother and say, ‘Please be the wife by choice of so-and-so.’” ... the wife through property of so-and-so.” ... the wife through clothes of so-and-so.” ... the wife through the bowl-of-water ritual of so-and-so.” ... the wife through removing the head pad of so-and-so.” ... the slave wife of so-and-so.” ... the servant wife of so-and-so.” ... the captured wife of so-and-so.” ... the momentary wife of so-and-so.” If he accepts the mission, finds out the response, and reports back, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

Acting as a matchmaker for a man and a single momentary wife

- 4.5.13.1 A man sends a monk, saying, “Sir, go to so-and-so protected by her father and say ... so-and-so protected by her parents ... so-and-so protected by her brother ... so-and-so protected by her sister ... so-and-so protected by her relatives ... so-and-so protected by her family ... so-and-so protected by her religion ... so-and-so otherwise protected ... so-and-so protected by the threat of punishment and say, ‘Please be the momentary wife of so-and-so.’” If he accepts the mission, finds out the response, and reports back, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

The setting out of the steps is finished.

Acting as a matchmaker for a man and two momentary wives

- 4.5.26.1 A man sends a monk, saying, “Sir, go to so-and-so protected by her mother and so-and-so protected by her father and say, ‘Please be the momentary wives of so-and-so.’” If he accepts the mission, finds out the response, and reports back, he commits an offense entailing suspension.
- 4.5.30 A man sends a monk, saying, “Sir, go to so-and-so protected by her mother and so-and-so protected by her parents ... so-and-so protected by her mother and so-and-so protected by the threat of punishment and say, ‘Please be the momentary wives of so-and-

so.’” If he accepts the mission, finds out the response, and reports back, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

The unconnected permutation series is finished.

A man sends a monk, saying, “Sir, go to so-and-so protected by her father and so-and-so protected by her parents and say, ‘Please be the momentary wives of so-and-so.’” If he accepts the mission, finds out the response, and reports back, he commits an offense entailing suspension. 4.5.36

A man sends a monk, saying, “Sir, go to so-and-so protected by her father and so-and-so protected by her brother ... so-and-so protected by her father and so-and-so protected by the threat of punishment and say, ‘Please be the momentary wives of so-and-so.’” If he accepts the mission, finds out the response, and reports back, he commits an offense entailing suspension. 4.5.40

A man sends a monk, saying, “Sir, go to so-and-so protected by her father and so-and-so protected by her mother and say, ‘Please be the momentary wives of so-and-so.’” If he accepts the mission, finds out the response, and reports back, he commits an offense entailing suspension. 4.5.45

The linked permutation series with the basis in brief is finished.

A man sends a monk, saying, “Sir, go to so-and-so protected by the threat of punishment and so-and-so protected by her mother and say, ‘Please be the momentary wives of so-and-so.’” If he accepts the mission, finds out the response, and reports back, he commits an offense entailing suspension. 4.5.50

A man sends a monk, saying, “Sir, go to so-and-so protected by the threat of punishment and so-and-so protected by her father ... so-and-so protected by the threat of punishment and so-and-so otherwise protected and say, ‘Please be the momentary wives of so-and-so.’” If he accepts the mission, finds out the response, and reports back, he commits an offense entailing suspension. 4.5.54

The section based on one item is finished.

Acting as a matchmaker for a man and three to nine momentary wives

- 4.5.60.1 The sections based on two items, etc., are to be done in the same way.

Acting as a matchmaker for a man and ten momentary wives

- 4.5.61.1 This is the section based on ten items:

- 4.5.62 A man sends a monk, saying, “Sir, go to so-and-so protected by her mother and so-and-so protected by her father and so-and-so protected by her parents and so-and-so protected by her brother and so-and-so protected by her sister and so-and-so protected by her relatives and so-and-so protected by her family and so-and-so protected by her religion and so-and-so otherwise protected and so-and-so protected by the threat of punishment and say, ‘Please be the momentary wives of so-and-so.’” If he accepts the mission, finds out the response, and reports back, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

The permutation series on momentary wives is finished.

Acting as a matchmaker for a man and one protected by her mother: a single reason⁸⁸

- 4.6.1 A man sends a monk, saying, “Sir, go to so-and-so protected by her mother and say, ‘Please be the bought wife of so-and-so.’” If he accepts the mission, finds out the response, and reports back, he commits an offense entailing suspension.
- 4.6.5 A man sends a monk, saying, “Sir, go to so-and-so protected by her mother and say, ‘Please be the wife by choice of so-and-so.’” ... the wife through property of so-and-so.” ... the wife through clothes of so-and-so.” ... the wife through the bowl-of-water ritual of so-and-so.” ... the wife through removing the head pad of so-and-so.” ... the slave wife of so-and-so.” ... the servant wife of so-and-so.” ... the captured wife of so-and-so.” ... the momentary wife of so-and-so.” If he accepts the mission, finds out

88. The reason referred to here and below refers to the one or more reasons why a woman might become a man’s wife.

the response, and reports back, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

The setting out of the steps is finished.

Acting as a matchmaker for a man and one protected by her mother: combinations of two reasons

A man sends a monk, saying, “Sir, go to so-and-so protected by her mother and say, ‘Please be the bought wife and the wife by choice of so-and-so.’” If he accepts the mission, finds out the response, and reports back, he commits an offense entailing suspension. 4.6.18.1

A man sends a monk, saying, “Sir, go to so-and-so protected by her mother and say, ‘Please be the bought wife and the wife through property of so-and-so.’” ... the bought wife and the wife through clothes of so-and-so.’” ... the bought wife and the wife through the bowl-of-water ritual of so-and-so.’” ... the bought wife and the wife through removing the head pad of so-and-so.’” ... the bought wife and the slave wife of so-and-so.’” ... the bought wife and the servant wife of so-and-so.’” ... the bought wife and the captured wife of so-and-so.’” ... the bought wife and the momentary wife of so-and-so.’” If he accepts the mission, finds out the response, and reports back, he commits an offense entailing suspension. 4.6.22

The unconnected permutation series is finished.

A man sends a monk, saying, “Sir, go to so-and-so protected by her mother and say, ‘Please be the wife by choice and the wife through property of so-and-so.’” ... the wife by choice and the momentary wife of so-and-so.’” ... the wife by choice and the bought wife of so-and-so.’” If he accepts the mission, finds out the response, and reports back, he commits an offense entailing suspension. 4.6.34

The linked permutation series with the basis in brief is finished.

A man sends a monk, saying, “Sir, go to so-and-so protected by her mother and say, ‘Please be the momentary wife so and the bought wife of so-and-so.’” ... the momentary wife and the wife by choice of so-and-so.’” ... the momentary wife and the cap- 4.6.41

tured wife of so-and-so.’” If he accepts the mission, finds out the response, and reports back, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

The section based on one item is finished.

Acting as a matchmaker for a man and one protected by her mother: combinations of three to nine reasons

- 4.6.48.1 The sections based on two items, etc., are to be done in the same way.

Acting as a matchmaker for a man and one protected by her mother: ten reasons

- 4.6.49.1 This is the section based on ten items:

- 4.6.50 A man sends a monk, saying, “Sir, go to so-and-so protected by her mother and say, ‘Please be the bought wife and the wife by choice and the wife through property and the wife through clothes and the wife through the bowl-of-water ritual and the wife through removing the head pad and the slave wife and the servant wife and the captured wife and the momentary wife of so-and-so.’” If he accepts the mission, finds out the response, and reports back, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

The permutation series on the one guarded by her mother is finished.

Acting as a matchmaker for a man and one protected in various ways: a single reason

- 4.6.55.1 A man sends a monk, saying, “Sir, go to so-and-so protected by her father ... so-and-so protected by her parents ... so-and-so protected by her brother ... so-and-so protected by her sister ... so-and-so protected by her relatives ... so-and-so protected by her family ... so-and-so protected by her religion ... so-and-so otherwise protected ... so-and-so protected by the threat of punishment and say, ‘Please be the bought wife of so-and-so.’” If he accepts the mission, finds out the response, and reports back, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

*Acting as a matchmaker for a man and one protected by the threat of punishment:
a single reason*

A man sends a monk, saying, “Sir, go to so-and-so protected by the threat of punishment and say, ‘Please be the wife by choice of so-and-so.’” ... the wife through property of so-and-so.” ... the wife through clothes of so-and-so.” ... the wife through the bowl-of-water ritual of so-and-so.” ... the wife through removing the head pad of so-and-so.” ... the slave wife of so-and-so.” ... the servant wife of so-and-so.” ... the captured wife of so-and-so.” ... the momentary wife of so-and-so.” If he accepts the mission, finds out the response, and reports back, he commits an offense entailing suspension. 4.6.67.1

The setting out of the steps is finished.

*Acting as a matchmaker for a man and one protected by the threat of punishment:
combinations of two reasons*

A man sends a monk, saying, “Sir, go to so-and-so protected by the threat of punishment and say, ‘Please be the bought wife and the wife by choice of so-and-so.’” If he accepts the mission, finds out the response, and reports back, he commits an offense entailing suspension. 4.6.80.1

A man sends a monk, saying, “Sir, go to so-and-so protected by the threat of punishment and say, ‘Please be the bought wife and the wife through property of so-and-so ... the bought wife and the momentary wife of so-and-so.’” If he accepts the mission, finds out the response, and reports back, he commits an offense entailing suspension. 4.6.84

The unconnected permutation series is finished.

A man sends a monk, saying, “Sir, go to so-and-so protected by the threat of punishment and say, ‘Please be the wife by choice and the wife through property of so-and-so.’” ... the wife by choice and the momentary wife of so-and-so.” ... the wife by choice and the bought wife of so-and-so.” If he accepts the mission, finds out 4.6.90

the response, and reports back, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

The linked permutation series with the basis in brief is finished.

- 4.6.97 A man sends a monk, saying, “Sir, go to so-and-so protected by the threat of punishment and say, ‘Please be the momentary wife and the bought wife of so-and-so.’” ... the momentary wife and the wife by choice of so-and-so.” ... the momentary wife and the captured wife of so-and-so.” If he accepts the mission, finds out the response, and reports back, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

The section based on one item is finished.

Acting as a matchmaker for a man and one protected by the threat of punishment: combinations of three to nine reasons

- 4.6.104.1 The sections based on two items, three items, up to nine items, are to be done in the same way.

Acting as a matchmaker for a man and one protected by the threat of punishment: ten reasons

- 4.6.105.1 This is the section based on ten items:

- 4.6.106 A man sends a monk, saying, “Sir, go to so-and-so protected by the threat of punishment and say, ‘Please be the bought wife and the wife by choice and the wife through property and the wife through clothes and the wife through the bowl-of-water ritual and the wife through removing the head pad and the slave wife and the servant wife and the captured wife and the momentary wife of so-and-so.’” If he accepts the mission, finds out the response, and reports back, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

The permutation series for the one protected by the threat of punishment is finished.

Incremental increase in both wives and reasons

- 4.7.1 A man sends a monk, saying, “Sir, go to so-and-so protected by her mother and say, ‘Please be the bought wife of so-and-so.’” If he

accepts the mission, finds out the response, and reports back, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

A man sends a monk, saying, “Sir, go to so-and-so protected by her mother and so-and-so protected by her father and say, ‘Please be the bought wives and the wives by choice of so-and-so.’” If he accepts the mission, finds out the response, and reports back, he commits an offense entailing suspension. 4.7.5

A man sends a monk, saying, “Sir, go to so-and-so protected by her mother and so-and-so protected by her father and so-and-so protected by her parents and say, ‘Please be the bought wives and the wives by choice and the wives through property of so-and-so.’” If he accepts the mission, finds out the response, and reports back, he commits an offense entailing suspension. 4.7.9

In this way the increase of both items is to be done.

A man sends a monk, saying, “Sir, go to so-and-so protected by her mother and so-and-so protected by her father and so-and-so protected by her parents and so-and-so protected by her brother and so-and-so protected by her sister and so-and-so protected by her relatives and so-and-so protected by her family and so-and-so protected by her religion and so-and-so otherwise protected and so-and-so protected by the threat of punishment and say, ‘Please be the bought wives and the wives by choice and the wives through property and the wives through clothes and the wives through the bowl-of-water ritual and the wives through removing the head pad and the slave wives and the servant wives and the captured wives and the momentary wives of so-and-so.’” If he accepts the mission, finds out the response, and reports back, he commits an offense entailing suspension. 4.7.14

The increase of both items is finished.

Relationships arranged for a man

A man’s mother sends a monk ... A man’s father sends a monk ... 4.8.1
A man’s parents send a monk ... A man’s brother sends a monk ...
A man’s sister sends a monk ... A man’s relatives send a monk ...

A man's family sends a monk ... A man's fellow believers send a monk ...

4.8.9 To be expanded as for the successive series on a man.

4.8.10 The increase of both items is to be expanded as before.

Relationships arranged by the mother: a single reason

4.9.1 The mother of one protected by her mother sends a monk, saying, "Sir, go to so-and-so and say, 'I have a wife for you who can be your bought wife.'" If he accepts the mission, finds out the response, and reports back, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

4.9.5 The mother of one protected by her mother sends a monk, saying, "Sir, go to so-and-so and say, 'I have a wife for you who can be your wife by choice.'" ... your wife through property.'" ... your wife through clothes.'" ... your wife through the bowl-of-water ritual.'" ... your wife through removing the head pad.'" ... your slave wife.'" ... your servant wife.'" ... your captured wife.'" ... your momentary wife.'" If he accepts the mission, finds out the response, and reports back, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

The setting out of the steps is finished.

Relationships arranged by the mother: combinations of two reasons

4.9.18.1 The mother of one protected by her mother sends a monk, saying, "Sir, go to so-and-so and say, 'I have a wife for you who can be your bought wife and your wife by choice.'" ... your bought wife and your wife through property.'" ... your bought wife and your momentary wife.'" If he accepts the mission, finds out the response, and reports back, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

The unconnected permutation series is finished.

4.9.25 The mother of one protected by her mother sends a monk, saying, "Sir, go to so-and-so and say, 'I have a wife for you who can be your wife by choice and your wife through property.'" ... your wife by choice and your momentary wife.'" ... your wife by choice and your bought wife.'" If he accepts the mission, finds out the

response, and reports back, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

The linked permutation series with the basis in brief is finished.

The mother of one protected by her mother sends a monk, saying, “Sir, go to so-and-so and say, ‘I have a wife for you who can be your momentary wife and your bought wife.’” ... your momentary wife and your wife by choice.” ... your momentary wife and your captured wife.” If he accepts the mission, finds out the response, and reports back, he commits an offense entailing suspension. 4.9.32

The section based on one item is finished.

Relationships arranged by the mother: combinations of three to nine reasons

The sections based on two items, three items, up to nine items, are to be done in the same way. 4.9.39.1

Relationships arranged by the mother: ten reasons

This is the section based on ten items: 4.9.40.1

The mother of one protected by her mother sends a monk, saying, “Sir, go to so-and-so and say, ‘I have a wife for you who can be your bought wife and your wife by choice and your wife through property and your wife through clothes and your wife through the bowl-of-water ritual and your wife through removing the head pad and your slave wife and your servant wife and your captured wife and your momentary wife.’” If he accepts the mission, finds out the response, and reports back, he commits an offense entailing suspension. 4.9.41

The permutation series on the mother is finished.

Relationships arranged by various people: a single reason

The father of one protected by her father sends a monk ... The parents of one protected by her parents send a monk ... The brother of one protected by her brother sends a monk ... The sister of one protected by her sister sends a monk ... The relatives of one protected by her relatives send a monk ... The family of one protected 4.10.1

by her family sends a monk ... The fellow believers of one protected by her religion send a monk ... The master of one otherwise protected sends a monk ... The one who punishes in relation to one protected by the threat of punishment sends a monk, saying, "Sir, go to so-and-so and say, 'I have a wife for you who can be your bought wife.'" If he accepts the mission, finds out the response, and reports back, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

Relationships arranged by the one who punishes: a single reason

- 4.10.13.1 The one who punishes in relation to one protected by the threat of punishment sends a monk, saying, "Sir, go to so-and-so and say, 'I have a wife for you who can be your wife by choice.'" ... your wife through property.'" ... your wife through clothes.'" ... your wife through the bowl-of-water ritual.'" ... your wife through removing the head pad.'" ... your slave wife.'" ... your servant wife.'" ... your captured wife.'" ... your momentary wife.'" If he accepts the mission, finds out the response, and reports back, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

The setting out of the steps is finished.

Relationships arranged by the one who punishes: two reasons

- 4.10.26.1 The one who punishes in relation to one protected by the threat of punishment sends a monk, saying, "Sir, go to so-and-so and say, 'I have a wife for you who can be your bought wife and your wife by choice.'" ... your bought wife and your wife through property.'" ... your bought wife and your momentary wife.'" If he accepts the mission, finds out the response, and reports back, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

The unconnected permutation series is finished.

- 4.10.33 The one who punishes in relation to one protected by the threat of punishment sends a monk, saying, "Sir, go to so-and-so and say, 'I have a wife for you who can be your wife by choice and your wife through property.'" ... your wife by choice and your momentary wife.'" ... your wife by choice and your bought wife.'" If he accepts

the mission, finds out the response, and reports back, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

The linked permutation series with the basis in brief is finished.

The one who punishes in relation to one protected by the threat of punishment sends a monk, saying, “Sir, go to so-and-so and say, ‘I have a wife for you who can be your momentary wife and your bought wife.’” ... who can be your momentary wife and your wife by choice.” ... who can be your momentary wife and your captured wife.” If he accepts the mission, finds out the response, and reports back, he commits an offense entailing suspension. 4.10.40

The section based on one item is finished.

Relationships arranged by the one who punishes: three to nine reasons

The sections based on two items, three items, up to nine items, are to be done in the same way. 4.10.47.1

Relationships arranged by the one who punishes: ten reasons

This is the section based on ten items: 4.10.48.1

The one who punishes in relation to one protected by the threat of punishment sends a monk, saying, “Sir, go to so-and-so and say, ‘I have a wife for you who can be your bought wife and your wife by choice and your wife through property and your wife through clothes and your wife through the bowl-of-water ritual and your wife through removing the head pad and your slave wife and your servant wife and your captured wife and your momentary wife.’” If he accepts the mission, finds out the response, and reports back, he commits an offense entailing suspension. 4.10.49

The permutation series on the one who punishes is finished.

The one protected by her mother taking the initiative: a single reason

The one protected by her mother sends a monk, saying, “Sir, go to so-and-so and say that I’ll be his bought wife.” If he accepts the mission, finds out the response, and reports back, he commits an offense entailing suspension. 4.11.1

- 4.11.5 The one protected by her mother sends a monk, saying, “Sir, go to so-and-so and say that I’ll be his wife by choice.” ... his wife through property.” ... his wife through clothes.” ... his wife through the bowl-of-water ritual.” ... his wife through removing the head pad.” ... his slave wife.” ... his servant wife.” ... his captured wife.” ... his momentary wife.” If he accepts the mission, finds out the response, and reports back, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

The setting out of the steps is finished.

The one protected by her mother taking the initiative: two reasons

- 4.11.18.1 The one protected by her mother sends a monk, saying, “Sir, go to so-and-so and say that I’ll be his bought wife and his wife by choice.” If he accepts the mission, finds out the response, and reports back, he commits an offense entailing suspension.
- 4.11.22 The one protected by her mother sends a monk, saying, “Sir, go to so-and-so and say that I’ll be his bought wife and his wife through property.” ... his bought wife and his wife through clothes.” ... his bought wife and his momentary wife.” If he accepts the mission, finds out the response, and reports back, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

The unconnected permutation series is finished.

- 4.11.29 The one protected by her mother sends a monk, saying, “Sir, go to so-and-so and say that I’ll be his wife by choice and his wife through property.” ... his wife by choice and his momentary wife.” ... his wife by choice and his bought wife.” If he accepts the mission, finds out the response, and reports back, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

The linked permutation series with the basis in brief is finished.

- 4.11.36 The one protected by her mother sends a monk, saying, “Sir, go to so-and-so and say that I’ll be his momentary wife and his bought wife.” ... his momentary wife and his wife by choice.” ... his momentary wife and his captured wife.” If he accepts the mission,

finds out the response, and reports back, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

The section based on one item is finished.

The one protected by her mother taking the initiative: three to nine reasons

The sections based on two items, etc., are to be done in the same way. 4.11.43.1

The one protected by her mother taking the initiative: ten reasons

This is the section based on ten items: 4.11.44.1

The one protected by her mother sends a monk, saying, “Sir, go to so-and-so and say that I’ll be his bought wife and his wife by choice and his wife through property and his wife through clothes and his wife through the bowl-of-water ritual and his wife through removing the head pad and his slave wife and his servant wife and his captured wife and his momentary wife.” If he accepts the mission, finds out the response, and reports back, he commits an offense entailing suspension. 4.11.45

The further permutation series on the one guarded by her mother is finished.

The ones protected by various people taking the initiative: a single reason

The one protected by her father sends a monk ... The one protected by her parents sends a monk ... The one protected by her brother sends a monk ... The one protected by her sister sends a monk ... The one protected by her relatives sends a monk ... The one protected by her family sends a monk ... The one protected by her religion sends a monk ... The one otherwise protected sends a monk ... The one protected by the threat of punishment sends a monk, saying, “Sir, go to so-and-so and say that I’ll be his bought wife.” If he accepts the mission, finds out the response, and reports back, he commits an offense entailing suspension. 4.11.50.1

The one protected by the threat of punishment taking the initiative: a single reason

The one protected by the threat of punishment sends a monk, saying, “Sir, go to so-and-so and say that I’ll be his wife by choice.” 4.11.62.1

... his wife through property.” ... his wife through clothes.” ... his wife through the bowl-of-water ritual.” ... his wife through removing the head pad.” ... his slave wife.” ... his servant wife.” ... his captured wife.” ... his momentary wife.” If he accepts the mission, finds out the response, and reports back, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

The setting out of the steps is finished.

The one protected by the threat of punishment taking the initiative: two reasons

- 4.11.75.1 The one protected by the threat of punishment sends a monk, saying, “Sir, go to so-and-so and say that I’ll be his bought wife and his wife by choice.” ... his bought wife and his momentary wife.” If he accepts the mission, finds out the response, and reports back, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

The unconnected permutation series is finished.

- 4.11.81 The one protected by the threat of punishment sends a monk, saying, “Sir, go to so-and-so and say that I’ll be his wife by choice and his wife though property.” ... his wife by choice and his momentary wife.” ... his wife by choice and his bought wife.” If he accepts the mission, finds out the response, and reports back, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

The linked permutation series with the basis in brief is finished.

- 4.11.88 The one protected by the threat of punishment sends a monk, saying, “Sir, go to so-and-so and say that I’ll be his momentary wife and his bought wife.” ... his momentary wife and his wife by choice.” ... his momentary wife and his captured wife.” If he accepts the mission, finds out the response, and reports back, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

The section based on one item is finished.

The one protected by the threat of punishment taking the initiative: three to nine reasons

- 4.11.95.1 The sections based on two items, etc., are to be done in the same way.

The one protected by the threat of punishment taking the initiative: ten reasons

This is the section based on ten items:

4.11.96.1

The one protected by the threat of punishment sends a monk, saying, “Sir, go to so-and-so and say that I’ll be his bought wife and his wife by choice and his wife through property and his wife through clothes and his wife through the bowl-of-water ritual and his wife through removing the head pad and his slave wife and his servant wife and his captured wife and his momentary wife.” If he accepts the mission, finds out the response, and reports back, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

4.11.97

The further permutation series on the one protected by the threat of punishment is finished.

The whole successive permutation series is finished.

Permutations part 2

If he accepts the mission, finds out the response, and reports back, he commits an offense entailing suspension. If he accepts the mission, and finds out the response, but does not report back, he commits a serious offense. If he accepts the mission, but does not find out the response, yet reports back, he commits a serious offense. If he accepts the mission, but neither finds out the response, nor reports back, he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If he does not accept the mission, yet finds out the response and reports back, he commits a serious offense. If he does not accept the mission, yet finds out the response, but does not report back, he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If he neither accepts the mission, nor finds out the response, yet reports back, he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If he does not accept the mission, nor finds out the response, nor reports back, there is no offense.

4.12.1

A man tells a number of monks, “Venerables, find out about such-and-such a woman.” If they all accept the mission, all find out the response, and all report back, they all commit an offense entailing suspension.

4.13.1

4.13.4 A man tells a number of monks, “Venerables, find out about such-and-such a woman.” If they all accept the mission, all find out the response, but only one reports back, they all commit an offense entailing suspension.

4.13.7 A man tells a number of monks, “Venerables, find out about such-and-such a woman.” If they all accept the mission, but only one finds out the response, yet all report back, they all commit an offense entailing suspension.

4.13.10 A man tells a number of monks, “Venerables, find out about such-and-such a woman.” If they all accept the mission, but only one finds out the response, and only one reports back, they all commit an offense entailing suspension.

4.14.1 A man tells a monk, “Sir, find out about such-and-such a woman.” If he accepts the mission, finds out the response, and reports back, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

4.14.4 A man tells a monk, “Sir, find out about such-and-such a woman.” If he accepts the mission, finds out the response, but gets a pupil to report back, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

4.14.7 A man tells a monk, “Sir, find out about such-and-such a woman.” If he accepts the mission, but gets a pupil to find out the response, and then reports back himself, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

4.14.10 A man tells a monk, “Sir, find out about such-and-such a woman.” If he accepts the mission, but gets a pupil to find out the response, and the pupil then reports back on his own initiative, they both commit a serious offense.

Permutations part 3

4.15.1 If he fulfills the agreement when he goes, but not when he returns, he commits a serious offense.

4.15.2 If he does not fulfill the agreement when he goes, but he does when he returns, he commits a serious offense.

4.15.3 If he fulfills the agreement both when he goes and when he returns, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

If he neither fulfills the agreement when he goes nor when he returns, there is no offense. 4.15.4

Non-offenses

There is no offense: if he goes because of business for the Sangha, for a shrine, or for one who is sick; if he is insane; if he is the first offender. 4.16.1

Summary verses of case studies

“Asleep, and dead, gone out,
Not a woman, a woman who lacks sexual organs;
He reconciled them after quarreling,
And he was a matchmaker for *paṇḍakas*.” 4.16.6

Case studies

At one time a man told a monk, “Sir, please find out about such-and-such a woman.” When the monk got there, he asked some people, “Where’s so-and-so?” 5.1.1

“She’s asleep, Venerable.” 5.1.5

He became anxious, thinking, “The Buddha has laid down a training rule. Could it be that I’ve committed an offense entailing suspension?” He told the Buddha, who said, “There’s no offense entailing suspension, but there’s an offense of wrong conduct.” 5.1.6

At one time a man told a monk, “Sir, please find out about such-and-such a woman.” When the monk got there, he asked some people, “Where’s so-and-so?” 5.2.1

“She’s dead, Venerable.” ... “She’s gone out, Venerable.” ... “That’s not a woman, Venerable.” ... “That’s a woman who lacks sexual organs, Venerable.” 5.2.5

He became anxious ... “There’s no offense entailing suspension, but there’s an offense of wrong conduct.” 5.2.9

At one time a certain woman quarreled with her husband and went to her mother’s house. A monk who associated with that family reconciled them. He became anxious ... “Were they divorced, monk?” 5.3.1

5.3.5 “No, Sir.”

5.3.6 “There’s no offense if they’re not divorced.”

5.4.1 At one time a monk acted as a matchmaker for *paṇḍakas*. He became anxious ... “There’s no offense entailing suspension, but there’s a serious offense.”

The training rule on matchmaking, the fifth, is finished.

The training rule on building huts

Kuṭṭikāra

Origin story

At one time the Buddha was staying at Rājagaha in the Bamboo Grove, the squirrel sanctuary. At that time the monks of Āḷavī were building huts by means of begging. The huts were intended for themselves, did not have a sponsoring owner, and were inappropriately large. And since they were never finished, the monks kept on begging and asking, “Please give a man, a servant, an ox, a cart, a machete, a hatchet, an ax, a spade, a chisel; give creepers, bamboo, reeds, grass, clay.”⁸⁹ People felt oppressed by all the begging and asking, so much so that when they saw a monk they became alarmed and fearful. They turned away, took a different path, ran off, and closed their doors. They even ran away when they saw cows, thinking they were monks. 1.1.1

Just then Venerable Mahākassapa, after completing the rainy-season residence at Rājagaha, set out for Āḷavī. When he eventually arrived, he stayed at the Aggāḷava Shrine. One morning Venerable Mahākassapa robed up, took his bowl and robe, and entered Āḷavī for alms. When people saw him, they became alarmed and fearful. They turned away, took a different path, ran off, and closed their doors. When he had eaten his meal and returned from alms round, Venerable Mahākassapa returned and said to the monks: 1.1.8

“There used to be plenty of almsfood in Āḷavī, and it was easy to get by on alms. But now there’s a shortage, and it’s hard to get by. Why is that?” The monks told Venerable Mahākassapa what had happened. 1.1.14

89. I have rendered *muñja*-reed and *pabbaja*-reed with the single word “reed”. I am not aware that these two kinds of reed can be distinguished in English.

- 1.2.1 Soon afterwards the Buddha too set out wandering toward Ālavī after staying at Rājagaha for as long as he liked. When he eventually arrived, he too stayed at the Aggālava Shrine.
- 1.2.4 Venerable Mahākassapa then went to see the Buddha, bowed, sat down, and told him what had happened.
- 1.2.6 The Buddha had the Sangha gathered and questioned the monks of Ālavī: “Is it true, monks, that this is happening?”
- 1.2.12 “It’s true, Sir.”
- 1.2.13 The Buddha rebuked them ... “Foolish men, how can you act like this? This will affect people’s confidence ...” After rebuking them, he gave a teaching and addressed the monks:

*Jātaka*⁹⁰

- 1.3.1 “Once upon a time, monks, two sages who were brothers lived near the river Ganges. On one occasion the dragon king Maṇikaṇṭha emerged from the Ganges and went up to the younger sage. He encircled him with seven coils and spread his large hood over his head. Then, because of his fear of that dragon, the younger sage became thin, haggard, and pale, with veins protruding all over his body. The older sage saw him like this and asked him what was the matter. The younger sage told him. The elder sage said, ‘So, do you want that dragon to stay away?’
- 1.3.10 ‘Yes.’
- 1.3.11 ‘Well then, did you see anything belonging to that dragon?’
- 1.3.12 ‘I saw an ornamental gem on his neck.’
- 1.3.13 ‘In that case, ask the dragon for that gem.’
- 1.3.16 Soon the dragon king again emerged from the Ganges and went up to the younger sage. And the sage said to him, ‘Sir, give me the gem. I want the gem.’ The dragon thought, ‘The monk is asking for the gem; he wants the gem,’ and he left in a hurry.
- 1.3.22 Once more the dragon king emerged from the Ganges and approached the younger sage. The sage saw him coming and said to

90. This story is parallel to the Maṇikaṇṭhajātaka, story number 253 in the Jātaka collection.

him, ‘Sir, give me the gem. I want the gem.’ When the dragon heard him, he turned around right there.

Yet again the dragon king emerged from the Ganges. The younger sage saw him emerging and said to him, ‘Sir, give me the gem. I want the gem.’ The dragon king then spoke these verses to the sage: 1.3.29

‘My food and drink are abundant and sublime,
And they appear because of this gem.
I won’t give it to you—you ask too much—
Nor will I return to your hermitage. 1.3.35

Like a youth holding a sword polished on a rock,⁹¹
You frighten me, asking for this gem.⁹² 1.3.39
I won’t give it to you—you ask too much—
Nor will I return to your hermitage.’

And the dragon king Maṇikaṇṭha thought, ‘The monk is asking for the gem; he wants the gem,’ and he left and never returned. 1.3.43

Because he did not get to see that beautiful dragon, the young sage became even thinner, more haggard and pale, his veins protruding even more. The older sage saw him like this and asked what was the matter. He replied, ‘It’s because I no longer get to see that beautiful dragon.’ The older sage then spoke to him in verse: 1.3.46

‘One shouldn’t beg from those one wishes to be dear
to; 1.3.52

91. Sp 1.344: *Sakkharā vuccati kāḷasilā, tattha dhotā asi “sakkharadhoto nāmā”ti vuccati, sakkharadhoto paṇimhi assāti sakkharadhotapāṇi, pāsāṇe dhotanisitakhaggahatthoti attho*; “A black rock is what is meant by *sakkharā*. A sword polished on that is termed *sakkharadhota*. A sword in his hand polished on a rock is the meaning of *sakkharadhotapāṇi*. The meaning is a hand with a sword that is sharp and polished on a rock.”

92. Sp 1.344: *Yathā so asihattho puriso tāseyya, evaṃ tāsesi maṇi selam yācamāno, maṇim yācantoti attho*, “The meaning is that just as that man with sword in hand would cause fear, so the one asking me for the rock, asking for the gem, caused fear.”

One is detested for asking for too much.
 When the brahmin asked the dragon for his gem,
 It left and was never to be seen again.’

- 1.3.56 One will be disliked even by animals, monks, for begging and asking, let alone by human beings.”

*Story*⁹³

- 1.4.1 “At one time, monks, a certain monk lived in a forest grove on the slopes of the Himalayas. Not far from that grove was a large, low-lying marsh. A great flock of birds fed in the marsh during the day and entered the grove to roost at night. The monk was disturbed by the noise of the flocking birds, and so he came to see me. He bowed, sat down, and I said to him, ‘I hope you’re keeping well, monk, I hope you’re getting by? I hope you’re not tired from traveling? And where have you come from?’
- 1.4.9 ‘I’m keeping well, Sir, I’m getting by. I’m not tired from traveling.’ He then explained where he had come from, adding, ‘That’s where I’ve come from, Sir. I left because I was disturbed by the noise of that flock of birds.’
- 1.4.16 ‘Do you want that flock of birds to stay away?’
- 1.4.17 ‘Yes, Sir.’
- 1.4.18 ‘Well then, go back to that forest grove. In the first part of the night, call out three times and say, “Listen to me, good birds. I want a feather from anyone roosting in this forest grove. Each one of you must give me a feather.” And in the middle and last part of the night do the same thing.’
- 1.4.27 The monk returned to that forest grove and did as instructed. That flock of birds thought, ‘The monk is asking for a feather; he wants a feather,’ and they left that grove and never returned. One will be disliked even by animals, monks, for begging and asking, let alone by human beings.

93. This story seems to be unique to this rule.

“The father of Raṭṭhapāla, monks, once spoke to his son with this verse:⁹⁴ 1.5.1

‘All these people, Raṭṭhāpāla, 1.5.2
Who come to me and beg—
I don’t even know them.
So why don’t *you* beg from me?’

‘The beggar is disliked, 1.5.6
And so is one who doesn’t give when asked.
That’s why I do not beg from you;
Please don’t hate me for this.’

If the gentleman Raṭṭhapāla could say this to his own father, how much more can one person to another. 1.5.10

It’s hard, monks, for householders to acquire and protect their possessions. And still, foolish men, you kept on begging and asking for all sorts of things. This will affect people’s confidence ...” ... 1.6.1
“And, monks, this training rule should be recited like this:

Final ruling

‘When a monk, by means of begging, builds a hut without a sponsoring owner and intended for himself, it is to be no more than twelve standard handspans long and seven wide inside. He must have monks approve a site where no harm will be done and which has space on all sides. If a monk, by means of begging, builds a hut on a site where harm will be done and which lacks space on all sides, or he does not have monks approve the site, or he exceeds the right size, he commits an offense entailing suspension.’”

94. For the inspiring story of Raṭṭhapāla, see MN 82:1.1.

Definitions

By means of begging: having himself begged for a man, a servant, an ox, a cart, a machete, a hatchet, an ax, a spade, a chisel; creepers, bamboo, reed, grass, clay.

A hut: plastered inside or plastered outside or plastered both inside and outside.

Builds: building it himself or having it built.

Without a sponsoring owner: there is no other owner, either a woman or a man, either a lay person or one gone forth.

Intended for himself: for his own use.

⁹⁵ **It is to be no more than twelve standard handspans long:** measured outside.

And seven wide inside: measured inside.

2.2.2 **He must have monks approve a site:** the monk who wants to build a hut should clear a site. He should then approach the Sangha, arrange his upper robe over one shoulder, pay respect at the feet of the senior monks, squat on his heels, raise his joined palms, and say:

2.2.3 “Venerables, I want to build a hut by means of begging, without a sponsoring owner and intended for myself. I request the Sangha to inspect the site for that hut.”

2.2.5 He should make his request a second and a third time. If the whole Sangha is able to inspect the site, they should all go. If the whole Sangha is not able to inspect the site, then those monks there who are competent and capable—who know where harm will be done and where no harm will be done, who know what is meant by space on all sides and a lack of space on all sides—should be asked and then appointed.

2.2.9 “And, monks, they should be appointed like this. A competent and capable monk should inform the Sangha:

2.2.11 ‘Please, Venerables, I ask the Sangha to listen. Monk so-and-so wants to build a hut by means of begging, without a sponsoring

95. This phrase is not translated in the rule, and so I leave it untranslated here.

owner and intended for himself. He is requesting the Sangha to inspect the site for that hut. If the Sangha is ready, it should appoint monk so-and-so and monk so-and-so to inspect the site for the hut of monk so-and-so. This is the motion.

Please, Venerables, I ask the Sangha to listen. Monk so-and-so 2.2.16
wants to build a hut by means of begging, without a sponsoring owner and intended for himself. He is requesting the Sangha to inspect the site for that hut. The Sangha appoints monk so-and-so and monk so-and-so to inspect the site for the hut of monk so-and-so. Any monk who approves of appointing monk so-and-so and monk so-and-so to inspect the site for the hut of monk so-and-so should remain silent. Any monk who doesn't approve should speak up.

The Sangha has appointed monk so-and-so and monk so-and-so 2.2.22
to inspect the site for the hut of monk so-and-so. The Sangha approves and is therefore silent. I'll remember it thus.'

The appointed monks should go and inspect the site for the hut 2.2.25
to find out if any harm will be done and if it has space on all sides. If harm will be done or it lacks space on all sides, they should say, 'Don't build here.' If no harm will be done and it has space on all sides, they should inform the Sangha: 'No harm will be done and it has space on all sides.' The monk who wants to build the hut should then approach the Sangha, arrange his upper robe over one shoulder, pay respect at the feet of the senior monks, squat on his heels, raise his joined palms, and say:

'Venerables, I wish to build a hut by means of begging, without a 2.2.30
sponsoring owner and intended for myself. I request the Sangha to approve the site for the hut.'

He should make his request a second and a third time. A com- 2.2.32
petent and capable monk should then inform the Sangha:

'Please, Venerables, I ask the Sangha to listen. Monk so-and-so 2.2.35
wants to build a hut by means of begging, without a sponsoring owner and intended for himself. He is requesting the Sangha to

- approve the site for that hut. If the Sangha is ready, it should approve the site for the hut of monk-so-and-so. This is the motion.
- 2.2.40 Please, Venerables, I ask the Sangha to listen. Monk so-and-so wants to build a hut by means of begging, without a sponsoring owner and intended for himself. He is requesting the Sangha to approve the site for that hut. The Sangha approves the site for the hut of monk so-and-so. Any monk who approves of approving the site for the hut of monk-so-and-so should remain silent. Any monk who doesn't approve should speak up.
- 2.2.46 The Sangha has approved the site for the hut of monk so-and-so . The Sangha approves and is therefore silent. I'll remember it thus.'"

Where harm will be done: it is the abode of ants, termites, rats, snakes, scorpions, centipedes, elephants, horses, lions, tigers, leopards, bears, or hyenas, or any other animal; or it is bordering on a field of grain, a field of vegetables, a place of slaughter, a place of execution, a charnel ground, a park, a royal property, an elephant stable, a horse stable, a prison, a bar, a slaughterhouse, a street, a crossroads, a public meeting hall, or a cul-de-sac—this is called “where harm will be done”.

Which lacks space on all sides: it is not possible to go around it with a yoked cart, or to go all the way around it with a ladder—this is called “which lacks space on all sides”.

Where no harm will be done: it is not the abode of ants, termites, rats, snakes, scorpions, centipedes ... it is not bordering on ... a cul-de-sac—this is called “where no harm will be done”.

Which has space on all sides: it is possible to go around it with a yoked cart, or to go all the way around it with a ladder—this is called “which has space on all sides”.

By means of begging: having himself begged for a man, a servant ... clay.

A hut: plastered inside or plastered outside or plastered both inside and outside.

Builds: building it himself or having it built.

Or he does not have monks approve the site, or he exceeds

the right size: if the site for the hut has not been approved through a legal procedure consisting of one motion and three announcements, or if he builds a hut or has one built that exceeds the allowable length or breadth even by the width of a hair, then for the effort there is an act of wrong conduct. When there is one piece left to complete the hut, he commits a serious offense. When the last piece is finished, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

He commits an offense entailing suspension: ... Therefore, too, it is called “an offense entailing suspension”.

Permutations

Permutations part 1

Building oneself

If a monk builds a hut whose site has not been approved, where 3.1.1
harm will be done, and which lacks space on all sides, he commits one offense entailing suspension and two offenses of wrong conduct. If a monk builds a hut whose site has not been approved, where harm will be done, but which has space on all sides, he commits one offense entailing suspension and one offense of wrong conduct. If a monk builds a hut whose site has not been approved, where no harm will be done, but which lacks space on all sides, he commits one offense entailing suspension and one offense of wrong conduct. If a monk builds a hut whose site has not been approved, where no harm will be done, and which has space on all sides, he commits one offense entailing suspension.

If a monk builds a hut whose site has been approved, where 3.1.5
harm will be done, and which lacks space on all sides, he commits two offenses of wrong conduct. If a monk builds a hut whose site has been approved, where harm will be done, but which has space on all sides, he commits one offense of wrong conduct. If a monk builds a hut whose site has been approved, where no harm will be

done, but which lacks space on all sides, he commits one offense of wrong conduct. If a monk builds a hut whose site has been approved, where no harm will be done, and which has space on all sides, there is no offense.

3.2.1 If a monk builds a hut which exceeds the right size, where harm will be done, and which lacks space on all sides, he commits one offense entailing suspension and two offenses of wrong conduct. If a monk builds a hut which exceeds the right size, where harm will be done, but which has space on all sides, he commits one offense entailing suspension and one offense of wrong conduct. If a monk builds a hut which exceeds the right size, where no harm will be done, but which lacks space on all sides, he commits one offense entailing suspension and one offense of wrong conduct. If a monk builds a hut which exceeds the right size, where no harm will be done, and which has space on all sides, he commits one offense entailing suspension.

3.2.5 If a monk builds a hut which is the right size, where harm will be done, and which lacks space on all sides, he commits two offenses of wrong conduct. If a monk builds a hut which is the right size, where harm will be done, but which has space on all sides, he commits one offense of wrong conduct. If a monk builds a hut which is the right size, where no harm will be done, but which lacks space on all sides, he commits one offense of wrong conduct. If a monk builds a hut which is the right size, where no harm will be done, and which has space on all sides, there is no offense.

3.3.1 If a monk builds a hut whose site has not been approved, which exceeds the right size, where harm will be done, and which lacks space on all sides, he commits two offenses entailing suspension and two offenses of wrong conduct. If a monk builds a hut whose site has not been approved, which exceeds the right size, where harm will be done, but which has space on all sides, he commits two offenses entailing suspension and one offense of wrong conduct. If a monk builds a hut whose site has not been approved, which exceeds the right size, where no harm will be done, but which lacks

space on all sides, he commits two offenses entailing suspension and one offense of wrong conduct. If a monk builds a hut whose site has not been approved, which exceeds the right size, where no harm will be done, and which has space on all sides, he commits two offenses entailing suspension.

If a monk builds a hut whose site has been approved, which is the right size, where harm will be done, and which lacks space on all sides, he commits two offenses of wrong conduct. If a monk builds a hut whose site has been approved, which is the right size, where harm will be done, but which has space on all sides, he commits one offense of wrong conduct. If a monk builds a hut whose site has been approved, which is the right size, where no harm will be done, but which lacks space on all sides, he commits one offense of wrong conduct. If a monk builds a hut whose site has been approved, which is the right size, where no harm will be done, and which has space on all sides, there is no offense. 3.4.1

Appointing someone else to build

A monk appoints someone to build him a hut. If they build one whose site has not been approved, where harm will be done, and which lacks space on all sides, he commits one offense entailing suspension and two offenses of wrong conduct. ... where harm will be done, but which has space on all sides, he commits one offense entailing suspension and one offense of wrong conduct. ... where no harm will be done, but which lacks space on all sides, he commits one offense entailing suspension and one offense of wrong conduct. ... where no harm will be done, and which has space on all sides, he commits one offense entailing suspension. 3.5.1

A monk appoints someone to build him a hut. If they build one whose site has been approved, where harm will be done, and which lacks space on all sides, he commits two offenses of wrong conduct. ... where harm will be done, but which has space on all sides, he commits one offense of wrong conduct. ... where no harm will be done, but which lacks space on all sides, he commits one offense 3.5.7

of wrong conduct. ... where no harm will be done, and which has space on all sides, there is no offense.

3.5.13 A monk appoints someone to build him a hut. If they build one which exceeds the right size, where harm will be done, and which lacks space on all sides, he commits one offense entailing suspension and two offenses of wrong conduct. ... where harm will be done, but which has space on all sides, he commits one offense entailing suspension and one offense of wrong conduct. ... where no harm will be done, but which lacks space on all sides, he commits one offense entailing suspension and one offense of wrong conduct. ... where no harm will be done, and which has space on all sides, he commits one offense entailing suspension.

3.5.19 A monk appoints someone to build him a hut. If they build one which is the right size, where harm will be done, and which lacks space on all sides, he commits two offenses of wrong conduct. ... where harm will be done, but which has space on all sides, he commits one offense of wrong conduct. ... where no harm will be done, but which lacks space on all sides, he commits one offense of wrong conduct. ... where no harm will be done, and which has space on all sides, there is no offense.

3.5.25 A monk appoints someone to build him a hut. If they build one whose site has not been approved, which exceeds the right size, where harm will be done, and which lacks space on all sides, he commits two offenses entailing suspension and two offenses of wrong conduct. ... where harm will be done, but which has space on all sides, he commits two offenses entailing suspension and one offense of wrong conduct. ... where no harm will be done, but which lacks space on all sides, he commits two offenses entailing suspension and one offense of wrong conduct. ... where no harm will be done, and which has space on all sides, he commits two offenses entailing suspension.

3.5.31 A monk appoints someone to build him a hut. If they build one whose site has been approved, which is the right size, where harm will be done, and which lacks space on all sides, he commits two

offenses of wrong conduct. ... where harm will be done, but which has space on all sides, he commits one offense of wrong conduct. ... where no harm will be done, but which lacks space on all sides, he commits one offense of wrong conduct. ... where no harm will be done, and which has space on all sides, there is no offense.

Departing without informing of the proper building procedure

A monk appoints someone to build him a hut. He then departs 3.6.1 without telling them to build one whose site has been approved, where no harm will be done, and which has space on all sides. If they build one whose site has not been approved, where harm will be done, and which lacks space on all sides, he commits one offense entailing suspension and two offenses of wrong conduct. ... where harm will be done, but which has space on all sides, he commits one offense entailing suspension and one offense of wrong conduct. ... where no harm will be done, but which lacks space on all sides, he commits one offense entailing suspension and one offense of wrong conduct. ... where no harm will be done, and which has space on all sides, he commits one offense entailing suspension.

A monk appoints someone to build him a hut. He then departs 3.6.7 without telling them to build one whose site has been approved, where no harm will be done, and which has space on all sides. If they build one whose site has been approved, where harm will be done, and which lacks space on all sides, he commits two offenses of wrong conduct. ... where harm will be done, but which has space on all sides, he commits one offense of wrong conduct. ... where no harm will be done, but which lacks space on all sides, he commits one offense of wrong conduct. ... where no harm will be done, and which has space on all sides, there is no offense.

A monk appoints someone to build him a hut. He then departs 3.7.1 without telling them to build one which is the right size, where no harm will be done, and which has space on all sides. If they build one which exceeds the right size, where harm will be done, and which lacks space on all sides, he commits one offense entailing

suspension and two offenses of wrong conduct. ... where harm will be done, but which has space on all sides, he commits one offense entailing suspension and one offense of wrong conduct. ... where no harm will be done, but which lacks space on all sides, he commits one offense entailing suspension and one offense of wrong conduct. ... where no harm will be done, and which has space on all sides, he commits one offense entailing suspension.

3.7.7 A monk appoints someone to build him a hut. He then departs without telling them to build one which is the right size, where no harm will be done, and which has space on all sides. If they build one which is the right size, where harm will be done, and which lacks space on all sides, he commits two offenses of wrong conduct. ... where harm will be done, but which has space on all sides, he commits one offense of wrong conduct. ... where no harm will be done, but which lacks space on all sides, he commits one offense of wrong conduct. ... where no harm will be done, and which has space on all sides, there is no offense.

3.8.1 A monk appoints someone to build him a hut. He then departs without telling them to build one whose site has been approved, which is the right size, where no harm will be done, and which has space on all sides. If they build one whose site has not been approved, which exceeds the right size, where harm will be done, and which lacks space on all sides, he commits two offenses entailing suspension and two offenses of wrong conduct. ... where harm will be done, but which has space on all sides, he commits two offenses entailing suspension and one offense of wrong conduct. ... where no harm will be done, but which lacks space on all sides, he commits two offenses entailing suspension and one offense of wrong conduct. ... where no harm will be done, and which has space on all sides, he commits two offenses entailing suspension.

3.8.7 A monk appoints someone to build him a hut. He then departs without telling them to build one whose site has been approved, which is the right size, where no harm will be done, and which has space on all sides. If they build one whose site has been approved,

which is the right size, where harm will be done, and which lacks space on all sides, he commits two offenses of wrong conduct. ... where harm will be done, but which has space on all sides, he commits one offense of wrong conduct. ... where no harm will be done, but which lacks space on all sides, he commits one offense of wrong conduct. ... where no harm will be done, and which has space on all sides, there is no offense.

Departing and then hearing about wrong building procedure

A monk appoints someone to build him a hut. He then departs, 3.9.1
telling them to build one whose site has been approved, where no harm will be done, and which has space on all sides, but they build one whose site has not been approved, where harm will be done, and which lacks space on all sides. If he hears about it, he must either go there himself or send a message, telling them to build one whose site has been approved, where no harm will be done, and which has space on all sides. If he neither goes himself nor sends a message, he commits an offense of wrong conduct.

A monk appoints someone to build him a hut. He then departs, 3.9.8
telling them to build one whose site has been approved, where no harm will be done, and which has space on all sides, but they build one whose site has not been approved, where harm will be done, but which has space on all sides. If he hears about it, he must either go there himself or send a message, telling them to build one whose site has been approved and where no harm will be done. If he neither goes himself nor sends a message, he commits an offense of wrong conduct.

A monk appoints someone to build him a hut. He then departs, 3.9.15
telling them to build one whose site has been approved, where no harm will be done, and which has space on all sides, but they build one whose site has not been approved, where no harm will be done, but which lacks space on all sides. If he hears about it, he must either go there himself or send a message, telling them to build one whose site has been approved and which has space on all

sides. If he neither goes himself nor sends a message, he commits an offense of wrong conduct.

3.9.22 A monk appoints someone to build him a hut. He then departs, telling them to build one whose site has been approved, where no harm will be done, and which has space on all sides, but they build one whose site has not been approved, where no harm will be done, and which has space on all sides. If he hears about it, he must either go there himself or send a message, telling them to build one whose site has been approved. If he neither goes himself nor sends a message, he commits an offense of wrong conduct.

3.9.29 A monk appoints someone to build him a hut. He then departs, telling them to build one whose site has been approved, where no harm will be done, and which has space on all sides, but they build one whose site has been approved, where harm will be done, and which lacks space on all sides. If he hears about it, he must either go there himself or send a message, telling them to build one where no harm will be done and which has space on all sides. If he neither goes himself nor sends a message, he commits an offense of wrong conduct.

3.9.36 A monk appoints someone to build him a hut. He then departs, telling them to build one whose site has been approved, where no harm will be done, and which has space on all sides, but they build one whose site has been approved, where harm will be done, but which has space on all sides. If he hears about it, he must either go there himself or send a message, telling them to build one where no harm will be done. If he neither goes himself nor sends a message, he commits an offense of wrong conduct.

3.9.43 A monk appoints someone to build him a hut. He then departs, telling them to build one whose site has been approved, where no harm will be done, and which has space on all sides, but they build one whose site has been approved, where no harm will be done, but which lacks space on all sides. If he hears about it, he must either go there himself or send a message, telling them to build one

which has space on all sides. If he neither goes himself nor sends a message, he commits an offense of wrong conduct.

A monk appoints someone to build him a hut. He then departs, 3.9.50
telling them to build one whose site has been approved, where no harm will be done, and which has space on all sides, and they do build one whose site has been approved, where no harm will be done, and which has space on all sides. There is no offense.

A monk appoints someone to build him a hut. He then departs, 3.10.1
telling them to build one which is the right size, where no harm will be done, and which has space on all sides, but they build one which exceeds the right size, where harm will be done, and which lacks space on all sides. If he hears about it, he must either go there himself or send a message, telling them to build one which is the right size, where no harm will be done, and which has space on all sides. ... telling them to build one which is the right size and where no harm will be done. ... telling them to build one which is the right size and which has space on all sides. ... telling them to build one which is the right size. If he neither goes himself nor sends a message, he commits an offense of wrong conduct.

A monk appoints someone to build him a hut. He then departs, 3.10.11
telling them to build one which is the right size, where no harm will be done, and which has space on all sides, but they build one which is the right size, where harm will be done, and which lacks space on all sides. If he hears about it, he must either go there himself or send a message, telling them to build one where no harm will be done and which has space on all sides. ... telling them to build one where no harm will be done. ... telling them to build one which has space on all sides. ... There is no offense.

A monk appoints someone to build him a hut. He then departs, 3.11.1
telling them to build one whose site has been approved, which is the right size, where no harm will be done, and which has space on all sides, but they build one whose site has not been approved, which exceeds the right size, where harm will be done, and which lacks space on all sides. If he hears about it, he must either go there

himself or send a message, telling them to build one whose site has been approved, which is the right size, where no harm will be done, and which has space on all sides. ... telling them to build one whose site has been approved, which is the right size, and where no harm will be done. ... telling them to build one whose site has been approved, which is the right size, and which has space on all sides. ... telling them to build one whose site has been approved and which is the right size. If he neither goes himself nor sends a message, he commits an offense of wrong conduct.

- 3.11.11 A monk appoints someone to build him a hut. He then departs, telling them to build one whose site has been approved, which is the right size, where no harm will be done, and which has space on all sides, but they build one whose site has been approved, which is the right size, where harm will be done, and which lacks space on all sides. If he hears about it, he must either go there himself or send a message, telling them to build one where no harm will be done and which has space on all sides. ... telling them to build one where no harm will be done. ... telling them to build one which has space on all sides. ... There is no offense.

Offenses for appointed builders

- 3.12.1 A monk appoints someone to build him a hut. He then departs, telling them to build one whose site has been approved, where no harm will be done, and which has space on all sides. If they build one whose site has not been approved, where harm will be done, and which lacks space on all sides, the builders commit three offenses of wrong conduct. ... where harm will be done, but which has space on all sides, the builders commit two offenses of wrong conduct. ... where no harm will be done, but which lacks space on all sides, the builders commit two offenses of wrong conduct. ... where no harm will be done, and which has space on all sides, the builders commit one offense of wrong conduct.
- 3.12.7 A monk appoints someone to build him a hut. He then departs, telling them to build one whose site has been approved, where no

harm will be done, and which has space on all sides. If they build one whose site has been approved, where harm will be done, and which lacks space on all sides, the builders commit two offenses of wrong conduct. ... where harm will be done, but which has space on all sides, the builders commit one offense of wrong conduct. ... where no harm will be done, but which lacks space on all sides, the builders commit one offense of wrong conduct. ... where no harm will be done, and which has space on all sides, there is no offense.

A monk appoints someone to build him a hut. He then departs, 3.13.1 telling them to build one which is the right size, where no harm will be done, and which has space on all sides. If they build one which exceeds the right size, where harm will be done, and which lacks space on all sides, the builders commit three offenses of wrong conduct. ... where harm will be done, but which has space on all sides, the builders commit two offenses of wrong conduct. ... where no harm will be done, but which lacks space on all sides, the builders commit two offenses of wrong conduct. ... where no harm will be done, and which has space on all sides, the builders commit one offense of wrong conduct.

A monk appoints someone to build him a hut. He then departs, 3.13.7 telling them to build one which is the right size, where no harm will be done, and which has space on all sides. If they build one which is the right size, where harm will be done, and which lacks space on all sides, the builders commit two offenses of wrong conduct. ... where harm will be done, but which has space on all sides, the builders commit one offense of wrong conduct. ... where no harm will be done, but which lacks space on all sides, the builders commit one offense of wrong conduct. ... where no harm will be done, and which has space on all sides, there is no offense.

A monk appoints someone to build him a hut. He then departs, 3.13.13 telling them to build one whose site has been approved, which is the right size, where no harm will be done, and which has space on all sides. If they build one whose site has not been approved, which exceeds the right size, where harm will be done, and which

lacks space on all sides, the builders commit four offenses of wrong conduct. ... where harm will be done, but which has space on all sides, the builders commit three offenses of wrong conduct. ... where no harm will be done, but which lacks space on all sides, the builders commit three offenses of wrong conduct. ... where no harm will be done, and which has space on all sides, the builders commit two offenses of wrong conduct.

- 3.13.19 A monk appoints someone to build him a hut. He then departs, telling them to build one whose site has been approved, which is the right size, where no harm will be done, and which has space on all sides. If they build one whose site has been approved, which is the right size, where harm will be done, and which lacks space on all sides, the builders commit two offenses of wrong conduct. ... where harm will be done, but which has space on all sides, the builders commit one offense of wrong conduct. ... where no harm will be done, but which lacks space on all sides, the builders commit one offense of wrong conduct. ... where no harm will be done, and which has space on all sides, there is no offense.

Unfinished when he returns

- 3.14.1 A monk appoints someone to build him a hut and then departs. They build one whose site has not been approved, where harm will be done, and which lacks space on all sides. If it is unfinished when he returns, that hut is to be given to someone else, or it is to be demolished and rebuilt. If he neither gives it to someone else, nor demolishes and rebuilds it, he commits one offense entailing suspension and two offenses of wrong conduct.
- 3.14.5 A monk appoints someone to build him a hut and then departs. They build one whose site has not been approved, where harm will be done, but which has space on all sides. If it is unfinished when he returns, that hut is to be given to someone else, or it is to be demolished and rebuilt. If he neither gives it to someone else, nor demolishes and rebuilds it, he commits one offense entailing suspension and one offense of wrong conduct. ... where no harm

will be done, but which lacks space on all sides. ... he commits one offense entailing suspension and one offense of wrong conduct. ... where no harm will be done, and which has space on all sides. ... he commits one offense entailing suspension.

A monk appoints someone to build him a hut and then departs. 3.14.12
They build one whose site has been approved, where harm will be done, and which lacks space on all sides. If it is unfinished when he returns, that hut is to be given to someone else, or it is to be demolished and rebuilt. If he neither gives it to someone else, nor demolishes and rebuilds it, he commits two offenses of wrong conduct. ... where harm will be done, but which has space on all sides ... he commits one offense of wrong conduct. ... where no harm will be done, but which lacks space on all sides ... he commits one offense of wrong conduct. ... where no harm will be done, and which has space on all sides. There is no offense.

A monk appoints someone to build him a hut and then departs. 3.14.19
They build one which exceeds the right size, where harm will be done, and which lacks space on all sides. If it is unfinished when he returns, that hut is to be given to someone else, or it is to be demolished and rebuilt. If he neither gives it to someone else, nor demolishes and rebuilds it, he commits one offense entailing suspension and two offenses of wrong conduct. ... where harm will be done, but which has space on all sides ... he commits one offense entailing suspension and one offense of wrong conduct. ... where no harm will be done, but which lacks space on all sides ... he commits one offense entailing suspension and one offense of wrong conduct. ... where no harm will be done, and which has space on all sides ... he commits one offense entailing suspension.

A monk appoints someone to build him a hut and then departs. 3.14.26
They build one which is the right size, where harm will be done, and which lacks space on all sides. If it is unfinished when he returns, that hut is to be given to someone else, or it is to be demolished and rebuilt. If he neither gives it to someone else, nor demolishes and rebuilds it, he commits two offenses of wrong conduct. ...

where harm will be done, but which has space on all sides ... he commits one offense of wrong conduct. ... where no harm will be done, but which lacks space on all sides ... he commits one offense of wrong conduct. ... where no harm will be done, and which has space on all sides. There is no offense.

3.14.33 A monk appoints someone to build him a hut and then departs. They build one whose site has not been approved, which exceeds the right size, where harm will be done, and which lacks space on all sides. If it is unfinished when he returns, that hut is to be given to someone else, or it is to be demolished and rebuilt. If he neither gives it to someone else, nor demolishes and rebuilds it, he commits two offenses entailing suspension and two offenses of wrong conduct. ... where harm will be done, but which has space on all sides ... he commits two offenses entailing suspension and one offense of wrong conduct. ... where no harm will be done, but which lacks space on all sides ... he commits two offenses entailing suspension and one offense of wrong conduct. ... where no harm will be done, and which has space on all sides ... he commits two offenses entailing suspension.

3.14.40 A monk appoints someone to build him a hut and then departs. They build one whose site has been approved, which is the right size, where harm will be done, and which lacks space on all sides. If it is unfinished when he returns, that hut is to be given to someone else, or it is to be demolished and rebuilt. If he neither gives it to someone else, nor demolishes and rebuilds it, he commits two offenses of wrong conduct. ... where harm will be done, but which has space on all sides ... he commits one offense of wrong conduct. ... where no harm will be done, but which lacks space on all sides ... he commits one offense of wrong conduct.

3.14.46 A monk appoints someone to build him a hut and then departs. They build one whose site has been approved, which is the right size, where no harm will be done, and which has space on all sides. There is no offense.

Permutations part 2

If he finishes what he began himself, he commits an offense entailing suspension. 3.15.1

If he has others finish what he began himself, he commits an offense entailing suspension. 3.15.2

If he finishes himself what was begun by others, he commits an offense entailing suspension. 3.15.3

If he has others finish what was begun by others, he commits an offense entailing suspension. 3.15.4

Non-offenses

There is no offense: if it is a shelter; if it is a cave;⁹⁶ if it is a grass hut; if it is built for someone else; if it is anything apart from a dwelling; if he is insane; if he is the first offender. 3.16.1

The training rule on building huts, the sixth, is finished.

96. For the rendering of *guhā* as “cave”, see Appendix of Technical Terms.

The training rule on building dwellings

Vihārakāra

Origin story

- 1.1 At one time when the Buddha was staying at Kosambi in Ghosita's Monastery, a householder who was a supporter of Venerable Channa said to him, "I'll have a dwelling built for you, Venerable, if you would find a site for it."
- 1.4 While Venerable Channa was clearing a site for that dwelling, he felled a tree that served as a shrine and was revered by village, town, district, and kingdom. People complained and criticized him, "How could the Sakyān monastics fell a tree that serves as a shrine and is revered by village, town, district, and kingdom? They are hurting one-sensed life."
- 1.8 The monks heard the criticism of those people, and the monks of few desires complained and criticized Venerable Channa in the same way.
- 1.11 After rebuking Venerable Channa in many ways, they told the Buddha. Soon afterwards he had the Sangha gathered and questioned Channa: "Is it true, Channa, that you did this?"
- 1.13 "It's true, Sir."
- 1.14 The Buddha rebuked him ... "Foolish man, how could you do this? People perceive trees as conscious. This will affect people's confidence ..." ... "And, monks, this training rule should be recited like this:

Final ruling

'When a monk builds a large dwelling with a sponsoring owner and intended for himself,⁹⁷ he must have monks approve a site

97. I have rendered *sassāmikam* as "with a sponsoring owner". The word *sāmika* generally means "owner", and there seems to be no reason why that should not also be the meaning here. However, although the monk does not

where no harm will be done and which has space on all sides. If a monk builds a large dwelling on a site where harm will be done and which lacks space on all sides, or he does not have monks approve the site, he commits an offense entailing suspension.”

Definitions

A large dwelling: one with a sponsoring owner is what is meant.

Dwelling: plastered inside or plastered outside or plastered both inside and outside.

Buils: building it himself or having it built.

With a sponsoring owner: there is another owner, either a woman or a man, either a lay person or one gone forth.

Intended for himself: for his own use.

He must have monks approve a site: the monk who is building 2.12
a dwelling should clear a site, then approach the Sangha, put his upper robe over one shoulder, pay respect at the feet of the senior monks, squat on his heels, raise his joined palms, and say:
“Venerables, I want to build a large dwelling with a sponsoring 2.13
owner and intended for myself. I request the Sangha to inspect the site for the dwelling.”

He should make his request a second and a third time. If the 2.15
whole Sangha is able to inspect the site, they should all go. If the whole Sangha is unable to inspect the site, then those monks there who are competent and capable—who know where harm will be done and where no harm will be done, and who understand the meaning of having space on all sides and lacking space on all sides—should be asked and then appointed.

“And, monks, they should be appointed like this. A competent 2.20
and capable monk should inform the Sangha:

‘Please, Venerables, I ask the Sangha to listen. Monk so-and-so 2.22
wants to build a large dwelling with a sponsoring owner and intended for himself. He is requesting the Sangha to inspect the

own the dwelling, he is still the builder and the intended user once the building is finished. To indicate this, I have added the word “sponsoring”.

- site for that dwelling. If the Sangha is ready, it should appoint monk so-and-so and monk so-and-so to inspect the site for the dwelling of monk-so-and-so. This is the motion.
- 2.27 Please, Venerables, I ask the Sangha to listen. Monk so-and-so wants to build a large dwelling with a sponsoring owner and intended for himself. He is requesting the Sangha to inspect the site for that dwelling. The Sangha is appointing monk so-and-so and monk so-and-so to inspect the site for the dwelling of monk-so-and-so. Any monk who approves of appointing monk so-and-so and monk so-and-so to inspect the site for the dwelling of monk-so-and-so should remain silent. Any monk who doesn't approve should speak up.
- 2.33 The Sangha has appointed monk so-and-so and monk so-and-so to inspect the site for the dwelling of monk so-and-so. The Sangha approves and is therefore silent. I'll remember it thus.'
- 2.36 The appointed monks should go and inspect the site for the dwelling to find out if any harm will be done and if it has space on all sides. If harm will be done and it lacks space on all sides, they should say, 'Don't build here.' If no harm will be done and it has space on all sides, they should inform the Sangha: 'No harm will be done and it has space on all sides.' The monk who is building the dwelling should then approach the Sangha, arrange his upper robe over one shoulder, pay respect at the feet of the senior monks, squat on his heels, raise his joined palms, and say:
- 2.43 'Venerables, I want to build a large dwelling with a sponsoring owner and intended for myself. I request the Sangha to approve the site for the dwelling.'
- 2.45 He should make his request a second and a third time. A competent and capable monk should then inform the Sangha:
- 2.48 'Please, Venerables, I ask the Sangha to listen. Monk so-and-so wants to build a large dwelling with a sponsoring owner and intended for himself. He is requesting the Sangha to approve the site for the dwelling. If the Sangha is ready, it should approve the site for the dwelling of monk-so-and-so. This is the motion.

Please, Venerables, I ask the Sangha to listen. Monk so-and-so 2.53
wants to build a large dwelling with a sponsoring owner and
intended for himself. He is requesting the Sangha to approve
the site for the dwelling. The Sangha approves the site for the
dwelling of monk so-and-so. Any monk who agrees to approving
the site for the dwelling of monk-so-and-so should remain silent.
Any monk who doesn't agree should speak up.

The Sangha has approved the site for the dwelling of monk so- 2.59
and-so. The Sangha agrees and is therefore silent. I'll remember
it thus."

Where harm will be done: it is the abode of ants, termites, rats,
snakes, scorpions, centipedes, elephants, horses, lions, tigers,
leopards, bears, or hyenas, or any other animal; or it is bordering
on a field of grain, a field of vegetables, a place of slaughter, a
place of execution, a charnel ground, a park, a royal property, an
elephant stable, a horse stable, a prison, a bar, a slaughterhouse,
a street, a crossroads, a public meeting hall, or a cul-de-sac—
this is called "where harm will be done".

Which lacks space on all sides: it is not possible to go around it
with a yoked cart, or to go all the way around it with a ladder—
this is called "which lacks space on all sides".

Where no harm will be done: it is not the abode of ants ... it
is not bordering on ... a cul-de-sac—this is called "where no
harm will be done".

Which has space on all sides: it is possible to go around it with
a yoked cart, or to go all the way around it with a ladder—this
is called "which has space on all sides".

A large dwelling: one with a sponsoring owner is what is meant.

Dwelling: plastered inside or plastered outside or plastered both
inside and outside.

Builds: building it himself or having it built.

Or he does not have monks approve the site: if the site has
not been approved through a legal procedure consisting of one
motion and three announcements, and he then builds a dwelling

or has one built, then for the effort there is an act of wrong conduct. When there is one piece left to complete the dwelling, he commits a serious offense. When the last piece is finished, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

He commits an offense entailing suspension: ... Therefore, too, it is called “an offense entailing suspension”.

Permutations

Permutations part 1

Building oneself

- 3.1.1 If a monk builds a dwelling whose site has not been approved, where harm will be done, and which lacks space on all sides, he commits one offense entailing suspension and two offenses of wrong conduct. If a monk builds a dwelling whose site has not been approved, where harm will be done, but which has space on all sides, he commits one offense entailing suspension and one offense of wrong conduct. If a monk builds a dwelling whose site has not been approved, where no harm will be done, but which lacks space on all sides, he commits one offense entailing suspension and one offense of wrong conduct. If a monk builds a dwelling whose site has not been approved, where no harm will be done, and which has space on all sides, he commits one offense entailing suspension.
- 3.1.5 If a monk builds a dwelling whose site has been approved, where harm will be done, and which lacks space on all sides, he commits two offenses of wrong conduct. If a monk builds a dwelling whose site has been approved, where harm will be done, but which has space on all sides, he commits one offense of wrong conduct. If a monk builds a dwelling whose site has been approved, where no harm will be done, but which lacks space on all sides, he commits one offense of wrong conduct. If a monk builds a dwelling whose site has been approved, where no harm will be done, and which has space on all sides, there is no offense.

Appointing someone else to build

A monk appoints someone to build him a dwelling. If they build a dwelling whose site has not been approved, where harm will be done, and which lacks space on all sides, he commits one offense entailing suspension and two offenses of wrong conduct. ... where harm will be done, but which has space on all sides, he commits one offense entailing suspension and one offense of wrong conduct. ... where no harm will be done, but which lacks space on all sides, he commits one offense entailing suspension and one offense of wrong conduct. ... where no harm will be done, and which has space on all sides, he commits one offense entailing suspension. 3.2.1

A monk appoints someone to build him a dwelling. If they build a dwelling whose site has been approved, where harm will be done, and which lacks space on all sides, he commits two offenses of wrong conduct. ... where harm will be done, but which has space on all sides, he commits one offense of wrong conduct. ... where no harm will be done, but which lacks space on all sides, he commits one offense of wrong conduct. ... where no harm will be done, and which has space on all sides, there is no offense. 3.2.7

Departing without informing of the proper building procedure

A monk appoints someone to build him a dwelling and then departs, but he does not tell them to build a dwelling whose site has been approved, where no harm will be done, and which has space on all sides. If they build a dwelling whose site has not been approved, where harm will be done, and which lacks space on all sides, he commits one offense entailing suspension and two offenses of wrong conduct. ... where harm will be done, but which has space on all sides, he commits one offense entailing suspension and one offense of wrong conduct. ... where no harm will be done, but which lacks space on all sides, he commits one offense entailing suspension and one offense of wrong conduct. ... where no harm will be done, and which has space on all sides, he commits one offense entailing suspension. 3.3.1

- 3.3.9 A monk appoints someone to build him a dwelling and then departs, but he does not tell them to build a dwelling whose site has been approved, where no harm will be done, and which has space on all sides. If they build a dwelling whose site has been approved, where harm will be done, and which lacks space on all sides, he commits two offenses of wrong conduct. ... where harm will be done, but which has space on all sides, he commits one offense of wrong conduct. ... where no harm will be done, but which lacks space on all sides, he commits one offense of wrong conduct. ... where no harm will be done, and which has space on all sides, there is no offense.

Departing and then hearing about wrong building procedure

- 3.4.1 A monk appoints someone to build him a dwelling and then departs. He tells them to build a dwelling whose site has been approved, where no harm will be done, and which has space on all sides, but they build a dwelling whose site has not been approved, where harm will be done, and which lacks space on all sides. If he hears about it, he must either go there himself or send a message, telling them to build a dwelling whose site has been approved, where no harm will be done, and which has space on all sides. ... whose site has been approved and where no harm will be done. ... whose site has been approved and which has space on all sides. ... whose site has been approved. If he neither goes himself nor sends a message, he commits an offense of wrong conduct.
- 3.4.13 A monk appoints someone to build him a dwelling and then departs. He tells them to build a dwelling whose site has been approved, where no harm will be done, and which has space on all sides, but they build a dwelling whose site has been approved, where harm will be done, and which lacks space on all sides. If he hears about it, he must either go there himself or send a message, telling them to build one where no harm will be done and which has space on all sides. ... (To be expanded as in Bu Ss 6:3.9.35–Bu

Ss 6:3.11.16.) ... where no harm will be done. ...⁹⁸ which has space on all sides. ... There is no offense.

Offenses for appointed builders

A monk appoints someone to build him a dwelling. He then de- 3.5.1
parts, telling them to build a dwelling whose site has been approved,
where no harm will be done, and which has space on all sides. If
they build a dwelling whose site has not been approved, where
harm will be done, and which lacks space on all sides, the builders
commit three offenses of wrong conduct. ... where harm will be
done, but which has space on all sides, the builders commit two
offenses of wrong conduct. ... where no harm will be done, but
which lacks space on all sides, the builders commit two offenses
of wrong conduct. ... where no harm will be done, and which
has space on all sides, the builders commit one offense of wrong
conduct.

A monk appoints someone to build him a dwelling. He then 3.5.7
departs, telling them to build a dwelling whose site has been ap-
proved, where no harm will be done, and which has space on all
sides. If they build a dwelling whose site has been approved, where
harm will be done, and which lacks space on all sides, the builders
commit two offenses of wrong conduct. ... where harm will be
done, but which has space on all sides, the builders commit one
offense of wrong conduct. ... where no harm will be done, but
which lacks space on all sides, the builders commit one offense of
wrong conduct. ... where no harm will be done, and which has
space on all sides, there is no offense.

Unfinished when he returns

A monk appoints someone to build him a dwelling and then de- 3.6.1
parts. They build a dwelling whose site has not been approved,
where harm will be done, and which lacks space on all sides. If

98. These ellipses points, and those in the next segment, are not found in the Pali. I have added them for clarity.

it is unfinished when he returns, that dwelling is to be given to someone else, or it is to be demolished and rebuilt. If he neither gives it to someone else, nor demolishes and rebuilds it, he commits one offense entailing suspension and two offenses of wrong conduct. ... where harm will be done, but which has space on all sides ... he commits one offense entailing suspension and one offense of wrong conduct. ... where no harm will be done, but which lacks space on all sides ... he commits one offense entailing suspension and one offense of wrong conduct. ... where no harm will be done, and which has space on all sides ... he commits one offense entailing suspension.

- 3.6.8 A monk appoints someone to build him a dwelling and then departs. They build a dwelling whose site has been approved, where harm will be done, and which lacks space on all sides. If it is unfinished when he returns, that dwelling is to be given to someone else, or it is to be demolished and rebuilt. If he neither gives it to someone else, nor demolishes and rebuilds it, he commits two offenses of wrong conduct. ... where harm will be done, but which has space on all sides ... he commits one offense of wrong conduct. ... where no harm will be done, but which lacks space on all sides ... he commits one offense of wrong conduct. ... where no harm will be done, and which has space on all sides ... there is no offense.

Permutations part 2

- 3.7.1 If he finishes what he began himself, he commits an offense entailing suspension.
- 3.7.2 If he has others finish what he began himself, he commits an offense entailing suspension.
- 3.7.3 If he finishes himself what was begun by others, he commits an offense entailing suspension.
- 3.7.4 If he has others finish what was begun by others, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

Non-offenses

There is no offense: if it is a shelter, a cave, or a grass hut;⁹⁹ if it is 3.7.5.1
built for someone else; if it is anything apart from a dwelling; if he
is insane; if he is the first offender.

The training rule on building dwellings, the seventh, is finished.

99. For the rendering of *guhā* as “cave”, see Appendix of Technical Terms.

The training rule on anger

Duṭṭhadosa

Origin story

- 1.1.1 At one time when the Buddha was staying at Rājagaha in the Bamboo Grove, Venerable Dabba the Mallian realized perfection at the age of seven. He had achieved all there is to achieve by a disciple and had nothing further to do. Then, while reflecting in private, he thought, “How can I be of service to the Sangha?”
- 1.1.10 Why don’t I assign the dwellings and designate the meals?”
- 1.2.1 In the evening Dabba came out of seclusion and went to the Buddha. He bowed, sat down, and said, “Sir, while I was reflecting in private, it occurred to me that I’ve achieved all there is to achieve by a disciple, and I was wondering how I could be of service to the Sangha. I thought, ‘Why don’t I assign the dwellings and designate the meals?’”
- 1.2.7 “Good, good, Dabba, please do so.”
- 1.2.9 “Yes.”
- 1.3.1 Soon afterwards the Buddha gave a teaching and addressed the monks: “Monks, the Sangha should appoint Dabba the Mallian as the assigner of dwellings and the designator of meals. And he should be appointed like this. First Dabba should be asked. A competent and capable monk should then inform the Sangha:
- 1.3.6 ‘Please, Venerables, I ask the Sangha to listen. If the Sangha is ready, it should appoint Venerable Dabba the Mallian as assigner of dwellings and designator of meals. This is the motion.
- 1.3.9 Please, Venerables, I ask the Sangha to listen. The Sangha appoints Venerable Dabba the Mallian as assigner of dwellings and designator of meals. Any monk who approves of appointing Venerable Dabba as assigner of dwellings and designator of meals should remain silent. Any monk who doesn’t approve should speak up.

The Sangha has appointed Venerable Dabba the Mallian as assigner of dwellings and designator of meals. The Sangha approves and is therefore silent. I'll remember it thus." 1.3.13

Dabba assigned dwellings to the monks according to their character. He assigned dwellings in the same place to those monks who were experts on the discourses, thinking, "They'll recite the discourses to one another." And he did likewise for the experts on the Monastic Law, thinking, "They'll discuss the Monastic Law;" for the expounders of the Teaching, thinking, "They'll discuss the Teaching;" for the meditators, thinking, "They won't disturb each other;" and for the gossips and the body-builders, thinking, "In this way even these venerables will be happy." 1.4.1

When monks arrived at night, he entered the fire element and assigned dwellings with the help of that light. Monks even arrived late on purpose, hoping to see the marvel of Dabba's supernormal powers. 1.4.12

They would approach Dabba and say, "Venerable Dabba, please assign us a dwelling." 1.4.15

"Where would you like to stay?" 1.4.17

They would intentionally suggest somewhere far away: "On the Vulture Peak," "At Robbers' Cliff," "On Black Rock on the slope of Mount Isigili," "In the Sattapaṇṇi Cave on the slope of Mount Vebhāra," "In Cool Grove on the hill at the Snake's Pool," "At Gotamaka Gorge," "At Tinduka Gorge," "At Tapoda Gorge," "In Tapoda Park," "In Jīvaka's Mango Grove," "In the deer park at Maddakucchi." 1.4.19

Dabba then entered the fire element, and with his finger glowing, he walked in front of those monks. They followed behind him with the help of that light. And he would assign them dwellings: "This is the bed, this the bench, this the mattress, this the pillow, this the place for defecating, this the place for urinating, this the water for drinking, this the water for washing, this the walking stick; these are the Sangha's agreements concerning the right time to enter and 1.4.31

the right time to leave.”¹⁰⁰ Dabba then returned to the Bamboo Grove.

1.5.1 At that time the monks Mettiya and Bhūmajaka were only newly ordained. They had little merit,¹⁰¹ getting inferior dwellings and meals. The people of Rājagaha were keen to give specially prepared almsfood to the senior monks—ghee, oil, and special curries—but to the monks Mettiya and Bhūmajaka they gave ordinary food of porridge and broken rice.

1.5.5 When they had eaten their meal and returned from alms round, they asked the senior monks, “What did you get at the dining hall?”

1.5.7 Some said, “We got ghee, oil, and special curries.”

1.5.9 But the monks Mettiya and Bhūmajaka said, “We didn’t get anything except ordinary food of porridge and broken rice.”

1.6.1 At that time there was a householder who gave a regular meal of fine food to four monks. He made his offering in the dining hall together with his wives and children. Some of them offered rice, some bean curry, some oil, and some special curries.

1.6.4 On one occasion the meal to be given by this householder on the following day had been designated to the monks Mettiya and Bhūmajaka. Just then that householder went to the monastery on some business. He approached Dabba, bowed, and sat down. And Dabba instructed, inspired, and gladdened him with a teaching. After the talk, he asked Dabba, “Sir, who has been designated to receive tomorrow’s meal in our house?”

1.6.10 “Mettiya and Bhūmajaka.”

1.6.11 He was disappointed, and thought, “Why should bad monks eat in our house?” After returning to his house, he told a female slave, “For those who are coming for tomorrow’s meal, prepare seats in the gatehouse and serve them broken rice and porridge.”

1.6.15 “Yes, sir.”

100. See Kd 18:1.2.22 for the correct interpretation of this line.

101. *Mettīyabhūmajakā bhikkhū* can be read either as referring to two monks, Mettiya and Bhūmajaka, or as a group of monks led by these two. I have not been able to find any clear evidence that it refers to a group, and so I prefer the more straightforward reading that it only refers to the two monks.

The monks Mettiya and Bhūmajaka said to each other, “Yesterday we were designated a meal from that householder who offers fine food. Tomorrow he’ll serve us together with his wives and children. Some of them will offer us rice, some bean curry, some oil, and some special curries.” And because they were excited, they did not sleep properly that night. 1.7.1

The following morning they robed up, took their bowls and robes, and went to the house of that householder. When the female slave saw them coming, she prepared seats in the gatehouse and said to them, “Please sit, Venerables.” 1.7.6

They thought, “The meal can’t be ready, since we’re given seats in the gatehouse.” 1.7.9

She then brought them broken rice and porridge, and said, “Eat, Sirs.” 1.7.11

“But, Sister, we’ve come for the regular meal.” 1.7.13

“I know. But yesterday I was told by the head of the household to serve you like this. Please eat.” 1.7.14

They said to each other, “Yesterday this householder came to the monastery and spoke with Dabba. Dabba must be responsible for this split between the householder and us.” And because they were dejected, they did not eat as much as they had intended. When they had eaten their meal and returned from alms round, they put their bowls and robes away, and squatted on their heels outside the monastery gatehouse, using their upper robes as back-and-knee straps. They were silent and humiliated, their shoulders drooping and their heads down, glum and speechless.¹⁰² 1.7.17

Just then the nun Mettiyā came to them and said, “My respectful greetings to you, Venerables.” But they did not respond. A second time and a third time she said the same thing, but they still did not respond. 1.8.1

“Have I done something wrong? Why don’t you respond?” 1.8.8

102. For the rendering of *saṅghāṭi* as “upper robe”, see Appendix of Technical Terms.

- 1.8.10 “It’s because we’ve been badly treated by Dabba the Mallian, and you’re not taking an interest.”
- 1.8.11 “But what can I do?”
- 1.8.12 “If you like, you could make the Buddha expel Dabba.”
- 1.8.13 “And how can I do that?”
- 1.8.14 “Go to the Buddha and say, ‘Sir, this isn’t proper or appropriate. There’s fear, distress, and oppression in this district, where none of these should exist. From where one would expect security, there’s insecurity. It’s as if water is burning. Venerable Dabba the Mallian has raped me.’”
- 1.8.20 Saying, “Alright, Venerables,” she went to the Buddha, bowed, and then repeated what she had been told to say.
- 1.9.1 Soon afterwards the Buddha had the Sangha gathered and questioned Dabba: “Dabba, do you remember doing as the nun Mettiyā says?”
- 1.9.3 “Sir, you know what I’m like.”
- 1.9.4 A second and a third time the Buddha asked the same question and got the same response. He then said, “Dabba, the Dabbas don’t give such evasive answers. If it was done by you, say so; if it wasn’t, then say that.”
- 1.9.11 “Since I was born, Sir, I don’t recall having sexual intercourse even in a dream, let alone when awake.”
- 1.9.12 The Buddha addressed the monks: “Well then, monks, expel the nun Mettiyā, and call these monks to account.” The Buddha then got up from his seat and entered his dwelling.
- 1.9.16 When the monks had expelled the nun Mettiyā, the monks Mettiya and Bhūmajaka said to them, “Don’t expel the nun Mettiyā; she’s done nothing wrong. She was urged on by us. We were angry and displeased, and trying to get Dabba to leave the monastic life.”
- 1.9.21 “But did you groundlessly charge Venerable Dabba with an offense entailing expulsion?”
- 1.9.22 “Yes.”

The monks of few desires complained and criticized them, “How 1.9.23
could the monks Mettiya and Bhūmajaka groundlessly charge Ven-
erable Dabba with an offense entailing expulsion?”

They rebuked those monks in many ways and then told the Bud- 1.9.25
dha. Soon afterwards he had the Sangha gathered and questioned
those monks: “Is it true, monks, that you did this?”

“It’s true, Sir.” 1.9.27

The Buddha rebuked them ... “Foolish men, how could you do 1.9.28
this? This will affect people’s confidence ...” ... “And, monks, this
training rule should be recited like this:

Final ruling

**‘If a monk who is angry and displeased groundlessly charges a
monk with an offense entailing expulsion, aiming to make him
leave the monastic life, and then after some time, whether he is
questioned or not, it is clear that the legal issue is groundless,
and he admits to his ill will, he commits an offense entailing
suspension.’”**

Definitions

A: whoever ...

Monk: ... The monk who has been given the full ordination by a
unanimous Sangha through a legal procedure consisting of one
motion and three announcements that is irreversible and fit to
stand—this sort of monk is meant in this case.

A monk: another monk.

Angry: upset, dissatisfied, discontent, having hatred, hostile.

Displeased: because of that upset, that ill will, that dissatisfac-
tion, and that discontent, he is displeased.

Groundlessly: not seen, not heard, not suspected.

With an offense entailing expulsion: with one of the four.

Charges: accuses him or has him accused.

To make him leave the monastic life: to make him leave the monkhood, leave the state of a monastic, leave his morality, leave the virtue of monasticism.

And then after some time: the moment, the instant, the second after he has laid the charge.

He is questioned: he is questioned about the grounds of his charge.

Not: he is not spoken to by anyone.

The legal issue: there are four kinds of legal issues: legal issues arising from disputes, legal issues arising from accusations, legal issues arising from offenses, legal issues arising from business.

And he admits to his ill will: “What I said was empty,” “What I said was false,” “What I said was unreal,” “I said it without knowing.”

He commits an offense entailing suspension: ... Therefore, too, it is called “an offense entailing suspension”.

Permutations

Permutations part 1

Doing the accusing oneself

- 3.1.1 Although he has not seen it, he accuses someone of having committed an offense entailing expulsion: “I’ve seen that you’ve committed an offense entailing expulsion. You’re not an ascetic, not a Sakyan monastic. You’re excluded from the observance-day ceremony, from the invitation ceremony, and from the legal procedures of the Sangha.” For each statement, he commits an offense entailing suspension.
- 3.1.6 Although he has not heard it, he accuses someone of having committed an offense entailing expulsion: “I’ve heard that you’ve committed an offense entailing expulsion. You’re not an ascetic, not a Sakyan monastic. You’re excluded from the observance-day ceremony, from the invitation ceremony, and from the legal proce-

dures of the Sangha.” For each statement, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

Although he does not suspect it, he accuses someone of having committed an offense entailing expulsion: “I suspect that you’ve committed an offense entailing expulsion. You’re not an ascetic, not a Sakyan monastic. You’re excluded from the observance-day ceremony, from the invitation ceremony, and from the legal procedures of the Sangha.” For each statement, he commits an offense entailing suspension. 3.1.12

Although he has not seen it, he accuses someone of having committed an offense entailing expulsion: “I’ve seen and I’ve heard that you’ve committed an offense entailing expulsion. You’re not a monastic ...” For each statement, he commits an offense entailing suspension. 3.2.1

Although he has not seen it, he accuses someone of having committed an offense entailing expulsion: “I’ve seen and I suspect that you’ve committed an offense entailing expulsion. You’re not a monastic ...” For each statement, he commits an offense entailing suspension. 3.2.5

Although he has not seen it, he accuses someone of having committed an offense entailing expulsion: “I’ve seen and I’ve heard and I suspect that you’ve committed an offense entailing expulsion. You’re not a monastic ...” For each statement, he commits an offense entailing suspension. 3.2.9

Although he has not heard it, he accuses someone of having committed an offense entailing expulsion: “I’ve heard and I suspect ...” ... “I’ve heard and I’ve seen ...” ... “I’ve heard and I suspect and I’ve seen that you’ve committed an offense entailing expulsion. You’re not a monastic ...” For each statement, he commits an offense entailing suspension. 3.2.13

Although he does not suspect it, he accuses someone of having committed an offense entailing expulsion: “I suspect and I’ve seen ...” ... “I suspect and I’ve heard ...” ... “I suspect and I’ve seen and I’ve heard that you’ve committed an offense entailing expulsion. 3.2.20

sion. You're not a monastic ..." For each statement, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

3.3.1 He has seen that someone has committed an offense entailing expulsion, but he accuses him like this: "I've heard that you've committed an offense entailing expulsion. You're not a monastic ..." For each statement, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

3.3.6 He has seen that someone has committed an offense entailing expulsion, but he accuses him like this: "I suspect that you've committed an offense entailing expulsion ..." ... "I've heard and I suspect that you've committed an offense entailing expulsion. You're not a monastic ..." For each statement, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

3.3.12 He has heard that someone has committed an offense entailing expulsion, but he accuses him like this: "I suspect that you've committed an offense entailing expulsion ..." ... "I've seen that you've committed an offense entailing expulsion ..." ... "I suspect and I've seen that you've committed an offense entailing expulsion. You're not a monastic ..." For each statement, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

3.3.20 He suspects that someone has committing an offense entailing expulsion, but he accuses him like this: "I've seen that you've committed an offense entailing expulsion ..." ... "I've heard that you've committed an offense entailing expulsion ..." ... "I've seen and I've heard that you've committed an offense entailing expulsion. You're not an ascetic, not a Sakyan monastic. ..." For each statement, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

3.4.1 He has seen someone committing an offense entailing expulsion, but he is unsure of what he has seen, he does not believe what he has seen, he does not remember what he has seen, he is confused about what he has seen ...¹⁰³ he is unsure of what he has heard, he does not believe what he has heard, he does not remember what he has heard, he is confused about what he has heard ... he is unsure of what he suspects, he does not believe what he suspects, he does

103. Sp 1.387: *No kappetīti na saddahati*, "No kappeti: he does not believe."

not remember what he suspects, he is confused about what he suspects. If he then accuses him like this: “I suspect and I’ve seen ...” ... “I suspect and I’ve heard ...” ... “I suspect and I’ve seen and I’ve heard that you’ve committed an offense entailing expulsion. You’re not an ascetic, not a Sakyan monastic. You’re excluded from the observance-day ceremony, from the invitation ceremony, and from the legal procedures of the Sangha.” For each statement, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

Getting someone else to do the accusing

Although he has not seen it, he has someone accused of having committed an offense entailing expulsion: “You’ve been seen. You’ve committed an offense entailing expulsion. You’re not an ascetic, not a Sakyan monastic. You’re excluded from the observance-day ceremony, from the invitation ceremony, and from the legal procedures of the Sangha.” For each statement, he commits an offense entailing suspension. 3.5.1

Although he has not heard it ... Although he does not suspect it, he has someone accused of having committed an offense entailing expulsion: “You’re suspected. You’ve committed an offense entailing expulsion. ...” For each statement, he commits an offense entailing suspension. 3.5.7

Although he has not seen it, he has someone accused of having committed an offense entailing expulsion: “You’ve been seen and you’ve been heard ...” ... “You’ve been seen and you’re suspected ...” ... “You’ve been seen and you’ve been heard and you’re suspected. You’ve committed an offense entailing expulsion ...” ... Although he has not heard it ... Although he does not suspect it, he has someone accused of having committed an offense entailing expulsion: “You’re suspected and you’ve been seen ...” ... “You’re suspected and you’ve been heard ...” ... “You’re suspected and you’ve been seen and you’ve been heard. You’ve committed an offense entailing expulsion. You’re not a monastic ...” For each statement, he commits an offense entailing suspension. 3.6.1

3.7.1 He has seen that someone has committed an offense entailing expulsion, but he has him accused like this: “You’ve been heard ...” ... but he has him accused like this: “You’re suspected ...” ... but he has him accused like this: “You’ve been heard and you’re suspected. You’ve committed an offense entailing expulsion. You’re not a monastic ...” For each statement, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

3.7.11 He has heard that someone has committed an offense entailing expulsion ... He suspects that someone has committed an offense entailing expulsion, but he has him accused like this: “You’ve been seen ...” ... but he has him accused like this: “You’ve been heard ...” ... but he has him accused like this: “You’ve been seen and you’ve been heard. You’ve committed an offense entailing expulsion. You’re not a monastic ...” For each statement, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

3.8.1 He has seen that someone has committed an offense entailing expulsion, but he is unsure of what he has seen, he does not believe what he has seen, he does not remember what he has seen, he is confused about what he has seen ... he is unsure of what he has heard, he does not believe what he has heard, he does not remember what he has heard, he is confused about what he has heard ... he is unsure of what he suspects, he does not believe what he suspects, he does not remember what he suspects, he is confused about what he suspects. If he then has him accused like this: “You’re suspected and you’ve been seen ...” ... he is confused about what he suspects. If he then has him accused like this: “You’re suspected and you’ve been heard ...” ... he is confused about what he suspects. If he then has him accused like this: “You’re suspected and you’ve been seen and you’ve been heard. You’ve committed an offense entailing expulsion. You’re not an ascetic, not a Sakyan monastic. You’re excluded from the observance-day ceremony, from the invitation ceremony, and from the legal procedures of the Sangha.” For each statement, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

Permutations part 2

Summary

Someone is impure, but viewed as pure; someone is pure, but viewed as impure; someone is impure and viewed as impure; someone is pure and viewed as pure. 4.1.1

Exposition

Impure but viewed as pure

An impure person has committed an offense entailing expulsion. If one views him as pure, but then, without having gotten his permission, speaks with the aim of making him leave the monastic life, one commits one offense entailing suspension and one offense of wrong conduct. 4.2.1

An impure person has committed an offense entailing expulsion. If one views him as pure, but then, having gotten his permission, speaks with the aim of making him leave the monastic life, one commits an offense entailing suspension. 4.2.3

An impure person has committed an offense entailing expulsion. If one views him as pure, but then, without having gotten his permission, speaks with the aim of abusing him, one commits one offense for abusive speech and one offense of wrong conduct.¹⁰⁴ 4.2.5

An impure person has committed an offense entailing expulsion. If one views him as pure, but then, having gotten his permission, speaks with the aim of abusing him, one commits an offense for abusive speech. 4.2.7

Pure but viewed as impure

A pure person has not committed an offense entailing expulsion. If one views him as impure, and then, without having gotten his permission, speaks with the aim of making him leave the monastic life, one commits an offense of wrong conduct. 4.3.1

104. See Bu Pc 2:1.2.33 for the rule on abusive speech.

4.3.3 A pure person has not committed an offense entailing expulsion. If one views him as impure, and then, having gotten his permission, speaks with the aim of making him leave the monastic life, there is no offense.

4.3.5 A pure person has not committed an offense entailing expulsion. If one views him as impure, and then, without having gotten his permission, speaks with the aim of abusing him, one commits one offense for abusive speech and one offense of wrong conduct.

4.3.7 A pure person has not committed an offense entailing expulsion. If one views him as impure, then, having gotten his permission, speaks with the aim of abusing him, one commits an offense for abusive speech.

Impure and viewed as impure

4.4.1.1 An impure person has committed an offense entailing expulsion. If one views him as impure, and then, without having gotten his permission, speaks with the aim of making him leave the monastic life, one commits an offense of wrong conduct.

4.4.3 An impure person has committed an offense entailing expulsion. If one views him as impure, and then, having gotten his permission, speaks with the aim of making him leave the monastic life, there is no offense.

4.4.5 An impure person has committed an offense entailing expulsion. If one views him as impure, and then, without having gotten his permission, speaks with the aim of abusing him, one commits one offense for abusive speech and one offense of wrong conduct.¹⁰⁵

4.4.7 An impure person has committed an offense entailing expulsion. If one views him as impure, and then, having gotten his permission, speaks with the aim of abusing him, one commits an offense for abusive speech.

105. See Bu Pc 2:1.2.33 for the rule on abusive speech.

Pure and viewed as pure

A pure person has not committed an offense entailing expulsion. If one views him as pure, but then, without having gotten his permission, speaks with the aim of making him leave the monastic life, one commits one offense entailing suspension and one offense of wrong conduct. 4.5.1

A pure person has not committed an offense entailing expulsion. If one views him as pure, but then, having gotten his permission, speaks with the aim of making him leave the monastic life, one commits an offense entailing suspension. 4.5.3

A pure person has not committed an offense entailing expulsion. If one views him as pure, but then, without having gotten his permission, speaks with the aim of abusing him, one commits one offense for abusive speech and one offense of wrong conduct. 4.5.5

A pure person has not committed an offense entailing expulsion. If one views him as pure, but then, having gotten his permission, speaks with the aim of abusing him, one commits an offense for abusive speech. 4.5.7

Non-offenses

There is no offense: if he views a pure person as impure; if he views an impure person as impure; if he is insane; if he is the first offender. 4.5.8.1

The training rule on groundless, the eighth, is finished.

The second training rule on anger

Aññabhāgiya

Origin story

- 1.1.1 At one time when the Buddha was staying at Rājagaha in the Bamboo Grove, the monks Mettiya and Bhūmajaka were descending from the Vulture Peak when they saw two goats copulating. They said to each other, “Let’s give the he-goat the name Dabba the Mallian and the she-goat the name Mettiyā the nun. We can then say, ‘Previously we spoke of what we had heard, but now we’ve seen Dabba copulating with the nun Mettiyā.’” They then gave them those names and told the monks, “Previously we spoke of what we had heard, but now we’ve seen Dabba copulating with the nun Mettiyā.”
- 1.1.14 The monks replied, “Don’t say such things. Venerable Dabba wouldn’t do that.”
- 1.1.17 The monks told the Buddha. Soon afterwards the Buddha had the Sangha gathered and questioned Dabba: “Dabba, do you remember doing as these monks say?”
- 1.1.20 “Sir, you know what I’m like.”
- 1.1.21 A second and a third time the Buddha asked the same question and got the same response. He then said, “Dabba, the Dabbas don’t give such evasive answers. If it was done by you, say so; if it wasn’t done by you, then say that.”
- 1.1.28 “Since I was born, Sir, I don’t recall having sexual intercourse even in a dream, let alone when awake.”
- 1.1.29 “Well then, monks, call those monks to account.” And the Buddha got up from his seat and entered his dwelling.
- 1.2.1 The monks then questioned Mettiya and Bhūmajaka, who told them what had happened. The monks said, “So did you charge Venerable Dabba with an offense entailing expulsion, using an unrelated legal issue as a pretext?”

“Yes.”

1.2.4

The monks of few desires complained and criticized them, “How could Mettiya and Bhūmajaka charge Venerable Dabba with an offense entailing expulsion, using an unrelated legal issue as a pretext?” 1.2.5

They rebuked those monks in many ways and then told the Buddha. Soon afterwards he had the Sangha gathered and questioned those monks: “Is it true, monks, that you did this?” 1.2.7

“It’s true, Sir.”

1.2.9

The Buddha rebuked them ... “Foolish men, how could you do this? This will affect people’s confidence ...” ... “And, monks, this training rule should be recited like this: 1.2.10

Final ruling

‘If a monk who is angry and displeased, uses an unrelated legal issue as a pretext to charge a monk with an offense entailing expulsion, aiming to make him leave the monastic life, and then after some time, whether he is questioned or not, it is clear that the legal issue is unrelated and was used as a pretext, and he admits to his ill will, he commits an offense entailing suspension.’

Definitions

A: whoever ...

Monk: ... The monk who has been given the full ordination by a unanimous Sangha through a legal procedure consisting of one motion and three announcements that is irreversible and fit to stand—this sort of monk is meant in this case.

A monk: another monk.

Angry: upset, dissatisfied, discontent, having hatred, hostile.

Displeased: because of that upset, that ill will, that dissatisfaction, and that discontent, he is displeased.

An unrelated legal issue: it is either unrelated in regard to offenses or unrelated in regard to legal issues. 2.2.2

- 2.2.3 How is a legal issue unrelated to a legal issue? A legal issue arising from a dispute is unrelated to a legal issue arising from an accusation, a legal issue arising from an offense, and a legal issue arising from business. A legal issue arising from an accusation is unrelated to a legal issue arising from an offense, a legal issue arising from business, and a legal issue arising from a dispute. A legal issue arising from an offense is unrelated to a legal issue arising from business, a legal issue arising from a dispute, and a legal issue arising from an accusation. A legal issue arising from business is unrelated to a legal issue arising from a dispute, a legal issue arising from an accusation, and a legal issue arising from an offense. It is in this way that a legal issue is unrelated to a legal issue.
- 2.2.9 How is a legal issue related to a legal issue? A legal issue arising from a dispute is related to a legal issue arising from a dispute. A legal issue arising from an accusation is related to a legal issue arising from an accusation. A legal issue arising from an offense may be either related or unrelated to a legal issue arising from an offense.
- 2.2.13 How is a legal issue arising from an offense unrelated to a legal issue arising from an offense? An offense entailing expulsion in regard to sexual intercourse is unrelated to an offense entailing expulsion in regard to stealing, an offense entailing expulsion in regard to a human being, and an offense entailing expulsion in regard to a superhuman quality. An offense entailing expulsion in regard to stealing is unrelated to an offense entailing expulsion in regard to a human being, an offense entailing expulsion in regard to a superhuman quality, and an offense entailing expulsion in regard to sexual intercourse. An offense entailing expulsion in regard to a human being is unrelated to an offense entailing expulsion in regard to a superhuman quality, an offense entailing expulsion in regard to sexual intercourse, and an offense entailing expulsion in regard to stealing. An offense entailing expulsion in regard to a superhuman quality is unrelated to an

offense entailing expulsion in regard to sexual intercourse, an offense entailing expulsion in regard to stealing, and an offense entailing expulsion in regard to a human being. It is in this way that a legal issue arising from an offense is unrelated to a legal issue arising from an offense.

How is a legal issue arising from an offense related to a legal issue arising from an offense? An offense entailing expulsion in regard to sexual intercourse is related to an offense entailing expulsion in regard to sexual intercourse. An offense entailing expulsion in regard to stealing is related to an offense entailing expulsion in regard to stealing. An offense entailing expulsion in regard to a human being is related to an offense entailing expulsion in regard to a human being. An offense entailing expulsion in regard to a superhuman quality is related to an offense entailing expulsion in regard to a superhuman quality. It is in this way that a legal issue arising from an offense is related to a legal issue arising from an offense. 2.2.19

A legal issue arising from business is related to a legal issue arising from business. It is in this way that a legal issue is related to a legal issue. 2.2.25

Uses as a pretext: A pretext: there are ten kinds of pretext—the pretext of caste, the pretext of name, the pretext of family, the pretext of characteristic, the pretext of offense, the pretext of almsbowl, the pretext of robe, the pretext of preceptor, the pretext of teacher, the pretext of dwelling. 2.3.2

1. The pretext of caste: a monk sees an aristocrat committing an offense entailing expulsion. If he then accuses another aristocrat, saying, “I’ve seen an aristocrat. You’ve committed an offense entailing expulsion. You’re not an ascetic, not a Sakyan monastic. You’re excluded from the observance-day ceremony, from the invitation ceremony, and from the legal procedures of the Sangha,” he commits an offense entailing suspension for each statement. A monk sees a brahmin ... A monk sees a merchant ... A monk sees a worker committing

an offense entailing expulsion. If he then accuses another worker, saying, “I’ve seen a worker. You’ve committed an offense entailing expulsion. You’re not an ascetic, not a Sakyan monastic. ...” he commits an offense entailing suspension for each statement.

2. The pretext of name: a monk sees someone whose name is Buddharakkhita ... Dhammarakkhita ... Saṅgharakkhita committing an offense entailing expulsion. If he then accuses another person called Saṅgharakkhita, saying, “I’ve seen Saṅgharakkhita. You’ve committed an offense entailing expulsion. You’re not an ascetic, not a Sakyan monastic. ...” he commits an offense entailing suspension for each statement.
3. The pretext of family: a monk sees someone whose family name is Gotama ... Moggallāna ... Kaccāyana ... Vāsiṭṭha committing an offense entailing expulsion. If he then accuses another person called Vāsiṭṭha, saying, “I’ve seen Vāsiṭṭha. You’ve committed an offense entailing expulsion. You’re not an ascetic, not a Sakyan monastic. ...” he commits an offense entailing suspension for each statement.
4. The pretext of characteristic: a monk sees someone tall ... short ... dark-skinned ... light-skinned committing an offense entailing expulsion. If he then accuses another light-skinned person, saying, “I’ve seen a light-skinned person. You’ve committed an offense entailing expulsion. You’re not an ascetic, not a Sakyan monastic. ...” he commits an offense entailing suspension for each statement.
5. The pretext of offense: a monk sees someone committing a light offense. If he then accuses him of an offense entailing expulsion, saying, “You’re not an ascetic, not a Sakyan monastic. ...” he commits an offense entailing suspension for each statement.

6. The pretext of almsbowl: a monk sees someone carrying an iron bowl ... a black clay bowl ...¹⁰⁶ an ordinary clay bowl committing an offense entailing expulsion.¹⁰⁷ If he then accuses another person carrying an ordinary clay bowl, saying, “I’ve seen someone carrying an ordinary clay bowl. You’ve committed an offense entailing expulsion. You’re not an ascetic, not a Sakyan monastic. ...” he commits an offense entailing suspension for each statement.
7. The pretext of robe: a monk sees a rag-robe wearer ... wearing robes given by householders committing an offense entailing expulsion. If he then accuses another person wearing robes given by householders, saying, “I’ve seen someone wearing robes given by householders. You’ve committed an offense entailing expulsion. You’re not an ascetic, not a Sakyan monastic. ...” he commits an offense entailing suspension for each statement.
8. The pretext of preceptor: a monk sees a student of so-and-so committing an offense entailing expulsion. If he then accuses another student of that person, saying, “I’ve seen the student of so-and-so. You’ve committed an offense entailing expulsion. You’re not an ascetic, not a Sakyan monastic. ...” he commits an offense entailing suspension for each statement.
9. The pretext of teacher: a monk sees a pupil of so-and-so committing an offense entailing expulsion. If he then accuses another pupil of that person, saying, “I’ve seen the pupil of so-and-so. You’ve committed an offense entailing expulsion.

106. Sp 1.400: *Sāṭakapattoti lohapattasadiṣo susaṇṭhāno succhavi siniddho bhamaravaṇṇo mattikāpatto vuccati*, “*Sāṭakapatta*: what is meant is a clay bowl like an iron bowl, which is well-formed, has a nice and glossy surface, and has the color of a bee.” Thig 13.1:1.1: *Kālakā bhamaravaṇṇasādisā*, “Black like the color of a bee.” It seems plausible that this kind of bowl was made of the ceramic that is now known among archeologists as “Northern Black Polished Ware”.

107. Sp 1.400: *Sumbhakapattoti pakatimattikāpatto*, “*Sumbhakapatta*: an ordinary clay bowl.”

You're not an ascetic, not a Sakyan monastic. ..." he commits an offense entailing suspension for each statement.

10. The pretext of dwelling: a monk sees one who dwells in such-and-such a dwelling committing an offense entailing expulsion. If he then accuses someone else who dwells in that dwelling, saying, "I've seen one who dwells in such-and-such a dwelling. You've committed an offense entailing expulsion. You're not an ascetic, not a Sakyan monastic. You're excluded from the observance-day ceremony, from the invitation ceremony, and from the legal procedures of the Sangha," he commits an offense entailing suspension for each statement.

With an offense entailing expulsion: with one of the four.

Charges: accuses him or has him accused.

To make him leave the monastic life: to make him leave the monkhood, leave the state of a monastic, leave his morality, leave the virtue of monasticism.

And then after some time: the moment, the instant, the second after he has laid the charge.

He is questioned: he is questioned about the grounds of his charge.

Not: he is not spoken to by anyone.

The legal issue: there are four kinds of legal issues: legal issues arising from disputes, legal issues arising from accusations, legal issues arising from offenses, legal issues arising from business.

Was used as a pretext: he has used a certain pretext among those listed above.

And he admits to his ill will: "What I said was empty," "What I said was false," "What I said was unreal," "I said it without knowing."

He commits an offense entailing suspension: ... Therefore, too, it is called "an offense entailing suspension."

Permutations

Doing the accusing oneself

A monk sees a second monk committing an offense entailing suspension, and the first monk regards it as an offense entailing suspension. If he then accuses him of an offense entailing expulsion, saying, “You’re not an ascetic, not a Sakyan monastic. You’re excluded from the observance-day ceremony, from the invitation ceremony, and from the legal procedures of the Sangha,” thus using an unrelated offense as a pretext, he commits an offense entailing suspension for each statement. 3.1.1

A monk sees a second monk committing an offense entailing suspension, but the first monk regards it as a serious offense ... but the first monk regards it as an offense entailing confession ... but the first monk regards it as an offense entailing acknowledgment ... but the first monk regards it as an offense of wrong conduct ... but the first monk regards it as an offense of wrong speech. If he then accuses him of an offense entailing expulsion, saying, “You’re not a monastic ...” thus using an unrelated offense as a pretext, he commits an offense entailing suspension for each statement. 3.1.6

A monk sees a second monk committing a serious offense, and the first monk regards it as a serious offense ... but the first monk regards it as an offense entailing confession ... but the first monk regards it as an offense entailing acknowledgment ... but the first monk regards it as an offense of wrong conduct ... but the first monk regards it as an offense of wrong speech ... but the first monk regards it as an offense entailing suspension. If he then accuses him of an offense entailing expulsion, saying, “You’re not a monastic ...” thus using an unrelated offense as a pretext, he commits an offense entailing suspension for each statement. 3.1.14

A monk sees a second monk committing an offense entailing confession ... an offense entailing acknowledgment ... an offense of wrong conduct ... an offense of wrong speech, and the first monk regards it as an offense of wrong speech ... but the first monk regards it as an offense entailing suspension ... but the first monk 3.1.23

regards it as a serious offense ... but the first monk regards it as an offense entailing confession ... but the first monk regards it as an offense entailing acknowledgment ... but the first monk regards it as an offense of wrong conduct. If he then accuses him of an offense entailing expulsion, saying, “You’re not an ascetic, not a Sakyan monastic. You’re excluded from the observance-day ceremony, from the invitation ceremony, and from the legal procedures of the Sangha,” thus using an unrelated offense as a pretext, he commits an offense entailing suspension for each statement.

The permutation series is to be linked by doing the items one by one.

Getting someone else to do the accusing

- 3.2.1 A monk sees a second monk committing an offense entailing suspension and the first monk regards it as an offense entailing suspension. If he then has him accused of an offense entailing expulsion, saying, “You’re not a monastic ...” thus using an unrelated offense as a pretext, he commits an offense entailing suspension for each statement.
- 3.2.5 A monk sees a second monk committing an offense entailing suspension, but the first monk regards it as a serious offense ... but the first monk regards it as an offense entailing confession ... but the first monk regards it as an offense entailing acknowledgment ... but the first monk regards it as an offense of wrong conduct ... but the first monk regards it as an offense of wrong speech. If he then has him accused of an offense entailing expulsion, saying, “You’re not a monastic ...” thus using an unrelated offense as a pretext, he commits an offense entailing suspension for each statement.
- 3.2.13 A monk sees a second monk committing a serious offense, and the first monk regards it as a serious offense ... but the first monk regards it as an offense entailing confession ... but the first monk regards it as an offense entailing acknowledgment ... but the first monk regards it as an offense of wrong conduct ... but the first monk regards it as an offense of wrong speech ... but the first monk regards it as an offense entailing suspension. If he then has

him accused of an offense entailing expulsion, saying, “You’re not a monastic ...” thus using an unrelated offense as a pretext, he commits an offense entailing suspension for each statement.

A monk sees a second monk committing an offense entailing confession ... an offense entailing acknowledgment ... an offense of wrong conduct ... an offense of wrong speech, and the first monk regards it as an offense of wrong speech ... but the first monk regards it as an offense entailing suspension ... but the first monk regards it as a serious offense ... but the first monk regards it as an offense entailing confession ... but the first monk regards it as an offense entailing acknowledgment ... but the first monk regards it as an offense of wrong conduct. If he then has him accused of an offense entailing expulsion, saying, “You’re not an ascetic, not a Sakyan monastic. You’re excluded from the observance-day ceremony, from the invitation ceremony, and from the legal procedures of the Sangha,” thus using an unrelated offense as a pretext, he commits an offense entailing suspension for each statement. 3.2.22

Non-offenses

There is no offense: if he accuses or has someone accused in accordance with his own perception; if he is insane; if he is the first offender. 3.3.1

The training rule on a (unrelated) pretext, the ninth, is finished.

The training rule on schism in the Sangha

Saṅghabheda

Origin story

- 1.1.1 At one time when the Buddha was staying at Rājagaha in the Bamboo Grove, Devadatta went to Kokālika, Kaṭamodakatissaka, Khaṇḍadeviyā-putta, and Samuddadatta. He said to them, “Let’s cause a schism in the Sangha of the ascetic Gotama. Let’s break its authority.”¹⁰⁸
- 1.1.4 Kokālika said to Devadatta, “The ascetic Gotama is powerful and mighty. How can we do this?”
- 1.1.7 “Well, let’s go to the ascetic Gotama and request five things: ‘In many ways, Sir, you praise fewness of wishes, contentment, self-effacement, ascetic practices, being inspiring, the reduction in things, and being energetic. And there are five things that lead to just that: It would be good, Sir,
1. if the monks stayed in the wilderness for life, and whoever stayed near an inhabited area would commit an offense
 2. if they ate only almsfood for life, and whoever accepted an invitational meal would commit an offense
 3. if they were rag-robe wearers for life, and whoever accepted robe-cloth from a householder would commit an offense
 4. if they lived at the foot of a tree for life, and whoever took shelter would commit an offense
 5. if they didn’t eat fish or meat for life, and whoever did would commit an offense.’

108. “Break its authority” renders *cakkabheda*. Sp 1.410: *Cakkabhedāyāti āṇābhedāya*, “*Cakkabhedāya*: by breaking the authority.” Vjb 4.343: *Cakkabhedanti sāsanabhedam*, “*Cakkabheda*: a break in the instruction.” The break in authority is presumably both from the Buddha and the Sangha. Although the Buddha was the only authority in laying down rules, the Sangha was autonomous in its decision making. For practical purposes, it was the Sangha that Devadatta was breaking with.

The ascetic Gotama won't allow this. We'll then be able to win people over with these five points." 1.1.21

Kokālika said, "It might be possible to cause a schism in the Sangha with these five points, for people have confidence in austerity." 1.1.23

Devadatta and his followers then went to the Buddha, bowed, and sat down, and Devadatta made his request. The Buddha replied, "No, Devadatta. Those who wish may stay in the wilderness, and those who wish may live near inhabited areas. Those who wish may eat only almsfood, and those who wish may accept invitational meals. Those who wish may be rag-robe wearers, and those who wish may accept robe-cloth from householders. I have allowed the foot of a tree as resting place for eight months of the year, as well as fish and meat that are pure in three respects: one hasn't seen, heard, or suspected that the animal was specifically killed to feed a monastic." 1.2.1

Devadatta thought, "The Buddha doesn't allow the five points." Glad and elated, he got up from his seat, bowed down, circumambulated the Buddha with his right side toward him, and left with his followers. 1.2.16

Devadatta then entered Rājagaha and won people over with the five points, saying, "The ascetic Gotama doesn't agree to them, but we practice in accordance with them." 1.2.18

The foolish people with little faith and confidence said, "These Sakyān monastics are practicing asceticism and living with the aim of self-effacement. But the ascetic Gotama is extravagant and has chosen a life of indulgence." But the wise people who had faith and confidence complained and criticized Devadatta, "How can Devadatta pursue schism in the Sangha of the Buddha? How can he break its authority?"¹⁰⁹ 1.3.1

The monks heard the criticism of those people, and the monks of few desires complained and criticized him in the same way. 1.3.6

109. For the further development of these events, see Kd 17:2.11–4.5.15.

1.3.9 After rebuking Devadatta in many ways, they told the Buddha. Soon afterwards he had the Sangha gathered and questioned Devadatta: “Is it true, Devadatta, that you are doing this?”

1.3.11 “It’s true, Sir.”

1.3.12 The Buddha rebuked him ... “Foolish man, how can you do this? This will affect people’s confidence ...” ... “And, monks, this training rule should be recited like this:

Final ruling

‘If a monk pursues schism in a united Sangha or persists in taking up a legal issue conducive to schism, the monks should correct him like this, “Venerable, don’t pursue schism in the united Sangha or persist in taking up a legal issue conducive to schism. Stay with the Sangha, for a united Sangha—in concord, in harmony, having a joint recitation—is at ease.” If that monk continues as before, the monks should press him up to three times to make him stop. If he then stops, all is well. If he does not stop, he commits an offense entailing suspension.’”

Definitions

A: whoever ...

Monk: ... The monk who has been given the full ordination by a unanimous Sangha through a legal procedure consisting of one motion and three announcements that is irreversible and fit to stand—this sort of monk is meant in this case.

A united Sangha: those belonging to the same Buddhist sect and staying within the same monastery zone.

Pursues schism: thinking, “What can I do to split, separate, and divide them?” he searches for a faction and puts together a group.

A legal issue conducive to schism:¹¹⁰ the eighteen grounds for schism.

110. For these eighteen grounds, see Kd 17:5.2.3.

Taking up: having adopted.

Taking up:¹¹¹ he proclaims.

If he persists in: if he does not stop.

Him: the monk who is pursuing schism in the Sangha.

The monks: other monks, those who see it or hear it. They 2.20
should correct him like this:

“Venerable, don’t pursue schism in the united Sangha or persist 2.21
in taking up a legal issue conducive to schism. Stay with the
Sangha, for a united Sangha—in concord, in harmony, having a
joint recitation—is at ease.”

And they should correct him a second and a third time. If he 2.24
stops, all is well. If he does not stop, he commits an offense of
wrong conduct.

If those who hear about it do not say anything, they commit an 2.28
offense of wrong conduct.

That monk, even if he has to be pulled into the Sangha, should 2.29
be corrected like this:

“Venerable, don’t pursue schism in the united Sangha or persist 2.30
in taking up a legal issue conducive to schism. Stay with the
Sangha, for a united Sangha—in concord, in harmony, having a
joint recitation—is at ease.”

They should correct him a second and a third time. If he stops, 2.33
all is well. If he does not stop, he commits an offense of wrong
conduct.

Should press him: “And, monks, he should be pressed like this. 2.38

A competent and capable monk should inform the Sangha:

‘Please, Venerables, I ask the Sangha to listen. The monk so-and- 2.40
so is pursuing schism in the united Sangha. And he keeps on
doing it. If the Sangha is ready, it should press him to make him
stop. This is the motion.

Please, Venerables, I ask the Sangha to listen. The monk so-and- 2.45
so is pursuing schism in the united Sangha. And he keeps on

111. In the rule “taking up” renders both *samādāya* and *paggayha*. As a consequence, the two terms are here rendered in the same way.

doing it. The Sangha presses him to make him stop. Any monk who approves of pressing him to make him stop should remain silent. Any monk who doesn't approve should speak up.

2.51 For the second time I speak on this matter: ... For the third time I speak on this matter: Please, Venerables, I ask the Sangha to listen. The monk so-and-so is pursuing schism in the united Sangha. And he keeps on doing it. The Sangha presses him to make him stop. Any monk who approves of pressing him to make him stop should remain silent. Any monk who doesn't approve should speak up.

2.59 The Sangha has pressed monk so-and-so to make him stop. The Sangha approves and is therefore silent. I'll remember it thus.”

2.62 After the motion, he commits an offense of wrong conduct.¹¹² After each of the first two announcements, he commits a serious offense. When the last announcement is finished, he commits an offense entailing suspension. For one who commits the offense entailing suspension, the offense of wrong conduct and the serious offenses are annulled.

He commits an offense entailing suspension: ... Therefore, too, it is called “an offense entailing suspension”.

Permutations

3.1.1 If it is a legitimate legal procedure, and he perceives it as such, and he does not stop, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

3.1.2 If it is a legitimate legal procedure, but he is unsure of it, and he does not stop, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

3.1.3 If it is a legitimate legal procedure, but he perceives it as illegitimate, and he does not stop, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

112. The Pali text just says *dukkata*, without specifying that it is an *āpatti*, an offense. Yet just below the text says that the *dukkata* is annulled if you commit the full offense of *saṅghādisesa*. The implication is that *dukkata* should be read as *āpatti dukkaṭassa*, “an offense of wrong conduct”.

If it is an illegitimate legal procedure, but he perceives it as legitimate, he commits an offense of wrong conduct. 3.1.4

If it is an illegitimate legal procedure, but he is unsure of it, he commits an offense of wrong conduct. 3.1.5

If it is an illegitimate legal procedure, and he perceives it as such, he commits an offense of wrong conduct. 3.1.6

Non-offenses

There is no offense: if he has not been pressed; if he stops; if he is insane; if he is deranged; if he is overwhelmed by pain; if he is the first offender. 3.2.1

The training rule on schism in the Sangha, the tenth, is finished.

The training rule on supporting a schism

Bhedānuvattaka

Origin story

- 1.1 At one time the Buddha was staying at Rājagaha in the Bamboo Grove, the squirrel sanctuary. At that time Devadatta was pursuing schism in the Sangha, a break in authority. The monks were saying, “Devadatta speaks contrary to the Teaching and the training. How can he pursue schism in the Sangha?”
- 1.6 But Kokālika, Kaṭamodakatissaka, Khaṇḍadeviyā-putta, and Samuddadatta said to those monks, “No, Venerables, Devadatta speaks in accordance with the Teaching and the training. And he speaks with our consent and approval. He knows about us and speaks for us, and we approve of this.”
- 1.10 The monks of few desires complained and criticized them, “How can these monks support Devadatta’s pursuit of schism in the Sangha?”
- 1.12 They rebuked those monks in many ways and then told the Buddha. Soon afterwards he had the Sangha gathered and questioned the monks: “Is it true, monks, that there are monks who support this?”
- 1.14 “It’s true, Sir.”
- 1.15 The Buddha rebuked them ... “Monks, how can those foolish men support this? This will affect people’s confidence ...” ... “And, monks, this training rule should be recited like this:

Final ruling

“That monk may have one, two, or three monks who side with him and support him, and they may say, “Venerables, don’t correct this monk. He speaks in accordance with the Teaching and the training. And he speaks with our consent and approval. He knows about us and speaks for us, and we approve of this.” The

monks should correct those monks like this, “No, Venerables, this monk speaks contrary to the Teaching and the training. And don’t consent to schism in the Sangha. Stay with the Sangha, for a united Sangha—in concord, in harmony, having a joint recitation—is at ease.” If those monks still continue as before, the monks should press them up to three times to make them stop. If they then stop, all is well. If they do not stop, they commit an offense entailing suspension.”

Definitions

That: that monk who is pursuing schism in the Sangha.

May have monks: may have other monks.

Who side with him: they have the same view, the same belief, the same persuasion as he does.

Who support him: they praise him and take his side.

One, two, or three: there is one, or two, or three. They may say, “Venerables, don’t correct this monk. He speaks in accordance with the Teaching and the training. And he speaks with our consent and approval. He knows about us and speaks for us, and we approve of this.”

Those monks: those monks who side with him.

The monks: other monks, those who see it or hear about it. They 2.16
should correct them like this:

“No, Venerables, this monk speaks contrary to the Teaching and 2.17
the training. And don’t consent to schism in the Sangha. Stay
with the Sangha, for a united Sangha—in concord, in harmony,
having a joint recitation—is at ease.”

And they should correct them a second and a third time. If they 2.22
stop, all is well. If they do not stop, they commit an offense of
wrong conduct. If those who hear about it do not say anything,
they commit an offense of wrong conduct.

Those monks, even if they have to be pulled into the Sangha, 2.27
should be corrected like this:

- 2.28 “No, Venerables, this monk speaks contrary to the Teaching and the training. And don’t consent to schism in the Sangha. Stay with the Sangha, for a united Sangha—in concord, in harmony, having a joint recitation—is at ease.”
- 2.33 They should correct them a second and a third time. If they stop, all is well. If they do not stop, they commit an offense of wrong conduct.
- 2.38 **Should press them:** “And, monks, they should be pressed like this. A competent and capable monk should inform the Sangha:
- 2.40 ‘Please, Venerables, I ask the Sangha to listen. Monks so-and-so and so-and-so are siding with and supporting monk so-and-so who is pursuing schism in the Sangha. And they keep on doing it. If the Sangha is ready, it should press them to make them stop. This is the motion.
- 2.45 Please, Venerables, I ask the Sangha to listen. Monks so-and-so and so-and-so are siding with and supporting monk so-and-so who is pursuing schism in the Sangha. And they keep on doing it. The Sangha presses them to make them stop. Any monk who approves of pressing them to make them stop should remain silent. Any monk who doesn’t approve should speak up.
- 2.51 For the second time I speak on this matter: ... For the third time I speak on this matter: Please, Venerables, I ask the Sangha to listen. Monks so-and-so and so-and-so are siding with and supporting monk so-and-so who is pursuing schism in the Sangha. And they keep on doing it. The Sangha presses them to make them stop. Any monk who approves of pressing them to make them stop should remain silent. Any monk who doesn’t approve should speak up.
- 2.59 The Sangha has pressed monks so-and-so and so-and-so to make them stop. The Sangha approves and is therefore silent. I’ll remember it thus.’”

After the motion, they commit an offense of wrong conduct.¹¹³ 2.62

After each of the first two announcements, they commit a serious offense. When the last announcement is finished, they commit an offense entailing suspension. For those who commit the offense entailing suspension, the offense of wrong conduct and the serious offenses are annulled. Two or three may be pressed together, but not more than that.

They commit an offense entailing suspension: ... Therefore, too, it is called “an offense entailing suspension”.

Permutations

If it is a legitimate legal procedure, and they perceive it as such, and they do not stop, they commit an offense entailing suspension. 3.1.1

If it is a legitimate legal procedure, but they are unsure of it, and they do not stop, they commit an offense entailing suspension. 3.1.2

If it is a legitimate legal procedure, but they perceive it as illegitimate, and they do not stop, they commit an offense entailing suspension. 3.1.3

If it is an illegitimate legal procedure, but they perceive it as legitimate, they commit an offense of wrong conduct. 3.1.4

If it is an illegitimate legal procedure, but they are unsure of it, they commit an offense of wrong conduct. 3.1.5

If it is an illegitimate legal procedure, and they perceive it as such, they commit an offense of wrong conduct. 3.1.6

Non-offenses

There is no offense: if they have not been pressed; if they stop; if they are insane; if they are deranged; if they are overwhelmed by pain; if they are the first offenders. 3.2.1

The training rule on supporting a schism, the eleventh, is finished.

113. The Pali text just says *dukkāṭa*, without specifying that it is an *āpatti*, an offense. Yet just below the text says that the *dukkāṭa* is annulled if you commit the full offense of *saṅghādisesa*. The implication is that *dukkāṭa* should be read as *āpatti dukkaṭassa*, “an offense of wrong conduct”.

The training rule on being difficult to correct

Dubbaca

Origin story

- 1.1 At one time when the Buddha was staying at Kosambi in Ghosita's Monastery, Venerable Channa was misbehaving. The monks would tell him, "Don't do that; it's not allowable," and he would reply, "Who are you to correct me? I should correct you! The Buddha is mine; the Teaching is mine. The Master realized the Truth because of me. Just as grass, sticks, and fallen leaves are whirled up by a strong wind all at once, just as various water plants are whirled up by a mountain stream all at once, so too have you—after going forth with various names, various families, various castes, various households—been lifted up all at once. So, who are you to correct me? I should correct you! The Buddha is mine; the Teaching is mine. The Master realized the Truth because of me."¹¹⁴
- 1.17 The monks of few desires complained and criticized him, "How can Venerable Channa make himself incorrigible when he's legitimately corrected by the monks?"
- 1.19 They rebuked Channa in many ways and then told the Buddha. Soon afterwards he had the Sangha gathered and questioned Channa: "Is it true, Channa, that you do this?"
- 1.21 "It's true, Sir."
- 1.22 The Buddha rebuked him ... "Foolish man, how can you do this? This will affect people's confidence ..." ... "And, monks, this training rule should be recited like this:

Final ruling

'If a monk is difficult to correct, and he makes himself incorrigible when legitimately corrected by the monks concerning

114. For the further development of these events, see Kd 11:25.1.1–31.1.219.

the training rules that are recited, saying, “Venerables, don’t say anything to me, either good or bad, and I won’t say anything to you, either good or bad. Please refrain from correcting me,” then the monks should correct him like this: “Be easy to correct, Venerable, not incorrigible. And please give legitimate correction to the monks, and the monks will do the same to you. For it’s in this way that the Buddha’s community has grown, that is, through mutual correction and mutual clearing of offenses.” If that monk continues as before, the monks should press him up to three times to make him stop. If he then stops, all is well. If he does not stop, he commits an offense entailing suspension.”

Definitions

If a monk is difficult to correct: if he is hard to correct, endowed with qualities that make him hard to correct, resistant, not receiving instructions respectfully.

Concerning the training rules that are recited: concerning the training rules of the Monastic Code.

The monks: other monks.

Legitimately: the training rules laid down by the Buddha— 2.8
this is called “legitimately”. When corrected in regard to this, he makes himself incorrigible, saying, “Venerables, don’t say anything to me, either good or bad, and I won’t say anything to you, either good or bad. Please refrain from correcting me.”

Him: the monk who is difficult to correct.

The monks: other monks, those who see it or hear about it. They 2.14
should correct him like this:

“Be easy to correct, Venerable, not incorrigible. And please give 2.15
legitimate correction to the monks, and the monks will do the same to you. For it’s in this way that the Buddha’s community has grown, that is, through mutual correction and mutual clearing of offenses.”

And they should correct him a second and a third time. If he 2.19
stops, all is well. If he does not stop, he commits an offense of

- wrong conduct. If those who hear about it do not say anything, they commit an offense of wrong conduct.
- 2.24 That monk, even if he has to be pulled into the Sangha, should be corrected like this:
- 2.25 “Be easy to correct, Venerable, not incorrigible. And please give legitimate correction to the monks, and the monks will do the same to you. For it’s in this way that the Buddha’s community has grown, that is, through mutual correction and mutual clearing of offenses.”
- 2.27 They should correct him a second and a third time. If he stops, all is well. If he does not stop, he commits an offense of wrong conduct.
- 2.32 **Should press him:** “And, monks, he should be pressed like this. A competent and capable monk should inform the Sangha:
- 2.34 ‘Please, Venerables, I ask the Sangha to listen. The monk so-and-so makes himself incorrigible when legitimately corrected by the monks. And he keeps on doing it. If the Sangha is ready, it should press him to make him stop. This is the motion.
- 2.39 Please, Venerables, I ask the Sangha to listen. The monk so-and-so makes himself incorrigible when legitimately corrected by the monks. And he keeps on doing it. The Sangha presses him to make him stop. Any monk who approves of pressing him to make him stop should remain silent. Any monk who doesn’t approve should speak up.
- 2.45 For the second time I speak on this matter: ... For the third time I speak on this matter: Please, Venerables, I ask the Sangha to listen. The monk so-and-so makes himself incorrigible when legitimately corrected by the monks. And he keeps on doing it. The Sangha presses him to make him stop. Any monk who approves of pressing him to make him stop should remain silent. Any monk who doesn’t approve should speak up.
- 2.53 The Sangha has pressed monk so-and-so to make him stop. The Sangha approves and is therefore silent. I’ll remember it thus.”

After the motion, he commits an offense of wrong conduct.¹¹⁵ 2.56

After each of the first two announcements, he commits a serious offense. When the last announcement is finished, he commits an offense entailing suspension. For one who commits the offense entailing suspension, the offense of wrong conduct and the serious offenses are annulled.

He commits an offense entailing suspension: ... Therefore, too, it is called “an offense entailing suspension”.

Permutations

If it is a legitimate legal procedure, and he perceives it as such, but he does not stop, he commits an offense entailing suspension. 3.1.1

If it is a legitimate legal procedure, but he is unsure of it, and he does not stop, he commits an offense entailing suspension. 3.1.2

If it is a legitimate legal procedure, but he perceives it as illegitimate, and he does not stop, he commits an offense entailing suspension. 3.1.3

If it is an illegitimate legal procedure, but he perceives it as legitimate, he commits an offense of wrong conduct. 3.1.4

If it is an illegitimate legal procedure, but he is unsure of it, he commits an offense of wrong conduct. 3.1.5

If it is an illegitimate legal procedure, and he perceives it as such, he commits an offense of wrong conduct. 3.1.6

Non-offenses

There is no offense: if he has not been pressed; if he stops; if he is insane; if he is the first offender. 3.2.1

The training rule on being difficult to correct, the twelfth, is finished.

115. The Pali text just says *dukkāṭa*, without specifying that it is an *āpatti*, an offense. Yet just below the text says that the *dukkāṭa* is annulled if you commit the full offense of *saṅghādisesa*. The implication is that *dukkāṭa* should be read as *āpatti dukkaṭassa*, “an offense of wrong conduct”.

The training rule on corrupters of families

Kuladūsaka

Origin story

- 1.1.1 At one time the Buddha was staying at Sāvattthī in the Jeta Grove, Anāthapiṇḍika's Monastery. At that time the bad and shameless monks Assaji and Punabbasuka were staying at Kīṭāgiri. They were misbehaving in many ways.
- 1.1.4 They planted flowering trees, watered and plucked them, and then tied the flowers together. They made the flowers into garlands, garlands with stalks on one side and garlands with stalks on both sides. They made flower arrangements, wreaths, ornaments for the head, ornaments for the ears, and ornaments for the chest. And they had others do the same. They then took these things, or sent them, to the women, the daughters, the girls, the daughters-in-law, and the female slaves of good families.
- 1.1.8 They ate from the same plates as these women and drank from the same vessels. They sat on the same seats as them, and they lay down on the same beds, on the same sheets, under the same covers, and both on the same sheets and under the same covers. They ate at the wrong time, drank alcohol, and wore garlands, perfumes, and cosmetics. They danced, sang, played instruments, and performed. While the women were dancing, singing, playing instruments, and performing, so would they.
- 1.2.1 They played various games: eight-row checkers, ten-row checkers, imaginary checkers, hopscotch, pick-up-sticks, board games, tip-cat, painting with the hand, dice, leaf flutes, toy plows, somersaults, pinwheels, toy measures, toy carriages, toy bows, guessing from syllables, thought guessing, mimicking deformities.
- 1.2.2 They trained in elephant riding, in horsemanship, in carriage riding, in archery, in swordsmanship. And they ran in front of elephants, horses, and carriages, and they ran backward and forward.

They whistled, clapped their hands, wrestled, and boxed. They spread their outer robe on a stage and said to the dancing girls, “Dance here, Sister,” and they made gestures of approval. And they misbehaved in a variety of ways.

Just then a monk who had completed the rainy-season residence 1.3.1
in Kāsī was on his way to visit the Buddha at Sāvattthī when he arrived at Kīṭāgiri. In the morning he robed up, took his bowl and robe, and entered Kīṭāgiri to collect almsfood. He was pleasing in his conduct: in going out and coming back, in looking ahead and looking aside, in bending and stretching his arms. His eyes were lowered, and he was perfect in deportment. When people saw him, they said, “Who’s this, acting like a moron and always frowning? Who’s gonna give almsfood to him? Almsfood should be given to our Venerables Assaji and Punabbasuka, for they are gentle, congenial, pleasant to speak with, greeting one with a smile, welcoming, friendly, open, the first to speak.”

A certain lay follower saw that monk walking for alms in Kīṭā- 1.3.5
giri. He approached him, bowed, and said, “Venerable, have you received any almsfood?”

“No, I haven’t.” 1.3.7

“Come, let’s go to my house.” 1.3.8

He took that monk to his house and gave him a meal. He then 1.4.1
said, “Where are you going, Venerable?”

“I’m going to Sāvattthī to see the Buddha.” 1.4.3

“Well then, would you please pay respect at the Buddha’s feet 1.4.4
in my name and say, ‘Sir, the monastery at Kīṭāgiri has been corrupted. The bad and shameless monks Assaji and Punabbasuka are staying there. And they’re misbehaving in a many ways. They plant flowering trees, water them ... And they misbehave in a variety of ways. Those who previously had faith and confidence have now lost it, and there’s no longer any support for the Sangha. The good monks have left and the bad monks are staying on. Sir, please send monks to stay at the monastery at Kīṭāgiri.’”

- 1.5.1 The monk consented, got up, and set out for Sāvattthī. When he eventually arrived, he went to the Buddha in Anāthapiṇḍika's Monastery. He bowed to the Buddha and sat down. Since it is the custom for Buddhas to greet newly arrived monks, the Buddha said to him, "I hope you're keeping well, monk, I hope you're getting by? I hope you're not tired from traveling? And where have you come from?"
- 1.5.8 "I'm keeping well, Sir, I'm getting by. I'm not tired from traveling." He then told the Buddha all that had happened at Kīṭāgiri,
- 1.5.19 adding, "That's where I've come from, Sir."
- 1.6.1 Soon afterwards the Buddha had the Sangha gathered and questioned the monks: "Is it true, monks, that the bad and shameless monks Assaji and Punabbasuka are staying at Kīṭāgiri and misbehaving in like this? And is it true that those people who previously had faith and confidence have now lost it, that there's no longer any support for the Sangha, and that the good monks have left and the bad monks are staying on?"
- 1.6.7 "It's true, Sir."
- 1.6.8 The Buddha rebuked them ... "Monks, how can those foolish men misbehave in this way?
- 1.6.19 This will affect people's confidence ... " He then gave a teaching and addressed Sāriputta and Moggallāna: "Go to Kīṭāgiri and do a legal procedure of banishing the monks Assaji and Punabbasuka. They're your students."
- 1.6.26 "Sir, how can we do a procedure of banishing these monks from Kīṭāgiri? They're temperamental and harsh."
- 1.6.27 "Well then, take many monks."
- 1.6.28 "Yes, sir."
- 1.7.1 "And, monks, this is how it should be done. First you should accuse the monks Assaji and Punabbasuka. They should then be reminded of what they have done, before they are charged with an offense. A competent and capable monk should then inform the Sangha:

‘Please, Venerables, I ask the Sangha to listen. These monks, 1.7.5
Assaji and Punabbasuka, are corrupters of families and badly behaved. Their bad behavior has been seen and heard about, and the families corrupted by them have been seen and heard about. If the Sangha is ready, it should do a legal procedure of banishing them, prohibiting the monks Assaji and Punabbasuka from staying at Kīṭāgiri. This is the motion.

Please, Venerables, I ask the Sangha to listen. These monks, 1.7.9
Assaji and Punabbasuka, are corrupters of families and badly behaved. Their bad behavior has been seen and heard about, and the families corrupted by them have been seen and heard about. The Sangha does a legal procedure of banishing them, prohibiting the monks Assaji and Punabbasuka from staying at Kīṭāgiri. Any monk who approves of doing this legal procedure should remain silent. Any monk who doesn’t approve should speak up.

For the second time ... For the third time I speak on this matter. 1.7.14
Please, Venerables, I ask the Sangha to listen. ... should speak up.

The Sangha has done a legal procedure of banishing them, prohibiting the monks Assaji and Punabbasuka from staying at Kīṭāgiri. The Sangha approves and is therefore silent. I’ll remember it thus.’” 1.7.16

Soon afterwards a sangha of monks, headed by Sāriputta and 1.8.1
Moggallāna, went to Kīṭāgiri and did the procedure of banishing Assaji and Punabbasuka, prohibiting them from staying at Kīṭāgiri. After the Sangha had done the procedure, those monks did not conduct themselves properly or suitably so as to deserve to be released, nor did they ask the monks for forgiveness. Instead they abused and reviled them, and they slandered them as acting from favoritism, ill will, confusion, and fear. And they left and they disrobed.¹¹⁶ The monks of few desires complained and criticized

116. The meaning of the first of these phrases, *sammā vattati*, is straightforward, but the last two, *lomam pātetī* and *netthāram vattati*, are more difficult. Sp 1.435: *Na lomam pātentitī anulomapaṭipadam appaṭipajjanatāya na pannalomā honti. Na netthāram vattantitī attano nittharaṇamaggaṃ na paṭipajjanti*, “*Na lomam pātentī*: because of their non-practicing in conformity with the path,

them, “How can these monks act in this way when the Sangha has done a legal procedure of banishing them?”

- 1.8.5 They rebuked the monks Assaji and Punabbasuka in many ways and then told the Buddha. Soon afterwards he had the Sangha gathered and questioned the monks: “Is it true, monks, that the monks Assaji and Punabbasuka acted in this way?” “It’s true, Sir.”
- 1.8.8 The Buddha rebuked them ... “And, monks, this training rule should be recited like this:

Final ruling

‘If a monk who lives supported by a village or town is a corrupter of families and badly behaved, and his bad behavior has been seen and heard about, and the families corrupted by him have been seen and heard about, then the monks should correct him like this: “Venerable, you’re a corrupter of families and badly behaved. Your bad behavior has been seen and heard about, and the families corrupted by you have been seen and heard about. Leave this monastery; you’ve stayed here long enough.” If he replies, “You’re acting out of favoritism, ill will, confusion, and fear. Because of this sort of offense, you only banish some, but not others,” the monks should correct him like this: “No, Venerable, the monks are not acting out of favoritism, ill will, confusion, and fear. Venerable, you’re a corrupter of families and badly behaved. Your bad behavior has been seen and heard about, and the families corrupted by you have been seen and heard about. Leave this monastery; you’ve stayed here long enough.” If that monk continues as before, the monks should press him up to three times to make him stop. If he then stops, all is well. If he does not stop, he commits an offense entailing suspension.’”

their bodily hairs are not flat. *Na netthāraṃ vattanti*: they are not practicing the path for their own getting out (of the offense).” My rendering attempts to capture the meaning in a non-literal way. For the further development of these events, see Kd 11:13.1.1–16.1.28.

Definitions

A monk ... a village or town: a village and a town and a city are included in just a village and a town.

Lives supported by: robe-cloth, almsfood, dwellings, and medicinal supplies can be obtained in that place.

A family: there are four kinds of families: the aristocratic family, the brahmin family, the merchant family, the worker family.

A corrupter of families: he corrupts families by means of flowers, fruit, bath powder, soap, tooth cleaners, bamboo, medical treatment, or by taking messages on foot.¹¹⁷

Badly behaved: he plants flowering trees and has it done; he waters them and has it done; he plucks them and has it done; he ties the flowers together and has it done.

Has been seen and heard about: those who are present see it; those who are absent hear about it.

The families corrupted by him: they have lost their faith because of him; they have lost their confidence because of him.

Have been seen and heard about: those who are present see it; those who are absent hear about it.

Him: that monk who is a corrupter of families.

The monks: other monks, those who see it or hear about it. They should correct him like this: “Venerable, you’re a corrupter of families and badly behaved. Your bad behavior has been seen and heard about, and the families corrupted by you have been seen and heard about. Leave this monastery; you’ve stayed here long enough.” If he replies, “You’re acting out of favoritism, ill will, confusion, and fear. Because of this sort of offense, you only banish some, but not others.”

Him: that monk who is having a legal procedure done against him.

The monks: other monks, those who see it or hear about it. They should correct him like this: “No, Venerable, the monks are 2.26

117. For the rendering of *mattika* and *cunṇa* as respectively “soap” and “bath powder”, see Appendix of Technical Terms.

- not acting out of favoritism, ill will, confusion, and fear. Venerable, you're a corrupter of families and badly behaved. Your bad behavior has been seen and heard about, and the families corrupted by you have been seen and heard about. Leave this monastery; you've stayed here long enough." And they should correct him a second and a third time.
- 2.31 If he stops, all is well. If he does not stop, he commits an offense of wrong conduct. If those who hear about it do not say anything, they commit an offense of wrong conduct.
- 2.34 That monk, even if he has to be pulled into the Sangha, should be corrected like this: "No, Venerable, the monks are not acting out of favoritism, ill will, confusion, and fear. Venerable, you're a corrupter of families and badly behaved. Your bad behavior has been seen and heard about, and the families corrupted by you have been seen and heard about. Leave this monastery; you've stayed here long enough." They should correct him a second and a third time. If he stops, all is well. If he does not stop, he commits an offense of wrong conduct.
- 2.42 **Should press him:** "And, monks, he should be pressed like this. A competent and capable monk should inform the Sangha:
- 2.44 'Please, Venerables, I ask the Sangha to listen. The monk so-and-so, who has had a legal procedure of banishment done against himself, is slandering the monks as acting out of favoritism, ill will, confusion, and fear. And he keeps on doing it. If the Sangha is ready, it should press him to make him stop. This is the motion.
- 2.49 Please, Venerables, I ask the Sangha to listen. The monk so-and-so, who has had a legal procedure of banishment done against himself, is slandering the monks as acting out of favoritism, ill will, confusion, and fear. And he keeps on doing it. The Sangha presses him to make him stop. Any monk who approves of pressing him to make him stop should remain silent. Any monk who doesn't approve should speak up.

For the second time I speak on this matter ... For the third time 2.54
I speak on this matter ...

The Sangha has pressed monk so-and-so to make him stop. The 2.56
Sangha approves and is therefore silent. I'll remember it thus."

After the motion, he commits an offense of wrong conduct.¹¹⁸ 2.58

After each of the first two announcements, he commits a serious offense. When the last announcement is finished, he commits an offense entailing suspension. For one who commits the offense entailing suspension, the offense of wrong conduct and the serious offenses are annulled.

He commits an offense entailing suspension: only the Sangha gives probation for that offense, sends back to the beginning, gives the trial period, and rehabilitates—not several monks, not an individual. Therefore it is called "an offense entailing suspension". This is the name and designation of this class of offense. Therefore, too, it is called "an offense entailing suspension".

Permutations

If it is a legitimate legal procedure, and he perceives it as such, and 3.1.1
he does not stop, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

If it is a legitimate legal procedure, but he is unsure of it, and he 3.1.2
does not stop, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

If it is a legitimate legal procedure, but he perceives it as ille- 3.1.3
gitimate, and he does not stop, he commits an offense entailing suspension.

If it is an illegitimate legal procedure, but he perceives it as legit- 3.1.4
imate, he commits an offense of wrong conduct.

If it is an illegitimate legal procedure, but he is unsure of it, he 3.1.5
commits an offense of wrong conduct.

118. The Pali just says *dukkāṭa*, without specifying that it is an *āpatti*, an offense. Yet just below the text says that the *dukkāṭa* is annulled if you commit the full offense of *saṅghādisesa*. The implication is that *dukkāṭa* should be read as *āpatti dukkaṭassa*, "an offense of wrong conduct".

- 3.1.6 If it is an illegitimate legal procedure, and he perceives it as such, he commits an offense of wrong conduct.

Non-offenses

- 3.2.1 There is no offense: if he has not been pressed; if he stops; if he is insane; if he is the first offender.

The training rule on corrupters of families, the thirteenth, is finished.

- 3.2.7 “Venerables, the thirteen rules on suspension have been recited, nine being immediate offenses, four after the third announcement. If a monk commits any one of them, he is to undergo probation for the same number of days as he knowingly concealed that offense. When this is completed, he must undertake the trial period for a further six days. When this is completed, he is to be rehabilitated wherever there is a sangha of at least twenty monks. If that monk is rehabilitated by a sangha of even one less than twenty, that monk is not rehabilitated and those monks are at fault. This is the proper procedure.

- 3.2.12 In regard to this I ask you, ‘Are you pure in this?’ A second time I ask, ‘Are you pure in this?’ A third time I ask, ‘Are you pure in this?’ You are pure in this and therefore silent. I’ll remember it thus.”

The group of thirteen is finished.

This is the summary:

- 3.2.18 “Emission, physical contact,
Indecent, and his own needs;
Matchmaking, and a hut,
And a dwelling, groundless.
- 3.2.22 A pretext, and schism,
Those who side with him;
Difficult to correct, and corrupter of families—
The thirteen offenses entailing suspension.”

The chapter on offenses entailing suspension is finished.

Undetermined

The first undetermined training rule

Paṭhamaaniyata

0.5 Venerables, these two undetermined rules come up for recitation.

Origin story

1.1 At one time the Buddha was staying at Sāvattthī in the Jeta Grove, Anāthapiṇḍika's Monastery. At that time Venerable Udāyī was associating with and visiting a number of families in Sāvattthī. On one occasion one of the families that supported him gave their daughter in marriage to the son of another family. Soon afterwards Venerable Udāyī robed up in the morning, took his bowl and robe, and went to the first of those families. When he arrived, he asked where the daughter was, and he was told that she had been given to another family. That family too supported Udāyī. He then went there and again asked where the girl was. They said, "She's sitting in her room." He went up to that girl, and the two of them sat down alone on a private and concealed seat suitable for action. When they were able, they chatted; otherwise he gave her a teaching.¹¹⁹

1.14 At that time Visākhā Migāramātā had many healthy children and grandchildren. As a consequence, she was considered auspicious. At sacrifices, ceremonies, and celebrations people would feed Visākhā first. Just then she had been invited to that family that supported Udāyī. When she arrived, she saw him sitting alone with that girl, and she said to him, "Venerable, it's not appropriate for you to sit alone with a woman on a private and concealed seat suitable for action. You may not be aiming at that act, but it's hard

119. Sp 1.443: *Tattha kālayuttam samullapantoti kālam sallakkhetvā yadā na añño koci samīpena gacchati vā āgacchati vā tadā tadanurūpaṃ* "kacci na ukkaṇṭhasi, na kilamasi, na chātāsī" *tiādikaṃ gehassitaṃ katham kathento*, "When they were able, they chatted': having considered the occasion, whether anyone else was coming or going nearby, they spoke about worldly things, such as, 'I hope you are not yearning, fed up, and craving.'"

to convince people with little confidence.” But Udāyī did not listen. After leaving, Visākhā told the monks what had happened. The monks of few desires complained and criticized him, “How could Venerable Udāyī sit alone with a woman on a private and concealed seat suitable for action?”

After rebuking Udāyī in many ways, they told the Buddha. Soon afterwards he had the Sangha gathered and questioned Udāyī: “Is it true, Udāyī, that you did this?” 1.25

“It’s true, Sir.” 1.27

The Buddha rebuked him ... “Foolish man, how could you do this? This will affect people’s confidence ...” ... “And, monks, this training rule should be recited like this: 1.28

Final ruling

‘If a monk sits alone with a woman on a private and concealed seat suitable for action, and a trustworthy female lay follower sees him and accuses him of an offense entailing expulsion, an offense entailing suspension, or an offense entailing confession, then, if he admits to the sitting, he is to be dealt with according to one of these three or according to what that trustworthy female lay follower has said. This rule is undetermined.’”

Definitions

A: whoever ...

Monk: ... The monk who has been given the full ordination by a unanimous Sangha through a legal procedure consisting of one motion and three announcements that is irreversible and fit to stand—this sort of monk is meant in this case.

A woman: a human female, not a female spirit, not a female ghost, not a female animal; even a girl born that very day, let alone an older one.

With: together.

Alone: just the monk and the woman.

Private: there is private to the eye and there is private to the ear.

Private to the eye: one is unable to see them winking, raising an eyebrow, or nodding.

Private to the ear: one is unable to hear ordinary speech.

Concealed seat: it is concealed by a wall, a screen, a door, a cloth screen, a tree, a pillar, a grain container, or anything else.

Suitable for action: one is able to have sexual intercourse.

Sits: the monk sits down or lies down next to the seated woman.

The woman sits down or lies down next to the seated monk.

Both are seated or both are lying down.

Trustworthy: she has attained the fruit, she has broken through, she has understood the Instruction.

Female lay follower: she has gone for refuge to the Buddha, the Teaching, and the Sangha.

Sees: having seen.

If she accuses him of an offense entailing expulsion, an offense entailing suspension, or an offense entailing confession, then, if he admits to the sitting, he is to be dealt with according to one of these three or according to what that trustworthy female lay follower has said:

2.2.4

If she accuses him like this: “I’ve seen you seated, having sexual intercourse with a woman,” and he admits to that, then he is to be dealt with for the offense. If she accuses him like this: “I’ve seen you seated, having sexual intercourse with a woman,” but he says, “It’s true that I was seated, but I didn’t have sexual intercourse,” then he is to be dealt with for the sitting. If she accuses him like this: “I’ve seen you seated, having sexual intercourse with a woman,” but he says, “I wasn’t seated, but lying down,” then he is to be dealt with for the lying down. If she accuses him like this: “I’ve seen you seated, having sexual intercourse with a woman,” but he says, “I wasn’t seated, but standing,” then he is not to be dealt with.

2.2.22

If she accuses him like this: “I’ve seen you lying down, having sexual intercourse with a woman,” and he admits to that, then he is to be dealt with for the offense. If she accuses him like

this: "I've seen you lying down, having sexual intercourse with a woman," but he says, "It's true that I was lying down, but I didn't have sexual intercourse," then he is to be dealt with for the lying down. If she accuses him like this: "I've seen you lying down, having sexual intercourse with a woman," but he says, "I wasn't lying down, but seated," then he is to be dealt with for the sitting. If she accuses him like this: "I've seen you lying down, having sexual intercourse with a woman," but he says, "I wasn't lying down, but standing," then he is not to be dealt with.

If she accuses him like this: "I've seen you seated, making physical contact with a woman," and he admits to that, then he is to be dealt with for the offense. ... "It's true that I was seated, but I didn't make physical contact," then he is to be dealt with for the sitting. ... "I wasn't seated, but lying down," then he is to be dealt with for the lying down. ... "I wasn't seated, but standing," then he is not to be dealt with. 2.2.40

If she accuses him like this: "I've seen you lying down, making physical contact with a woman," and he admits to that, then he is to be dealt with for the offense. ... "It's true that I was lying down, but I didn't make physical contact," then he is to be dealt with for the lying down. ... "I wasn't lying down, but seated," then he is to be dealt with for the sitting. ... "I wasn't lying down, but standing," then he is not to be dealt with. 2.2.49

If she accuses him like this: "I've seen you seated alone with a woman on a private and concealed seat suitable for action," and he admits to that, then he is to be dealt with for the sitting. ... "I wasn't seated, but lying down," then he is to be dealt with for the lying down. ... "I wasn't seated, but standing," then he is not to be dealt with. 2.2.58

If she accuses him like this: "I've seen you lying down alone with a woman on a private and concealed seat suitable for action," and he admits to that, then he is to be dealt with for the lying down. ... "I wasn't lying down, but seated," then he is to be dealt with 2.2.65

for the sitting. ... “I wasn’t lying down, but standing,” then he is not to be dealt with.

Undetermined: not determined. It is either an offense entailing expulsion, an offense entailing suspension, or an offense entailing confession.

Permutations

- 3.1 If he admits to going, and he admits to sitting, and he admits to an offense, he is to be dealt with for the offense. If he admits to going, but he does not admit to sitting, yet he admits to an offense, he is to be dealt with for the offense. If he admits to going, and he admits to sitting, but he does not admit to an offense, he is to be dealt with for the sitting. If he admits to going, but he does not admit to sitting, nor does he admit to an offense, he is not to be dealt with.
- 3.5 If he does not admit to going, but he admits to sitting, and he admits to an offense, he is to be dealt with for the offense. If he does not admit to going, nor does he admit to sitting, but he admits to an offense, he is to be dealt with for the offense. If he does not admit to going, but he admits to sitting, yet he does not admit to an offense, he is to be dealt with for the sitting. If he does not admit to going, nor does he admit to sitting, nor does he admit to an offense, he is not to be dealt with.

The first undetermined offense is finished.

The second undetermined training rule

Dutiyaaniyata

Origin story

At one time the Buddha was staying at Sāvattthī in the Jeta Grove, 1.1
Anāthapiṇḍika’s Monastery. At this time Venerable Udāyī heard
that the Buddha had prohibited sitting alone with a woman on a
private and concealed seat suitable for action, and so instead he sat
alone in private with the same girl. When they were able, they just
chatted; otherwise he gave her a teaching.

A second time Visākhā had been invited to that family. When 1.3
she arrived, she saw Udāyī sitting alone in private with the same
girl, and she said to Udāyī, “Venerable, it’s not appropriate for you
to sit alone with a woman on a private seat. You may not be aiming
at that act, but it’s hard to convince people with little confidence.”
But Udāyī did not listen. After leaving, Visākhā told the monks
what had happened. The monks of few desires complained and
criticized him, “How could Venerable Udāyī sit alone with a woman
on a private seat?”

After rebuking Udāyī in many ways, they told the Buddha. Soon 1.12
afterwards he had the Sangha gathered and questioned Udāyī: “Is
it true, Udāyī, that you did this?”

“It’s true, Sir.” 1.14

The Buddha rebuked him ... “Foolish man, how could you do 1.15
this? This will affect people’s confidence ...” ... “And, monks, this
training rule should be recited like this:

Final ruling

**‘Although a seat is not concealed, nor suitable for action, it may
be suitable for speaking indecently to a woman. If a monk sits
alone with a woman in private on such a seat, and a trustwor-
thy female lay follower sees him and accuses him of an offense**

entailing suspension or an offense entailing confession, then, if he admits to the sitting, he is to be dealt with according to one of these two or according to what that trustworthy female lay follower has said. This rule too is undetermined.’”

Definitions

Although a seat is not concealed: it is not concealed by a wall, a screen, a door, a cloth screen, a tree, a pillar, a grain container, or anything else.

Nor suitable for action: one is not able to have sexual intercourse.

It may be suitable for speaking indecently to a woman: one is able to speak indecently to a woman.

A: whoever ...

Monk: ... The monk who has been given the full ordination by a unanimous Sangha through a legal procedure consisting of one motion and three announcements that is irreversible and fit to stand—this sort of monk is meant in this case.

On such a seat: on that sort of seat.

A woman: a human female, not a female spirit, not a female ghost, not a female animal. She understands and is capable of discerning bad speech and good speech, what is decent and what is indecent.

With: together.

Alone: just the monk and the woman.

Private: there is private to the eye and there is private to the ear.

Private to the eye: one is unable to see them winking, raising an eyebrow, or nodding.

Private to the ear: one is unable to hear ordinary speech.

Sits: the monk sits down or lies down next to the seated woman. The woman sits down or lies down next to the seated monk. Both are seated or both are lying down.

Trustworthy: she has attained the fruit, she has broken through, she has understood the Instruction.

Female lay follower: she has gone for refuge to the Buddha, the Teaching, and the Sangha.

Sees: having seen.

If she accuses him of an offense entailing suspension or an offense entailing confession, then, if he admits to the sitting, he is to be dealt with according to one of these two or according to what that trustworthy female lay follower has said: If

she accuses him like this: “I’ve seen you seated, making physical contact with a woman,” and he admits to that, then he is to be dealt with for the offense. If she accuses him like this: “I’ve seen you seated, making physical contact with a woman,” but he says, “It’s true that I was seated, but I didn’t make physical contact,” then he is to be dealt with for the sitting. ... “I wasn’t seated, but lying down,” then he is to be dealt with for the lying down. ... “I wasn’t seated, but standing,” then he is not to be dealt with. 2.2.4

If she accuses him like this: “I’ve seen you lying down, making physical contact with a woman,” and he admits to that, then he is to be dealt with for the offense. ... “It’s true that I was lying down, but I didn’t make physical contact,” then he is to be dealt with for the lying down. ... “I wasn’t lying down, but seated,” then he is to be dealt with for the sitting. ... “I wasn’t seated, but standing,” then he is not to be dealt with. 2.2.16

If she accuses him like this: “I’ve heard you speaking indecently to a woman while seated,” and he admits to that, then he is to be dealt with for the offense. If she accuses him like this: “I’ve heard you speaking indecently to a woman while seated,” but he says, “It’s true that I was seated, but I didn’t speak indecently,” then he is to be dealt with for the sitting. ... “I wasn’t seated, but lying down,” then he is to be dealt with for the lying down. ... “I wasn’t seated, but standing,” then he is not to be dealt with. 2.2.25

If she accuses him like this: “I’ve heard you speaking indecently to a woman while lying down,” and he admits to that, then he is to be dealt with for the offense. ... “It’s true that I was lying down, but I didn’t speak indecently,” then he is to be dealt with 2.2.37

for the lying down. ... “I wasn’t lying down, but seated,” then he is to be dealt with for the sitting. ... “I wasn’t lying down, but standing,” then he is not to be dealt with.

2.2.46 If she accuses him like this: “I’ve seen you seated alone with a woman in private,” and he admits to that, then he is to be dealt with for the sitting. ... “I wasn’t seated, but lying down,” then he is to be dealt with for the lying down. ... “I wasn’t seated, but standing,” then he is not to be dealt with.

2.2.53 If she accuses him like this: “I’ve seen you lying down alone with a woman in private,” and he admits to that, then he is to be dealt with for the lying down. ... “I wasn’t lying down, but seated,” then he is to be dealt with for the sitting. ... “I wasn’t lying down, but standing,” then he is not to be dealt with.

This rule too: this is said with reference to the previous undetermined rule.

Undetermined: not determined. It is either an offense entailing suspension or an offense entailing confession.

Permutations

3.1 If he admits to going, and he admits to sitting, and he admits to an offense, he is to be dealt with for the offense. If he admits to going, but he does not admit to sitting, yet he admits to an offense, he is to be dealt with for the offense. If he admits to going, and he admits to sitting, but he does not admit to an offense, he is to be dealt with for the sitting. If he admits to going, but he does not admit to sitting, nor does he admit to an offense, he is not to be dealt with.

3.5 If he does not admit to going, but he admits to sitting, and he admits to an offense, he is to be dealt with for the offense. If he does not admit to going, nor does he admit to sitting, but he admits to an offense, he is to be dealt with for the offense. If he does not admit to going, but he admits to sitting, yet he does not admit to an offense, he is to be dealt with for the sitting. If he does not admit to

going, nor does he admit to sitting, nor does he admit to an offense, he is not to be dealt with.

The second undetermined offense is finished.

“Venerables, the two undetermined rules have been recited. In 3.10
regard to this I ask you, ‘Are you pure in this?’ A second time I ask,
‘Are you pure in this?’ A third time I ask, ‘Are you pure in this?’ You
are pure in this and therefore silent. I’ll remember it thus.”

This is the summary:

“Suitable for action, 3.21
And then not so—
The undetermined offenses have been well laid down,
By the Stable One, the Buddha who is the best.”

The chapter on undetermined offenses is finished.

Colophon

The Translator

Bhikkhu Brahmali was born Normay in 1964. He first became interested in Buddhism and meditation in his early 20s after a visit to Japan. Having completed degrees in engineering and finance, he began his monastic training as an anagarika (keeping the eight precepts) in England at Amaravati and Chithurst Buddhist Monastery.

After hearing teachings from Ajahn Brahm he decided to travel to Australia to train at Bodhinyana Monastery. Bhikkhu Brahmali has lived at Bodhinyana Monastery since 1994, and was ordained as a Bhikkhu, with Ajahn Brahm as his preceptor, in 1996. In 2015 he entered his 20th Rains Retreat as a fully ordained monastic and received the title Maha Thera (Great Elder).

Bhikkhu Brahmali's knowledge of the Pali language and of the Suttas is excellent. Bhikkhu Bodhi, who translated most of the Pali Canon into English for Wisdom Publications, called him one of his major helpers for the 2012 translation of *The Numerical Discourses of the Buddha*. He has also published two essays on Dependent Origination and a book called *The Authenticity of the Early Buddhist Texts* with the Buddhist Publication Society in collaboration with Bhante Sujato.

The monastics of the Buddhist Society of WA (BSWA) often turn to him to clarify Vinaya (monastic discipline) or Sutta questions. They also greatly appreciate his Sutta and Pali classes. Furthermore he has been instrumental in most of the building and

maintenance projects at Bodhinyana Monastery and at the emerging Hermit Hill property in Serpentine.

Creation Process

Translated from the Pali. Primary source was the Mahāsaṅgīti edition, with occasional reference of other Pali editions, especially the Chaṭṭha Saṅgāyana edition and the Pali Text Society edition. I cross-checked with I.B. Horner's English translation, "The Book of the Discipline", as well Bhikkhu Ñāṇatusita's "A Translation and Analysis of the Pātimokkha" and Ajahn Ṭhānissaro's "Buddhist Monastic Code".

The Translation

This is the first complete translation of the Vinaya Piṭaka in English. The aim has been to produce a translation that is easy to read, clear, and accurate, and also modern in vocabulary and style.

About SuttaCentral

SuttaCentral publishes early Buddhist texts. Since 2005 we have provided root texts in Pali, Chinese, Sanskrit, Tibetan, and other languages, parallels between these texts, and translations in many modern languages. Building on the work of generations of scholars, we offer our contribution freely.

SuttaCentral is driven by volunteer contributions, and in addition we employ professional developers. We offer a sponsorship program for high quality translations from the original languages. Financial support for SuttaCentral is handled by the SuttaCentral Development Trust, a charitable trust registered in Australia.

About Bilara

“Bilarā” means “cat” in Pali, and it is the name of our Computer Assisted Translation (CAT) software. Bilara is a web app that enables translators to translate early Buddhist texts into their own language. These translations are published on SuttaCentral with the root text and translation side by side.

About SuttaCentral Editions

The SuttaCentral Editions project makes high quality books from selected Bilara translations. These are published in formats including HTML, EPUB, PDF, and print.

You are welcome to print any of our Editions.