

Standardised Mean

Difference

SMD

-10.42 [-23.21; 2.38]

-9.67 [-20.84; 1.50]

-9.42 [-22.19; 3.35]

-8.35 [-12.16; -4.54]

-7.08 [**-13.21**; **-0.94**]

-6.67 [**-12.25**; **-1.09**]

-6.07 [-7.44; -4.70]

-5.84 [-7.90; -3.78]

-5.36 [**-7.60**; **-3.11**]

-5.34 [-10.23; -0.44]

-5.29 [-10.03; -0.56]

-5.13 [-8.94; -1.33]

-4.74 [-8.80; -0.68]

-4.41 [-7.19; -1.64]

-4.23 [-6.34; -2.12]

-4.21 [-6.32; -2.11]

-4.11 [**-6.14**; **-2.08**]

-4.02 [-6.39; -1.65]

-3.68 [-4.66; -2.70]

-3.57 [-5.60; -1.54]

-3.38 [-4.34; -2.43]

-3.34 [-5.97; -0.71]

-3.33 [-4.50; -2.16]

-1.91 [-2.48; -1.34]

-1.87 [-2.81; -0.93]

-1.85 [-2.43; -1.27]

-1.81 [-2.74; -0.89]

-1.79 [-2.48; -1.10]

-1.78 [-3.05; -0.51]

-1.78 [-2.78; -0.78]

-1.76 [-3.08; -0.44]

-1.75 [-2.66; -0.85]

-1.75 [-3.01; -0.49]

-1.71 [-2.36; -1.06]

-1.67 [-2.55; -0.79]

-1.59 [-2.11; -1.07]

-1.59 [-1.86; -1.32]

-1.56 [-2.49; -0.63]

-1.52 [-2.37; -0.68]

-1.50 [-2.86; -0.14]

-1.43 [-2.05; -0.82]

-1.36 [-2.06; -0.66]

-1.29 [-2.07; -0.50]

-1.27 [-1.56; -0.97]

-1.26 [-1.89; -0.63]

-1.21 [**-2.14**; **-0.28**]

-1.16 [-1.73; -0.59]

-1.03 [-1.58; -0.48]

-1.02 [-2.28; 0.24]

-0.85 [-1.10; -0.60]

-0.82 [-2.20; 0.57]

-0.80 [-1.33; -0.27]

-0.80 [-1.31; -0.29]

-0.59 [-0.93; -0.25]

[-3.08; 0.09]

[-2.62; 0.01]

[-2.44; 0.24]

[-1.94; 0.17]

[-2.07; 0.39]

[-1.67; 0.03]

[-1.80; 0.61]

[-2.18; 1.05]

[-0.89; 0.06]

[-1.30; 0.68]

[-1.00; 0.57]

[-1.05; 0.91]

[-0.52; 0.44]

[-1.49; 1.65]

[-1.24; 1.93]

[-0.38; 1.22]

[2.11; 3.55]

-1.85 [**-2.13**; **-1.58**] **100.0%**

0.66 [0.13; 1.19]

0.86 [0.02; 1.70]

-1.49

-1.30

-1.10

-0.89

-0.84

-0.82

-0.60

-0.57

-0.41

-0.31

-0.21

-0.07

-0.04

80.0

0.34

0.42

2.83

10

[-3.95; 0.21]

-1.87

95%-CI Weight

0.0%

0.1%

0.0%

0.4%

0.2%

0.2%

1.0%

0.8%

0.7%

0.3%

0.3%

0.4%

0.3%

0.6%

0.7%

0.7%

0.8% 0.7%

1.1%

0.8%

1.1%

0.6% 1.1%

1.3%

0.8%

1.1%

1.3% 1.2%

1.2%

1.0%

1.1%

1.0%

1.2%

1.0%

1.2%

1.2%

1.3%

1.3%

1.1%

1.2%

1.0%

0.9% 1.2%

1.2%

1.0%

1.2%

1.3%

1.2%

1.2%

1.3%

1.0%

1.3%

1.0%

1.1%

1.3%

1.0%

1.2% 1.0%

1.3%

1.3%

1.1%

1.3%

0.9%

1.3%

1.1%

1.2%

1.1%

1.3%

0.9%

0.9%

1.2%

1.3%

1.2%

1.2%

SMD SE(SMD)

6.5275 ←

5.6982 ◆

6.5168 +

3.1294 ←

2.8474 <

0.7007

1.0524

1.1461

2.4986

2.4161

1.9419

2.0725

1.4136

1.0788

1.0728

1.0359

1.2084

0.5003

1.0367

0.4864

1.3423

0.5962

0.2910

1.0622

0.4788

0.2959

0.4706

0.3502

0.6486

0.5102

0.6723

0.4616

0.6439

0.3313

0.4492

0.2670

0.1384

0.4764

0.4299

0.6935

0.8063

0.3140

0.3574

0.6707

0.4022

0.1500

0.3209

0.4732

0.2921

0.6855

0.2796

0.6431

0.5367

0.1282

0.6293

0.4339

0.7083

0.2702

0.2604

0.6148

0.1739

0.8240

0.2423

0.5045

0.4017

0.5002

0.2436

0.8005

0.8087

0.4067

0.2703

0.4279

0.3655

-10

♦

0

5

-5

-1.9074

-1.8696

-1.8683

-1.8514

-1.8148

-1.7906

-1.7803

-1.7772

-1.7610

-1.7546

-1.7522

-1.7109

-1.6673

-1.5903

-1.5870

-1.5601

-1.5226

-1.4981

-1.4949

-1.4313

-1.3571

-1.3022

-1.2858

-1.2654

-1.2609

-1.2102

-1.1600

-1.1002

-1.0327

-1.0171

-0.8853

-0.8470

-0.8388

-0.8228

-0.8163

-0.8042

-0.7986

-0.5963

-0.5902

-0.5652

-0.4115

-0.3097

-0.2127

-0.0668

-0.0376

0.0801

0.3402

0.4213

0.6570

0.8629

2.8310

1.9427 ←

-10.4161

-9.6730

-9.4208

-8.3490

-7.0773

-6.6669

-6.0698

-5.8393

-5.3550

-5.3365

-5.2906

-5.1321

-4.7427

-4.4146

-4.2298

-4.2128

-4.1062

-4.0209

-3.6837

-3.5685

-3.3845

-3.3369

-3.3283

Study

Wang, J (2016)

Wang, J (2016)

Shen, J (2009)

Liu, Q (2014)

Sun, J (2012)

Sun, J (2012)

Hu, S (2012)

Xu, C (2012)

Ren, C (2008)

Sun, J (2012)

Ren, C (2008)

Gao, X (2017)

Xu, W (2016)

Liu, M (2018)

Huang, D (2017)

Zhou, F (2015)

Xiao, B (2017)

Shen, J (2009)

Liu, Y (2011)

Lu, X (2010)

Pignataro, G (2013)

Brager, A (2016)

Zhang, W (2017)

Bonova, P (2015)

Gang-ling, C (2015)

Doeppner, T (2018)

Yang, J (2018)

Ren, C (2008)

Jin, W (2016)

Qi, Z (2012) Ma, L (2013)

Ma, J (2016)

Qi, Z (2015)

Wang, Y (2018)

Zhao, H (2007)

Ren, C (2008)

Xia, M (2016)

Zhao, H (2007)

Li, S (2015)

Li, J (2018)

Cheng, X (2018)

Hoda, M (2012)

Kong, Y (2013)

Ren, C (2009)

Zhao, H (2007)

Ma, L (2013)

Qi, Z (2012)

Qi, W (2016)

Zhao, H (2007)

Chen, Q (2016)

Ren, C (2009)

Ren, C (2017)

Hahn, C (2011)

Zhao, H (2007)

Hahn, C (2011)

Gao, X (2017)

Ren, C (2008)

Pignataro, G (2013)

Kitagawa, K (2018)

Silachev, D (2017)

Pignataro, G (2013)

Pignataro, G (2013)

Kitagawa, K (2018)

อแacnev, D (2017)

Kitagawa, K (2018)

Random effects model

Shan, L (2013)

Liu, Z (2015)

Silachev, D (2017)

Qi, Z (2012)

Zhang, Y (2018)

Doeppner, T (2018)

Li, P (2016)

Liang, D (2018)

Zhou, M (2015)

