

Clase 4: Presentar y comentar un artículo de investigación en Economía

Seminario de Tesis PEG
Econ 4600

Ignacio Sarmiento-Barbieri

Universidad de los Andes

February 5, 2021

Dates and Reminders

Fecha	Actividad
Enero 27	Introducción, presentación de los estudiantes, y discusión de temas aprobados
Enero 29	Estructura de un trabajo de investigación en Economía
Febrero 3	Estructura de un trabajo de investigación en Economía
Febrero 5	Presentar y comentar un artículo de investigación en Economía
Febrero 10, 12	Discusión individual con el profesor (horario de atención y horario de clase)
Febrero 17,19	Discusión individual con el profesor (horario de atención y horario de clase)
Febrero 24, 26	Presentaciones (15 min.) + Comentarios (5 min.) y discusión en grupo
Marzo 3, 5	Presentaciones (15 min.) + Comentarios (5 min.) y discusión en grupo
Marzo 10, 12	Presentaciones (15 min.) + Comentarios (5 min.) y discusión en grupo
Marzo 17.	Presentaciones (15 min.) + Comentarios (5 min.) y discusión en grupo
Marzo 19	Discusión individual con el profesor (horario de atención y horario de clase)
Primer documento (Marzo 19) 30% Nota	

Dates and Reminders

Fecha	Actividad
Marzo 24, 26	Semana de Receso
Marzo 31, Abril 2	Semana Santa (Semana de trabajo individual)
Abril 7, 9	Presentaciones (25 min.) + Comentarios (5 min.) y discusión en grupo
Abril 14, 16	Presentaciones (25 min.) + Comentarios (5 min.) y discusión en grupo
Abril 21, 23	Presentaciones (25 min.) + Comentarios (5 min.) y discusión en grupo
Abril 28, 30	Presentaciones (25 min.) + Comentarios (5 min.) y discusión en grupo
Mayo 5, 7	Presentaciones (25 min.) + Comentarios (5 min.) y discusión en grupo
Mayo 12, 14	Presentaciones (25 min.) + Comentarios (5 min.) y discusión en grupo
Mayo 19	Presentaciones (25 min.) + Comentarios (5 min.) y discusión en grupo
Mayo 21	Discusión individual con el profesor (horario de atención y horario de clase)
Mayo 26, 28	Discusión individual con el profesor (horario de atención y horario de clase)
Documento Final en PDF (Mayo 28)	

Presentation Schedule

Presentador	Presentacion 1	Presentacion 2	Comentarista
Orjuela Pava , Maria Alejandra	Febrero 24	Abril 7	Noriega Arciniegas , Dana Sofia
Rico Avendaño , Juan Pablo	Febrero 24	Abril 9	Cala Perez , Paula Daniela
Naranjo Beltran , Andres	Febrero 26	Abril 14	Alfaro Del Rio , Carlos Alberto
Rubio Arrubla , Juan Felipe	Febrero 26	Abril 16	Cubillos Rocha , Juan Sebastian
Salas Carpio , Valeria Alejandra	Marzo 3	Abril 21	Pulido Mahecha , Karen Lorena
Cano Polania , Rafael	Marzo 3	Abril 23	Porras Barrera , Maryan Raquel
Gutierrez Coronel , Julian Camilo	Marzo 5	Abril 28	Salas Carpio , Valeria Alejandra
Porras Barrera , Maryan Raquel	Marzo 5	Abril 30	Cano Polania , Rafael
Pulido Mahecha , Karen Lorena	Marzo 10	Mayo 5	Gutierrez Coronel , Julian Camilo
Cubillos Rocha , Juan Sebastian	Marzo 10	Mayo 7	Rubio Arrubla , Juan Felipe
Alfaro Del Rio , Carlos Alberto	Marzo 12	Mayo 12	Naranjo Beltran , Andres
Cala Perez , Paula Daniela	Marzo 12	Mayo 14	Rico Avendaño , Juan Pablo
Noriega Arciniegas , Dana Sofia	Marzo 17	Mayo 19	Orjuela Pava , Maria Alejandra

1 General Tips

- Motivation
- Designing Slides
- Developing Arguments
- Presenting Slides

2 Specific Tips for this Seminar

3 Commenting a Paper

1 General Tips

- Motivation
- Designing Slides
- Developing Arguments
- Presenting Slides

2 Specific Tips for this Seminar

3 Commenting a Paper

Motivation

Good ideas do not sell themselves

Busy people often prefer communicating through presentations

- ▶ Reading is too time consuming.
- ▶ Asking questions/interacting helps to understand new material.

Disclosure: Today's material is a mashup/summary of: (most are linked in my website)

- ▶ Berthold Herrendorf's "How to Make Academic Presentations – Short Version"
- ▶ Rachael Meager's "Public Speaking for Academic Economists"
- ▶ Advice I received at Illinois' AMRL
- ▶ Manuel Fernandez-Sierra's past classes

Know what your audience cares about

- ▶ You are selling your research, which presumably you believe in.
- ▶ It is not dishonest to try to explain to others why you believe in it.
- ▶ You cannot sell ideas without understanding what your audience cares about and how they think.
- ▶ What is convincing to you may not convince others.

PREPARE, PRACTICE, PRACTICE

- ▶ **Routinize as much as possible**

- ▶ In the spirit of Yogi Berra: “90% of a presentation is routine and the other half is mental”.

- ▶ **Tape yourself**

- ▶ Watching yourself makes you aware of all the goofy things you do.
 - ▶ That’s painful and your voice will sound weird to you, but that’s also educational.

- ▶ **Give practice presentations**

- ▶ Experience how your presentation feels when you speak out in front of others.
 - ▶ Get feedback, wait for a few days, and critically re-evaluate.

1 General Tips

- Motivation
- Designing Slides
- Developing Arguments
- Presenting Slides

2 Specific Tips for this Seminar

3 Commenting a Paper

Don't assume people know what you know...

- ▶ Don't overestimate your audience.
- ▶ People cannot digest a lot of new material in one sitting.
- ▶ Much of what now seems obvious to you is not obvious and actually has to be spelled out.
- ▶ It is almost impossible to make a presentation too simple.
- ▶ People must feel they understand your work well enough to critique it.
 - ▶ They will not “buy” something if they feel they can't evaluate it.
 - ▶ If they do not feel this, you are sunk.

...but don't try to show how hard you worked

- ▶ Really good ideas in economics are often obvious ex-post.
- ▶ But don't try to show how hard you worked.
- ▶ The only way to manage this problem is to frame the talk correctly.
- ▶ If you can make the idea feel obvious now but remind the audience why it wasn't obvious before, they will buy the idea, and they will buy it from you.

Restrict the number of slides and the material on each slide

- ▶ Put only the bare essentials on the main slides
- ▶ Use landscape and large font (can you read this?)
- ▶ Any software is fine (beamer, power point, etc.)
- ▶ Convey one message per slide
 - ▶ Summarize the message in the headline.
 - ▶ Use at most ten bullet points to deliver the message.
 - ▶ Restrict each bullet point to one line.

Plan to say everything that is on the slides

- ▶ If you don't plan to say it, then leave it out. Plan to say more than is on the slides
- ▶ I need 2–3 minutes to deliver one slide.
- ▶ I first say what is on it, then I explain and rephrase it, then I go beyond it.
- ▶ Where possible, graphs $>$ tables.

Make figures, graphs, and tables accessible

- ▶ Design each figure to convey one message summarized in the title (it's ok if it is not the exact same figure of the paper)
 - ▶ Label the axes and the curves clearly.
 - ▶ Use large font (typically much larger than in the paper).
 - ▶ Plot at most 3 time series on each figure.
- ▶ Keep tables simple
 - ▶ Put only the numbers that you plan to talk about [▶ More](#)
 - ▶ If you need more than 10 numbers, consider turning the table into a figure.
- ▶ Never have 0.0000 point estimates or standard errors. Change units in these cases.
- ▶ Be able to provide a real life interpretation of your estimates.

Make figures, graphs, and tables accessible

Table 10
Socio-economic changes and the complementarity between park proximity and homicide risk.

Panel A	Dependent variable:							
	ln(Population density)		White, fraction		African-American, fraction		Latino, fraction	
	Neighborhood spatial differences (NSD)							
Estimator	(1) NSD	(2) NSD + IV	(3) NSD	(4) NSD + IV	(5) NSD	(6) NSD + IV	(7) NSD	(8) NSD + IV
Park within 1/16 mile	−0.0531** (0.0206) [0.0444]	−0.0504 (0.0241) [0.1642]	0.0055 (0.0061) [0.4049]	0.0111 (0.0066) [0.2835]	0.0059 (0.0044) [0.2287]	−0.0006 (0.0052) [0.9698]	−0.0083 (0.0043) [0.1224]	−0.0046 (0.0048) [0.5851]
Homicide Risk	0.0595*** (0.0058) [0.0000]	0.1157*** (0.0129) [0.0000]	−0.0528*** (0.0040) [0.0000]	−0.0996*** (0.0076) [0.0000]	0.0377*** (0.0042) [0.0000]	0.0679*** (0.0090) [0.0000]	0.0147*** (0.0034) [0.0000]	0.0318*** (0.0064) [0.0000]
Park within 1/16 mile × Homicide Risk	0.0144 (0.0072) [0.3518]	0.0167 (0.0094) [0.1693]	−0.0012 (0.0021) [0.7322]	−0.0073** (0.0027) [0.0307]	0.0023 (0.0021) [0.4455]	0.0078** (0.0028) [0.0307]	−0.0022 (0.0021) [0.4455]	−0.0030 (0.0026) [0.3715]
Observations	364,269	364,269	364,269	364,269	364,269	364,269	364,269	364,269

Panel B	Dependent variable:									
	ln(Median income)		Median age		Renter, fraction		Vacant, fraction		Unemployed, fraction	
	NSD	NSD + IV	NSD	NSD + IV	NSD	NSD + IV	NSD	NSD + IV	NSD	NSD + IV
Park within 1/16 mile	0.0014 (0.0112) [0.9011]	−0.0005 (0.0131) [0.9698]	1.2943*** (0.2584) [0.0000]	1.4997*** (0.3072) [0.0000]	−0.0126 (0.0077) [0.1852]	−0.0135 (0.0091) [0.3075]	0.0043** (0.0022) [0.1224]	0.0022 (0.0027) [0.5851]	0.0017 (0.0012) [0.2287]	0.0012 (0.0016) [0.5851]
Homicide Risk	−0.0783*** (0.0055) [0.0000]	−0.1513*** (0.0112) [0.0000]	−0.5970*** (0.0715) [0.0000]	−1.4391*** (0.1482) [0.0000]	0.0240*** (0.0028) [0.0000]	0.0488*** (0.0055) [0.0000]	0.0069*** (0.0009) [0.0000]	0.0131*** (0.0017) [0.0000]	0.0089*** (0.0007) [0.0000]	0.0148*** (0.0015) [0.0000]
Park within 1/16 mile × Homicide Risk	−0.0006 (0.0048) [0.8934]	−0.0045 (0.0062) [0.5259]	−0.1249 (0.1039) [0.4455]	−0.2910** (0.1314) [0.0805]	0.0038 (0.0027) [0.4455]	0.0059+ (0.0035) [0.1693]	−0.0018+ (0.0010) [0.3518]	−0.0003 (0.0014) [0.8248]	0.0001 (0.0007) [0.8934]	0.0008 (0.0009) [0.5158]
Observations	364,269	364,269	364,269	364,269	364,269	364,269	364,269	364,269	322,368	322,368

Notes: Sample includes a interpolated yearly series of socio-economic characteristics from the 2000, 2010 Censuses and the 2011–15 ACS at block level. All specifications include neighborhood fixed effects and year fixed effects. Neighborhood refers to the 3/8 miles radius around a park. Standard errors clustered at the neighborhood level are in parentheses. Benjamini and Hochberg (1995) adjusted *p*-values in brackets.

Specifications also include controls for park proximity between 1 and 2/16th miles and it's interaction with Homicide Risk, which we omit for clarity of exposition as these coefficients are never statistically significant.

* Significant at 10% level; ** significant at 5% level; *** significant at 1% level according to Benjamini and Hochberg (1995) adjusted *p*-values.

1 General Tips

- Motivation
- Designing Slides
- Developing Arguments
- Presenting Slides

2 Specific Tips for this Seminar

3 Commenting a Paper

Develop your arguments in newspaper style, not in joke/novel style

- ▶ Journalists first state the main point, then explain the main steps, then the details
 - ▶ The editor can cut the article from the end so as to fit it into the available space.
 - ▶ The reader can get the main idea without fully reading the article.
- ▶ Use the advantages of newspaper style for your presentations
 - ▶ Makes sure the audience knows where you are going.
 - ▶ Allows to leave out less important material when time pressure builds.
 - ▶ Allows to use the same set of slides for presentations of different length.

Don't confuse people with elegant variation

- ▶ Use the same concepts throughout the talk
 - ▶ If you introduce, say, the firm, then it's the firm.
 - ▶ Save people the effort it takes to realize that synonyms (company etc) mean the same.
- ▶ Use established concepts, conventions, notation

Use active verbs and parallel structures

▶ OK

- ▶ Using active verbs makes presentations lively.
- ▶ Presentations are easier to follow if parallel structures are used.

▶ Better

- ▶ Use active verbs to make presentations lively.
- ▶ Use parallel structures to make presentations easier to follow.

1 General Tips

- Motivation
- Designing Slides
- Developing Arguments
- Presenting Slides

2 Specific Tips for this Seminar

3 Commenting a Paper

Provide direction

- ▶ Offer recalls, transitions, and previews
 - ▶ Where are we coming from?
 - ▶ Where are we going?
- ▶ Periodically collect people that you may have lost
 - ▶ “The key point is ...”
 - ▶ “What I want you to take away is ...”
 - ▶ “Any questions?”
 - ▶ “Everyone on board?”

Take charge of the room

- ▶ Take ownership of the room. You are responsible for what happens during your talk. This is your time.
- ▶ It does not matter that the audience is more accomplished than you. You have something to tell them.
- ▶ It does not matter if you make a fool of yourself. Commit.
- ▶ People will forgive committed foolishness. They will not forgive you for not taking the seminar - or their time - seriously.

Take charge of your presentation

- ▶ Allow questions but don't encourage follow up questions
- ▶ Questions tell you what the audience cares about
- ▶ Postpone questions that are out of logical order
 - ▶ Write down the questions you postpone to make sure you don't forget to answer them.
- ▶ Ensure that things don't get out of hand
 - ▶ "Let's talk about that after the presentation".
 - ▶ "I now need five/ten minutes without questions to deliver my main point".
- ▶ Don't get defensive or capitulate, explain your reasoning!

Learn how to answer questions

- ▶ Gain time before answering
 - ▶ Listen to the question until the end.
 - ▶ Repeat the question and ask for clarification.
- ▶ Adjust your answer to the situation
 - ▶ Answer clarifying questions as briefly as possible (“Yes”, “No” ...).
 - ▶ Use “Yes–But” technique if you disagree with a question.
- ▶ Think about obvious questions in advance
 - ▶ Preempt obvious and important questions.
 - ▶ Prepare answers to other obvious questions in your back up slides or notes.

Take charge of your presentation

- ▶ Present the work you have, not the work you wish you had.
- ▶ Nobody else knows what you wanted to get done but couldn't:
 - ▶ That information is not in their minds.
 - ▶ Do not put it there!!!!

Nosce te ipsum: Understand the biology behind the reactions of your body

- ▶ Your body interprets a big talk as an existential crisis
 - ▶ gets ready to fight and releases adrenaline
 - ▶ stops higher reasoning and goes on autopilot.
- ▶ Some adrenalin is necessary to help you perform.
- ▶ Too much adrenalin prevents you from delivering, except in fights.

Nosce te ipsum: Learn how to manage the reactions of your body

- ▶ Manage your adrenalin through deep breathing, meditation, physical exercise, yoga.
- ▶ Put a lower limit on how bad things can turn out
- ▶ Routinize as much as possible
 - ▶ You will make mistakes when you improvise, particularly under pressure (that's why the training of airplane pilots aims to minimize improvisation).
 - ▶ Think ahead and address expected problems.
 - ▶ PREPARE, PRACTICE, PRACTICE.

Nosce te ipsum: Use body language to your advantage

- ▶ If face to face
 - ▶ Choose a stable stand and an open posture
 - ▶ Keep your feet slightly apart.
 - ▶ Hold your hands openly in front of your body (instead of in your pockets).
 - ▶ Use gestures to release excess energy.
 - ▶ Establish eye contact with the audience
 - ▶ Work all parts of the room.
 - ▶ Focus on people who smile and send approving signals.
- ▶ Via Zoom
 - ▶ Make sure you have a good set up (Internet, camera, microphone, location)
 - ▶ With Zoom we need to work much harder to “feel” the audience

1 General Tips

- Motivation
- Designing Slides
- Developing Arguments
- Presenting Slides

2 Specific Tips for this Seminar

3 Commenting a Paper

Structure of the presentation

- ▶ There are two presentations throughout the semester: 15 min. and a 25 min.
- ▶ These presentations should be organized as follows:
 - ▶ Slide 1: Title slide
 - ▶ Slide 2: Motivation (1 slide is good, 2 slides maximum)
 - ▶ Slide 3: Clear Research Question (the research question could also be at the end of the motivation slide)
 - ▶ Slide 4: What this paper does (1 slide is good, 2 slides max)- identification strategy in 1 sentence, data in 1 sentence, headline results
 - ▶ Slide 5: Presentation Outline (for the 25 minute talks, you do not need to have an outline. Those are only necessary for 60-90 minute talks).
 - ▶ The rest of the slides are going to be dependent on the needs of the individual presentation. “if in doubt, leave it out”

General advice

- ▶ 15 and 25 minutes are not a lot of time.
- ▶ 2 minutes per slide is a decent benchmark.
 - ▶ For a 15 minute presentation you should have about 7 slides
 - ▶ For a 25 minute presentation you should have about 12 slides
- ▶ **IMPORTANT:** Have someone take notes for you (it can be your commenter), they should write down all the comments and questions that were made.
- ▶ I record all lectures, if you want a specific recording let me know

1 General Tips

- Motivation
- Designing Slides
- Developing Arguments
- Presenting Slides

2 Specific Tips for this Seminar

3 Commenting a Paper

Commenting a Paper

Objective: improve the paper

- ▶ Begin by telling the audience why the paper is important: what is the “big picture”?
- ▶ Summarize the paper in one (maximum two) slide. (5 min. is not a lot of time!!!)
- ▶ Identify 2-3 points related to the paper that you want to draw attention to.
 - ▶ Focus on the “big picture”: it is less interesting to discuss minor details.
 - ▶ It is important to be critical, but it is much better if you propose solutions to the problems you identify.
 - ▶ Try to give a different perspective: a new angle or a reformulation of the problem.
- ▶ Be respectful

Thanks!

[https://ignaciomsarmiento.github.io/
i.sarmiento@uniandes.edu.co](https://ignaciomsarmiento.github.io/i.sarmiento@uniandes.edu.co)

More: Extra Stuff

Extra stuff

► [Back](#)