

## **Deliverable 1: Selecting and Scoping**

Due: February 4th at 6 pm on Bloque Neón

The first deliverable will focus on the Selecting and Scoping of the paper, and as with every deliverable we will lean on the [ACRe Guidelines](#)

### **1 Selecting a Paper**

The purpose of this stage is to assist you in deciding which paper to use for your reproduction. **Note** that in this stage, you are not expected to review the reproduction materials in detail, as you will dedicate most of your time to this in later stages of the exercise.

1. You first should consider some candidate papers. Since this is an Urban Economics course, you should search for an article related to Urban Economics. If you are working on applied micro topics and have a paper related to your research that you want to reproduce, please first talk to me.

To maximize your chances of finding a paper with a reproduction package, I recommend you search first on the ten journals with the highest h5-index. For example, on August 4th, 2021, these were: American Economic Review, The Quarterly Journal of Economics, The Review of Financial Studies, Journal of Political Economy, The Journal of Finance, Econometrica, The Review of Economic Studies, Review of Economics and Statistics, The Economic Journal, Journal of Public Economics. I especially recommend focusing on papers published since 2019 in the journals of the American Economic Association, which are more likely to contain reproduction packages given a change in the AEA Data and Code Availability Policy that took effect that year, or papers published after 2026 in the American Journal of Political Science, which are also likely to contain reproduction packages.

2. With your candidate papers, select a paper and read the abstract to verify that there is a computational analysis. Discard if there is not.
3. If there is a computational analysis, search [socialsciencereproduction.org](https://socialsciencereproduction.org) to verify that there is a recorded reproduction.
4. If someone already reproduced the paper extensively, discard it and move to your next candidate paper. If not, you can go ahead. If in doubt, talk to me.
5. You are encouraged to register your reproduction at [socialsciencereproduction.org](https://socialsciencereproduction.org), but it is not mandatory. Those that record it will get bonus points in subsequent deliverables.

## 2 Scoping the Paper

1. **Summary.** Once you have selected your paper, you will read it carefully and summarize it. The objective is to show me that you understand the paper and its various components. In your summary, try to address the following:

- How many scientific claims can you identify in the paper?
- Would you classify the claims as causal, descriptive (e.g., estimating a population's descriptive statistic), or something else?
- What is the population that is the focus of the paper as a whole?
- What is the population for which the estimates apply?
- What are the primary data sources used in the paper?
- What is the primary statistical or econometric method used to examine each claim?
- What is the author's preferred specification (or yours, if the authors' is unclear)?
- What are some possible robustness checks for the preferred specification?
- How many display items are there in the paper (tables, figures, and inline results)?

**Note** that I expect a short document (< 1000 words), and not a simple answering of the above questions.

2. **Initial Reproduction.** Reproduce one claim (major finding) in your selected paper based on the code provided in the original package. In your own words, write a brief explanation of the claim, the empirical specification, and interpretation of the result.
3. **Reproduction Package.** Create a GitHub repository where you will upload the code of the paper you are going to reproduce, name it "Revised reproduction package for [Paper Citation, e.g. Smith et al. (2019)]". GitHub has a file size limit, so there's no need to upload the data. Later on, you can upload the complete reproduction package to a trusted repository.