

# Manufactured Solution for the 2D Favre-Averaged Navier–Stokes Equations with Spalart-Allmaras turbulence model using Maple

Kemelli C. Estacio-Hiroms

February 15, 2011

## Abstract

The Method of Manufactured Solutions is a valuable approach for code verification, providing means to verify how accurately the numerical method solves the partial differential equations of interest. This document presents the source terms generated by the application of the Method of Manufactured Solutions on the 2D transient Favre-Averaged Navier–Stokes Equations with Spalart-Allmaras turbulence model using the analytical manufactured solutions for density, velocity and pressure presented by Roy et al. (2002).

## 1 Mathematical Model

Turbulent flows occur at high Reynolds numbers, when the inertia of the fluid overwhelms the viscosity of the fluid, causing the laminar flow motions to become unstable. Under these conditions, the flow is characterized by rapid fluctuations in pressure and velocity which are inherently three dimensional and unsteady. Turbulent flow is composed of large eddies that migrate across the flow generating smaller eddies as they go. These smaller eddies in turn generates smaller eddies until they become small enough that their energy is dissipated due to the presence of molecular viscosity.

In practice, the effect of this sensitivity is to make the value of any flow quantity at any particular point in time and space uncertain. Thus, these quantities may be viewed as random variables with associated probability density functions, allowing the use of statistical techniques in the description and analysis of the flow. Or, in other words, the full influence of the turbulent fluctuations on the mean flow must be modelled.

For flows with significant density variations it is possible to capture the turbulent effects using the Favre averaged Navier-Stokes equations (FANS), together with baseline compressible Spalart-Allmaras (SA) turbulent model (Oliver, 2010).

Mass conservation:

$$\frac{\partial \bar{\rho}}{\partial t} + \frac{\partial}{\partial x_i} (\bar{\rho} \tilde{u}_i) = 0, \quad (1)$$

Momentum conservation:

$$\frac{\partial}{\partial t} (\bar{\rho} \tilde{u}_i) + \frac{\partial}{\partial x_j} (\bar{\rho} \tilde{u}_j \tilde{u}_i) = - \frac{\partial \bar{p}}{\partial x_i} + \frac{\partial}{\partial x_j} \left( 2(\bar{\mu} + \mu_t) \tilde{S}_{ji} \right), \quad (2)$$

Total energy conservation:

$$\frac{\partial}{\partial t} \left[ \bar{\rho} \left( \tilde{e} + \frac{1}{2} \tilde{u}_i \tilde{u}_i \right) \right] + \frac{\partial}{\partial x_j} \left[ \bar{\rho} \tilde{u}_j \left( \tilde{h} + \frac{1}{2} \tilde{u}_i \tilde{u}_i \right) \right] = \frac{\partial}{\partial x_j} \left( 2(\bar{\mu} + \mu_t) \tilde{S}_{ji} \tilde{u}_i \right) + \frac{\partial}{\partial x_j} \left[ \left( \frac{\bar{\mu}}{\text{Pr}} + \frac{\mu_t}{\text{Pr}_t} \right) \frac{\partial \tilde{h}}{\partial x_j} \right], \quad (3)$$

Baseline compressible Spalart-Allmaras equation:

$$\frac{\partial}{\partial t} (\bar{\rho} \nu_{sa}) + \frac{\partial}{\partial x_j} (\bar{\rho} \tilde{u}_j \nu_{sa}) = c_{b1} S_{sa} \bar{\rho} \nu_{sa} - c_{w1} f_w \bar{\rho} \left( \frac{\nu_{sa}}{d} \right)^2 + \frac{1}{\sigma} \frac{\partial}{\partial x_k} \left[ (\bar{\mu} + \bar{\rho} \nu_{sa}) \frac{\partial \nu_{sa}}{\partial x_k} \right] + \frac{c_{b2}}{\sigma} \bar{\rho} \frac{\partial \nu_{sa}}{\partial x_k} \frac{\partial \nu_{sa}}{\partial x_k}, \quad (4)$$

where  $[\tilde{\cdot}]$  denotes a Favre-averaging variable and  $[\cdot]$  denotes Reynolds averaging.

To close the equations, many additional relationships are necessary—e.g., a constitutive relation for the viscous stress, an equation of state, etc. In this work, the gas is considered calorically perfect and:

$$\begin{aligned}
\bar{\mu} &= \text{constant}, \quad \tilde{S}_{ij} = \tilde{s}_{ij} - \frac{1}{3}\tilde{s}_{kk}\delta_{ij}, \quad \tilde{s}_{ij} = \frac{1}{2}\left(\frac{\partial\tilde{u}_i}{\partial x_j} + \frac{\partial\tilde{u}_j}{\partial x_i}\right), \\
\bar{p} &= \bar{\rho}R\tilde{T}, \quad \tilde{e} = c_v\tilde{T}, \quad \tilde{h} = c_p\tilde{T} = \tilde{e} + \frac{\bar{p}}{\bar{\rho}} \\
\mu_t &= \bar{\rho}\nu_t = \bar{\rho}\nu_{sa}f_{v1}, \quad S_{sa} = \Omega + \frac{\nu_{sa}}{\kappa^2 d^2}f_{v2}, \quad \Omega = \sqrt{2\tilde{\Omega}_{ij}\tilde{\Omega}_{ij}}, \quad \tilde{\Omega}_{ij} = \frac{1}{2}\left(\frac{\partial\tilde{u}_i}{\partial x_j} - \frac{\partial\tilde{u}_j}{\partial x_i}\right), \\
f_{v2} &= 1 - \frac{\chi}{1 + \chi f_{v1}}, \quad f_{v1} = \frac{\chi^3}{\chi^3 + c_{v1}^3}, \quad \chi = \frac{\nu_{sa}}{\tilde{\nu}}, \\
f_w &= g\left(\frac{1 + c_{w3}^6}{g^6 + c_{w3}^6}\right)^{1/6}, \quad g = r + c_{w2}(r^6 - r), \quad r = \frac{\nu_{sa}}{S_{sa}\kappa^2 d^2},
\end{aligned} \tag{5}$$

where  $d$  is the distance to the nearest no slip wall.

The constants  $c_v$  and  $c_p$  are fluid properties. The constants  $c_{b1}$ ,  $c_{b2}$ ,  $c_{v1}$ ,  $\sigma$ ,  $c_{w1}$ ,  $c_{w2}$ ,  $c_{w3}$ , and  $\kappa$  are the SA model calibration parameters.

## 2 Manufactured Solution

The Method of Manufactured Solutions (MMS) applied to Favre-Averaged Navier–Stokes equations with baseline compressible Spalart–Allmaras turbulence model consists in modifying Equations (1) – (4) by adding a source term to the right-hand side of each equation, so the modified set of equations conveniently has the analytical solution chosen *a priori*.

Roy et al. (2002) introduce the general form of the two-dimensional primitive manufactured solution variables to be a function of sines and cosines in  $x$  and  $y$ . In this work, Roy et al. (2002)’s manufactured solutions are modified in order to address temporal accuracy as well:

$$\phi(x, y, t) = \phi_0 + \phi_x f_s\left(\frac{a_{\phi x}\pi x}{L}\right) + \phi_y f_s\left(\frac{a_{\phi y}\pi y}{L}\right) + \phi_t f_s\left(\frac{a_{\phi t}\pi t}{L}\right), \tag{6}$$

where  $\phi = \rho, u, v, p$  or  $\nu_{sa}$ , and  $f_s(\cdot)$  functions denote either sine or cosine function. Note that in this case,  $\phi_x$ ,  $\phi_y$  and  $\phi_t$  are constants and the subscripts do not denote differentiation.

The manufactured analytical solutions (6) for each one of the variables in two-dimensional case of FANS equations with SA turbulence model are:

$$\begin{aligned}
\rho(x, y, t) &= \rho_0 + \rho_x \sin\left(\frac{a_{\rho x}\pi x}{L}\right) + \rho_y \cos\left(\frac{a_{\rho y}\pi y}{L}\right) + \rho_t \sin\left(\frac{a_{\rho t}\pi t}{L}\right), \\
u(x, y, t) &= u_0 + u_x \sin\left(\frac{a_{ux}\pi x}{L}\right) + u_y \cos\left(\frac{a_{uy}\pi y}{L}\right) + u_t \cos\left(\frac{a_{ut}\pi t}{L}\right), \\
v(x, y, t) &= v_0 + v_x \cos\left(\frac{a_{vx}\pi x}{L}\right) + v_y \sin\left(\frac{a_{vy}\pi y}{L}\right) + v_t \sin\left(\frac{a_{vt}\pi t}{L}\right), \\
p(x, y, t) &= p_0 + p_x \cos\left(\frac{a_{px}\pi x}{L}\right) + p_y \sin\left(\frac{a_{py}\pi y}{L}\right) + p_t \cos\left(\frac{a_{pt}\pi t}{L}\right), \\
\nu_{sa}(x, y, t) &= \nu_{sa0} + \nu_{sax} \cos\left(\frac{a_{\nu_{sa}x}\pi x}{L}\right) + \nu_{say} \cos\left(\frac{a_{\nu_{sa}y}\pi y}{L}\right) + \nu_{sat} \cos\left(\frac{a_{\nu_{sa}t}\pi t}{L}\right).
\end{aligned} \tag{7}$$

Source terms for mass conservation ( $Q_\rho$ ), momentum ( $Q_u$ , and  $Q_v$ ), total energy ( $Q_E$ ) and SA variable ( $Q_{\nu_{sa}}$ ) equations are obtained by symbolic manipulations of FANS equations with SA turbulence model above using Maple 13 (Maplesoft, 2010) and are presented in the following sections.

## 2.1 2D FANS Equations and SA Turbulence Model

MMS applied to the 2D transient FANS equations with SA turbulent model simply consists in modifying Equations (1) – (4) by adding a source term to the right-hand side of each equation:

$$\begin{aligned}
\frac{\partial(\bar{\rho})}{\partial t} + \nabla \cdot (\bar{\rho} \tilde{\mathbf{u}}) &= Q_{\bar{\rho}}, \\
\frac{\partial(\bar{\rho} \tilde{\mathbf{u}})}{\partial t} + \nabla \cdot (\bar{\rho} \tilde{\mathbf{u}} \tilde{\mathbf{u}}) + \nabla \bar{p} - \nabla \cdot (2(\bar{\mu} + \mu_t) \tilde{\mathbf{S}}) &= Q_{\tilde{\mathbf{u}}}, \\
\frac{\partial(\bar{\rho} \tilde{E})}{\partial t} + \nabla \cdot (\bar{\rho} \tilde{\mathbf{u}} \tilde{H}) - \nabla \cdot \bar{\mathbf{q}} - \nabla \cdot (2(\bar{\mu} + \mu_t) \tilde{\mathbf{S}} \cdot \tilde{\mathbf{u}}) &= Q_{\tilde{E}}, \\
\frac{\partial(\bar{\rho} \nu_{\text{sa}})}{\partial t} + \nabla \cdot (\bar{\rho} \tilde{\mathbf{u}} \nu_{\text{sa}}) - c_{b1} S_{\text{sa}} \bar{\rho} \nu_{\text{sa}} + c_{w1} f_w \bar{\rho} \left( \frac{\nu_{\text{sa}}}{d} \right)^2 - \frac{1}{\sigma} \nabla \cdot ((\bar{\mu} + \bar{\rho} \nu_{\text{sa}}) \nabla \nu_{\text{sa}}) - \frac{c_{b2} \bar{\rho}}{\sigma} \nabla \nu_{\text{sa}} \cdot \nabla \nu_{\text{sa}} &= Q_{\nu_{\text{sa}}},
\end{aligned} \tag{8}$$

so the modified set of Equations (8) has Equation (7) as analytical solution.

Recall that the averaged kinematic viscosity, total energy per unit mass and the total enthalpy per unit mass are given, respectively, by:

$$\tilde{\nu} = \frac{\bar{\mu}}{\bar{\rho}}, \quad \tilde{E} = \tilde{e} + \frac{\tilde{\mathbf{u}} \cdot \tilde{\mathbf{u}}}{2}, \quad \tilde{H} = \tilde{h} + \frac{\tilde{\mathbf{u}} \cdot \tilde{\mathbf{u}}}{2}, \tag{9}$$

with  $\tilde{e}$  and  $\tilde{h}$  defined in Equation (5). The averaged absolute viscosity  $\bar{\mu}$  is assumed to be constant.

The laminar mean heat-flux vector  $\bar{\mathbf{q}} = (\bar{q}_x, \bar{q}_y)$  is given by:

$$\bar{q}_x = \left( \frac{\bar{\mu}}{\text{Pr}} + \frac{\mu_t}{\text{Pr}_t} \right) \frac{\partial \tilde{h}}{\partial x} \quad \text{and} \quad \bar{q}_y = \left( \frac{\bar{\mu}}{\text{Pr}} + \frac{\mu_t}{\text{Pr}_t} \right) \frac{\partial \tilde{h}}{\partial y}, \tag{10}$$

where the Prandtl number,  $\text{Pr}$ , and the turbulent Prandtl number,  $\text{Pr}_t$ , are also assumed to be constant.

Additionally,  $\Omega$  and  $\tilde{\mathbf{S}}$  in expression (5) are:

$$\Omega = \sqrt{\left( \frac{\partial \tilde{u}}{\partial y} - \frac{\partial \tilde{v}}{\partial x} \right)^2} \quad \text{and} \quad \tilde{\mathbf{S}} = \begin{bmatrix} \tilde{S}_{xx} & \tilde{S}_{xy} \\ \tilde{S}_{yx} & \tilde{S}_{yy} \end{bmatrix},$$

with

$$\tilde{S}_{xx} = \frac{\partial \tilde{u}}{\partial x} - \frac{1}{3} \nabla \cdot \tilde{\mathbf{u}}, \quad \tilde{S}_{yy} = \frac{\partial \tilde{v}}{\partial y} - \frac{1}{3} \nabla \cdot \tilde{\mathbf{u}}, \quad \tilde{S}_{xy} = \tilde{S}_{yx} = \left( \frac{\partial \tilde{u}}{\partial y} + \frac{\partial \tilde{v}}{\partial x} \right).$$

Source terms  $Q_{\bar{\rho}}$ ,  $Q_{\tilde{\mathbf{u}}}$ ,  $Q_{\tilde{v}}$ ,  $Q_{\tilde{E}}$  and  $Q_{\nu_{\text{sa}}}$  are presented in the subsequent sessions with the use of the auxiliary variables:

$$\begin{aligned}
\text{Rho} &= \rho_0 + \rho_x \sin \left( \frac{a_{\rho x} \pi x}{L} \right) + \rho_y \cos \left( \frac{a_{\rho y} \pi y}{L} \right) + \rho_t \sin \left( \frac{a_{\rho t} \pi t}{L} \right), \\
\text{U} &= u_0 + u_x \sin \left( \frac{a_{ux} \pi x}{L} \right) + u_y \cos \left( \frac{a_{uy} \pi y}{L} \right) + u_t \cos \left( \frac{a_{ut} \pi t}{L} \right), \\
\text{V} &= v_0 + v_x \cos \left( \frac{a_{vx} \pi x}{L} \right) + v_y \sin \left( \frac{a_{vy} \pi y}{L} \right) + v_t \sin \left( \frac{a_{vt} \pi t}{L} \right), \\
\text{P} &= p_0 + p_x \cos \left( \frac{a_{px} \pi x}{L} \right) + p_y \sin \left( \frac{a_{py} \pi y}{L} \right) + p_t \cos \left( \frac{a_{pt} \pi t}{L} \right), \\
\text{Nu}_{\text{sa}} &= \nu_{\text{sa}0} + \nu_{\text{sa}x} \cos \left( \frac{a_{\nu_{\text{sa}}x} \pi x}{L} \right) + \nu_{\text{sa}y} \cos \left( \frac{a_{\nu_{\text{sa}}y} \pi y}{L} \right) + \nu_{\text{sa}t} \cos \left( \frac{a_{\nu_{\text{sa}}t} \pi t}{L} \right).
\end{aligned} \tag{11}$$

### 2.1.1 2D FANS Mass Conservation

The 2D Favre-averaged mass conservation equation written as an operator is:

$$\mathcal{L} = \frac{\partial(\bar{\rho})}{\partial t} + \frac{\partial(\bar{\rho} \tilde{u})}{\partial x} + \frac{\partial(\bar{\rho} \tilde{v})}{\partial y}.$$

Analytically differentiating Equation (7) for  $\bar{\rho}$ ,  $\tilde{u}$  and  $\tilde{v}$  using operator  $\mathcal{L}$  defined above gives the source term  $Q_{\bar{\rho}}$ :

$$\begin{aligned}
Q_{\bar{\rho}} = & \frac{a_{\rho x} \pi \rho_x \mathbf{U}}{L} \cos\left(\frac{a_{\rho x} \pi x}{L}\right) + \\
& - \frac{a_{\rho y} \pi \rho_y \mathbf{V}}{L} \sin\left(\frac{a_{\rho y} \pi y}{L}\right) + \\
& + \frac{\pi \mathbf{Rho}}{L} \left[ a_{ux} u_x \cos\left(\frac{a_{ux} \pi x}{L}\right) + a_{vy} v_y \cos\left(\frac{a_{vy} \pi y}{L}\right) \right] + \\
& + \frac{a_{\rho t} \pi \rho_t}{L} \cos\left(\frac{a_{\rho t} \pi t}{L}\right).
\end{aligned} \tag{12}$$

where  $\mathbf{Rho}$ ,  $\mathbf{U}$  and  $\mathbf{V}$  are given in Equation (11).

### 2.1.2 2D FANS Momentum Conservation

For the generation of the analytical source term  $Q_{\tilde{u}}$  for the Favre-averaged  $x$ -momentum equation, the first component of Equation (2) is written as an operator  $\mathcal{L}$ :

$$\mathcal{L} = \frac{\partial(\bar{\rho}\tilde{u})}{\partial t} + \frac{\partial(\bar{\rho}\tilde{u}^2)}{\partial x} + \frac{\partial(\bar{\rho}\tilde{u}\tilde{v})}{\partial y} + \frac{\partial(\bar{p})}{\partial x} - \frac{\partial(2(\bar{\mu} + \mu_t)\tilde{S}_{xx})}{\partial x} - \frac{\partial(2(\bar{\mu} + \mu_t)\tilde{S}_{xy})}{\partial y},$$

which, when operated in Equation (7), provides source term  $Q_{\tilde{u}}$ :

$$\begin{aligned}
Q_{\tilde{u}} = & \frac{a_{\rho x} \pi \rho_x \mathbf{U}^2}{L} \cos\left(\frac{a_{\rho x} \pi x}{L}\right) - \frac{a_{\rho y} \pi \rho_y \mathbf{U} \mathbf{V}}{L} \sin\left(\frac{a_{\rho y} \pi y}{L}\right) + \\
& - \frac{a_{uy} \pi u_y \mathbf{Rho} \mathbf{V}}{L} \sin\left(\frac{a_{uy} \pi y}{L}\right) + \frac{\pi \mathbf{Rho} \mathbf{U}}{L} \left[ 2a_{ux} u_x \cos\left(\frac{a_{ux} \pi x}{L}\right) + a_{vy} v_y \cos\left(\frac{a_{vy} \pi y}{L}\right) \right] + \\
& - \frac{a_{px} \pi p_x}{L} \sin\left(\frac{a_{px} \pi x}{L}\right) + \\
& + \frac{f_{v1} \pi^2 \mathbf{Rho} \mathbf{Nu}_{sa}}{L^2} \left[ 4/3 a_{ux}^2 u_x \sin\left(\frac{a_{ux} \pi x}{L}\right) + a_{uy}^2 u_y \cos\left(\frac{a_{uy} \pi y}{L}\right) \right] + \\
& + \frac{f_{v1} \pi^2 \mathbf{Rho}}{L^2} \left[ 4/3 a_{ux} a_{\nu_{sa}x} u_x \nu_{sa}x \cos\left(\frac{a_{ux} \pi x}{L}\right) \sin\left(\frac{a_{\nu_{sa}x} \pi x}{L}\right) - a_{uy} a_{\nu_{sa}y} u_y \nu_{sa}y \sin\left(\frac{a_{uy} \pi y}{L}\right) \sin\left(\frac{a_{\nu_{sa}y} \pi y}{L}\right) \right. \\
& \quad \left. - a_{vx} a_{\nu_{sa}y} v_x \nu_{sa}y \sin\left(\frac{a_{vx} \pi x}{L}\right) \sin\left(\frac{a_{\nu_{sa}y} \pi y}{L}\right) - 2/3 a_{vy} a_{\nu_{sa}x} v_y \nu_{sa}x \cos\left(\frac{a_{vy} \pi y}{L}\right) \sin\left(\frac{a_{\nu_{sa}x} \pi x}{L}\right) \right] + \\
& + \frac{f_{v1} \pi^2 \mathbf{Nu}_{sa}}{L^2} \left[ -4/3 a_{\rho x} a_{ux} \rho_x u_x \cos\left(\frac{a_{\rho x} \pi x}{L}\right) \cos\left(\frac{a_{ux} \pi x}{L}\right) + 2/3 a_{\rho x} a_{vy} \rho_x v_y \cos\left(\frac{a_{\rho x} \pi x}{L}\right) \cos\left(\frac{a_{vy} \pi y}{L}\right) \right. \\
& \quad \left. - a_{\rho y} a_{uy} \rho_y u_y \sin\left(\frac{a_{\rho y} \pi y}{L}\right) \sin\left(\frac{a_{uy} \pi y}{L}\right) - a_{\rho y} a_{vx} \rho_y v_x \sin\left(\frac{a_{\rho y} \pi y}{L}\right) \sin\left(\frac{a_{vx} \pi x}{L}\right) \right] + \\
& + \frac{\pi^2 \bar{\mu}}{3L^2} \left[ \frac{c_{v1}^3}{\chi^3 + c_{v1}^3} + f_{v1} \right] \left[ 4a_{ux}^2 u_x \sin\left(\frac{a_{ux} \pi x}{L}\right) + 3a_{uy}^2 u_y \cos\left(\frac{a_{uy} \pi y}{L}\right) \right] + \\
& + \frac{a_{\rho t} \pi \rho_t \mathbf{U}}{L} \cos\left(\frac{a_{\rho t} \pi t}{L}\right) + \\
& - \frac{a_{ut} \pi u_t \mathbf{Rho}}{L} \sin\left(\frac{a_{ut} \pi t}{L}\right),
\end{aligned} \tag{13}$$

where

$$f_{v1} = \frac{\chi^3}{\chi^3 + c_{v1}^3} \quad \text{and} \quad \chi = \frac{\mathbf{Nu}_{sa}}{\tilde{\nu}} = \frac{\mathbf{Rho} \mathbf{Nu}_{sa}}{\bar{\mu}}, \tag{14}$$

and  $\mathbf{Rho}$ ,  $\mathbf{U}$ ,  $\mathbf{V}$  and  $\mathbf{Nu}_{sa}$  are given in Equation (11).

Analogously, for the generation of the analytical source term  $Q_{\tilde{v}}$  for the Favre-averaged  $y$ -momentum equation, the second component of Equation (2) is written as an operator  $\mathcal{L}$ :

$$\mathcal{L} = \frac{\partial(\bar{\rho}\tilde{v})}{\partial t} + \frac{\partial(\bar{\rho}\tilde{u}\tilde{v})}{\partial x} + \frac{\partial(\bar{\rho}\tilde{v}^2)}{\partial y} + \frac{\partial(\bar{p})}{\partial y} - \frac{\partial(2(\bar{\mu} + \mu_t)\tilde{S}_{yx})}{\partial x} - \frac{\partial(2(\bar{\mu} + \mu_t)\tilde{S}_{yy})}{\partial y},$$

and then applied to Equation (7). It yields:

$$\begin{aligned}
Q_{\tilde{v}} = & \frac{a_{\rho x} \pi \rho_x \mathbf{U} \mathbf{V}}{L} \cos\left(\frac{a_{\rho x} \pi x}{L}\right) - \frac{a_{\rho y} \pi \rho_y \mathbf{V}^2}{L} \sin\left(\frac{a_{\rho y} \pi y}{L}\right) + \\
& - \frac{a_{v x} \pi v_x \mathbf{Rho} \mathbf{U}}{L} \sin\left(\frac{a_{v x} \pi x}{L}\right) + \frac{\pi \mathbf{Rho} \mathbf{V}}{L} \left[ a_{u x} u_x \cos\left(\frac{a_{u x} \pi x}{L}\right) + 2 a_{v y} v_y \cos\left(\frac{a_{v y} \pi y}{L}\right) \right] + \\
& + \frac{a_{p y} \pi p_y}{L} \cos\left(\frac{a_{p y} \pi y}{L}\right) + \\
& + \frac{f_{v1} \pi^2 \mathbf{Rho} \mathbf{Nu}_{sa}}{L^2} \left[ a_{v x}^2 v_x \cos\left(\frac{a_{v x} \pi x}{L}\right) + 4/3 a_{v y}^2 v_y \sin\left(\frac{a_{v y} \pi y}{L}\right) \right] + \\
& + \frac{f_{v1} \pi^2 \mathbf{Rho}}{L^2} \left[ -2/3 a_{u x} a_{v_{sa} y} u_x v_{sa y} \cos\left(\frac{a_{u x} \pi x}{L}\right) \sin\left(\frac{a_{v_{sa} y} \pi y}{L}\right) - a_{u y} a_{v_{sa} x} u_y v_{sa x} \sin\left(\frac{a_{u y} \pi y}{L}\right) \sin\left(\frac{a_{v_{sa} x} \pi x}{L}\right) + \right. \\
& \quad \left. - a_{v x} a_{v_{sa} x} v_x v_{sa x} \sin\left(\frac{a_{v x} \pi x}{L}\right) \sin\left(\frac{a_{v_{sa} x} \pi x}{L}\right) + 4/3 a_{v y} a_{v_{sa} y} v_y v_{sa y} \cos\left(\frac{a_{v y} \pi y}{L}\right) \sin\left(\frac{a_{v_{sa} y} \pi y}{L}\right) \right] + \\
& + \frac{f_{v1} \pi^2 \mathbf{Nu}_{sa}}{L^2} \left[ a_{\rho x} a_{u y} \rho_x u_y \cos\left(\frac{a_{\rho x} \pi x}{L}\right) \sin\left(\frac{a_{u y} \pi y}{L}\right) + a_{\rho x} a_{v x} \rho_x v_x \cos\left(\frac{a_{\rho x} \pi x}{L}\right) \sin\left(\frac{a_{v x} \pi x}{L}\right) + \right. \\
& \quad \left. - 2/3 a_{\rho y} a_{u x} \rho_y u_x \sin\left(\frac{a_{\rho y} \pi y}{L}\right) \cos\left(\frac{a_{u x} \pi x}{L}\right) + 4/3 a_{\rho y} a_{v y} \rho_y v_y \sin\left(\frac{a_{\rho y} \pi y}{L}\right) \cos\left(\frac{a_{v y} \pi y}{L}\right) \right] + \\
& + \frac{\pi^2 \bar{\mu}}{3 L^2} \left[ \frac{c_{v1}^3}{\chi^3 + c_{v1}^3} + f_{v1} \right] \left[ 3 a_{v x}^2 v_x \cos\left(\frac{a_{v x} \pi x}{L}\right) + 4 a_{v y}^2 v_y \sin\left(\frac{a_{v y} \pi y}{L}\right) \right] + \\
& + \frac{a_{\rho t} \pi \rho_t \mathbf{V}}{L} \cos\left(\frac{a_{\rho t} \pi t}{L}\right) + \\
& + \frac{a_{v t} \pi v_t \mathbf{Rho}}{L} \cos\left(\frac{a_{v t} \pi t}{L}\right),
\end{aligned} \tag{15}$$

where  $\chi$  and  $f_{v1}$  are given in Equation (14), and  $\mathbf{Rho}$ ,  $\mathbf{U}$ ,  $\mathbf{V}$  and  $\mathbf{Nu}_{sa}$  are given in Equation (11).

### 2.1.3 2D FANS Total Energy Conservation

The operator for the 2D Favre-averaged total energy is:

$$\begin{aligned}
\mathcal{L} = & \frac{\partial(\bar{\rho} \tilde{E})}{\partial t} + \frac{\partial(\bar{\rho} \tilde{u} \tilde{E})}{\partial x} + \frac{\partial(\bar{\rho} \tilde{v} \tilde{E})}{\partial y} + \frac{\partial(\bar{p} \tilde{u})}{\partial x} + \frac{\partial(\bar{p} \tilde{v})}{\partial y} - \frac{\partial(\bar{q}_x)}{\partial x} - \frac{\partial(\bar{q}_y)}{\partial y} + \\
& - \frac{\partial(2(\bar{\mu} + \mu_t) \tilde{u} \tilde{S}_{xx})}{\partial x} - \frac{\partial(2(\bar{\mu} + \mu_t) \tilde{v} \tilde{S}_{xy})}{\partial x} - \frac{\partial(2(\bar{\mu} + \mu_t) \tilde{u} \tilde{S}_{yx})}{\partial y} - \frac{\partial(2(\bar{\mu} + \mu_t) \tilde{v} \tilde{S}_{yy})}{\partial y}.
\end{aligned}$$

Source term  $Q_{\tilde{E}}$  is obtained by operating  $\mathcal{L}$  on Equation (7) together with the use of the auxiliary relations for energy given in Equations (5), (9) and (10). It yields:

$$\begin{aligned}
Q_{\tilde{E}} = & \frac{a_{\rho x} \pi \rho_x \mathbf{U}(\mathbf{U}^2 + \mathbf{V}^2)}{2L} \cos\left(\frac{a_{\rho x} \pi x}{L}\right) - \frac{a_{\rho y} \pi \rho_y \mathbf{V}(\mathbf{U}^2 + \mathbf{V}^2)}{2L} \sin\left(\frac{a_{\rho y} \pi y}{L}\right) + \frac{a_{\rho t} \pi \rho_t (\mathbf{U}^2 + \mathbf{V}^2)}{2L} \cos\left(\frac{a_{\rho t} \pi t}{L}\right) + \\
& - \frac{c_p a_{p x} \pi p_x \mathbf{U}}{LR} \sin\left(\frac{a_{p x} \pi x}{L}\right) + \frac{c_p a_{p y} \pi p_y \mathbf{V}}{LR} \cos\left(\frac{a_{p y} \pi y}{L}\right) + \\
& + \frac{c_p \pi \mathbf{P}}{LR} \left[ a_{u x} u_x \cos\left(\frac{a_{u x} \pi x}{L}\right) + a_{v y} v_y \cos\left(\frac{a_{v y} \pi y}{L}\right) \right] + \frac{c_v a_{\rho t} \pi \rho_t \mathbf{P}}{LR \mathbf{Rho}} \cos\left(\frac{a_{\rho t} \pi t}{L}\right) + \\
& - \frac{a_{u t} \pi u_t \mathbf{Rho} \mathbf{U}}{L} \sin\left(\frac{a_{u t} \pi t}{L}\right) + \frac{a_{v t} \pi v_t \mathbf{Rho} \mathbf{V}}{L} \cos\left(\frac{a_{v t} \pi t}{L}\right) + \\
& + \frac{\pi^2 \mathbf{U} \mu_t}{L^2} \left[ 4/3 a_{u x}^2 u_x \sin\left(\frac{a_{u x} \pi x}{L}\right) + a_{u y}^2 u_y \cos\left(\frac{a_{u y} \pi y}{L}\right) \right] + \\
& + \frac{\pi^2 \mathbf{V} \mu_t}{L^2} \left[ a_{v x}^2 v_x \cos\left(\frac{a_{v x} \pi x}{L}\right) + 4/3 a_{v y}^2 v_y \sin\left(\frac{a_{v y} \pi y}{L}\right) \right] + \\
& + \dots
\end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
& + \dots \\
& + \frac{\pi^2 \mu_t}{L^2} \left[ -4/3 a_{ux}^2 u_x^2 \cos\left(\frac{a_{ux}\pi x}{L}\right)^2 + 4/3 a_{ux} a_{vy} u_x v_y \cos\left(\frac{a_{ux}\pi x}{L}\right) \cos\left(\frac{a_{vy}\pi y}{L}\right) - a_{uy}^2 u_y^2 \sin\left(\frac{a_{uy}\pi y}{L}\right)^2 + \right. \\
& \quad \left. - 2a_{uy} a_{vx} u_y v_x \sin\left(\frac{a_{uy}\pi y}{L}\right) \sin\left(\frac{a_{vx}\pi x}{L}\right) - a_{vx}^2 v_x^2 \sin\left(\frac{a_{vx}\pi x}{L}\right)^2 - 4/3 a_{vy}^2 v_y^2 \cos\left(\frac{a_{vy}\pi y}{L}\right)^2 \right] + \\
& + \frac{\pi^2 f_{v1} \text{Rho U}}{L^2} \left[ 4/3 a_{ux} a_{\nu_{sa}x} u_x \nu_{sa}x \cos\left(\frac{a_{ux}\pi x}{L}\right) \sin\left(\frac{a_{\nu_{sa}x}\pi x}{L}\right) - a_{uy} a_{\nu_{sa}y} u_y \nu_{sa}y \sin\left(\frac{a_{uy}\pi y}{L}\right) \sin\left(\frac{a_{\nu_{sa}y}\pi y}{L}\right) + \right. \\
& \quad \left. - a_{vx} a_{\nu_{sa}x} v_x \nu_{sa}x \sin\left(\frac{a_{vx}\pi x}{L}\right) \sin\left(\frac{a_{\nu_{sa}x}\pi x}{L}\right) - 2/3 a_{vy} a_{\nu_{sa}y} v_y \nu_{sa}y \cos\left(\frac{a_{vy}\pi y}{L}\right) \sin\left(\frac{a_{\nu_{sa}y}\pi y}{L}\right) \right] + \\
& + \frac{\pi^2 f_{v1} \text{Rho V}}{L^2} \left[ -2/3 a_{ux} a_{\nu_{sa}x} u_x \nu_{sa}x \cos\left(\frac{a_{ux}\pi x}{L}\right) \sin\left(\frac{a_{\nu_{sa}x}\pi x}{L}\right) - a_{uy} a_{\nu_{sa}y} u_y \nu_{sa}y \sin\left(\frac{a_{uy}\pi y}{L}\right) \sin\left(\frac{a_{\nu_{sa}y}\pi y}{L}\right) + \right. \\
& \quad \left. - a_{vx} a_{\nu_{sa}x} v_x \nu_{sa}x \sin\left(\frac{a_{vx}\pi x}{L}\right) \sin\left(\frac{a_{\nu_{sa}x}\pi x}{L}\right) + 4/3 a_{vy} a_{\nu_{sa}y} v_y \nu_{sa}y \cos\left(\frac{a_{vy}\pi y}{L}\right) \sin\left(\frac{a_{\nu_{sa}y}\pi y}{L}\right) \right] + \\
& + \frac{\pi^2 f_{v1} \text{U Nu}_{sa}}{L^2} \left[ -4/3 a_{\rho x} a_{ux} \rho_x u_x \cos\left(\frac{a_{\rho x}\pi x}{L}\right) \cos\left(\frac{a_{ux}\pi x}{L}\right) + 2/3 a_{\rho x} a_{vy} \rho_x v_y \cos\left(\frac{a_{\rho x}\pi x}{L}\right) \cos\left(\frac{a_{vy}\pi y}{L}\right) + \right. \\
& \quad \left. - a_{\rho y} a_{uy} \rho_y u_y \sin\left(\frac{a_{\rho y}\pi y}{L}\right) \sin\left(\frac{a_{uy}\pi y}{L}\right) - a_{\rho y} a_{vx} \rho_y v_x \sin\left(\frac{a_{\rho y}\pi y}{L}\right) \sin\left(\frac{a_{vx}\pi x}{L}\right) \right] + \\
& + \frac{\pi^2 f_{v1} \text{V Nu}_{sa}}{L^2} \left[ a_{\rho x} a_{uy} \rho_x u_y \cos\left(\frac{a_{\rho x}\pi x}{L}\right) \sin\left(\frac{a_{uy}\pi y}{L}\right) + a_{\rho x} a_{vx} \rho_x v_x \cos\left(\frac{a_{\rho x}\pi x}{L}\right) \sin\left(\frac{a_{vx}\pi x}{L}\right) + \right. \\
& \quad \left. - 2/3 a_{\rho y} a_{ux} \rho_y u_x \sin\left(\frac{a_{\rho y}\pi y}{L}\right) \cos\left(\frac{a_{ux}\pi x}{L}\right) + 4/3 a_{\rho y} a_{vy} \rho_y v_y \sin\left(\frac{a_{\rho y}\pi y}{L}\right) \cos\left(\frac{a_{vy}\pi y}{L}\right) \right] + \\
& - \frac{\pi^2 \bar{\mu}}{3L^2} \left[ \frac{c_{v1}^3}{\chi^3 + c_{v1}^3} + f_{v1} \right] \left[ 4a_{ux}^2 u_x^2 \cos\left(\frac{a_{ux}\pi x}{L}\right)^2 - 4a_{ux} a_{vy} u_x v_y \cos\left(\frac{a_{ux}\pi x}{L}\right) \cos\left(\frac{a_{vy}\pi y}{L}\right) + 3a_{uy}^2 u_y^2 \sin\left(\frac{a_{uy}\pi y}{L}\right)^2 + \right. \\
& \quad \left. + 6a_{uy} a_{vx} u_y v_x \sin\left(\frac{a_{uy}\pi y}{L}\right) \sin\left(\frac{a_{vx}\pi x}{L}\right) + 3a_{vx}^2 v_x^2 \sin\left(\frac{a_{vx}\pi x}{L}\right)^2 + 4a_{vy}^2 v_y^2 \cos\left(\frac{a_{vy}\pi y}{L}\right)^2 \right] + \\
& + \frac{\pi^2 \bar{\mu} \text{U}}{3L^2} \left[ \frac{c_{v1}^3}{\chi^3 + c_{v1}^3} + f_{v1} \right] \left[ 4a_{ux}^2 u_x \sin\left(\frac{a_{ux}\pi x}{L}\right) + 3a_{uy}^2 u_y \cos\left(\frac{a_{uy}\pi y}{L}\right) \right] + \\
& + \frac{\pi^2 \bar{\mu} \text{V}}{3L^2} \left[ \frac{c_{v1}^3}{\chi^3 + c_{v1}^3} + f_{v1} \right] \left[ 3a_{vx}^2 v_x \cos\left(\frac{a_{vx}\pi x}{L}\right) + 4a_{vy}^2 v_y \sin\left(\frac{a_{vy}\pi y}{L}\right) \right] + \\
& + \frac{\pi \text{Rho U}^2}{2L} \left[ 3a_{ux} u_x \cos\left(\frac{a_{ux}\pi x}{L}\right) + a_{vy} v_y \cos\left(\frac{a_{vy}\pi y}{L}\right) \right] + \\
& - \frac{\pi \text{Rho U V}}{L} \left[ a_{uy} u_y \sin\left(\frac{a_{uy}\pi y}{L}\right) + a_{vx} v_x \sin\left(\frac{a_{vx}\pi x}{L}\right) \right] + \\
& + \frac{\pi \text{Rho V}^2}{2L} \left[ a_{ux} u_x \cos\left(\frac{a_{ux}\pi x}{L}\right) + 3a_{vy} v_y \cos\left(\frac{a_{vy}\pi y}{L}\right) \right] + \\
& - \frac{c_p \pi^2}{L^2 R \text{Rho Nu}_{sa}} \frac{\mu_t}{\text{Pr}_t} \left[ a_{px} a_{\nu_{sa}x} p_x \nu_{sa}x \sin\left(\frac{a_{px}\pi x}{L}\right) \sin\left(\frac{a_{\nu_{sa}x}\pi x}{L}\right) - a_{py} a_{\nu_{sa}y} p_y \nu_{sa}y \cos\left(\frac{a_{py}\pi y}{L}\right) \sin\left(\frac{a_{\nu_{sa}y}\pi y}{L}\right) \right] + \\
& - \frac{c_p \pi^2 \text{P}}{L^2 R \text{Rho}^2 \text{Nu}_{sa}} \frac{\mu_t}{\text{Pr}_t} \left[ a_{\rho x} a_{\nu_{sa}x} \rho_x \nu_{sa}x \cos\left(\frac{a_{\rho x}\pi x}{L}\right) \sin\left(\frac{a_{\nu_{sa}x}\pi x}{L}\right) - a_{\rho y} a_{\nu_{sa}y} \rho_y \nu_{sa}y \sin\left(\frac{a_{\rho y}\pi y}{L}\right) \sin\left(\frac{a_{\nu_{sa}y}\pi y}{L}\right) \right] + \\
& - \frac{c_p \pi^2}{L^2 R \text{Rho}^2} \left[ \frac{\mu_t}{\text{Pr}_t} + \frac{2\bar{\mu}}{\text{Pr}} \right] \left[ a_{px} a_{\rho x} \rho_x p_x \cos\left(\frac{a_{\rho x}\pi x}{L}\right) \sin\left(\frac{a_{px}\pi x}{L}\right) + a_{py} a_{\rho y} \rho_y p_y \sin\left(\frac{a_{\rho y}\pi y}{L}\right) \cos\left(\frac{a_{py}\pi y}{L}\right) \right] + \\
& - \frac{c_p \pi^2 \text{P}}{L^2 R \text{Rho}^3} \left[ \frac{\mu_t}{\text{Pr}_t} + \frac{2\bar{\mu}}{\text{Pr}} \right] \left[ a_{\rho x}^2 \rho_x^2 \cos\left(\frac{a_{\rho x}\pi x}{L}\right)^2 + a_{\rho y}^2 \rho_y^2 \sin\left(\frac{a_{\rho y}\pi y}{L}\right)^2 \right] + \\
& + \frac{c_p \pi^2}{L^2 R \text{Rho}} \left[ \frac{\mu_t}{\text{Pr}_t} + \frac{\bar{\mu}}{\text{Pr}} \right] \left[ a_{px}^2 p_x \cos\left(\frac{a_{px}\pi x}{L}\right) + a_{py}^2 p_y \sin\left(\frac{a_{py}\pi y}{L}\right) \right] + \\
& - \frac{c_p \pi^2 \text{P}}{L^2 R \text{Rho}^2} \left[ \frac{\mu_t}{\text{Pr}_t} + \frac{\bar{\mu}}{\text{Pr}} \right] \left[ a_{\rho x}^2 \rho_x \sin\left(\frac{a_{\rho x}\pi x}{L}\right) + a_{\rho y}^2 \rho_y \cos\left(\frac{a_{\rho y}\pi y}{L}\right) \right],
\end{aligned}
\tag{16}$$

where  $\text{Rho}$ ,  $\text{P}$ ,  $\text{U}$ ,  $\text{V}$  and  $\text{Nu}_{sa}$  are given in Equation (11),  $\chi$  and  $f_{v1}$  are given in Equation (14), and

$$\mu_t = f_{v1} \text{Rho Nu}_{sa}.$$

### 2.1.4 2D SA Transport Equation

The operator for the viscosity-like baseline compressible Spalart-Allmaras equation is:

$$\begin{aligned}\mathcal{L} = & \frac{\partial(\bar{\rho}\nu_{sa})}{\partial t} + \frac{\partial(\bar{\rho}\tilde{u}\nu_{sa})}{\partial x} + \frac{\partial(\bar{\rho}\tilde{v}\nu_{sa})}{\partial y} - c_{b1}S_{sa}\bar{\rho}\nu_{sa} + c_{w1}f_w\bar{\rho}\left(\frac{\nu_{sa}}{d}\right)^2 + \\ & - \frac{1}{\sigma}\left[\frac{\partial}{\partial x}\left((\bar{\mu} + \bar{\rho}\nu_{sa})\frac{\partial\nu_{sa}}{\partial x}\right) + \frac{\partial}{\partial y}\left((\bar{\mu} + \bar{\rho}\nu_{sa})\frac{\partial\nu_{sa}}{\partial y}\right)\right] - \frac{c_{b2}\bar{\rho}}{\sigma}\left[\left(\frac{\partial\nu_{sa}}{\partial x}\right)^2 + \left(\frac{\partial\nu_{sa}}{\partial y}\right)^2\right].\end{aligned}$$

Source term  $Q_{\nu_{sa}}$  is obtained by operating  $\mathcal{L}$  on Equation (7) together with the use of the auxiliary relations given in Equation (5). It yields:

$$\begin{aligned}Q_{\nu_{sa}} = & \frac{a_{\rho x}\pi\rho_x U Nu_{sa}}{L} \cos\left(\frac{a_{\rho x}\pi x}{L}\right) + \\ & - \frac{a_{\rho y}\pi\rho_y V Nu_{sa}}{L} \sin\left(\frac{a_{\rho y}\pi y}{L}\right) + \\ & - \frac{a_{\nu_{sa}x}\pi\nu_{sax} Rho U}{L} \sin\left(\frac{a_{\nu_{sa}x}\pi x}{L}\right) + \\ & - \frac{a_{\nu_{sa}y}\pi\nu_{say} Rho V}{L} \sin\left(\frac{a_{\nu_{sa}y}\pi y}{L}\right) + \\ & - \frac{(1 + c_{b2})\pi^2 Rho}{L^2\sigma} \left[ a_{\nu_{sa}x}^2 \nu_{sax}^2 \sin^2\left(\frac{a_{\nu_{sa}x}\pi x}{L}\right) + a_{\nu_{sa}y}^2 \nu_{say}^2 \sin^2\left(\frac{a_{\nu_{sa}y}\pi y}{L}\right) \right] + \\ & + \frac{\pi^2 Nu_{sa}}{L^2\sigma} \left[ a_{\rho x} a_{\nu_{sa}x} \rho_x \nu_{sax} \cos\left(\frac{a_{\rho x}\pi x}{L}\right) \sin\left(\frac{a_{\nu_{sa}x}\pi x}{L}\right) - a_{\rho y} a_{\nu_{sa}y} \rho_y \nu_{say} \sin\left(\frac{a_{\rho y}\pi y}{L}\right) \sin\left(\frac{a_{\nu_{sa}y}\pi y}{L}\right) \right] + \\ & + \frac{\pi Rho Nu_{sa}}{L} \left[ a_{ux} u_x \cos\left(\frac{a_{ux}\pi x}{L}\right) + a_{vy} v_y \cos\left(\frac{a_{vy}\pi y}{L}\right) \right] + \\ & + \frac{(Rho Nu_{sa} + \bar{\mu})\pi^2}{L^2\sigma} \left[ a_{\nu_{sa}x}^2 \nu_{sax} \cos\left(\frac{a_{\nu_{sa}x}\pi x}{L}\right) + a_{\nu_{sa}y}^2 \nu_{say} \cos\left(\frac{a_{\nu_{sa}y}\pi y}{L}\right) \right] + \\ & + \frac{a_{\rho t}\pi\rho_t Nu_{sa}}{L} \cos\left(\frac{a_{\rho t}\pi t}{L}\right) + \\ & - \frac{a_{\nu_{sa}t}\pi\nu_{sat} Rho}{L} \sin\left(\frac{a_{\nu_{sa}t}\pi t}{L}\right) + \\ & - c_{b1}S_{sa} Rho Nu_{sa} + \\ & + c_{w1}f_w Rho \left(\frac{Nu_{sa}}{d}\right)^2, \end{aligned} \tag{17}$$

where  $Rho$ ,  $U$ ,  $V$  and  $Nu_{sa}$  are defined in (11) and

$$\begin{aligned}S_{sa} = & \Omega + \frac{Nu_{sa}}{\kappa^2 d^2} f_{v2}, \quad \Omega = \sqrt{\left[\frac{a_{uy}\pi u_y}{L} \sin\left(\frac{a_{uy}\pi y}{L}\right) - \frac{a_{vx}\pi v_x}{L} \sin\left(\frac{a_{vx}\pi x}{L}\right)\right]^2}, \\ f_{v2} = & 1 - \frac{\chi}{1 + \chi f_{v1}}, \quad f_{v1} = \frac{\chi^3}{\chi^3 + c_{v1}^3}, \quad \chi = \frac{Rho Nu_{sa}}{\bar{\mu}}, \\ f_w = & g \left(\frac{1 + c_{w3}^6}{g^6 + c_{w3}^6}\right)^{1/6}, \quad g = r + c_{w2}(r^6 - r), \quad r = \frac{Nu_{sa}}{S_{sa}\kappa^2 d^2}.\end{aligned} \tag{18}$$

## 3 Comments

The complexity, and consequently length, of the source terms increase with both dimension and physics handled by the governing equations. Applying commands in order to simplify extensive expressions is challenging even with a high performance workstation; thus, a suitable alternative to this issue is to simplify each equation by dividing it into a combination of sub-operators handling different physical phenomena. Then, each one of the operators may be applied to the manufactured solutions individually, and the resulting sub-source terms are combined back to represent the source term for the original equation.

For instance, instead of writing the two-dimensional FANS SA equation using one single operator  $\mathcal{L}$ :

$$\mathcal{L} = \frac{\partial(\bar{\rho}\nu_{sa})}{\partial t} + \nabla \cdot (\bar{\rho}\tilde{\mathbf{u}}\nu_{sa}) - c_{b1}S_{sa}\bar{\rho}\nu_{sa} + c_{w1}f_w\bar{\rho}\left(\frac{\nu_{sa}}{d}\right)^2 - \frac{1}{\sigma}\nabla \cdot ((\bar{\mu} + \bar{\rho}\nu_{sa})\nabla\nu_{sa}) - \frac{c_{b2}\bar{\rho}}{\sigma}\nabla\nu_{sa} \cdot \nabla\nu_{sa} \quad (19)$$

to then be used in the MMS, let Equation (19) be written with six operators:

$$\begin{aligned} \mathcal{L}_1 &= \frac{\partial(\bar{\rho}\nu_{sa})}{\partial t}, & \mathcal{L}_2 &= \nabla \cdot (\bar{\rho}\tilde{\mathbf{u}}\nu_{sa}), \\ \mathcal{L}_3 &= -c_{b1}S_{sa}\bar{\rho}\nu_{sa}, & \mathcal{L}_4 &= c_{w1}f_w\bar{\rho}\left(\frac{\nu_{sa}}{d}\right)^2, \\ \mathcal{L}_5 &= -\frac{1}{\sigma}\nabla \cdot ((\bar{\mu} + \bar{\rho}\nu_{sa})\nabla\nu_{sa}) & \mathcal{L}_6 &= -\frac{c_{b2}\bar{\rho}}{\sigma}\nabla\nu_{sa} \cdot \nabla\nu_{sa}. \end{aligned} \quad (20)$$

Naturally,  $\mathcal{L} = \mathcal{L}_1 + \mathcal{L}_2 + \mathcal{L}_3 + \mathcal{L}_4 + \mathcal{L}_5 + \mathcal{L}_6$ .

After the application of each sub-operator defined in (20), the corresponding sub-source terms are also simplified, factorized and sorted. Then, the final factorized version is checked against the original one, in order to assure that not human error has been introduced.

An advantage of this strategy is the possibility of inclusion and/or removal of other physical effects without the need of re-doing previous manipulations. For instance, in order to simplify this model, assuming that the distance  $d$  to the nearest wall is infinite, only changes should be made in only two operators:  $\mathcal{L}_3$  is simplified since  $S_{sa}$  is reduced to  $S_{sa} = \Omega$ , and  $\mathcal{L}_4 = 0$ . The equations for conservation of mass, momentum and total energy remain unchanged.

This strategy results in less time, decreases the computational effort and occasional software crashes, and also increases the flexibility in the code verification procedure.

### 3.1 Boundary Conditions and C Files

Additionally to verifying code capability of solving the governing equations accurately in the interior of the domain of interest, one may also verify the software capability of correctly imposing boundary conditions. Therefore, the gradients of the analytical solutions (7) have been calculated:

$$\begin{aligned} \nabla\bar{\rho} &= \begin{bmatrix} \frac{a_{\rho x}\pi\rho_x}{L}\cos\left(\frac{a_{\rho x}\pi x}{L}\right) \\ -\frac{a_{\rho y}\pi\rho_y}{L}\sin\left(\frac{a_{\rho y}\pi y}{L}\right) \end{bmatrix}, & \nabla\bar{p} &= \begin{bmatrix} -\frac{a_{px}\pi p_x}{L}\sin\left(\frac{a_{px}\pi x}{L}\right) \\ \frac{a_{py}\pi p_y}{L}\cos\left(\frac{a_{py}\pi y}{L}\right) \end{bmatrix}, & \nabla\tilde{u} &= \begin{bmatrix} \frac{a_{ux}\pi u_x}{L}\cos\left(\frac{a_{ux}\pi x}{L}\right) \\ -\frac{a_{uy}\pi u_y}{L}\sin\left(\frac{a_{uy}\pi y}{L}\right) \end{bmatrix}, \\ \nabla\tilde{v} &= \begin{bmatrix} -\frac{a_{vx}\pi v_x}{L}\sin\left(\frac{a_{vx}\pi x}{L}\right) \\ \frac{a_{vy}\pi v_y}{L}\cos\left(\frac{a_{vy}\pi y}{L}\right) \end{bmatrix} & \text{and} & \nabla\nu_{sa} &= \begin{bmatrix} -\frac{a_{\nu_{sa}x}\pi\nu_{sa}x}{L}\sin\left(\frac{a_{\nu_{sa}x}\pi x}{L}\right) \\ -\frac{a_{\nu_{sa}y}\pi\nu_{sa}y}{L}\sin\left(\frac{a_{\nu_{sa}y}\pi y}{L}\right) \end{bmatrix}. \end{aligned}$$

and translated into  $C$  codes:

```
grad_rho_an[0] = rho_x * cos(a_rhox * pi * x / L) * a_rhox * pi / L;
grad_rho_an[1] = -rho_y * sin(a_rhoy * pi * y / L) * a_rhoy * pi / L;
grad_p_an[0] = -p_x * sin(a_px * pi * x / L) * a_px * pi / L;
grad_p_an[1] = p_y * cos(a_py * pi * y / L) * a_py * pi / L;
grad_u_an[0] = u_x * cos(a_ux * pi * x / L) * a_ux * pi / L;
grad_u_an[1] = -u_y * sin(a_uy * pi * y / L) * a_uy * pi / L;
grad_v_an[0] = -v_x * sin(a_vx * pi * x / L) * a_vx * pi / L;
grad_v_an[1] = v_y * cos(a_vy * pi * y / L) * a_vy * pi / L;
grad_nu_sa_an[0] = -nu_sa_x * sin(a_nusax * pi * x / L) * a_nusax * pi / L;
grad_nu_sa_an[1] = -nu_sa_y * sin(a_nusay * pi * y / L) * a_nusay * pi / L;
```

Files containing  $C$  codes for the source terms have also been automatically generated. They are:

FANS\_SA\_transient\_2d\_rho\_code.C, FANS\_SA\_transient\_2d\_u\_code.C, FANS\_SA\_transient\_2d\_v\_code.C, FANS\_SA\_transient\_2d\_E\_code.C and FANS\_SA\_transient\_2d\_nu\_code.C.

An example of the  $C$  file from the source term  $Q_{\nu_{sa}}$  for the 2D Spalart-Allmaras equation is:



```

#include <math.h>

double SourceQ_nu (double x, double y, double t, double mu, double c_b1, double c_b2, double c_v1,
double c_w1, double c_w2, double c_w3, double kappa, double d, double sigma)
{
double Q_nu;
double RHO;
double U;
double V;
double NU_SA;
double chi;
double f_v1;
double f_v2;
double Omega;
double Ssa;
double r;
double g;
double f_w;
NU_SA = nu_sa_0 + nu_sa_x * cos(a_nusax * PI * x / L) + nu_sa_y * cos(a_nusay * PI * y / L)
+ nu_sa_t * cos(a_nusat * PI * t / L);
RHO = rho_0 + rho_x * sin(a_rhox * PI * x / L) + rho_y * cos(a_rhoy * PI * y / L)
+ rho_t * sin(a_rhot * PI * t / L);
U = u_0 + u_x * sin(a_ux * PI * x / L) + u_y * cos(a_uy * PI * y / L) + u_t * cos(a_ut * PI * t / L);
V = v_0 + v_x * cos(a_vx * PI * x / L) + v_y * sin(a_vy * PI * y / L) + v_t * sin(a_vt * PI * t / L);
chi = NU_SA * RHO / mu;
f_v1 = pow(chi, 0.3e1) / (pow(chi, 0.3e1) + pow(c_v1, 0.3e1));
f_v2 = 0.1e1 - chi / (0.1e1 + chi * f_v1);
Omega = PI * sqrt(pow(a_uy * u_y * sin(a_uy * PI * y / L)
- a_vx * v_x * sin(a_vx * PI * x / L), 0.2e1) * pow(L, -0.2e1));
Ssa = Omega + NU_SA * f_v2 * pow(kappa, -0.2e1) * pow(d, -0.2e1);
r = NU_SA / Ssa * pow(kappa, -0.2e1) * pow(d, -0.2e1);
g = r + c_w2 * (pow(r, 0.6e1) - r);
f_w = g * pow((0.1e1 + pow(c_w3, 0.6e1)) / (pow(g, 0.6e1) + pow(c_w3, 0.6e1)), 0.1e1 / 0.6e1);

Q_nu = (a_nusax * a_nusax * nu_sa_x * cos(a_nusax * PI * x / L)
+ a_nusay * a_nusay * nu_sa_y * cos(a_nusay * PI * y / L))
* PI * PI * (NU_SA * RHO + mu) / sigma * pow(L, -0.2e1)
- (a_nusax * a_nusax * nu_sa_x * nu_sa_x * pow(sin(a_nusax * PI * x / L), 0.2e1)
+ a_nusay * a_nusay * nu_sa_y * nu_sa_y * pow(sin(a_nusay * PI * y / L), 0.2e1))
* PI * PI * RHO * (c_b2 + 0.1e1) / sigma * pow(L, -0.2e1)
+ a_rhox * PI * rho_x * U * NU_SA * cos(a_rhox * PI * x / L) / L
- a_rhoy * PI * rho_y * V * NU_SA * sin(a_rhoy * PI * y / L) / L
- a_nusax * PI * nu_sa_x * RHO * U * sin(a_nusax * PI * x / L) / L
- a_nusay * PI * nu_sa_y * RHO * V * sin(a_nusay * PI * y / L) / L
+ (a_ux * u_x * cos(a_ux * PI * x / L) + a_vy * v_y * cos(a_vy * PI * y / L)) * PI * RHO * NU_SA / L
+ (a_rhox * a_nusax * rho_x * nu_sa_x * cos(a_rhox * PI * x / L) * sin(a_nusax * PI * x / L)
- a_rhoy * a_nusay * rho_y * nu_sa_y * sin(a_rhoy * PI * y / L) * sin(a_nusay * PI * y / L))
* PI * PI * NU_SA / sigma * pow(L, -0.2e1)
+ a_rhot * PI * rho_t * NU_SA * cos(a_rhot * PI * t / L) / L
- a_nusat * PI * nu_sa_t * RHO * sin(a_nusat * PI * t / L) / L
- c_b1 * Ssa * RHO * NU_SA + c_w1 * RHO * NU_SA * NU_SA * f_w * pow(d, -0.2e1);
return(Q_nu);
}

```

## References

- Maplesoft (2010, November). Maple: the essential tool for mathematics and modeling. <http://www.maplesoft.com/Products/Maple/>.
- Oliver, T. A. (2010). Favre-Averaged Navier-Stokes and Turbulence Model Equation Documentation. Technical report, Intitute for Computational Engineering and Sciences of the University of Texas, Austin.
- Roy, C., T. Smith, and C. Ober (2002). Verification of a compressible CFD code using the method of manufactured solutions. In *AIAA Fluid Dynamics Conference and Exhibit*, Number AIAA 2002-3110.