|  |  |
| --- | --- |
|  |  |

9B18M139

EMPOWERMENT THROUGH INTEGRATION: scaling up AND FINANCIAL SUSTAINABILITY

Mohamad Alameh wrote this case under the supervision of Dr. Alain Daou and Dr. Yassar Nasser solely to provide material for class discussion. The authors do not intend to illustrate either effective or ineffective handling of a managerial situation. The authors may have disguised certain names and other identifying information to protect confidentiality.

This publication may not be transmitted, photocopied, digitized, or otherwise reproduced in any form or by any means without the permission of the copyright holder. Reproduction of this material is not covered under authorization by any reproduction rights organization. To order copies or request permission to reproduce materials, contact Ivey Publishing, Ivey Business School, Western University, London, Ontario, Canada, N6G 0N1; (t) 519.661.3208; (e) cases@ivey.ca; www.iveycases.com.

Copyright © 2018, Ivey Business School Foundation Version: 2018-09-18

Whether you are blind or facing another struggle, discern that all struggles are blessings. Turn them around and honour the positives that can come out of them.

Sara Minkara

On January 16, 2017, Sara Minkara, the founder and chief executive officer of Empowerment through Integration (ETI), a not-for-profit organization (NFP), had just finished celebrating with her dedicated U.S. and Lebanon teams. January was a prosperous month. After weeks of waiting, Lebanon’s Ministry of Social Affairs had conferred on ETI the status of an NFP. Founded in 2011 in the United States, ETI was devoted to “the development of an inclusive society by transforming the social stigma against disabilities across the globe and empowering blind youth to be the authors of their futures.”[[1]](#footnote-1)

With its NFP legal status in hand, the crew was appeased, as ETI could now apply to more endowments and stretch its influence and activities to the national level. In fact, Minkara had her eyes on a grant offered by the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) office in Lebanon. In 2015, the UNDP had contributed more than US$49 million[[2]](#footnote-2) to programs, touching the most vulnerable in Lebanon through the funding of social undertakings.[[3]](#footnote-3) Minkara was confident that ETI would be eligible under the crisis prevention category, to which the UNDP allocated 16 per cent of its total budget. The award was competitive for a newly established NFP such as ETI, especially in a small country such as Lebanon where resources were limited and the number of NFPs exceeded 8,500.[[4]](#footnote-4) January was a good month, but Minkara knew that if ETI was successful in securing this grant, it would need to face the next decision to scale up the organization. Minkara needed to address two main questions: How could ETI scale up in Lebanon? How could ETI become financially sustainable?

LEBANON

Established in 1945, the Republic of Lebanon (see Exhibit 1) was a sovereign state in the Middle East comprising eight governorates, or administrative divisions. After Lebanon’s 18 religious groups had fought each other in a fierce civil war during the 1975–1990 period, the Lebanese population emerged into the 1990s with a sentiment of sectarian belonging.[[5]](#footnote-5)

Covering a total area of 10,452 square kilometres, Lebanon was the smallest country in the Asian mainland, and its citizens suffered from limited resources. In 2008, 28.5 per cent of the Lebanese population was estimated to be poor, while 5 per cent was considered extremely poor, unable to meet their fundamental nutrient needs.[[6]](#footnote-6) Lebanon also hosted a total of 450,000 Palestinian refugees. Concentrated in eight camps, the Lebanese government refused to naturalize the Palestinians, who were therefore forbidden to work in more than 70 occupations, leading to a huge dependency on foreign aid.[[7]](#footnote-7) In 2013, the United Nations Relief and Works Agency for Palestinian Refugees in the Near East allocated $675 million for the Palestinians’ support and for the agencies working with them.[[8]](#footnote-8)

After the Syrian Civil War began in 2011, Lebanon hosted more than 2 million Syrian refugees who fled the war, resulting in the highest number of refugees per capita. Approximately 70 per cent of the Syrian refugees in Lebanon lived below the poverty line with a daily average income of less than $3.84.[[9]](#footnote-9) Because approximately 90 per cent of Syrian refugees were indebted, many Syrian families withdrew their children from schools and pushed them into labour. The humanitarian need stimulated the international community to assist the Lebanese government and NFPs to provide relief to the Syrian refugees. Up until 2017, the total European Commission funding that aided the Syrian refugees reached €439 million,[[10]](#footnote-10) while the US funding reached more than $167 million.[[11]](#footnote-11) All of this funding led to a great burden on the Lebanese economy and diverted attention from development and social issues, such as assistance to people who were visually impaired, and humanitarian and relief efforts.

VISUALLY IMPAIRED individuals

In 2016, the World Health Organization estimated that 1 billion individuals globally lived with a form of disability.[[12]](#footnote-12) Depending on the severity of the condition, a person who was disabled faced marginalization that limited access to education and employment and led to other negative socio-economic consequences.

Categorized into three groups, visual impairment could be classified as moderate, severe, or absolute blindness. In 2017, the World Health Organization estimated the number of people with moderate to severe vision impairment to be 217 million, while 36 million were blind. In developing countries, the marginalization of people who were visually impaired resulted in 90 per cent of them living on a relatively low income.[[13]](#footnote-13)

In many developing countries, such as Brazil and Turkey, citizens with visual impairments were becoming more and more empowered and engaged in the community. Many developing nations appreciated the concept of inclusion, but Lebanon’s rates of progress remained slow. In fact, in Lebanon, very little was known about people with visual impairments, making it difficult for NFPs to track and empower them. In 1997, the American University of Beirut conducted a national survey on blindness and low vision in Lebanon, which involved 10,148 individuals. The survey estimated a 0.6 per cent prevalence of blindness and 3.9 per cent prevalence of low vision. Despite these numbers, only a few hundred of visually impaired people attended one of the three specialized schools around the capital, thereby further separating them from the community.[[14]](#footnote-14)

Due to the lack of empowerment, one of Lebanon’s most common jobs for visually impaired people, even among those holding a university degree, was that of a telephone operator. According to Lebanon’s national survey of blindness and low vision, the two main causes of blindness were cataracts (41.3 per cent) and uncorrected large refractive errors (12.6 per cent)—causes that could be slowed down or even reversed but required public education and funding.[[15]](#footnote-15) Despite the necessity for medical interventions, ETI perceived blindness as a continuously existing reality in the global community that should be embraced and appreciated just as any difference. A country with limited financial resources, Lebanon did not merely disregard the necessity of empowering those with disabilities but most importantly overlooked the entire concept of inclusion. According to Minkara, “ETI’s main message was not to prevent blindness or even encourage accepting the visually impaired into mainstream society. Rather, ETI hoped that the public value all individuals, with all sorts of differences, such as those with visual impairment.”

INTERVENTIONS

In Lebanon, NFPs had limited financial resources, which discouraged both the employment of talented individuals and the acceleration of social impacts. Few NFPs in Lebanon actively operated with people who were visually impaired (see Exhibit 2). Given the inadequate resources available, the Lebanese government responsible for maintaining an empowering lifestyle for visually impaired persons did not set their needs as a priority.

Ministry of Social Affairs

In May 2000, years after political engagement and demands by Lebanon’s National Association for the Rights of Persons with Disabilities (NARPD), the Lebanese Parliament approved *Law 220/2000*. Aimed to enhance the living conditions of those who had special needs, the law consisted of 10 sections and stated the rights of persons with disabilities in terms of health, support services, rehabilitation environments, education, employment, and social benefits. The legislation’s employment section mandated that medium and large corporations employ at least one person who had a disability card, a card offered by the Rights and Access Group of the Ministry of Social Affairs. Although the law was created to protect employees with disabilities, the law was never enforced despite several attempts by the NARPD to raise awareness of this issue.

Due to insufficient funds, interventions by the ministry were minimal. In fact, the ministry failed to direct parents of visually impaired children to register their infants, did not educate the public about the potential of visually impaired individuals, and did not award any supporting equipment. In particular, the impact of this insignificant involvement was accentuated in rural areas, where citizens received fewer education and employment opportunities. Up to 2017, the Lebanese infrastructure was not equipped to assist visually impaired individuals to navigate independently. For instance, local municipalities should have installed buzzers next to traffic lights, standardized buttons on elevators, and implemented accessible signage boards for people who were blind. This neglect resulted in people with visual impairments lacking integration with their communities. Moreover, many registered NFPs in Lebanon did not receive funding from the Ministry of Social Affairs. In June 2017, the Lebanese Institution for the Blind (LIB) posted on its website: “Yet, despite all the efforts put behind the support of LIB, the financial campaigns were insufficient to cover the growing needs and expenses of the institution given that all the services the institution offers are free of charge. To be noted that LIB did not receive yet any support from the Lebanese government.”[[16]](#footnote-16)

Ministry of Education and Higher Education

The Ministry of Education and Higher Education (MEHE) was one of Lebanon’s most significant ministries in terms of size, budget, and responsibilities. In 2010, the MEHE managed a total of 1,365 schools, 38,723 teachers, and 285,399 students, along with 105 technical institutions accommodating 12,502 teachers and 37,317 students. The MEHE also administered the Lebanese University with its more than 50 branches, enrolling 72,813 students and employing more than 7,000 professors.[[17]](#footnote-17)

The MEHE aimed to initiate an inclusion program at public schools for disabled students, including those who were visually impaired. However, the programs required funding, the development of an evaluation department, and the expertise to train school staff members and instructors. Thirteen years after the declaration of *Law 220/2000*, the MEHE delivered the essential funds to transform only five schools, each in a different governorate, to make them accessible for visually impaired students.[[18]](#footnote-18) Implementation and integration was not initiated in the schools until 2017.

Youth Association of the Blind

Youth Association of the Blind (YAB), a Lebanese NFP, was founded in October 1988. With visually impaired individuals comprising a majority of its staff and board, YAB worked to “establish an inclusive society by ensuring the inclusion of the visually impaired at all levels and refusing all forms of isolation and discrimination.”[[19]](#footnote-19)

Headquartered in Beirut, YAB established nationwide connections with governorates and their visually impaired citizens. YAB’s impact was nationally acknowledged, as the NFP was honoured with multiple awards and recognitions and was featured on local and regional TV shows, newspapers, and websites. Some of YAB’s objectives included integrating visually impaired people in family life, recreational activities, educational systems, and the labour market.

As part of its educational program, YAB integrated numerous visually impaired students in mainstream schools and arranged for their textbooks to be audio-recorded. To diversify its sources of income, YAB hosted Lebanon’s only National Talking Library. Located in Beirut, the library provided recorded educational books and sources of information for a $10 annual subscription fee.

In 2008, YAB introduced a rehabilitation program for visually impaired persons, in partnership with Mercy Corps and the United States Agency for International Development. In an effort to break the stigma of visual impairment, YAB also initiated the National Advocacy and Awareness Campaign through workshops and seminars for sighted people. In addition, YAB founded the Blind Youth Club of Sports, which hosted chess, swimming, and soccer events, and organized summer camps, radio shows, and trips to entertain youth who were visually impaired.

THE GERMINATION OF AN IDEA

Minkara was a Lebanese American woman who lost her vision at the age of seven. Living in Boston, Minkara had the necessary family and communal support to empower her to reach her potential, but it was aid that she never sensed when visiting Lebanon. When pursuing her undergraduate studies at Wellesley College, Minkara applied for and received funding from the Clinton Foundation to initiate Camp Rafiqi. The camp engaged 39 Lebanese sighted and visually impaired students in a series of bonding activities and aimed to break stereotypes about visual impairment. Minkara acknowledged the positive impact and emphasized the need to develop such a connection. In 2011, Minkara founded ETI in the United States and operated the programs in two Lebanese communities: Beirut, the capital, and Tripoli, Lebanon’s second-largest city. The ETI-US team began networking with academic institutions, other NFPs, and the public sector, but that was not enough. Minkara realized afterwards the complexity of operating an NFP, the difficulty of creating a systematic change, and the need to develop skills such as leadership and negotiation. As a result, Minkara pursued her graduate studies at Harvard University’s John F. Kennedy School of Government while managing ETI.

In 2012, the ETI-U.S. team conducted a two-month outreach assessment in Lebanon. The programs operated again in Tripoli in 2016, when the ETI-Lebanon team was recruited. “We came across many sad and depressing stories,” Minkara claimed, “ranging from kids locked away in their homes to kids who never left their homes and parents abandoning their infants.”

Given her dedication and arduous work, Minkara became internationally recognized as an advocate of disability rights and was selected as a *Forbes* 30 under 30 honouree. Minkara also received the Emily Balch Peace and Justice Award, and the David Peace Project Certification in 2011. Minkara was featured on BBC Arabia and in the *Daily Star* (Lebanon)newspaper as ETI’s mission tackled the dilemma of inclusion from a holistic perspective. According to Minkara, “All efforts in Lebanon addressed inclusion from one side placing an individual with disability in society, not realizing the need to break the stigma from the society’s side. Our programs brought everybody together, whether sighted or blind, to learn and teach one another.”

EMPOWERMENT THROUGH INTEGRATION

ETI’s vision was to “create a place that captures and builds on the value of inclusion of all regardless of disability,” and its top value was inclusion on all levels, regardless of ethnicity, social status, racial background, gender identity, or financial capability. Built on the ideology that every individual had something to contribute to society, Minkara believed that empowerment and inclusion were complementary, and this belief had led to the organization’s name. According to Minkara, “an individual cannot get integrated into the society without empowerment, and empowerment cannot be fully acquired when isolated from the community.”

Programs

Due to intense marginalization, ETI inaugurated two different yet complementary programs to initiate systemic change on both the individual and communal levels: Empowerment Programs and Integration Programs.

Empowerment Programs

Aiming to break the stigma attached to individuals who were visually impaired, Empowerment Programs (EPs) engaged youth who were visually impaired, their parents, and sighted volunteers in six consecutive programs (see Exhibit 3). In 2017, EP chains operating in Beirut and Tripoli were expected to influence 2,800 direct and indirect beneficiaries. The Volunteer Training Program, the first of the EPs, provided sighted high school and university students with the knowledge and skills they needed to interact appropriately with people who were visually impaired. Following that program, ETI initiated the Life Skills Program, an ongoing support program that introduced people who were blind and visually impaired to cooking, banking, technology, and other independent-living skills. ETI observed that the program was integral to building both confidence and a foundation for independence in youth who were visually impaired.

Camp Rafiqi was a two-week camp that gathered both sighted campers and campers who were visually impaired in a recreational camp setting. Camp Rafiqi, which translated to Camp of My Friend in Arabic, permitted people who were visually impaired to apply their newly acquired skills. By integrating people who were sighted into activities of mutual interest with people who were visually impaired, both groups fostered a sense of shared learning, dialogue, stronger relationships, and inclusion.

The Social Project Program combined individuals who were sighted and their visually impaired counterparts in a three- to six-month project that served the community. ETI introduced the concept of community service through working with municipalities on civic projects. Through such an activity, all youth conceded that everyone could contribute to the community in their own distinctive way. When the community projects were finalized, ETI invited local government representatives, NFPs, sponsors, and program participants to disseminate the achievements. Through sharing ETI’s mission and achievements at the community celebration, ETI aimed to create a ripple effect, whereby stakeholders applied the mission to their daily lives.

Meanwhile, ETI provided the parents of children who were visually impaired with a four-day workshop. The Parents Workshop targeted both parents of each visually impaired child. The workshop aimed to broaden parents’ awareness of visual impairments, create a sense of sympathy with one another, and define the social barriers that defied the empowerment of their children. Eighty parents were expected to join the workshop, but only 10 did.

Integration Programs

The Integration Programs (IPs), ETI’s second series of programs, engaged sighted representatives and employees from the private and public sectors in activities while blindfolded. Aimed to create sustainable revenue and promote the message of inclusion, the IPs comprised four programs, each with a special fee. Designed particularly for sighted individuals in the academic, corporate, government, and NFP sectors, the in-the-dark sessions were intended to break peoples’ preconceived ideas about individuals who were visually impaired. For example, when blindfolded and meeting an individual for the first time, participants had to remove the labels they might have automatically attached when meeting someone and attempt to truly understand the other person. Similarly, allowing society to label them discouraged many people who were visually impaired from unveiling their true potential. To be clear, ETI did appreciate diversity but requested participants to drop all labels except for embracing the fact that anyone could contribute beneficially to the global community. Differences made everybody unique, but should be appreciated and not used as a source of divisiveness. During the sessions, the facilitators’ raised topics that separated societies such as racism, sexism, ageism, origin, and ableism, which led the participants to consider and reflect on their preconceived assumptions. In 2017, ETI expected to launch 12 IPs in the United States, which would involve 1,500 individuals.

The first IP, Dining in the Dark, was an annual event that aimed to “shed [participants’] preconceived notions, challenging assumptions and changing attitudes about not only blindness and disability, but also superficial physical characteristics that all too often divide us.”[[20]](#footnote-20) Through this activity, ETI’s aim was that attendees would apply the new ideology in their workplace and spread the ideas within their societies. Networking in the Dark and Team Building in the Dark were modelled to assist employees within an organization to interact with one another without biases and stereotypes. The activity provided a deep understanding of the self, the other, and stereotypically free tactics. Finally, Orientation in the Dark was an entertaining activity that assisted sighted employees in truly learning about their workplace while blindfolded.

Staffing

Human capital was a major challenge, as ETI sought hard-working, passionate, and skilled staff members. Furthermore, ETI relied heavily on unpaid volunteers. In 2016, ETI’s operation and finance directors (see Exhibit 4), as well as the 19 advisors, were volunteers.

Moreover, ETI identified a total of five Lebanese and four American boards of directors whose main tasks were strategy, governance, and fundraising. By 2017, ETI-Lebanon comprised two co-country directors and two community managers. The co-country directors’ tasks included fundraising, managing the donations received from the United States, and networking. The community managers oversaw the recruitment and training of student volunteers, reached out to people who were visually impaired in Lebanon, and arranged logistics.

Funding

In 2016, most ETI-Lebanon operations were funded by ETI-U.S fundraising campaigns; however, ETI-Lebanon’s budget was expected to exceed $100,000 (see Exhibit 5). ETI-Lebanon had two main challenges when raising local funds. First, the Lebanese Ministry of Finance did not deduct individual and corporate taxes based on donations to NFPs. However, corporations had incentives to contribute to NFPs; doing so would reduce their net profits and therefore their taxable income. NFPs in Lebanon were also prohibited from investing their donations in commercial activities as means to sustain their programs, even if the generated profit was to be fully reinvested in the social cause. As such, many Lebanese social enterprises were mandated to register their organization as a for-profit entity. The challenges were expected to limit ETI-Lebanon’s aspiration to achieve a minimum of 50 per cent financial sustainability by 2020.

In 2016, the board of directors of ETI-Lebanon and the co-country directors instigated a plan to raise funds locally and thereby reduce their dependence on financial aid from ETI-US. ETI-Lebanon scheduled meetings with large local foundations for donations. On the other hand, ETI-Lebanon thought that it would be a good strategy to seek financing through corporations’ corporate social responsibility (CSR) programs. Over the past decade, CSR had gained much ground in Lebanon, and organizations were keener to give back in a systematic and thoughtful manner. Lebanese businesses were moving from a charity model toward a more integrative one in terms of CSR. This integrative approach was exactly what ETI-Lebanon was targeting, as it wanted engagement from potential partners that extended beyond financial donations to other types of partnerships such as hosting events, assisting in transportation, and offering other services as well as integration of their beneficiaries. For instance, Alfa 4-Life was a CSR program initiated by Alfa, Lebanon’s first mobile network, which was managed by Orascom Telecom, Media and Technology. The program supported local NFPs and spread awareness within the local community. The Lebanese School for the Blind and Deaf was one major beneficiary of the program.[[21]](#footnote-21)

“In Lebanon,” Minkara explained, “fundraising is like a charity, and that perpetuates the stigma around disability, so we need to fundraise sustainably in terms of our mission.”

Strategic Partnerships

As part of its value of inclusion, ETI-Lebanon felt the need to target Lebanon’s Syrian and Palestinian refugees. To do that, ETI collaborated with the United Nations Children’s Fund (UNICEF) and the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO). ETI-Lebanon established several strategic local, regional, and international partnerships, each delivering a distinctive benefit (see Exhibit 6). Student clubs and societies in academic institutions enabled ETI to spread its message to the younger generations, recruit volunteers, and host programs on campus. Furthermore, the NFP extended its co-operation to the public sector, specifically municipalities, through engaging both sighted and visually impaired participants on assignments for the Social Project Programs. Local and international NFPs, such as Teach for Lebanon and Ruwwad Al-Tanmeya, provided experiential on-ground recommendations when needed and recruited volunteers for ETI.

THE WAY FORWARD

The future sounded tempting for Minkara, motivating her to list the opportunities for scaling up the NFP’s impact and prepare a portfolio aimed toward financial sustainability. By setting some decision-making criteria for scaling, such as financial sustainability, cost of implementation, level of impact, available expertise, and resources and time for implementation, Minkara would be able to stipulate the upcoming decision for ETI-Lebanon, the optimal path to scale up while sustaining the organization financially. As for each of the imminent years, ETI intended to double its expected 2017 social impact (see Exhibit 7). Minkara hoped that ETI-Lebanon would be able to directly affect more than 15,000 individuals by 2020.

After satisfying operational and financial independency, ETI-Lebanon could become a regional hub where it could initiate replicating the structure throughout the Middle East and North Africa region. Surely, it would mean that Lebanon, like any forthcoming hub, would need to form two working entities. The first would operate locally, while the other would ascertain the social need in the region, recruit teams, and evaluate the progress. When sustainability was reached, ETI-US would shift attention to a new hub at a new geographic location such as Eastern Europe, sub-Saharan Africa, or Latin America. In fact, ETI-US anticipated the establishment of a new hub by 2020. ETI-US would continue to place the strategy, vision, and tone while constantly monitoring and evaluating programs.

“ETI Lebanon will continuously share experiences and struggles with the other hubs,” Minkara claimed, “because there are always lessons to be learned.”

Exhibit 1: MAP OF LEBANON



Source: *The World Factbook*, s.v., “Lebanon,” last updated November 27, 2017, www.cia.gov/library/publications/the-world-factbook/geos/le.html.

Exhibit 2: LEADING LEBANESE Not-For-Profit organizationS FOR VISUALLY IMPAIRED individuals, 2004

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Organization Name** | **Mission Statement** |
| Al-Hadi Institution for Deaf & Blind Children | “Developing the capabilities of the disabled through education and rehabilitation in a dignified and respectful environment that enables the disabled to sense his humanity and potentials.” |
| Lebanese Institution for the Blind | “Taking care of the blind medically, psychologically, socially and economically and providing them with a scientific, cultural and professional education.” |
| Lebanese Society for Blind and Deaf | “Help students reach their full potentials, maximum autonomy, and best social and economic inclusion in their societies.” |
| Lebanese Universities League for the Blind | Unspecified |
| South Lebanese Society for the Blind | Unspecified |
| Youth Association of the Blind | “Establish an inclusive society by ensuring the inclusion of the visually impaired at all levels and refusing all forms of isolation and discrimination.” |

Source: United Nations Development Programme, *List of NGOs by Affiliation Type*, January 12, 2004, accessed November 6, 2017, www.undp.org.lb/partners/NGOs/AffiliationType.pdf; “Association Letter,” Al-Hadi Institution for Deaf & Blind Children, accessed November 12, 2017, www.alhadi.org.lb/Doc/Educational/5/حول-المؤسسة..; “Profile,” Lebanese Institution for the Blind, accessed November 12, 2017, www.arabblind.org/English/profile/profile.htm; “About LSBD,” Lebanese Society for Blind and Deaf, accessed November 12, 2017, www.lsbdbaabda.com/about.php; “About Us,” Youth Association of the Blind, accessed November 7, 2017, www.yablb.org/aboutus.php.

Exhibit 3: Empowerment Through Integration’S EMPOWERMENT PROGRAMS (2016)

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **Program** | **Activity** | **Details** |
| Volunteer Training Program | Guidance | * Workshops |
| Life Skills Program | Orientation and Mobility | * Body language * White canes |
| Independent Life Skills | * Cooking * Organizational skills * Clothing tips * Shopping |
| Technology | * Technology usage * Banking and money management |
| Camp Rafiqi | Arts | * Foil drawing * Patterns * Spice paintings * Open studio process * Blind portraits * Rainmaker |
| Blind Soccer | * Orientation and passing * Moving with the ball * Shooting * Picking a corner * World Cup championship tournament |
| Theatre | * Creating body and facial exercises for self-expression * Practicing short plays |
| Identity Discovery | * Self-awareness storytelling * Defining who we are * How others define us * Where do we fit in the community * What can we contribute to society * Finding the tree roots |
| Social Project Program | Environmental | * Tree planting with SABIS School |
| Parents Workshop | Workshop | * Understanding the eye and the diseases * Group sharing of struggles * Blind and visual-impairment simulation * One-on-one discussions |
| Community Celebration | Festival | * Annual celebration with all the participants |

Source: Company files.

Exhibit 4: HIERARCHY OF ETI-US

Note: ETI = Empowerment through Integration; CSR = corporate social responsibility; IT = information technology

Source: Company files.

Exhibit 5: Empowerment Through Integration’S ESTIMATED LINE ITEM BUDGET, 2017 (in US$)

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **Personnel** | Country Directors (2) | 9,000 |
| Managers (2) | 7,200 |
| Coordinators | 14,400 |
| Directors | 4,200 |
| Assistants | 2,400 |
| ETI-U.S. Empowerment Program Director | 15,000 |
| **Supplies** | White Canes | 1,200 |
| Blindfolds | 180 |
| Dance Mats | 240 |
| Activity Kits | 736 |
| Other Supplies | 760 |
| **Rental** | Life Skill Program | 600 |
| Camp Rafiqi | 1,000 |
| Parent Seminar | 600 |
| Capacity Building Workshop | 400 |
| University Club Workshops | 320 |
| Community Celebration | 1,000 |
| **Other Direct Cost** | Meals and Refreshments | 11,700 |
| Marketing and Advertising | 1,646 |
| Certificates and Workshop Materials | 4,050 |
| Office Supplies | 4,800 |
| International Travelling | 4,200 |
| Support Groups | 2,000 |
| Travel and Transportation | 12,880 |
| **Total Direct Cost** | | 100,512 |

Note: ETI = Empowerment through Integration; This line item budget was created merely for illustrative purposes and the purpose of discussion. It is not the actual line item budget from Empowerment through Integration.

Source: Created by the authors.

Exhibit 6: Empowerment Through Integration’S STRATEGIC PARTNERSHIPS LIST, 2016

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Local and Regional | Academic Institutions | * American University of Beirut * University of Balamand * Jinan University * Lebanese American University * SABIS School |
| Government Entities | * Beirut Municipality * Tripoli Municipality |
| Non-profit Organizations | * Youth Association of the Blind * Ruwwad Al-Tanmeya * Utopia * Safadi Foundation * Al-Montada * Environmental Scouts of Tripoli * Chamber of Commerce, Industry, and Agriculture Tripoli |
| International | Government Entities | * United Arab Emirates Embassy, Washington, DC * UNESCO * UNICEF |
| Non-profit Organizations | * Right to Play * Mercy Corps * Teach for Lebanon |

Note: UNESCO = United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization; UNICEF = United Nations Children’s Fund

Source: Company files.

Exhibit 7: Empowerment Through Integration’S DIRECT SOCIAL IMPACT

(EXPECTED 2017)

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **Program Category** | **Participants** | **Total Impact** |
| The Empowerment Program (per Community) | Sighted | 70 |
| Visually Impaired / Blind | 50 |
| Parents | 100 |
| The Integration Program (Total) | Attendees | 1,500 |

Source: Company files.

1. “Mission & Vision,” Empowerment through Integration, accessed November 7, 2017, www.etivision.org/what-we-do/. [↑](#footnote-ref-1)
2. All currency amounts are in US dollars unless otherwise specified. [↑](#footnote-ref-2)
3. “Funding and Delivery,” UNDP in Lebanon, accessed November 6, 2017, www.lb.undp.org/content/lebanon/en/home/

   operations/funding\_delivery.html. [↑](#footnote-ref-3)
4. “Civic Freedom Monitor: Lebanon,” The International Center for Not-for-Profit Law, last updated July 5, 2017, www.icnl.org/research/monitor/lebanon.html. [↑](#footnote-ref-4)
5. *The World Factbook*, s.v., “Lebanon,” last updated November 27, 2017, www.cia.gov/library/publications/the-world-factbook/geos/le.html. [↑](#footnote-ref-5)
6. “Rapid Poverty Assessment in Lebanon for 2016,” UNDP in Lebanon, accessed November 6, 2017, www.lb.undp.org/content/lebanon/en/home/Response\_to\_the\_Syrian\_Crisis/successstories/Rapid-Poverty-Assessment-in-Lebanon-for-2016.html. [↑](#footnote-ref-6)
7. Jeremy M. Sharp, *U.S. Foreign Assistance to the Middle East: Historical Background, Recent Trends, and the FY2010 Request*, July 17, 2009, accessed November 6, 2017, http://pdf.usaid.gov/pdf\_docs/Pcaab954.pdf. [↑](#footnote-ref-7)
8. “Frequently Asked Questions,” UNRWA, accessed December 18, 2017, www.unrwa.org/who-we-are/frequently-asked-questions. [↑](#footnote-ref-8)
9. Josh Wood, “Faced with Mounting Debts, Syrian Refugees Have No Way of Leaving Lebanon,” *The National*, January 10, 2016, accessed November 6, 2017, www.thenational.ae/world/faced-with-mounting-debts-syrian-refugees-have-no-way-of-leaving-lebanon-1.226875. [↑](#footnote-ref-9)
10. European Commission, *Lebanon: Syria Crisis*, March 2017, accessed November 6, 2017. https://ec.europa.eu/echo/files/aid/countries/factsheets/lebanon\_syrian\_crisis\_en.pdf; € = euro; US$1 = €0.94 on March 31, 2017. [↑](#footnote-ref-10)
11. “U.S. Humanitarian Assistance in Response to the Syrian Crisis,” U.S. Department of State, April 5, 2017, accessed November 6, 2017, www.state.gov/j/prm/releases/factsheets/2017/269469.htm. [↑](#footnote-ref-11)
12. World Health Organization, “New World Report Shows More Than 1 Billion People with Disabilities Face Substantial Barriers in Their Daily Lives,” news release, June 9, 2011, accessed August 15, 2018, www.who.int/mediacentre/news/releases/2011/

    disabilities\_20110609/en/. [↑](#footnote-ref-12)
13. “Blindness and Vision Impairment: Key Facts,” *World Health Organization*, October 11, 2017, accessed November 6, 2017, www.who.int/mediacentre/factsheets/fs282/en/. [↑](#footnote-ref-13)
14. Ibid. [↑](#footnote-ref-14)
15. A. M. Mansour, Kassem Kassak, Monique Chaya, Talal Hourani, Abla Sibai, and M. N. Alameddine, “National Survey of Blindness and Low Vision in Lebanon,” *British Journal of Ophthalmology* 81, no. 10 (1997): 905–906, www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC1722019/. [↑](#footnote-ref-15)
16. “Sources of Income,” Lebanese Association for the Blind, accessed November 12, 2017, www.arabblind.org/English/finance/sourcesofincome.htm. [↑](#footnote-ref-16)
17. Lebanon Ministry of Education and Higher Education, *Achievements: 2010*, 2011, accessed November 6, 2017, www.mehe.gov.lb/uploads/file/Reports/2011/Progress\_Report\_of\_Ministry\_of\_Education\_18\_5\_2011\_(Repaired).pdf. [↑](#footnote-ref-17)
18. Sylvana Lakkis, Nermine El-Sibai, and Eddie Thomas, *Lebanon: Disability and Access to Information* (London, UK: Article 19, May 2015), www.article19.org/data/files/medialibrary/37983/Disability-and-access-to-information-in-Lebanon,-31-May-2015,-English.pdf. [↑](#footnote-ref-18)
19. “About Us,” Youth Association of the Blind, accessed November 7, 2017, www.yablb.org/aboutus.php. [↑](#footnote-ref-19)
20. “Dining in the Dark, Boston,” Mapado.com, October 27, 2017, accessed December 13, 2017, www.mapado.com/en/boston/dining-in-the-dark-18. [↑](#footnote-ref-20)
21. “Alfa 4-Life,” Alfa, accessed August 15, 2018, www.alfa.com.lb/en/csr/alfa-4-life. [↑](#footnote-ref-21)