|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Ivey Publishing Logo |  |

9B21C003

AMAZON: Legal Woes, Crisis, and Resilience[[1]](#endnote-1)

Jyotsna Bhatnagar and Parul Gupta wrote this case solely to provide material for class discussion. The authors do not intend to illustrate either effective or ineffective handling of a managerial situation. The authors may have disguised certain names and other identifying information to protect confidentiality.

*This publication may not be transmitted, photocopied, digitized or otherwise reproduced in any form or by any means without the permission of the copyright holder. Reproduction of this material is not covered under authorization by any reproduction rights organization. To order copies or request permission to reproduce materials, contact Ivey Publishing, Ivey Business School, Western University, London, Ontario, Canada, N6G 0N1; (t) 519.661.3208; (e)* [*cases@ivey.ca*](mailto:cases@ivey.ca)*;* [*www.iveycases.com*](http://www.iveycases.com)*.*

Copyright © 2021, Management Development Institute Gurgaon and Ivey Business School Foundation Version: 2021-04-21

On December 31, 2019, the World Health Organization (WHO) was informed by China that a pneumonia of an unknown cause had been detected in Wuhan, the most populous city in Central China. On March 11, 2020, the director general of the WHO declared the disease to be a pandemic and, referring to the type of virus and the year of its emergence, it was named COVID-19 (see Exhibit 1).[[2]](#endnote-2) Consequent to the ever-increasing health risks, stay-at-home mandates, and business closures, when companies across the world were losing business, retail sales surged to a record level for Amazon.com, Inc. (Amazon), adding US$6 billion[[3]](#endnote-3) to the fortune of Jeff Bezos, the chief executive officer of Amazon.[[4]](#endnote-4) To meet the unprecedented workforce requirements created by this business opportunity, Bezos announced a new hiring drive for its warehouses and delivery network.[[5]](#endnote-5) Amazon workers expressed their concerns about the hiring of additional employees, as the increased number of workers could further deepen the workplace safety issues at Amazon warehouses through the pandemic. However, Bezos vehemently claimed to be fully committed to workers’ safety in the workplace.[[6]](#endnote-6)

Amidst the turbulence caused by COVID-19, Amazon had found itself facing legal battles. Its labour practices were being scrutinized by city authorities for the alleged wrongful termination of a warehouse worker named Christian Smalls, who had led a workers’ protest against inadequate workplace safety measures during a pandemic. Was Amazon providing essentials to its customers at the cost of the safety and health of its workers and tech talent? How was Amazon dealing with the COVID-19 crisis? How can Amazon move from a greed/profit perspective to a profit-with-purpose perspective? Would getting ready for a legal battle be the way forward for Amazon?

THE RISING ANGUISH OF WAREHOUSE WORKERS DURING THE PANDEMIC

As the COVID-19 virus continued to spread, Amazon warehouse workers demanded more protective gear and hazard pay for continuing to work under unprecedented hazardous conditions.[[7]](#endnote-7) During an interview with a leading media outlet, they expressed frustration at Amazon’s response to the threat of the pandemic. They argued that the measures taken by Amazon were not adequate for keeping them safe.[[8]](#endnote-8) Although Amazon made an offer to its warehouse workers to stay at home without the risk of losing their jobs, workers faced limited options. For example, the option of two weeks of paid sick leave was only available to COVID-19-positive workers or those who had been told to quarantine. Other workers were allowed to take unlimited time off in April 2020, but they would not be paid. They had to choose between going to work and risking their health or staying at home and not receiving their pay. Most of the workers continued working, including some of the sick workers, and warehouses remained crowded.[[9]](#endnote-9)

In the absence of adequate supplies of sanitation equipment and masks, workers felt unsafe going to an overcrowded workplace where it was difficult to follow social distancing guidelines. According to workers, even after the first known COVID-19 case had been confirmed at JFK8 fulfillment centre (FC) in New York, workers were expected to continue working the night shifts. Amazon denied this, but[[10]](#endnote-10) Barbara Chandler, an Amazon warehouse employee at JFK8 FC, who had tested positive for COVID-19, said, “They don’t have enough workers to clean the building. Instead they called mandatory overtime for two weeks.”[[11]](#endnote-11) The inconsistent safety measures and sanitization supplies in the FCs across the United States generated a feeling of distrust between Amazon workers and management.[[12]](#endnote-12)

PROTESTS AND TERMINATIONS AT AMAZON AMID pandemic PANIC

In March 2020, five-year Amazon employee Smalls quickly entered the media spotlight after his employment was terminated by Amazon. He was reportedly fired for organizing a workers’ protest against the company for not shutting down JFK8 FC on Staten Island after a number of FC workers tested positive for COVID-19. On March 3, 2020, Smalls organized a small walkout over the health and safety concerns of workers, and he accused the company of being untruthful about the number of workers who had tested positive for the virus.[[13]](#endnote-13) After the protest, he became a focal point of the debate about Amazon’s response to the threat COVID-19 posed to workers’ safety at work.[[14]](#endnote-14)

Amazon downplayed the walkout by disputing almost every detail related to the protest, from the number of protestors to the reasons for Smalls’ termination. Amazon claimed that there had been no disruption to JFK8 FC’s operations, as the number of protesting workers was as small as 15. The organizers counterclaimed that more than 60 workers had participated in the protest.[[15]](#endnote-15) Amazon also fervently denied the allegations of the wrongful termination of Smalls, explaining that he was fired for putting the safety of other workers at risk by violating social distancing guidelines, including by coming on-site for the walkout. Amazon claimed that despite multiple warnings, Smalls continued violating social distancing guidelines and caused multiple safety issues at the warehouse, and that his employment was terminated as a result.[[16]](#endnote-16) Contesting the company’s claims about the violation of social distancing guidelines, Smalls argued the he had been ordered to quarantine in order to stop him from organizing workers’ protests against unsafe working conditions. Smalls planned to take legal action against Amazon for wrongful termination. He argued that the company did not follow due process for terminations, which was comprised of three steps: the issuance of a verbal warning, documentation, and a write-up. He accused the company of skipping all of the steps in the termination.[[17]](#endnote-17)

The frustration of Amazon workers was expressed one more time when over 300 workers had threatened to call in sick on April 25, 2020. Employees participating in the protest demanded Amazon to stagger its shifts to make fewer people available at FC at a time. The workforce demanded that Amazon close its facility immediately, especially those warehouses where employees had tested positive for the virus. They also demanded that Amazon provide compensation to the workforce in the effected locations and paid sick leave to employees with possible coronavirus symptoms, as well as to increase hazard pay and do away with quotas so that employees could take a break from their work to isolate themselves. In a statement, Amazon spokeswoman Lisa Levandowski said that employees’ participation in the April 25, 2020, protest had been “grossly exaggerated” and that many further steps had been put into operation for employees, including “temperature checks, masks, a $2 minimum wage bump, and more frequent cleaning of doorknobs, touch screens, and other areas.” Amazon also stated that employees could leave and wash their hands at any time without having to worry about performance goals.[[18]](#endnote-18)

The tech workers who had covered the live streaming of the call-in-sick protest were also fired. Maren Costa and Emily Cunningham, user-experience designers, were hosts of the live-streaming event and were fired for violating Amazon’s internal policy.[[19]](#endnote-19)Supporters of the workers criticized Amazon for terminating these employees, which they felt could intimidate others. Many employees were apprehensive about further vengeance.[[20]](#endnote-20) Despite these incidents, Amazon was second on Fortune’s list of most admired companies in 2020.[[21]](#endnote-21)

ABOUT AMAZON

Amazon, headquartered in Seattle, Washington, was incorporated by Jeff Bezos in 1994. Founded as an online bookstore, Amazon quickly became the world’s largest online “everything store.”[[22]](#endnote-22) Occupying the position of the leading e-commerce company in the United States in 2019, the online behemoth employed 798,000 full- and part-time employees and earned a net revenue of around $280.5 billion. Approximately 50 per cent of its global revenue was contributed by online retail sales and just 19 per cent by third-party services. Despite America’s stagnant wages and high income and wealth inequality, Amazon continued to grow its workforce⎯it roughly doubled its headcount between 2015 and 2018.[[23]](#endnote-23) Additionally, the company invested in the grocery business, buying Whole Foods Market Inc. in 2017, which employed 87,000 people at the time.[[24]](#endnote-24)

AMAZON’S RESPONSE TO AMPLIFIED CONCERNS FOR WORKERS’ SAFETY

Amazon called the accusations of unsafe working conditions by its workers unfounded.[[25]](#endnote-25) The company contested workers’ claims that sanitary supplies were not standard or adequate in all of the warehouses and that antiseptic wipes and hand sanitizer were unevenly available across its network. The company counterclaimed that nothing was more important than the safety of its employees. As stated by an Amazon spokesperson, “We are encouraging those who are unwell to stay home and [are] taking extreme measures to keep people safe in our buildings.”[[26]](#endnote-26) She added that Amazon had announced a broad set of novel benefits changes for its FC workers, such as double overtime pay and 14 days of paid sick leave for employees who were told to quarantine themselves.[[27]](#endnote-27) Responding to workers’ safety concerns, David Clark, Amazon’s senior vice-president of worldwide operations, announced four new safety measures that included temperature checks on workers as soon as they reported to the workplace, the distribution of face masks to workers, daily monitoring of the new health measures, and ongoing financial investment in workers.[[28]](#endnote-28) To audit the safety measures, Bezos made a surprise visit to an undisclosed Amazon FC and a Whole Foods store in the last week of March 2020.[[29]](#endnote-29)

Appreciating the zeal of Amazon workers to serve the community, the company said in a statement, “Like all businesses grappling with the ongoing coronavirus pandemic, we are working hard to keep employees safe while serving communities and the most vulnerable . . . the truth is the vast majority of employees continue to show up and do the heroic work of delivering for customers every day.”[[30]](#endnote-30)

Amazon was not only concerned with protecting workers’ safety but also took action against those who were taking advantage of the situation. The company took a strong stance against price gouging during the pandemic, intervening with an Amazon seller when it discovered the hoarding of masks and essential supplies in early March 2020.[[31]](#endnote-31) The seller was made to donate all of his 18,000 sanitizers, and Amazon suspended his account. He also came under the scrutiny of the attorney general for price gouging.[[32]](#endnote-32)

MOUNTING PRESSURE ON AMAZON

Despite being non-unionized, Amazon workers’ protests received the support of some of the most powerful labour unions in the United States. They called for the closing of Amazon’s warehouses until real solutions to protect Amazon workers and the public were put in place. The unions also supported Smalls’ claim that his termination had been inspired by his role in organizing a protest against the company and, thus, was a “wrongful termination.” They sent a letter to Bezos demanding the “swift reinstatement” of Smalls.[[33]](#endnote-33) In the meantime, the workers at Whole Foods supported Smalls and their fellow Amazon warehouse workers, and they also demanded hazard benefits and paid sick leave for Whole Food employees who were not well, irrespective of the fact that they were COVID-19-negative.[[34]](#endnote-34) Criticizing Amazon’s new sick leave policy, Dr. David Michaels, professor at George Washington University (and former head of the Occupational Safety and Health Administration), said that most of the employees who showed symptoms of the virus continued to show up for work until their test came back positive because only COVID-19-positive employees were eligible for paid sick leave.[[35]](#endnote-35)

Amazon under State and City Scrutiny

New York State and New York City authorities also questioned the firing of Smalls and scrutinized the working conditions of Amazon’s warehouses. On the day after Smalls’ dismissal, New York City Mayor Bill de Blasio announced that the city’s Commission on Human Rights would investigate whether Smalls had been terminated for organizing the protest for workers’ health and safety concerns.[[36]](#endnote-36) The mayor said, “If so, that would be a violation of our city’s human rights law. We would act on it immediately.”[[37]](#endnote-37)According to *New York City’s Human Rights Law* (Title 8 of the Administrative Code), retaliation, discriminatory lending practices, discriminatory harassment, and bias-based profiling by law enforcement was prohibited (see Exhibit 2-A).[[38]](#endnote-38) Letitia James, New York State’s attorney general, tweeted that Amazon’s conduct was “disgraceful.”[[39]](#endnote-39) Excoriating Amazon’s actions, she said, “In New York, the right to organize is codified into law, and any retaliatory action by management related thereto is strictly prohibited. At a time when so many New Yorkers are struggling and are deeply concerned about their safety, this action was also immoral and inhumane” (see Exhibit 2-B).[[40]](#endnote-40) Moreover, according to the *Occupational Safety and Health Act* of 1970, it was the legal obligation of an employer to prevent workers from being killed or seriously harmed at work. An employer was required to ensure that employees worked under safe working conditions and remained protected from all known dangers in the workplace.[[41]](#endnote-41)

Fuel to the Fire

From the notes of a meeting of top executives (attended by Bezos), a leaked memo written by Amazon’s general counsel, David Zapolsky, added fuel to the fire. The memo gave an unpleasant insight into Amazon’s public relations (PR) strategy, as Zapolsky had advised the PR team to focus on detailing the immorality and illegality of workers’ protests rather than worker safety issues.[[42]](#endnote-42) Criticizing the memo and Amazon’s PR approach, Athena (a coalition of labour and community groups campaigning against Amazon)’s director Dania Rajendra stated, “Hundreds of Amazon workers are telling the public about the risk Amazon poses to their health, and we’ve got Amazon execs, working from home, trying to fix the PR problem instead of the public health problem.”[[43]](#endnote-43) When questioned about the leaked memo, Zapolsky released a statement to VICE News that read: “My comments were personal and emotional. I was frustrated and upset that an Amazon employee would endanger the health and safety of other Amazonians by repeatedly returning to the premises after having been warned to quarantine himself after exposure to virus COVID-19.”[[44]](#endnote-44)

Crisis

The dangers presented by the pandemic continued even after three months of its outbreak, and the world was struggling to manage it, which led many people to turn to e-commerce to respond to their personal needs during periods of quarantine and social distancing. Amazon saw a significant surge in orders in its markets across the globe.[[45]](#endnote-45) In April 2020, on its website, orders for groceries increased more than 50 times. To meet this exponential rise in demand, most of the warehouse workers stayed on the job.[[46]](#endnote-46) Though Amazon labelled itself as an essential service/goods provider that was helping Americans to avoid crowded marketplaces, lawmakers feared that the ambitious e-commerce retailer was putting warehouse, supermarket, and delivery personnel at risk.[[47]](#endnote-47) A warehouse worker in Robbinsville, New Jersey, disclosed that Amazon was not restricting supply to only essentials but was also delivering non-essentials. The worker said, “They lie by saying they’re just shipping out essential products like toilet paper, wipes, and other essential items because I’m still packing non-essential items like dildos, comics, video game headsets, Apple Air Pods, Beats headphones, to name a few.”[[48]](#endnote-48)

In his annual letter to Amazon shareholders, Bezos openly boasted that he had created new jobs and given jobs to workers who had lost their jobs, and expressed his concerns about the safety and health of his employees and customers during the COVID-19 crisis.[[49]](#endnote-49)

A representative of Amazon made the following announcement to the media on April 25, 2020—the day of the call-in-sick protest:

The fact is that today all but a handful of our 800,000+ employees around the world came to work as usual to continue delivering on behalf of customers. Our employees are heroes fighting for their communities and helping people get the critical items they need in this crisis. Health and safety is our top priority and our focus remains on protecting associates in our operations network with extensive measures including distributing face masks, disinfectant wipes, hand sanitizer, implementing temperature checks, operating with strict social distancing protocols, and recognizing their contributions with additional pay and leading benefits.[[50]](#endnote-50)

During the pandemic, citizens and workers alike realized how integral warehouse and grocery store workers were to the functioning of everyday lives. “For the first time since my working life, it’s just become obvious who keeps this society running,” said an Amazon warehouse and logistics employee from Poland on the live stream. “It’s us, the logistic workers, the retail workers, the healthcare workers. . . . If it were not for us, this society would fall apart.” She added, “It’s not that we just ended up working at Amazon because we weren’t smart enough to work somewhere else. These are critical jobs for this world, so we deserve much more.[[51]](#endnote-51)

**AMAZON DONATES TO AND INVESTS IN COVID-19 EFFORTS**

While Amazon’s blog continued to explain all of the extra precautions Amazon had implemented for its employees and customers to keep them safe and socially distanced during the pandemic, the company also began making donations. For example, Bezos donated $100 million to feeding America, and in Europe, Amazon committed almost $23 million (€21 million) to support those most affected by the pandemic. Amazon also launched the $20-million AWS Diagnostic Development Initiative to accelerate COVID-19 research. In addition to monetary donations, Amazon donated 8,200 laptops to Seattle’s public schools to help with remote learning. Through the Amazon Future Engineer program, it also donated 4,000 laptops to high school students across the United States, and it made new online computer science resources, including exam prep, free for underserved communities.[[52]](#endnote-52) The company’s annual shareholder letter, dated April 16, 2020, spoke of agility even in a crisis situation.[[53]](#endnote-53) With Amazon greatly profiting from the increase of e-commerce sales, many were watching to see what the company would do with the profits. For Amazon, the donations and investments emphasized the protection of employees and customers, a commitment to finding a cure, as well as business opportunities beyond COVID-19.[[54]](#endnote-54)

The letter to shareholders stated:

Though we are optimistic, we must remain vigilant and maintain a sense of urgency. The challenges and hurdles we will face to make our long-term vision for Amazon.com a reality is several: aggressive, capable, well-funded competition; considerable growth challenges and execution risk; the risks of product and geographic expansion; and the need for large continuing investments to meet an expanding market opportunity.[[55]](#endnote-55)

Amazon acted as an assertive organization that was ready to “protect its customers from bad actors, ready to exploit the crises.”[[56]](#endnote-56)

AGILE AMAZON

In his book, *Think Like Amazon: 50 1/2 Ideas to Become a Digital Leader*, former Amazon employee John Rossman discussed “the famous empty chair: Bezos is known to leave one seat open at a conference table to inform all attendees that they should consider that seat occupied by their customer, ‘the most important person in the room.’” Rossman stated that, “ultimately, these symbolic gestures are highly calculated and often repeated messages created to reinforce Amazon’s leadership principles.”[[57]](#endnote-57)

After customer obsession, Amazon’s leadership principles stated that leaders were expected to be innovative, showing strong judgement, and always seeking to improve and insist on the highest standards, among other expectations.[[58]](#endnote-58)

Rossman explained how the firm sustained agility through empowered and autonomous teams at the lower levels while maintaining increasing levels of success:

One of Amazon’s secrets? Forcing functions. A forcing function is a set of guidelines, restrictions, requirements, or commitments that ‘force,’ or direct, a desirable outcome without having to manage all the details of making it happen. Forcing functions are a powerful technique used at Amazon to enforce a strategy or change or to get a difficult project launched.[[59]](#endnote-59)

Rossman further explained, “Executives at Amazon are not accorded stature or salary as per the size of their staff /teams or their budget. Managers at a senior level lead important initiatives with relatively modest staff resources. At Amazon senior leaders are in Execution mode, and not as administrators or overseers of others.” As per Rossman,[[60]](#endnote-60) “Amazon had ‘two-pizza teams,’ meaning that teams at Amazon’s teams should be small enough to feed with two pizzas. These teams believed in single-thread ownership. Each team has one focused project which it owns collectively. If they fail, they move to another project where new connections are forged and team members move to another single thread project.”[[61]](#endnote-61) In its warehouses, Amazon used video games to motivate workers—the games, with names like Mission Racer, track output and pitted workers against one another, prodding them to move faster.[[62]](#endnote-62)

According to, Steve Denning, Amazon connected people and things through its deliveries. It was omnipotent as a daily service provider across many parts of the world. It delivered quick, personal, tension-free value on a huge scale.[[63]](#endnote-63) Amazon stated that it “would invest its expected $4 billion second-quarter profit in coronavirus-related efforts, including buying personal protective equipment for workers, stepping up cleaning in its facilities, and building its own testing capability.”[[64]](#endnote-64)

Where are you HEADING, AMAZON?

The announcement of new hiring raised the frustrations of existing Amazon employees. Reacting to the announcement, a worker commented: “They’re now doing temperature checks at the door and still want to practice social distancing with a couple thousand people in the building. But they’re hiring a mass of new employees so it’s damn near impossible to stay six feet from another individual.”[[65]](#endnote-65) The outpouring of customer orders tested the powerful capacity of Amazon’s distribution system and compelled changes to the employer−worker relationship.

Considering the many moves made by Bezos during the pandemic, how could he claim he had ensured safety for his workers while firing others? Did the investigations by regulatory authorities into Smalls’ controversial termination and into the adequacy of safety measures to protect workers signal to Amazon that legal battles were a possibility? Was Amazon emerging as a saviour to many quarantined citizens around the world, yet exposing its many employees to the virus? How effective had Bezos’ messaging been regarding Amazon’s mission as a company, given the experiences of Amazon employees with the virus? Was there a bigger purpose at Amazon or was it just about profits? Was Amazon showing that it was effective at fostering agility and resilience during the COVID-19 crisis?

Exhibit 1: Spread of the Pandemic and related Health Advisories

A. Outbreak of COVID-19

By the beginning of the second week of March, 2020, COVID-19 had spread to over 114 countries around the world. China, Italy, South Korea, and the United States were majorly affected by the pandemic.[[66]](#endnote-66) The virus moved rapidly around the world, as it could easily jump between people in close contact with each other. One of the best and most effective ways to slow the spread of this virus was “social distancing”—staying away from other people by staying home. It was believed that by “social distancing” the impact of the pandemic could be lessened, and therefore people were told to stay home from work, and to quarantine if they had been exposed to the virus.[[67]](#endnote-67) By the end of March 2020, the pandemic had led to more than 3,000 deaths and to the infection of over 164,000 Americans. The number of deceased was quite a bit more than the number of people who had died in the 9/11 terror attacks. In the United States, response to the pandemic had been crippled because of a slower rollout of testing and inadequate testing capacity.[[68]](#endnote-68) The World Health Organization issued detailed hygiene and medical advice and health advisories for avoiding the spread of COVID-19.

B. Health Advisories Issued by the World Health Organization

Maintain social distancing

Maintain at least 1 metre (3 feet) distance between yourself and anyone who is coughing or sneezing.

Why? When someone coughs or sneezes, they spray small liquid droplets from their nose or mouth which may contain virus. If you are too close, you can breathe in the droplets, including the COVID-19 virus if the person coughing has the disease.

Hygiene advice

* Clean hands frequently with soap and water, or alcohol-based hand rub.
* Wash hands after coughing or sneezing; when caring for the sick; before, during, and after food preparation; before eating; after using the toilet; when hands are visibly dirty; and after handling animals or waste.
* Maintain at least 1 metre (3 feet) distance from anyone who is coughing or sneezing.
* Avoid touching your hands, nose, and mouth. Do not spit in public.
* Cover your mouth and nose with a tissue or bent elbow when coughing or sneezing. Discard the tissue immediately and clean your hands.

Medical advice

* Avoid close contact with others if you have any symptoms.
* Stay at home if you feel unwell, even with mild symptoms such as headache and runny nose, to avoid potential spread of the disease to medical facilities and other people.
* If you develop serious symptoms (fever, cough, difficulty breathing), seek medical care early and contact local health authorities in advance.
* Note any recent contact with others and travel details to provide to authorities who can trace and prevent spread of the disease.
* Stay up-to-date on COVID-19 developments issued by health authorities and follow their guidance.

Exhibit 1 (Continued)

Mask and glove usage

* Healthy individuals only need to wear a mask if taking care of a sick person.
* Wear a mask if you are coughing or sneezing.
* Masks are effective when used in combination with frequent hand cleaning.
* Do not touch the mask while wearing it. Clean hands if you touch the mask.
* Learn how to properly put on, remove, and dispose of masks. Clean hands after disposing of the mask.
* Do not reuse single-use masks.

Regularly washing bare hands is more effective against catching COVID-19 than wearing rubber gloves.

The COVID-19 virus can still be picked up on rubber gloves and transmitted by touching your face.

Source: Created by authors based on inputs from Brendan Cole, “New York Attorney General Threatens Amazon with Legal Action after Firing of Worker Who Led Strike over Coronavirus Precautions,” *NewsWeek*, March 31, 2020 accessed April 2, 2020, www.newsweek.com/amazon-letitia-james-covid-19-staten-island-1495182.

Exhibit 2: Legal Provisions for the Protection of Workers in New York City

A. Codified definition of retaliation

It is against the law for anyone—your employer, your landlord, or anyone else to whom the *New York City Human Rights Law* applies—to retaliate against you because you:

1. Opposed an unlawful discriminatory practice
2. Made a charge or filed a complaint of discrimination with the New York City Commission on Human Rights, your employer, or any other agency
3. Testified, assisted, or participated in an investigation, proceeding, or hearing relating to something prohibited by the *New York City Human Rights Law*

The law protects you against retaliation as long as you have a reasonable good faith belief that the persons’ conduct is illegal, even if it turns out that you were mistaken.

B. § 703. Rights of employees

“Employees shall have the right of self-organization, to form, join, or assist labour organizations, to bargain collectively through representatives of their own choosing, and to engage in concerted activities, for the purpose of collective bargaining or other mutual aid or protection, free from interference, restraint, or coercion of employers, but nothing contained in this article shall be interpreted to prohibit employees from exercising the right to confer with their employer at any time, provided that during such conference there is no attempt by the employer, directly or indirectly, to interfere with, restrain or coerce employees in the exercise of the rights guaranteed by this section.”

Exhibit 2 (continued)

C. § 704. Unfair labour practices.

It shall be an unfair labour practice for an employer:

1. To spy upon or keep under surveillance, whether directly or through agents or any other person, any activities of employees or their representatives in the exercise of the rights guaranteed by section 703.
2. To prepare, maintain, distribute, or circulate any blacklist of individuals for the purpose of preventing any of such individuals from obtaining or retaining employment because of the exercise by such individuals of any of the rights guaranteed by section 703…
3. To discharge or otherwise discriminate against an employee because he has signed or filed any affidavit, petition, or complaint or given any information or testimony under this article.

Source: Source: Created by the authors based on inputs from New York City Human Rights, accessed March 28, 2020, [www1.nyc.gov/site/cchr/law/the-law.page#retaliation](https://www1.nyc.gov/site/cchr/law/the-law.page#retaliation); and “2012 New York Consolidated Laws– Labor Article 20 - (700 - 718) NEW YORK STATE LABORRELATIONS ACT704 – Unfair Labor Practices,” JUSTIA US Law, accessed April 3, 2020, <https://law.justia.com/codes/new-york/2012/lab/article-20/704/>.

endnotes

1. This case has been written on the basis of published sources only. Consequently, the interpretation and perspectives presented in this case are not necessarily those of Amazon.com, Inc. or any of its employees. [↑](#endnote-ref-1)
2. World Health Organization, “Coronavirus Disease (COVID-19) Outbreak,” World Health Organization, accessed March 29, 2020, www.who.int/westernpacific/emergencies/COVID-19. [↑](#endnote-ref-2)
3. All currency amounts are in U.S. dollars unless otherwise specified. [↑](#endnote-ref-3)
4. Taylor Nicole Rogers, “The World's Wealthiest People Are Losing Billions in the Coronavirus Pandemic – Except for Jeff Bezos, Who Has Added $6 billion to His Fortune in 2020 as Amazon Sales Surge,” *Business Insider*, April 1, 2020, accessed April 16, 2020, www.businessinsider.com/coronavirus-made-amazon-jeff-bezos-richer-but-not-other-billionaires-2020-3. [↑](#endnote-ref-4)
5. “Coronavirus Outbreak May ‘Get Worse’: Jeff Bezos to Amazon Employees,” Livemint, March 22, 2020, accessed April 25, 2020, www.livemint.com/companies/news/coronavirus-outbreak-may-get-worse-jeff-bezos-to-amazon-employees-11584848795072.html. [↑](#endnote-ref-5)
6. Annie Palmer, “‘They’re Putting Us All at Risk’: What It’s Like Working in Amazon’s Warehouses during the Coronavirus Outbreak,” CNBC, March 26, 2020, accessed March 30, 2020, www.cnbc.com/2020/03/26/amazon-warehouse-employees-grapple-with-coronavirus-risks.html. [↑](#endnote-ref-6)
7. Kenya Evelyn, “Amazon Fires New York Worker Who Led Strike over Coronavirus Concerns,” *The Guardian*, March 31, 2020, accessed April 7, 2020, <https://www.theguardian.com/us-news/2020/mar/31/amazon-strike-worker-fired-organizing-walkout-chris-smallls>. [↑](#endnote-ref-7)
8. Annie Palmer, “‘They’re Putting Us All at Risk’: What It’s Like Working in Amazon’s Warehouses during the Coronavirus Outbreak,” op. cit. [↑](#endnote-ref-8)
9. Annie Palmer, “Amazon Fires Warehouse Worker Who Led Staten Island Strike for More Coronavirus Protection,” CNBC, March 31, 2020, accessed March 31, 2020, www.cnbc.com/2020/03/30/amazon-fires-staten-island-coronavirus-strike-leader-chris-smalls.html. [↑](#endnote-ref-9)
10. Michelle Mark, “Jeff Bezos Is Asking Laid-off Restaurant and Bar Workers To Come Work for Amazon Amid the Coronavirus Crisis,” *Business Insider*, March 22, 2020, accessed March 31, 2020, www.businessinsider.in/international/news/jeff-bezos-is-asking-laid-off-restaurant-and-bar-workers-to-come-work-for-amazon-amid-the-coronavirus-crisis/articleshow/74755219.cms. [↑](#endnote-ref-10)
11. Michael Sainato, “Jeff Bezos Values Profits above Safety: Amazon Workers Voice Pandemic Concern,” *The Guardian*, April 7, 2020 accessed April 10, 2020, www.theguardian.com/technology/2020/apr/07/amazon-warehouse-workers-coronavirus-safety#maincontent. [↑](#endnote-ref-11)
12. Annie Palmer, “Amazon Fires Warehouse Worker Who Led Staten Island Strike for More Coronavirus Protection,” op. cit. [↑](#endnote-ref-12)
13. Evie Fordham, “Who Fired Amazon Worker Chris Smalls,” *Fox Business*, April 6, 2010, accessed April 8, 2020, www.foxbusiness.com/money/coronavirus-amazon-chris-smalls-fired-strike. [↑](#endnote-ref-13)
14. Josh Eidelson & Luke Kawa, “Firing of Amazon Strike Leader Draws State and City Scrutiny,” Bloomberg, March 31, 2020, accessed May 15, 2020, https://www.bloomberg.com/news/articles/2020-03-30/amazon-worker-who-led-strike-over-virus-says-company-fired-him. [↑](#endnote-ref-14)
15. Kenya Evelyn, op. cit. [↑](#endnote-ref-15)
16. Evie Fordham, op. cit. [↑](#endnote-ref-16)
17. Bill Hutchinson, “'It's Retaliation': Amazon Warehouse Worker Fired Following Coronavirus Employee Walkout,” *abc News*, April 1, 2020, accessed April 6, 2020, <https://abcnews.go.com/Business/retaliation-amazon-warehouse-worker-fired-staging-walkout/story?id=69893683>. [↑](#endnote-ref-17)
18. Rachel Sandler, “Hundreds of Amazon Employees Plan To Protest Coronavirus Safety by Calling Out of Work,” *Forbes*, April 27, 2020, accessed April 30, 2020, www.forbes.com/sites/rachelsandler/2020/04/21/hundreds-of-amazon-employees-plan-to-protest-coronavirus-safety-by-calling-out-of-work/#7936f7b53db2. [↑](#endnote-ref-18)
19. Angel Au-Yeung, “Amnesty International Calls on Jeff Bezos to Address Amazon Employees’ Concerns about Working Conditions,” *Forbes*, April 24, 2020, accessed April 28, 2020, www.forbes.com/sites/angelauyeung/2020/04/24/amnesty-international-calls-on-jeff-bezos-to-address-amazon-employees-concerns-about-working-conditions/#304ee5cf4fe8. [↑](#endnote-ref-19)
20. Evelyn, op. cit. [↑](#endnote-ref-20)
21. “Amazon at No. 2 on Fortune’s 2021 World’s Most Admired Companies list,” Amazon Workplace, March 22, 2021, accessed April 5, 2021, https://www.aboutamazon.com/news/workplace/amazon-at-no-2-on-fortunes-worlds-most-admired-companies-list. [↑](#endnote-ref-21)
22. “Amazon,” WhatIs.com, April 2014, accessed October 13, 2019, <https://whatis.techtarget.com/definition/Amazon>. [↑](#endnote-ref-22)
23. Michael Sainato, “Exploited Amazon Workers Need a Union. When Will They Get One?,” *The Guardian*, July 8, 2019, accessed October 25, 2019, www.theguardian.com/commentisfree/2018/jul/08/amazon-jeff-bezos-unionize-working-conditions. [↑](#endnote-ref-23)
24. Paul R. La Monica and Chris Isidore, “Amazon Is Buying Whole Foods for 13.7 Billion,” *CNN*, June 16, 2017, https://money.cnn.com/2017/06/16/investing/amazon-buying-whole-foods/index.html. [↑](#endnote-ref-24)
25. Evie Fordham, “Non-union Amazon Workers Protesting Coronavirus Conditions Get Support of Big Labor Groups,” Fox Business, April 5, 2020, accessed April 12, 2020, www.foxbusiness.com/money/coronavirus-amazon-unions-afl-cio-jeff-bezos. [↑](#endnote-ref-25)
26. Michael Sainato, “Jeff Bezos Values Profits above Safety: Amazon Workers Voice Pandemic Concern,” op. cit. [↑](#endnote-ref-26)
27. Evie Fordham, “Non-union Amazon Workers Protesting Coronavirus Conditions Get Support of Big Labor Groups,” op. cit. [↑](#endnote-ref-27)
28. Audrey Conklin, “Amazon Enacts New Coronavirus Measures as Employees Protest Safety Conditions,” Fox Business, April 2, 2020, accessed April 18, 2020, www.foxbusiness.com/technology/amazon-new-coronavirus-safety-rules. [↑](#endnote-ref-28)
29. Annie Palmer, “They’re Putting Us All at Risk’: What It’s Like Working in Amazon’s Warehouses during the Coronavirus Outbreak,” op. cit. [↑](#endnote-ref-29)
30. Annie Palmer, “Amazon Fires Warehouse Worker Who Led Staten Island Strike for More Coronavirus Protection,” op. cit. [↑](#endnote-ref-30)
31. Annie Palmer, “Amazon Tells Sellers It’s Not Taking New Listings for Face Masks or Hand Sanitizer Amid Coronavirus Price Gouging,” CNBC, March 12, 2020, accessed April 5, 2020,https://www.cnbc.com/2020/03/12/amazon-blocks-new-sale-listings-of-face-masks-hand-sanitizer.html. [↑](#endnote-ref-31)
32. “Man Donates 18,000 Hand Sanitizer Products after Amazon Shuts Down Sales,” Graham Media Group, March 16, 2020, accessed March 26, 2020, www.clickorlando.com/news/local/2020/03/16/man-donates-18000-hand-sanitizer-products-after-amazon-shuts-down-sales/. [↑](#endnote-ref-32)
33. Evie Fordham, “Non-union Amazon Workers Protesting Coronavirus Conditions Get Support of Big Labor Groups,” op. cit. [↑](#endnote-ref-33)
34. Matt Day, “Whole Foods Workers Launch Sickout Protest. How Many Isn’t Clear,” Bloomberg, March 31, 2020, accessed April 7, 2020, www.bloomberg.com/news/articles/2020-03-31/whole-foods-workers-launch-sick-out-protest-how-many-isn-t-clear. [↑](#endnote-ref-34)
35. Karen Weise and Kate Conger, “Gaps in Amazon’s Response as Virus Spreads to More Than 50 Warehouses,” *The New York Times*, April 5, 2020, accessed April 15, 2020, www.nytimes.com/2020/04/05/technology/coronavirus-amazon-workers.html. [↑](#endnote-ref-35)
36. Bill Hutchinson, op. cit. [↑](#endnote-ref-36)
37. Shirin Ghaffary, “NYC Is Investigating Amazon for Firing a Worker Who Protested Coronavirus Working Conditions,” *The New York Time*s, March 31, 2020, accessed April 10, 2020, www.vox.com/recode/2020/3/31/21202075/new-york-city-amazon-coronavirus-fired-worker-protest-quarantine-bill-de-blasio-chris-smalls. [↑](#endnote-ref-37)
38. NYC, accessed April 30, 2020, [www1.nyc.gov/site/cchr/law/the-la.page](https://www1.nyc.gov/site/cchr/law/the-la.page). [↑](#endnote-ref-38)
39. Evelyn, op. cit. [↑](#endnote-ref-39)
40. Annie Palmer, “Amazon Fires Warehouse Worker Who Led Staten Island Strike for More Coronavirus Protection,” op. cit. [↑](#endnote-ref-40)
41. “OSHA Requirements,” NYC Buildings, accessed May 2, 2020, [www1.nyc.gov/site/buildings/safety/osha-requirements.page](https://www1.nyc.gov/site/buildings/safety/osha-requirements.page). [↑](#endnote-ref-41)
42. Paul Blest, “Leaked Amazon Memo Details Plan to Smear Fired Warehouse Organizer: ‘He’s Not Smart or Articulate’,” Vice News, April 3, 2020, accessed April 20, 2020, www.vice.com/en\_us/article/5dm8bx/leaked-amazon-memo-details-plan-to-smear-fired-warehouse-organizer-hes-not-smart-or-articulate. [↑](#endnote-ref-42)
43. Julia Carrie Wong, “Amazon Execs Labeled Fired Worker ‘Not Smart or Articulate’ in Leaked PR Notes,” *The Guardian*, April 3, 2020, accessed April 20, 2020, www.theguardian.com/technology/2020/apr/02/amazon-chris-smalls-smart-articulate-leaked-memo. [↑](#endnote-ref-43)
44. Ibid. [↑](#endnote-ref-44)
45. Mariya Parodi, “Jeff Bezos Must Address Concerns of Amazon Workers during COVID-19 Crisis,” Amnesty International, April 24, 2020, accessed April 30, 2020, www.amnestyusa.org/press-releases/jeff-bezos-must-address-concerns-of-amazon-workers-during-covid-19/. [↑](#endnote-ref-45)
46. Karen Weise and Kate Conger, op. cit. [↑](#endnote-ref-46)
47. Spencer Soper, “Amazon’s Sick Leave Called Inadequate by State Attorneys General,” Bloomberg, March 2, 2020, accessed March 30, 2020, www.bloomberg.com/news/articles/2020-03-25/amazon-s-sick-leave-called-inadequate-by-state-attorneys-general. [↑](#endnote-ref-47)
48. Michael Sainato, “Jeff Bezos Values Profits above Safety: Amazon Workers Voice Pandemic Concern,” op. cit. [↑](#endnote-ref-48)
49. Jeff Bezos, “2019 Letter to Shareholders,” The Amazon Blog, April 16, 2020, accessed April 25, 2020, <https://blog.aboutamazon.com/company-news/2019-letter-to-shareholders>. [↑](#endnote-ref-49)
50. Angel Au-Yeung, op. cit. [↑](#endnote-ref-50)
51. Ibid. [↑](#endnote-ref-51)
52. Amazon Staff, “Amazon’s COVID-19 Blog: Daily Updates on How We’re Responding to the Crisis,” Amazon, November 27, 2020, accessed December 20, 2020, <https://blog.aboutamazon.com/company-news/amazons-actions-to-help-employees-communities-and-customers-affected-by-covid-19>. [↑](#endnote-ref-52)
53. Jeff Bezos, op. cit. [↑](#endnote-ref-53)
54. Amazon Staff, op. cit. [↑](#endnote-ref-54)
55. Ibid. [↑](#endnote-ref-55)
56. Ibid. [↑](#endnote-ref-56)
57. Steve Denning, “How Amazon Became Agile,” *Forbes*, June 2, 2019, accessed March 11, 2020, www.forbes.com/sites/stevedenning/2019/06/02/how-amazon-became-agile/#2c2ec30331aa. [↑](#endnote-ref-57)
58. Amazon.com Inc., *Leadership Principles*, Amazon.com Inc., www.amazon.jobs/en/principles. [↑](#endnote-ref-58)
59. “Leadership Principles,” Amazon, April 16, 2020, accessed April 25, 2020, <https://www.amazon.jobs/en/principles>. [↑](#endnote-ref-59)
60. Steve Denning, op. cit. [↑](#endnote-ref-60)
61. Michael. J. Arena, “Adaptive Space: How GM and Other Companies are Positively Disrupting Themselves and Transforming into Agile Organizations,” 2018, McGraw Hill Education. Kindle Version. [↑](#endnote-ref-61)
62. Franklin Foer, “Bezos’s Master Plan,” The Atlantic, November 2019, accessed August 27, 2020, www.theatlantic.com/magazine/archive/2019/11/what-jeff-bezos-wants/598363/Jeff. [↑](#endnote-ref-62)
63. Steve Denning, “The Seven Things A Highly Agile CEO Does: Jeff Bezos,” *Forbes*, September 17, 2018, accessed March 11, 2020, www.forbes.com/sites/stevedenning/2018/09/17/the-seven-things-a-highly-agile-ceo-does-jeff-bezos/#3016c85f4f09. [↑](#endnote-ref-63)
64. Lauren Feiner, “Amazon Told Investors They ‘May Want To Take a Seat,’ Here’s What That Means,” CNBC, May 1, 2020, accessed May 2, 2020, www.cnbc.com/2020/05/01/amazon-investors-may-want-to-take-a-seat-heres-what-that-means.html?recirc=taboolainternal. [↑](#endnote-ref-64)
65. Ibid. [↑](#endnote-ref-65)
66. Nicole Wetsman, “WHO Declares the Outbreak of the New Coronavirus Is a Pandemic,” *The Verge*, March 11, 2020, accessed April 29, 2020, [www.theverge.com/2020/3/11/21156325/coronavirus-pandemic-who-declares-COVID-19-outbreak-global-h1n1](https://www.theverge.com/2020/3/11/21156325/coronavirus-pandemic-who-declares-covid-19-outbreak-global-h1n1). [↑](#endnote-ref-66)
67. Ibid. [↑](#endnote-ref-67)
68. Ibid. [↑](#endnote-ref-68)