

DEFENDANT	United States District Court Northern District of California	
	Case No. <b>4:20-cv-05640-YGR</b>	
	Case Title <b>Epic Games, Inc. v. Apple, Inc.</b>	
	Exhibit No. <b>DX-3796</b>	
	Date Entered _____	
		Susan Y. Seong, Clerk
		By: _____ Deputy Clerk

**Subject:** Re: ERB: Minecraft shared currency

**From:** "Trystan Kosmyka" [REDACTED]

**Received(Date):** Wed, 31 May 2017 00:34:36 +0000

**To:** "Bill Havlicek" [REDACTED]

**Cc:** "Stoney Gamble" [REDACTED], "Anders Baecklund"

[REDACTED], "Mary Ann Brunson"

[REDACTED], "Alexandria McEnroe" [REDACTED]

**Date:** Wed, 31 May 2017 00:34:36 +0000

Have we also verified no link outs / marketing material that would let the iOS customer know that coins can be purchased outside of iOS/tvOS

On May 30, 2017, at 5:09 PM, Bill Havlicek [REDACTED] wrote:

New ERB Ticket created and Alexandria has it for Out of Cycle tonight.

<https://elevate.apple.com/tickets/1724722>

Bill

On May 30, 2017, at 4:53 PM, Bill Havlicek [REDACTED] wrote:

Yes. They will fix both iOS and tvOS

On May 30, 2017, at 4:30 PM, Trystan Kosmyka [REDACTED] wrote:

When's the call?

On May 30, 2017, at 3:21 PM, Bill Havlicek [REDACTED] wrote:

Hello Trystan,  
Just FYI in case this escalates through other channels.

Minecraft: Apple TV Edition for tvOS is requiring users to sign in with or sign up for an Xbox live account in order to purchase consumable currency. Since the app as a single player mode we would require that users be able to access IAP without forced registration. We are rejecting for 5.1.1.

It appears this new Marketplace feature was enabled in the iOS version and was approved in error with this same 5.1.1 issue.

When I spoke to them today, they claimed that because they have a multi-platform shared marketplace for coins, they need users to be logged in to purchase. I'm setting up another call with them and the partnership manager to deliver the news that we are going to require them to allow purchase without sign in and to address this on the iOS app too.

Best regards,

Bill

On May 11, 2017, at 9:04 AM, Bill Havlicek [REDACTED] wrote:

Hello Trystan,

The call has been made with the Minecraft team at Microsoft. They were happy with the revised guidance and agreed to the points detailed below.

- Incidental shared currency is OK
- Apps must offer IAP for virtual currency
- No buttons, links, emails or solicitation that direct iOS or tvOS users to other purchasing mechanisms
- The app should be setup for IAP and users should not be directed inside or outside the app to purchase mechanisms other than IAP

Best regards,

Bill

On May 10, 2017, at 7:06 AM, Trystan Kosmynka [REDACTED] wrote:

Great, thanks

On May 10, 2017, at 7:04 AM, Bill Havlicek [REDACTED] wrote:

The PM is setting it up.

Likely happening today or tomorrow.

Bill

On May 10, 2017, at 6:53 AM, Trystan Kosmynka [REDACTED] wrote:

If we haven't already moved forward with a call on this one we can.

On May 8, 2017, at 10:53 AM, Bill Havlicek [REDACTED] wrote:

Thanks, will do.

On May 8, 2017, at 10:38 AM, Trystan Kosmynka [REDACTED] wrote:

Give it until say 2PM, doubt there will be any objections or responses, but want to give a few hours to be sure

On May 8, 2017, at 10:34 AM, Bill Havlicek [REDACTED] wrote:

OK for me to reach out to the PM and get a conf call arranged with the team we spoke to previously to deliver this info?

Best regards,

Bill

On May 8, 2017, at 10:32 AM, Trystan Kosmynga [REDACTED] wrote:

Begin forwarded message:

**From:** Trystan Kosmynga [REDACTED]  
**Date:** May 8, 2017 at 10:31:59 AM PDT  
**To:** Josh Shaffer [REDACTED]  
**Cc:** Ron Okamoto [REDACTED], Philip Schiller [REDACTED], Emily Blumsack [REDACTED], Matt Fischer [REDACTED], "C.K. Haun" [REDACTED]

**Subject: Re: ERB: Minecraft shared currency**

Privileged and Confidential

Thanks for the feedback, we will arrange the call asap.

On May 6, 2017, at 9:38 AM, Josh Shaffer [REDACTED] wrote:

Privileged and confidential

Agreed. I think this is necessary for user experience.

Josh

On May 5, 2017, at 11:35 PM, Ron Okamoto [REDACTED] wrote:

Privileged and confidential

I agree with this approach, no objections.

Sent from my iPhone

On May 5, 2017, at 10:53 PM, Philip Schiller [REDACTED] wrote:

Privileged and Confidential

I think this makes sense and is even necessary.

We don't want to distribute apps that allow purchases of digital goods and services outside of the App Store. But we also have to allow apps that are cross platform to work properly

for users. If users play Minecraft on for example the PC, and purchase goods there, and then run Minecraft on iOS or AppleTV with the same log on they would expect those goods to be there as well. I don't see any other way around this.

If anyone feels otherwise please say so. I think this is a big deal.

For reference our current guideline is the following:

Guideline 3.1 "If you want to unlock features or functionality within your app, (by way of example: subscriptions, in-game currencies, game levels, access to premium content, or unlocking a full version), you must use in-app purchase."

On May 6, 2017, at 1:45 AM, Trystan Kosmynka [REDACTED] wrote:

Privileged and Confidential

After several discussions we believe we have a path forward for the Minecraft shared currency issue.

We are okay if there is incidental shared currency in Minecraft. The app must use IAP for virtual currency and there must be no buttons, external links or other calls to action that direct customers to purchasing mechanisms other than IAP.

Outside of the app there must be no links, emails or other solicitations that direct iOS/tvOS customers to purchasing mechanisms other than IAP.

The entire app experience must be setup for purchasing with IAP, and nothing the developer does in the app or outside the app is designed to encourage purchases for use on iOS happening anywhere but on iOS.

Unless anyone objects we would like to move forward with letting Minecraft know.

Bill Havlicek | [REDACTED] | 408.974.2992

Information in this email including any attachments may be privileged, confidential and is intended exclusively for the addressee. The views expressed may not be official policy, but the personal views of the originator. If you have received it in error, please notify the sender by return email and delete it from your system. You should not reproduce, distribute, store, retransmit, use or disclose its contents to anyone. Please note we reserve the right to monitor all email communication through our internal and external networks. Apple and the Apple logo are trade marks of Apple Inc registered in the US and other countries.

Bill Havlicek | [REDACTED] | 408.974.2992

Information in this email including any attachments may be privileged, confidential and is intended exclusively for the addressee. The views expressed may not be official policy, but the personal views of the originator. If you have received it in error, please notify the sender by return email and delete it from your system. You should not reproduce, distribute, store, retransmit, use or disclose its contents to anyone. Please note we reserve the right to monitor all email communication through our internal and external networks. Apple and the Apple logo are trade marks of Apple Inc registered in the US and other countries.

Bill Havlicek | [REDACTED] | 408.974.2992



Information in this email including any attachments may be privileged, confidential and is intended exclusively for the addressee. The views expressed may not be official policy, but the personal views of the originator. If you have received it in error, please notify the sender by return email and delete it from your system. You should not reproduce, distribute, store, retransmit, use or disclose its contents to anyone. Please note we reserve the right to monitor all email communication through our internal and external networks. Apple and the Apple logo are trade marks of Apple Inc registered in the US and other countries.

Bill Havlicek | [REDACTED] | 408.974.2992

Information in this email including any attachments may be privileged, confidential and is intended exclusively for the addressee. The views expressed may not be official policy, but the personal views of the originator. If you have received it in error, please notify the sender by return email and delete it from your system. You should not reproduce, distribute, store, retransmit, use or disclose its contents to anyone. Please note we reserve the right to monitor all email communication through our internal and external networks. Apple and the Apple logo are trade marks of Apple Inc registered in the US and other countries.

Bill Havlicek | [REDACTED] | 408.974.2992

Information in this email including any attachments may be privileged, confidential and is intended exclusively for the addressee. The views expressed may not be official policy, but the personal views of the originator. If you have received it in error, please notify the sender by return email and delete it from your system. You should not reproduce, distribute, store, retransmit, use or disclose its contents to anyone. Please note we reserve the right to monitor all email communication through our internal and external networks. Apple and the Apple logo are trade marks of Apple Inc registered in the US and other countries.