

Corrections for Matt Thompson

Marina De Vos and Pablo Gervás Gómez-Navarro

1 Marking changes

For the corrections, please provide a short document detailing how you addressed our concerns. Please use the `changebars/todonote` package or colour the text where you have changed/added text unless it concerns typos.

2 Requested Changes

2.1 Contribution of the dissertation

The contribution of the dissertation, as discussed during the viva, should be an interpretation of the theory of Propp using Tropes and a normative multi-agent system.

2.2 Revise the introductory chapters

- 2.2.1 Rewrite the introduction (chapter 1) to rephrase the overall objectives of the thesis ensuring that humbler appropriate objectives are set. This was because the objectives in the original Introduction could not be seen to be supported by the results reported in the thesis
- 2.2.2 Tidy-up the literature review (chapter 2) in light of discussion in the viva: your approach is also a version planning and it is maybe not as interactive as you claim, Tone down some of your critique.

2.3 Bringing the contribution to the forefront

Reorganise the bulk of the contribution – which was presented in chapters 3 (on institutions), 4 (on tropes), 5 (on the TropICAL language) and 6 (StoryBuilder plus some evaluation of it) – by shifting the example of how the Punch and Judy experience can be phrased in terms of institutions towards the end. This would present two advantages:

- There would be no need to first explain the Punch and Judy experience in terms of Proppian functions and then re-explain it in terms of tropes (a single explanation in terms of tropes at the end would suffice)

- The example in terms of institutions would serve to exemplify how the rest of the developments (the trope representation, the TropICAL language and the StoryBuilder application) would allow users to access significant expressive and computational power for their stories

2.3.1 Rearrange the chapters and rewrite the connecting text to support this:

- (a) new chapter 3 - Current chapter 4
- (b) new chapter 4 - Current chapter 5
- (c) new chapter 5 - Current chapter 6 excluding the evaluation
- (d) new chapter 6 - Current chapter 3 from section 3.3 on in the context of how to combine Storybuilder with agents
- (e) new chapter 7 -New chapter: Evaluation and Validation: including the work on evaluation already present in the original version (section 6.3) but also possibly the questionnaire appearing in Appendix A and reference to the thematic analysis transcripts in Appendix E

2.3.2 The new chapters needs to include:

- (a) a full specification of Punch and Judy
- (b) a discussion of how to combine tropes, i.e. provide a methodology for combining tropes
- (c) Add an example of “Character Freedom”, as in breaking away from the norms

2.3.3 It must also specifically discuss for the approach presented the issues that have been addressed in the literature review (this may need to be adjusted depending on the final version of the literature review, but should include at least):

- (a) comparison with planning approaches that contrasts the relative merits of the two approaches, with specific reference to the capabilities of the approach as it is finally presented (not just comparing against the ambitious goals set at the start in the original introduction but which were not fulfilled in the final prototypes)
- (b) a discussion of whether ”Character Freedom” has been achieved, and whether the version of it achieved delivers on the advantages it promised (this corresponds to you second bullet point on requirements for the new chapter)
- (c) a valuation of the final prototypes in terms of the interactivity literature included in the review.This should include complexity.

2.3.4 Seeing the volume of issues to be discussed, it may be worth it to include an additional separate chapter on Discussion, after the contribution has been outlined but before the Conclusions.

2.4 Other Additions and Changes

- 2.4.1 Explain the Hashmaps: what are they
- 2.4.2 Provide a short introduction to ASP and Instal including why you selected them
- 2.4.3 Provide a more expansive future work section. Future work is not just about the little bits you would like to add. It should discuss the new research challenges that this work unlocks and some initial thoughts on how they could be tackled.
- 2.4.4 Add pagerefs when you referring to sections/tables/figures in other chapters (the fancyref package does this for you).