

Peer-review process

Writer/speaker:

- Produces work.
- Asks for feedback → expects criticism.
- Judges feedback.
- Revises.

Peer-review process

Reviewer:

- Reads/listens to **full** work.
- THEN:
 - 1) **Summarises** it.
 - 2) Discusses **most important** issues.

Is constructive:

- Says **why**.
- Gives suggestions/solutions.
- Is *specific*.
- Points out successful parts.

Good vs bad feedback

The text:

The system is intended to function at payload of 5 tons. For this purpose we will make it strong big system.

Bad feedback:

- What you wrote is silly.
- I like the grammar.

Correct but pedantic:

- You should write "a payload".

Good vs bad feedback

The text:

The system is intended to function at payload of 5 tons. For this purpose we will make it strong big system.

Good feedback (general):

- Text describes relationship between requirements & design of some system.
- Good: Expresses clear requirement. Sets context well.

Good vs bad feedback

The text:

The system is intended to function at payload of 5 tons. For this purpose we will make it strong big system.

Good feedback (specific):

- But unclear what "strong" and "big" means in this context. Perhaps work on clarifying.
- "Tons" could be ambiguous in the US. Perhaps write "metric tons" or "tonnes".

Feedback exercise

BLG374E

Tech.

Comm.

Eng.

Task: Give feedback (conceptual, style, mechanics) on in-class essay.

Reviewer to-do:

- Read whole essay first.
- Write your name & ID.
- Write a summary main ideas.
- Write about biggest issues first.
- Be specific.
- Note positive aspects.

Sample Questions

Organisation:

- Is objective clear?
- Are transitions smooth?
- Do introduction and conclusion match main ideas?
- Easy to follow flow of ideas?
- Are different ideas muddled together?
- Ideas/paragraphs order sensible?

Mechanics:

- Spelling?
- Grammar good – ambiguities or difficulty with understanding?
- Punctuation should help not hinder.
- Name and ID on all pages?

Support:

- Main ideas explained/developed?
- Support for ideas persuasive?
- Connection between the ideas & support clear?

Revision suggestions:

- How would you revise this work if it were your own?