Syntax

Introducing Linguistics

This outstanding series is an indispensable resource for students and teachers – a concise and engaging introduction to the central subjects of contemporary linguistics. Presupposing no prior knowledge on the part of the reader, each volume sets out the fundamental skills and knowledge of the field, and so provides the ideal educational platform for further study in linguistics.

1	Andrew Spencer	*Phonology*
2	John Saeed	*Semantics*, Second Edition
3	Barbara Johnstone	*Discourse Analysis*
4	Andrew Carnie	*Syntax*, Second Edition

Syntax

A Generative Introduction

Second Edition

Andrew Carnie

© 2006 by Andrew Carnie PLEASE CHECK DATE

BLACKWELL PUBLISHING
350 Main Street, Malden, MA 02148-5020, USA
9600 Garsington Road, Oxford OX4 2DQ, UK
550 Swanston Street, Carlton, Victoria, Australia

The right of Andrew Carnie to be identified as the Author of this Work has been asserted in accordance with the UK Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, except as permitted by the UK Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, without the prior permission of the publisher.

First Edition published 2002 by Blackwell Publishing Ltd

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

ISBN013: 978-1-4051-3384-5 (hardback)
ISBN-10: 1-4051-3384-8 (hardback) PLEASE CONFIRM NO ISBN FOR PBK?

IS THERE NO LIBRARY OF CONGRESS DATA FOR THIS?

A catalogue record for this title is available from the British Library.

Set in Palatino 10 pt by the author
Printed and bound in Great Britain by [NAME AND ADDRESS OF PRINTER]

The publisher's policy is to use permanent paper from mills tha toperat ea sustainable forestry policy, and which has been manufactured form pulp processed using acid-free and elementary chlorine-free practices. Furthermore the publisher ensures that the text paper and coverboard used have met acceptable environmental accreditation standards.

For further information on
Blackwell Publishers, visit our website: www.blackwellpublishing.com

Dedicated with love to my parents, Robert and Jean
and in memory of my teacher and mentor, Ken Hale

The text formatting in this book has been adapted and modified by ReadSmart®, an algorithm which imposes almost undetectable changes in presentation. This formatting is based on psycholinguistic principles, and has been shown in studies to enhance readers' reading speed, comprehension and enjoyment and to make the text more persuasive. The ReadSmart® treatment of the text was provided by Language Technologies Inc., which offers this service for all forms of publication. (www.lngtek.com)

Contents

Preface and Acknowledgments xv

Part 1 Preliminaries 1

1 Generative Grammar 3
0. Preliminaries 3
1. Syntax as a Cognitive Science 4
2. Modeling Syntax 5
3. Syntax as Science – the Scientific Method 6
3.1 An Example of the Scientific Method as Applied to Syntax 9
3.2 Sources of Data 11
4. Where do the Rules Come From? 14
4.1 Learning vs. Acquisition 14
4.2 Innateness: Language as an Instinct 15
4.3 The Logical Problem of Language Acquisition 15
4.4 Other Arguments for UG 19
4.5 Explaining Language Variation 22
5. Choosing among Theories about Syntax 23
6. The Scientific Method and the Structure of this Textbook 24
7. Summary 25
Ideas Introduced in this Chapter 25
Further Reading 28
General Problem Sets 28
Challenge Problem Sets 30

2 Parts of Speech 35
0. Words and Why They Matter to Syntax 35
1. Determining Part of Speech 36
1.1 The Problem of Traditional Definitions 36
1.2 Distributional Criteria 38
2. The Major Parts of Speech: N, V, Adj, and Adv 39
2.1 Nouns 40
2.2 Verbs 41
2.3 Adjectives 41
2.4 Adverbs 42
3. Open vs. Closed; Lexical vs. Functional 43
3.1 Open vs. Closed Parts of Speech 43
3.2 Lexical vs. Functional 44
3.3 Some Functional (Closed) Categories of English 44
3.4 Summary 46
4. Subcategories and Features 46
4.1 Subcategories of Nouns 47
4.2 Subcategories of Verbs 49
5. Summary 52
Ideas Introduced in this Chapter 53
Further Reading 54
General Problem Sets 54
Challenge Problem Sets 58

3 Constituency, Trees, and Rules 61
0. Introduction 61
1. Rules and Trees 64
1.1 Noun Phrases (NPs) 64
1.2 Adjective Phrases (AdjPs) and Adverb Phrases (AdvPs) 66
1.3 Prepositional Phrases (PPs) 69
1.4 Verb Phrases (VPs) 70
1.5 Clauses 72
1.6 Summary 77
2. How to Draw a Tree 79
2.1 Bottom-up Trees 79
2.2 The Top-down Method of Drawing Trees 82
2.3 Bracketed Diagrams 84
3. Modification and Ambiguity 85
4. Constituency Tests 86
5. Summary and Conclusion 89

Appendix: How to Do Foreign Language PSR Problems 89
A1. Doing problems with word-by-word glosses 90
A2. Doing problems without word-by-word glosses 92
Ideas Introduced in this Chapter 93
Further Reading 94
General Problem Sets 94
Challenge Problem Sets 99

4 Structural Relations 101
0. Introduction 101
1. The Parts of a Tree 102
2. Domination 104
2.1 Domination 104
2.2 Exhaustive Domination 105
2.3 Immediate Domination 107
3. Precedence 108
4. C-command 111
5. Grammatical Relations 116
6. Summary and Conclusions 119
Ideas Introduced in this Chapter 119
Further Reading 122
General Problem Sets 122
Challenge Problem Sets 130

5 Binding Theory 133
0. Introduction 133
1. The Notions *Coindex* and *Antecedent* 135
2. Binding 136
3. Locality Conditions on the Binding of Anaphors 139
4. The Distribution of Pronouns 140
5. The Distribution of R-expressions 141
6. Conclusion 142
Ideas Introduced in this Chapter 142
Further Reading 143
General Problem Sets 144
Challenge Problem Sets 145

Part 2 The Base 149

6 X-bar Theory 151
0. Introduction 151
1. Bar-level Projections 153
1.1 V-bar 154
1.2 Adj-bar and Adv-bar 156
1.3 P-bar 158
2. Generalizing the Rules: The X-bar Schema 158
3. Complements, Adjuncts, and Specifiers 161
3.1 Complements and Adjuncts in NPs 163
3.2 Complements and Adjuncts in VPs, AdjPs, AdvPs, and PPs 168
3.3 The Notion Specifier 170
4. Some Definitional Housekeeping 171
5. Parameters of Word Order 172
6. Drawing Trees in X-bar Notation 175
6.1 Important Considerations in Tree Drawing 175
6.2 A Sample Tree 178
7. X-bar Theory: A Summary 185
Ideas Introduced in this Chapter 186
Further Reading 187
General Problem Sets 188
Challenge Problem Sets 192

7 Extending X-bar Theory to Functional Categories 195
0. Introduction 195
1. Determiner Phrases (DPs) 196
2. A Descriptive Tangent into Clause Types 199
3. Complementizer Phrases (CPs) 204
4. Tense Phrases (TPs) 208
5. CP, TP, DP tree 210
Ideas Introduced in this Chapter 211
Further Reading 212
General Problem Sets 212
Challenge Problem Sets 214

8 Constraining X-bar Theory: The Lexicon 217
0. Introduction 217
1. Some Basic Terminology 218
2. Thematic Relations and Theta Roles 219

3. The Lexicon 224
4. Expletives and the Extended Projection Principle 226
5. Summary 228
Ideas Introduced in this Chapter 229
Further Reading 230
General Problem Sets 230
Challenge Problem Sets 234

Part 3 Movement 239

9 Head-to-Head Movement 241
0. Introduction 241
1. Verb Movement (V → T) 244
1.1 French 244
1.2 Irish 252
2. T Movement (T → C) 258
3. *Do*-support 261
4. Multiple Auxiliaries and Affix-hopping in English 263
4.1 Multiple Auxiliaries 263
4.2 Affix-hopping 266
5. Summary 269
Appendix: Tests for Determining if a Language has V → T or Affix Lowering 270
Ideas Introduced in this Chapter 270
Further Reading 272
General Problem Sets 272
Challenge Problem Sets 277

10 DP Movement 283
0. Introduction 283
1. A Puzzle for the Theory of Theta Roles 283
2. Passives 289
3. Case 293
4. Raising: Reprise 298
5. Passives: Reprise 300
6. Closing Up a Loose End 302
7. Conclusion 304
Ideas Introduced in this Chapter 304
Further Reading 305
General Problem Sets 305

Challenge Problem Sets 311

11 *Wh*-movement 315
0. Introduction 315
1. Movement in *Wh*-questions 316
2. Islands 331
3. The Minimal Link Condition 334
3.1 Wh-*islands and the Minimal Link Condition* 334
3.2 The MLC in DP Movement and Head Movement 337
4. Echo Questions (*Wh*-in-situ) in English 339
5. Conclusion 341
Ideas Introduced in this Chapter 342
Further Reading 343
General Problem Sets 344
Challenge Problem Sets 346

12 A Unified Theory of Movement 351
0. Introduction 351
1. Move 353
2. Explaining Cross-linguistic Differences 356
3. Scope, LF Movement, and the MLC 361
3.1 MLC Effects in Wh-*in-situ Languages* 362
3.2 English Quantifiers and Scope 362
4. Conclusion 365
Ideas Introduced in this Chapter 365
Further Reading 366
General Problem Sets 367
Challenge Problem Sets 368

Part 4 Advanced Topics 371

13 Expanded VPs 373
0. Introduction 373
1. The Problem of Ditransitive Verbs 373
2. Light Verbs 375
3. Object Shift 378
4. Ditransitives: Reprise 383
Ideas Introduced in this Chapter 387
Further Reading 387

General Problem Sets 389
Challenge Problem Sets 390

14 Raising, Control, and Empty Categories 393
0. Introduction 393
1. Raising vs. Control 394
1.1 Two Kinds of Theta Grids for Main Predicates 394
1.2 Distinguishing Raising from Control 401
1.3 What is PRO? 403
2. Two Kinds of Raising, Two Kinds of Control 403
2.1 Two Kinds of Raising 403
2.2 Two Kinds of Control 407
2.3 Summary of Predicate Types 408
3. Control Theory 410
4. Another Kind of Null Subject: "Little" *pro* 413
5. Summary 415
Ideas Introduced in this Chapter 415
Further Reading 416
General Problem Sets 417
Challenge Problem Sets 419

15 Advanced Topics in Binding Theory 421
0. A Quick Review of Chapter 5 Binding Theory 421
1. Levels of Representation 422
2. The Definition of Binding Domain 424
2.1 A Miscellany of Domain Violations 424
2.2 Anaphors 425
2.3 Pronouns 428
Ideas Introduced in this Chapter 430
Further Reading 431
General Problem Sets 431
Challenge Problem Sets 432

Part 5 Alternatives 433

16 Lexical-Functional Grammar 435
0. Alternative Theories 435
1. C-structure 436
2. Functions 437
3. The Lexicon 438

4. F-structure 439
4.1 Why F-structures? 442
5. Assorted Phenomena 443
5.1 Head Mobility 444
5.2 Passives 445
5.3 Raising and Control 445
5.4 Wh-*movement: Long Distance Dependencies* 448
6. Conclusion 449
Ideas Introduced in this Chapter 449
Further Reading 451
General Problem Sets 452
Challenge Problem Sets 452

17 Head-Driven Phrase Structure Grammar 453
0. Introduction 453
1. Features 454
2. The Lexicon 457
3. Rules, Features, and Trees 459
4. Binding 463
5. Long Distance Dependencies 463
Ideas Introduced in this Chapter 465
Further Reading 468
General Problem Sets 468
Challenge Problem Sets 469

Conclusions and Directions for Further Study 471

References 473
Index 480

Preface and Acknowledgments

Almost every preface to every syntax textbook out there starts out by telling the reader how different this book is from every other syntax textbook. On one hand, this is often the truth: each author shows their own particular spin or emphasis. This is certainly true of this textbook. For example, you'll be hard pressed to find another textbook on Principles and Parameters syntax that uses as many Irish examples as this one does. Nor will you find another P&P textbook with a supplementary discussion of alternative theoretical approaches like LFG or HPSG. On the other hand, let's face facts. The basic material to be covered in an introductory textbook doesn't really vary much. One linguist may prefer a little more on binding theory, and a little less on control, etc. In this text, I've attempted to provide a relatively balanced presentation of most of the major issues and I've tried to do this in a student-friendly way. I've occasionally abstracted away from some of the thornier controversies, where I felt they weren't crucial to a student understanding the basics. This may, to a certain extent, make the professional syntactician feel that I've cut corners or laid out too rosy a picture. I did this on purpose, however, to give students a chance to absorb the fundamentals before challenging the issues. This is a textbook, not a scholarly tome, so its aim is to reach as many students as possible. The style is deliberately low key and friendly. This doesn't mean I don't want the students to challenge the material I've presented here. Throughout the book, you'll find gray "textboxes" that contain issues for further discussion, or interesting tidbits. Many of the problem sets also invite the student to challenge the black and white presentation I've given in the text. I encourage instructors to assign these, and students to do them, as they form an important part of the textbook. Instructors may note that if a favorite topic is not dealt with in the body of the text, a problem set may very well treat the question.

A quick word on the level of this textbook: This book is intended as an introduction to syntactic theory. It takes the student through most of the major issues in Principles and Parameters, from tree drawing to constraints on movement. While this book is written as an introduction, some students have reported it to be

challenging. I use this text in my upper division undergraduate introduction to syntax with success, but I can certainly see it being used in more advanced classes. I hope instructors will flesh out the book, and walk their students through some of the thornier issues.

This textbook has grown out of my lecture notes for my own classes. Needless to say, the form and shape of these notes have been influenced in terms of choice of material and presentation by the textbooks my own students have used. While the book you are reading is entirely my fault, it does owe a particular intellectual debt to the following three textbooks, which I have used in teaching at various times:

Cowper, Elizabeth (1992) *A Concise Introduction to Syntactic Theory: The Government and Binding Approach*. Chicago: Chicago University Press.

Haegeman, Liliane (1994) *Introduction to Government and Binding Theory* (2nd edition). Oxford: Blackwell.

Radford, Andrew (1988) *Transformational Grammar: A First Course*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

I'd like to thank the authors of these books for breaking ground in presenting a complicated and integrated theory to the beginner. Writing this book has given me new appreciation for the difficulty of this task and their presentation of the material has undoubtedly influenced mine.

Sadly, during the final stages of putting the first edition of this text together, my dissertation director, teacher, mentor, and academic hero, Ken Hale passed away after a long illness. Ken always pushed the idea that theoretical syntax is best informed by cross-linguistic research; while at the same time, the accurate documentation of languages requires a sophisticated understanding of grammatical theory. These were important lessons that I learned from Ken and I hope students will glean the significance of both by reading this text. While I was writing this book (and much other work) Ken gave me many comments and his unfettered support. He was a great man and I will miss him terribly.

This, the second edition of this book, is considerably different from the first edition. Here is a brief list of the major differences between the two editions. This list is not comprehensive, many more minor differences can be found.

- The exercise sections of the chapters are now organized differently and are greatly expanded. Exercises are presented in the order that the material appears in the chapter. I have attempted to categorize each exercise for level and type.
- There are two types of problem sets: General and Challenge. These two types roughly correspond to the exercises that I assign to my regular students and my honors students respectively. Challenge Problem Sets often challenge the straightforward presentation of the material in the main body of the text.
- The former chapter 2 on structure and parts of speech has been split into two chapters. The new chapter 2 contains new information on subcategorization that

some instructors requested to better inform students about the role of part of speech in phrase structure processes. Also Adjectives are now distinguished from Adverbs.

- The phrase structure rules in the new chapter 3 have been completely revised. In particular, I'm using non-X-bar versions of TP and CP here, and have added embedded clauses to all the relevant rules.
- The definitions of precedence, exhaustive domination and c-command have all been significantly revised in the chapter on structural relations. A limited version of government is given for those instructors who wish to teach it to their students.
- The chapters on X-bar theory have many more trees and examples.
- DPs are used consistently from chapter 7 forward.
- I have added categories to the theta grids in the chapter on the Lexicon in order to tie them to the subcategories introduced in chapter 2.
- A new section on stacked VPs and affix-hopping has been added to the chapter on head movement
- VP-internal subjects are used consistently from chapter 9 forward
- The treatment of passives in chapter 10 is completely different from the previous edition. I have moved towards a Baker, Johnson and Roberts style approach where the *-en* morphology is directly assigned the internal theta role and accusative case by the verb in the syntax rather than in the lexicon.
- The treatment of locality conditions in the chapter on *wh*-movement is entirely new. I've dropped subjacency in favor of an MLC based approach. The chapter now includes an inventory of the major island types; but theoretical coverage is only given to *wh*-islands. (Although the chapter also contains a brief discussion of the Head-Movement Constraint and Super-raising in the context of the MLC).
- Chapter 12 now contains a more accurate discussion of wh-in situ and develops the ideas of feature checking, covert movement, and SPELLOUT.
- There is a brand new chapter on split VPs in a brand new section on "advanced topics," including sections on object shift, ditransitives, a Lasnik style analysis of Pseudogapping and a Hornstein style analysis of ACD.
- The chapter on Raising and Control has been moved to the new part of the book on advanced topics, and uses a split VP (vP-AgrOP-VP) structure to avoid ternary branching.
- There is a new chapter on advanced topics in binding theory. This looks at issues on level of representation, chains and the copy theory of movement. It also takes a relativized view of binding domain consistent with Chomsky (1986).
- I've taken some of the more controversial "comparing theories" language out of the chapters on LFG and HPSG.

I hope that instructors and students will find these revisions helpful. I have attempted where possible to take into account all the many comments and suggestions I received from people using the first edition. Although of course in order to maintain consistency, I was unable to do them all.

Acknowledgements:
I'd like to thank the many people who taught me syntax through the years: Barb Brunson, Noam Chomsky, Elizabeth Cowper, Ken Hale, Alec Marantz, Diane Massam, Jim McCloskey, Shigeru Miyagawa, and David Pesetsky. A number of people have read through this book or the previous edition and have given me extensive and helpful comments: William Alexander Ash Asudeh, Andy Barss, Mark Baltin, Luis Barragan, Emily Bender, Abbas Benmamoun, Joan Bresnan, Dirk Bury, Roy Chan, Danny Chen, Deborah Chen Pichler, Barbara Citko, Peter Cole, Lorenzo Demery, Sheila Dooley, Yehuda Falk, Leslie Ford, Alexandra Galani, Jila Ghomeshi, Erin Good, Paul Hagstrom, Ken Hale, Heidi Harley, Josh Harrison, Rachel Hayes, Bernhard Heigl, One-Soon Her, Stephan Hurtubise, Alana Johns, Mark Johnson, Simin Karimi, Andreas Kathol, Péter Lazar, Anne Lobeck, Leila Lomashivili, Sarah Longstaff, Ahmad Reza Lotfi, Ricardo Mairal, Joan Maling, Jack Martin, Diane Massam, Nathan McWhorter, Dave Medeiros, Martha McGinnis, Mirjana Miskovic-Lukovic, Jon Nissenbaum, Peter Norquest, Kazutoshi Ohno, Heidi Orcutt, Hyeson Park, David Pesetsky, Colin Phillips, Carl Pollard, Janet Randall, Norvin Richards, Frank Richter, Betsy Ritter, Ed Rubin, Ivan Sag, Theresa Satterfield, Leslie Saxon, Leah Shocket, Dan Siddiqi, Nick Sobin, Peggy Speas, Tania Strahan, Joshua Strauss, Robert Van Valin, Lisa deMena Travis, Enwei Wang, Dainon Woudstra, Susi Wurmbrand, Kim Youngroung, and several anonymous Blackwell reviewers. I'm absolutely convinced I've left someone off this large list, if it's you many apologies, I really did appreciate the help you gave me. The students in my *Introduction to Syntax* classes in Michigan in 1997, and in Arizona in 1998-2006 have used all or parts of this textbook as their reading. Thanks to them for their patience and suggestions. A number of problem sets in this book were graciously contributed by Sheila Dooley, Jila Ghomeshi, Erin Good, Heidi Harley, Simin Karimi, Chris Kennedy, Amy LaCross, Betsy Ritter and Leslie Saxon. I also owe a great debt to all my colleagues here at the University of Arizona for their help and support. In particular, Diana Archangeli, Andy Barss, Tom Bever, Sandiway Fong, Mike Hammond, Heidi Harley, Eloise Jelinek, Simin Karimi, Diane Ohala, Adam Ussishkin, and Andy Wedel deserve special mention. Ada Brunstein, Sarah Coleman, Simon Eckley, Tami Kaplan, Becky Kennison, Anna Oxbury, Rhonda Pearce, Beth Remmes, and Steve Smith of Blackwell all deserve many thanks for encouraging me to write this and the previous edition up, and then smoothing its way towards production. My family (Jean, Bob, Morag, Fiona, Pangur and Calvin) were all incredible in their support and love.

Go raibh maith agaibh!
Tucson, Arizona

The clip art in chapters 1 and 6 is taken from the Microsoft Clip Art Gallery and is used with permission. This usage does not imply Microsoft's endorsement of this book