TITLE in APA Style (7th Edition)

Chungil (Chad) Chae[1], Author2[2], Author4[1], and Author3[2]
[1]College of Business and Public Management, Wenzhou-Kean University
[2]Some Department, Some University

Reviewer and Editor Comments

Reviewer's comment is

Decision and Task

Discussion

Conclusion

Revision Table

DRAFT

Chungil (Chad) Chae https://orcid.org/0000-0002-7364-1525
Author2 https://orcid.org/0000-0000-0000-0000
Author4 https://orcid.org/0000-0000-0000-0000
Author3 https://orcid.org/0000-0000-0000-0000

Author roles were classified using the Contributor Role Taxonomy (CRediT; https://credit.niso.org/) as follows: Chungil (Chad) Chae: conceptualization, writing; Author2: conceptualization, writing; Author4: conceptualization, writing; Author3: conceptualization, writing

Correspondence concerning this article should be addressed to Chungil (Chad) Chae, College of Business and Public Management, Wenzhou-Kean University, 88 Daxue Rd, Ouhai, Wenzhou, Zhejiang 325060, China, Email: chad-chae@gmail.com

ID	Comment From	Comment
1	editor	Improve logical flow, ensuring that the introduction narrows down the research focus
2	editor	Establish a compelling problem statement specifically for HRD. The core issue here is that there is a difference betw
3	editor	not being able to address PA in HRD practice, which might be because there is a lack of the literature on the use of
4	editor	You used the term, "PA research in HRD contexts"in the introduction and discussion section. However, this may no
5	editor	Present a strong rationale for how the topics to be identified will advance HRD research and theory building, consi
6	editor	Reorganize content to prevent redundancy and abrupt context switches
7	editor	Develop a standalone method section instead of the "Selection of the Literature"section. This will require you to dis
8	editor	Figure 1 is not difficult read; fix this issue.
9	editor	Detail the process of article selection, including inclusion/exclusion criteria and rounds of selection.
10	editor	Specify the steps taken in each round for article selection.
11	editor	You may move the "Structural and Compositional Characteristics of PA Research" section to the method section w
12	editor	In addition, consider condensing the description in this section. This will require you to omit RQ1. Otherwise, a st
13	editor	Create a standalone data analysis section within the method section
14	editor	Explain the language criteria for article selection
15	editor	Provide the number of articles related to each topic identified
16	editor	Include a measure of purity for the clustering model
17	editor	Explain how centrality and impact of clusters were measured and specify the centrality metrics used
18	editor	Clarify the reasons for selecting topic modeling analysis alongside bibliocoupling and hierarchical clustering
19	editor	Explain whether these analyses are complementary or convergent
20	editor	Include recent articles relevant to HRD, such as Ratnam & Devi (2023)
21	editor	For readers who may not be familiar with technical terms, please kindly explain what some numbers mean (e.g., K=
22	editor	Map the identified clusters/themes to portray the landscape for PA in HRD. You have 20 topics that are grouped in
23	editor	Highlight clusters/themes relevant to HRD research AND practice.
24	editor	Compare findings with other studies (e.g., Yoon & Chae, 2022) to identify convergences or divergences.
25	editor	This study may give some guidance for HRD and PA research relevant to HRD. However, it is difficult to envision
26	editor	Create the limitations section and address limitations along with its delimitation and methodological limitations
27	editor	Split the "Implications for Future Research and Practice"section into "Implications for HRD Research,""Implications
28	editor	You proposed what PA should focus on. Please make it clear that your proposal is based on the findings and suffici
29	editor	Why do you need the definitions along with the new one to achieve the purpose of this study? How is it relevant to
30	editor	Address APA format issues as Reviewer 1 raised. In addition, italicize the journal titles.
31	editor	Clearly articulate the significance of your work and how it advances the field of HRD (see Reviewer 2's comments
32	reviewer1	I believe that there is a need for this research topic to explore the boundaries and scope of PA research in HRD. Ho
33	reviewer1	Additionally, the fourth paragraph (Line 29–50, Page 2) in the introduction section repeats the concerns and challe
34	reviewer1	Furthermore, on Page 2, Lines 3–6, it is stated, "Despite these concerns, the PA scholar community has established
35	reviewer1	In the last paragraph of the introduction section, there is a limited discussion of the methods employed. I recomme
36	reviewer1	In Line 34–35, Page 5, it is stated, "After the third round, a total of 173 articles were retrieved." However, the auth

Copyright @ Chad (Chungil) Chae, since 2025

DRAFT