# Advanced Topics in Control 2020: Large-Scale Convex Optimization

### Solution to Exercise 2

Goran Banjac, Mathias Hudoba de Badyn, Andrea Iannelli, Angeliki Kamoutsi, Ilnura Usmanova

March 20, 2020

### 1 Convex Functions

(a) We will show that the Hessian of  $f_1$  is positive semidefinite at all  $x \in \mathbb{R}^n$ . Let  $\beta(x) = e^{x_1} + \ldots + e^{x_n}$ . Then a straightforward calculation yields

$$z^{\top} \nabla^2 f_1(x) z = \frac{1}{\beta(x)^2} \sum_{i=1}^n \sum_{j=1}^n e^{x_i + x_j} (z_i - z_j)^2 \ge 0, \ \forall z \in \mathbb{R}^n.$$

Hence by Proposition on Slide 12 of Lecture 3,  $f_1$  is convex.

(b) The function  $f_2(x) = ||x||^p$  can be viewed as a composition h(g(x)) of the scalar function

$$h(t) = \begin{cases} t^p, & \text{if } t \ge 0\\ 0, & \text{otherwise,} \end{cases}$$

with  $p \ge 1$ , and the function g(x) = ||x||. In this case h is convex and monotically increasing, while g is convex over  $\mathbb{R}^n$  (since any vector norm is convex, by the triangle inequality and positive homogeneity). Using the composition rules on Slide 17, it follows that  $f_2$  is convex over  $\mathbb{R}^n$ .

(c) The function  $f_3(x)$  can be viewed as a composition h(g(x)) of the function

$$h(t) = \begin{cases} \frac{1}{t}, & \text{if } t > 0\\ +\infty, & \text{otherwise,} \end{cases}$$

and the function g(x) = f(x), for  $x \in \mathbb{R}^n$ . In this case, h is convex and monotonically decreasing over  $\mathbb{R}$ , while g is concave over  $\mathbb{R}^n$ . Therefore, by the composition rules of Slide 17, it follows that  $f_3$  is convex over  $\mathbb{R}^n$ .

- (d) As we have already shown in 1b), the map  $x \to ||x||_2^2$  is convex. Threfore,  $x \to ||Ax b||_2^2$  is convex as it is a composition with the affine mapping  $x \to Ax b$ . Moreover,  $x \to ||x||_1$  is convex since it is a norm, Finally, sum of convex functions is convex.
- (e) For each i = 1, ..., n, the map  $x \to 1+x_i$  is convex (since it is affine), thus  $x \to \max(0, 1+x_i)$  is convex as max of convex functions. The sum over i is convex, as (finite) sum of convex functions. The second term  $x \to ||x||_2^2$  is convex by 1b). Finally, the sum  $f_5$  is convex.

1

- (f) For a fixed  $y \in \mathbb{R}^n$ , we consider the affine map  $f_y(x) := x^\top y g(y)$ . Then we have  $f_6(x) = \sup_{y \in \mathbb{R}^n} f_y(x)$  which is convex as the supremum of (uncountably many) convex functions.
- (g) Note that

$$d_C^2(x) = \min_{y \in C} \|x - y\|_2^2 = \|x\|_2^2 - \max_{y \in C} \{2x^\top y - \|y\|_2^2\},\$$

where we used that  $||x-y||_2^2 = (x-y)^\top (x-y)$  and  $\min_{y \in C} \{-2y^\top x + ||y||_2^2\} = -\max_{y \in C} \{2x^\top y - ||y||_2^2\}$ . Hence,

$$\phi_C(x) = \max_{y \in C} \left[ y^\top x - \frac{1}{2} ||y||_2^2 \right].$$

Therefore, since  $\phi_C$  is a maximization of affine - and hence convex - functions, it is necessarily convex.

(h) Note that since  $h_1$  and  $h_2$  have a common affine minorant, we ensure that  $g(x) > -\infty$ , for all  $x \in \mathbb{R}^n$ . Indeed, for arbitrary  $x \in \mathbb{R}^n$  and  $x_1, x_2$  such that  $x_1 + x_2 = x$ , we have by assumption that  $h_1(x_1) + h_2(x_2) \ge s^{\top}x - 2r > -\infty$ . So,  $g(x) = \inf\{h_1(x_1) + h_2(x_2) : x_1 + x_2 = x\} \ge s^{\top}x - 2r > -\infty$ .

Moreover, g is proper. Indeed, choose specific  $x_1 \in \text{dom } h_1$  and  $x_2 \in \text{dom } h_2$ . Then  $h_1(x_1) + h_2(x_2) < \infty$ . Thus  $x := x_1 + x_2 \in \text{dom } g$ .

Next, define  $f: \mathbb{R}^n \times \mathbb{R}^n \to (-\infty, \infty]$  by  $f(x, y) := h_1(x) + h_2(x - y)$ . The convexity of  $h_1$  and  $h_2$  implies that f is convex. Indeed, for all  $\theta \in [0, 1]$  and for all  $(x_1, y_1), (x_2, y_2) \in \mathbb{R}^n \times \mathbb{R}^n$ , we have

$$f(\theta(x_1, y_1) + (1 - \theta)(x_2, y_2)) = h_1(\theta x_1 + (1 - \theta)x_2) + h_2(\theta(x_1 - y_1) + (1 - \theta)(x_2 - y_2))$$

$$\leq \theta h_1(x_1) + (1 - \theta h_1(x_2)) + \theta h_2(x_1 - y_1) + (1 - \theta)h_2(x_2 - y_2)$$

$$= \theta f(x_1, y_1) + (1 - \theta)f(x_2, y_2),$$

where in the first and third line we used the definition of f, while in the second line we used the convexity of  $h_1$  and  $h_2$ .

All in all, we have that f(x,y) is jointly convex in (x,y) and the partial minimization over the second variable  $g(x) = \min_{y \in \mathbb{R}^n} f(x,y) > -\infty$ , for all  $x \in \mathbb{R}^n$ . Hence, by the partial minimization rule on Slide 16, we conclude that g is convex.

# 2 Strictly Convex Functions and Unique Minimizers

(a) Assume for the sake of contradiction that there exists  $x \neq x^*$  that satisfies  $f(x) = f(x^*)$ . Then, since f is strictly convex we get

$$f(\frac{1}{2}x + \frac{1}{2}x^*) < \frac{1}{2}(f(x) + f(x^*)) = f(x^*),$$

which is a contradiction. Hence, at most one minimizer exists.

(b) The function  $f(x) = \frac{1}{x}$  with domain  $\{x : x > 0\}$  is strictly convex with infimum 0. But no x exists that attains the infimum.

### 3 Subdifferentials

(a) Assume first that  $s = (s_1, \ldots, s_n) \in \partial g(x)$ . Then

$$\sum_{i=1}^{n} g_i(y_i) = g(y) \ge g(x) + s^{\top}(y - x) = \sum_{i=1}^{n} (g_i(x_i) + s_i(x_i - y_i)), \tag{1}$$

for all  $y = (y_1, \dots, y_n) \in \mathbb{R}^n$ .

For fixed j = 1, ..., n, set  $y_i = x_i$ , for all  $i \neq j$  and let the j-th component  $y_j$  be a free scalar. Then, (1) gives

$$g_j(y_j) \ge g_j(x_j) + s_j(y_j - x_j),$$

for all  $y_j \in \mathbb{R}$ . Equivalently,  $s_j \in \partial g_j(x_j)$ . Since this holds for arbitrary  $j = 1, \ldots, n$  the proof of one direction is complete.

For the other direction let  $s = (s_1, \ldots, s_n)$  and suppose that  $s_i \in \partial g_i(x_i)$ , for each  $i = 1, \ldots, n$ . Then,

$$g_i(y_i) \ge g_i(x_i) + s_i(y_i - x_i),$$

for all  $y_i \in \mathbb{R}$ . Summing over i

$$g(y) \ge g(x) + \sum_{i=1}^{n} s_i(y_i - x_i) = g(x) + s^{\top}(y - x),$$

for all  $y = (y_1, \dots, y_n) \in \mathbb{R}^n$  and thus  $s = (s_1, \dots, s_n) \in \partial g(x)$ .

(b) A vector  $s \in \partial \mathcal{I}_C(x)$  if and only if

$$\mathcal{I}_C(y) \ge \mathcal{I}_C(x) + s^{\top}(y - x), \tag{2}$$

for all  $y \in \mathbb{R}^n$ . Assume first that  $x \in C$ , then (2) is equivalent to  $\mathcal{I}_C(y) \geq s^{\top}(y-x)$ , for all y. This is equivalent to  $s^{\top}(y-x) \leq 0$ , for all  $y \in C$ . Equivalently  $s \in N_C(x)$ . Thus,  $\partial \mathcal{I}_C(x) = N_C(x)$ , for  $x \in C$ .

Assume next that  $x \notin C$ . For  $y \in C$ , relation (2) gives  $0 \ge \infty + s^{\top}(y - x)$ . No such s exists and  $\partial \mathcal{I}_C(x) = \emptyset$ .

## 4 Conjugate Functions

- (a) Let  $f(x) = ||x||_2$ . We then have that  $f^*(s) = \sup_{x \in \mathbb{R}^n} (s^\top x ||x||_2)$ . We will compute the conjugate  $f^*$  via the following steps.
  - (1) We have that  $f^*(s) \ge 0$ , for all s. Indeed by selecting x = 0, we get  $f^*(s) \ge s^\top 0 \|0\|_2 = 0$ .
  - (2) Next, we show that  $f^*(s) \leq 0$ , for all s with  $||s||_2 \leq 1$ . Indeed, by the Cauchy-Schwarz inequality, we have

$$f^*(s) = \sup_{x} (s^{\top} x - \|x\|_2) \le \sup_{x} (\|s\|_2 \|x\|_2 - \|x\|_2) = \sup_{x} ((\|s\|_2 - 1) \|x\|_2).$$

Hence, if  $||s||_2 \le 1$ , then  $f^*(s) \le 0$ .

- (3) Moreover, we show that  $f^*(s) = \infty$ , for all s with  $||s||_2 > 1$ . Set x = ts with  $t \ge 0$  to get  $f^*(s) = \sup(s^\top x ||x||) \ge t||s||_2(||s||_2 1)$ . Whenever,  $||s||_2 > 1$ , we let  $t \to \infty$  to conclude that  $f^*(s) = \infty$ .
- (4) Finally, we combine the above results to derive

$$f^*(s) = \begin{cases} 0, & \text{if } ||s||_2 \le 1\\ +\infty, & \text{otherwise,} \end{cases}$$

(b) We use the formula  $\partial f(x) = \arg\max_s(s^\top x - f^*(s)) = \arg\max_{\|s\|_2 \le 1}(s^\top x)$ . For x = 0 the objective is 0 and all feasible points are maximizers. Thus,  $\partial f(0) = \{s : \|s\|_2 \le 1\}$ . For  $x \ne 0$ , the maximum is attained when s and x are aligned, i.e., when  $s = \frac{x}{\|x\|_2}$ . Therefore,

$$\partial f(x) = \begin{cases} B_{\|\cdot\|_2}(0,1), & \text{if } x = 0\\ \{\frac{x}{\|x\|_2}\}, & \text{otherwise.} \end{cases}$$