

Author:

Reviewer:

Peer Review Guide: Academic Research Report

Title & Overall	Guideline	Response	Commentary
	How clearly does the title indicate both the topic and the aspect of that topic being discussed?	0 1 2 3 4	
	Would the title benefit from a “medial colon”?		
	Look at the length of the report. Does it “feel” short, long, or just right? (Comment on which \$s need more/less, where, and why.)	short / long / right	

Introduction	Guideline	Response	Commentary
	How well do you understand what other researchers think about the topic at issue in this study?	0 1 2 3 4	
	In what way(s) does the author’s work fit in with existing research?	extends • challenges • answers • confirms	
	How clearly does the author express the goals of the paper and the conclusions expected by the end?	0 1 2 3 4	

Methods	Guideline	Rating	Commentary
	How appropriate is the data-collection method for the question(s) being asked? Would that method provide the right kind of data for what the author wanted to know?	0 1 2 3 4	
	How thoroughly does author explain how research was conducted? (Could you replicate the study?)	0 1 2 3 4	
	Can you tell how and why participants were selected?	0 1 2 3 4	

Results	Guideline	Rating	Commentary
	How effectively are results directly reported/quoted?	0 1 2 3 4	
	How clear and easy to understand are the results?	0 1 2 3 4	
	How well does the author explain the role of this data in the larger research, project, or investigation?	0 1 2 3 4	
	How well does the author help you make sense of the data, emphasizing importance and explaining detail?	0 1 2 3 4	

Discussion	Guideline	Rating/Response	Commentary
	How appropriate and effective is the discussion of limitations or issues encountered in the study?	0 1 2 3 4	
	How well do you understand the potential benefits of these research findings? Is the new knowledge useful, valuable, or controversial?	0 1 2 3 4	
	How well is the importance of the study’s findings discussed and elaborated?	0 1 2 3 4	
	What changes, actions, or further research does the author suggest?	fix • adjust • start • stop • change • find out...	
	One-word reaction to argument: convinced? surprised? confused? thoughtful? [other]?		
	How well does the concluding thought of the paper address (not necessarily <i>answer</i>) the initial research question and the purpose stated in the intro?	0 1 2 3 4	

Overall	Guideline	Commentary
	What impressed you most about this report?	
	What needs the author’s attention most urgently?	