Author: Reviewer:

Peer Review Guide: Secondary Research Report (SRR)

Show-Stoppers

Guideline	Rating	Commentary
How many sources are in the list? What does that number suggest about the author's goals?		
Look at the length of the framing synthesis. Does it "feel" short, long, or just right?	short / long / right	
How professional or serious does the text appear? How could the visual elements be improved? (Check the annotations and the list of sources. Do they look neat, organized, and consistent?)	0 1 2 3 4	
How easily can you tell what the author's research question is based on the discussion?	0 1 2 3 4	

Framing Synthesis

Guideline	Rating	Commentary
How clearly is the topic introduced? Do you understand what's at issue as quickly as you expect?	0 1 2 3 4	
Who is the intended audience of this document? How can you tell, or why are you unsure?		
How well can you identify the criteria used to choose and organize the sources?	0 1 2 3 4	
Do you know what the author hopes to do with the bibliography? (In other words, how clear is the author's purpose?)	0 1 2 3 4	
Depth & Progress: How well does this text illustrate college-level thinking about the issue (rather than just repeating others' words)?	0 1 2 3 4	
Synthesis: How well are the sources integrated into one discussion?	0 1 2 3 4	
Relevance & Connection: How thoroughly do the sources address the author's research question?	0 1 2 3 4	
What would make the framing synthesis better?		

Annotations

Guideline	Rating	Commentary
Citation Style: How well do the entries match the specific requirements of formatting? What elements should the author attend to?	0 1 2 3 4	
Summary: How clearly do the annotations summarize each source? Do you feel like you know what the sources said?	0 1 2 3 4	
Evaluation: How thoroughly does the author evaluate the sources, questioning the reasoning or approaches?	0 1 2 3 4	
Relevance: Can you easily tell how each annotation relates to the author's research question?	0 1 2 3 4	
How balanced are the types of sources used? Are there enough peer-reviewed, academic sources? What types of voices should be added to this collection? (How urgent is that need?)	0 1 2 3 4	

Overall

Guideline	Commentary
What impressed you most about this SRR?	
What needs the author's attention most urgently?	