MIS590: Ethical Debate Activity Handout

Instructor: Pei-Chi Lo

December 15, 2024

Overview

In this activity, you will participate in a debate exploring the ethical and societal implications of AI adoption. You will take on the role of either an **AI Supporter** or a member of the **AI-Hesitant Crowd** to argue your position. By focusing on specific scenarios, you'll develop persuasive arguments and engage with real-world challenges related to AI ethics. The objective of this activity is to equip you with:

1. A deeper understanding of the trade-offs between AI advancement and ethical concerns.

2. The ability to critically analyze multiple perspectives on AI adoption.

3. Practice in building and presenting compelling arguments.

Steps for the Debate

I. **Introduction and Context (5-7 minutes)**

- The instructor will provide an overview of the debate topic: **AI Supporters vs. AI-Hesitant Crowds**.
- You'll be assigned to one of two groups:
    - **AI Supporters**: Advocates for the benefits of AI advancement.
    - **AI-Hesitant Crowds**: Those with concerns about privacy, copyright, and societal risks.

II. **Group Preparation (5-10 minutes)**

- Work with your group to:
    (a) Choose 1-2 scenarios to focus on. Examples include:
        - **Generative AI and copyright**: Training AI on copyrighted works.
        - **AI surveillance and privacy**: Facial recognition in public spaces.
        - **Bias and fairness in AI**: Issues in hiring algorithms or recommendations.
        - **Job displacement and economic impact**: Automation replacing jobs.
    (b) Develop 2-3 strong arguments for your position.
    (c) Decide who will speak during the debate.

III. **Debate (20-25 minutes)**

(a) **Opening Statements (5 minutes)**:
    - Each group presents their position (2-3 minutes per group).

(b) **Rebuttal (5-7 minutes)**:
    - Each group responds to the other's key points.

(c) **Open Discussion (10-13 minutes)**:
- Engage in a moderated back-and-forth, asking questions and defending your points.

IV. **Debrief and Reflection (10 minutes)**
- After stepping out of your roles, reflect on:
  (a) What arguments were most compelling?
  (b) How can AI balance innovation with ethical concerns?
  (c) What do you think the long-term impact of AI on society will be?

Your Role and Focus Areas

Group 1: AI Supporters

Your Position: AI is a force for good, driving innovation, solving problems, and improving lives. Restrictions on its development slow progress.

What to Focus On:
- How does AI benefit society and drive innovation?
- Why are privacy and copyright concerns secondary to the greater good?
- How can responsible AI practices address these concerns?

Challenges You'll Face:
- How do you explain the risks AI poses without dismissing them?
- Should AI companies compensate creators or protect user privacy? Why or why not?

Group 2: AI-Hesitant Crowds

Your Position: AI's risks, including privacy violations, copyright infringement, and societal bias, outweigh its benefits.

What to Focus On:
- How do AI systems exploit user data or creative works?
- What are the societal harms (e.g., bias, job loss) caused by rapid AI adoption?
- Why is stricter regulation necessary to protect people and society?

Challenges You'll Face:
- How can ethical concerns be addressed without stifling innovation?
- What compromises could make AI adoption safer and more equitable?

Reflection Questions

1. Which arguments made by the opposing group were most convincing? Why?

2. How can AI systems address privacy, copyright, and fairness concerns more effectively?

3. What role will you play in ensuring AI development is ethical and responsible in the future?

Tips for Success

- Be respectful: Focus on the arguments, not the people.

- Use examples: Reference real-world scenarios to strengthen your case.

- Stay on topic: Focus on your chosen scenarios and their implications.

- Think critically: Consider the trade-offs and offer creative solutions.