

## Analysis of Buffer Management Policies for Opportunistic Networks

Salem Sati, Christopher Probst, Kalman Graffi

Department of Computer Science, University of Düsseldorf, Germany

04.08.2016



- 1 Introduction
- 2 Routing in Opportunistic Networks
- 3 Simulation Setup
- 4 Scenarios
- **5** Evaluation
- 6 Conclusion



- 1 Introduction
- 2 Routing in Opportunistic Networks
- 3 Simulation Setup
- 4 Scenarios
- **5** Evaluation
- 6 Conclusion

#### Motivation

- Mobile Web not always available
  - Outside of cities
  - Third World countries
  - Even in cities (congestion, buildings, ...)
- Mobile Web is centralized
  - Missing privacy (surveillance)
  - Limited traffic (depends on country)
  - Expensive infrastructure

#### Possible Solution

- · Mobile devices communicate with each other
  - WiFi, Bluetooth, IR, NFC, etc.
  - Range and bandwidth determined by interface type
  - Independent of Mobile Web
- Message delivery
  - Opportunistic routing
  - Indeterministic, churn, overhead
  - Anonymous

### Challenges

#### Routing Protocol

- Network topology constantly changing
- Origin and destination might be isolated
- Node selection for routing
- Different routing strategies
  - Epidemic (used for evaluation)
  - PRoPHET
  - etc.

#### Buffer Management

- Queue policy: Buffers messages in send queue
- Drop policy: Drops messages, if queue exhausted
- Effect on routing performance?



- Introduction
- 2 Routing in Opportunistic Networks
- 3 Simulation Setup
- 4 Scenarios
- **5** Evaluation
- 6 Conclusion

## HEINRICH HEINE UNIVERSITÄT DÜSSELDORF

- Epidemic
  - Basically flooding
  - High delivery probability + overhead
  - Exchange summary vectors with nearby nodes
  - Transmit missing messages and buffer
    - Based on queue policy
    - Drop messages if congested
      - Based on drop policy
  - Routing performance inherently based on Buffer Management
    - Good fit for first study

## Other Routing Protocols

- PRoPHET
  - Probability-based
  - Overrides queue policy
    - Fallback if probabilities are equal
- First Contact
  - Node-to-node routing
- Direct Delivery
  - Only deliver to destination directly
- etc.

Conclusion

- {Queue, Drop} Policy == Sorting order
- Popular policies
  - FIFO Arrival-time (ascending)
  - LIFO Arrival-time (descending)
- Further policies
  - Random
  - Replications (ascending / descending)
  - Relayed-nodes (ascending / descending)
  - Time-to-live (ascending / descending)
  - Message-size (ascending / descending)
- 11 sorting orders per policy
  - 121 different combinations



- Introduction
- 2 Routing in Opportunistic Networks
- 3 Simulation Setup
- 4 Scenarios
- 5 Evaluation
- 6 Conclusion

Scenarios

- Opportunistic Network Environment (ONE) simulator
- Supports only two queue policies
  - Random, FIFO
- Supports only one drop policy
  - FIFO
- Inherently single-threaded
- Contribution
  - Implementations for all policies
  - Parallelized by running multiple instances

Routing in Opportunistic Networks Simulation Setup Scenarios Evaluation Conclusio

### Methodology



- Multiple scenarios and metrics
  - Each scenario extends base scenario
  - 121 runs per simulated scenario
- Four scenarios
  - Simulated
    - Medium Traffic
    - Frequent and Medium Traffic
    - Frequent, Medium and Demanding Traffic
  - Computed
    - · Composite scenario evaluation
- Four metrics
  - Measured
    - Delivery Ratio
    - Overhead Factor
    - Average Delay
  - Computed
    - Composite



- 1 Introduction
- 2 Routing in Opportunistic Networks
- 3 Simulation Setup
- 4 Scenarios
- 5 Evaluation
- 6 Conclusion

#### Base Scenario

| Parameter                          | Value                               |
|------------------------------------|-------------------------------------|
| Simulation time                    | 12 hours                            |
| Total Number of Nodes              | 126                                 |
| Total Number of Node Groups        | 6                                   |
| Routing Protocol                   | Epidemic                            |
| Buffer Management Policies         | 11 * 11 = 121                       |
| 2x Pedestrian Group [Count; Speed] | 40; 0.5-1.5 m/s                     |
| 1x Car Group [Count; Speed]        | 40; 2.7-13.9 m/s                    |
| 3x Tram Group [Count; Speed]       | 2; 7-10 m/s                         |
| Movement Model 1 (M1)              | Shortest Path Map based<br>Movement |
| Movement Model 2 (M2)              | Map Route Movement                  |
| Movement Model Groups [M1; M2]     | 3; 3                                |
| Movement Model Buffers [M1; M2]    | 5 MB; 50 MB                         |
| Interface types                    | Low-Speed, High-Speed               |
| Low-Speed [Range; Bandwidth]       | 10 m; 250 KB/s                      |
| High-Speed [Range; Bandwidth]      | 1 km; 10 MB/s                       |
| Groups using Low-Speed             | All                                 |
| Groups using High-Speed            | 1x Tram Group                       |

#### Scenarios



| Parameter                            | Value             |
|--------------------------------------|-------------------|
| Message Generators                   | 1                 |
| Message Generator 1 [Interval; Size] | 25-35 s; 0.5-1 MB |

Tabelle: Scenario 1

| Parameter                            | Value              |
|--------------------------------------|--------------------|
| Message Generators                   | 2                  |
| Message Generator 1 [Interval; Size] | 1-5 s; 0.5-2 KB    |
| Message Generator 2 [Interval; Size] | 25-35 s; 64-512 KB |

Tabelle: Scenario 2

| Parameter                            | Value              |
|--------------------------------------|--------------------|
| Message Generators                   | 3                  |
| Message Generator 1 [Interval; Size] | 1-5 s; 0.5-2 KB    |
| Message Generator 2 [Interval; Size] | 25-35 s; 64-512 KB |
| Message Generator 3 [Interval; Size] | 60-120 s; 1-5 MB   |

Tabelle: Scenario 3



- Introduction
- 2 Routing in Opportunistic Networks
- 3 Simulation Setup
- 4 Scenarios
- 5 Evaluation
- 6 Conclusion

Simulation Setup

Evaluation

## Scenario 1 - Delivery Ratio

|              |            |  |   |  |              |               |              | D.E          |              |              |               |              |              |  |  |
|--------------|------------|--|---|--|--------------|---------------|--------------|--------------|--------------|--------------|---------------|--------------|--------------|--|--|
|              |            |  | X   |  |              | 15            |              | rop Poli     | cy           |              | 10.           |              |              |  |  |
|              |            |  | Α   |  | <i>P</i>     | scendin       | g            |              |              | υ            | escendir      | ıg           |              |  |  |
|              |            |  | Random                                      | Arrival-time   | Replications | Relayed-nodes | Time-to-live | Message-size | Arrival-time | Replications | Relayed-nodes | Time-to-live | Message-size |  |  |
|              |            | Metric   | Delivery Ratio (percentage, more is better) |  |              |               |              |              |              |              |               |              |              |  |  |
|              | ×          | Random   | 21.9  | 25.2   | 15.1         | 8.8           | 39.4         | 11.4         | 16.2         | 23.9         | 38.3          |              |              |  |  |
|              | 20         | Arrival-time   | 18.6  | Delivery Ratio (percentage, more is better)     25.2   15.1   8.8   39.4   11.4   16.2   23.9   38.3   11.2   10.1 |              |               |              |              | 10.3         |              |               |              |              |  |  |
|              | Ascending  | Replications   | 25.0  | 24.7   | 15.3         | 8.8           | 39.9         | 11.3         | 15.9         | 23.3         | 39.7          | 9.4          | 10.5         |  |  |
| >            | enc        | Relayed-nodes  | 30.4  | 36.8   | 22.7         | 10.2          | 40.9         | 10.6         | 17.5         | 26.7         | 39.1          | 11.1         | 10.3         |  |  |
| olj:         | 8          | Time-to-live   | 18.3  | 19.1   | 12.4         | 9.0           | 38.2         | 9.5          | 16.1         | 23.8         | 35.5          | 10.3         | 10.9         |  |  |
| e P          |            | Message-size   | 17.0  | 18.9   | 11.6         | 7.3           | 33.0         | 12.0         | 14.6         | 23.0         | 38.7          | 8.8          | 9.7          |  |  |
| Queue Policy | as         | Arrived time 22.2 24.1 15.6 9.5 29.1 11.9 15.0 24.5 40.6 0.4 |   |  |              |               |              |              |              |              |               | 10.3         |              |  |  |
| Õ            | الها       | Replications 18.1 20.4 14.7 8.5 35.5 10.2 15.5 21.6 36.2 9.  |   |  |              |               |              |              |              |              | 9.8           | 10.3         |              |  |  |
|              | Descending | Relayed-nodes  | 15.9  | 17.5   | 11.8         | 8.6           | 32.1         | 9.6          | 14.2         | 23.0         | 37.4          | 9.8          | 10.7         |  |  |
|              | š          | Time-to-live   | 30.4  | 34.0   | 18.9         | 9.1           | 38.0         | 11.4         | 16.1         | 25.5         | 40.1          | 9.8          | 10.1         |  |  |
|              |            | Message-size   | 17.8  | 20.2   | 14.2         | 9.0           | 31.6         | 10.3         | 17.9         | 25.6         | 36.1          | 9.9          | 11.8         |  |  |

#### Scenario 1 - Overhead Factor

|  |            |               |        |              |              |               | D            | rop Poli     | cy           |              |               |              |              |
|--|------------|---------------|--------|--------------|--------------|---------------|--------------|--------------|--------------|--------------|---------------|--------------|--------------|
|  |            |               | X      |              | Α            | Ascendin      | g            |              |              | D            | escendii      | ng           |              |
|  |            |               | Random | Arrival-time | Replications | Relayed-nodes | Time-to-live | Message-size | Arrival-time | Replications | Relayed-nodes | Time-to-live | Message-size |
| Metric Overhead Factor (transmissions per message, less is better) |            |               |        |              |              |               |              |              |              |              |               |              |              |
|  | ×          | Random        | 115.6  | 84.0         | 145.1        | 233.3         | 290.9        | 127.9        | 147.9        | 167.1        | 242.2         | 129.6        | 148.2        |
|  | 20         | Arrival-time  | 116.6  | 81.2         | 144.8        | 203.0         | 227.1        | 134.1        | 139.8        | 112.9        | 161.6         | 125.8        | 147.7        |
|  | l iji      | Replications  | 117.9  | 89.3         | 153.6        | 245.1         | 329.5        | 173.4        | 188.2        | 148.3        | 258.5         | 136.4        | 140.5        |
| 3  | enc        | Relayed-nodes | 92.0   | 53.5         | 123.9        | 191.6         | 227.7        | 193.0        | 137.7        | 216.8        | 273.9         | 112.7        | 139.4        |
| Policy   | Ascending  | Time-to-live  | 102.2  | 91.2         | 166.2        | 178.1         | 212.1        | 100.0        | 126.1        | 88.5         | 157.9         | 113.7        | 138.0        |
| e P  |            | Message-size  | 167.4  | 134.4        | 239.7        | 320.3         | 410.6        | 501.3        | 190.6        | 152.8        | 293.2         | 161.4        | 153.0        |
| Queue  | 20         | Arrival-time  | 136.3  | 93.7         | 159.2        | 252.1         | 346.4        | 104.9        | 156.4        | 178.4        | 288.6         | 139.6        | 143.9        |
| Õ  | ايّاا      | Replications  | 124.0  | 95.7         | 140.3        | 217.5         | 258.4        | 105.3        | 131.1        | 156.3        | 149.0         | 131.0        | 146.0        |
|  | en         | Relayed-nodes | 122.5  | 110.2        | 183.3        | 199.4         | 295.0        | 97.8         | 154.0        | 92.6         | 172.0         | 122.6        | 144.6        |
|  | Descending | Time-to-live  | 104.8  | 62.7         | 145.0        | 201.8         | 350.2        | 178.0        | 201.0        | 284.6        | 313.4         | 133.7        | 143.9        |
|  |            | Message-size  | 73.4   | 59.8         | 105.2        | 137.2         | 246.3        | 91.6         | 86.1         | 72.3         | 137.2         | 97.9         | 248.6        |
|  |            |               |        |              |              |               |              |              |              |              |               |              |              |

Simulation Setup

## Scenario 1 - Average Delay

|   |          |  |      |      |       |         | D    | rop Poli | cy           |              |          |       |      |
|---|----------|--|------|------|-------|---------|------|----------|--------------|--------------|----------|-------|------|
|   |          |  | X    |      | Α     | scendin | g    |          |              | D            | escendir | ıg    |      |
|   |          | Random Arrival-time Replications Relayed-nodes Time-to-live Message-size Arrival-time Replications Relayed-nodes |      |      |       |         |      |          | Time-to-live | Message-size |          |       |      |
| Metric Average Delay (minutes, less is better)  |          |  |      |      |       |         |      |          |              |              |          |       |      |
|   | X        | Random   | 83.5 | 78.4 | 98.3  | 78.0    | 58.4 | 83.7     | 101.9        | 79.5         | 110.1    | 97.2  | 75.2 |
|   | 20       | Arrival-time   | 97.2 | 92.2 | 96.6  | 78.1    | 67.9 | 96.8     | 101.2        | 95.8         | 125.4    | 101.0 | 75.7 |
|   | scending | Replications   | 68.2 | 65.4 | 97.8  | 67.6    | 47.6 | 76.6     | 94.1         | 60.9         | 101.0    | 81.0  | 62.2 |
| 5   | e [      | Relayed-nodes  | 72.9 | 59.4 | 106.8 | 71.2    | 52.7 | 75.8     | 94.0         | 69.4         | 114.1    | 93.2  | 62.0 |
| Policy  | Asc      | Time-to-live   | 97.6 | 93.0 | 96.6  | 85.5    | 84.6 | 92.7     | 114.1        | 100.4        | 124.4    | 101.9 | 76.4 |
| e P   | [        | Message-size   | 78.1 | 72.2 | 91.3  | 71.5    | 56.0 | 75.1     | 103.6        | 78.2         | 110.3    | 79.2  | 68.8 |
| Queue   | 20       | Arrival-time   | 71.2 | 55.8 | 98.3  | 74.2    | 45.3 | 74.8     | 98.6         | 64.1         | 98.0     | 78.7  | 61.8 |
| Helpications 97.4 81.8 102.6 82.8 66.1 86.5 107.3 92.8 120.9 96.8 Relayed-nodes 83.3 86.4 101.1 83.7 67.7 92.4 103.9 95.7 117.9 85.4 Time-to-live 51.6 48.0 90.8 61.4 40.4 72.2 90.5 60.8 96.9 71.7 |          |  |      |      |       |         |      |          |              | 75.8         |          |       |      |
|   | e l      | Relayed-nodes  | 83.3 | 86.4 | 101.1 | 83.7    | 67.7 | 92.4     | 103.9        | 95.7         | 117.9    | 85.4  | 76.0 |
|   | esc      | Time-to-live   | 51.6 | 48.0 | 90.8  | 61.4    | 40.4 | 72.2     | 90.5         | 60.8         | 96.9     | 71.7  | 61.8 |
|   |          | Message-size   | 86.4 | 73.8 | 104.5 | 77.2    | 61.8 | 84.2     | 111.6        | 87.4         | 113.7    | 92.1  | 74.6 |

## Scenario 1 - Composite

|         |   |  |        | Drop Boliau  |              |               |              |              |              |              |               |              |              |  |
|---------|---|--|--------|--------------|--------------|---------------|--------------|--------------|--------------|--------------|---------------|--------------|--------------|--|
|         |   |  |        |              |              |               | D            | rop Poli     | сy           |              |               |              |              |  |
|         |   |  | X      |              | A            | Ascendin      | g            |              |              | D            | escendir      | ıg           |              |  |
|         |   |  | Random | Arrival-time | Replications | Relayed-nodes | Time-to-live | Message-size | Arrival-time | Replications | Relayed-nodes | Time-to-live | Message-size |  |
|         |   | Metric   |        |              |              | Compo         | site (per    | centage      | more is      | better)      |               |              |              |  |
|         | ×   | Random   | 59.7   | 67.3         | 44.9         | 40.0          | 73.8         | 48.3         | 44.4         | 59.4         | 56.0          | 42.7         | 48.8         |  |
|         | 20  | Random 59.7 67.3 44.9 40.0 73.8 48.3 44.4 59.4 56.0 42.7 4 |        |              |              |               |              | 48.8         |              |              |               |              |              |  |
|         | Ascending   | Replications   | 68.5   | 71.5         | 44.7         | 43.3          | 75.6         | 47.6         | 44.2         | 67.5         | 59.8          | 46.7         | 54.8         |  |
| 8       | ei  | Relayed-nodes  | 73.9   | 88.5         | 50.7         | 47.2          | 82.2         | 45.7         | 49.5         | 62.4         | 52.9          | 45.4         | 54.8         |  |
| Policy  | l sc  | Time-to-live   | 51.6   | 55.0         | 41.4         | 41.4          | 68.2         | 44.9         | 41.1         | 56.9         | 53.9          | 41.1         | 49.9         |  |
| е Р     | `   | Message-size   | 53.0   | 59.7         | 37.2         | 34.6          | 59.5         | 24.4         | 39.0         | 60.0         | 52.5          | 45.0         | 50.6         |  |
| Queue 1 | an  | Arrival-time   | 64.2   | 74.3         | 44.4         | 39.9          | 73.5         | 53.9         | 44.8         | 65.2         | 59.6          | 47.3         | 54.5         |  |
| Õ       | Trinvariante 04.2 74.3 43.4 39.5 73.3 33.7 44.8 05.2 15.2 15.2 15.2 15.2 15.2 15.2 15.2 1 |  |        |              |              |               |              |              | 56.7         | 41.3         | 48.9          |              |              |  |
|         | l ë l   | Relayed-nodes  | 53.2   | 54.5         | 37.6         | 40.2          | 62.6         | 45.3         | 41.1         | 57.7         | 57.3          | 46.4         | 49.3         |  |
|         | š   | Time-to-live   | 81.4   | 89.4         | 51.6         | 49.2          | 75.0         | 49.0         | 44.8         | 59.5         | 57.6          | 51.0         | 54.4         |  |
|         |   | Message-size   | 57.6   | 65.9         | 44.6         | 47.7          | 68.0         | 49.6         | 46.9         | 65.0         | 60.2          | 45.7         | 43.3         |  |

## Scenario 3 - Delivery Ratio

|  |  |               |  |              |              |               | D            | rop Poli     |              |              |               |              |              |  |  |  |  |
|--|--|---------------|--|--------------|--------------|---------------|--------------|--------------|--------------|--------------|---------------|--------------|--------------|--|--|--|--|
|  |  |               | X  |              |              | scendin       |              | top Pon      | l l          | D            | escendii      | 20           |              |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |               | Λ  |              | F            | Ascendin      | g            |              |              | υ            | escendii      | ig           |              |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |               | Random   | Arrival-time | Replications | Relayed-nodes | Time-to-live | Message-size | Arrival-time | Replications | Relayed-nodes | Time-to-live | Message-size |  |  |  |  |
| Metric Delivery Ratio (percentage, more is better) |  |               |  |              |              |               |              |              |              |              |               |              |              |  |  |  |  |
|  | $\times$   | Random        | 55.2   | 63.5         | 44.5         | 33.7          | 76.3         | 26.9         | 47.3         | 64.1         | 72.5          | 38.1         | 77.3         |  |  |  |  |
|  |  | Arrival-time  | ıl-time 41.6 53.0 32.7 23.0 70.5 19.8 35.0 52.2 61.9 27.6 73 |              |              | 73.2          |              |              |              |              |               |              |              |  |  |  |  |
|  | <u>ii</u>  | Replications  | 69.3   | 73.9         | 59.1         | 47.3          | 81.9         | 33.9         | 60.3         | 75.6         | 81.8          | 46.5         | 83.3         |  |  |  |  |
| >  | l ei   | Relayed-nodes | 68.7   | 77.8         | 60.5         | 53.6          | 79.2         | 33.5         | 55.1         | 76.6         | 74.9          | 46.0         | 85.0         |  |  |  |  |
| olji   | Ascending  | Time-to-live  | 41.5   | 46.8         | 30.2         | 22.5          | 61.2         | 21.0         | 36.0         | 58.0         | 58.6          | 29.1         | 71.7         |  |  |  |  |
| Queue Policy                                       | ^  | Message-size  | 64.0   | 70.9         | 62.2         | 60.8          | 74.4         | 43.0         | 57.9         | 69.2         | 71.4          | 55.4         | 75.3         |  |  |  |  |
| ien  | 20   | Arrival-time  | 63.8   | 66.9         | 55.5         | 42.3          | 72.1         | 32.9         | 57.1         | 68.3         | 75.5          | 43.0         | 79.2         |  |  |  |  |
| Õ  | Hilliamine 03.8 00.9 30.3 42.5 72.1 32.3 77.1 08.3 77.3 77.3 77.1 08.3 77.3 77.1 08.3 77.3 77.1 08.3 77.3 77.1 08.3 77.3 77.3 77.3 77.3 77.3 77.3 77.3 7 |               |  |              |              |               |              |              |              | 27.7         | 67.1          |              |              |  |  |  |  |
|  | ĕ  | Relayed-nodes | 40.3   | 45.4         | 30.4         | 26.8          | 57.4         | 18.5         | 36.8         | 57.4         | 60.8          | 24.4         | 71.9         |  |  |  |  |
|  | š  | Time-to-live  | 72.1   | 77.2         | 65.1         | 49.9          | 76.4         | 40.3         | 61.9         | 76.4         | 79.8          | 53.5         | 86.0         |  |  |  |  |
|  |  | Message-size  | 29.3   | 34.0         | 22.4         | 20.7          | 45.2         | 20.3         | 27.0         | 42.5         | 49.5          | 21.2         | 67.3         |  |  |  |  |

Simulation Setup

#### Scenario 3 - Overhead Factor

|  |   |  |        |              |              |               | D            | rop Poli     | cy           |              |               |              |              |
|--|---|--|--------|--------------|--------------|---------------|--------------|--------------|--------------|--------------|---------------|--------------|--------------|
|  |   |  | X      |              | Α            | scendin       | g            |              |              | D            | escendir      | ıg           |              |
|  |   |  | Random | Arrival-time | Replications | Relayed-nodes | Time-to-live | Message-size | Arrival-time | Replications | Relayed-nodes | Time-to-live | Message-size |
| Metric Overhead Factor (transmissions per message, less is better) |   |  |        |              |              |               |              |              |              |              |               |              |              |
|  |   |  |        |              |              |               |              |              |              | 74.3         |               |              |              |
|  | an  | Arrival-time   | 104.3  | 85.0         | 114.6        | 160.3         | 59.2         | 69.5         | 95.7         | 87.6         | 72.1          | 130.5        | 69.8         |
|  | Ascending   | Replications   | 82.1   | 75.7         | 93.4         | 115.1         | 66.5         | 98.3         | 91.5         | 73.8         | 64.9          | 112.9        | 71.8         |
| 5  | en [  | Relayed-nodes  | 65.5   | 54.4         | 80.8         | 85.9          | 54.6         | 67.8         | 76.0         | 60.2         | 60.7          | 89.9         | 61.4         |
| Policy   | Asc   | Time-to-live   | 84.5   | 77.7         | 107.3        | 140.7         | 77.7         | 93.0         | 84.3         | 67.4         | 75.0          | 103.4        | 62.4         |
| е Р  | `   | Message-size   | 98.6   | 89.5         | 101.7        | 102.8         | 85.1         | 122.5        | 105.7        | 90.8         | 88.2          | 111.8        | 82.0         |
| Queue  | an  | Arrival-time   | 84.4   | 77.6         | 97.0         | 122.1         | 75.7         | 95.2         | 93.7         | 78.9         | 68.3          | 114.8        | 67.0         |
| ō  | Fig. 2 (1) (1) (2) (1) (2) (1) (2) (1) (2) (1) (2) (1) (2) (1) (2) (2) (2) (2) (2) (2) (2) (2) (2) (2 |  |        |              |              |               |              |              |              | 76.1         |               |              |              |
|  | i en  | Relayed-nodes 97.1 85.9 118.9 142.4 82.5 138.2 106.0 74.4 82.3 168 |        |              |              |               |              | 168.0        | 61.4         |              |               |              |              |
|  | esc   | Time-to-live   | 67.8   | 57.2         | 77.0         | 100.1         | 60.9         | 86.4         | 78.0         | 64.9         | 59.5          | 96.1         | 55.8         |
|  |   | Message-size   | 23.6   | 23.0         | 31.9         | 31.5          | 24.5         | 29.2         | 35.0         | 20.4         | 25.7          | 45.0         | 33.4         |

## Scenario 3 - Average Delay

|  |  |               |        |              |              |               | D            | rop Poli     | cv           |              |               |              |              |
|--|--|---------------|--------|--------------|--------------|---------------|--------------|--------------|--------------|--------------|---------------|--------------|--------------|
|  |  |               | X      |              | Α            | scendin       | g            |              |              | D            | escendi       | ıg           |              |
|  |  |               | Random | Arrival-time | Replications | Relayed-nodes | Time-to-live | Message-size | Arrival-time | Replications | Relayed-nodes | Time-to-live | Message-size |
| Metric Average Delay (minutes, less is better) |  |               |        |              |              |               |              |              |              |              |               | 1            |              |
|  | ×  | Random        | 63.9   | 62.1         | 63.7         | 50.5          | 55.2         | 46.9         | 66.2         | 67.6         | 68.0          | 54.9         | 71.9         |
|  | 50   | Arrival-time  | 68.6   | 68.7         | 65.8         | 50.7          | 62.7         | 51.7         | 70.6         | 72.0         | 86.2          | 55.9         | 90.1         |
|  | Ascending  | Replications  | 47.4   | 46.3         | 47.9         | 39.6          | 42.1         | 37.4         | 51.0         | 50.8         | 49.5          | 41.6         | 46.8         |
| >  | en   | Relayed-nodes | 39.0   | 35.0         | 54.0         | 39.7          | 37.5         | 33.3         | 48.2         | 39.6         | 57.6          | 41.6         | 42.6         |
| Queue Policy                                   | Sc   | Time-to-live  | 68.9   | 65.7         | 58.5         | 54.3          | 86.3         | 54.1         | 75.0         | 86.0         | 96.9          | 55.5         | 98.9         |
| e P  |  | Message-size  | 53.7   | 52.7         | 47.6         | 45.4          | 54.9         | 48.8         | 53.0         | 59.0         | 61.9          | 47.9         | 49.7         |
| ien  | 20   | Arrival-time  | 37.3   | 33.8         | 40.5         | 33.5          | 33.6         | 32.0         | 46.6         | 43.5         | 46.2          | 37.5         | 42.5         |
| Õ  | Hitterature 57.5 53.6 40.5 53.7 59.4 49.0 70.5 74.9 84.5 54.6 8.6 Relayed-nodes 63.9 61.1 56.8 50.6 68.7 51.7 66.8 80.7 86.2 52.2 Time-to-live 28.1 26.1 31.7 28.4 25.7 24.5 35.8 33.0 36.5 34.2 |               |        |              |              |               |              |              |              | 85.2         |               |              |              |
|  | j ĕ  | Relayed-nodes | 63.9   | 61.1         | 56.8         | 50.6          | 68.7         | 51.7         | 66.8         | 80.7         | 86.2          | 52.2         | 87.8         |
|  | š  | Time-to-live  | 28.1   | 26.1         | 31.7         | 28.4          | 25.7         | 24.5         | 35.8         | 33.0         | 36.5          | 34.2         | 30.8         |
|  |  | Message-size  | 55.5   | 50.1         | 52.5         | 51.9          | 47.0         | 44.9         | 61.1         | 62.8         | 68.6          | 52.0         | 86.2         |

Simulation Setup

## Scenario 3 - Composite

|   |           |   |        | Drew Ballion |   |               |              |              |              |              |               |              |              |  |  |
|---|-----------|---|--------|--------------|---|---------------|--------------|--------------|--------------|--------------|---------------|--------------|--------------|--|--|
|   |           |   |        |              |   |               | D            | rop Poli     | cy           |              |               |              |              |  |  |
|   |           |   | X      |              | A   | Ascendin      | g            |              |              | D            | escendii      | ıg           |              |  |  |
|   |           |   | Random | Arrival-time | Replications  | Relayed-nodes | Time-to-live | Message-size | Arrival-time | Replications | Relayed-nodes | Time-to-live | Message-size |  |  |
| Metric Composite (percentage, more is better) |           |   |        |              |   |               |              |              |              |              |               |              |              |  |  |
|   | $\times$  | Random  | 50.5   | 57.9         | 40.9  | 35.2          | 71.4         | 45.7         | 43.2         | 57.2         | 63.2          | 39.6 62.4    |              |  |  |
|   | 20        | Arrival-time  | 39.4   | 49.3         | 57.9         40.9         35.2         71.4         45.7         43.2         57.2         63.2         39.6         62.4           49.3         33.9         25.6         66.5         44.1         37.1         46.9         48.8         32.2         53.2 |               |              |              |              |              |               | 53.2         |              |  |  |
|   | l iği l   | Replications  | 67.6   | 71.8         | 59.8  | 52.7          | 79.7         | 50.9         | 59.4         | 71.0         | 76.7          | 52.0         | 77.1         |  |  |
| >   | l ei      | Relayed-nodes   | 74.8   | 83.6         | 60.5  | 62.4          | 83.1         | 59.4         | 61.6         | 79.6         | 70.6          | 56.9         | 82.1         |  |  |
| Policy  | Ascending | Time-to-live  | 43.7   | 49.3         | 37.6  | 28.1          | 47.2         | 38.2         | 38.3         | 48.0         | 41.7          | 39.3         | 50.1         |  |  |
| e P   |           | Message-size  | 58.4   | 64.3         | 59.6  | 59.6          | 66.1         | 44.8         | 54.1         | 60.4         | 60.8          | 53.8         | 69.5         |  |  |
| Queue 1                                       | 20        | Arrival-time  |        |              |   |               |              |              |              |              |               | 78.1         |              |  |  |
| Õ   | اﷺ        | Replications 38.8 45.3 29.9 26.0 55.5 42.7 34.5 45.7 47.5 31.4 Relayed-nodes 42.5 48.8 35.8 31.6 52.1 27.9 37.5 48.5 46.0 23.9 Time-to-live 80.8 86.6 73.7 62.4 85.6 62.5 70.0 81.4 82.7 62.5 |        |              |   |               |              |              |              |              | 50.9          |              |              |  |  |
|   | ĕ         | Relayed-nodes   | 42.5   | 48.8         | 35.8  | 31.6          | 52.1         | 27.9         | 37.5         | 48.5         | 46.0          | 23.9         | 55.4         |  |  |
|   | š         | Time-to-live  | 80.8   | 86.6         | 73.7  | 62.4          | 85.6         | 62.5         | 70.0         | 81.4         | 82.7          | 62.5         | 89.2         |  |  |
|   |           | Message-size  | 57.4   | 62.3         | 53.4  | 53.0          | 68.8         | 56.4         | 51.1         | 61.4         | 61.0          | 50.2         | 60.2         |  |  |

## Composite Scenario Evaluation - Delivery Ratio

|  |            |               |        |              |              |               | D            | rop Poli     | cy           |              |               |              |              |
|--|------------|---------------|--------|--------------|--------------|---------------|--------------|--------------|--------------|--------------|---------------|--------------|--------------|
|  |            |               | X      |              | A            | scendin       | g            |              |              | D            | escendi       | ng           |              |
|  |            |               | Random | Arrival-time | Replications | Relayed-nodes | Time-to-live | Message-size | Arrival-time | Replications | Relayed-nodes | Time-to-live | Message-size |
| Metric Delivery Ratio (percentage, more is better) |            |               |        |              |              |               |              |              |              |              |               | 1            |              |
|  | ×          | Random        | 46.2   | 52.7         | 35.4         | 23.9          | 66.8         | 20.8         | 38.2         | 53.1         | 64.9          | 27.7         | 56.7         |
|  |            | Arrival-time  | 36.2   | 46.5         | 30.0         | 18.0          | 64.0         | 17.5         | 32.6         | 44.6         | 59.0          | 21.8         | 54.3         |
|  | Ascending  | Replications  | 56.3   | 59.8         | 45.2         | 31.5          | 70.1         | 24.8         | 44.7         | 60.5         | 70.6          | 31.4         | 60.6         |
| 55   | enc        | Relayed-nodes | 58.1   | 66.9         | 50.0         | 35.6          | 69.5         | 24.1         | 42.9         | 60.9         | 65.2          | 30.2         | 61.4         |
| Policy   | §          | Time-to-live  | 34.9   | 38.5         | 25.2         | 18.1          | 57.3         | 17.0         | 36.1         | 50.0         | 55.6          | 23.3         | 52.8         |
| е Р  | ~          | Message-size  | 54.4   | 58.3         | 49.0         | 43.4          | 64.3         | 30.5         | 47.4         | 59.0         | 65.1          | 37.3         | 56.9         |
| Queue 1  | 20         | Arrival-time  | 51.9   | 54.5         | 43.0         | 29.5          | 62.6         | 23.8         | 44.2         | 56.6         | 67.1          | 28.5         | 58.1         |
| Õ  | اﷺ         | Replications  | 35.7   | 39.8         | 28.9         | 17.8          | 52.5         | 17.2         | 31.9         | 44.9         | 55.0          | 21.4         | 50.2         |
|  | j ĕ        | Relayed-nodes | 33.4   | 37.7         | 24.3         | 20.7          | 52.3         | 15.9         | 32.8         | 49.4         | 56.7          | 19.6         | 53.2         |
|  | Descending | Time-to-live  | 60.0   | 64.9         | 50.0         | 32.2          | 66.0         | 27.6         | 45.5         | 60.6         | 69.4          | 35.6         | 61.9         |
|  |            | Message-size  | 26.7   | 30.0         | 21.4         | 16.0          | 41.6         | 17.5         | 34.7         | 39.9         | 49.6          | 18.6         | 51.9         |

Drop Policy

## Composite Scenario Evaluation - Overhead Factor

|         |            |               | Diop rolley |              |              |               |              |              |              |              |               |              |              |  |  |
|---------|------------|---------------|-------------|--------------|--------------|---------------|--------------|--------------|--------------|--------------|---------------|--------------|--------------|--|--|
|         |            |               | X           |              | A            | scendin       | g            |              |              | D            | escendir      | ıg           |              |  |  |
|         |            |               | Random      | Arrival-time | Replications | Relayed-nodes | Time-to-live | Message-size | Arrival-time | Replications | Relayed-nodes | Time-to-live | Message-size |  |  |
|         |            | Metric        |             | (            | Overhead     | l Factor      | (transmi     | ssions p     | er messa     | ige, less    | ss is better) |              |              |  |  |
|         | X          | Random        | 98.4        | 80.9         | 123.3        | 180.3         | 139.4        | 103.4        | 118.6        | 105.0        | 122.4         | 131.6        | 98.2         |  |  |
|         | 20         | Arrival-time  | 103.9       | 81.0         | 118.1        | 178.2         | 114.0        | 91.8         | 105.5        | 92.1         | 96.0          | 130.1        | 93.5         |  |  |
|         | الثانا     | Replications  | 93.1        | 79.0         | 114.3        | 167.7         | 154.0        | 123.8        | 126.7        | 97.5         | 127.4         | 127.8        | 94.8         |  |  |
| 5       | ene        | Relayed-nodes | 75.2        | 55.0         | 94.9         | 131.0         | 114.2        | 117.6        | 99.8         | 114.0        | 134.2         | 113.5        | 87.8         |  |  |
| Policy  | Ascending  | Time-to-live  | 88.7        | 80.7         | 121.3        | 156.8         | 118.0        | 93.5         | 92.5         | 71.0         | 97.1          | 110.0        | 86.8         |  |  |
| е Р     | `          | Message-size  | 116.3       | 101.4        | 144.8        | 176.1         | 192.0        | 249.3        | 129.9        | 107.9        | 154.1         | 135.0        | 103.2        |  |  |
| Queue 1 | 90         | Arrival-time  | 101.8       | 82.3         | 118.4        | 173.7         | 165.7        | 102.7        | 116.3        | 110.4        | 141.1         | 135.0        | 92.3         |  |  |
| Õ       | di.        | Replications  | 113.6       | 99.3         | 127.5        | 181.4         | 141.1        | 90.4         | 111.1        | 109.1        | 97.5          | 137.8        | 97.3         |  |  |
|         | Descending | Relayed-nodes | 104.5       | 92.9         | 141.4        | 166.7         | 147.5        | 117.0        | 113.7        | 77.7         | 108.5         | 157.0        | 88.8         |  |  |
|         | es         | Time-to-live  | 80.1        | 59.8         | 101.5        | 150.4         | 157.6        | 120.7        | 123.9        | 139.1        | 144.8         | 119.2        | 86.5         |  |  |
|         |            | Message-size  | 38.3        | 33.4         | 52.9         | 68.2          | 100.7        | 52.2         | 44.4         | 35.5         | 59.6          | 72.8         | 108.0        |  |  |
|         |            | ·             |             |              |              |               |              |              |              |              |               |              |              |  |  |

Evaluation

## Composite Scenario Evaluation - Average Delay

|        |            |               |        | Drop Policy  |              |               |              |              |              |              |               |              |              |  |  |  |
|--------|------------|---------------|--------|--------------|--------------|---------------|--------------|--------------|--------------|--------------|---------------|--------------|--------------|--|--|--|
|        |            |               | X      |              | A            | scendin       | g            |              | Ĺ            | D            | escendir      | ıg           |              |  |  |  |
|        |            |               | Random | Arrival-time | Replications | Relayed-nodes | Time-to-live | Message-size | Arrival-time | Replications | Relayed-nodes | Time-to-live | Message-size |  |  |  |
|        |            | Metric        |        |              |              | Averag        | e Delay      | (minute      | s, less is   | better)      |               |              |              |  |  |  |
|        | ×          | Random        | 71.3   | 68.2         | 75.4         | 57.9          | 58.4         | 59.2         | 79.6         | 72.6         | 85.7          | 67.6         | 72.9         |  |  |  |
|        | 50         | Arrival-time  | 79.6   | 78.6         | 80.5         | 58.3          | 72.6         | 67.2         | 85.6         | 81.7         | 107.2         | 70.1         | 86.6         |  |  |  |
|        | Ascending  | Replications  | 54.5   | 52.5         | 64.7         | 47.6          | 44.3         | 51.1         | 65.2         | 54.8         | 66.8          | 54.0         | 51.3         |  |  |  |
| 5      | en         | Relayed-nodes | 50.9   | 43.4         | 74.5         | 50.2          | 43.6         | 51.8         | 65.1         | 49.6         | 81.7          | 58.7         | 48.7         |  |  |  |
| Policy | °          | Time-to-live  | 79.6   | 76.1         | 72.0         | 62.3          | 93.3         | 66.4         | 93.5         | 93.9         | 110.0         | 70.1         | 91.4         |  |  |  |
| e P    |            | Message-size  | 63.9   | 61.3         | 64.1         | 53.2          | 57.8         | 57.8         | 70.6         | 67.6         | 79.6          | 57.5         | 58.0         |  |  |  |
| Queue  | 20         | Arrival-time  | 48.4   | 41.2         | 60.9         | 47.1          | 37.5         | 49.4         | 64.9         | 51.9         | 64.6          | 51.4         | 48.8         |  |  |  |
| Õ      | اﷺ         | Replications  | 77.3   | 68.4         | 80.3         | 60.0          | 68.2         | 62.5         | 86.7         | 81.9         | 100.8         | 68.0         | 83.3         |  |  |  |
|        | ĕ          | Relayed-nodes | 71.4   | 70.9         | 72.0         | 61.3          | 73.6         | 65.7         | 84.6         | 88.4         | 99.7          | 62.5         | 84.2         |  |  |  |
|        | Descending | Time-to-live  | 36.0   | 33.5         | 52.6         | 39.8          | 30.7         | 44.9         | 55.0         | 43.0         | 58.5          | 46.8         | 40.8         |  |  |  |
|        |            | Message-size  | 68.0   | 61.0         | 73.9         | 59.5          | 55.3         | 60.2         | 87.3         | 75.3         | 93.1          | 65.2         | 82.2         |  |  |  |

Conclusion

## Composite Scenario Evaluation - Composite

|         |            |               |        | Drop Policy  |              |               |              |              |              |              |               |              |              |  |  |
|---------|------------|---------------|--------|--------------|--------------|---------------|--------------|--------------|--------------|--------------|---------------|--------------|--------------|--|--|
|         |            |               |        |              |              |               |              | rop Poli     | cy           |              |               |              |              |  |  |
|         |            |               | X      |              | A            | scendin       | g            |              |              | D            | escendii      | 1g           |              |  |  |
|         |            |               | Random | Arrival-time | Replications | Relayed-nodes | Time-to-live | Message-size | Arrival-time | Replications | Relayed-nodes | Time-to-live | Message-size |  |  |
|         |            | Metric        |        |              |              | Compo         | site (per    | centage      | more is      | better)      |               |              |              |  |  |
|         | ×          | Random        | 55.4   | 62.6         | 43.6         | 36.3          | 72.8         | 46.2         | 44.6         | 59.4         | 62.1          | 40.1         | 59.3         |  |  |
|         |            | Arrival-time  | 45.6   | 55.2         | 39.8         | 32.3          | 68.1         | 43.9         | 41.5         | 51.4         | 52.2          | 36.2         | 53.3         |  |  |
|         | Ascending  | Replications  | 69.0   | 73.1         | 55.2         | 47.4          | 79.0         | 49.2         | 53.8         | 71.0         | 72.6          | 48.4         | 70.5         |  |  |
| y.      | l ei       | Relayed-nodes | 74.9   | 85.8         | 57.4         | 53.9          | 83.1         | 50.8         | 56.6         | 73.7         | 63.2          | 48.3         | 73.4         |  |  |
| Policy  | s          | Time-to-live  | 47.5   | 52.0         | 41.0         | 34.1          | 54.6         | 41.8         | 42.3         | 52.8         | 48.5          | 40.7         | 51.7         |  |  |
| e P     | `          | Message-size  | 60.1   | 65.0         | 54.0         | 52.1          | 65.1         | 37.6         | 52.0         | 62.9         | 60.4          | 49.2         | 64.6         |  |  |
| Queue 1 | an         | Arrival-time  | 68.1   | 74.6         | 55.1         | 45.8          | 76.3         | 50.9         | 54.4         | 69.2         | 70.5          | 46.7         | 71.0         |  |  |
| Õ       | الثال      | Replications  | 44.5   | 52.2         | 37.2         | 31.4          | 59.5         | 44.6         | 39.3         | 49.9         | 51.8          | 35.4         | 51.9         |  |  |
|         | l ë l      | Relayed-nodes | 47.3   | 51.7         | 37.1         | 34.7          | 56.8         | 36.5         | 40.8         | 53.4         | 51.9          | 32.3         | 54.7         |  |  |
|         | Descending | Time-to-live  | 81.5   | 87.8         | 65.5         | 52.9          | 82.6         | 54.1         | 59.7         | 73.8         | 74.4          | 55.2         | 77.5         |  |  |
|         |            | Message-size  | 57.6   | 62.9         | 50.6         | 51.1          | 67.0         | 53.2         | 52.8         | 62.8         | 60.0          | 47.6         | 55.8         |  |  |



- Introduction
- 2 Routing in Opportunistic Networks
- 3 Simulation Setup
- 4 Scenarios
- **5** Evaluation
- 6 Conclusion

#### Conclusion

- Differently sized messages influence each other
- Epidemic routing performance depends on {queue, drop} policy
- Each metrics has other characteristics
  - But: A few policies are preferable on average

#### **Future Work**



- More scenarios
- More metrics
- More routing protocols
- More {queue, drop} policies





|              |            |               |        |   |              |               | D            | rop Poli     | cv           |   |               |              |              |  |  |
|--------------|------------|---------------|--------|---|--------------|---------------|--------------|--------------|--------------|---|---------------|--------------|--------------|--|--|
|              |            |               | X      |   | A            | scendin       |              | -1           |              | 71.2         84.0         33.7         82.7           60.7         77.6         27.6         79.4           82.7         90.2         38.4         88.1           79.5         81.5         33.5         88.9           68.2         72.8         30.4         75.8           85.0         85.1         47.7         85.6           77.0         85.3         33.1         84.7 |               |              |              |  |  |
|              |            |               | Random | Arrival-time                                | Replications | Relayed-nodes | Time-to-live | Message-size | Arrival-time | Replications  | Relayed-nodes | Time-to-live | Message-size |  |  |
|              |            | Metric        |        | Delivery Ratio (percentage, more is better) |              |               |              |              |              |   |               |              |              |  |  |
|              | ×          | Random        | 61.3   | 69.4  | 46.8         | 29.4          | 84.6         | 24.1         | 51.0         | 71.2  | 84.0          | 33.7         | 82.7         |  |  |
|              | 20         | Arrival-time  | 48.5   | 61.3  | 43.0         | 22.3          | 82.7         | 22.4         | 48.3         | 60.7  | 77.6          | 27.6         | 79.4         |  |  |
|              | Ascending  | Replications  | 74.6   | 80.8  | 61.3         | 38.3          | 88.4         | 29.3         | 57.8         | 82.7  | 90.2          | 38.4         | 88.1         |  |  |
| 5            | enc        | Relayed-nodes | 75.3   | 86.1  | 66.8         | 43.0          | 88.5         | 28.3         | 55.9         | 79.5  | 81.5          | 33.5         | 88.9         |  |  |
| ij           | \sc        | Time-to-live  | 44.9   | 49.6  | 33.0         | 22.7          | 72.5         | 20.6         | 56.2         | 68.2  | 72.8          | 30.4         | 75.8         |  |  |
| e P          | 7          | Message-size  | 82.4   | 85.2  | 73.1         | 62.2          | 85.6         | 36.5         | 69.7         | 85.0  | 85.1          | 47.7         | 85.6         |  |  |
| Queue Policy | 50         | Arrival-time  | 68.6   | 72.5  | 57.8         | 37.7          | 77.6         | 26.6         | 59.5         | 77.0  | 85.3          | 33.1         | 84.7         |  |  |
| õ            | ling       | Replications  | 47.4   | 52.9  | 40.1         | 21.9          | 65.0         | 22.0         | 44.7         | 59.8  | 68.6          | 26.9         | 73.4         |  |  |
|              | Descending | Relayed-nodes | 44.0   | 50.2  | 30.8         | 26.8          | 67.3         | 19.7         | 47.5         | 67.7  | 71.9          | 24.6         | 77.0         |  |  |
|              | esc        | Time-to-live  | 77.5   | 83.5  | 66.0         | 37.6          | 83.6         | 31.0         | 58.6         | 79.8  | 88.3          | 43.4         | 89.7         |  |  |
|              | Д          | Message-size  | 32.9   | 35.8  | 27.7         | 18.5          | 47.9         | 22.0         | 59.3         | 51.6  | 63.3          | 24.7         | 76.6         |  |  |

## Scenario 2 - Overhead Factor



|              |            |               |        | Drop Policy  |              |               |              |              |              |              |               |              |              |  |  |  |
|--------------|------------|---------------|--------|--------------|--------------|---------------|--------------|--------------|--------------|--------------|---------------|--------------|--------------|--|--|--|
|              |            |               |        |              |              |               |              | rop Poli     | cy           |              |               |              |              |  |  |  |
|              |            |               | X      |              | A            | scendin       | g            |              |              | D            | escendii      | 1g           |              |  |  |  |
|              |            |               | Random | Arrival-time | Replications | Relayed-nodes | Time-to-live | Message-size | Arrival-time | Replications | Relayed-nodes | Time-to-live | Message-size |  |  |  |
|              |            | Metric        |        | (            | Overhead     | 1 Factor      | (transmi     | ssions p     | er messa     | ge, less     | is better     | )            |              |  |  |  |
|              | ×          | Random        | 85.5   | 75.7         | 111.3        | 166.2         | 62.2         | 94.8         | 103.2        | 71.2         | 57.3          | 142.1        | 72.2         |  |  |  |
|              | 20         | Arrival-time  | 90.8   | 76.8         | 94.9         | 171.3         | 55.7         | 71.7         | 81.0         | 75.7         | 54.3          | 134.0        | 63.1         |  |  |  |
|              | ij.        | Replications  | 79.3   | 72.0         | 96.1         | 142.8         | 65.9         | 99.6         | 100.3        | 70.4         | 58.8          | 134.1        | 72.3         |  |  |  |
| 3            | enc        | Relayed-nodes | 68.2   | 56.9         | 79.9         | 115.4         | 60.3         | 91.9         | 85.6         | 64.9         | 67.9          | 137.8        | 62.7         |  |  |  |
| Queue Policy | Ascending  | Time-to-live  | 79.5   | 73.2         | 90.6         | 151.6         | 64.3         | 87.5         | 67.0         | 57.2         | 58.6          | 113.0        | 60.0         |  |  |  |
| e P          | `          | Message-size  | 83.1   | 80.2         | 93.0         | 105.2         | 80.5         | 124.0        | 93.3         | 80.0         | 81.0          | 131.7        | 74.5         |  |  |  |
| en           |            | Arrival-time  | 84.7   | 75.6         | 99.1         | 146.9         | 75.0         | 108.1        | 98.9         | 73.9         | 66.2          | 150.5        | 66.1         |  |  |  |
| õ            | ij         | Replications  | 104.3  | 96.4         | 107.8        | 170.4         | 80.0         | 85.3         | 93.0         | 81.7         | 66.1          | 145.4        | 69.8         |  |  |  |
|              | enc        | Relayed-nodes | 93.8   | 82.7         | 121.9        | 158.2         | 65.1         | 114.8        | 81.2         | 66.1         | 71.2          | 180.4        | 60.5         |  |  |  |
|              | Descending | Time-to-live  | 67.7   | 59.4         | 82.5         | 149.3         | 61.6         | 97.8         | 92.7         | 67.9         | 61.5          | 127.9        | 59.8         |  |  |  |
|              |            | Message-size  | 17.9   | 17.5         | 21.4         | 35.9          | 31.1         | 35.8         | 12.2         | 13.8         | 15.9          | 75.5         | 42.2         |  |  |  |

# HEINRICH HEINE UNIVERSITÄT DÜSSELDORF

## Scenario 2 - Average Delay

|               | X   |               | Drop Policy  |  |  |  |   |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|---------------|---|---------------|--------------|--|--|--|---|--|---|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|
|               |   |               | P            | scendin  | g  |  |   | D  | Descending  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|               | Random  | Arrival-time  | Replications | Relayed-nodes  | Time-to-live   | Message-size   | Arrival-time  | Replications   | Relayed-nodes   | Time-to-live   | Message-size   |  |  |  |  |  |
| Metric        |   |               |              | Averag   | e Delay  | (minute  | s, less is  | better)  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Random        | 66.6  | 64.1          | 64.3         | 45.2   | 61.6   | 47.0   | 70.5  | 70.6   | 79.1  | 50.9   | 71.4   |  |  |  |  |  |
| Arrival-time  | 72.9  | 75.0          | 79.1         | 46.2   | 87.3   | 53.0   | 84.8  | 77.4   | 110.0   | 53.6   | 94.0   |  |  |  |  |  |
| Replications  | 47.8  | 46.0          | 48.4         | 35.5   | 43.1   | 39.3   | 50.6  | 52.7   | 49.8  | 39.4   | 44.8   |  |  |  |  |  |
| Relayed-nodes | 40.9  | 35.8          | 62.8         | 39.7   | 40.6   | 46.3   | 53.3  | 39.8   | 73.4  | 41.4   | 41.4   |  |  |  |  |  |
| Time-to-live  | 72.4  | 69.7          | 60.9         | 47.0   | 109.1  | 52.5   | 91.3  | 95.3   | 108.7   | 52.9   | 98.9   |  |  |  |  |  |
| Message-size  | 59.8  | 59.1          | 53.4         | 42.8   | 62.7   | 49.3   | 55.3  | 65.6   | 66.8  | 45.4   | 55.6   |  |  |  |  |  |
| Arrival-time  | 36.8  | 33.8          | 44.0         | 33.6   | 33.7   | 41.3   | 49.5  | 48.0   | 49.5  | 38.0   | 42.0   |  |  |  |  |  |
| Replications  | 68.8  | 63.8          | 74.4         | 45.5   | 79.0   | 52.2   | 82.3  | 78.1   | 96.9  | 52.5   | 89.1   |  |  |  |  |  |
| Relayed-nodes | 67.1  | 65.2          | 58.0         | 49.6   | 84.4   | 53.0   | 83.2  | 88.9   | 94.8  | 49.7   | 88.6   |  |  |  |  |  |
| Time-to-live  | 28.3  | 26.5          | 35.2         | 29.6   | 26.0   | 38.0   | 38.8  | 35.2   | 42.1  | 34.6   | 29.8   |  |  |  |  |  |
| Message-size  | 62.2  | 59.0          | 64.8         | 49.4   | 57.2   | 51.5   | 89.3  | 75.6   | 96.9  | 51.6   | 85.9   |  |  |  |  |  |
|               | Random Arrival-time Replications Relayed-nodes Time-to-live Message-size Arrival-time Replications Relayed-nodes Time-to-live | Random   66.6 | Random       | Metric         Random         66.6         64.1         64.3           Arrival-time         72.9         75.0         79.1           Replications         47.8         46.0         48.4           Relayed-nodes         40.9         35.8         62.8           Time-to-live         72.4         69.7         60.9           Message-size         59.8         59.1         53.4           Arrival-time         36.8         33.8         44.0           Replications         68.8         63.8         74.4           Relayed-nodes         67.1         65.2         58.0           Time-to-live         28.3         26.5         35.2 | Metric         Average           Random         66.6         64.1         64.3         45.2           Arrival-time         72.9         75.0         79.1         46.2           Replications         47.8         46.0         48.4         35.5           Relayed-nodes         40.9         35.8         62.8         39.7           Time-to-live         72.4         69.7         60.9         47.0           Message-size         59.8         59.1         53.4         42.8           Arrival-time         36.8         33.8         44.0         33.6           Replications         68.8         63.8         74.4         45.5           Relayed-nodes         67.1         65.2         58.0         49.6           Time-to-live         28.3         26.5         35.2         29.6 | Metric         Average Delay           Random         66.6         64.1         64.3         45.2         61.6           Arrival-time         72.9         75.0         79.1         46.2         87.3           Replications         47.8         46.0         48.4         35.5         43.1           Relayed-nodes         40.9         35.8         62.8         39.7         40.6           Time-to-live         72.4         69.7         60.9         47.0         109.1           Message-size         59.8         59.1         53.4         42.8         62.7           Arrival-time         36.8         33.8         44.0         33.6         33.7           Replications         68.8         63.8         74.4         45.5         79.0           Relayed-nodes         67.1         65.2         58.0         49.6         84.4           Time-to-live         28.3         26.5         35.2         29.6 <b>26.0</b> | Metric         Average Delay (minute           Random         66.6         64.1         64.3         45.2         61.6         47.0           Arrival-time         72.9         75.0         79.1         46.2         87.3         53.0           Replications         47.8         46.0         48.4         35.5         43.1         39.3           Relayed-nodes         40.9         35.8         62.8         39.7         40.6         46.3           Time-to-live         72.4         69.7         60.9         47.0         109.1         52.5           Message-size         59.8         59.1         53.4         42.8         62.7         49.3           Arrival-time         36.8         33.8         44.0         33.6         33.7         41.3           Replications         68.8         63.8         74.4         45.5         79.0         52.2           Relayed-nodes         67.1         65.2         58.0         49.6         84.4         53.0           Time-to-live         28.3         26.5         35.2         29.6         26.0         38.0 | Metric         Average Delay (minutes, less is           Random         66.6         64.1         64.3         45.2         61.6         47.0         70.5           Arrival-time         72.9         75.0         79.1         46.2         87.3         53.0         84.8           Replications         47.8         46.0         48.4         35.5         43.1         39.3         50.6           Relayed-nodes         40.9         35.8         62.8         39.7         40.6         46.3         53.3           Time-to-live         72.4         69.7         60.9         47.0         109.1         52.5         91.3           Message-size         59.8         59.1         53.4         42.8         62.7         49.3         55.3           Arrival-time         36.8         33.8         44.0         33.6         33.7         41.3         49.5           Replications         68.8         63.8         74.4         45.5         79.0         52.2         82.3           Relayed-nodes         67.1         65.2         58.0         49.6         84.4         53.0         83.2           Time-to-live         28.3         26.5         35.2         29.6 | Metric         Average Delay (minutes, less is better)           Random         66.6         64.1         64.3         45.2         61.6         47.0         70.5         70.6           Arrival-time         72.9         75.0         79.1         46.2         87.3         53.0         84.8         77.4           Replications         47.8         46.0         48.4         35.5         43.1         39.3         50.6         52.7           Relayed-nodes         40.9         35.8         62.8         39.7         40.6         46.3         53.3         39.8           Time-to-live         72.4         69.7         60.9         47.0         109.1         52.5         91.3         95.3           Message-size         59.8         59.1         53.4         42.8         62.7         49.3         55.3         65.6           Arrival-time         36.8         33.8         44.0         33.6         33.7         41.3         49.5         48.0           Replications         68.8         63.8         74.4         45.5         79.0         52.2         82.3         78.1           Relayed-nodes         67.1         65.2         58.0         49.6         84.4 <td>Metric         Average Delay (minutes, less is better)           Random         66.6         64.1         64.3         45.2         61.6         47.0         70.5         70.6         79.1           Arrival-time         72.9         75.0         79.1         46.2         87.3         53.0         84.8         77.4         110.0           Replications         47.8         46.0         48.4         35.5         43.1         39.3         50.6         52.7         49.8           Relayed-nodes         40.9         35.8         62.8         39.7         40.6         46.3         53.3         39.8         73.4           Time-to-live         72.4         69.7         60.9         47.0         109.1         52.5         91.3         95.3         108.7           Message-size         59.8         59.1         53.4         42.8         62.7         49.3         55.3         65.6         66.8           Arrival-time         36.8         33.8         44.0         33.6         33.7         41.3         49.5         48.0         49.5           Replications         68.8         63.8         74.4         45.5         79.0         52.2         82.3</td> <td>Metric         Average Delay (minutes, less is better)           Random         66.6         64.1         64.3         45.2         61.6         47.0         70.5         70.6         79.1         50.9           Arrival-time         72.9         75.0         79.1         46.2         87.3         53.0         84.8         77.4         110.0         53.6           Replications         47.8         46.0         48.4         35.5         43.1         39.3         50.6         52.7         49.8         39.4           Relayed-nodes         40.9         35.8         62.8         39.7         40.6         46.3         53.3         39.8         73.4         41.4           Time-to-live         72.4         69.7         60.9         47.0         109.1         52.5         91.3         95.3         108.7         52.9           Message-size         59.8         59.1         53.4         42.8         62.7         49.3         55.3         65.6         66.8         45.4           Arrival-time         36.8         33.8         44.0         33.6         33.7         41.3         49.5         48.0         49.7         38.0           Replications</td> | Metric         Average Delay (minutes, less is better)           Random         66.6         64.1         64.3         45.2         61.6         47.0         70.5         70.6         79.1           Arrival-time         72.9         75.0         79.1         46.2         87.3         53.0         84.8         77.4         110.0           Replications         47.8         46.0         48.4         35.5         43.1         39.3         50.6         52.7         49.8           Relayed-nodes         40.9         35.8         62.8         39.7         40.6         46.3         53.3         39.8         73.4           Time-to-live         72.4         69.7         60.9         47.0         109.1         52.5         91.3         95.3         108.7           Message-size         59.8         59.1         53.4         42.8         62.7         49.3         55.3         65.6         66.8           Arrival-time         36.8         33.8         44.0         33.6         33.7         41.3         49.5         48.0         49.5           Replications         68.8         63.8         74.4         45.5         79.0         52.2         82.3 | Metric         Average Delay (minutes, less is better)           Random         66.6         64.1         64.3         45.2         61.6         47.0         70.5         70.6         79.1         50.9           Arrival-time         72.9         75.0         79.1         46.2         87.3         53.0         84.8         77.4         110.0         53.6           Replications         47.8         46.0         48.4         35.5         43.1         39.3         50.6         52.7         49.8         39.4           Relayed-nodes         40.9         35.8         62.8         39.7         40.6         46.3         53.3         39.8         73.4         41.4           Time-to-live         72.4         69.7         60.9         47.0         109.1         52.5         91.3         95.3         108.7         52.9           Message-size         59.8         59.1         53.4         42.8         62.7         49.3         55.3         65.6         66.8         45.4           Arrival-time         36.8         33.8         44.0         33.6         33.7         41.3         49.5         48.0         49.7         38.0           Replications |  |  |  |  |  |

## Scenario 2 - Composite

HEINRICH HEINE UNIVERSITÄT DÜSSELDORF

|              |            |               |        | Drop Policy  |              |               |              |              |              |              |               |              |              |  |  |  |
|--------------|------------|---------------|--------|--------------|--------------|---------------|--------------|--------------|--------------|--------------|---------------|--------------|--------------|--|--|--|
|              |            |               |        |              |              |               |              | rop Poli     | cy           |              |               |              |              |  |  |  |
|              |            |               | X      |              | Α            | Ascendin      | g            |              |              | D            | escendii      | ıg           |              |  |  |  |
|              |            |               | Random | Arrival-time | Replications | Relayed-nodes | Time-to-live | Message-size | Arrival-time | Replications | Relayed-nodes | Time-to-live | Message-size |  |  |  |
|              |            | Metric        |        |              |              | Compo         | site (per    | centage.     | more is      | better)      |               |              |              |  |  |  |
|              | ×          | Random        | 56.0   | 62.6         | 45.0         | 33.6          | 73.4         | 44.6         | 46.1         | 61.8         | 67.1          | 38.1         | 66.6         |  |  |  |
|              |            | Arrival-time  | 46.4   | 54.3         | 40.6         | 28.9          | 63.6         | 46.0         | 43.6         | 53.3         | 52.5          | 35.9         | 57.9         |  |  |  |
|              | ii)        | Replications  | 70.8   | 75.9         | 61.1         | 46.3          | 81.7         | 49.1         | 57.8         | 74.4         | 81.3          | 46.5         | 79.6         |  |  |  |
| y            | and        | Relayed-nodes | 76.0   | 85.3         | 61.1         | 52.2          | 83.9         | 47.4         | 58.7         | 79.1         | 66.1          | 42.6         | 83.3         |  |  |  |
| olic         | Ascending  | Time-to-live  | 47.2   | 51.7         | 44.0         | 32.7          | 48.5         | 42.2         | 47.4         | 53.4         | 49.9          | 41.6         | 54.9         |  |  |  |
| e P          |            | Message-size  | 68.9   | 71.0         | 65.2         | 61.9          | 69.8         | 43.7         | 62.8         | 68.4         | 67.8          | 48.9         | 73.7         |  |  |  |
| Queue Policy | 20         | Arrival-time  | 71.3   | 76.1         | 60.6         | 45.9          | 78.7         | 45.4         | 59.2         | 72.9         | 77.7          | 41.3         | 80.4         |  |  |  |
| Õ            | ij         | Replications  | 44.9   | 51.0         | 38.6         | 29.2          | 53.8         | 43.4         | 40.5         | 51.4         | 51.1          | 33.7         | 55.7         |  |  |  |
|              | Descending | Relayed-nodes | 46.1   | 51.9         | 38.0         | 32.3          | 55.7         | 36.2         | 43.8         | 53.9         | 52.5          | 26.8         | 59.4         |  |  |  |
|              | esc        | Time-to-live  | 82.2   | 87.4         | 71.2         | 47.0          | 87.1         | 50.8         | 64.3         | 80.4         | 82.9          | 52.0         | 88.9         |  |  |  |
|              |            | Message-size  | 57.9   | 60.6         | 53.8         | 52.7          | 64.2         | 53.5         | 60.5         | 62.1         | 58.7          | 46.9         | 64.0         |  |  |  |