Peer Review Workshop 3, 1dv607

Fredrik Olsson(folep02) & Andras Ballas(ab223sq)
Reviews:
Christer Hamberg (ch22xb)

Try to compile/use the source code provided. Can you get it up and running ?

There was no problem compiling and running the source code.
Test the runnable version:
The commands to play, hit , stand and quit all seem to work correctly during testing. There is a bug when outputting the result it will output the same hand multiple times due to a faulty implementation of the Observer pattern.

Does the implementation and diagrams conform (do they show the same thing)?

The diagram seems to be correct with all the relations presented. The diagram is a bit cluttered making it bigger and just leaving more space between classes would increase the readability.

Is the dependency between controller and view handled? How? Good? Bad?

Yes we would say that it is removed in a good way by using a check method in the view class.

Is the Strategy Pattern used correctly for the rule variant Soft17?

The RuleSoft17 is indeed implemented but not in a correct way. The method CalcScore inside player is where the value of the Ace is subtracted instead of in the Rule. All of the logic surrounding the soft 17 rule should be handled in the Rule while CalcScore should just calculate the current score of the hand.

Is the Strategy Pattern used correctly for the variations of who wins the game?

The solution is maybe a bit too elaborate but yes RulesFactory seems to be correct.

Is the duplicate code removed?

The duplicate code is commented out and it's being handled by a method instead. I think that all the comments with old code should be removed to increase readability.

Is the Observer Pattern correctly implemented?

The Observer Pattern is implemented but it does not work as expected it will allow duplicate outputs of the same hand. The output increases incrementally the more you play so there are either too many events fired or to many observers.

Is the class diagram updated?

Yes it is.

Do you think the design/implementation has passed the grade 2 criteria?

With some changes to the implementation and removal of all the bugs yes I think it would meet the criteria for grade 2.