Journal Pre-proof

Dermatology without Dermatologists? Analyzing Instagram influencers with dermatology-related hashtags

Varun Ranpariya, BA, Brian Chu, BS, Ramie Fathy, AB, Jules B. Lipoff, MD

PII: S0190-9622(20)30870-7

DOI: https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jaad.2020.05.039

Reference: YMJD 14658

To appear in: Journal of the American Academy of Dermatology

Received Date: 31 March 2020 Revised Date: 17 April 2020 Accepted Date: 7 May 2020

Please cite this article as: Ranpariya V, Chu B, Fathy R, Lipoff JB, Dermatology without Dermatologists? Analyzing Instagram influencers with dermatology-related hashtags, *Journal of the American Academy of Dermatology* (2020), doi: https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jaad.2020.05.039.

This is a PDF file of an article that has undergone enhancements after acceptance, such as the addition of a cover page and metadata, and formatting for readability, but it is not yet the definitive version of record. This version will undergo additional copyediting, typesetting and review before it is published in its final form, but we are providing this version to give early visibility of the article. Please note that, during the production process, errors may be discovered which could affect the content, and all legal disclaimers that apply to the journal pertain.

© 2020 Published by Elsevier on behalf of the American Academy of Dermatology, Inc.



- Dermatology without Dermatologists? Analyzing Instagram influencers with dermatology related hashtags
- 3 Varun Ranpariya, BA, Brian Chu, BS, Ramie Fathy, AB, Jules B. Lipoff, MD³
- 4 (1) Rutgers Robert Wood Johnson Medical School, Piscataway, NJ
- 5 (2) Perelman School of Medicine, University of Pennsylvania, Philadelphia, PA
- 6 (3) Department of Dermatology, Perelman School of Medicine, University of Pennsylvania,
- 7 Philadelphia, PA

- 9 Corresponding author:
- 10 Jules B. Lipoff, MD
- 11 Department of Dermatology, University of Pennsylvania
- 12 Penn Medicine University City
- 13 3737 Market Street, Suite 1100
- 14 Philadelphia, PA 19104
- 15 Clinic Phone: 215-662-8060
- 16 Clinic Fax: 215-243-3284
- 17 Email: jules.lipoff@pennmedicine.upenn.edu

- 19 **Conflict of Interest:** None declared
- 20 **Funding Sources:** None
- 21 **Word count**: 499
- 22 Number of References: 5
- 23 **Number of Tables:** 2 (and 1 <u>Supplemental Table</u>)

24 The general public is increasingly turning to social media for health information, with 25 Instagram representing an especially popular and growing forum for education and support communities. However, serious concerns remain about reliability and accuracy. In this study, 26 27 we sought to characterize the credentials of dermatology influencers on Instagram, that is, accounts creating the most popular dermatology content. 28 This study was institutional review board exempt. Content coding involved analysis of 29 30 eleven hashtags, consisting of the top 5 dermatology-related diagnoses, top 5 dermatologyrelated procedures, and #dermatology (Supplemental Table 1).^{2,3} These hashtags were queried on 31 Instagram for 14 days. The "Top 9" or the most popular posts for each hashtag, were recorded 32 33 daily, totaling 1368 posts. Demographic data for associated accounts were recorded. As there are no established criteria for labeling influencers, we used two different sets of criteria to define 34 influencer status. The first criteria required that an account have 40,000 followers to be 35 considered an influencer. Under the second criteria, accounts were considered influencers if they 36 37 were featured in the "Top 9" 5 or more times, including multiple "Top 9" features of the same post on separate days. We then manually characterized account type by medical 38 occupation/credentials, presence of promotional content, and location (Table 1). 39 40 Over 300,000 dermatology-tagged posts were created during the study period. Of the 1,368 "Top 9" posts recorded, there were 649 unique posts by 420 unique accounts. One 41 hundred-six accounts had ≥40,000 followers, and 76 accounts were featured ≥5 times in the "Top 42 43 9", with a total of 146 accounts meeting one or both influencer criteria. Healthcare 44 professionals/businesses constituted 38% (55/146) of influencers, most of which (73%, 40/55) 45 had occupation/credentials listed on their account page. Seven accounts (5%, 7/146) were operated by dermatologists (6/7 were board-certified). Most (87%, 48/55) healthcare influencers 46

47 promoted their personal products and services (self-promotion). Overall, 32% (46/146) of all 48 influencers had promotional content (any non-personal promotional disclosures) and 61% 49 (89/146) had self-promotional content (any disclosure of their own 50 products/services/brand). Influencer account characteristics varied by the criteria used to identify influencers (Table 2). 51 Board-certified dermatologists appear to comprise a small fraction (4%, 6/146) of 52 53 Instagram accounts with popular dermatology content. Most influencers (93%, 135/146) 54 featured self-promotional posts or directly promoted brands, products, or services. This promotional content may create conflicts of interest that should be explicitly disclosed and 55 56 addressed. Furthermore, account credentials were often unmentioned (71%, 104/146, of all 57 influencers and 27%, 15/55, of healthcare influencers). 58 Medical information on social media should come from reliable sources, as patients use social media to join communities and make treatment decisions. ^{4,5} Given little regulation in these 59 60 arenas, medical information from unqualified sources may result in misguided management or 61 unnecessary treatment. Thus, Instagram may represent an unrealized opportunity for 62 dermatologists and dermatology organizations to share quality educational content to counter potentially biased promotional content and misinformation. Moreover, dermatologists should 63 anticipate that many patients are using Instagram as a source of dermatologic information and be 64

prepared to advise on awareness of promotional interests and qualifications on social media.

66

67	RI	EFERENCES
68	1.	Wong XL, Liu RC, Sebaratnam DF. Evolving role of Instagram in #medicine. <i>Intern Med J</i> .
69		2019;49(10):1329-1332.
70	2.	ASDS Survey on Dermatologic Procedures. https://www.asds.net/portals/0/PDF/procedures-
71		survey-results-presentation-2018.pdf. Published August 2019. Accessed February 23, 2020.
72	3.	Wilmer EN, Gustafson CJ, Ahn CS et al. Most common dermatologic conditions
73		encountered by dermatologists and nondermatologists. Cutis. 2014; 94(6):285-92.
74	4.	Yousaf A, Hagen R, Delaney E, Davis S, Zinn Z. The influence of social media on acne
75		treatment: A cross-sectional survey. <i>Pediatr Dermatol</i> . 2020 Jan 15. [Epub ahead of print]
76	5.	Smailhodzic E, Hooijsma W, Boonstra A, Langley DJ. Social media use in healthcare: A
77		systematic review of effects on patients and on their relationship with healthcare
78		professionals. BMC Health Serv Res. 2016;16(1):442.
79 80		
81		
82		
83		
84		
85		
86		

88 <u>TABLES</u>

89

Table 1. Definitions of characterizations of Instagram influencer accounts.

A	Account Char	racterization	Definition						
Type of Account		Business	Non-healthcare accounts promoting their own products or services (e.g. beauty products, make-up, supplements)						
	Healthcare	Business or Professional	Business or personal accounts of healthcare professionals or businesses (including physicians, nurses, estheticians, etc.)						
		Personal	Non-disease centric, non-healthcare professional accounts of individuals						
		Patient	Accounts about a personal journey with a disease						
	Diseas	se Advocacy/Charity	Non-personal accounts promoting disease advocacy or a charity's social media account.						
	Educati	ional or Informational	Only educational or informational content						
		Other	Does not meet any other characterization criteria						
Credentials		None	No explicit credentials listed in account biography						
		US Physician	Non-dermatologist US physician						
		Board-Certified	US board-certified non-dermatology physician*						
		Self-Described Only	Self-described US physician, but not board-certified*						
	U	S Dermatologist	US dermatologist						
		Board-Certified	US board-certified dermatologist *						
		Self-Described Only	Self-described US dermatologist, but not board-certified*						
	Inter	national Physician	Non-US, non-dermatologist, self-described physician						
	International Dermatologist		Non-US, self-described dermatologist						
	Physician Assistant		Self-described physician assistant						
	Nurse	e/Nurse Practitioner	Self-described nurse or nurse practitioner						
		Dentist	Self-described dentist						
		Esthetician	Self-described esthetician						

Promotions	Promotional	Any disclosures for promotional content (e.g. #'s or text indicating ad, ambassador, discounts, tags, etc.)**					
	Self-Promotional	Any disclosures for content promoting account's own products/services. Any links/tags to other accounts or stores with the same brand.					
	None	No promotional or self-promotional content identified					
Location	US	US location described in account biography or US location tagged in posts					
	Foreign	Non-US location described in account biography or non- US location tagged in posts or posts/biographies written in a non-English language					
	Both	Both US and non-US locations described in account biography or tagged in posts					
	Unknown	No location identified					

^{*} According to certificationmatters.org

** According to the Federal Trade Commission: https://www.ftc.gov/tips-advice/businesscenter/guidance/disclosures-101-social-media-influencers

Table 2. Influencer characteristics associated with each set of influencer criteria.

	40k+ followers		Top 9, ≥5 times		All Influencers		Healthcare Only		
	106		76		146		55		
Account Characteristic			%	Total	%	Total	%	Total	%
Account Type	Business	18	17	7	9	20	14		
	Healthcare Business/Professional	43	41	31	41	55	38	55	100
	Personal	31	29	14	18	37	25		
	Patient	3	3	21	28	22	15		
	Disease Advocacy/Charity	2	2	0	0	2	1		
	Education/Informational		7	3	4	8	5		
Other		2	2	0	0	2	1		
Credentials	als None		68	56	74	104	71	15	27
	US Physician (Total)	3	3	0	0	3	2	3	5
	Board-Certified	1	1	0	0	1	1	1	2
	Self-Described only	2	2	0	0	2	1	2	4
	US Dermatologist (Total)	7	7	0	0	7	5	7	13
	Board-Certified	6	6	0	0	6	4	6	11
	Self-Described only	1	1	0	0	1	1	1	2
	International Physician	5	5	5	7	6	4	6	11
	International Dermatologist	3	3	4	5	6	4	6	11
	Physician Assistant	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	2
	Nurse/Nurse Practitioner	7	7	6	8	10	7	10	18
	Dentist	1	1	0	0	1	1	1	2
	Estheticians	5	5	4	5	6	4	6	11

	Other	2	2	0	0	2	1	0	0	
Promotional	Promotional	36	34	18	24	46	32	5	9	
Content	Self-Promotional	51	48	49	64	89	61	48	87	
	None	3	3	9	12	11	8	2	4	
Location	US	34	32	35	46	54	37	23	42	
	Foreign	59	56	30	40	74	51	29	53	
	Both	4	4	4	5	5	3	3	5	
	Unknown	9	8	7	9	13	9	0	0	