



Trinity College Dublin

Coláiste na Tríonóide, Baile Átha Cliath

The University of Dublin

SCHOOL OF POLITICAL

**ENTITLEMENT METHODS –
AN EXAMPLE OF THE GREAT FAMINE
IN IRELAND, 1845 – 1851**

Chenxi Li

23330541

JUNE 4, 2024

School of Political, TCD

SUBMITTED IN PARTIAL FULFILMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS FOR THE DEGREE OF
M.SC. APPLIED SOCIAL DATA SCIENCES

Declaration

I hereby declare that this Dissertation is entirely my own work and that it has not been submitted as an exercise for a degree at this or any other university.

I have read and I understand the plagiarism provisions in the General Regulations of the University Calendar for the current year, found at
<http://www.tcd.ie/calendar>.

I have also completed the Online Tutorial on avoiding plagiarism 'Ready Steady Write' and located at
<http://tcd-ie.libguides.com/plagiarism/ready-steady-write>.

Signature: 

Date: June 4, 2024

Acknowledgements

Abstract

Contents

Abstract	iii
1 Introduction	1
2 Literature Review	5
2.1 Famine Outline	5
2.2 Refuting some hypotheses	5
2.2.1 Potato Blight	5
2.3 Entitlement Approach	6
3 Data	7
4 Methods	8

List of Figures

List of Tables

1.1	Timeline of Great Famine Root-Cause Academic Discussion	3
-----	---	---

Chapter 1 | Introduction

October playing a symphony on a slack wire paling.

Maguire watches the drills flattened out

And the flints that lit a candle for him on a June altar,

Flameless.

— “The Great Hunger” by Patrick Kavanagh. (Kavanagh and Quinn, 2006)

The Irish Great Famine (1845 – 1852) reshaped the entire history of Ireland. Before the Great Famine, according to the 1841 census, the population of the Ireland had close to 8.5 million ¹. In 1851, when the Irish Great Famine had not yet ended, census noted that about 1 million people had died for hunger, and a similar number had gone into overseas exile ². In 1926, as a result of the Irish independence 5 years earlier, the Central Statistical Office was capable to integrate historical documents since famine and showed the fact that the population was decline of roughly 22% ³ in the 10 years from 1841 to 1851. Using parish baptism data, some scholars have estimated that in the year 1847 alone – which is also known as black’47 in Ireland history – there existed counties with a nearly 70% reduction in baptisms in Munster province in the south of Ireland (Cousens, 1960), especially from southwest Cork and including north and east Clare ⁴, while it was not the worst hit by the famine compared to the province of Connacht in the west ⁵. Apart from these quantitative explorations, the Great Famine is equally pivotal in Irish cultural history and ethnography. From Joseph O’Connor’s fiction “Star of the sea” to W. B. Yeats’s “The Countess Cathleen”, together they expressed that the Great Famine not only pointed to the corpses of the dead, but also to a black hole of identity, naming and meaning (Luchen, 2019).

¹ 1841 Census of Ireland, Last accessed: 13 May, 2024

² 1851 Census of Ireland, Last accessed: 2 May, 2024

³ 1926 Census of Ireland, Chapter II, Last accessed: 9 May, 2024

⁴ RTE, How “a truly modern famine” devastated Ireland, Last accessed: 11 May, 2024

⁵ Wesley Johnston: The Famine: The Summer of Black’47, Last accessed: 13 May, 2024

The effects of the Great Famine were far-reaching, and reflected in the long-term population development, land institution structure and attitude to the UK government directly. It was not until 120 years later, in the 1960s, that Ireland's population began to grow consistently due to large-scale emigration, late marriage and a high incidence of permanent celibacy no longer hold (Grada, 1979), but it was still nowhere near as large as it had been during the Great Famine ⁶. This also makes Ireland one of the few countries in the world to suffer population decline over the past 170 years when the world's population has increased more than 6 fold ⁷. Regarding the land, on the one hand, in the aftermath of the famine, there was a tendency in Ireland to shift from agriculture to livestock husbandry ⁸, and on the other hand, when the late blight back in the 1870s, the Land War, which was directed at the landowners and the government, took place at the same time, with a deep consequences for the land structure of Ireland. And finally, there raised hostility between Irish and UK government, which was described as "a bankruptcy of the British-Irish Union of 1800" (Gray, 2021).

But data on Ireland's food imports and exports show increases in specific commodities, even barley, oats and butter, that violate the characteristics of the Great Famine. In History Ireland magazine, Christine wrote:

Almost 4,000 vessels carried food from Ireland to the ports of Bristol, Glasgow, Liverpool and London during 1847, when 400,000 Irish men, women and children died of starvation and related diseases [...] The most shocking export figures concern butter [...] That works out to be 822,681 gallons of butter exported to England from Ireland.⁹

Scholars pondered if potato blight was the root cause of the famine, and they have engaged in many discussions about the origin factor, like Catholic and religious behavior (Miller, 1975), anti-Irish racism (Waters, 1995), the poor law and colonial bio-politics (Nally, 2008) and, typically, the potato blight (Bartoletti, 2001), etc.

⁶ 2022 Census of Ireland – Summary Results, Last accessed: 8 May, 2024

⁷ Blog by Ambassador Mulhall on Black'47: Ireland's Great Famine and its after-effects, Last accessed: 9 May, 2024

⁸ CSO: Farming Since the Famine, 1847 - 1996, Last accessed: 12 May, 2024

⁹ Ireland's Great Hunger Museum: Learn About the Great Hunger, Last accessed: 13 May, 2024

Although to this day, we can be certain that the root causes of the Irish Great Famine were multiple regardless of the perspective used, historically, the academic discussion of the root causes of the famine changed (Henderson, 2005):

Table 1.1: Timeline of Great Famine Root-Cause Academic Discussion

Timeline	Root Cause Summary	Reference
1845 – 1852: famine	Few food importation and opposition in poor law	1850/01/05 The Illustrated London News ^a
1852 – 1920: Be ignored	— ^b	(Kinealy, 2017)
1920 – 1960: nationalist	Key grouping, like land-lord class or the UK government	(Smith, 2005)
1960 – 1980: revisionism	Focus on history and event itself, ignore outside force	(Daly, 2006)
1980s: post-revisionist	Emotional description also blame UK government	(Hamera, 2011)
1980s: diverse	Malthus population theory	(O’Flynn, 2009) & (McGregor, 1989) & (Weir, 1991)
	Anti-Malthus theory	(Ó Gráda, 1983) & (Mokyr, 1980) & (Guinnane, 1994)
	Blight biological analysis	(Donnelly, 2011)
	Foucault’s bio-politics and colonial perspective	(Nally, 2008) & (Kennedy, 2020) & (Madden, 2016)

^a The original newspaper mentioned: *Free importation of corn into this union is essentially necessary – [...] any attempt to re-impose a duty on the importation of food can only [...] tend to the starving of the people. Poor law [...] relieves the struggling farmer of a heavy burden he had hitherto.* (McNamara, 1850)

^b The famine literature few. The quantity and quality of work on the famine sparse: *The two standard books of the Great Famine, [...] the chapters were uneven in quality and lacked coherence (some lacked footnotes, some were lost).* (Kinealy, 2017)

Famine narrative travel along the path of Irish history. When nationalism was high, there was a tendency to external attribution; then when the economy and society stabilized, revisionism was born. As Hu Shih, a Chinese philosopher of the 1900s, put it, *Reality, like a block of marble in our hands, is carved into whatever likeness we choose.*

What these strands of history described is that while food shortages are an objective fact, there are nonetheless other causes that conspire to drive famine – as Amartya Sen’s rights approach asserts.

Based on the theoretical structure described above, this paper would like to reject some of the established theories on the famine (**Chapter 2.1**) and propose an Amartya Sen entitlement approach perspective on the Irish Famine (**Chapter 2.2**). Then this paper will discuss the data used in this paper and its collection process (**Chapter 3**), present the RDD regression methodology employed (**Chapter 4**) and then verify the applicability of the rights approach to this scenario (**Chapter 5**). Finally, a conclusion will be presented (**Chapter 6**).

Chapter 2 | Literature Review

Famines imply starvation, but not vice versa, and starvation implies poverty, but not vice versa.

— Amartya Sen

2.1 Famine Outline

Irish Lumper potato,

2.2 Refuting some hypotheses

This part I will refute some hypothesis of famine origin. Many people regard single factor as the root of the Great Famine.

2.2.1 Potato Blight

In Nature journal,

1845 June Belgium, August France, August South of UK, September Ireland

1. Blame potato blight as the only origin of famine

People believe potato blight was responsible for the Irish Great Famine.

lumper potato

Blight became a semi-permanent fixture until the end of the century, when effective treatments were found (O'Rourke, 1994).

2. Ireland have the bad land quality.

2.3 Entitlement Approach

I will operationalize entitlement approach into these 4 dimensions according to the book:

- (1) trade-based entitlement: price, grain amount,
- (2) production-based entitlement: tax policy
- (3) own-labour entitlement: wage, land own amount, poor law
- (4) inheritance and transfer entitlement: none, hard to get data

Chapter 3 | Data

Wage(Bishop, 1915)

Chapter 4 | Methods

Bibliography

- Bartoletti, S. C. (2001), *Black potatoes: The story of the great Irish famine, 1845-1850*, Houghton Mifflin Harcourt.
- Bishop, A. L. (1915), 'A history of the commercial and financial relations between eng-land and ireland from the period of the restoration'.
- Cousens, S. H. (1960), 'Regional death rates in ireland during the great famine, from 1846 to 1851', *Population Studies* **14**(1), 55–74.
- Daly, M. (2006), Revisionism and irish history: The great famine, in 'The Making of Modern Irish History', Routledge, pp. 71–89.
- Donnelly, J. (2011), 'The irish famine', *BBC: British History* **17**.
- Grada, C. O. (1979), The population of ireland 1700-1900: a survey, in 'Annales de démographie historique', JSTOR, pp. 281–299.
- Gray, P. (2021), 'Was the great irish famine a colonial famine?', *East/West* **8**(1), 159–172.
- Guinnane, T. W. (1994), 'The great irish famine and population: the long view', *The American Economic Review* **84**(2), 303–308.
- Hamera, P. (2011), 'An outline of irish famine historiography', *The Linguistic Academy Journal of Interdisciplinary Language Studies* p. 65.
- Henderson, L. (2005), 'The irish famine: A historiographical review', *Historia* **14**, 133–140.
- Kavanagh, P. and Quinn, A. (2006), *Collected poems*, Penguin Books.
- Kennedy, S. (2020), 'Beckett, evangelicalism and the biopolitics of famine', *Beckett Beyond the Normal* pp. 62–78.

- Kinealy, C. (2017), *The Great Irish Famine: impact, ideology and rebellion*, Bloomsbury Publishing.
- Luchen, W. (2019), 'The naming of identity: The famine narrative in Joseph O'Connor's star of the sea and the transatlantic diasporic writing', *Foreign Literature Studies* **41**(5), 123.
- Madden, E. (2016), 'Aids and the hunger: Fiction, biopolitics and the historical imagination', *The Irish Review* (1986-) (53), 60–73.
- McGregor, P. P. (1989), 'Demographic pressure and the Irish famine: Malthus after Mokyr', *Land Economics* pp. 228–238.
- McNamara, P. (1850), 'Condition of Ireland. Illustrations of the new poor-law. Cabin of Pat McNamara, village of Clear', *The Illustrated London News*.
- Miller, D. W. (1975), 'Irish Catholicism and the great famine', *Journal of Social History* **9**(1), 81–98.
- Mokyr, J. (1980), 'Malthusian models and Irish history', *The Journal of Economic History* **40**(1), 159–166.
- Nally, D. (2008), '"that coming storm": The Irish poor law, colonial biopolitics, and the great famine', *Annals of the Association of American Geographers* **98**(3), 714–741.
- Ó Gráda, C. (1983), 'Malthus and the pre-famine economy', *Hermathena* (135), 75–95.
- O'Flynn, M. (2009), 'Food crises and the ghost of Malthus', *New Proposals: Journal of Marxism and Interdisciplinary Inquiry* **3**(1), 33–41.
- O'Rourke, K. (1994), 'The economic impact of the famine in the short and long run', *The American Economic Review* **84**(2), 309–313.
- Smith, M. E. (2005), *Reckoning with the past: Teaching history in Northern Ireland*, Lexington Books.

Waters, H. (1995), 'The great famine and the rise of anti-irish racism', *Race & Class* 37(1), 95–108.

Weir, D. R. (1991), Malthus's theory of population, *in* 'The World of Economics', Springer, pp. 401–406.