Supplementary Tables: Cognitive Load and Moral Dumbfounding

Table of Contents

Blinded1, Blinded2, Blinded1, & Blinded1

1 Blinded

2 Blinded

Author note

n/a

Correspondence concerning this article should be addressed to Blinded, Blinded. E-mail: Blinded

Abstract

n/a

*Keywords:* keywords

*Word count:* TBC

Supplementary Tables: Cognitive Load and Moral Dumbfounding

# Supplementary Tables

Below are additional tables:

Table 1:

*Study 1 – Changes in Jugment*

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Initial Judgment | Revised Judgment | Total Changed |
| neutral | right | 1 |
| neutral | wrong | 3 |
| wrong | neutral | 7 |
| wrong | right | 1 |

Table 2:

*Study 1 – Response to the critical slide depending on cognitive load*

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | N | % | N | % |
| It’s wrong and I can provide a valid reason. | 12 | 36% | 21 | 64% |
| It’s wrong but I can’t think of a reason. | 6 | 18% | 7 | 21% |
| There is nothing wrong. | 15 | 45% | 5 | 15% |

Table 3:

*Study 2 – Changes in Jugment*

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Initial Judgment | Revised Judgment | Total Changed |
| neutral | right | 2 |
| right | neutral | 1 |
| wrong | neutral | 6 |
| wrong | right | 1 |

Table 4:

*Study 2 – Response to the critical slide depending on cognitive load/engagement*

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Measure | Response | N | % | N | % |
| Manipulation Only | Reasons | 25 | 49% | 25 | 51% |
|  | Dumbfounded | 15 | 29% | 11 | 22% |
|  | Nothing Wrong | 11 | 22% | 13 | 27% |
| Engagement | Reasons | 23 | 41% | 27 | 61% |
|  | Dumbfounded | 20 | 36% | 6 | 14% |
|  | Nothing Wrong | 13 | 23% | 11 | 25% |

Table 5:

*Study 3 – Changes in Jugment*

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Initial Judgment | Revised Judgment | Total Changed |
| neutral | right | 2 |
| neutral | wrong | 2 |
| right | neutral | 4 |
| right | wrong | 1 |
| wrong | neutral | 2 |
| wrong | right | 2 |

Table 6:

*Study 3 – Response to the critical slide depending on cognitive load/engagement*

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | N | % | N | % |
| It’s wrong and I can provide a valid reason. | 36 | 53% | 41 | 67% |
| It’s wrong but I can’t think of a reason. | 17 | 25% | 5 | 8% |
| There is nothing wrong. | 15 | 22% | 15 | 25% |

Table 7:

*Study 4 – Changes in Jugment*

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Initial Judgment | Revised Judgment | Total Changed |
| neutral | right | 4 |
| right | neutral | 1 |
| right | wrong | 1 |
| wrong | neutral | 6 |
| wrong | right | 1 |

Table 8:

*Study 4 – Response to the critical slide depending on cognitive load/engagement*

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | N | % | N | % |
| It’s wrong and I can provide a valid reason. | 35 | 55% | 41 | 65% |
| It’s wrong but I can’t think of a reason. | 10 | 16% | 10 | 16% |
| There is nothing wrong. | 19 | 30% | 12 | 19% |

Table 9:

*Study 5 – Changes in Jugment*

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Initial Judgment | Revised Judgment | Total Changed |
| neutral | right | 1 |
| right | neutral | 2 |
| right | wrong | 1 |
| wrong | neutral | 6 |
| wrong | right | 1 |

Table 10:

*Study 5 – Response to the critical slide depending on cognitive load/engagement*

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | N | % | N | % |
| It’s wrong and I can provide a valid reason. | 51 | 52% | 68 | 64% |
| It’s wrong but I can’t think of a reason. | 25 | 26% | 20 | 19% |
| There is nothing wrong. | 22 | 22% | 18 | 17% |

Table 11:

*Study 6 – Changes in Jugment (full sample)*

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Initial Judgment | Revised Judgment | Total Changed |
| neutral | right | 8 |
| neutral | wrong | 19 |
| right | neutral | 10 |
| right | wrong | 61 |
| wrong | neutral | 29 |
| wrong | right | 73 |

Table 12:

*Study 6 – Changes in Jugment for each Scenario*

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Scenario | Initial Judgment | Revised Judgment | Total Changed |
| Julie and Mark | neutral | right | 1 |
|  | neutral | wrong | 4 |
|  | right | wrong | 6 |
|  | wrong | neutral | 9 |
|  | wrong | right | 8 |
| Jennifer | neutral | right | 1 |
|  | neutral | wrong | 3 |
|  | right | neutral | 2 |
|  | right | wrong | 10 |
|  | wrong | neutral | 2 |
|  | wrong | right | 11 |
| Trolley | neutral | right | 4 |
|  | neutral | wrong | 7 |
|  | right | neutral | 4 |
|  | right | wrong | 18 |
|  | wrong | neutral | 14 |
|  | wrong | right | 26 |
| Heinz | neutral | right | 2 |
|  | neutral | wrong | 5 |
|  | right | neutral | 4 |
|  | right | wrong | 27 |
|  | wrong | neutral | 4 |
|  | wrong | right | 28 |

Table 13:

*Study 6 – Response to the critical slide depending on cognitive load (full sample)*

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | N | % | N | % |
| It’s wrong and I can provide a valid reason. | 113 | 56% | 143 | 67% |
| It’s wrong but I can’t think of a reason. | 55 | 27% | 36 | 17% |
| There is nothing wrong. | 35 | 17% | 36 | 17% |

Table 14:

*Study 6 – Response to the critical slide depending on cognitive load, for each scenario*

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Scenario | Response | N | % | N | % |
| Julie and Mark | Reasons | 106 | 54% | 123 | 57% |
|  | Dumbfounded | 51 | 26% | 51 | 24% |
|  | Nothing Wrong | 40 | 20% | 41 | 19% |
| Jennifer | Reasons | 142 | 65% | 173 | 81% |
|  | Dumbfounded | 67 | 31% | 30 | 14% |
|  | Nothing Wrong | 9 | 4% | 11 | 5% |
| Trolley | Reasons | 97 | 47% | 135 | 62% |
|  | Dumbfounded | 72 | 35% | 55 | 25% |
|  | Nothing Wrong | 39 | 19% | 26 | 12% |
| Heinz | Reasons | 113 | 56% | 143 | 67% |
|  | Dumbfounded | 55 | 27% | 36 | 17% |
|  | Nothing Wrong | 35 | 17% | 36 | 17% |

Table 15:

*Study 6 – Observed counts, expected counts, and standardised residuals for each response to the critical slide depending on cognitive load (Julie and Mark)*

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  |  | Cognitive Load | Control |
| Observed count | Reasons | 106 | 123 |
|  | Dumbfounded | 51 | 51 |
|  | Nothing Wrong | 40 | 41 |
| Expected count | Reasons | 109.5 | 119.5 |
|  | Dumbfounded | 48.77 | 53.23 |
|  | Nothing Wrong | 38.73 | 42.27 |
| Standardised residuals | Reasons | -0.69 | 0.69 |
|  | Dumbfounded | 0.51 | -0.51 |
|  | Nothing Wrong | 0.32 | -0.32 |

*Note.* \* = sig. at < .05; \*\* = sig. at < .001

Table 16:

*Study 6 – Observed counts, expected counts, and standardised residuals for each response to the critical slide depending on cognitive load (Jennifer)*

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  |  | Cognitive Load | Control |
| Observed count | Reasons | 142 | 173 |
|  | Dumbfounded | 67 | 30 |
|  | Nothing Wrong | 9 | 11 |
| Expected count | Reasons | 158.96 | 156.04 |
|  | Dumbfounded | 48.95 | 48.05 |
|  | Nothing Wrong | 10.09 | 9.91 |
| Standardised residuals | Reasons | -3.67\*\* | 3.67\*\* |
|  | Dumbfounded | 4.16\*\* | -4.16\*\* |
|  | Nothing Wrong | -0.5 | 0.5 |

*Note.* \* = sig. at < .05; \*\* = sig. at < .001

Table 17:

*Study 6 – Observed counts, expected counts, and standardised residuals for each response to the critical slide depending on cognitive load (Trolley)*

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  |  | Cognitive Load | Control |
| Observed count | Reasons | 97 | 135 |
|  | Dumbfounded | 72 | 55 |
|  | Nothing Wrong | 39 | 26 |
| Expected count | Reasons | 113.81 | 118.19 |
|  | Dumbfounded | 62.3 | 64.7 |
|  | Nothing Wrong | 31.89 | 33.11 |
| Standardised residuals | Reasons | -3.28\* | 3.28\* |
|  | Dumbfounded | 2.06\* | -2.06\* |
|  | Nothing Wrong | 1.92 | -1.92 |

*Note.* \* = sig. at < .05; \*\* = sig. at < .001

Table 18:

*Study 6 – Observed counts, expected counts, and standardised residuals for each response to the critical slide depending on cognitive load (Heinz)*

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  |  | Cognitive Load | Control |
| Observed count | Reasons | 113 | 143 |
|  | Dumbfounded | 55 | 36 |
|  | Nothing Wrong | 35 | 36 |
| Expected count | Reasons | 124.33 | 131.67 |
|  | Dumbfounded | 44.19 | 46.81 |
|  | Nothing Wrong | 34.48 | 36.52 |
| Standardised residuals | Reasons | -2.27\* | 2.27\* |
|  | Dumbfounded | 2.56\* | -2.56\* |
|  | Nothing Wrong | 0.14 | -0.14 |

*Note.* \* = sig. at < .05; \*\* = sig. at < .001

Table 19:

*Responses to critical slide for all cognitive load studies (raw)*

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Study | Response | N | percent | N | percent |
| Study 1\* | Reasons | 12 | 36% | 21 | 64% |
|  | Dumbfounded | 6 | 18% | 7 | 21% |
|  | Nothing wrong | 15 | 45% | 5 | 15% |
| Study 2 | Reasons | 25 | 49% | 25 | 51% |
|  | Dumbfounded | 15 | 29% | 11 | 22% |
|  | Nothing wrong | 11 | 22% | 13 | 27% |
| Study 3\* | Reasons | 54 | 53% | 41 | 67% |
|  | Dumbfounded | 27 | 26% | 5 | 8% |
|  | Nothing wrong | 21 | 21% | 15 | 25% |
| Study 4 | Reasons | 35 | 55% | 41 | 65% |
|  | Dumbfounded | 10 | 16% | 10 | 16% |
|  | Nothing wrong | 19 | 30% | 12 | 19% |
| Study 5 | Reasons | 51 | 52% | 68 | 64% |
|  | Dumbfounded | 25 | 26% | 20 | 19% |
|  | Nothing wrong | 22 | 22% | 18 | 17% |
| Study 6 | Reasons | 458 | 55% | 574 | 67% |
|  | Dumbfounded | 245 | 30% | 172 | 20% |
|  | Nothing wrong | 123 | 15% | 114 | 13% |
| All Studies\* | Reasons | 635 | 54% | 770 | 66% |
|  | Dumbfounded | 328 | 28% | 225 | 19% |
|  | Nothing wrong | 211 | 18% | 177 | 15% |

*Note.* \*significant variation at < .05; \*\*significant variation at < .001

Table 20:

*Responses to critical slide for all cognitive load studies (controlling for engagement)*

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Study | Response | N | percent | N | percent |
| Study 1\* | Reasons | 12 | 36% | 21 | 64% |
|  | Dumbfounded | 6 | 18% | 7 | 21% |
|  | Nothing wrong | 15 | 45% | 5 | 15% |
| Study 2 (engaged)\* | Reasons | 23 | 41% | 27 | 61% |
|  | Dumbfounded | 20 | 36% | 6 | 14% |
|  | Nothing wrong | 13 | 23% | 11 | 25% |
| Study 3 (engaged)\*\* | Reasons | 36 | 53% | 41 | 67% |
|  | Dumbfounded | 17 | 25% | 5 | 8% |
|  | Nothing wrong | 15 | 22% | 15 | 25% |
| Study 4 (engaged) | Reasons | 35 | 55% | 41 | 65% |
|  | Dumbfounded | 10 | 16% | 10 | 16% |
|  | Nothing wrong | 19 | 30% | 12 | 19% |
| Study 5 | Reasons | 51 | 52% | 68 | 64% |
|  | Dumbfounded | 25 | 26% | 20 | 19% |
|  | Nothing wrong | 22 | 22% | 18 | 17% |
| Study 6 | Reasons | 458 | 55% | 574 | 67% |
|  | Dumbfounded | 245 | 30% | 172 | 20% |
|  | Nothing wrong | 123 | 15% | 114 | 13% |
| All studies (engaged)\*\* | Reasons | 615 | 54% | 772 | 66% |
|  | Dumbfounded | 323 | 28% | 220 | 19% |
|  | Nothing wrong | 207 | 18% | 175 | 15% |

*Note.* \*significant variation at < .05; \*\*significant variation at < .001