Alyssa R. Cirtwill Postdoctoral fellow

Department of Ecology, Evolution, and Plant Sciences Stockholm University 114 19 Stockholm, Sweden



11 December 2019

Dr. Jana Vamosi Editor, New Phytologist University of Calgary 2500 University Drive NW Calgary, Canada T2N 1N4

Dear Dr. Vamosi:

We are pleased to submit a revised version of our manuscript, NPH-MS-2019-30803. In response to a suggestion from Referee 3, we have re-titled it "Related plants tend to share pollinators and herbivores, but strength of phylogenetic signal varies among plant families". We have also taken care to revise our methods section in response to the many helpful suggestions from Referee 4, and hope that our approach is now clearer. Finally, we have expanded the discussion to include some additional concepts suggested by Referees 2 and 4, and a possible application of our research suggested by Referee 3.

Given the difference of opinion between Referees 1, 3, and 4 and Referee 2, we have prioritised adjusting the manuscript according to the majority view. We must also admit to having some difficulty parsing a number of Referee 2's comments in order to find what precisely was being asked. These difficulties mean that we may not have been able to address Referee 2's comments as fully as we have those of the other Referees. Nevertheless, we do appreciate their time and effort in offering feedback. In addressing Referee 2's comments to the best of our abilities, we hope that we have at least managed to clarify our perspective.

We appreciate all of the Referees' comments and are confident that our manuscript is all the stronger for responding to them.

Regards,

Alyssa R. Cirtwill