Intraclonal genetic variation: ecological and evolutionary aspects.

Edited by H. D. Loxdale FLS, FRES and G. Lushai FRES

Microorganisms and parthenogenesis

R. K. KAROLIINA KOIVISTO* and HENK R. BRAIG

School of Biological Sciences, University of Wales Bangor, Bangor LL57 2UW, UK

Endosymbionts are being discovered in unprecedented numbers of invertebrate species. The bacterium *Wolbachia pipientis* alone is carried by some 20% of all insect species, in which it is responsible for such reproductive manipulations as cytoplasmic incompatibility, feminization of genetic males, male-killing and parthenogenesis. The discovery of *Wolbachia*-induced thelytoky in hymenopteran parasitoids has initiated the successful search in other groups of haplodiploid species. Haplodiploidy has arisen at least 17 times during animal evolution and intracellular bacteria that effect sexual development have been found in many of these haplodiploid groups, rekindling the question regarding the origin of haplodiploidy. The detection of *Wolbachia* in parthenogenetic thrips (Thysanoptera), booklice (Psocoptera), springtails (Collembola), mites (Acari) and *Xiphinematobacter* in dragger nematodes (Dorylaimida) raises the possibility of bacterial-induced parthenogenesis in diplodiploid species as well. Recent studies indicate that *Wolbachia* might be just one of a rapidly increasing list of intracellular bacteria capable of inducing parthenogenesis in their host. The search for novel endosymbionts will rely heavily on previous taxonomic work, but the possibilities for discovery remain boundless. © 2003 The Linnean Society of London. *Biological Journal of the Linnean Society* 2003, **79**, 43–58.

ADDITIONAL KEYWORDS: bacteria – cytogenetics – endosymbionts – geographical parthenogenesis – haplodiploidy – sex ratio distortion – thelytoky – *Wolbachia pipientis*.

INTRODUCTION

Parthenogenesis is surprisingly common among both plants and animals, perhaps accounting for up to 1% of the total number of species (Suomalainen, Saura & Lokki, 1987; Short & Balaban, 1994). With the exception of the most evolved taxa such as gymnosperms and mammals, in which it has not been reliably reported, parthenogenesis is practically universally distributed in the tree of life. This might reflect the ongoing battle between two basic forms of reproduction. Only bdelloid rotifers constitute an order that consists entirely of parthenogens. Most parthenogens have close relatives that are sexual, and often sexual and asexual populations of one species have been found geographically separated. Local adaptation easily explains these patterns. However, the sympatric occurrence of sexual and asexual populations defies mainstream evolutionary thinking. After all, cytoplasmic genes and not nuclear ones might be the decisive

evolutionary force behind some of the more interesting population structures of invertebrates.

DISCOVERING ENDOSYMBIOTIC BACTERIA

Many invertebrates are known to have intimate intracellular relationships with a diverse array of microorganisms. The taxonomic range of the invertebrate hosts to the microorganisms is equally wide. Microorganisms associated with parthenogenesis can be placed into three general categories. The Wolbachia pipientis assemblage is a widespread group of closely related α-Proteobacteria known to cause a variety of reproductive alterations, including cytoplasmic incompatibility, thelytokous parthenogenesis, feminization of genetic males, and male-killing (O'Neill, Hoffmann & Werren, 1997; Bourtzis & Braig, 1999; Stouthamer, Breeuwer & Hurst, 1999; Stevens, Giordano & Fialho, 2001). Bacteria belonging to the Cytophaga-Flexibacter-Bacteroides (CFB) group are associated with parthenogenetic wasps and feminized mites (Zchori-Fein et al., 2001; Weeks, Marec & Breeuwer, 2001).

^{*}Corresponding author. E-mail: r.k.k.koivisto@bangor.ac.uk

Xiphinematobacter species belonging to the newly established Verrucomicrobia have been found in parthenogenetic nematodes attacking the rootlets of fruit crops (Vandekerckhove *et al.*, 2000). Table 1 reflects an ever increasing list of species subject to bacterial induced parthenogenesis.

Cytoplasmic microorganisms tend to be inherited exclusively from the mother, because males usually produce very small gametes where room for cytoplasmic bacteria is lacking. Hence cytoplasmic genes have no 'evolutionary interest' in being in a male, which for them is an evolutionary 'dead-end' (Hurst, 1993). Consequently, maternally inherited microorganisms are thought to evolve towards favouring the production of female offspring in order to maintain themselves and promote their own propagation. They are often referred to as 'sex ratio distorters' (Wrench & Ebbert, 1992; Hurst, 1993; O'Neill et al., 1997). It should be noted that even though the existence of female-biased sex ratios may be an indication of extrachromosomal elements in an organism, a number of chromosomal mechanisms including meiotic drive, hybrid dysgenesis, sex linkage of a trait and maternal effects can also cause sex ratio distortion (Braig & Yan, 2002). Moreover, a wide variety of parasites are known to distort the sex ratios of their hosts without causing parthenogenesis (Braig et al., 2002).

To verify the presence and character of endosymbionts within the female-biased species, a variety of investigations can be applied. The classic test for both maternal effect and uniparental inheritance is to perform reciprocal crosses involving back-crossing so as to replace the original maternal nuclear DNA with paternal DNA of an unaffected lineage. If the condition persists it must be cytoplasmic. However, in cases of obligate parthenogenesis, genetic analysis is not possible. Other methods of analysis include horizontal transfer of the trait and the removal of the trait by heat shock or antibiotics. Additionally, visual detection of the symbionts in every affected lineage, but never in unaffected lineages, is indirect but highly suggestive evidence (Hurst, 1993). This can be achieved, for example, by the bacterial stain lacmoid, followed by bleach treatment, or by using the double-stranded DNA stain, DAPI (4',6-diamidine-2phenylindole-dihydrochloride) (Quicke, 1997). Sampling efforts for microorganism-induced thelytoky have clearly been taxonomically biased and relatively few non-hymenopteran organisms have been studied with respect to Wolbachia or to any other cytoplasmic endosymbiont. All these studies included only small samples of each host species and were therefore unlikely to detect the majority of sex ratio distorting strains, which commonly occur at low prevalence. It now looks possible that maternally inherited, thelytoky-associated microorganisms may also be widespread in diplodiploids and thus it can be expected that future research will involve a far wider range of taxa. The likelihood of detection of any endosymbiont depends on the detection method applied. Initial detection using *Wolbachia*-specific PCR (polymerase chain reaction) primers will discriminate against any unknown parthenogenesis inducing bacterium (Vandekerckhove *et al.*, 1999; Weeks *et al.*, 2001).

BACTERIAL-INDUCED PARTHENOGENESIS IN HYMENOPTERA

In 1990, Stouthamer and colleagues reported that thelytokous strains of egg parasitoids in the genus Trichogramma could be induced to produce males if treated with specific antibiotics (tetracycline hydrochloride, sulfamethoxazole and rifampicin), or subjected to high temperatures (>30°C; Stouthamer, Luck & Hamilton, 1990a). They also conducted backcrossing experiments to determine if chromosomal factors had an effect on the inheritance of thelytoky. Wild-caught sexual (arrhenotokous) females were crossed with males derived from thelytokous strains through heat treatment. The back-crossed females remained arrhenotokous, showing that thelytoky was not inherited through the chromosomes of the wasps. It was concluded that microorganisms were the cause of thelytoky, and it was further suggested that their findings could explain the existence of many species of thelytokous wasps.

Not surprisingly, ever since the discovery of Stouthamer and colleagues increasing numbers of researchers have been attracted to the phenomenon. Even prior to their findings, many authors had found that rearing the females of thelytokous parasitoid wasps - including members of the chalcidoid genera such as Encarsia, Aphelinus, Muscidifurax, Ooencyrtus, Trichogramma, and Hexacola members of the cypnipoids - at elevated temperatures (>28-35°C) led to the production of males (Schlinger & Hall, 1959; Wilson & Woolcock, 1960a; Bowen & Stern, 1966; Orphanides & Gonzalez, 1970; Eskafi & Legner, 1974; Laraichi, 1978; Cabello-Garcia & Vargas-Piqueras, 1985; Legner, 1985). Interest in the parasitoid Hymenoptera was spurred by their potential as biological control agents and also as a means of clarifying the taxonomic status of uniparental species in relation to the biparental conspecifics. As summarized by Flanders (1965), most of the above authors concluded that sexuality and primary sex ratios in populations of many species of Hymenoptera were functions of the environment, which were acting indirectly on a preembryonic stage of the individual, changing it either from potentially female to male, or vice versa.

To confirm the presence of microorganisms in the thelytokous *Trichogramma* wasps, Stouthamer &

Table 1. Microorganisms in parthenogenetic species. (M = molecular identification; A = antibiotic treatment; H = heat treatment; O = optical detection)

| Species | Bacterium | Mechanism | M | A | н | 0 | Reference |
|--|------------------------|------------------------|----|---|------------|---|--|
| PHYLUM ARTHROPODA | | | | | | | |
| CLASS ELLIPLURA | | | | | | | |
| Order Collembola Superfamily Entomobryodea Family Isotomidae | ; | ; | , | , | | | |
| Folsomia candida Superfamily Poduroidea Family Onychiuridae | Wolbachia | Gamete duplication | ` | ` | | ` | Vandekerckhove <i>et al.</i> (1999), Vandekerckhove (2001) |
| Mesaphorura macrochaeta Paratullbergia callipygos | Wolbachia Wolbachia | | >> | | | | Czarnetzki & Tebbe (2002) Czarnetzki & Tebbe (2002) |
| CLASS INSECTA | | | | | | | |
| Order Hymenoptera Superfamily Chalcidoidae | | | | | | | |
| Family Aphelinidae | | | | | | | |
| Aphelinus semiflavus | | | | | ` | | Schlinger & Hall (1959) |
| $Aphytis\ chilensis$ | Wolbachia | | > | | | | Gottlieb $et al. (1998)$ |
| $A.\ chrysomphae$ | Wolbachia | | > | | | | Gottlieb et al. (1998) |
| A. diaspidis | Wolbachia | | > | > | | | Zchori-Fein et al. (1995); Gottlieb et al. (1998) |
| A. lignanensis | Wolbachia | | > | > | | | Zchori-Fein et al. (1994), 995); Gottlieb et al. (1998) |
| A. mytilaspidis | ٠. | Terminal fusion | | | | | Rössler & DeBach (1973) |
| A. yanonensis | Wolbachia | | > | | | | Werren $et al. (1995)$ |
| Encarsia berlesei | CFB group | | > | | | | Zchori-Fein $et\ al.\ (2001)$ |
| $E.\ citrina$ | CFB group | | > | | | | Zchori-Fein $et\ al.\ (2001)$ |
| $E.\ formosa$ | Wolbachia | | > | > | | | Zchori-Fein et al. (1992) ; Werren et al. (1995) |
| E. hispida | CFB group | | > | > | | | Hunter (1999), Zchori-Fein et al. (2001) |
| E. meritoria | ٠. | | | > | ` | | Giorgini (2001) |
| $E.\ pergandiella$ | CFB group | Also in sexual lineage | > | > | | | Gottlieb et al. (2000), Zchori-Fein et al. (2001) |
| $E.\ perniciosi$ | CFB group | | > | | | | Zchori-Fein $et\ al.\ (2001)$ |
| $E.\ protransvena$ | CFB group | | > | > | ` | | Giorgini (2001) Zchori-Fein et al. (2001) |
| $Eret mocerus\ mundus$ | Wolbachia | | > | > | | | De Barro & Hart (2001) |
| <i>E. staufferi</i> Family Encyrtidae | Wolbachia | | > | | | | van Meer $et\ al.\ (1999)$ |
| Apoanagyrus diversicornis | Wolbachia | | > | > | ` | | Pijls <i>et al.</i> (1996); van Meer <i>et al.</i> (1999) |
| Coccidoxenoides peregrinus | Wolbachia | | > | | , | | van Meer <i>et al.</i> (1999) |
| Habrolepis rouxi | ·· (| | | | > | | Flanders (1965) |
| Ooencyrtus submetallicus O foomdus | ·· « | | | | , , | | Wilson & Woolcock (1960a,b) Laraichi (1978) |
| O. Jecunuus | -• | | | | > | | Laraiciii (1910) |

| Species | Bacterium | Mechanism | M | A | H | 0 | Reference |
|---|------------------------|--------------------|----------|-----|-----|---|--|
| Pauridia peregrina Plagiomerus diaspidis Trechnites psyllae | ? ? Wolbachia | | > | | > > | | Flanders (1965) Gordh & Lacey (1976) Stouthamer, pers. comm. |
| ramny reeromanaae Muscidifurax uniraptor Spalangia fuscipes | Wolbachia Wolbachia | Gamete duplication | > > | > | > | | Legner (1985); Stouthamer <i>et al.</i> (1993); Zchori-Fein <i>et al.</i> (2000) Werren <i>et al.</i> (1995) |
| Family Signiphoridae Signiphora borinquensis Family Torymidae | ۶. | | | | > | | Quezada <i>et al.</i> (1973) |
| Torymus bedeguaris Family Trichogrammatidae | Wolbachia | | > | | | | Schilthuizen & Stouthamer (1998) |
| Trichogramma brevicapillum | Wolbachia | | > | | | ` | Stouthamer & Werren (1993); Schilthuizen & Stouthamer (1997) |
| $T.\ chilonis$ | Wolbachia | | > | > | > | | Stouthamer et al. (1990ab); Chen et al. (1992); Schilthuizen & Stouthamer (1997) |
| $T.\ cordubensis$ | Wolbachia | | > | > | > | ` | Cabello & Vargas (1985); Stouthamer & Werren (1993); Schilthuizen & Stouthamer (1997); Pintureau et al. (1999a) |
| T. deion | Wolbachia | Gamete duplication | ` | ` · | | > | Stouthamer et al. (1990a,b); Stouthamer & Werren (1993) |
| I. nr deton | Wolbachia | Gamete duplication | > | > | | | Stouthamer & Azmer (1994); Schilthuizen & Stouthamer (1997) |
| $T.\ embryophagum$ | Wolbachia | | > | ` | ` | ` | Stouthamer & Werren (1993); Pintureau et al. (2000) |
| $T.\ evanescens$ | Wolbachia | | ` | > | ` | | Stouthamer et al. (1990b); Stouthamer (1997); Pintureau et al. (2000) |
| T. kaykai T. nubilale | Wolbachia Wolbachia | | > > | | | | Schilthuizen <i>et al.</i> (1998) Schilthuizen & Stouthamer (1997) |
| T. oleae | Wolbachia | | . > | | | | Pintureau et al. (2000) |
| T. platneri | Wolbachia | | > | > | ` | ` | Stouthamer et al. (1990a); Stouthamer & Werren (1993) |
| $T.\ pretiosum$ | Wolbachia | Gamete duplication | > | ` | ` | ` | Stouthamer et al. (1990a); Stouthamer & Werren (1993); Schilthuizen & Stouthamer (1997) |
| $T. \ \mathrm{nr} \ pretiosum$ | Wolbachia | | > | | | | Schilthuizen & Stouthamer (1997) |
| $T.\ semblidis$ | Wolbachia | | ` | | | | Pintureau et al. (2000) |
| $T.\ sibericum$ | Wolbachia | | > | | | | Schilthuizen & Stouthamer (1997) |
| T. nr sibericum | Wolbachia | | > | | , | | Schilthuizen & Stouthamer (1997) |
| <i>I. telengal</i> Superfamily Cynipoidea Family Cynipidae | ۸. | | | | > | | Stouthamer (1997) |
| Diplolepis bicolor | Wolbachia | | ` | | | | Plantard <i>et al.</i> (1999) |
| D. eglanteriae | Wolbachia | | ` ` | | | | Figure $et u.$ (1999) Plantard $et al.$ (1999) |
| D. $fructuum$ | Wolbachia | | > | | | | Plantard et al. (1999) |

| Plantard et al. (1999) Plantard et al. (1999) Plantard et al. (1999) Plantard et al. (1999) Stille & Dävring (1980); van Meer et al. (1995) Plantard et al. (1999) Plantard et al. (1999) Plantard et al. (1999) Plantard et al. (1999) | Arakaki et al. (2001b) Eskafi & Legner (1974) Werren et al. (1995) Werren et al. (1995) | van Meer et al. (1999) Arakaki et al. (2000) Smith (1955) Smith (1955); Darwish et al. (1992) | ✓ Werren et al. (1995) ✓ Piper et al. (2001) ✓ Piper et al. (2001) ✓ Peleg & Norris (1972) | ✓ Nur (1972) ✓ Yusuf et al. (2000) ✓ Yusuf (1999) |
|---|--|--|---|---|
| Wolbachia Wolbachia Wolbachia Wolbachia Wolbachia Wolbachia Wolbachia Wolbachia | Wolbachia ? Wolbachia Wolbachia | Wolbachia Wolbachia ? ? | Wolbachia Wolbachia Wolbachia Staphylococcus | ? Wolbachia Wolbachia |
| D. mayri D. nodulosa D. polita D. radicum D. rosae D. spinosa D. spinosa D. spinosissimae Woo Liposthenes glechomae Woo Framily Fucolilasa | omorpha steri ilis es gastroidea idae | inoidea sa ii | mnicus s | sifex a didae rychophila |

Table 1. Continued

| Species | Bacterium | Mechanism | M A | 0 Н | Reference |
|--|--------------------------------|-----------|---------------------------------------|-----|--|
| Order Thysanoptera Family Aeolothripidae Franklinothrips vespiformis | Wolbachia | | `` | ` | Arakaki (2001a) |
| Heliothrips haemorrhoidalis Hercinothrips femoralis | Wolbachia Wolbachia | | >> | | Pintureau <i>et al.</i> (1999b) Pintureau <i>et al.</i> (1999b) |
| SUBPHYLUM CHELICERATA | | | | | |
| CLASS ARACHNIDA Subclass Arachnida | | | | | |
| Order Prostigmata Superfamily Tetranychoidea Family Tetranychidae | | | | | |
| Bryobia graminum B. kissophila | Wolbachia Wolbachia | | >>' | | Weeks & Breeuwer (2001) Weeks & Breeuwer (2001) |
| B. neopraetiosa R. nraetiosa | Wolbachia Wolbachia | Anomictic | ` | | Weeks & Breeuwer (2001) Waaks & Braanwar (2001) |
| E. praeriosa B. rubrioculus | Wolbachia | Apomicaio | • | | Weeks & Breeuwer (2001) |
| $B. \mathrm{sp.} X$ Family Tenuipalpidae | Wolbachia | Apomictic | ` ` ` ` ` ` ` ` ` ` ` ` ` ` ` ` ` ` ` | | Weeks & Breeuwer (2001) |
| Brevipalpus phoenicis | CFB group | Haploid | ` ` ` ` ` ` ` ` ` ` ` ` ` ` ` ` ` ` ` | ` | Weeks et al. (2001) |
| SUBPHYLUM CRUSTACEA | | | | | |
| CLASS OSTRACODA Subclass Podocopia | | | | | |
| Order Podocopida Superfamily Cypridoidea Family Cyprididae Heterocypris incongruens | <i>د</i> . | | ` | ` | Vandekerckhove (1998); Vandekerckhove (2001) |
| PHYLUM NEMATODA | | | | | |
| CLASS ENOPLEA Subclass Enoplia | | | | | |
| Order Dorylaimida Family Longidoridae | | | | | |
| Xiphinema americana | Xiphinematobacter americani | er | ` | > | $Vandekerckhove\ et\ al.\ (2000)$ |
| X. brevicollum | Xi. brevicollum | | ` | > | Vandekerckhove et al. (2000); Coomans et al. (2000) |
| X. $rivesi$ | Xi. revesi | | ` | > | Vandekerckhove et al. (2000) |
| | | | | | |

Werren (1993) used 2% lacmoid stain to visualize them in wasp eggs. Eggs of field-collected thelytokous species examined in this way appeared spotted, whereas those from naturally sexual races lacked the dark-staining microorganisms in their cytoplasm. Similarly, staining of eggs from thelytokous and cured strains of *Trichogramma* showed that eggs of the former were infected with numerous bacterial cells, whilst these were absent from the latter.

The microorganisms in thelytokous *Trichogramma* species were subsequently identified as *Wolbachia* by sequence analysis. All parthenogenesis-inducing microorganisms were found to be closely related to cytoplasmic-incompatibility bacteria found in diverse insect taxa including beetles (Coleoptera), butterflies (Lepidoptera), flies (Diptera), spider mites (Prostigmata) and woodlice (Isopoda) (Rousset *et al.*, 1992; Stouthamer *et al.*, 1993; Braig *et al.*, 2002).

The induction of thelytoky by *Wolbachia* has now been found in a wide range of micro-Hymenoptera. It occurs in 12 parasitoid families and one species from the sawfly family Tenthredinidae (Stouthamer, 1997; Braig *et al.*, 2002).

Two forms of thelytoky are recognized in Hymenoptera - 'revertible/reversible or microbeassociated thelytoky' and 'non-revertible/irreversible thelytoky' (Stouthamer & Kazmer, 1994). In microorganism-associated thelytoky, Wolbachia cause parthenogenesis and the removal of the microbes by antibiotics or high-temperature treatment induces the production of males. In non-revertible parthenogenesis, microbes are not present and neither temperature nor antibiotic treatments cause a reversion to arrhenotoky (Stouthamer et al., 1990b; Stouthamer & Werren, 1993). However over time, more and more cases have been detected where the outcome of antibiotic treatment covers the whole range from a clearcut appearance of functional males to nothing more than a 'hard to interpret' increase in egg mortality. Since attempts to re-establish sexual lines have failed in all but one genus, most Wolbachia-induced cases of thelytoky are actually irreversible. Therefore, it might be clearer to only distinguish between microbial or cytoplasmic-induced and non-microbial or nuclearinduced parthenogenesis.

The sexual functioning of antibiotic-induced females and males in micro-Hymenoptera ranges widely. Australian parthenogenetic forms of *Eretmocerus mundus* Mercet (arrhenotokous in the rest of the world) are able to produce sperm and inseminate females, but fertilization leading to viable egg development does not appear to occur (De Barro & Hart, 2001). This is also reported in *Aphytis lingnanensis* Compere and *A. diaspidis* (Howard; Zchori-Fein *et al.*, 1995) and in the egg parasitoid *Telenomus nawai* Ashmead (Arakaki, Noda & Yamagishi, 2000). These are differ-

ent to the situation found in Encarsia formosa (Zchori-Fein, Roush & Hunter, 1992) where no insemination is observed despite sperm being produced by males. Further, in Apoanagyrus diversicornus (Howard) males from cured females can be successfully mated with sexual females, but not with cured thelytokous females (Pijls, van Steenbergen & van Alphen, 1996). It has been suggested that, after a considerable period of time, the accumulation of mutations in the genes governing sexuality as well as various behavioural and physical pre-zygotic barriers may arise to make thelytoky irreversible (Zchori-Fein et al., 1992). In the case of Muscidifurax uniraptor Kogan & Legner, these reproductive barriers have now been more closely characterized. During the time of Wolbachia-induced thelytoky, genes for the maturation of sperm, for the mating behaviour of females and for a major muscle in the female sperm reservoir, the spermatheca, have been lost (Gottlieb & Zchori-Fein, 2001).

In all cases of Wolbachia-induced parthenogenesis, apart from Trichogramma, the infection has gone to fixation in the population. Although curing the parasitoid of Wolbachia restores male and female production, either the sons, or more usually the daughters, are unable or unwilling to mate, and so arrhenotokous lines are not established (Stouthamer, 1997; Gottlieb & Zchori-Fein, 2001). Interestingly, Wolbachiainduced thelytokous females of Trichogramma pretiosum Riley and T. deion Pinto & Oatman can and will mate with sexual males and the sperm is utilized to fertilize some of their eggs. These fertilized eggs give rise to females whose genome consists of one set of chromosomes from each parent (Stouthamer & Kazmer, 1994). In many populations of parasitoid Hymenoptera, thelytokous and arrhenotokous conspecifics occur sympatrically (Orphanides & Gonzalez, 1970; Rössler & DeBach, 1973; Stouthamer et al., 1990a; Stouthamer et al., 1990b; Chen, Kfir & Chen, 1992) and sometimes rare males are found in infected populations (Plantard et al., 1998, 1999). In contrast to this, parthenogenesis-inducing Wolbachia infections in Trichogramma kaykai Pinto, Platner & Stouthamer, populations are at a low level and parthenogenetic individuals coexist and interbreed with uninfected conspecifics. Stouthamer et al. (2001) found that a male-biasing sex-ratio distorter, a parasitic B-chromosome, analogous to the 'paternal sex ratio' chromosome psr in the jewel wasp Nasonia vitripennis (Beukeboom & Werren, 2000), causes females to produce all-male offspring, preventing the fixation of parthenogenetic-inducing Wolbachia. It achieves this by converting the diploid fertilized egg into a male haploid egg by destroying the paternal set of chromosomes. This extremely selfish genetic element enhances its own transmission by preventing any outcrossing (Stouthamer et al., 2001).

Does bacterial induced parthenogenesis come at a price? Since most infected thelytokous lines cannot revert back to sex this is not so easy to answer. When Muscidifurax uniraptor is treated with antibiotics at immature stages, no difference in adult fecundity or fitness are found between treated and non-treated lines (Horjus & Stouthamer, 1995; Zchori-Fein, Gottlieb & Coll, 2000). However, any effects on the egg or early larval stages cannot be assessed in this species. and that is where the cost of infection ultimately might lie. For Trichogramma species, Wolbachiainfected thelytokous and non-infected arrhentokous lines can be compared directly. Only one third of the eggs of Wolbachia-infected strains develop compared to more than 78% of the non-infected strains. Half of the mortality stems from an arrest in the mitotic stage even 48 h after oviposition, whereas non-infected embryos develop a cellular blastoderm after six hours (Tagami, Miura & Stouthamer, 2001).

TRANSMISSION

The final proof that microorganisms are indeed causal agents of thelytokous parthenogeneocity is the transmission experiment. The first attempt had been reported by Grenier et al. (1998). These authors transferred purified Wolbachia from thelytokous Trichogramma pretiosum by microinjection into pupae of an uninfected species, T. dendrolimi Matsumura. The infection was still present 26 generations after the transfer, although only 4% of virgin females had between one and five females in their offspring at that time. Van Meer & Stouthamer (1999) encountered a similar fate when they attempted to transfer Wolbachia of parthenogenetic haplodiploid Muscidifurax uniraptor into diplodiploid Drosophila simulans that are not adapted to thelytoky. No parthenogenesis was observed in the host and transmission rates of the bacterium decreased after each generation until it was 0% in the seventh generation. Interspecific transfers of Wolbachia resulted in some interesting phenotypes. Wolbachia from the mosquito Aedes albopictus (Skuse) caused a new crossing type and bidirectional incompatibility in *Drosophila simulans* Sturtevant (Braig et al., 1994). Bouchon, Rigaud & Juchault (1998) reported that Wolbachia from Porcellio pruinosus Brandt (Crustacea: Isopoda) feminized Porcellio dilatatus petiti Vandel, the natural infection of which is associated with cytoplasmic incompatibility, demonstrating that a single host species can express different phenotypes with different Wolbachia strains. The most exciting transinfection of Wolbachia was accomplished by Fuji et al. (2001). They demonstrated that Wolbachia harboured by the adzuki bean borer, Ostrina scapulalis (Walker) (Lepidoptera) induced male-killing in the Mediterranean flour moth, Ephestia kuehniella Keller, which is naturally infected with a strain expressing cytoplasmic incompatibility. In its natural host, the adzuki bean borer, Wolbachia causes the conversion of genetic males into functional females (feminization). Horizontal transfer of Wolbachia has been shown from Wolbachia-infected Drosophila simulans hosts to its parasitoid wasp, Leptopilina boulardi (Barbotin, Carton & Kelner-Pillault), but the infections were lost in subsequent generations (Heath et al., 1999). In a like manner, a survey of 82 insect species from two temperate host–parasitoid communities did not show any evidence of horizontal transfer of Wolbachia between hosts and parasitoids (West et al., 1998).

Lastly, Huigens et al. (2000) were able to show that Wolbachia-associated parthenogenesis is indeed infectious. Females of the parasitoid wasp Trichogramma kaykai in populations in Last Chance Canyon in the Mojave Desert of southern California are from 6 to 26% infected with Wolbachia (Stouthamer & Kazmer, 1994). The eggs of two T. kaykai females can share and mature in one and the same egg of a butterfly or moth host. Using a microsatellite marker, Huigens et al. (2000) were able to trace each offspring back to its mother. When a moth egg was parasitized by eggs from both a Wolbachia-infected and an uninfected female, 21 instances of horizontal transmission were recorded in 56 all-female broods. Intraspecifically, parthenogenesis-inducing Wolbachia are transferred at an unexpectedly high frequency.

Similar sequence comparisons between *Wolbachia* from different parthenogenetic host species and lineages suggest that the ability to induce parthenogenesis has either evolved on numerous occasions in *Wolbachia* or that the vast majority of *Wolbachia* strains have been lost (Gottlieb *et al.*, 1998; Plantard *et al.*, 1999; van Meer, Witteveldt & Stouthamer, 1999). These analyses are questioned with two recent reports about recombination between *Wolbachia* strains (Jiggins *et al.*, 2001; Werren & Bartos, 2001). The interspecies transmission of *Wolbachia*, which equals the *de novo* infection of a species, is very likely to be an extremely rare event, perhaps best measured on an evolutionary timescale.

CYTOLOGY OF INFECTED PARTHENOGENS

Because parthenogenesis is a very widespread phenomenon within the animal kingdom, it is natural that cytological questions connected with it have been much studied, as demonstrated by the very extensive associated literature. However, only two publications describe in detail the cytogenetics of parthenogenetic wasps known to be infected with *Wolbachia* (Stille & Dävring, 1980; Stouthamer & Kazmer, 1994). The

cytological mechanism of parthenogenesis induced by Wolbachia has been determined in three species of Trichogramma parasitoids (T. deion, T. nr deion and T. pretiosum) but the molecular biology remains unknown. Normal meiosis in eggs was observed (with recombination) resulting in a haploid pronucleus consisting of five chromosomes and a total of 15 polar chromosomes. This stage was followed, after an interphase, by a mitotic metaphase in which five sets of metaphase chromosomes were visible. During the ensuing anaphase, chromosomes failed to segregate without a clear spindle formation, resulting in a nucleus containing ten chromosomes, five homozygous pairs. Throughout this process, the 15 polar chromosomes remained at the periphery of the egg. From then on, normal mitotic divisions continued (Stouthamer & Kazmer, 1994). In normal arrhenotokous gamete formation, the haploid cells formed after meiosis undergo two further mitotic divisions to form four haploid cells from each meiotic product, thereby producing twice as many haploid eggs as conspecific infected individuals do (Quicke, 1997).

Gamete duplication would normally result in purely homozygous offspring, but it is clear, at least in Trichogramma, that should a sperm from a male fuse with the egg before fusion of the first mitotic nuclei, it can prevent that fusion and a normal heteroparental zygote will develop. Thus, Stouthamer & Kazmer (1994) have shown that Wolbachia-induced thelytoky does not necessarily mean that populations will tend to homozygosity and that gene flow between thelytokous and arrhenotokous individuals can occur. The gene flow to thelytokous lines will also remove or reduce the presumed long-term costs of asexual reproduction, i.e. the accumulation of mutations via Muller's ratchet and the inability to adapt to changing environments (Muller, 1964; Stouthamer & Kazmer, 1994). Gamete duplication has also been confirmed as the cytological basis for parthenogenesis in the gall wasp, Diplolepis rosae (L.) (Stille & Dävring, 1980). Van Meer et al. (1995) later demonstrated, using 16S rDNA sequences, that the wasp was infected with Wolbachia. Examinations conducted by Legner (1985) showed that female Muscidifurax uniraptor achieves cytological diploidy also through endomitosis. It is also possible that Wolbachia can cause other cytological distortions. For example, in Aphytis mytilaspidis (Le Baron) where Wolbachia is thought to be responsible for thelytoky (Stouthamer, 1997), meiosis up to the beginning of anaphase was shown to be normal (Rössler & DeBach, 1973). From that stage on meiosis became unclear and two possible avenues were given for the peripheral nucleus: (1) completion of anaphase followed by endomitosis, or (2) the anaphase may or may not be completed, but the two anaphase groups of haploid products reunite to restore a diploid chromosome number. The female offspring of virgin heterozygous females consisted mainly of females homozygous for the markers, but a number of heterozygous offspring was also found, indicating fusion between the pronucleus and a polar body at some stage (Stouthamer, 1997). It was concluded that the cytogenetic mechanism is most likely terminal fusion (Rössler & DeBach, 1973).

A number of factors have been associated with microorganism-induced thelytoky in haplodiploids. Hurst (1993) proposed that typical species vulnerable to particular mechanisms of cytoplasmic distorters easily manipulated sex-determining/ have an sex-ratio-determining system. That is because the sex ratio distorters presumably can only achieve simple manipulations. Looking at the intriguing physiology and pathogenesis of some microbes and the diversity of Wolbachia-induced phenotypes, this view is increasingly difficult to hold. Also, the greater the plasticity in sex ratio and sex determination, the greater will be a species' vulnerability to selfish sex ratio distorters. Werren (1997) states the suitability of haplodiploids for invasion by parthenogenesis-inducing Wolbachia, which restore diploidy by gamete duplication. Since gamete duplication results in complete homozygosity, it would expose recessive deleterious mutations normally present in out-breeding diploid species. In contrast, haplodiploids have considerably lower frequencies of deleterious recessives, due to their purging in the male (haploid) sex.

The distribution of thelytoky among different Hymenoptera taxa appears to be extensive. Luck, Stouthamer & Nunney (1993) report that at least 270 cases exist exclusive of the 2000 cases of Cynipoidea. Most of these have a haplodiploid sex determination mechanism. However, some species have single-locus complementary sex determination (CSD) in which fertilized (diploid) zygotes develop as females if the sex locus is heterozygous, but as sterile diploid males if it is homozygous (Cook, 1993; Cook & Crozier, 1995). Since the Wolbachia act by preventing the first cleavage division of a haploid egg, rendering the zygote diploid, this would lead species with CSD to sterile diploid males. The incompatibility of CSD with thelytoky via gamete dublication has been proposed as an explanation for the apparent absence of parthenogenesis-inducing Wolbachia in the Ichneumonoidea (Cook & Butcher, 1999). Diploid males in Hymenoptera have been additionally reported in ants, several species of bees and sawflies (Bull, 1983; Luck et al., 1993; Quicke, 1997). As discussed by Cook & Butcher (1999), gamete duplication could in theory induce thelytoky in all arthropod species except those that have sex determination by female heterogamety or analogous systems. The presumption that thelytoky induced by microorganisms is restricted to male haploid species is based on the absence of a requirement for any fertilization or syngamy-associated checkpoints, or a requirement for paternally derived centrioles to derive astral microtubules (Werren, 1997; Cook & Butcher, 1999). It is generally thought that the male gamete is essential for the formation of the functional zygotic centrosome, which in turn allows duplicatation and organization of the first mitotic spindle. However, during parthenogenetic development the centrosome must be of maternal origin and egg cytoplasm must contain all the material necessary to form a zygotic centrosome. To clarify the reconstruction of a functional centrosome in Wolbachia-infected parthenogenetic eggs, Riparbelli et al. (1998) performed an ultrastructural study in which they confirmed/ demonstrated that the cytoplasm of Muscidifurax uniraptor eggs does indeed contain a pool of inactive centrosomal precursor proteins that transform nucleate microtubules into well-defined asters containing centrioles after parthenogenetic activation. In the hymenopterous parasitoid, Nasonia vitripennis (Walker) (Hymenoptera: Pteromalidae) unfertilized male eggs use maternal centrosomes whereas fertilized female eggs use the paternal centrioles brought in with the sperm and peri-centriole material to form centrosome. This is the first case in which egg cells switch between centrioles (Tram & Sullivan, 2000; Karr, 2000).

INFECTED NON-HYMENOPTERAN PARTHENOGENS

Parthenogenetic thrips and haplodiploid mites were considered to be particularly important groups in searching for parthenogenesis-inducing *Wolbachia* (Werren, 1997; Cook & Butcher, 1999). Werren had already found *Wolbachia* in a parthenogenetic weevil, *Aramigus tesselatus* (Say) (Coleoptera: Curculionidae: Naupactini) in 1995. Curing with antibiotics or heat treatment was not possible because the population turned out to be triploid, but evidence of *Wolbachia* has not been found in related sexual lineages (Braig *et al.*, 2002).

During investigations on buprestid beetles and male-killing, Lawson et al. (2001) detected low levels of parthenogenetic production in 29% of field-collected females. A novel *Rickettsia* was found, called Btess (Brachys tessellatus), most closely related to a tick-associated bacterium and a pea-aphid Rickettsia, but also related to a Rickettsia that causes male-killing in ladybird beetle species. The field surveys revealed highly distorted sex ratios in some populations of Brachys tessellatus, ranging from 1.3 to 6 females per male. This was explained by possible selection for parthenogenetic development when males are scarce. Although the usual tetracycline treatment of the par-

thenogenetic females used in the experiment was conducted, males were introduced to the females, leaving unclear what the role of bacteria was in the parthenogenetic reproduction.

Pintureau et al. (1999b) fulfilled the anticipation of Wolbachia in thelytokous Thysanoptera. They discovered the bacterium using PCR in two thrip species collected from Portugal and France. Once again, further substantiation of the role of Wolbachia in the species was left for the future, and therefore could be considered hypothetical. Nevertheless, in a recent publication by Arakaki, Miyoshi & Noda (2001a), the causative agent of the thelytoky in predatory thrips from Japan was indeed shown to be Wolbachia. Males of Franklinothrips vespiformis Crawford were produced after the thelytokous females were exposed to a high temperature (35°C) at the pupal stage and after treatment of newly emerged adults with tetracycline. Sequencing 16S rDNA revealed the identity of the bacteria. The males successfully mated and transmitted motile sperm to the spermathecae of females, but the females continued producing all-female progeny.

A speciose genus of haplodiploid phytophagous mites, the *Bryobia*, exists within the family of spider mites (Tetranychidae). Approximately 100 species have been described, most of them thought to reproduce by thelytokous parthenogenesis (Norton et al., 1993). Weeks & Breeuwer (2001) screened six Bryobia species for Wolbachia using ftsZ (cell-cycle gene) primers and investigated the effect of the infection by curing two of the species with tetracycline. Most usefully, they used microsatellites for comparing genotypes of adults and their offspring to assess the mode of parthenogenesis. Predictably, Wolbachia infection was found in every individual tested and accordingly antibiotic-treated females produced significantly more male progeny than the untreated control. Infected individuals were observed to copulate with cured males but no genetic recombination was evident in the offspring, which all had identical genotypes to their mothers. The mode of parthenogenesis was found to be functionally apomictic since the maternal genotypes of three microsatellite loci tested passed unchanged to all progeny (mothers were heterozygous). This is significant, because it suggests that parthenogenesisinducing Wolbachia might not be functionally restricted to haplodiploids, however, Bryobia species are haplodiploid.

Weeks et al. (2001) continued their studies with the phytophagous mite Brevipalpus phoenicis (Geijskes) and unexpectedly came across an extraordinary phenomenon. They discovered that the species exists only in a female haploid state. Large amounts of intracellular bacteria were noticed in the eggs, but in this case it was not identified as Wolbachia. Instead, after sequencing 16S rDNA, its closest relative was an

undescribed endosymbiontic bacterium belonging to the phylum the Cytophaga-Flexibacter-Bacteroides (CFB group) found in the tick, *Ixodes scapularis* Say. Tetracycline treatment led to the production of males. Weeks and colleagues suggested that infection of a sexual haplodiploid ancestor with feminizing intracellular bacteria caused haploid eggs that normally developed as males to develop into females. The authors deliberated that similar mechanisms that cause feminization in the isopod, Armadillidium vulgare Latreille, could be involved in B. phoenicis. In the former, Wolbachia induces feminization by blocking the formation of the androgenic gland responsible for male differentiation (Rousset et al., 1992; Martin et al., 1999). Whether or not diploid sexual females can be generated in B. phoenicis has yet to be demonstrated. It would also be worthwhile seeing if this bacterium is involved in thelytoky induction in two closely related species, B. obovatus Donnadieu and B. californicus (Banks). By successfully infecting the closest sexual relative, the haplodiploid B. russulus (Boisduval) with bacteria from B. phoenicis, it might be possible to gain the first empirical data on the relative importance of somatic and germline deleterious mutations for the maintenance of diploidy in animals (Weeks, Marec & Breeuwer, 2001; Otto & Jarne, 2001).

Despite the fact that research had long ago been recommended by Nur (1972) into the mode of reproduction in haplodiploid soft scale insects (Coccoidea: Homoptera), on a suggestion that it would prove rewarding, no work has been conducted/published to date. In a detailed study, he observed that some of the uninseminated females of Parthenolecanium (Lecanium) cerasifex Fitch (Homoptera: Coccidae) produced only female offspring in the presence of needle-like bacterial symbionts, whereas other females lacking this bacterium produced male offspring only. He cleared the puzzle by suggesting that L. cerasifex females belonged to at least two races: a diploid arrhenotokous race and an obligate automictic thelytokous one. Diploidy is restored by a fusion of the first haploid cleavage nuclei.

It is now clear that the ability to induce thelytokous parthenogenesis is neither a unique property of *Wolbachia* nor even of the Proteobacteria. The finding of an undescribed vertically transmitted bacterium in association with thelytokous parthenogenetic reproduction in *Encarsia*, a genus of parasitoid wasps (Hymenoptera: Aphelinidae), further substantiates the above statement (Zchori-Fein *et al.*, 2001). Six species of this genus are infected with an '*Encarsia* bacterium (EB)'. The 16S rDNA sequence closely matches with the CFB group and the bacterium in the haploid female mite. Furthermore, analysis of the different EB sequences from four not-closely related infected *Encarsia* populations and one infected sexual popula-

tion showed a very high degree of sequence identity (99.7%), indicating horizontal transmission. Rifampicin treatment affected the oviposition behaviour of the *Encarsia pergandiella* Howard females, which laid significantly fewer eggs than the untreated wasps. The authors concluded that EB was the most likely cause of the parthenogenesis and that the bacterium might have multiple reproductive effects like *Wolbachia*, since one of the populations was bisexual. This conclusion is corroborated by previous study of Hunter (1999) who demonstrated that thelytokous *E. hispida* produced male progeny after been fed with antibiotics.

The springtail, Folsomia candida (Willem) (Collembola) represents the first significant case of a diplodiploid species found to reproduce by Wolbachia-induced thelytoky. In their search for novel endocytobioses, Vandekerckhove et al. (1999), using transmission electron microscopy, PCR and fluorescence microscopy with DAPI staining, detected Wolbachia in this species. DAPI fluorescence microcopy revealed, as expected for diplodiploid parthenogenetic Wolbachia hosts, that uninfected eggs from cured virgins aborted because of haploidy. However, complete elimination of parthenogenesis by antibiotics was not achieved. Using electron microscopy, it was observed that during Wolbachia-induced parthenogenesis, at the end of the anaphase of the first cleavage, diploidy was restored through non-disjunction, or fusion of the two haploid division products. Further mitoses continued normally, giving rise to 100% homozygous females (Vandekerckhove, 2001). This is concordant with Stouthamer & Kazmer's (1994) findings that gamete duplication is the mechanism for diploidy restoration in Wolbachia-induced parthenogenesis.

Psocoptera is yet another non-hymenopteran order where a Wolbachia-like ricketsial bacterium is associated with parthenogenesis. Liposcelis bostrychophila Bondonnel (Psocoptera: Liposcelididae), a storedproduct pest, is parthenogenetic. Intracellular bacteria have been detected in its oocytes with electron microscopy (Yusuf et al., 2000). Thelytoky was reported in 13 of the 32 families in Mockford's (1971) review of parthenogenesis in psocids. Among the small subset of psocids that are pests, L. bostrychophila is the only species that is parthenogenetic (Mockford, 1971). Cytological studies conducted by Goss (1954) suggest that there is only a single maturation division in the oocyte (ordinarily mitosis). This division is an equatorial one, so that there is no chromosome synapses and no chromosome reduction, thus preventing new gene combinations. Nevertheless, in their study of allozyme patterns among 111 British populations of L. bostrychophila, Ali & Turner (2001) found 47 distinct genotypes.

An unexpected discovery was made when endosymbiotic bacteria associated with parthenogenesis were

detected in plant nematodes (Vandekerckhove et al., 2000). Species of the Xiphinema americanum group (Longidoridae), X. americanum Cobb, X. rivesi Dalmasso and X. brevicollum Lordello & da Costa, all reproduce by thelytokous parthenogenesis (Coomans, Vandekerckhove & Claeys, 2000), each harbouring their own specific, maternally inherited verrucomicrobial endosymbionts. The first cytoplasmic species identified among the Verrucomicrobia, these were described on the basis of transmission electron microscopy (TEM) and 16S rDNA sequence analysis and named *Xiphine*matobacter americani, X. rivesi and X. brevicolli. The microorganisms were only found in the gut epithelium and in the ovaries of *X. americanum* group specimens. In females they prevail in the ovarial wall cells, while oogonia and primary oocytes are scarcely populated. The endosymbionts in the egg move to the pole where the gut primordial cell will arise, so that all bacteria populate the intestinal epithelium of juvenile worms. During the moult from last juvenile stage to adult female, the bacteria concentrate around the developing ovaries. The endosymbionts become enclosed in the when thev start ripening oocvtes to grow (Vandekerckhove, 2001). This is different from Wolbachia, which invade the gonadal primordium directly (Hadfield & Axton, 1999).

Sequence divergence between the three bactera suggest that the infection in the common ancestor of the Xiphinema species would have originated some 100-140 million years ago (Vandekerchkhove et al., 2000). It is still unclear whether the bacteria have a role in the metabolic activity of their hosts or whether they might be the driving force behind the thelytokous parthenogenesis. Curiously, the verrucomicrobial endosymbionts are only found in parthenogenetic Xiphinema species belonging to the X. americanum group, all the other Xiphinema species, sexual or parthenogenetic, are free of endosymbionts (Vandekerchkhove et al., 2000). Lastly, ostracod crustaceans represent the latest addition to the taxa where parthenogenesis and intracellular microbes are intertwined. Using transmission electron microscopy, unidentified intracellular bacteria have been seen in great numbers in the gonadal cells of the Ostracod, Heterocypris incongruens (Ramdohr) (Vandekerckhove, 1998). DAPI staining showed the preference of the bacterium for superficial tissues associated with the mantle (Vandekerckhove et al., 2000).

SYMBIONTS AND CYCLICAL PARTHENOGENESIS

Soon after the discovery of microbial-induced parthenogenesis, Stouthamer, Luck and Hamilton speculated that a moderate heatwave might uncouple the bacterial-induced parthenogenesis without actually

killing the endosymbiont. They foresaw a scenario where a temporary controlled incapacitation of the endosymbiont without eliminating it could evolve into a potentially powerful adaptation for the host, affording entry to facultative or cyclic parthenogenesis (Stouthamer *et al.*, 1990a). If sex ratio distorting symbionts had been instrumental in the evolution of cyclic parthenogenesis, one would expect that the two major clades expressing cyclic parthenogenesis would also harbour reminicent lineages that are still all sexual. This is not the case (Bell, 1982).

The only study so far addressing this question was conducted on oak gallwasps (Hymenoptera; Cynipidae, tribe Cynipini), aiming to establish the prevalance of *Wolbachia* infection and its phenotypic consequences within the cyclically parthenogenetic Cynipini. Here, it was shown that there was no correlation between life-cycle structure and the infection status (Rokas *et al.*, 2002). Also, preliminary surveys of aphid species that exist as both cyclic and obligate parthenogenetic populations have not revealed any involvement of *Wolbachia*. The broader association between endosymbionts and cyclic parthenogenesis needs further investigation.

SYMBIONTS AND HAPLODIPLOIDY

The production of all-male progenies has been a puzzle for some time. Virgin females of the hymenopteran spider egg parasitoid, Baeus achaearaneus (Loiacono) (Hymenoptera: Scelionidae) produce all-male progenies in a close inbreeding system. It has been suggested that these males serve as prey for emerging spiderlings to secure access to future spider eggs (Valerio, 1976). Wolbachia is not only known to induce parthenogenesis in haplodiploid species. Several strains of Wolbachia can also cause cytoplasmic incompatibility. Whereas cytoplasmic incompatibility will lead to embryonic mortality in diplodiploid species, it will generate all-male progenies in haplodiploid species. Considering the implications of close inbreeding populations, W.D. Hamilton speculated that maternally inherited endosymbionts might be involved in the origins of haplodiploidy (Hamilton, 1993). He suggested that the development of haploids as males is essentially a counter-adaptation by the host to the elimination by endosymbionts of all-maledetermining elements from the genome. Evidence for this hypothesis is still very scarce; however, the idea is getting increasing attention (Normark, Jordell & Farrell, 1999; Braig et al., 2002). Peleg & Norris (1972) describe a beetle, Xyleborus ferrugineus (F.) (Coleoptera: Scolytidae) in which an endosymbiotic bacterium has taken over the role of the sperm in activating the egg cell. The direct induction of arrhenotokous male-production by endosymbionts seems

counter-intuitive, and may have the simple explanation that the bacteria provide needed nutrients for oviposition. The beetles in this clade are haplodiploid and exhibit regular sib mating with highly female-biased sex ratios (Normark *et al.*, 1999). Normark and colleagues argue that microbial control of arrhenotoky may explain why none of the over 1300 species in this arrhenotokous clade have ever evolved anything close to 50:50 sex ratios.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This work is supported by funding from the Biotechnology and Biological Research Council (5/S11854), the Natural Environment Research Council (GR3/13199) and the European Commission (EUWOL, QLRT-1999–31079).

REFERENCES

- Ali N, Turner B. 2001. Allozyme polymorphism and variability in permethrin tolerance in British populations of the parthenogenetic stored product pest *Liposcelis bostrychophila* (Liposcelididae, Psocoptera). *Journal of Stored Products Research* 37: 111–125.
- Arakaki N, Miyoshi T, Noda H. 2001a. Wolbachia-mediated parthenogenesis in the predatory thrips Franklonothrips vespiformis (Thysanoptera: Insecta). Proceedings of the Royal Society of London B 268: 1011–1016.
- Arakaki N, Tsuyoshi O, Hiroaki N. 2001b. Parthenogenesis induced by Wolbachia. Gronotoma micromorpha (Hymenoptera: Eucoilidae). Entomological Science 4: 9–5.
- Arakaki N, Noda H, Yamagishi K. 2000. Wolbachia-induced parthenogenesis in the egg parasitoid Telenomus nawai. Entomologia Experimentalis et Applicata 96: 177–184.
- Bell G. 1982. The masterpiece of nature: the evolution and genetics of sexuality. London: Croom-Helm.
- Beukeboom LW, Werren JH. 2000. The paternal-sex-ratio (PSR) chromosome in natural populations of *Nasonia* (Hymenoptera: Chalcidoidea). *Journal of Evolutionary Biology* 13: 967–975.
- Bouchon D, Rigaud T, Juchault P. 1998. Evidence for widespread *Wolbachia* infection in isopod crustaceans: molecular identification and host feminization. *Proceedings of the Royal Society of London B* 265: 1081–1090.
- Bourtzis K, Braig HR. 1999. The many faces of Wolbachia.
 In: Raoult D, Brouqui P, eds. Rickettsiae and rickettsial diseases at the turn of the third millennium. Paris: Elsevier, 199–219.
- **Bowen WR, Stern VM. 1966.** Effect of temperature on the production of males and sexual mosaics in a uniparental race of *Trichogramma semifumatum* (Hymenoptera: Trichogrammatidae). *Annals of the Entomological Society of America* **59:** 823–834.
- Braig HR, Guzman H, Tesh RB, O'Neill SL. 1994. Replacement of the natural *Wolbachia* symbiont of *Drosophila simulans* with a mosquito counterpart. *Nature* 367: 453–455.

- Braig HR, Turner BD, Normark BB, Stouthamer R. 2002.

 Microorganism-induced parthenogenesis. In: Hughes RN,
 ed. Reproductive biology of invertebrates. Volume XI:
 Progress in asexual reproduction. New Delhi: Oxford & IBH publishing, 1–62.
- Braig HR, Yan G. 2002. The spread of genetic constructs in natural insect populations. In: Letourneau DK, Burrows BE, eds. Genetically engineered organisms: assessing environmental and human health effects. Boca Raton: CRC Press, 251–314.
- **Bull JJ. 1983.** Evolution of sex determining mechanisms. London: The Benjamin/Cummings Publishing Co.
- Cabello-Garcia T, Vargas-Piqueras P. 1985. Temperature as a factor influencing the form of reproduction of *Trichogramma cordubensis*. *Zeitschrift für Angewandte Entomologie* 100: 434–441.
- Chen B-H, Kfir R, Chen CN. 1992. The thelytokous Trichogramma chilonis in Taiwan. Entomologia Experimentalis et Applicata 65: 195–198.
- Cook JM. 1993. Sex determination in the Hymenoptera: a review of models and evidence. *Heredity* 71: 421–435.
- Cook JM, Butcher RDJ. 1999. The transmission and effects of Wolbachia bacteria in parasitoids. Research in Population Ecology 41: 15–28.
- Cook JM, Crozier RH. 1995. Sex determination and population biology in the Hymenoptera. Trends in Ecology and Evolution 10: 281–286.
- Coomans A, Vandekerckhove TTM, Claeys M. 2000. Transovarial transmission of symbionts in *Xiphinema brevicollum* (Nematoda: Longidoridae). *Nematology* 2: 443–449.
- Czarnetzki AB, Tebbe CC. 2002. Three parthenogenetic Collembola-hosts for Wolbachia. Second International Wolbachia Conference, July 9-15, 2002 Kolymbari, Crete, Greece 97
- Darwish A, Brooks WM, Moore CB. 1992. Ultrastructural observations and taxonomic considerations of a microsporidium of the larch sawfly, *Pristiphora erichsonii*: conspecificity with *Thelohania pristiphorae* and *Pleistophora* sp. *Journal of Invertebrate Pathology* 59: 178–185.
- De Barro PJ, Hart PJ. 2001. Antibiotic curing of parthenogenesis in *Eretmocerus mundus* (Australian parthenogenic form). *Entomologia Experimentalis et Applicata* 99: 225-220
- Eskafi FM, Legner EF. 1974. Fecundity, development, and diapause in *Hexacola* sp. near *websteri*, a parasite of *Hippelates* Eye Gnats. *Annals of the Entomological Society of America* 67: 769–771.
- **Flanders SE. 1965.** On the sexuality and sex ratios of Hymenopterous populations. *American Naturalist* **99:** 489–494
- Fuji Y, Kageyama D, Hoshizaki S, Ishikawa H, Sasaki T. 2001. Transfection of Wolbachia. Lepidoptera: the feminizer of the adzuki bean borer Ostrinia scapulalis causes male killing in the Mediterranean flour moth Ephestia kuehniella. Proceedings of the Royal Society of London B 268: 855–859.
- Giorgini M. 2001. Induction of males in thelytokous populations of *Encarsia meritoria* and *Encarsia protransvena*: a systematic tool. *BioControl* 46: 427-438.

- Gordh G, Lacey L. 1976. Biological studies of Plagiomerus diaspidis, a primary internal parasite of diaspidid scale insects. Proceedings of the Entomological Society of Washington 78: 132-144.
- Goss RJ. 1954. Ovarian development and oogenesis in the book louse, Liposcelis divergens Badonnel (Psocoptera, Liposcelidae). Annals of the Entomological Society of America 47: 190-207.
- Gottlieb Y, Zchori-Fein E. 2001. Irreversible thelytokous reproduction in Muscidifurax uniraptor. Entomologia Experimentalis et Applicata 100: 271-278.
- Gottlieb Y, Zchori-Fein E, Faktor O, Rosen D. 1998. Phylogenetic analysis of parthenogenesis-inducing Wolbachia in the genus Aphytis (Hymenoptera: Aphelinidae). Insect Molecular Biology 7: 393–396.
- Gottlieb Y, Zchori-Fein E, Karr TL. 2000. Encarsia pergandiella, asexual line, endosymbiont, 16S ribosomal RNA gene, partial sequence. GenBank AF 19783.
- Grenier S, Pintureau B, Heddi A, Lassablière CJ, Louis C, Khatchadourian C. 1998. Successful horizontal transfer of Wolbachia symbionts between Trichogramma wasps. Proceedings of the Royal Society of London B 265: 1441–1445.
- Hadfield SJ, Axton JM. 1999. Germ cells colonized by endosymbiotic bacteria. Nature 402: 482.
- **Hamilton WD. 1993.** Inbreeding in Egypt and in this book: a childish perspective. In: Thornhill NW, ed. The natural history of inbreeding and outbreeding: theoretical and empirical perspectives. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 429– 450.
- Heath BD, Butcher RDJ, Whitfield WGF, Hubbard SF. 1999. Horizontal transfer of Wolbachia between phylogenetically distant insect species by a naturally occurring mechanism. Current Biology 9: 313–316.
- Horjus M, Stouthamer R. 1995. Does infection with thelytoky-causing Wolbachia in the pre-adult and adult life stages influence the adult fecundity of Trichogramma deion and Muscidifurax raptor? Proceedings of the Section Experimental and Applied Entomology of the Netherlands Entomological Society (N E V) 6: 35-40.
- Huigens ME, Luck RF, Klaassen RHG, Maas MFP, Timmermans MJTN, Stouthamer R. 2000. Infectious parthenogenesis. Nature 405: 178-179.
- Hunter MS. 1999. The influence of parthenogenesis-inducing Wolbachia on the oviposition behaviour and sex-specifc devepmental requirements of autoparasitoid wasps. Journal of Evolutionary Biology 12: 735-741.
- Hurst LD. 1993. The incidences, mechanisms and evolution of cytoplasmic sex ratio distorters in animals. Biological Review 68: 121-193.
- Jiggins FM, von der Schulenburg HJG, Hurst GDD, Majerus MEN. 2001. Recombination confounds interpretations of Wolbachia evolution. Proceedings of the Royal Society of London B 268: 1423-1427.
- Karr TL. 2000. Centrosome inheritance: a central 'in-egg-ma' solved? Current Biology 11: R21-R24.
- Laraichi M. 1978. L'effet de hautes temperatures sur le taux sexuel de Ooencyrtus fecundus (Hymenoptera: Encyrtidae). Entomologia Experimentalis et Applicata 23: 237-242.

- Lawson ET, Mousseau TA, Klaper R, Hunter MD, Werren JH. 2001. Rickettsia associated with male-killing in a buprestid beetle. Heredity 86: 497-505.
- Legner EF. 1985. Effects of scheduled high temperature on male production in thelytokous Muscidifurax uniraptor (Hymenoptera: Pteromalidae). Canadian Entomologist 11:
- Luck RF, Stouthamer R, Nunney LP. 1993. Sex determination and sex ratio patterns in parasitic Hymenoptera. In: Wrench DL, Ebbert MA, eds. Evolution and diversity of sex ratio in insects and mites. New York: Chapman & Hall, 442-476.
- Martin G, Sorokine O, Moniatte M, Bulet P, Hetru C, Van Dorsselaer A. 1999. The structure of a glycosylated protein hormone responsible for sex determination in the isopod, Armadillidium vulgare. European Journal of Biochemistry **262:** 727–736.
- van Meer MMM, Stouthamer R. 1999. Cross-order transfer of Wolbachia from Muscidifurax uniraptor (Hymenopter: Pteromalidae) to Drosophila simulans (Diptera: Drosophilidae). Heredity 82: 163–169.
- van Meer MMM, van Kan FJPM, Breeuwer JAJ, Stouthamer R. 1995. Identification of symbionts associated with parthenogenesis in Encarsia formosa (Hymenoptera: Aphelinidae) and Diplolepis rosae (Hymenoptera: Cynipidae). Proceedings of the Section Experimental and Applied Entomology of the Netherlands Entomological Molecular Society (NEV) **6:** 81–86.
- van Meer MMM, Witteveldt J, Stouthamer R. 1999. Phylogeny on the arthropod endosymbiont Wolbachia based on the wsp gene. Insect Molecular Biology 8: 399-408.
- Mockford EL. 1971. Parthenogenesis in Psocids (Insecta: Psocoptera). American Zoologist 11: 327-339.
- Muller HJ. 1964. The relation of recombination to mutational advance. Mutation Research 1: 2-9.
- Normark BB, Jordal BH, Farrell BD. 1999. Origin of a haplodiploid beetle lineage. Proceedings of the Royal Society of London B 266: 2253-2259.
- Norton RA, Kethley JB, Johnston DE, O'Connor BM. 1993. Phylogenetic perspectives on genetic systems and reproductive modes of mites. In: Wrench DL, Ebbert MA, eds. Evolution and diversity of sex ratio in insects and mites. New York: Chapham & Hall. 8-99.
- Nur U. 1972. Diploid arrhenotoky and automictic thelytoky in soft scale insects. Chromosoma 39: 381-401.
- O'Neill SL, Hoffmann AA, Werren JH. 1997. Influential passengers, inherited microorganisms and arthropod reproduction. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Orphanides GM, Gonzalez D. 1970. Identity of a uniparental race of Trichogramma pretiosum (Hymenoptera: Trichogrammaidae). Annals of the Entomological Society of America 63: 1784–1785.
- Otto SP, Jarne P. 2001. Haploids hapless or happening? Science 292: 24-244.
- Peleg B, Norris D. 1972. Bacterial symbiote activation of insect parthenogenetic reproduction. Nature 236: 111-
- Pijls JWAM, van Steenbergen HJ, van Alphen JJM. 1996.

- Asexuality cured: the relations and differences between sexual and asexual *Apoanagyrus diversicornis*. *Heredity* **76**: 506–513.
- Pintureau B, Chapelle L, Delobel B. 1999a. Effects of repeated thermic and antibiotic treatments on a *Trichogramma* (Hym., Trichogrammatidae) symbiont. *Journal of Applied Entomology* 123: 473–483.
- Pintureau B, Lassablière F, Khatchadourian C, Daumal J. 1999b. Parasitoïdes oophages et symbiotes de deux thrips européens. *Annales de la Societé Entomologique de France* 35 (Suppl.): 416–420.
- Pintureau B, Chaudier S, Lassabliere F, Charles H, Grenier S. 2000. Addition of wsp sequences to the Wolbachia phylogenetic tree and stability of the classification. *Journal of Molecular Evolution* 51: 374–377.
- Piper RW, Compton SG, Rasplus J-Y, Piry S. 2001. The species status of *Cathormiocerus britannicus*, an endemic, endangered British weevil. *Biological Conservation* 101: 9–13.
- Plantard O, Rasplus J-Y, Mondor G, Le Clainche I, Solignac M. 1998. Wolbachia-induced thelytoky in the rose gallwasp Diplolepis spinosissimae (Giraud) (Hymenoptera: Cynipidae), and its consequences on the genetic structure of its host. Proceedings of the Royal Society of London B 265: 1075–1080.
- Plantard O, Rasplus JY, Mondor G, Le Clainche I, Solignac M. 1999. Distribution and phylogeny of Wolbachia inducing thelytoky in Rhoditini and Aylacini (Hymenoptera: Cynipidae). Insect Molecular Biology 8: 185-191.
- Quezada JR, DeBach P, Rosen D. 1973. Biological and taxonomic studies of Signophora borinquensis, new species (Hym: Signiphoridae), a primary parasite of diaspine scales. Hilgardia 41: 543–604.
- Quicke DLJ. 1997. Parasitic wasps. London: Chapham & Hall.
- Riparbelli MG, Stouthamer R, Dallai R, Callaini G. 1998. Microtubule organization during the early development of the parthenogenetic egg of the hymenopteran *Muscidifurax uniraptor*. *Developmental Biology* 195: 89–99.
- Rokas A, Atkinson RJ, Nieves-Aldrey J-L, West SA, Stone GN. 2002. The indicence and diversity of Wolbachia in gallwasps (Hymenoptera; Cynipidae) on oak. Molecular Biology 11: 1815–1829.
- Rössler Y, DeBach P. 1973. Genetic variability in the thelytokous form of Aphis mytilaspidis. Hilgardia 42: 149–175.
- Rousset F, Bouchon D, Pintureau B, Juchault P, Solignac M. 1992. Wolbachia endosymbionts responsible for various alterations of sexuality in arthropods. Proceedings of the Royal Society of London B 250: 91–98.
- Schilthuizen M, Honda J, Stouthamer R. 1998. Parthenogenesis-inducing Wolbachia in Trichogramma kay-kai (Hymenoptera: Trichogrammatidae) originates from a single infection. Ecology and Population Biology 91: 410–414
- Schilthuizen M, Stouthamer R. 1997. Horizontal transmission of parthenogenesis-inducing microbes in *Trichogramma* wasps. *Proceedings of the Royal Society of London B* 264: 361–366.
- Schilthuizen M, Stouthamer R. 1998. Distribution of Wol-

- bachia among the guild associated with the parthenogenetic gall wasp *Diplolepis rosae*. Heredity **81:** 270–274.
- Schlinger E, Hall JC. 1959. A synopsis of the biologies of three imported parasites of the spotted alfalfa aphid. *Journal of Economic Entomology* **52:** 154–157.
- **Short RV, Balaban E. 1994.** The differences between the sexes. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Smith SG. 1955. Cytogenetics of obligatory parthenogenesis. Canadian Entomologist 87: 131–135.
- Stevens L, Giordano R, Fialho RF. 2001. Male-killing, nematode infections, bacteriophage infection, and virulence of cytoplasmic bacteria in the genus Wolbachia. Annual Review of Ecology and Systematics 32: 519–545.
- Stille B, Dävring L. 1980. Meiosis and reproductive strategy in the parthenogenetic gall wasp *Dislolepis rosae* (L.) (Hymenoptera, Cynipidae). *Hereditas* 92: 353–362.
- Stouthamer R. 1997. Wolbachia-induced parthenogenesis. In: O'Neill SL, Hoffmann AA, Werren JH, eds. Influential passengers: inherited microorganisms and arthropod reproduction. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 102–124.
- Stouthamer R, Breeuwer JAJ, Hurst GDD. 1999. Wolbachia pipientis: microbial manipulators of arthropod reproduction. Annual Review of Microbiology 53: 71–102.
- Stouthamer R, Breeuwer JAJ, Luck RF, Werren JH. 1993. Molecular identification of microorganisms associated with parthenogenesis. *Nature* 361: 66–68.
- **Stouthamer R, Kazmer DJ. 1994.** Cytogenetics of microbe-associated parthenogenesis and its consequences for gene flow in *Trichogramma* wasps. *Heredity* **73:** 317–327.
- Stouthamer R, Luck RF, Hamilton WD. 1990a. Antibiotics cause parthenogenetic *Trichogramma* (Hymenoptera: Trichogrammatidae) to revert to sex. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, USA* 87: 2424–2427.
- Stouthamer R, Pinto JD, Platner GR, Luck RF. 1990b.

 Taxonomic status of thelytokous forms of *Trichogramma* (Hymenoptera: Trichogrammatidae). *Annals of the Entomological Society of America* 83: 475–481.
- Stouthamer R, van Tilborg M, de Jong JH, Nunney L, Luck RF. 2001. Selfish element maintains sex in natural populations of a parasitoid wasp. *Proceedings of the Royal Society of London B* 268: 617–622.
- **Stouthamer R, Werren JH. 1993.** Microbes associated with parthenogenesis in wasps of the genus *Trichogramma*. *Journal of Invertebrate Pathology* **61:** 6–9.
- Suomalainen E, Saura A, Lokki J. 1987. Cytology and evolution in parthenogenesis. Boca Raton: CRC Press.
- Tagami Y, Miura K, Stouthamer R. 2001. How does infection with parthenogenesis-inducing Wolbachia reduce the fitness of Trichogramma? Journal of Invertebrate Pathology 78: 267–271.
- **Tram U, Sullivan W. 2000.** Reciprocal inheritance of centrosomes in the parthenogenetic hymenopteran *Nasonia vitripennis*. *Current Biology* **10:** 1413–1419.
- Valerio CE. 1976. Significance of all-male progenies in some microhymenopteran parasites. *Brenesia* 9: 25–29.
- Vandekerckhove TTM. 1998. Cytoplasmic bacteria in Heterocypris incongreuens (Crustacea, Ostracoda). In: Martens K, ed. Sex and parthenogenesis: evolutionary ecology of repro-

- ductive modes in non-marine Ostracods. Leiden: Backhuys Publishers, 119-125.
- Vandekerckhove TTM. 2001. Cytoplasmic sex-ratio distorting bacteria and induction of parthenogenesis in invertbrates. Unpublished DPhil Thesis, University of Gent.
- Vandekerckhove TTM, Watteyne S, Willems A, Swings JG, Mertens J, Gillis M. 1999. Phylogenetic analysis of the 16S DNA of the cytoplasmic bacterium Wolbachia from the novel host Folsomia candida (Hexapoda, Collembola), and its implications for wolbachial taxonomy. FEMS Microbiological Letters 180: 279–286.
- Vandekerckhove TTM, Willems A, Gillis M, Coomans A. 2000. Occurance of novel verrucomicrobial species, endosymbiotic in Xiphinema americanum-group species (Nematoda Longidoridae) and associated with parthenogenesis. International Journal of Systematic Evolutionary Microbiology 50: 2197-2205.
- Weeks AR, Breeuwer JAJ. 2001. Wolbachia-induced parthenogenesis in a genus of phytophagous mites. Proceedings of the Royal Society of London B 268: 2245-2251.
- Weeks AR, Marec F, Breeuwer AJ. 2001. A mite species that consists entirely of haploid females. Science 292: 2479-2482.
- Werren JH. 1997. Biology of Wolbachia. Annual Review in Entomology 42: 587-609.
- Werren JH, Bartos JD. 2001. Recombination in Wolbachia. Current Biology 11: 431-435.
- Werren JH, Zhang W, Guo RL. 1995. Evolution and phylogeny of Wolbachia: reproductive parasites of arthropds. Proceedings of the Royal Society of London B 261: 55-71.
- West SA, Cook JM, Werren JH, Godfray CJ. 1998. Wolbachia in two insect host-parasitoid communities. Molecular Ecology 7: 1457-1465.
- Wilson F, Woolcock LT. 1960a. Temperature determination of sex in a parthenogenetic parasite, Ooencyrtus submetallicus (Howard) (Hymenoptera: Encyrtidae). Australian Journal of Zoology 8: 153-169.

- Wilson F, Woolcock LT. 1960b. Environmental determination of sex in a parthenogenetic parasite. Nature 186: 99-100.
- Wrench DL, Ebbert MA. 1992. Evolution and diversity of sex ratio in insects and mites. New York: Chapham & Hall.
- Yusuf MAS. 1999. Reproductive biology, ultrastructure and molecular characterisation of Liposcelis bostrychophila (Badonnel) (Liposcelididae: Psocoptera) and its intracellular rickettsial endosymbionts. Unpublished PhD Thesis, King's College, University of London.
- Yusuf M, Turner B, Whitfield R, Miles RJ, Pacey J. 2000. Electron microscopical evidence of a vertically transmitted Wolbachia-like parasite in the parthenogenetic, storedproduct pest Liposcelis bostrychophila Badonnel (Psocoptera). Journal of Stored Products Research 36: 169-175.
- Zchori-Fein E, Faktor O, Zeidan M, Gottlieb Y, Czosnek H, Rosen D. 1995. Parthenogenesis-inducing microorganisms in Aphytis (Hymenoptera: Aphenlinidae). Insect Molecular Biology 4: 173-178.
- Zchori-Fein E, Gottlieb Y, Coll M. 2000. Wolbachia density and host fitness components in Muscidifurax uniraptor (Hymenoptera: Pteromalidae). Journal of Invertebrate Pathology **75:** 267–272.
- Zchori-Fein E, Gottlieb Y, Kelly SE, Brown JK, Wilson JM, Karr TL, Hunter MS. 2001. A newly discovered bacterium associated with parthenogenesis and a change in host selection behavior in parasitoid wasps. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, USA 98: 12555–12560.
- Zchori-Fein E, Rosen D, Roush RT. 1994. Microorganisms associated with thelytoky in Aphytis linguansensis Compere (Hymenoptera: Aphelinidae). International Journal of Insect Morphology and Embryology 23: 169-172.
- Zchori-Fein E, Roush RT, Hunter MS. 1992. Male production induced by antibiotic treatment in Encarcia formosa (Hymenoptera: Aphelinidae), an asexual species. Experientia **48:** 102-105.