

# Personality and Rating Error

Eul-Teo Lee, Visiting Fellow, The New York State School of Industrial and Labor  
Relations, Cornell University

## *ABSTRACT*

This study was designed to investigate the relationship between rater's personality and rating errors. For this, I propose a model that is Big Five Factors may relate in rating errors. This study predicted (1) Extraversion and Agreeableness is hypothesized to positively relate to the leniency error (2) Conscientiousness, Neuroticism may be positively correlated to the severity error and halo effect. Particular attention was paid to the consistency of rating error according to personality factors.

The Crosstable results showed that the Agreeableness and Extraversion were significantly correlated in with leniency. But rater's other personality factors were not significantly related in leniency, severity, and halo error. The result of ANOVA indicated that Agreeableness had significant level between leniency and severity group. There was no correlation between personality factor and halo effect. Based on the empirical findings, implications and limitations were discussed. Suggestions for future research also follow.

Key words:

Big Five Model, Extraversion, Agreeableness, Conscientiousness,  
Neuroticism, Rating error, Leniency, Severity, Halo effect

*This paper was submitted to the Korean Personnel Administration Journal on 16<sup>th</sup> of  
February, 2005 and is under examination*



## 1.

500  
(rating scale)  
(Kane, et al., 1995).  
(Feldman, 1981).  
1950 1952 Wherry  
(Wherry & Bartlett, 1982). Landy & Farr(1980)  
(Ilgen & Feldman, 1983; Mitchell, 1983; Wexley & Klimoski, 1984;  
Judge & Ferris, 1993). 90 ( , 1998; ? , 2000; , 2003)  
1990  
(Neuman & Kickul, 1998; Organ, 1994; Barrick, Mount, &  
Strauss, 1992; Organ & Lingl, 1992; Smith, Organ, & Near, 1983), (Barrick &  
Mount, 1991; Smith, Hanges, & Dickson, 2001), (Barrick & Mount, 1991; Hurtz & Donovan,  
2000; Salgado, 1997), (Judge, Bono, & Locke, 2000), (Judge & Bono, 2000),  
(Costa, & McCrae, & Holland, 1984)  
(Hogan, 1991)  
5  
(Piedmont &  
Weinstein, 1995; Kane et al., 1995; Ployhart, Lim, & Chan, 2001),  
(Saal, Downey, & Lahey, 1980; Murphy & Cleveland, 1991; Villanova, et al.,  
1993; Kane et al., 1995).  
(Guilford,  
1959)  
(social-stimulus)

## 2.

5 (Five Factor Model Big 5 Model) (Goldberg, 1990; Digman, 1990; 1997;

Digman & Inouye, 1986; McCrae & Costa, 1987; 1988; 1991). Tupes & Christal(1961)  
 30 5 , 1963 Norman  
 5  
 McCrae & Costa(1987, 1988, 1991) Digman(1990, 1997) 5 - , , ,  
 ( ), - .  
 . 5  
 .

## 2.1 5

(leniency error)  
 (Guilford, 1954; Tsui & Barry, 1986).  
 (Villanova et al., 1993; Saal, et al., 1980).  
 . (agreeableness) ,  
 , , , (service orientation)  
 . Hogan, Hogan, & Busch(1984) , ,  
 .  
 ,  
 (Longenecker, Gioia, & Sims, 1987).  
 . Schoorman(1988)  
 . Klores(1966)  
 Ohio .  
 . ,  
 , , ,  
 .  
 (extraversion) , , , ,  
 . Eysenck(1967)  
 Gray(1971; 1981; 1987) (Larsen & Ketelaar, 1991)  
 .  
 Gray (emotional susceptibility),  
 ,  
 (behavioral activation system: BAS) (behavioral  
 inhibition system: BIS) . BAS , BIS  
 . BAS , BIS  
 , BIS  
 BAS  
 BAS ,  
 .  
 , ,  
 , .

Gray  
Larsen & Ketelaar(1991)  
Tusi & Barry(1986) 344  
Mandell(1956)  
(2002)  
1:  
2:  
2.2 5  
(severity error) (Saal et al., 1980).  
(neuroticism)  
(emotional stability)  
(Hogan, 1991). , Gray  
BIS  
, Schneier(1977)  
(Costa & McCrae, 1992),  
(Barrick & Mount, 1991; Hurtz & Donovan, 2000; Salgado, 1997).  
Bernardin, Cooke, & Villanova(2000)  
( $r=-.37$ )  
3:  
4:  
2.3 5  
(halo effect)

(Tsui & Barry, 1986; Murphy & Anhalt, 1992).

‘ (self-effacing)’  
Bernardin, et al.(2000)  
McCrae & Costa(1991)

5:  
6:

2.4 5  
459 1947 1977 (West & Graziano, 1989). Finn(1986)

Kane et al.(1995) 328  
, 243 376  
Guilford(1954)  
Villanova et al.(1993)  
( $r=.63$ ,  $p<.01$ ) Vance, Winne, & Wright(1983)  
90 350 3 6

7:

3.

3.1  
K 119 85  
2 14 (16.5%), 3 34 (40.0%), 4 37%(43.5%)  
67 (78.8%), 18 (21.2%)

4~5 23

(overall rating)

3

20

7 2 7 10

### 3.2

$$\frac{5}{5} :$$

Digman &amp; Inouye(1986)

5

43

(1:

, 5:

)

8

8

9

7

11

Digman &amp; Inouye(1986)

499

5

1.3

\_\_\_\_\_

7

20

7

. 1~6

5

(A~E 5 )

(global rating)

(Smith, 1976; James, 1973; Campbell et al., 1970; Landy & Farr, 1980).

(1~6 ),

(7)

$$\vdots \quad \quad \quad \langle 1 \rangle$$

(Bernardin, et al., 2000).

(Tsui & Barry, 1986).

	×	
/	(skewness)	
/	(kurtosis)	
/	(intraclass correlations)	
	×	

: (graphic rating scales), (mixed standard rating scales)  
: Saal, Downey, & Lahey(1980), p. 421.

\_\_\_\_\_:

(Tusi & Barry, 1986; Wayne & Liden, 1995), (Hamner, et al., 1974; London & Poplawski, 1976: Landy & Farr, 1980) (

20 293 ( ) 5 14.65 . 20  
85% , ( 87.7%)  
12.3%) ( 3.7920 (67 ) 3.7933 , (18 ) 3.7873







4.	-.131	.113	-.016	-								
5.	.057	-.244**	-.356**	.128	-							
6.	-.092	.321**	-.115	.038	-.105	-						
7.	.533**	-.164	.164	-.035	.106	-.097	-					
8.	.671**	-.019	.124	-.101	-.011	-.033	.735**	-				
9.	.638**	-.256*	.282**	-.165	.083	-.211	.471**	.582**	-			
10.	.685**	-.097	.190	-.273*	-.041	-.002	.475**	.670**	.827**	-		
11.	.734**	-.093	.124	-.201	.044	.018	.539**	.728**	.690**	.779**	-	
12.	.738**	-.095	.061	-.159	.072	.069	.500**	.725**	.692**	.799**	.895**	-

\*\*.: p<0.01, \*: p<0.05

1

4

3.7920

(Tusi & Barry, 1986; Bernardin et al., 2000).

35.3%

2

34.4%

.130

0 1

,0

1

	1	13	3	17
	.4	10.2	6.4	17.0
%	5.9%	76.5%	17.6%	100.0%
%	50.0%	25.5%	9.4%	20.0%
%	1.2%	15.3%	3.5%	20.0%
	0	18	5	23
	.5	13.8	8.7	23.0
%	.0%	78.3%	21.7%	100.0%
%	.0%	35.3%	15.6%	27.1%
%	.0%	21.2%	5.9%	27.1%
	0	11	11	22
	.5	13.2	8.3	22.0
%	.0%	50.0%	50.0%	100.0%
%	.0%	21.6%	34.4%	25.9%
%	.0%	12.9%	12.9%	25.9%

Chi-square : Value=17.298, df=11, Asymp. Sig=.099  
Lamda : .130 (approx. sig=.008)

---

\*\* :  $p < 0.05$

. Epstein(1977)

- (test-retest)

13

18

		1	2	1	2	1	2	1	2
1	3.7662	3.6224	<b>3.8929</b> F=3.9226**	3.4167	<b>3.7823</b> F=4.725**	3.9018	3.7194 F=2.295	2.7054	<b>3.0765</b> F=4.393**
2	4.0676	<b>3.7121</b>	3.4474 F=6.242**	3.5818	3.7719 F=.983	3.8455	3.6842 F=1.206	2.9682	3.1184 F=.527
3	3.3896	3.8373	3.7333 F=.631	3.6667	3.6000 F=.171	3.7976	3.8500 F=.193	2.8393	3.1071 F=2.512
4	4.1184	3.8075	3.5463 F=2.602	3.6034	3.6481 F=.053	<b>3.8707</b>	3.5972 F=3.655*	3.0603	2.8889 F=.728
5	3.9014	3.8167	3.7092 F=.465	3.4167	3.6863 F=2.061	3.9250	3.7500 F=1.640	<b>3.2500</b>	2.8824 F=3.294*
6	3.8625	<b>3.9762</b>	3.6442 F=5.931**	3.6190	3.6218 F=.000	3.8304	3.7885 F=.122	2.7054	<b>3.1010</b> F=5.177**
7	3.7284	3.8238	3.6957 F=.912	3.5429	3.7101 F=1.065	3.9000	3.7337 F=1.882	2.9429	2.9891 F=.072
8	3.9242	3.7685	3.7604 F=.002	3.4444	3.6250 F=.765	3.7500	3.8177 F=.225	2.9583	3.0313 F=.122
9	3.5526	<b>3.8547</b>	3.5946 F=3.635*	3.6667	3.6396 F=.026	3.8397	3.6959 F=1.294	2.9038	2.9662 F=.121
10	3.8281	3.8696	3.6463 F=2.202	3.5507	3.6911 F=.653	3.8696	3.7500 F=.693	3.1087	2.9573 F=.626
11	3.7867	3.6319	3.7843 F=1.022	<b>3.4028</b>	<b>3.8170</b> F=6.375**	3.8438	3.8039 F=.103	2.9271	2.9167 F=.003
12	4.0000	3.8214	3.5714 F=2.084	3.6508	3.6905 F=.039	3.8690	3.6250 F=2.031	3.0417	2.9286 F=.267
13	4.1875	3.6636	3.8733 F=2.207	3.6606	3.5867 F=.117	3.8136	3.7800 F=.071	3.0000	2.9700 F=.027
14	4.3506	3.7752	3.7745 F=.000	3.6822	3.3.8547 F=.396	3.8547	3.7721 F=.450	2.8721	3.0294 F=.875
15	4.4156	3.8062	3.6667 F=1.036	3.6357	3.6275 F=.003	3.8198	3.7794 F=.105	3.0465	2.8971 F=.876
16	4.0270	3.6944	3.7500 F=.124	3.6914	3.5833 F=.366	3.8472	3.7500 F=.472	3.0000	2.8250 F=.766
17	4.0658	3.7485	3.7456 F=.000	3.6784	3.7368 F=.091	3.8421	3.6184 F=2.543	2.9254	2.9211 F=.000
18	3.6406	3.8506	3.7333 F=.636	3.6437	3.6286 F=.007	3.7672	3.7571 F=.005	3.0259	2.9429 F=.201
19	3.9867	3.7353	3.7701 F=.046	3.6474	3.7471 F=.312	3.9118	3.7069 F=1.940	3.0588	2.8578 F=1.057
20	4.0667	3.7712	3.7431 F=.037	3.7059	3.7639 F=.130	3.7157	3.8333 F=.782	2.8775	2.9583 F=.210

: 1- , 2  
\*: p<0.1, \*\*: p<0.05

## 5.

al.(2000) Klores(1966), Schoorman(1988), Bernardin et (Hogan et al., 1984)

BAS, Larsen & Ketelaar(1991)

(Cardy & Dobbins, 1986). Feldman(1981)

Tusi & Barry(1986)

Arvey & Campion(1982)

(Barrick & Mount, 1991; Salgado, 1997; Hurtz & Donovan, 2000)

Arvey & Campion(1982) Tusi & Barry(1986)

(Cardy & Dobbins, 1986; Tusi & Barry, 1986; Wayne & Liden, 1995; , 1998).

,  
.  
,  
, Villanova et al.(1993) 178  
(discomfort),  
,  
, 20

.  
,  
(Harris, 1994), , (Feldman, 1981),  
.  
.

- (2002), “ ,” 2002 , 148-157.
- (2003), “ ,” , 11 1 , 113-131.
- (1998), “ ,” , 6 1 , 69-92.
- ? ? (2000), , .
- ? (2001), “ : ,”
- , 9 1 , 109-136.
- ? (1997), “ ,” , 21 1 , 33-52.
- ? (1994), “ ,” □ , 23 , 75-102.
- Arvey, R. D., & Campion, J. E.(1982), “The Employment Interview: A Summary and Review of Recent Research, *Personnel Psychology*, 35: 281-322.
- Barrick, M. R., & Mount, M. K.(1991), “The Big Five Personality Dimensions and Job Performance: A Meta-Analysis,” *Personnel Psychology*, 44: 1-26.
- Barrick, M. R., Mount, M. K., & Strauss, J. P.(1992), “The Big Five and Ability Predictors of Citizenship, Delinquency, and Sales Performance,” Paper presented at Seventh Annual Conference of the Society of Industrial and Organizational Psychology, Montreal.
- Bernardin, H. J., Cooke, D. K., & Villanova, P.(2000), “Conscientiousness and Agreeableness as Predictors or Rating Leniency,” *Journal of Applied Psychology*, 85(2): 232-234.
- Bretz, R. D. Jr., Milkovich, G. T., & Read, W.(1992), “The Current State of Performance Appraisal Research and Practice: Concerns, Directions, and Implications,” *Journal of Management*, 18(2): 321-352.
- Cardy, R. L., & Dobbins, G. H.(1986), “Affect and Appraisal Accuracy: Liking as an Integral Dimension in Evaluating Performance,” *Journal of Applied Psychology*, 71(4): 672-678.
- Costa, P. T. Jr., & McCrae, R. R.(1992), *Revised NEO Personality Inventory and the Neo Five-Factor Inventory*. Odessa, FL: Psychological Assessment Resources.
- Costa, P. T. Jr., McCrae, R. R., & Holland, J. L.(1984), “Personality and Vocational Interests in an Adult Sample,” *Journal of Applied Psychology*, 69(3): 390-400.
- Digman, J. M.(1990), “Personality Structure: Emergence of the Five-Factor Model,” *Annual Review of Psychology*, 41: 417-440.
- Digman, J. M.(1997), “Higher-Order Factors of the Big Five,” *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, 73(6): 1246-1256.
- Digman, J. M., & Inouye, J.(1986), “Further Specification of the Five Robust Factors of Personality,” *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, 50(1): 116-123.
- Epstein, S.(1977), “Traits are Alive and Well,” In D. Magnusson & N. Endler (eds), *Personality at the Crossroads: Current Issues In Interactional Psychology*, NJ: Erlbaun.
- Feldman, J. M.(1981), “Beyond Attribution Theory: Cognitive Processes in Performance Appraisal,” *Journal of Applied Psychology*, 66(2): 127-148.
- Finn, S. E.(1986), “Stability of Personality Self-Ratings Over 30 Years: Evidence for an Age/Cohort Interaction, *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, 50(4): 813-818.
- Goldberg, L. R.(1990), “An Alternative ‘Descriptive of Personality’: The Big-Five Factor Structure,” *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, 59(6): 1216-1229.
- Guilford(1954), *Psychometric methods*. NY: McGraw-Hill, Inc.
- Guilford(1959), *Personality*. McGraw-Hill, Inc.



- Harris, M. M.(1994), "Rater Motivation in the Performance Appraisal Context: A Theoretical Framework," *Journal of Management*, 20(4): 734-756.
- Hogan, J., Hogan, R., & Busch, C. M.(1984), "How to Measure Service Orientation," *Journal of Applied Psychology*, 74: 273-279.
- Hogan, R. T.(1991), "Personality and Personality Measurement," In M. D. Dunnette and L. M. Hough(2nd.), *Handbook of Industrial and Organizational Psychology* (pp. 876-919). Palo Alto, CA: Consulting Psychologist Press. Inc.
- Hurtz, G. M., & Donovan, J.(2000), "Personality and Job Performance: The Big Five Revisited," *Journal of Applied Psychology*, 85(6): 869-879.
- Ilggen, D. R., & Feldman, J. M.(1983), "Performance Appraisal: A Process Focus," *Research in Organizational Behavior*, 5: 141-197.
- Jacobs, R., & Kozlowski, S. W.(1985), "A Closer Look at Halo Error in Performance Ratings, *Academy of Management Journal*, 28: 201-212.
- James, L. R.(1982) "Aggregation Bias in Estimates of Perceptual Agreement," *Journal of Applied Psychology*, 67(2): 219-229.
- Judge, T. A., & Bono, J. E.(2000), "Five-Factor Model of Personality and Transformational Leadership," *Journal of Applied Psychology*, 85(5): 751-765.
- Judge, T. A., Bono, J. E., & Locke, E. A.(2000), "Personality and Job Satisfaction: The Mediating Role of Job Characteristics," *Journal of Applied Psychology*, 85(2): 237-249.
- Kane, J. S., Bernardin, H. J., Villanova, P., & Peyrefitte, J.(1995), "Stability of rater leniency: Three studies," *Academy of Management Journal*, 38(4): 1036-1051.
- Klores, M. S.(1996), "Rater Bias in Forced-Distribution Ratings," *Personnel Psychology*, 19: 411-421.
- Landy, F. J., & Farr, J. L.(1980), "Performance Rating," *Psychological Bulletin*, 87(1): 72-107.
- Larsen, R. J., & Ketelaar, T.(1991), "Personality and Susceptibility to Positive and Negative Emotional States," *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, 61(1): 132-140.
- Longenecker, C. O., Gioia, D. A., & Sims, H. P.(1987), "Behind the mask: The politics of employee appraisal," *Academy of Management Executive*, 1: 183-193.
- Mandell, M. M.(1956), "Supervisory Characteristics and Ratings: A Summary of Recent Research," *Personnel Psychology*, 32: 435-440.
- McGrae, R. R.(1996), "Social Consequences of Experiential Openness," *Psychological Bulletin*, 120: 323-337.
- McGrae, R. R., Costa, P. T. Jr.(1987), "Validation of the Five-Factor Model of Personality Across Instruments and Observers," *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, 52(1): 81-90.
- McGrae, R. R., Costa, P. T. Jr.(1988), "Personality in Adulthood: A Six-Year Longitudinal Study of Self-Reports and Spouse Ratings on the NEO Personality Inventory," *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, 54(5): 853-863.
- McGrae, R. R., Costa, P. T. Jr.(1991), "Adding Liebe and Arbeit: The Full Five-Factor Model and Well-being," *Personality and Social Psychology Bulletin*, 17: 227-232.
- Murphy, K. R., & Anhalt, R. L.(1992), "Is Halo Error a Property of the Rater, Ratees, or the Specific Behaviors Observed?" *Journal of Applied Psychology*, 77(4): 494-500.
- Murphy, K. R., & Cleveland, J. N.(1991), *Performance Appraisal: An Organizational Perspective*. Boston: Allyn & Bacon.
- Neuman, G. A., & Kickul, J. R.(1998), "Organizational Citizenship Behaviors: Achievement Orientation and Personality," *Journal of Business and Psychology*, 13(2): 263-279.
- Norman, W. T.(1963), "Toward and Adequate Taxonomy of Personality Attributes: Replicated Factor Structure in Peer Nomination Personality Ratings," *Journal of Abnormal and Social Psychology*,

66: 574-583.

- Organ, D. W.(1994), "Personality and Organizational Citizenship Behavior," *Journal of Management*, 20(2): 465-478.
- Organ, D. W., & Lingl, A.(1992), "Personality, Satisfaction, and Organizational Citizenship Behavior," Paper presented at Academy of Management Meetings, Las Vegas, NE.
- Piedmont, R., & Weinstein, H. P.(1996), "Predicting Supervisor Ratings of Job Performance Using the NEO Personality Inventory," *The Journal of Psychology*, 128(3): 255-265.
- Ployhart, R. E., Lim, B. C., & Chan, K. Y.(2001), "Exploring relations between typical and maximum performance ratings and the five factor model of personality," *Personnel Psychology*, 54: 809-843.
- Robbins, T. L., & DeNisi, A. S.(1993), "Moderators of Sex Bias in the Performance Appraisal Process: A Cognitive Analysis," *Journal of Management*, 19(1): 113-126.
- Roberts, B. W., & DelVecchio, W. F.(2000), "The Rank-Order Consistency of Personality Trait From Childhood to Old Age: A Quantitative Review of Longitudinal Studies," *Psychological Bulletin*, 126(1): 3-25.
- Saal, F. E., Downey, R. G., & Lahey, M. A.(1980), "Rating the Ratings: Assessing the Psychometric Quality of Rating Data," *Psychological Bulletin*, 88(2): 413-428.
- Salgado, J. F.(1997), "The Five Factor Model of Personality and Job Performance in the European Community," *Journal of Applied Psychology*, 82(1): 30-43.
- Schneier, C. E.(1977), "Operational utility and psychometric characteristics of behavioral expectation scales: A cognitive reinterpretation," *Journal of Applied Psychology*, 62: 541-548.
- Schoorman, F. D.(1988), "Escalation Bias in Performance Appraisals: An Unintended Consequence of Supervisor Participation in Hiring Decisions," *Journal of Applied Psychology*, 73: 58-62.
- Shrout, P. E., & Fleiss, J. L.(1979), "Intraclass Correlations: Uses in Assessing Rater Reliability," *Psychological Bulletin*, 86(2): 420-428.
- Smith, C. A., Organ, D. W., & Near, J. P.(1983), "Organizational Citizenship Behavior: Its Nature and Antecedents," *Journal of Applied Psychology*, 68: 653-663.
- Smith, D. B., Hanges, P. J., & Dickson, M. W.(2001), "Personnel Selection and the Five-Factor Model: Reexamining the Effects of Applicant's Frame of Reference," *Journal of Applied Psychology*, 86(2): 304-315.
- Trapnell, P. D.(1994), "Openness Versus Intellect: A Lexical Left Turn," *European Journal of Personality*, 8: 273-290.
- Tupes, E. C., & Christal, R. E.(1961), *Recurrent Personality Factors Based on Trait Ratings*. USAF ASD Technical Report, No. 61-97, TX: Lackland Air Force Base.
- Tusi, A. S., & Barry, B.(1986), "Interpersonal Affect and Rating Errors," *Academy of Management Journal*, 29(3): 586-599.
- Vance, R. J., Winne, P. S., & Wright, E. S.(1983), "A Longitudinal Examination of Rater and Ratee Effects in Performance Ratings," *Personnel Psychology*, 36: 609-620.
- Villanova, P., Bernardin, H. J., Dahmus, S. A., Sims, R. L.(1993), "Rater Leniency and Performance Appraisal Discomfort," *Educational and Psychological Measurement*, 53: 789-799.
- Wayne, S. J., & Liden, R. C.(1995), "Effects of Impression Management on Performance Ratings: A Longitudinal Study," *Academy of Management Journal*, 38(1): 232-260.
- West, S. G., & Graziano, W. G.(1989), "Long-Term Stability and Changing Personality: An Introduction," *Journal of Personality*, 57: 175-196.
- Wherry, R. J., & Bartlett, C. J.(1982), "The Control of Bias in Ratings: A Theory of Ratings," *Personnel Psychology*, 35: 521-551.