

Game theory

4.1

Question 1: Find the optimum strategy of the players in the following games.

Player's (A) (strategies)	Player's B (strategies)		
	A	B	C
A	25	20	35
B	50	45	55
C	48	40	42

Solution: Here,

Player's A strategies	Player's B (strategies)			Minimum of row pay-off
	A	B	C	
A	25	20	35	20
B	50	(45) saddle point	55	(45) (Maximum)
C	48	40	42	40
Maximum of column pay off	50	(45) minimax	55	

$$\therefore \text{Minimax} = \text{Maximin} = 45$$

$$\therefore \text{saddle point} \Leftrightarrow \text{Maximin} = \text{minimax} = 45$$

Hence, optimal probability is

Probability of player A: $P_1=0, P_2=1, P_3=0$, then

$$P_1+P_2+P_3=0+1+0=1.$$

Probability of player B: $Q_1=0, Q_2=1, Q_3=0$ then

$$Q_1+Q_2+Q_3=0+1+0=1.$$

$$\therefore \text{Value of game} = 45$$

Hence, a game has saddle point with corresponding row 2 or column 2 cell value is called game value.

Game with mixed strategy

Question: consider the following pay-off matrix with respect to player A and solved it optimally.

		Player-B	
		I	II
Player-A	I	9	7
	II	5	11

Solution: Here,

		Player A		Minimum Pay-off [7] Maximin 5
		I	II	
Player B	I	9	7	
	II	5	11	

Maximin
Pay-off
↑
Minimax

∴ Maximin pay-off ≠ minimax pay-off.

Hence, Maximin pay-off ≠ minimax pay-off, then it has no saddle point. So, it is called mixed strategy. In this case, used oddments method to find the value of game.

Oddments method:

Now take 2×2 matrix and find out the oddments for both row and column.

		Player B	oddments	probability
		I	II	
Player A	I	9	7	$\frac{6}{6+2}$ A
	II	5	11	
oddments	4	4	2	$\frac{2}{6+2}$ B
probability	$\frac{4}{4+4}$	$\frac{4}{4+4}$		

(4.3)

$$\text{Probability of row I} (P_1) = \frac{\text{oddment of row}}{\text{sum of oddments}} = \frac{6}{6+2} = \frac{6}{8} = \frac{3}{4}$$

$$\text{Probability of row II} (P_2) = \frac{2}{6+2} = \frac{2}{8} = \frac{1}{4}$$

$$\text{Probability of column I} (Q_1) = \frac{4}{4+4} = \frac{4}{8} = \frac{1}{2}$$

$$\text{Probability of column II} (Q_2) = \frac{4}{4+4} = \frac{4}{8} = \frac{1}{2}$$

$$\therefore \text{sum of probability of player A} = \frac{3}{4} + \frac{1}{4} = 1$$

$$\text{sum of probability of player B} = \frac{1}{2} + \frac{1}{2} = 1$$

Now,

Value of game is

$$\text{For row I, value game}(V) = \frac{9 \times 4 + 7 \times 4}{8} = \frac{64}{8} = 8$$

$$\text{For row II, value of game } (V) = \frac{5 \times 4 + 11 \times 4}{8} = \frac{64}{8} = 8$$

$$\text{For column I, value of game } (V) = \frac{9 \times 6 + 5 \times 2}{6+2} = \frac{64}{8} = 8$$

$$\text{For column II, value of game } (V) = \frac{7 \times 6 + 11 \times 2}{8} = \frac{64}{8} = 8$$

\therefore Value of game is

$$V = 8 \text{ Ans}$$

By formula method

$$\text{Probability of first row } (P_1) = \frac{A_{22} - A_{21}}{(A_{11} + A_{22}) - (A_{12} + A_{21})}$$

$$\text{Probability of second row } (P_2) = 1 - P_1$$

$$\text{Probability of column I } (Q_1) = \frac{A_{22} - A_{12}}{(A_{11} + A_{22}) - (A_{12} + A_{21})}$$

$$\text{Probability of column II } (Q_2) = 1 - Q_1$$

$$\text{Value of game } (V) = \frac{A_{11} \times A_{22} - A_{12} \times A_{21}}{(A_{11} + A_{22}) - (A_{12} + A_{21})}$$

Dominance property:

In some games, it is possible to reduce the size of the pay-off matrix by eliminating rows (or columns) which are dominated by other rows (or columns) respectively.

1. Dominance property for row: If all elements of particular row x are less than or equal to the corresponding elements of another row y then delete row x .
2. Dominance property for column: If all elements of particular column x are more than or equal to the corresponding elements of another column y then delete column x .
3. A pure strategy may be dominated, if it is inferior (less than) to an average of two or more other pure strategy.

Question: The following table represents the pay-off matrix with respect to player A. solve it optimally using dominance property.

		Player B					Row minimum
		1	2	3	4	5	
Player A	1	4	6	5	10	6	
	2	7	8	5	9	10	
	3	8	9	11	10	9	
	4	6	4	10	8	4	

Solution: Here,

		Player B					
		1	2	3	4	5	Row minimum
Player A	1	4	6	5	10	6	4
	2	7	8	5	9	10	5
	3	(8)	9	11	10	9	(8) Maximin
	4	6	4	10	6	4	(8) Minimax
Column maximum ↑		9	11	10	10		

minimax.

∴ Maximin = Minimax = 8 = saddle point.

∴ Value of game = 8

Probability of player A = [0, 0, 1, 0]

Probability of player B = [1, 0, 0, 0]

Now, using dominance probability, the value of game is same.

		Player B					
		1	2	3	4	5	Row total
Player A	1	4	6	5	10	6	31
	2	7	8	5	9	10	39
	3	8	9	11	10	9	47
	4	6	4	10	6	4	30

~~Row 4~~ Each element of row 4 is less than or equal to row 3, then row 4 is dominated by row 3, then delete row 4

Another least value is 30, then each element of row 1 is less than or equal to row 3, then row 1 is dominated by row 3, then delete row 1.

Q15o, column reduction

	1	2	3	4	5
2	7	8	5	9	10
3	8	9	11	10	9
column total	15	17	16	19	19

- (i) Most column total is 19, each element of column 4 is more than or equal to column 1, then column 4 is dominated by column 1. so delete column 4.
- (ii) Another most column total is 19, each element of column 5 is more than or equal to column 1, then column 5 is dominated by column 1, then delete column 5.
- (iii) similarly, column 2 is dominated by column 1, then delete column 2.

After row and column reduction, the pay-off matrix is

		Player B		R-TOTAL
		1	3	
Player A	2	7	5	12
	3	8	11	19

- (i) Least Row total is 12, each element of row 2 is less than or equal to row 3, then row 2 dominated by row 3. so delete row 2.
- (ii) Most column total is 11, each element of column 3 is more than or equal to column 1, then column 3 is dominated by column 1. so, delete column 3.

(7.7)

∴ optimal strategy of

$$\text{Player A} = [0, 0, 1, 0]$$

$$\text{Player B} = [1, 0, 0, 0]$$

$$\text{Value of game } V = 8$$

Question: The following table represents the pay-off matrix with respect to Player A. solve it optimally using dominance property with mixed strategy.

		Player B				
		1	2	3	4	
		1	5	-3	3	4
		2	-4	5	4	5
		3	4	-4	-3	3

Solution: Here

		Player B				R-minimum
		1	2	3	4	(-3) Maximin
		1	5	-3	3	4
		2	-4	5	4	5
		3	3	-4	-3	3
			5	5	(4)	5
		C-maximum			Minimax	

$$\therefore \text{Maximin} = -3$$

$$\text{Minimax} = 4$$

$$\therefore \text{Maximin} \neq \text{Minimax}$$

∴ There is no saddle point, then it is called mixed strategy.

Now by using dominance property

		Player B				
		1	2	3	4	R.Total
Player A	1	5	-3	3	4	(9)
	2	-4	5	4	5	10
	3	-4	-4	-3	3	(0)

- (i) least ~~total~~ row total is 0. each element of row 3 is less than or equal to row 1, then row 3 is dominated by row 1. so Row 3 delete.

After row reduction, then table is

		Player B				
		1	2	3	4	C.Total
Player A	1	5	-3	3	4	1
	2	-4	5	4	5	2 (7) (9)

lest column total is 9. each element of column 4 is more than or equal to column 2; then column 4 is dominated by column 2 - so column 4 is delete.

And, ~~another~~ most column ~~total is 7~~.

Now, after column reduction. No 2x2 matrix, in this case, we checked average of any two column comparing to other column.

		Player B			
		1	2	3	Average of C2, C3
Player A	1	5	-3	3	$\frac{5+3}{2} = 4$
	2	-4	5	4	$\frac{-4+5}{2} = \frac{1}{2}$

In order to find 2×2 matrix. using oddment method.

(4.9)

		Player B		oddment	probability
		1	2		
Player A	1	5	-3	9	$\frac{9}{5+8} = \frac{9}{17}$
	2	-4	5	8	$\frac{8}{5+8} = \frac{8}{17}$

Probability: $\frac{8}{8+9} = \frac{8}{17}$ $\frac{9}{17}$

$$\text{Value of game (v)} = \frac{5 \times 9 + (-4) \times 8}{9+8} = \frac{54 - 32}{17} = \frac{22}{17}$$

$$\begin{aligned}\therefore \text{Probability of player A} &= \left\{ \cancel{\frac{9}{17}}, \cancel{\frac{8}{17}}, \cancel{0}, \cancel{0}, \cancel{0} \right\} \\ &= \left\{ \frac{9}{17}, \frac{8}{17}, 0 \right\}\end{aligned}$$

Algebraic method

Algebraic method / equal game method:

Let P_1, P_2, \dots, P_m be the probability that the player A choose his strategy A_1, A_2, \dots, A_m respectively. Where, $P_1 + P_2 + \dots + P_m = 1$

Also, let q_1, q_2, \dots, q_n be the probability that the Player B choose his strategy B_1, B_2, \dots, B_n respectively. Where, $q_1 + q_2 + \dots + q_n = 1$

Player A Strategy	Player B strategies				Probability
	B_1	B_2	...	B_n	
A_1	q_{11}	q_{12}	...	q_{1n}	P_1
A_2	q_{21}	q_{22}	...	q_{2n}	P_2
\vdots
A_m	q_{m1}	q_{m2}	...	q_{mn}	P_m
Probability	q_1	q_2	...	q_n	1

Let v be the value of game

To find s_A

The expected gain to player A when the player B selects strategies B_1, B_2, \dots, B_n respectively, since, player A is gainer and he expects at least v , we have

$$a_{11}P_1 + a_{21}P_2 + \dots + a_{m1}P_m \geq v$$

$$a_{12}P_1 + a_{22}P_2 + \dots + a_{m2}P_m \geq v$$

To find the value of P_i 's above inequality equation and are solved for given unknowns.

To find s_B

The expected loss to player B when player A selects strategies A_1, A_2, \dots, A_m respectively. Since, player B is loser player, we have and he expects at most v , we have

$$a_{11}q_1 + a_{12}q_2 + \dots + a_{1n}q_n \leq v$$

$$a_{21}q_1 + a_{22}q_2 + \dots + a_{2n}q_n \leq v$$

$$a_{m1}q_1 + a_{m2}q_2 + \dots + a_{mn}q_n \leq v$$

$$a_{11}q_1 + a_{m2}q_2 + \dots + a_{mn}q_n \leq v$$

To find the values of q_i 's above inequality equation and are solved for given unknowns.

By substituting the values of a_i 's and q_i 's in any one of the above equation give the value of the game.

Example ①: Two player A and B match coins. If the coins match, then A wins two units of value, if the coin do not match, then B win 2 units of value. Determine the optimal strategies for the players and the value of the game.

Solution: Let us construct the pay-off matrix for player A.

		Player B		Row minimum	Probability
		H	T		
Player A	H	2	-2	(-2)	Maximin p_1
	T	-2	2	(-2)	p_2

column maximum $\boxed{2}$ $\boxed{1/2}$

Probability Minimax q_2
Since, Maximin = ~~Minimax~~ q_2 max = 2, then value of game lies between -2 to 2.

\therefore Maximin \neq minimax, therefore, there is no saddle point. The game has no saddle point should be solved by mixed strategy. ~~mixed~~. If it is 2×2 game without saddle point, we use algebraic method.

To find s_A :

$$2p_1 - 2p_2 \geq v \quad \text{--- (1)}$$

$$-2p_1 + 2p_2 \geq v \quad \text{--- (2)}$$

$$p_1 + p_2 = 1 \quad \text{--- (3)}$$

Equality equation of above inequality equation is

$$2p_1 - 2p_2 = v \quad \text{--- (4)}$$

$$-2p_1 + 2p_2 = v \quad \text{--- (5)}$$

$$p_1 + p_2 = 1 \quad \text{--- (6)}$$

Solving eqn. ④ and ⑤, we have

$$V = V$$

$$\text{or, } 2P_1 - 2P_2 = -2P_1 + 2P_2$$

$$\text{or, } 4P_1 = 4P_2$$

$$\therefore P_1 = P_2$$

From eqn. ⑥, we get

$$P_1 + P_2 = 1$$

$$\text{or, } P_1 + P_1 = 1$$

$$\text{or, } 2P_1 = 1$$

$$\therefore P_1 = \frac{1}{2}$$

$$\therefore P_1 = P_2 = \frac{1}{2}$$

To find SB:

$$2q_1 - 2q_2 \leq V \quad \text{--- ⑦}$$

$$-2q_1 + 2q_2 \leq V \quad \text{--- ⑧}$$

$$q_1 + q_2 = 1 \quad \text{--- ⑨}$$

Equality equation of eqn. 7, 8, 9 is

$$2q_1 - 2q_2 = V \quad \text{--- ⑩}$$

$$-2q_1 + 2q_2 = V \quad \text{--- ⑪}$$

$$q_1 + q_2 = 1 \quad \text{--- ⑫}$$

Solving eqn. ⑩ w/ ⑪, we get

$$V = V$$

$$\text{or, } 2q_1 - 2q_2 = -2q_1 + 2q_2$$

$$\text{or, } 2q_1 + 2q_1 = 2q_2 + 2q_2$$

$$\text{or, } 4q_1 = 4q_2$$

$$\therefore q_1 = q_2$$

From eqn. ⑫, we have

$$\text{or, } q_1 + q_2 = 1 \quad \therefore 2q_1 = 1 \quad \therefore q_1 = \frac{1}{2} \quad \therefore q_1 = q_2 = \frac{1}{2}$$

From eqn. ①, $V = 2q_1 - 2q_2 = 2 \times \frac{1}{2} - 2 \times \frac{1}{2} = 0$ (Ans)

Hence,

The optimal strategy for player A and B is

~~Probability of player A = $\left[\frac{1}{2}, \frac{1}{2} \right]$~~

~~Probability of player B = $\left[\frac{1}{2}, \frac{1}{2} \right]$~~

And, value of game (V) = 0. Ans.

Example ②: solve the following 2×2 game.

		Player A	
		2	5
		7	3
Player B			

Solution: Here,

		Player A	R.MIN	Probability
		2	2	p_1
		7	3	p_2
Player B				
c. max	9	8		

$$\text{Probability } q_1, q_2$$

$$\text{since, Maximin} = 3$$

$$\text{Minimax} = 8$$

$\therefore \text{Maximin} \neq \text{Minimax}$, there is no saddle point.

Since, a game has no saddle point is called mixed strategy. Now we need algebraic method.

For TO find s_A :

$$2q_1 + 5q_2 = V \quad \text{--- ①}$$

$$7q_1 + 3q_2 = V \quad \text{--- ②}$$

$$q_1 + q_2 = 1 \quad \text{--- ③}$$

(4.1) 10

solving eqn. ① and ②

$$2q_1 + 5q_2 = 7q_1 + 3q_2$$

$$\therefore 2q_1 - 7q_2 = 3q_2 - 5q_2$$

$$\text{or}, -5q_1 = -2q_2$$

$$\text{or}, 5q_1 = 2q_2$$

$$\text{or}, q_1 = \frac{2q_2}{5}$$

$$\therefore q_1 = \frac{2q_2}{5} \quad \text{--- (4)}$$

From eqn. ③, we get

$$q_1 + q_2 = 1$$

$$\text{or}, \frac{2q_2}{5} + q_2 = 1$$

$$\text{or}, \frac{2q_2 + 5q_2}{5} = 1$$

$$\text{or}, 2q_2 + 5q_2 = 5$$

$$\text{or}, 7q_2 = 5$$

$$\therefore q_2 = \frac{5}{7}$$

From eqn. ④, we get

$$q_1 = \frac{2}{5} \times \frac{5}{7} = \frac{2}{7}$$

From eqn. ①, we get

$$V = 2q_1 + 5q_2$$

$$= 2 \times \frac{2}{7} + 5 \times \frac{5}{7}$$

$$= \frac{4}{7} + \frac{25}{7}$$

$$= \frac{29}{7}$$

To find s_A

$$2P_1 + 7P_2 = v \quad \text{--- (5)}$$

$$5P_1 + 3P_2 = v \quad \text{--- (6)}$$

$$P_1 + P_2 = 1 \quad \text{--- (7)}$$

Solving eqn. (5) and (7), we get

$$2P_1 + 7P_2 = 5P_1 + 3P_2$$

$$\text{or, } 2P_1 - 5P_1 = 3P_2 - 7P_2$$

$$\text{or, } -3P_1 = -4P_2$$

$$\text{or, } P_1 = \frac{4}{3}P_2 \quad \text{--- (8)}$$

From eqn. (8), we get

$$P_1 + P_2 = 1$$

$$\text{or, } \frac{4}{3}P_2 + P_2 = 1$$

$$\text{or, } \frac{4P_2 + 3P_2}{3} = 1$$

$$\text{or, } 7P_2 = 3$$

$$\therefore P_2 = \frac{3}{7}$$

From eqn. (8), we have

$$P_1 = \frac{4}{3} \times \frac{3}{7} = \frac{4}{7}$$

From eqn. (5), we get

$$\begin{aligned} v &= 2P_1 + 7P_2 \\ &= 2 \times \frac{4}{7} + 7 \times \frac{3}{7} \\ &= \frac{8}{7} + \frac{21}{7} \\ &= \frac{29}{7} \end{aligned}$$

Hence, optimum strategies is
 Probability of player A = $(\frac{4}{7}, \frac{3}{7})$
 Probability of player B = $(\frac{4}{7}, \frac{3}{7})$
 \therefore Value of game (v) = $\frac{29}{7}$

Arithmetic method

Arithmetic method provides an easy technique for obtaining the optimum strategy for each player in 2×2 matrix without saddle point.

- ① Find the difference of two numbers in column I, and put it under the column II (neglecting the negative sign if occurs).
- ② Find the difference of two numbers in column II, and put it under the column I. (neglecting the negative sign if occurs)
- ③ Proceed same for each row.

Question: Two players A and B without showing each other, put on a table a coin, with head or tail up. A wins Rs 8 when both the coin show head and Rs 1 when both are tails. B wins Rs 3 when the coin do not match. Given the choice of being being matching player (A) or non-matching player (B). Which one should you choose and what would be your strategy?

Solution:

Step 1: The pay-off matrix for A:-

		Player B	
		H	T
		8	-3
Player A	H	8	-3
	T	-3	1

Step 2: Apply minimax criteria to find saddle point

		Player B		
		H	T	B-Min
		8	-3	-3
Player A	H	8	-3	-3
	T	-3	1	-3

c-max

8	1
---	---