

Core - Bug # 48673

Status:	Accepted	Priority:	Must have
Author:	Rainer Becker	Category:	Frontend
Created:	2013-05-30	Assigned To:	Markus Klein
Updated:	2015-07-25	Due date:	
TYPO3 Version:	6.2		
PHP Version:			
Complexity:	nightmare		
Is Regression:	No		
Sprint Focus:	Remote Sprint		
Subject:	Changed language overlay behaviour in TYPO3 6.*		
Description			
<p>Create this records:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">- 0A All languages- 1A Default Language<ul style="list-style-type: none">- 1B Default Language translated- 2A Default Language (hidden)<ul style="list-style-type: none">- 2B Default Language translated- 3A Default Language<ul style="list-style-type: none">- 3B Default Language translated (hidden)- 4A Default Language- 5B Default Language translated <p>Setting: sys_language_overlay = hideNonTranslated</p> <p>In FE / default language / TYPO3 V6 these will be shown: 0A, 1A, 3A, 4A (which is correct in my opinion)</p> <p>In FE / other language / TYPO3 V6 these will be shown: 0A, 1B (which is incorrect in my opinion; 2B and 5B are missing)</p> <p>In FE / other language / TYPO3 V4.5 these will be shown: 0A, 1B, 5B (which is still incorrect in my opinion; 2B is missing)</p> <p>Is this change intended? If yes: Where is this documented? This is a major change in one of the most crucial enterprise features of TYPO3...</p> <p>Btw: If records are fetched via extbase in V6 all translated records (0A, 1B, 2B, 5B) show up.</p> <p>In TYPO3 6.1 the behaviour is unchanged.</p>			
Related issues:			
related to Core - Bug # 17354: fallback for menus. "content_fallback;1,0" has...		Under Review	2007-07-22
related to Core - Bug # 19114: sys_language_mode does not work		Under Review	2008-07-16
related to TypoScript Reference (TSref) - Feature # 49106: Add new option "in...		Resolved	2013-06-13
related to Core - Bug # 63684: sys_language_uid and sys_language_content are ...		New	2014-12-08
related to Core - Bug # 52960: FE Language overlay differs from BE		New	2013-10-18
related to Core - Feature # 33734: Domain - Language mapping		New	2012-02-07
related to Core - Bug # 39798: Language changes on re-ordering of Content Ele...		Accepted	2012-08-14
related to Core - Feature # 34823: Remove language "default" from Alternative...		Resolved	2012-03-14

related to Core - Bug # 60052: sys_language_mode=content_fallback only suppor...
precedes Core - Bug # 56351: view page in another language than default langu...

Closed
New

2014-07-02
2014-02-26

History

#1 - 2013-05-31 12:29 - Alexander Opitz

- Status changed from New to Needs Feedback

Not showing 5B is correct behavior for "hideNonTranslated":

"Hide default translation of the page" incompatible with content binding: When using the "Binding" method (ie. "config.sys_language_overlay = 1 / hideNonTranslated") you must supply placeholder records in the default language if you use the "Localization setting" for pages "Hide default translation of the page".

<http://docs.typo3.org/typo3cms/FrontendLocalizationGuide/LocalizedContent/ContentBinding/Index.html>

As sxw: http://typo3.org/documentation/document-library/guides/doc_l10nguide/1.1.0/sxw/?no_cache=1 as some Tables are broken in the HTML Version.

Not showing 2B is IMHO also correct, as the page is hidden.

Does this hint solve your problem?

#2 - 2013-05-31 12:43 - Rainer Becker

My case is just about content elements, the page is visible in both languages - sorry, I didn't mention that.

So 2B should show up - no matter that it's original 2A is hidden.

Ok, the 5B case is documented then. In my opinion this is not very intuitive (my clients think so too). In large scale translated projects there are cases, where an english page consists of different content elements than the german one. Telling the editor to either link records which have different meanings in de/en is no good solution; why shouldn't it be possible to create a record just in EN?

#3 - 2013-06-01 11:29 - Alexander Opitz

Then maybe you need another translation mode.

#4 - 2013-06-03 09:35 - Rainer Becker

- File *TYPO3_6.0_LanguageModes.pdf* added

I tried all combinations of sys_language_modes (not set, strict, ignore, content_fallback, content_fallback;1,0) against sys_language_overlay (not set,hideNonTranslated, 1).

No one leads to the desired result. I attached my test matrix results (green background means: this one should show up in my opinion).

Or which other language related setting did I miss?

Why does Extbase fetch data in another way than styles.content.get()? (It show all the records I want to see in strict/hideNonTranslated mode)

#5 - 2013-06-03 10:26 - Markus Klein

Hi!

I agree that the translation stuff has some flaws. Especially the fallback mechanism is not doing so well.
I didn't inspect your report in detail yet, but I'll try to bring some attention to this crucial part of TYPO3.

Thanks for you tests. Could you also upload your test setup as t3d? This would help to compare your test setup against mine.

#6 - 2013-06-04 11:43 - Rainer Becker

- *File l10ntest.zip added*

I created a little test suite. You can see and change the language settings (sys_language_uid, sys_language_mode, sys_language_overlay). I created icons to visualize the results. Results are splitted in contents fetched by TypoScript, contents fetched by Extbase (for this to work you need to install the attached ext) and all contents.

Please have a look at it and tell me, if this works for you.

Btw: the results are... interesting.

#7 - 2013-06-11 15:59 - Alexander Opitz

- *Priority changed from Should have to Must have*

Raise priority as I think this should be fixed for LTS.

#8 - 2013-06-18 10:54 - Alexander Opitz

- *Status changed from Needs Feedback to New*

#9 - 2013-11-20 13:03 - Matthias Secker

I totally agree that this is a must have for LTS.

In most multilingual websites I use

- sys_language_mode = content_fallback
- sys_language_overlay = hideNonTranslated

Since TYPO3 6 I'm not able to add some extra CEs to a translated page, but I think this is a necessary feature.

For now I deactivate sys_language_overlay, but I face some side effects e.g. TS CONTENT objects will not be overlayed.

Furthermore I got problems with l10n_mode in TCA. Using the data from original language CE by using "exclude" or "mergeIfNotBlank" will not deliver the data in my extbase extension, so I have to fill out every CE field for every language, even if the content is the same. Tried this with and without sys_language_overlay. Can anybody confirm this behavior?

Would be great to see some improvements in LTS.

#10 - 2013-11-20 13:34 - Markus Klein

- *TYPO3 Version changed from 6.1 to 6.2*

- *Is Regression set to No*

I invested quite some time to investigate the status quo.

Together with others we came to the conclusion that is unfortunately by far not trivial to fix and even more the concept behind translation in TYPO3 CMS has to be re-thought.

There are ideas from Oliver Hader and there are working patches like [1], but neither can this patch be backported, nor does it really fit with improvements desirable for 6.2 and later.

The last decision was that Olly will implement his ideas into 6.2, but nobody can guarantee if this works out in the remaining time.

[1] <https://review.typo3.org/9937>

#11 - 2013-11-20 13:57 - Gunther Schöbinger

- *Target version set to next-patchlevel*

In my option the working patch is no solution. The output in the frontend of TYPO3 is buggy and it does not show 1:1 the translations from the backend. This still confuse the editors:

1. sys_language_overlay = 0

- the frontend displays content-elements with a separate language (pdf: only NL)
- the frontend **did not show** content-elements with the label "all languages"

2. sys_language_overlay = 1 / hideNonTranslated

- the frontend **did not show** displays content-elements with a separate language (pdf: only NL)
- the frontend displays content-elements with the label "all languages"

Both possibilities("all languages" and separate contentelements) are available/visible in the backend, but only one of these could be visible at the frontend.

#12 - 2014-02-24 21:01 - Gernot Plöiner

- *File test.jpg added*

Same Problem here. Tested with TYPO3 4.5.30 and 6.1.7! So the Problem exists much longer than 6.x!

I create Content as following:

- default language with translations (de+en)
- standalone default language (de)
- standalone translation (en)
- all languages (de+en)

The Backend-View looks like as expected.

In the Frontend it is not possible to get the same contellation.

I understand the backport problem. Whats about new fixed TypoScript Keywords (e.g.: sysLanguageMode / sysLanguageOverlay) and set the sys_language_mode and sys_language_overlay to deprecated?

With Templavoila the Problem doesn't exist. But at this time a lot of people switch from TV to other solutions and meet this problem. So it is very important to fix it as soon as possible.

My TypoScript:

```
config {
    sys_language_uid = 0
```

```

locale_all = de_AT
language = de
htmlTag_langKey = de
#column1:
sys_language_mode = strict
#sys_language_mode = content_fallback
#sys_language_mode = ignore
#column2:
#sys_language_overlay = 1
#sys_language_overlay = hideNonTranslated
#sys_language_overlay = 0
}

```

```

[globalVar = GP:L = 1]
config {
sys_language_uid = 1
language = en
locale_all = en_GB
htmlTag_langKey = en
}
[end]

```

```

page = PAGE
page {
10 = CONTENT
10 {
table = tt_content
select {
pidInList = this
orderBy = sorting
#column3:
languageField=sys_language_uid
}
}
}
}

```

#13 - 2014-03-25 21:00 - Gernot Ploiner

Thank you TYPO3 6.2
select.includeRecordsWithoutDefaultTranslation = 1
Not tested yet, but i think this is what i need :-)

#14 - 2014-04-18 13:13 - Stefan Neufeind

includeRecordsWithoutDefaultTranslation was added in #49106

#15 - 2014-08-28 21:36 - Christian Ludwig

Are there any news about this bug?
We are running a site with 6.2.4 still having problems with the translation.

Our setup:

```
# Default (German)
config {
    sys_language_uid = 0

    locale_all = de_DE.UTF-8
    language = de
    language_alt = de
    htmlTag_langKey = de-DE
}

# English /en/
[globalVar = GP:L = 2]
config {
    sys_language_uid = 2

    locale_all = en_GB.UTF-8
    language = en
    language_alt = en
    htmlTag_langKey = en-GB
}
[global]

# Chinese /cn/
[globalVar = GP:L = 3]
config {
    sys_language_uid = 3

    locale_all = zh_CN.UTF-8
    language = zh
    language_alt = zh
    htmlTag_langKey = zh-CN
}
[global]
```

We have translated all pages 1:1 (German:English) and only some Chinese pages are missing. Here the german content gets displayed (menus are shown in Chinese, TS-Content in German, see description at the end of my post).

No we need to change the fallback language to English (L=2) with these additional settings:

```
config.sys_language_mode = content_fallback; 2,0
config.sys_language_overlay = 1
```

Everything seems to work fine, but contents from a custom fluid extension with IRRE elements suddenly disappear from every page.

An other problem that existed before is that content (global footer) added by TypoScript to the template (Fluid cObject ViewHelper) with `styles.content.get` is displayed in the fallback language instead of the exiting content. I tried `select.includeRecordsWithoutDefaultTranslation = 1`, without success.

```
lib.footer < styles.content.get
lib.footer {
  select.pidInList = 16
  select.where = colPos=0
  select.includeRecordsWithoutDefaultTranslation = 1
}
```

#16 - 2014-09-18 12:59 - Markus Klein

@Rainer

I'm just reading your PDF file again.

A few questions:

- Which language had which UID?
- What does a crossed-out language mean?
- What language did you request for each testcase? L=?

#17 - 2014-09-18 14:28 - Rainer Becker

DE is sysLangUid 0 (default),

NL is sysLangUid 2

Green backgrounds mean "This record should show up", check means "it did show up".

Columns "DE" mean "page is called with L=0, "NL" means page is called with "L=2"

Crossed out means "record exists but is hidden"

Left column:

- * = ContentRecord for language=ALL
- DE+NL = ContentRecord is created for DE and translated to NL
- DE (crossedout) + NL = ContentRecord is created for DE and translated to NL, DE is hidden
- DE + NL (crossedout) = ContentRecord is created for DE and translated to NL, NL is hidden
- DE = ContentRecord is created only for DE
- NL = ContentRecord is created only for NL

#18 - 2014-10-08 09:19 - Andreas Allacher

Bug #49176

does not yet work for me with 6.2.5

Not sure where it checks regarding l10n_mode exclude.

The problem here is specifically the addSysLanguageStatement and if I query against a l10n_mode exclude field. Especially, if I want to mix l10n_mode exclude fields with non excluded.

Details regarding this I posted in the ticket: #49176#note-13

#19 - 2014-12-23 12:27 - Mathias Brodala

Andreas Allacher wrote:

*Bug #49176
does not yet work for me with 6.2.5*

Confirmed. The same issue is hitting us currently in Extbase.

| Not sure where it checks regarding l10n_mode exclude.

Nowhere. There is not a single occurrence of this in the Extbase persistence layer.

#20 - 2015-04-30 09:34 - Mathias Brodala

Please delete the last comment as it's clearly spam.

#21 - 2015-07-25 12:50 - Markus Klein

- Category set to Frontend
- Status changed from New to Accepted
- Assigned To set to Markus Klein
- Target version deleted (next-patchlevel)
- Complexity set to nightmare
- Sprint Focus set to Remote Sprint

Files

TYPO3_6.0_LanguageModes.pdf	118.7 kB	2013-06-03	Rainer Becker
l10ntest.zip	1 MB	2013-06-04	Rainer Becker
test.jpg	107.1 kB	2014-02-24	Gernot Ploiner