

Machine learning-based evidence and attribution mapping of 100,000 climate impact studies - Supplementary material

Max Callaghan^{1,2}, Carl-Friedrich Schleussner^{3,5}, Shruti Nath^{3,4}, Quentin Lejeune³, Thomas R. Knutson⁶, Markus Reichstein^{7,8}, Gerrit Hansen¹, Emily Theokritoff^{3,5}, Marina Andrijevic^{3,5}, Robert Brecha^{3,9}, Michael Hegarty³, Chelsea Jones³, Kaylin Lee³, Agathe Lucas³, Nicole van Maanen^{3,5}, Inga Menke³, Peter Pflieger^{3,5}, Burcu Yesil³, and Jan Minx^{1,2}

¹Mercator Research Institute on Global Commons and Climate Change, Torgauer Straße, 10829 Berlin, Germany

²Priestley International Centre for Climate, University of Leeds, Leeds LS2 9JT, United Kingdom

³Climate Analytics, Berlin, Germany

⁴Institute of Atmospheric and Climate Sciences, ETH Zürich, Switzerland

⁵Integrative Research Institute on Transformations of Human-Environment Systems, Humboldt University, Berlin, Germany

⁶NOAA/Geophysical Fluid Dynamics Laboratory, Princeton, NJ, 08540, USA

⁷Max Planck Institute for Biogeochemistry, Department Biogeochemical Integration, D-07701 Jena, Germany

⁸Michael Stifel Center Jena for Data-driven and Simulation Science, Jena, Germany

⁹Hanley Sustainability Institute, Renewable and Clean Energy Program and Physics Dept., University of Dayton, Dayton, Ohio, USA

		Coastal and marine Ecosystems	Human and managed systems	Mountains, snow and ice	Rivers, lakes, and soil mois- ture	Terrestrial ecosystems	Other sys- tems	Total
South America	D&A	365 (194-662)	460 (275-925)	296 (184-491)	384 (207-794)	1366 (699-2681)	830 (331-1744)	3674 (2400-5760)
	Other	209 (74-520)	130 (61-322)	57 (35-116)	234 (141-469)	235 (94-592)	205 (56-689)	1061 (605-1995)
North America	D&A	2429 (1304-4241)	1708 (936-3300)	1734 (972-3203)	2621 (1415-4899)	7835 (4308-13552)	5614 (2485-11662)	21745 (14364-31884)
	Other	1620 (579-3859)	446 (180-1240)	608 (295-1259)	1715 (876-3595)	2259 (1029-4821)	2307 (799-6068)	8868 (5002-15196)
Africa	D&A	448 (219-881)	1102 (625-2039)	268 (143-514)	747 (393-1422)	1556 (706-2951)	1246 (470-2725)	5323 (3391-8104)
	Other	345 (105-865)	364 (164-956)	79 (44-199)	531 (259-1077)	447 (182-1036)	496 (99-1488)	2251 (1220-4105)
Europe	D&A	1300 (628-2426)	1637 (934-3162)	985 (547-1937)	1307 (743-2638)	6006 (3389-10396)	2850 (1150-6705)	13991 (9105-21466)
	Other	678 (222-1900)	162 (70-620)	344 (198-723)	834 (439-1850)	816 (361-2020)	956 (287-2893)	3762 (2089-7232)
Asia	D&A	1164 (604-2097)	3516 (2124-6329)	1105 (700-2011)	2968 (1790-5292)	5822 (3270-10040)	6480 (3089-12295)	20885 (14705-29783)
	Other	712 (256-1856)	917 (410-2383)	275 (144-531)	1987 (1138-3699)	991 (402-2269)	1938 (664-4896)	6764 (3999-11548)
Oceania	D&A	890 (499-1484)	494 (271-979)	349 (191-622)	521 (296-993)	1539 (777-2866)	1720 (875-3228)	5482 (3579-8202)
	Other	594 (235-1239)	117 (50-367)	79 (44-192)	272 (125-568)	355 (155-873)	519 (215-1336)	1922 (1047-3441)
Global	D&A	5529 (2957-9755)	7729 (4487-14423)	3783 (2201-7050)	6623 (3777-12384)	19622 (10796-34361)	14498 (6382-30282)	57366 (38371-85227)
	Other	3465 (1277-8215)	1870 (823-5013)	1423 (750-2912)	4416 (2391-8910)	4249 (1885-9546)	5149 (1658-13868)	20419 (11697-35705)
Without location	D&A	0 (0-0)	0 (0-0)	0 (0-0)	0 (0-0)	0 (0-0)	0 (0-0)	0 (0-0)
	Other	3613 (1561-7413)	2587 (1213-6704)	1101 (575-2266)	1766 (887-3867)	11117 (5839-21759)	3956 (1517-11551)	23954 (13897-42921)

Table 1: The number of studies in each impact category and each continent

		Coastal and marine Ecosystems (WS>1)		Human and managed systems (WS>1)		Mountains, snow and ice (WS>1)		Rivers, lakes, and soil moisture (WS>1)		Terrestrial ecosystems (WS>1)		Other systems (WS>1)		Total (WS>5)	
		area	population	area	population	area	population	area	population	area	population	area	population	area	population
South America	D&A	8% (5%-31%)	26% (18%-51%)	26% (13%-62%)	55% (38%-79%)	11% (8%-15%)	19% (14%-32%)	16% (6%-45%)	33% (14%-68%)	63% (38%-64%)	77% (67%-81%)	45% (11%-64%)	63% (27%-81%)	52% (18%-63%)	75% (46%-81%)
	Other	3% (1%-27%)	6% (2%-15%)	24% (5%-34%)	14% (9%-17%)	13% (6%-14%)	6% (3%-10%)	19% (3%-34%)	15% (5%-19%)	36% (29%-36%)	19% (17%-19%)	28% (8%-36%)	17% (7%-19%)	33% (12%-36%)	19% (13%-19%)
North America	D&A	33% (19%-50%)	58% (43%-70%)	40% (25%-57%)	64% (48%-72%)	34% (18%-54%)	43% (27%-56%)	52% (24%-64%)	60% (41%-69%)	70% (61%-70%)	70% (64%-72%)	58% (32%-71%)	72% (58%-72%)	62% (55%-70%)	70% (69%-72%)
	Other	11% (5%-12%)	27% (9%-27%)	9% (7%-15%)	28% (26%-28%)	8% (5%-19%)	19% (8%-24%)	15% (9%-18%)	28% (28%-28%)	21% (16%-21%)	28% (28%-28%)	16% (11%-21%)	28% (27%-28%)	17% (16%-21%)	28% (28%-28%)
Africa	D&A	12% (4%-23%)	22% (12%-37%)	32% (25%-46%)	68% (58%-79%)	3% (1%-9%)	7% (6%-14%)	17% (5%-35%)	44% (18%-68%)	40% (22%-51%)	71% (46%-79%)	35% (15%-52%)	64% (26%-79%)	32% (24%-41%)	66% (51%-75%)
	Other	2% (0%-4%)	1% (0%-4%)	7% (3%-14%)	3% (3%-5%)	0% (0%-1%)	0% (0%-1%)	9% (1%-13%)	4% (2%-7%)	7% (3%-20%)	4% (2%-9%)	9% (2%-23%)	6% (2%-8%)	6% (2%-12%)	4% (2%-6%)
Europe	D&A	16% (11%-21%)	59% (41%-71%)	25% (20%-33%)	80% (73%-88%)	21% (8%-30%)	58% (25%-79%)	24% (18%-31%)	77% (64%-86%)	35% (28%-56%)	88% (83%-95%)	29% (21%-45%)	85% (73%-93%)	28% (25%-34%)	83% (78%-90%)
	Other	0% (0%-0%)	0% (0%-0%)	1% (0%-1%)	0% (0%-0%)	0% (0%-1%)	0% (0%-0%)	0% (0%-0%)	1% (0%-0%)	1% (1%-3%)	0% (0%-0%)	0% (0%-1%)	0% (0%-0%)	0% (0%-1%)	0% (0%-0%)
Asia	D&A	19% (6%-29%)	47% (18%-58%)	61% (44%-78%)	80% (75%-82%)	27% (14%-43%)	39% (12%-56%)	61% (34%-72%)	75% (50%-81%)	71% (60%-81%)	80% (72%-83%)	73% (51%-83%)	80% (73%-84%)	70% (60%-76%)	80% (78%-82%)
	Other	3% (1%-4%)	9% (4%-13%)	5% (5%-7%)	15% (15%-15%)	4% (2%-4%)	14% (6%-14%)	5% (5%-5%)	15% (15%-15%)	6% (4%-7%)	15% (14%-15%)	6% (5%-7%)	15% (15%-15%)	5% (5%-6%)	15% (15%-15%)
Oceania	D&A	76% (72%-76%)	91% (59%-91%)	74% (53%-84%)	70% (54%-86%)	3% (2%-8%)	37% (15%-53%)	19% (4%-83%)	53% (43%-82%)	84% (79%-86%)	77% (74%-92%)	86% (73%-86%)	89% (61%-91%)	84% (74%-86%)	84% (75%-92%)
	Other	14% (14%-14%)	5% (5%-5%)	14% (14%-14%)	5% (5%-5%)	1% (1%-3%)	4% (4%-4%)	14% (1%-14%)	5% (4%-5%)	14% (14%-14%)	5% (5%-5%)	14% (14%-14%)	5% (5%-5%)	14% (14%-14%)	5% (5%-5%)
Global	D&A	22% (13%-33%)	44% (23%-57%)	38% (27%-53%)	73% (64%-79%)	17% (9%-27%)	32% (13%-46%)	32% (16%-49%)	62% (40%-75%)	53% (41%-62%)	75% (63%-81%)	49% (29%-63%)	75% (59%-82%)	48% (37%-56%)	74% (67%-80%)
	Other	5% (2%-8%)	8% (3%-11%)	8% (4%-12%)	11% (11%-12%)	4% (2%-7%)	9% (4%-10%)	9% (3%-12%)	11% (10%-12%)	12% (9%-15%)	12% (11%-13%)	11% (5%-16%)	12% (11%-13%)	10% (6%-13%)	12% (11%-12%)

Table 2: The percentage of land area and population with robust evidence by impact category and continent

		Coastal and marine Ecosystems (WS>1)		Human and managed systems (WS>1)		Mountains, snow and ice (WS>1)		Rivers, lakes, and soil moisture (WS>1)		Terrestrial ecosystems (WS>1)		Other systems (WS>1)		Total (WS>5)	
		area	population	area	population	area	population	area	population	area	population	area	population	area	population
Low income	D&A	8% (2%-20%)	17% (5%-27%)	35% (29%-45%)	53% (46%-61%)	6% (3%-11%)	6% (3%-17%)	22% (7%-37%)	36% (11%-54%)	37% (25%-48%)	51% (41%-61%)	38% (17%-54%)	51% (27%-64%)	34% (27%-43%)	50% (43%-59%)
	Other	3% (0%-5%)	12% (11%-17%)	5% (4%-11%)	20% (20%-21%)	1% (1%-2%)	16% (5%-17%)	4% (2%-8%)	20% (18%-23%)	7% (3%-19%)	21% (18%-26%)	8% (4%-20%)	22% (19%-24%)	5% (3%-7%)	20% (19%-22%)
Lower middle income	D&A	26% (9%-37%)	59% (19%-65%)	50% (42%-74%)	77% (71%-80%)	22% (6%-29%)	49% (12%-58%)	38% (19%-59%)	67% (37%-77%)	64% (41%-71%)	78% (58%-80%)	58% (31%-72%)	76% (62%-80%)	58% (40%-65%)	77% (70%-79%)
	Other	5% (1%-8%)	10% (2%-16%)	14% (9%-19%)	18% (18%-18%)	12% (3%-12%)	17% (7%-17%)	13% (8%-20%)	18% (17%-19%)	19% (14%-21%)	19% (17%-19%)	15% (7%-22%)	18% (17%-19%)	16% (9%-21%)	18% (18%-19%)
Upper middle income	D&A	11% (5%-23%)	29% (17%-49%)	34% (21%-51%)	80% (69%-88%)	13% (9%-24%)	19% (11%-42%)	31% (16%-47%)	73% (52%-85%)	53% (39%-64%)	87% (81%-91%)	45% (25%-59%)	83% (67%-90%)	45% (33%-53%)	85% (77%-89%)
	Other	2% (1%-9%)	4% (1%-6%)	9% (3%-11%)	6% (4%-6%)	2% (2%-3%)	2% (0%-4%)	9% (2%-12%)	6% (4%-6%)	10% (8%-13%)	6% (5%-6%)	10% (4%-13%)	6% (5%-6%)	10% (5%-12%)	6% (5%-6%)
High Income	D&A	45% (34%-56%)	77% (60%-85%)	50% (37%-66%)	85% (80%-90%)	32% (16%-48%)	68% (37%-82%)	46% (24%-68%)	81% (71%-86%)	73% (66%-76%)	87% (86%-89%)	67% (47%-78%)	89% (81%-91%)	67% (60%-74%)	88% (85%-89%)
	Other	9% (6%-10%)	9% (6%-9%)	8% (6%-13%)	9% (8%-9%)	5% (3%-13%)	7% (6%-8%)	12% (5%-14%)	9% (8%-9%)	15% (12%-17%)	9% (9%-9%)	13% (9%-17%)	9% (9%-9%)	13% (12%-16%)	9% (9%-9%)
Global	D&A	22% (13%-33%)	44% (23%-57%)	38% (27%-53%)	73% (64%-79%)	17% (9%-27%)	32% (13%-46%)	32% (16%-49%)	62% (40%-75%)	53% (41%-62%)	75% (63%-81%)	49% (29%-63%)	75% (59%-82%)	48% (37%-56%)	74% (67%-80%)
	Other	5% (2%-8%)	8% (3%-11%)	8% (4%-12%)	11% (11%-12%)	4% (2%-7%)	9% (4%-10%)	9% (3%-12%)	11% (10%-12%)	12% (9%-15%)	12% (11%-13%)	11% (5%-16%)	12% (11%-13%)	10% (6%-13%)	12% (11%-12%)

Table 3: The percentage of land area and population with robust evidence by impact category and income category

		Gridcell sums	
		area	population
South America	D&A	64%	81%
	Other	36%	19%
North America	D&A	71%	72%
	Other	29%	28%
Africa	D&A	73%	89%
	Other	27%	11%
Europe	D&A	95%	100%
	Other	5%	0%
Asia	D&A	93%	85%
	Other	7%	15%
Oceania	D&A	86%	95%
	Other	14%	5%
Global	D&A	80%	87%
	Other	20%	13%

Table 4: The percentage of land area and population with attributable impacts in temperature and/or precipitation by continent

		Gridcell sums	
		area	population
5. Low income	D&A	74%	73%
	Other	26%	27%
4. Lower middle income	D&A	78%	81%
	Other	22%	19%
3. Upper middle income	D&A	85%	94%
	Other	15%	6%
1. High Income	D&A	78%	91%
	Other	22%	9%
Global	D&A	80%	87%
	Other	20%	13%

Table 5: The percentage of land area and population with attributable impacts in temperature and/or precipitation by income category