

# Tattvaratnāvaloka and Vivaraṇa

Vāgīśvarakīrti

February 15, 2025

## Some Conventions/Policies

- Tibetan translations are included in the apparatus when they indicate variant Sanskrit readings.
- Sanskrit renderings suggested by Tibetan appear in brackets after the translation's siglum. These renderings are hypothetical and cannot be provide in all cases.
- When two Tibetan translations differ slightly, they are separated by a semicolon. Only the second translation includes a Sanskrit rendering.
- A Tibetan translation's siglum is included when it appears to support one of multiple Sanskrit readings, based on the editors' judgment.
- Tibetan is not included in the apparatus when it offers no clear support for or against a reading.
- When both Tibetan translations of the commentary agree, they are given the siglum TV.

## Sigla and Abbreviations

TaRaA	Tattvaratnāvaloka
TaRaA-Vi	Tattvaratnāvalokavivaraṇa
E <sub>DH</sub>	Dhīḥ vol. 21, pp. 129–149.
K	NAK 5–252 = NGMPP A 915/4
TM <sub>D</sub>	<i>De kho na nyid rin po che snang ba</i> . Tōhoku no. 1889. sDe dge bstan 'gyur, vol. Pi, fols. 203r3–204r5. Tr. by 'Gos Lhas btsas
TVA <sub>D</sub>	<i>De kho na nyid rin po che snang ba'i rnam par bshad pa</i> . Tōh. 1890. sDe dge bsTan 'gyur, vol. 44 (rGyud 'grel, Pi), fols. 204r5–214v4. Tr. by 'Gos Lhas btsas.

TVB <sub>G</sub>	<i>De kho na nyid rin po che snang ba'i rnam par bshad pa</i> . Ōtani no. 4793. bsTan 'gyur gSer bris ma, vol. 84 (83 in BDRC outline(?)), (rGyud 'brel, Zhu), fols. 70v–85v. translator given.
TV	Both Tibetan translations of the commentary (differences, if any, indicated in a mini-aparatus)
<i>ac</i>	<i>ante correctionem</i>

<i>deest</i>	omitted in
<i>diag. conj.</i>	diagnostic conjecture [e.g. 'reconstructed' from Tibetan]
<i>conj.</i>	conjecture
<i>em.</i>	emendation [an emendation is made with a high degree of confidence, whereas a conjecture proposes a correction while acknowledging a greater possibility for alternatives]
fol./fols.	folio/folios
<i>pc</i>	<i>post correctionem</i>
<i>r</i>	recto
<i>v</i>	verso
$\Sigma_X$	Reading shared in all witnesses but X
(( <i>kiṃcit</i> ))	Reading uncertain—either illegible or otherwise in doubt
< <i>kiṃcit</i> >	Reading cancelled
† <i>kiṃcit</i> †	Reading does not make sense to the editor and an adequate conjecture was not able to be chosen.
[ <i>kiṃcit</i> ]	Indication of a diagnostic conjecture
..	Damaged <i>akṣara</i> (one . per half <i>akṣara</i> )
...	Lacunae of an unknown quantity of <i>akṣaras</i>
°	Mark of abbreviation

## Text

### 1 maṅgalācaraṇam

[K fol. 1r] [siddham]<sup>1</sup> namaḥ śrīsadgurupādebhyaḥ |<sup>i</sup>

anupamasukharūpī śrīnivāso 'nivāso  
nirupamadaśadevīrūpavidyaḥ<sup>2</sup> savidyaḥ |  
tribhuvanahitasaukhyaprāptikāro 'vikāro  
jayati kamalapāṇir yāvad āśāvikāśaḥ || 1 ||<sup>iii</sup>

[K fol. 2r3] namaḥ samantakāyavākcittavajrāya.<sup>iii</sup>

anupametyādi. kamalaṃ padmaṃ pāṇau yasya sa kamalapāṇir a-  
valokiteśvaro bhagavāñ jayatīti sambandhaḥ. kiṃviśiṣṭaḥ? anupa-  
mam ity<sup>3,iv</sup> atipraṇītatvamahattvāsaṃsārasthāyitvalakṣaṇair<sup>4</sup> dha-  
rmair yuktasyānyasyābhāvād upamārahitam sukham eva rūpaṃ sva-  
bhāvo yasya sa tathoktaḥ. punar api kiṃviśiṣṭaḥ? śrīḥ puṇyajñāna-  
sambhāralakṣaṇā, tasyā nivāsa āśrayo yaḥ sa tathā. dharmakāyarū-

<sup>i</sup> Scribal homage

<sup>ii</sup> This verse is in Mālinī metre.

<sup>iii</sup> Scribal homage

<sup>iv</sup> Here one may wish to conjecture a reading such as, *anumapetyādi. anupamam ity* ... This reading is partially suggested by TV: *khyad par ji lta bu zhig dang ldan zhe na | dpe med ces bya ba la sogs pa smos te | dpe med pa ni (ni)* TVAD; *dang* TVBG). The corruption, if there is one, can be seen as a kind of haplography. The text nonetheless reads acceptably well with the transcribed reading (although perhaps less smoothly); thus we feel that while a conjecture is possible it is not strongly compelling.

<sup>1</sup> [siddham] K; om EDH

<sup>2</sup> nirupama° EDH; nirūpama° K

<sup>3</sup> kiṃviśiṣṭaḥ? anupamam ity] K EDH; *khyad par ji lta bu zhig dang ldan zhe na | dpe med ces bya ba la sogs pa smos te | dpe med pa ni* TVAD; *khyad par ji lta bu zhig dang ldan zhe na | dpe med ces bya ba la sogs pa smos te | dpe med pa dang* TVBG (kiṃviśiṣṭa ity āha anumapam ityādi. anupamam)

<sup>4</sup> °saṃsārasthāyitva° K; °saṃsārasthāyisva° EDH

patvena<sup>5,v</sup> sarvagatatvāt [E<sub>DH</sub> p. 132] pratiniyatanivāsābhāvād anivāsaḥ.

punaḥ kīdrśaḥ? nirupamaḥ paramarūpayauvanaśṛṅgārādirasa-mahākaruṇādiyuktatvenopamātīkrāntā rūpavajrādītārāparyantadaśadevīrūpā vidyāḥ paricāraakatvena<sup>6</sup> yasya sa tathā. saha svābhārūpayā vidyayā<sup>7</sup> vartata iti savidyāḥ. tribhuvanasya tribhuvanavartino janasya yad dhitam āyatipathyam<sup>8,vi</sup> buddhatvādikam, saukhyam

<sup>v</sup> The manuscript's *dharmakāyarūpitvena* is theoretically acceptable and nearly synonymous; however, *dharmakāyarūpatvena* is more expected, with forms in *°rūpatvena* being vastly more frequent in Classical Sanskrit. TV's reading *chos kyi sku'i ngo bo nyid kyi* does not clearly confirm either variant, as *rūpin* in the root verse is also translated as *ngo bo*. We provisionally adopt *dharmakāyarūpatvena*, but cannot fully discount the transmitted reading.

<sup>vi</sup> We need not necessarily read a compound for *āyatipathyam*, treating instead *āyati* as a locative of *āyat*. The expression appears as a gloss for *hita* in several Buddhist texts, such as in Vilāsavajra's *Mantrārthāvalokinī*: *mahyam hitam maddhitam hitam āyatipathyam āgāmipariṇāmatvāt* (p. 233). Similarly, Durvekamiśra writes in his *Hetubinduṭīkāloka*: *parasmai hitamāyati pathyam* (p. 212). In both cases, the construction is ambiguous, but in the latter case, the editors of Durvekamiśra's text have not taken it as a compound.

The word *āyatipathya* is used less ambiguously in compound by Śākyarakṣita, quoted in the following note. Similarly, the roughly parallel expression *āyatisukha* is evidently treated as a compound by Yaśomitra in his *Abhidharmakośavyākhyā*: *aihikasukhārtham apuṇyam iti. ihasukhāpekṣayā tat kṛtam nāyatisukhāpekṣayety arthaḥ* (vol. 1 p. 299). Note also the contrast made with *aihikasukha*. Likewise, we can find a compounded form of *āyatidukha* in a verse attributed to Naradatta in the *Subhāṣitaratnaśoḥa*: *muṇḍāpriyād āyatidukhadāyino vasantam utsārya vijṛmbhitaśriyaḥ | na kaḥ khalāt tāpitamitramaṇḍalād upaiti pāpam tapavāsarād iva ||* 'Who does not become miserable because of a rogue who, like a hot day, is hated by widows (? *muṇḍā*) (the hot day being hated by bald men), who leads to future pain, whose wealth expands after he expels those living with him (like the hot day manifests its richness having dismissed the spring), and who annoys his circle of friends (like on a hot day the orb of the sun is heated) (cf. INGALLS 1965: 553).

<sup>5</sup> *dharmakāyarūpatvena*] *em.*; *dharmakāyarūpitvena* K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>6</sup> *paricāraakatvena*] *em.*; *sapari(c)ārakatvena* K; *sapariṇārakatvena* E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>7</sup> *vidyayā*] K E<sub>DH</sub>; *rig pa ste | shes rab TV* (*vidyayā prajñayā*)

<sup>8</sup> *āyatipathyam*] *variant word division in* E<sub>DH</sub>: *āyati pathyam*; *and in* K: *āyati | pathyam*

tadātve pathyaṃ<sup>9</sup> cakravartitvādikam,<sup>vii</sup> tasya yā prāptiḥ<sup>10</sup> [K fol. 2v] sāksātkriyā, tasyāḥ karaṇaṃ kāro yasya sa tathā.<sup>viii</sup> aparinirvā-

<sup>vii</sup> The text is insecure here but perhaps not far from the author's intention. Where the manuscript reads *tad dāpayati pathyaṃ* (word division unclear, *pa* and *ya* touching), we conjecture *tadātve pathyaṃ*, following only partially the lead of TVA<sub>D</sub>. The Tibetan translations read as follows: *gang la phan pa ni ma 'ongs pa'i phan pa ste | sangs rgyas nyid la sogs pa'o || de la bde ba ni 'phral gyi phan pa ste |* (TVA<sub>D</sub>); *gang la phan pa ni ma 'ongs pa'i phan pa ste | sangs rgyas nyid la sogs pa dang | de la bde ba ni bde ba ste | 'khor lo bsgyur ba nyid la sogs pa'o ||* (TVB<sub>G</sub>). It appears that TVB<sub>G</sub> also transmits a corrupt reading. TVA<sub>D</sub> suggests reading something that contrasts with *āyati pathyaṃ*, for which *tadātve pathyaṃ* fits. Another possibility is *āpātapaṃ*, but *tadātva* is more often used in contrast with *āyati*. See, for example, Śākyarakṣita's *Vṛttamālāstutivṛtti: prthagjanatve 'pi āyatipathyadārśinas tadātve ca niṣpāpāḥ* (p. 299); 'Although ordinary people, they see the future welfare and are without sin in the present moment.'

The Tibetan translations also suggest that *hita* and *saukhya* are linked with relative and corelative pronouns: *gang la* and *de la*, or *yasya* and *tasya* in Sanskrit. This does not yield good sense. It is possible that *tadātve* was misread by the translator as a corelative pronoun, while it is also possible that a second relative pronoun (*yat*) or a conjunction (*ca*) was found in the original text near *saukhyaṃ*. Here *hitasaukhya* within the larger compound is only really viable as a *dvandva*: Avalokiteśvara causes the attainment of (ultimate) welfare and (temporary) happiness for all beings. Given that, *tayor yā prāptiḥ* might be preferable to *tasya yā prāptiḥ*, but the singular is also probably acceptable in place of the dual.

<sup>viii</sup> It is notable that Vāgīśvakīrti evidently understands °*prāptikāra* as a *bahuvrīhi*, whereas other commentators may prefer to treat it akin to *kumbhakāra* and therefore as an *upapadasamāsa* as per *Aṣṭādhyāyī* 3.1.18. Given the latter understanding, the expected gloss for *prāptikāra* would be *prāptiṃ karoti*. Compounds ending in *kāra* are occasionally analysed as *ṣaṣṭhitatpuruṣas*: see, for examples, Vijñāneśvara's *Mitākṣarā ad Yājñavalkya-dharmaśāstra* 2.61 on *satyaṃkārakṛta*, here referring roughly to a thing 'acquired with a pledge', i.e., acquired as earnest money: *karaṇaṃ kāraḥ, bhāve ghaṇ. satyasya kāraḥ satyaṃkārakṛt—kāre satyāga-dasya (Aṣṭādhyāyī 6.3.70) iti mum. satyaṃkāreṇa kṛtaṃ satyaṃkārakṛtam* (p. 275). We are unable to provide another example of a compound ending in *kāra* analysed as a *bahuvrīhi*, but we should also note that the compound *prāptikāra* is itself rare.

TV does not clearly reflect a *bahuvrīhi* analysis, nor does it very clearly point to another reading: *de dag sgrub par mdzad po gang yin pa de la de skad ces bya'o* (TVA<sub>D</sub>); *de dag gi rgyu mdzad pa gang yin pa de la de skad ces bya'o* (TVB<sub>G</sub>).

<sup>9</sup> *saukhyaṃ tadātve pathyaṃ*] *conj.*; *tad dāpayati pathyaṃ* K E<sub>DH</sub> (word division unclear); *de la bde ba ni 'phral gyi phan pa* TVA<sub>D</sub>; *de la bde ba ni bde ba ste* TVB<sub>G</sub>

<sup>10</sup> *prāptiḥ*] K E<sub>DH</sub>; *thob pa ni rnyed pa ste* TV (*prāptir lābhaḥ*)

ṇadharmakatvenāpratiṣṭhitanirvāṇarūpatvenā<sup>11</sup> nyathātvalakṣaṇasya vikāraśyābhāvād avikārah. evaṃviśiṣṭo bhagavāñ jayati.

kiyaṃtaṃ kālam ity āha—yāvad āśāvikaśāḥ. āśa daśa diśo gaganasvarūpāḥ. yadvā āśāḥ sarvasattvānāṃ bhavabhogaṭṭṣṇāḥ.<sup>12</sup> tā-sāṃ vikāśā avakāśāḥ pravartanāni, prādurbhāvā iti yāvat. te yāvat tāvad<sup>13</sup> bhagavāñ jayati, sarvahariharahirāṇyagarbhādibhyaḥ prakṛṣṭo bhavatīty arthaḥ.

atrānupamasukharūpīty anena svārthasaṃpattīḥ kathitā. śrīni-vāsa ity anena tadupāyaḥ, puṇyajñānasambhārayoḥ śrīśābenābhihitatvāt. tribhuvanahitasaukhyaprāptikāra ity anena parārthasaṃpattir uktā. nirupamadaśadevīrūpavidyaḥ sa vidya ity anena tadupāyaḥ,<sup>14</sup> tathābhūtadaśadevīdvātriṃśallakṣaṇāśītyanuvyañjanakāyākā-raśūnyena<sup>15</sup> sarvākāraparārthasaṃpatteḥ kartum āśakyatvād iti.

## 2 prajojanādi

śrīmantranītigatacārucaturthaseka-  
rūpaṃ vidanti na hi ye sphuṭaśabdaśūnyam |  
nānopadeśagaṇasaṃkulasaptabhedais  
teṣaṃ sphuṭāvagataye kriyate prayatnaḥ || 2 ||<sup>ix</sup>

śrīmantranītiśabdena<sup>16</sup> sāmānyayogatantravācakenāpi śrīsamājah<sup>17</sup> parigrhyate, caturthārthakasyānyatrāsambhavāt. śeṣaṃ subodham.

<sup>ix</sup> This verse is in Vasantatilakā.

<sup>11</sup> °rūpatvenā°] K E<sub>DH</sub>; ngo bo rnyed pas TVA<sub>D</sub>; ngo bo brnyed pas TVB<sub>G</sub> (°rūpa-prāptyā°)

<sup>12</sup> °ṭṭṣṇāḥ] E<sub>DH</sub> (°ṭṭṣṇās); ṭṭṣṇā K

<sup>13</sup> te yāvat tāvad] *em.*; tā yāvat tāvad K E<sub>DH</sub>; de srid du TV (tāvad)

<sup>14</sup> tathābhūta°] K E<sub>DH</sub> TVB<sub>G</sub> (*de lta bu*); *no reflex* in TVA<sub>D</sub>

<sup>15</sup> °kāyā°] K E<sub>DH</sub>; dam pa'i sku TV (°satkāyā°)

<sup>16</sup> śrīmantranītiśabdena] K E<sub>DH</sub> TVB<sub>G</sub> (dpal ldan sngags kyi gzhung lugs zhes bya ba'i sgras); dpal ldan sngags kyi gzhung lugs shes || zhes bya ba la sogs pa la | sngags kyi gzhung lugs zhes bya ba'i sgras ni | TVA<sub>D</sub> (śrīmantranītigatetyādi. mantranītiśabdena)

<sup>17</sup> śrīsamājah] K E<sub>DH</sub>; shugs kyis dpal gsang ba 'dus pa TV (sāmārthyāt śrīsamājah)

nānācāryopadeśagaṇasaṃkulai[E<sub>DH</sub> p. 133]r vyākulaiḥ<sup>18</sup> saptabhir  
bhedaiḥ prakāraiḥ<sup>19</sup> atītānāgatavartamānācārya<sup>20</sup> gatopadeśarāśisaṃgrāhakaiḥ.<sup>21,x</sup>  
sphuṭāvagataye sukhena sphuṭapratītyartham<sup>22</sup> iti.

### 3 tīrthikānāṃ tattvaṃ sādhyam ca

sambhrāntabodhā nikhilā hi tīrthyās  
tattvasya sādhyasya ca rūpavittau |  
tebhyah prakṛṣṭaḥ kila tattvavettā  
vedāntavādīti janapravādaḥ || 3 ||<sup>xi</sup>

sambhrāntetyādi. sambhrānto vibhrānto bodhaḥ prajñāviśeṣo yeṣāṃ  
tīrthikānāṃ te tatho[K fol. 3r]ktāḥ.<sup>23</sup> sarva eva tīrthyā ātmātmīya-  
grahatimiropahatabuddhinayanāḥ. tattvam idam iti sādhyam idam<sup>24</sup>

<sup>x</sup> In this case TVB<sub>G</sub> resembles closely the Sanskrit text transmitted in K, apart from the addition of a further gloss after *vyākula*. The reading *rnam par bkaḥ pa* ('covered') doesn't yield much sense, but it could be a mistake for *rnam par bkang ba* ('filled'), which is perfectly fitting and synonymous with TVA<sub>D</sub>'s *rnam par khyab pa* (Negi records the latter as rendering *vipūrṇa* in some texts). One may wish to conjecture such a reading. TVA<sub>D</sub> is significantly different here, even though most of the words of the transmitted Sanskrit text are still reflected: *du ma'i man ngag ces bya ba la sogs pa la | 'das pa dang ma 'ongs pa dang | da ltar gyi slob dpon du ma'i man ngag gi tshogs yang dag par bsduḥ pa'i mdun gyi dbye bas yongs su dkrugs pa ni | rnam par dkrugs pas rnam pa thams cad la rnam par khyab pa ste | des bsgrub par bya ba dkrugs pa'o ||* The text is dubious but reflects a Sanskrit text along the following lines: *nānācāryopadeśarāśisaṃgrāhakaiḥ saptabhir bhedaiḥ saṃkulair vyākulaiḥ sarvatravīpūrṇaiḥ taiḥ sādhyasaṃkulaiḥ*.

<sup>xi</sup> This verse is in *Indravajrā*.

<sup>18</sup> *vyākulaiḥ*] K E<sub>DH</sub>; *rnam par dkrugs pas rnam pa thams cad la rnam par khyab pa* TVA<sub>D</sub>; *rnam par 'khrugs pa rnam par bkaḥ pa ste* TVB<sub>G</sub>; *vyākulair vipūrṇaiḥ possible conj. (see notes)*

<sup>19</sup> *prakāraiḥ*] K E<sub>DH</sub>; *no reflex in TV*

<sup>20</sup> *°vartamānā°*] E<sub>DH</sub>; *°pravartamānā°* K

<sup>21</sup> *°gato°*] K E<sub>DH</sub> TVB<sub>G</sub> (*gtogs pa*); *no reflex in TVA<sub>D</sub>*

<sup>22</sup> *sukhena sphuṭapratītyartham*] K E<sub>DH</sub>; *bde bar gnas par khong du chud par bya ba'i phyir* TVA<sub>D</sub>; *bde bar gsal bar khong du chud par bya'o* TVB<sub>G</sub>

<sup>23</sup> *te tathoktāḥ*] K<sup>pc</sup>; *te thoktāḥ* K<sup>ac</sup>; *tathoktāḥ* E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>24</sup> *sādhyam idam*] *em.*; *sādhyam cedam* K E<sub>DH</sub>



iti ca tattvasya sādhyasya yat<sup>25</sup> svarūpaṃ tasya yā vittiḥ pratītiḥ, ta-  
syāṃ bhrāntāḥ. śeṣaṃ subodham.

nanu tattvasādhyayor upādeyatvenaika-rūpatvāt katham tattva-  
sya sādhyasya ceti<sup>26, xii</sup> bhedenā nirdeśa itī cet. asad etat. tattvaṃ  
hy upādeyatve 'pi<sup>27</sup> sukhaduḥkhoppekṣādisakalapratibhāsaṃdoha-  
vyāpakam.<sup>28</sup> sādhyam cānabhimataparīhāreṇecchālakṣaṇaṃ phalam  
upādeyatve 'pi sakalaprañibhir avāśyam evāsādhyavyāvṛtṭyā sādha-  
yitavyatvenābhimatam ity adoṣaḥ.

#### 4 vedāntavādināṃ śrāvakapratyekabuddhānāṃ ca sādhyāni

tatra tāvad<sup>29</sup> vedāntavādyabhimatam sādhyam āha—ānandarūpaṃ  
ityādi.

ānandarūpaṃ svavid<sup>xiii</sup> aprakampyaṃ  
vedāntinaḥ sādhyam uṣanti śāntam<sup>30</sup> |  
saśrāvakāḥ<sup>31</sup> khaḍgajināś ca sādhyam  
icchanti rūpādyupadher virāmam || 4 ||

<sup>xii</sup> E<sub>DH</sub> misreads the manuscript as *tattvasya sādhyasya ceti* and supplies *katham* after *ceti*. There is in fact a *katham* before *tattvasya* in the manuscript, but the *tat* preceding that *katham* is evidently a corruption.

<sup>xiii</sup> From the commentary it is clear that *svavid* is not in compound; thus, being an accusative form of a feminine noun, we expect *svavidam*. The form may be grammatically justifiable if it is treated as neuter adjective, akin to *vedavid*.

<sup>25</sup> yat] E<sub>DH</sub> (*em.*); tat K

<sup>26</sup> katham tattvasya sādhyasya ceti] *em.*; tat katham tattvasya sādhyasya ceti K; tattvasya sādhyasya ceti katham E<sub>DH</sub> (*em.*)

<sup>27</sup> upādeyatve 'pi] *conj.* (TV: blang bar bya ba nyid yin yang); upādeyatvenāpi K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>28</sup> vyāpakam] K (°kaṃ) E<sub>DH</sub> TVB<sub>G</sub> (khyab par byed pa yin la); shes bya tsam du khyab par byed pa yin la TVA<sub>D</sub> (°vyāpakam jñeyamātratvena)

<sup>29</sup> tāvad] K E<sub>DH</sub> TVA<sub>D</sub> (re zhig); *no reflex in* TVB<sub>G</sub>

<sup>30</sup> śāntam] *corr.*; sāntam K E<sub>DH</sub>; *no reflex in* TM<sub>D</sub>

<sup>31</sup> saśrāvakāḥ] *em.*; saśrāvakā K E<sub>DH</sub>

ānandarūpam iti sadāsukhamayatvāt. svavid iti jyotirūpatvena<sup>32</sup> svayaṃ prakāśamānatvāt.<sup>33</sup> aprakampyam iti nityatayā<sup>34</sup> kampayitum aśakyatvāt. śāntam<sup>35</sup> iti kleśopakleśaśūnyatvena parikalpitatvāt. evaṃvidhaṃ sādhyam uṣanti kāmayinge.

saha śrāvakair vartante ye khaḍgajināḥ khaḍgaviṣṇanakalpā e-kacāriṇo vargacāriṇaś<sup>36</sup> ca pratyekabuddhāḥ te sādhyam icchanti. kiḍḍṣam? rūpādyupadher virāmaṃ rūpavedanāsaṃjñāsaṃskāravi-jñānalakṣaṇānām upadhīnāṃ skandhānāṃ virāmaṃ vicchedam, nir-rodham iti yāvat. [E<sub>DH</sub> p. 134] etad uktaṃ bhavati—sarvaśrāvaka-pratyekabuddhāḥ sopadhiśeṣanirupadhiśeṣabhedenā bhinne 'pi nir-vāṇe<sup>37</sup> nirupadhiśeṣam eva nirvāṇaṃ sā[K fol. 3v]kṣātkartavyatvena sādhyam pratipannāḥ.

## 5 pāramitānayavādināṃ caturvidhaṃ sādhyam

idānīm pāramitānayavādināṃ abhimataṃ<sup>38</sup> caturvidhaṃ sādhyam āha—ākāraśūnyam ityādi.

ākāraśūnyam gaganendurūpaṃ  
pratyātmavedyaṃ karuṇārasaṃ ca |  
sallakṣaṇair bhūṣitam<sup>39</sup> arthakāri  
dānādiniṣyandam apetasaukhyam || 5 ||

sānandasallakṣaṇamaṇḍitāṅgaṃ  
sambhujaṃ mānaṃ daśabhūmisamsthāiḥ |  
sattvārthakāri pravādanti sādhyam  
dānādiṣaṭpāramitānayasthāḥ || 6 ||<sup>xiv</sup>

<sup>xiv</sup> These two verses are in Indraavajrā.

<sup>32</sup> jyotirūpatvena] K; jyotirūpatvena E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>33</sup> prakāśamānatvāt] E<sub>DH</sub> (*em.*); prakāśamānat K

<sup>34</sup> nityatayā] E<sub>DH</sub>; anityatayā K TV (mi rtag pa nyid kyis)

<sup>35</sup> śāntam] *corr.*; sāntam K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>36</sup> vargacāriṇaś] K TV (tshogs kyi spyod pa) ; vanacāriṇaś E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>37</sup> nirvāṇe] E<sub>DH</sub>; nirvāṇa° K

<sup>38</sup> abhimataṃ] E<sub>DH</sub>; abhimata K

<sup>39</sup> bhūṣitam] E<sub>DH</sub>; bhuṣitam K

### 5.1 pāramitānaye prathamam sādhyam

ākārair nīlapītasukhaduḥkhādibhiś citrarūpaiḥ śūnyaṃ nirākāram. ata eva gaganasyeva nirākāratvenendor iva prabhāsvaratvena rūpam svabhāvo yasya tat tathā. pratyātmavedyam iti svasaṃvedanaikavedyam.<sup>40</sup> karuṇā duḥkhād<sup>41</sup> duḥkhahetor vā sakalajagadabhyuddharaṇakāmatā.<sup>42,xv</sup> saiva rasaḥ svabhāvo yasya tat tathoktam. e tad uktam bhavati—nīlapītādicitrākārasūnyaṃ nirābhāsam<sup>43</sup> nirañjanam<sup>xvi</sup> gaganopamam svaccham sakalajagadarthakāri<sup>xvii</sup> mahākaruṇāyuktam pratyātmavedyam pāramitopadeśasābdābhidheyaṃ sādhyam iti pāramitānaye prathamam sādhyam.

### 5.2 pāramitānaye dvitīyam sādhyam

śobhanāni ca tāni lakṣaṇāni ca dvātriṃśallakṣaṇasaṃjñakāni,<sup>44,xviii</sup> tair bhūṣitam. artham janānām prayojanam kartum śilam svabhāvo

<sup>xv</sup> An alternative to °*abhyuddharaṇakāmatā* is to read °*samuddharaṇakāmatā*. This definition of *karuṇā*, in various forms, is well known in Buddhist texts. See, for instance, Durvekamiśra's *Hetubinduṭīkāloka*: ... *duḥkhāt duḥkhahetor vā samuddharaṇakāmatā nāma yā karuṇā* ... (p. 234); or Manorathānandin's *Pramāṇavārttikavṛtti*: *duḥkhād duḥkhahetośca samuddharaṇakāmatā karuṇā* (edition reads *dukhā*°; p. 21).

<sup>xvi</sup> One may instead wish to accept the manuscript reading *nirābhāsanirañjanam*, which is understandable as a *viśeṣaṇasamāsa*. The combination of *nirābhāsam nirañjanam* occurs in a verse from an untraced source cited in Raviśrījñāna's *Amṛtakaṇikā*: *yat kāyam sarvabuddhānām nirābhāsam nirañjanam | ajñātam akṛtam śuddham abhāvādivivarjitam* || (p. 19)

<sup>xvii</sup> *sakalajagadarthakāri* can also be read in compound with *mahākaruṇā*°. This is reflected in both Tibetan translations: 'gro ba ma lus pa'i don byed pa'i snying rje chen po. Regardless, the two are evidently closely related.

<sup>xviii</sup> The manuscript reading *ceti* after *dvātriṃśallakṣaṇasaṃjñakāni* appear superfluous. The commentary analyses *sallakṣaṇa* as a *karmadhāraya*, glossing *sat* with *śobhana*; *dvātriṃśallakṣaṇa* serves as a clarification of that, requiring no fu-

<sup>40</sup> svasaṃvedanaikavedyam] E<sub>DH</sub> (*em.*) (°vedyam); svasaṃvedyanaikavedyam K

<sup>41</sup> karuṇā duḥkhād] K; karuṇāduḥkhā° E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>42</sup> °*abhyuddharaṇakāmatā*] *em.*; °*atyuddharaṇakāmatā* K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>43</sup> nirābhāsam] *em.*; nirābhāsa° K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>44</sup> dvātriṃśallakṣaṇasaṃjñakāni] *conj.*; dvātriṃśallakṣaṇasaṃjñakāni ceti K E<sub>DH</sub>; mdzes pa'i mtshan sum cu rtse gnyis zhes bya ste TV (dvātriṃśatsallakṣaṇānīti / dvātriṃśatsallakṣaṇasaṃjñakāni)

yasya tad arthakāri.<sup>45</sup> dānādīnāṃ daśapāramitānāṃ niṣyandaṃ<sup>xix</sup>  
 tatprakarṣaprabhavatvena sadṛśaṃ phalam.<sup>xx</sup> duḥkhasya pūrvam eva  
 prahīnatvāt sākṣātkaraṇāvasthāyāṃ<sup>46,xxi</sup> saukhyasyāpy abhāvād<sup>47</sup>  
 upekṣārūpatvenāpetasaukhyam apagatasaukhyam. etad uktaṃ bha-  
 vati—dvātriṃśallakṣaṇadharāśītyanuvyañjanavirājitaśarīraṃ sakala-  
 jagadarthakāri dānādīpāramitābhyāsa<sup>†</sup>balenātmānaṃ<sup>48†</sup> samyaksam-  
 buddharūpaṃ sukhaduḥkharahitatvenopekṣārūpaṃ dvitīyaṃ sādhyam.

### 5.3 pāramitānaye tṛtīyaṃ sādhyam

[E<sub>DH</sub> p. 135] sānandetyādi. sahānandena vartata iti sā[K fol. 4r]nandam.  
 sānandaṃ ca tat sallakṣaṇamaṇḍitāṅgaṃ ca<sup>49</sup> sambhujyamānaṃ dha-

rther conjunction. Likewise, the words *iti* and *saṃjñaka* together are redundant. In TV, the *zhes bya* following the phrase may either render *iti* or *saṃjñaka*—we find this rendering for the latter in the commentary on verse 9 for *mahāsukhasaṃjñaka*. We cannot fully discount that Vāgīśvarakīrti wrote the transmitted reading, nor can we give a clear explanation for the corruption, if it is one. Nonetheless, given that this appears to be genuine redundancy rather than simply a stylistic oddity, we provisionally conjecture a slightly smoother reading.

<sup>xix</sup> Here *niṣyandaṃ* should be understood either as an accusative form (as it is in the verse) or (less likely) anomalously as a neuter noun.

<sup>xx</sup> cf. *Abhidharmakośa* 2.57c: *niṣyando hetusadṛśaḥ*. Vāgīśvarakīrti perhaps also alludes to Dharmakīrti's definition of yogic perception in *Nyāyabindu* 11: *bhūtārthabhāvanāprakarṣaparyantaṃ yogijñānaṃ ceti*.

<sup>xxi</sup> ISAACSON (personal communication) proposes *sākṣātkaraṇāvasthāyāṃ* or *sākṣātkṛtyāvasthāyāṃ* as potentially superior readings to the manuscript's *sākṣātkṛtāvatāsthāyāṃ* or the previous edition's *sākṣātkṛtāvasthāyāṃ*.

In support of the former, see Vāgīśvarakīrti's *Samkṣiptābhiṣekavidhi*: *tadanantaram ekatathatāmatena tayaiva bhinnamate tv ānayā svasaṃviditajñānasākṣātkaraṇāvasthāyāṃ pūrvoktagāthayā adhyeṣitavate śiṣyāya tatpāṇau tasyāḥ pāṇim pratisthāpya* | (p. 417)

<sup>45</sup> tad arthakāri] K E<sub>DH</sub> TVA<sub>D</sub> (de ni don mdzad pa'o); de ni de'i don mdzad pa'o TVB<sub>G</sub> (tad tadarthakāri)

<sup>46</sup> sākṣātkaraṇāvasthāyāṃ] conj. (ISAACSON); sākṣātkṛtāvasthāyāṃ E<sub>DH</sub>; sākṣātkṛtāvatāsthāyāṃ K

<sup>47</sup> abhāvāt] em. (ISAACSON); abhāvatvāt K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>48</sup> balenātmānaṃ] K E<sub>DH</sub>; stobs kyis bdag nyid TVA<sub>D</sub>; stobs kyis byung ba TVB<sub>G</sub>

<sup>49</sup> sallakṣaṇamaṇḍitāṅgaṃ ca] em. (ISAACSON); sallakṣaṇamaṇḍitāṅgaṃ K E<sub>DH</sub>

rmadeśanādvāreṇopajīvyamānam.<sup>50,xxii</sup> kaiḥ? daśabhūmīśvaraiḥ, pariśiṣṭabhūmisthitānām<sup>51</sup> agocaratvāt. daśabhūmiprāptair avalokiteśvaramaṇjuśrīprabhṛtibhir upabhujyamānam iti yāvat. etad uktaṃ bhavati—śuddhāvāsopari ghanavyūhasaṃjñake<sup>52</sup> samyaksaṃbuddhabhuvane yathā bhagavān ānandarūpaḥ sambhogakāyātmā nirmāṇadvāreṇa<sup>53</sup> sakalajagadarthasaṃpādakāḥ śrāvakapratyekabuddhanavabhūmīśvarair apy adṛśyaśāriro daśabhūmīśvarair eva paraṃ bodhisattvair<sup>54</sup> dharmāśravaṇadvāreṇopabhujyamāna<sup>55</sup> āsaṃsāraṃ cakāsti, tathaiva tat sādhyam iti tṛtiyam.

#### 5.4 pāramitānaye caturthaṃ sādhyam

saṃpūrya dānādiguṇān aśeṣān  
saṃbuddhakṛtyaṃ<sup>56</sup> sakalaṃ ca kṛtvā |  
yad bhūtakoteḥ karaṇaṃ ca sākṣāt  
sādhyam tad apy asti nirodharūpam || 7 ||<sup>xxiii</sup>

saṃpūryetyādi. dānādipāramitā eva guṇā, guṇyante<sup>xxiv</sup> 'bhyasyanta iti kṛtvā. tān saṃpūrya paripūrṇān<sup>57</sup> kṛtvā, yat saṃbuddhānāṃ kṛtyaṃ

<sup>xxii</sup> For *upajīvyamāna* we might expect *nye bar 'tsho ba* in Tibetan. Below *upabujyamāna* is translated as *longs spyod par bya ba* and then *nye bar longs spyod par bya ba*.

<sup>xxiii</sup> This verse is in *Indravajrā* metre.

<sup>xxiv</sup> In the *Dhātupāṭha*, the tenth class verbal root  $\sqrt{\text{guṇa}}$  is said to express *āmantraṇa*. Here, however, this is a denominative verb with the sense of *āmreḍaṇa* (multiplication/repetition) formed from the noun *guṇa*.

<sup>50</sup> °opajīvyamānam] K E<sub>DH</sub>; nye bar longs spyod par gyur pa'o TV (°opabhujyamānam)

<sup>51</sup> pariśiṣṭabhūmi°] *corr.*; pariśiṣṭa bhumi° E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>52</sup> °saṃjñake] *em.*; °saṃjñako K; °saṃjñakāḥ E<sub>DH</sub> (*em.*)

<sup>53</sup> nirmāṇadvāreṇa] K E<sub>DH</sub>; sprul pa'i sku'i sgo nas TV (nirmāṇakāyadvāreṇa)

<sup>54</sup> paraṃ bodhisattvair] K E<sub>DH</sub> (°sattvair); mchog tu gyur pa'i byang chub sems dpa' TV (paramabodhisattvair)

<sup>55</sup> °bhujyamāna] *em.*; °bhujyamānam K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>56</sup> saṃbuddhakṛtyaṃ] *em.* (*cf.* TaRaA-V: saṃbuddhānāṃ ... avāśyakartavyaṃ kṛtsnaṃ); saṃbuddhya kṛtyaṃ K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>57</sup> paripūrṇān] *em.*; paripūrṇaṃ K E<sub>DH</sub>

sakalam<sup>58,xxv</sup> avaśyakartavyaṃ kṛtsnaṃ tad api kṛtvā, bhūtakoteḥ śūnyatālakṣaṇāyāś cittacaittanīrodhātmikāyā<sup>59</sup> yat sākṣāt karaṇaṃ tad api sādhyam astīti pāramitānayasthā evaṃ bruvate caturthaṃ sādhyam iti.

## 6 mantranaye saptavidhaṃ sādhyam

### 6.1 mantranaye prathamam sādhyam

idānīm mantranayopadiṣṭaṃ saptavidhaṃ<sup>60</sup> sādhyam kathayitum āha—svābhāṅganetyādi.

svābhāṅganāśleṣi<sup>61</sup> janārthakāri<sup>62</sup>  
duḥkhaiḥ sukhaiś caiva vimuktirūpaṃ |  
aśītyanuvyañjanabhūṣitāṅgaṃ  
apetakalpaṃ pravādanti sādhyam || 8 ||<sup>xxvi</sup>

svābhāṅganām<sup>63</sup> āśleṣitum śīlaṃ svabhāvo yasya tat svābhāṅganāśleṣi.<sup>64</sup> [E<sub>DH</sub> p. 136] apetakalpaṃ vyapagatakalpaṃ, kalpanārahitam

<sup>xxv</sup> The manuscript's reading of simply *sakalam* instead of *kṛtyaṃ sakalam* is asymmetrical given the following gloss, *avaśyakartavyaṃ kṛtsnaṃ*. Here TV reads simply *nges par mdzad par bya ba ma lus pa*, reflecting only the gloss and neither *sakalam* of the K nor the conjecture *kṛtyaṃ sakalam*. It is also possible that *sakalam* is a mistaken scribal addition, but it's also possible that even if the Tibetan translators saw *kṛtyaṃ sakalam*, they chose not to render this because of the superfluous sounding result in Tibetan. We believe the manuscript's transmitted reading is improbable.

<sup>xxvi</sup> This verse is in Upajāti.

<sup>58</sup> *kṛtyaṃ sakalam*] *conj.*; *sakalam* K E<sub>DH</sub>; *no reflex in TV*

<sup>59</sup> *cittacaitta°*] E<sub>DH</sub> (*em.*); *cittacaitya°* K

<sup>60</sup> *saptavidhaṃ*] E<sub>DH</sub> (TV *rnam pa bdun*); *caturthaṃ* K

<sup>61</sup> *svābhāṅganāśleṣi*] E<sub>DH</sub> (*corr.*); *svābhāṅgañāśleṣi* K

<sup>62</sup> *janārthakāri*] *conj.* (TM<sub>D</sub> 'gro ba yi don mdzad; TaRaA-V: jagadarthakāri); *ta..rthakāri* K (*akṣara uncertain, perhaps gna or mva*); *tadarthakāri* E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>63</sup> *svābhāṅganām*] E<sub>DH</sub> (*corr.*); *svābhāṅganām* K

<sup>64</sup> *svābhāṅganāśleṣi*] *corr.*; *svābhāṅgañāśleṣi* K E<sub>DH</sub>

iti yāvat. anyat subodham. ayam arthaḥ—samāliṅgitasvābhāṅganā-  
śleṣi jagadarthakāri<sup>65,xxvii</sup> dvātriṃśallakṣaṇavibhūṣitaśarīram<sup>66</sup> upe-  
kṣārūpaṃ<sup>67,xxviii</sup> prathamam sādhyam.

## 6.2 mantranaye dvitīyaṃ sādhyam

svadevatākāraviśeṣasūnyaṃ  
prāḡ eva sambhāvya sukhaṃ sphuṭaṃ sat |  
mahāsukhākhyam jagadarthakāri  
cintāmaṇiprakhyam uvāca kaścit || 9 ||<sup>xxix</sup>

svadevatetyādi. svadevatākāraviśeṣeṇa<sup>68</sup> sveṣṭadevatākāreṇa sūnyam,  
nirākāram iti yāvat. prāḡ eva prathamataram<sup>69</sup> upadeśānantaram

<sup>xxvii</sup> The compound °svābhāṅganāśleṣajagadarthakāri is strinckly speaking not i-  
mpossible, and could perhaps be interpreted as an instrumental *tatpuruṣa*; howe-  
ver, given that this is a prose explanation of the verse, there is no need for the  
author to use such a compound and it seems more likely that the scribe left off  
the *ikāra*.

<sup>xxviii</sup> Something along the lines of *āsaṃsārasthāyi sākṣāt kriyata iti* may have dro-  
pped out of the text here given TV, but there is no very compelling reason to think  
that it did. The addition words certainly relevant, given that it is a pertinent fea-  
ture of the first *sādhyā* that it remains active for as long as *saṃsāra* continues to  
exist. We can be reasonably sure that TV reflects *āsaṃsārasthāyi* with 'khor ba ji  
*srid du bzhugs pa*, as this is the Tibetan rendering of this word in the next section.

<sup>xxix</sup> The metre of this verse is Viparītākhyānikī

<sup>65</sup> °svābhāṅganāśleṣi jagadarthakāri] *conj.* (TVB<sub>G</sub>: nyid dang mtshungs pa'i lha  
mos 'khyud pa can 'gro ba'i don mdzad pa); °svābhāṅganāśleṣajagadarthakāri K  
E<sub>DH</sub>; nyid dang mtshungs pa'i lha mos 'khyud pa can | 'gro ba ma lus pa'i don  
mdzad pa TV<sub>AD</sub> (°svābhāṅganāśleṣy aśeṣajagadarthakāri)

<sup>66</sup> śarīram] E<sub>DH</sub>; śarīra K

<sup>67</sup> upekṣārūpaṃ] K E<sub>DH</sub>; btang snyoms kyi ngo bo du 'khor ba ji srid du bzhugs  
pa mngon du bya ba yin no zhe bya ba TV<sub>AD</sub>; btang snyoms kyi ngo bo nyid du  
'khor ba ji bzhugs pa mngon sum du bya ba yin zhes bya ba TVB<sub>G</sub> (upekṣārūpaṃ  
āsaṃsārasthāyi sākṣāt kriyata iti)

<sup>68</sup> svadevatā°] K TVB<sub>G</sub> (rang lha'i); lha TV<sub>AD</sub> (devatā°)

<sup>69</sup> prathamataram] K; prathamataro° E<sub>DH</sub>

eva<sup>70,xxx</sup> devatākāranirapekṣaṃ sukhaṃ sambhāvya, bhāvanayā sā-  
kṣāt kṛtvā, sphuṭaṃ<sup>71,xxx</sup> sphu[K fol. 4v]ṭīkṛtaṃ san mahāsukha-  
saṃjñakaṃ bhavati. tac ca jagadarthakāri cintāmaṇīsamānarūpaṃ.  
etad uktaṃ bhavati—upadeśānantaram eva mantramudrādevatākā-  
rarahitaṃ<sup>72</sup> bhāvanayā sphuṭīkṛtaṃ mahāsukhasaṃjñakaṃ cintā-  
maṇīvaj jagadarthakāri<sup>73</sup> māyopamam āsaṃsārasthāyi dvitīyaṃ sā-  
dhyam.

### 6.3 mantranaye tṛtīyaṃ sādhyam

kṛtvā sāksāt svādhipaṃ [K fol. 1v] sātārūpaṃ  
paścāt tyaktvā sātāmātraṃ phalaṃ syāt |  
śuddhaṃ sāksāc chakyate naiva kartuṃ  
tenākāro bhāvitaḥ svādhipasya || 10 ||

kṛtvetyādi. svādhipaṃ sveṣṭadaivataṃ sāksāt kṛtvāmukhīkṛtya sātā-  
rūpaṃ sukhaikasvabhāvam, paścād devatākāraṃ parityajya, sukha-  
mātraṃ<sup>74</sup> phalaṃ sādhyam vyavasthitaṃ syāt.

nanu yadi<sup>75</sup> sāksāt kṛtvāpi devatākāras tyaktavyaḥ, tarhi pratha-  
mam eva kasmād [E<sub>DH</sub> p. 137] vibhāvitaḥ? sukhamātraṃ eva dvi-  
tīyasādhyavat kiṃ na vibhāvitaṃ?<sup>76</sup> kiṃ vṛthāprayāsenety<sup>77</sup> āha—

<sup>xxx</sup> Normally *bshad ma thag pa* in Tibetan has the sense of *anantarokta*, but pe-  
rhaps here the translator did intend it to render *upadeśānantaram eva*.

<sup>xxx</sup> The understanding offered by TV, with reflected *asphuṭaṃ* instead of *sphu-  
ṭaṃ*, appears to indicate a misunderstanding on the translator's part, confusing  
the word division of *kṛtvā sphuṭaṃ*. It is not possible for *sphuṭīkṛtaṃ* to take an a-  
ccusitive object, nor is a form such as *sphuṭīkṛtya* possible without larger changes  
to the text.

<sup>70</sup> upadeśānantaram eva] E<sub>DH</sub> (*em.*); upadeśāntaram eva K; bshad ma thag pa'i TV

<sup>71</sup> sphuṭaṃ] K; *deest in* E<sub>DH</sub>; ma gsal ba TV

<sup>72</sup> °rahitam] K E<sub>DH</sub> TVB<sub>G</sub> (spangs ste); spangs te | bde ba 'ba' zhiḡ tsam TVA<sub>D</sub>  
(°rahitam sukhamātra°)

<sup>73</sup> jagadarthakāri] K E<sub>DH</sub> TVB<sub>G</sub> ('gro ba'i don mdzad pa); 'gro ba ma lus pa'i don  
mdzad pa TVA<sub>D</sub> (sakalajagadarthakāri)

<sup>74</sup> sukhamātraṃ] *em.*; sukhamātra° K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>75</sup> nanu yadi] *conj.*; nanu K E<sub>DH</sub>; gal te TVA<sub>D</sub> ([nanu] yadi); TVB<sub>G</sub>: *not clearly  
rendered*

<sup>76</sup> vibhāvitaṃ] *em.*; vibhāvitaḥ E<sub>DH</sub> (*em.*); vibhāgato K

<sup>77</sup> vṛthāprayāsenety] E<sub>DH</sub>; vyathāprayāsenety K



śuddham ityādi. śuddhaṃ kevalaṃ devatākāravirahitaṃ sukhamā-  
traṃ naiva sāksāt kartuṃ śakyate, ākārahitasya sukhasyānupala-  
mbhāt. tasmāt tena kāraṇenākāro bhāvitaḥ svādhīpasyeti tṛtīyam.<sup>78</sup>  
ayam arthaḥ<sup>79</sup>—devatākārasaṃvalitaṃ eva sukhaṃ vibhāvya, sāksā-  
dbhūte devatākāraṃ tyaktvā, sukhamātraṃ eva sādhyam uktagu-  
ṇam.

#### 6.4 mantranaye caturthaṃ sādhyam

gagaṇasamaśarīraṃ lakṣaṇair bhūṣitāṅgaṃ  
nirupamasukhapūrṇaṃ<sup>80</sup> svābhayā saṃgataṃ ca |  
sphuradāmitamunīndraiḥ<sup>81</sup> sarvasattvārthakāri  
pravādati punar anyāḥ sādhyam ucchedaśūnyam || 11 ||

gagaṇetyādi. gagaṇasamaṃ māyopamaṃ vicārāsahaṃ<sup>82</sup> śarīraṃ ya-  
sya. lakṣaṇair dvātriṃśadbhir aśītibhiś cānuvyañjanair maṇḍitāny  
aṅgāni yasya. nirupamaiḥ sthauḷya<sup>83</sup> nairantaryā<sup>84</sup> saṃsāra<sup>85</sup> pravāhitvanirāsravatv  
upamābhāvād upamātikrāntaiḥ sukhaiḥ pūrṇaṃ romāgraparyantaṃ<sup>86,xxxii</sup>  
saṃpūrṇam. svābhayā ca tathābhūtayā saṃgataṃ samāliṅgitam. sphu-

<sup>xxxii</sup> See a similar expression in *Siddhaikavīrasādhana* (author unknown): *tato niḥ-  
sṛtaraśmibhir āpādataḷād vālāgraparyāntaprāptaṃ bhāvyaṭe (Sādhanaṃālā no. 67,  
p. 67); de las byung ba'i 'od zer gyis rkang pa'i mthil nas skra'i rtse mo'i mthar thug  
pa khyab par bsgoms te (Tōh. 3461 fol. 116r)*

<sup>78</sup> tṛtīyam] *em.* TVB<sub>G</sub> (gsum pa yin no); tṛtīyaḥ K E<sub>DH</sub>; bsgrub par bya ba gsum  
pa yin no TVA<sub>D</sub> (tṛtīyaṃ sādhyam)

<sup>79</sup> arthaḥ] E<sub>DH</sub>; artha K

<sup>80</sup> nirupama°] E<sub>DH</sub>; nirupama° K

<sup>81</sup> °munīndraiḥ] *em.*; °munīndraḥ K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>82</sup> māyopamaṃ vicārāsahaṃ] K (*reading slightly unclear*); māyopamavicārāsaha  
E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>83</sup> sthauḷya°] K E<sub>DH</sub>; rgya nom pa nyid dang | rgya che ba nyid dang TVA<sub>D</sub> (praṇī-  
tatvasthauḷya°); lhun che ba nyid dang | TVB<sub>G</sub> (sthauḷya°)

<sup>84</sup> °nairantaryā°] E<sub>DH</sub> (*em.*) (TV: bar med pa nyid dang); °nairuttaryā° K

<sup>85</sup> °āsaṃsāra°] *em.*; °āsaṃsāraṃ E<sub>DH</sub> K

<sup>86</sup> pūrṇaṃ romāgraparyantaṃ] *conj.* (TV: gang ba ni | ba spu rtse mo'i mthar thug  
pa); pūrṇaṃ masimāgrapayantaṃ K; pūrṇatāṃ samāśrayantaṃ E<sub>DH</sub>

radbhir anantanirmitair munīndrais tathābhūtaiṛ eva sarvasattvā-  
rthakāri.<sup>87</sup> ucchedeneti nirodhena śūnyam tucchaṃ riktam.<sup>88</sup>

etad uktam bhavati—gaganamāyāmarīci<sup>89</sup> gandharvanagarodaka-  
candrapratibimbavapnopamam<sup>90</sup> [K fol. 5r] ekānekabhāvābhāva-  
grāhyagrāhakasvabhāvarahitam anādyantam aśeṣavastusaṃdohasva-  
bhāvam<sup>91</sup> anābhāsaṃ nirañjanaṃ sarvopamātikrāntaṃ paramasū-  
kṣmātigambhīraprajñārūpatayā dharmakāyasvabhāvam, dvātriṃśa-  
llakṣaṇavibhūṣitaśarīram aśīṭyanuvyañjanavirājitaḡātram<sup>92</sup> para-  
śṛṅgārayauvanādyupetaṃ svābhāṅganālingitāṅgaṃ rūpavajrādītā-  
rāparyantadevigaṇair anantaprabhedānimittarati<sup>93</sup> svarūpaparamānandopabhogadvā-  
pratibimbavat [E<sub>DH</sub> p. 138] sambhujyamānaṃ karuṇāsaṃvalitodāra-  
rūpatayā sambhogakāyarūpam, nānādhimuktivineyajanaparipācanā-  
rtham anekavidhaprātihāryadvāreṇa<sup>94</sup> nirmītānantakulāntarbhūta-

<sup>xxxiii</sup> See parallels in *Samantabhadrasādhana* for \*animittarati / mtshan ma med pa'i dga' ba.

From *rūpavajrā*° up to °dvāreṇa, TVA<sub>D</sub> reads : gzugs rdo rje la sogs pa nas | sgrol ma'i mthar thug pa'i lha mo'i tshogs kyis mtshan ma med pa'i dga' ba'i rang gi ngo bo'i rab tu dbye ba dpag tu med pas mchog tu dga' ba la nye bar longs skyod pa'i sgo nas. TVB<sub>G</sub> reads: gzugs rdo rje la sogs pa nas sgrol ma'i mthar thug pa'i lha mo'i tshogs kyis mtshan ma med pa'i rang gi ngo bo'i rab tu dpag tu med pas mchog tu dga' ba la nye bar longs spyod pa'i sgo nas.

<sup>87</sup> sarvasattvārtha°] K E<sub>DH</sub> (TVB<sub>G</sub>: sems can thams cad kyi don); sems can gyi don TVA<sub>D</sub> (sattvārtha°)

<sup>88</sup> tucchaṃ riktam] K; bhūsthaṃ riktam E<sub>DH</sub>; spangs pa'o TV (tucchaṃ / riktam)

<sup>89</sup> māyāmarīci°] K E<sub>DH</sub> (TVB<sub>G</sub>: sgyu ma dang | smig rgyu dang |); sgyu ma dang | smig rgyu dang | smig rgyu dang | TVA<sub>D</sub> (māyāmarīcīndrajāla° / māyendrajāla-marīci°)

<sup>90</sup> °svapnopamam] E<sub>DH</sub>; svapnāpayam K

<sup>91</sup> anādyantam aśeṣavastusaṃdohasvabhāvam] K E<sub>DH</sub>; thog ma dang tha ma med pa'i dngos po ma lus pa'i rang bzhin TVA<sub>D</sub> TVB<sub>G</sub> (anādyantāśeṣavastusvabhāvam)

<sup>92</sup> °gātram] K E<sub>DH</sub>; no reflex in TV

<sup>93</sup> anantaprabhedānimittarati°] conj. (TVA<sub>D</sub>: mtshan ma med pa'i dga' ba'i rang gi ngo bo'i rab tu dbye ba dpag tu med pas); anantaprabhedānimittarati° KE<sub>DH</sub>; mtshan ma med pa'i rang gi ngo bo'i rab tu dpag tu med pas TVB<sub>G</sub>

<sup>94</sup> anekavidhaprātihārya°] K E<sub>DH</sub>; rdzu 'phrul dang cho 'phrul rnam pa du ma TVA<sub>D</sub> TVB<sub>G</sub> (anekaṛddhiprātihārya°)

saṃbuddhabodhisattvaspharaṇasaṃhāra-kāritvena<sup>95</sup> nirmāṇakāyātma-  
kam, śūnyatākaruṇābhinnabodhicitta<sup>96</sup> svabhāvāmalaprajñopāyasa-  
mādhisambhūtasatsukhāpūrṇam<sup>xxxiv</sup> āsaṃsārasthitidharmaṃ<sup>97</sup> apra-  
tiṣṭhitanirvāṇarūpaṃ nirmalanivātaniścalapradīpaśikhāprabandha-  
nityatayā nirodhasūnyaṃ caturthaṃ<sup>98</sup> sādhyam.

## 6.5 mantranaye pañcamam sādhyam

kṛtvā sāksāt svādhipaṃ satarūpaṃ  
tyaktvopekṣājñānamātraṃ<sup>99</sup> phalaṃ syāt |  
āsaṃsārasthāyi sattvārthakāri  
cintā<sup>100</sup> ratnaprakhyam<sup>101</sup> ekāntaśāntam || 12 ||

kṛtvetyādi. sāksāt svādhipaṃ kṛtvā, paścāt<sup>102</sup> tyaktvā, upekṣārūpaṃ  
yaj jñānaṃ tanmātraṃ<sup>xxxv</sup> sādhyam syāt. anyat sugamaṃ.<sup>103</sup> etad  
uktaṃ bhavati—maṇḍalacakrarūpaṃ sāksāt kṛtvā, paścāt tan niro-  
dhyā, upekṣājñānamātraṃ sādhyam syāt pañcamam.

## 6.6 mantranaye ṣaṣṭhamam sādhyam

kṛtvā sāksān maṇḍalaṃ satarūpaṃ  
paścāt tasya svecchayā nirvṛtiś<sup>104</sup> ca|

<sup>xxxiv</sup> See Sahajavilāsa, *Svādhiṣṭhānakurukullāsādhana* (SāMā no. 183, p. 383): *ta-  
taḥ prajñopāyāmalasamādhisambhūtasatsukhāpūrṇam iva svadehaṃ trailokya ca  
paśyēt.*

<sup>xxxv</sup> tanmātraṃ] check: in compound or not

<sup>95</sup> °bodhisattva°] *conj.* (TVB<sub>G</sub>: byang chub sems dpa'i); °bodhi° K E<sub>DH</sub>; byang chub  
sems dpa' la sogs pa'i TVA<sub>D</sub> (°bodhisattvādi°)

<sup>96</sup> °bodhicitta°] E<sub>DH</sub>; °bodhicittā° K

<sup>97</sup> *conj.* (cf. Tib: chos can); dharmāṇām K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>98</sup> caturthaṃ] E<sub>DH</sub>; caturtha K

<sup>99</sup> tyaktvopekṣā°] K (E<sub>DH</sub> *incorrectly reports as* tyajyo°) (*see commentary*); bhāvo-  
pekṣā° E<sub>DH</sub> (*em.*); no reflex in TM<sub>D</sub>

<sup>100</sup> cintā°] K<sup>pc</sup> E<sub>DH</sub>; cittā° K<sup>ac</sup>

<sup>101</sup> °prakhyam] E<sub>DH</sub>; °prakhyamṃ K

<sup>102</sup> paścāt] E<sub>DH</sub>; paścāta K

<sup>103</sup> sugamaṃ] E<sub>DH</sub>; sūgamaṃ K

<sup>104</sup> nirvṛtiś] K; nirvṛtiṃ] E<sub>DH</sub>

sattvārthasyāpy asty abhāvo na vāsmīn  
prādurbhāvo nirvṛtād<sup>105</sup> asti yasmāt || 13 ||

kṛtvetyādi. kṛtvā sāksān maṇḍalaṃ sātasaṃvalitaṃ,<sup>106</sup> tasya svecchayā  
nirvṛtir nirodhaḥ.

nanu yadi sāksāt kṛtvāpi paścāt svecchayā nirodhayita[K fol. 5v]vyam,<sup>107</sup>  
tadā karuṇāyā anekakālābhyastāyā abhāvaḥ syāt. tasyās cābhāvāt  
sattvārthābhāvaḥ [E<sub>DH</sub> p. 139] syād ity āśaṅkyāha—sattvārthasyāpy  
asty abhāvo na vetyādi. asmin pakṣe sattvārthābhāvo nāsti, yasmān  
nirvṛtāc cakrāt karuṇāsaṃvalitāt sattvārthasya prādurbhāvo 'sti.<sup>xxxvi</sup>

etenaitad evāha—sātasaṃpūrṇacakraṃ sāksāt kṛtvā, yāvad iṣṭaṃ  
kālaṃ vyavasthāpya, paścāt tasya sarvathaiva pradīpavan nirodhaṃ  
kṛtvā sthātavyam. yadā punaḥ sattvārthābhilāṣo bhavati, tadā niru-  
ddhād eva cakrāntaram utpādyā sattvārthaḥ kartavyaḥ. cakrāntaro-  
tpāde<sup>108</sup> 'pi ciraniruddhād<sup>109</sup> eva cakrād yathābhavyatayā<sup>110</sup> vineyā-  
nāṃ yathābhilaṣitaprāptir bhavatīti ṣaṣṭham.

## 6.7 mantranaye saptamaṃ sādhyam

kṛtvā sphuṭaṃ rūpaṃ abhiṣṭam eṣāṃ  
paścān nirodhaḥ<sup>111,xxxvii</sup> phalam āha kaścit |  
abhinnarūpaś ca yato nirodho  
na pakṣabhede 'pi tato 'sti bhedaḥ || 14 ||

<sup>xxxvi</sup> TV suggests reading *karuṇāsaṃvalitasya*: 'gags pa'i 'khor lo las snying rje'i  
rang bzhin can sems can gyi don ('gags pa'i] TVB<sub>G</sub>; 'gog pa'i TVA<sub>D</sub>)

<sup>xxxvii</sup> It is possible to take *phala* as the direct object of *√ah* and then read *nirodhaṃ*,  
construing it as an accusative form; however, the agent of *√kr* and *√ah* would  
have to be the same. Rather, with the reading *nirodhaḥ phalam*, we can avoid this  
problem and simply supply an *iti*.

<sup>105</sup> nirvṛtād] E<sub>DH</sub>; nivṛtād K

<sup>106</sup> sātasaṃvalitaṃ] *em.* (TV: bde ba'i rang bzhin can); sātāṃ saṃvalitaṃ K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>107</sup> nirodhayitavyam] *em.*; nirodhayitavyaḥ K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>108</sup> cakrāntarotpāde] E<sub>DH</sub>; cakrāntaropāde K

<sup>109</sup> ciraniruddhād] *em.* (TV: rin du 'gags pa'i); citaniruddhād K; cittaniruddhād E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>110</sup> yathābhavyatayā] *variant word division in* E<sub>DH</sub>: yathā bhavyatayā

<sup>111</sup> nirodhaḥ] *em.*; nirodha(ṃ) K (*this may be corrected to ḥ*); nirodhaṃ E<sub>DH</sub>

kṛtvetyādi. ṣaṇṇāṃ pakṣāṇāṃ anyatamasya phalasya<sup>112</sup> sādhyatvād yad yad evābhiṣṭaṃ<sup>113</sup> tad<sup>114</sup> eva sāksāt kṛtvā, paścāt sarvathaiva pradīpavan nirodha uttarakālaṃ sattvārthādiśūnyaḥ sāksāt kartavyaḥ.

nanu ṣaṭpakṣabhedenā ṣaḍ eva<sup>115</sup> nirodhāḥ syuḥ. tat katham eka eva nirodha ity āśaṅkyāha—abhinnetyādi. abhinnaṃ<sup>116</sup> rūpaṃ ya-sya sa tathā.<sup>117</sup> na hi nirodhānāṃ ṣaṭpakṣalakṣaṇabhede 'pi bhedo 'sti, abhāvaikarūpatayā nirodhasya samānatvāt. ayam arthaḥ—anyatamapakṣaṃ sāksāt kṛtvā paścāt tasya santānocchedarūpo nirodha iti saptamaṃ sādhyam.

## 7 caturthe 'bhiṣekase vipratipattiḥ

### 7.1 caturthaseke vipratipattiḥ prathamā

prajñājñānād uttaraṃ bodhicittā-  
svādas turyaṃ sekam<sup>118</sup> āhāvaraṃ tat |  
yasmāt<sup>119</sup> sarvo bhāvanāsu prayāso  
vyarthaḥ prāptas tatphalasya prasiddheḥ || 15 ||

[E<sub>DH</sub> p. 140] prajñājñānetyādi. prajñājñānopadeśād uttarakālaṃ<sup>120</sup> yat bodhicittasyāmṛtarūpasya<sup>121</sup> rasanayā grahaṇam, tat turyaṃ ca-

<sup>112</sup> anyatamasya phalasya] *conj.*; arthaphalasya K E<sub>DH</sub>; nang nas 'bras bu TV

<sup>113</sup> phalasya sādhyatvād yad yad evābhiṣṭaṃ] K E<sub>DH</sub>; 'bras bu bsgrub bya gang kho na TV<sub>AD</sub> (phalaṃ yad eva); bsgrub bya gang kho na mngon par 'dod pa TV<sub>BG</sub> (phalaṃ yad evābhiṣṭaṃ);

<sup>114</sup> tad] E<sub>DH</sub>; sad K

<sup>115</sup> ṣaḍ eva] E<sub>DH</sub>; ṣatreva K

<sup>116</sup> abhinnaṃ] E<sub>DH</sub>; abhinna K

<sup>117</sup> sa tathā] *em.*; tat tathā K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>118</sup> sekam] E<sub>DH</sub>; seṣam K

<sup>119</sup> yasmāt] E<sub>DH</sub>; paścāt K

<sup>120</sup> prajñājñānopadeśād uttarakālaṃ] K E<sub>DH</sub>; shes rab dang ye shes ni shes rab ye shes te | dbang bskur ba'i bye brag go || phyis ni 'das pa'i 'og tu'o || gang zhe na | TV<sub>AD</sub> (prajñājñānetyādi. prajñā ca jñānaṃ prajñājñānaṃ sekaviśeṣaḥ. uttaram paścāt. kim iti); shes rab dang ye shes te | dbang bskur ba'i bye brag go || phyis te rdzogs pa'i dus kyi byang chub gang zhe na | TV<sub>BG</sub> (*text may have suffered from corruption after phyis*)

<sup>121</sup> bodhicittasyāmṛtarūpasya] *em.* (TV<sub>AD</sub>: byang chub kyi sems te); saṃ bodhici-ttasyāmṛtarūpasya K E<sub>DH</sub>; sems te TV<sub>BG</sub> (cittasya)

turthaṃ [K fol. 6r] sekam āha kaścīt. tac cāvaram hīnam, vinikṛṣṭam iti yāvat. kasmād avaram? yasmāt sarvaprayāso mantramudrādevatādyākārabhāvanāsu punaḥ punar anuṣṭhānalakṣaṇas tathāgato-  
kto<sup>122</sup> vyarthaḥ prāptaḥ.<sup>xxxviii</sup> kutaḥ? tatphalasya bhāvanāsādhyasya phalasya bodhicittāsvādakāla eva prasiddhatvāt prāptatvāt, anyasya viśiṣṭasya phalasyābhāvād iti yāvat.

## 7.2 caturthaseke vipratipattir dvitīyā

prajñājñānād uttaram prāptarāmā-  
svādas turyaṃ sekam āhādhamam tat |  
yasmāt sarvo bhāvanādao prayatno  
buddhoddīṣṭo niṣphalaḥ samprasaktaḥ || 16 ||

prajñetyādi. prajñājñānād uttarakālaṃ yāḥ prāptā yathāmilitā rāmāḥ striyas tāsāṃ samāpattidvāreṇa<sup>123</sup> ya āsvādaḥ, tat turyaṃ sekam. tad apy adhamam. śeṣaṃ gatārtham.

## 7.3 āgamasya arthavyākhyānam

atha caturthaṃ tat punas tatheti<sup>124,xxxix</sup> vyākhyāyate. caturtham iti<sup>125</sup> prajñājñānaṃ tṛtīyam apekṣya caturtham ity ucyate. tad iti tacchabdena tad eva prajñājñānaṃ tadrūpaṃ parāmṛśyate. punar iti punaḥśabdena tasmād viśeṣaḥ. viśeṣaś cātra nirāsravaniruttarātyanta-

<sup>xxxviii</sup> TV reflects understanding two items that would be *vyartha*, perhaps suggesting another reading of the Sanskrit text: *gang gi phyir sngags dang phyag rgya dang | lha nyid la sogs pa'i rnam pa bsgom pa la yang dang yang du 'bad pa dang | gzhan yang de bzhi gshegs pas gsungs pa'i sgrub pa'i mtshan nyid don med pa thob par 'gyur ro* || 'Because it would follow that repeated effort in meditation ... and, what's more (gzhan yang; Skt. *cā?*), what is characterised as practice taught by the *tathāgatas*'.

<sup>xxxix</sup> *Samājottara* 112c

<sup>122</sup> tathāgatokto] K; tathāgatoktau E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>123</sup> samāpattidvāreṇa] E<sub>DH</sub>; rig pa'i sgo nas TV<sub>AD</sub>; reg pa'i sgo nas TV<sub>BG</sub> (sparṣa-dvāreṇa)

<sup>124</sup> punas tatheti] E<sub>DH</sub> (*em.*); punar iti K

<sup>125</sup> caturtham iti] K E<sub>DH</sub> TV<sub>AD</sub> (bzhi pa ni); deest in TV<sub>BG</sub>

sphītāvicchinnaprabandha<sup>126</sup> pravāhitvalakṣaṇaḥ.<sup>127</sup> tatheti tathāśa-  
bdena tādr̥ṣatvam abhidhīyate. tādr̥ṣatvam ca yādr̥śyā prajñādiyu-  
ktayā<sup>128</sup> sāmāgryā yādr̥śam prajñājñānam utpannam, paścād api tā-  
dr̥śyaiva sāmāgryā tathaiva cotpadyate, nānyatheti tathāśabdārthaḥ.

atra ca lakṣyalakṣaṇabhāvenārtho boddhavyaḥ. lakṣyate 'neneti  
lakṣaṇam anubhūyamānam prajñājñānam, apratīyamānasya lakṣa-  
ṇatvāyogāt, nāgr̥hitaviśeṣaṇā [E<sub>DH</sub> p. 141]viśeṣyabuddhir iti nyāyāt.  
lakṣyate jñāyate pratipādyate 'neneti lakṣyam sākṣāt kariṣyamānam  
caturtham.

#### 7.4 caruthaseke vipratipattis tṛtīyā

atra caturtham nāstīty eke.<sup>xi</sup> nanu caturtham ity etad asti tatpadam.<sup>129</sup>  
tat katham nāstīty ucyate? satyam, upadeśasamrakṣārtham sattva-  
vyāmohanāya ca tṛtīyam eva caturthaśabde[K fol. 6v]noktam bha-  
gavatā. anyathā tat punar iti noktam syāt.<sup>xli</sup>

tad atyantāsaṃgatam, caturthasya pramāṇasiddhasya pratipādi-  
tatvāt pratipādayiṣyamāṇatvāc ceti.<sup>xlii</sup>

<sup>xi</sup> TVA<sub>D</sub> adds near the beginning of this sentence *Samājottara* 112ab *abhiṣekaṃ tridhā bhedam asmin tantre prakalpitaṃ* |: 'dir 'ga' zhig | dbang ni rnam pa gsum dag tu | rgyud 'di las ni rab tu grags || zhes gsungs pas na | bzhi pa ni yang dag pa ma yin no zhe na |

<sup>xli</sup> A portion seems to have dropped out from TVA<sub>D</sub>.

<sup>xlii</sup> Tib. discusses two further *pakṣas* here: that the fourth referred to in the *Samājottara* is the four *aṅga* of *sevā* and so forth; and what appears to be the idea that

<sup>126</sup> °niruttarātyantasphītāvicchinnaprabandha°] K; shin tu rgyas pa nyid rgyun mi chad par TVB<sub>G</sub> (°ātyantasphītāvicchinnaprabandha°); nirantarātyantasphītāvicchinnaprabandha° E<sub>DH</sub> (*em.*); shin tu rgyas pa nyid dang | bar chad med pa nyid dang | rgyun mi 'chad par TVA<sub>D</sub> (°ātyantasphītānirantarāvicchinnaprabandha°)

<sup>127</sup> °lakṣaṇaḥ] E<sub>DH</sub>; °lakṣaṇam K

<sup>128</sup> °yuktayā] *conj.* (TV: dang ldan pa'i); °yuktyā K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>129</sup> nanu caturtham ity etad asti tatpadam] K (nanu caturtham ity etad asti | tat padan) E<sub>DH</sub>; de ltar de bzhin bzhi pa yang || zhes bya ba'i tshig bcom ldan 'das kyis gsungs pa yod pa ma yin nam | TVA<sub>D</sub> (caturtham tat punas tatheti padam bhagavatā notkam vā); de lta na de ma yin pa gzhan de ltar de bzhin bzhi pa yang zhes bya ba der bzhi pa zhes bya ba'i tshig bcom ldan 'das kyis gsungs pa yod pa ma yin nam | TVB<sub>G</sub> (nanu yadi evam na syāt, tadā caturtham tat punas tatheti padam bhagavatā noktam vā)

## 7.5 lakṣyasya vicāraṇam

atra lakṣaṇam prajñājñānam pratītam eva sarvaiḥ. lakṣye<sup>130</sup> param vyāmohaḥ. tad vicāryate. lakṣyam hi bhaved<sup>131</sup> artharūpam vā syāt jñānarūpam vā. na tāvad artharūpam, arthasyaikasyābhāvāt, ekānekaviyogitvena pramāṇena tasya nirākṛtatvāt. mantranaye ca vijñānavādamadhyamakamatayor<sup>132</sup> eva pradhānatvād jñānarūpam vā syāt. jñānam ca sākāram vā nirākāram vā. sākāram api citrādvaitarūpam vā syād anekarūpam vā syād iti vikalpāḥ.

### 7.5.1 sākārasya vijñānasya nirākaraṇam

tatra sākāravijñānam sarvathaiva gagaṇakamalavan nāstīti nirākāravādino bruvate. nanu nilapītaśuklādighaṭapaṭaśakaṭādi<sup>133</sup> rūpeṇākārāḥ<sup>134</sup> pratibhāsante<sup>135</sup> pratyakṣataḥ.<sup>xliii</sup> te cārthasyābhāvād jñānarūpā eva. tat katham sākāram nāstīti?<sup>xliv</sup> satyam. pratibhāsanta evākārāḥ, param alikarūpeṇa. alikarūpatā caikānekaviyogitvena<sup>136</sup> pramāṇalakṣaṇena<sup>137</sup> prasiddhā. tasya ca pramāṇasvarūpasyānyatra<sup>138</sup> kathitātvan

the four initiation consists in the third accompanied by its fruits ('*bras bu dang bcas pa*).

<sup>xliii</sup> TV phrases this sentence as a rhetorical question, as if the Sanskrit started *kiṃ na ....*

<sup>xliv</sup> TV<sub>AD</sub>'s expression of the argument runs differently: *don (rnam pa) de dag kyang med pa'i phyir shes pa'i ngo bo nyid kyang med yin na | de ji ltar rnam pa dang bcas pa ma yin zhe na* | 'Because those objects [i.e., *ākāras*] also do not exist, the nature of cognition too cannot exist. So how can cognition not have *ākāras*?'

<sup>130</sup> lakṣye] E<sub>DH</sub> (*em.*); lakṣyā K

<sup>131</sup> lakṣyam hi bhaved] *conj.*(TV: mtshon par bya ba yang srid na); lakṣyam hi bhagavat K E<sub>DH</sub> (°gavad)

<sup>132</sup> matayor] E<sub>DH</sub>; tamayor K

<sup>133</sup> °śakaṭādi°] E<sub>DH</sub> (*em.*); °prakaṭādi° K

<sup>134</sup> °ākārāḥ] *conj.*; ((cā)kārāḥ] K; vākārāḥ E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>135</sup> pratibhāsante] E<sub>DH</sub>; pratibhāsante K

<sup>136</sup> °viyogitvena] *conj.* °viyogitva° K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>137</sup> °pramāṇalakṣaṇena] K E<sub>DH</sub> (TVB<sub>G</sub>: tshad ma'i mtshan nyid kyis); mtshan nyid kyis TVB<sub>G</sub> (°lakṣaṇena)

<sup>138</sup> pramāṇasvarūpasyā°] E<sub>DH</sub>; pramāṇa(((pe)))rūpasyā° K



neha<sup>139</sup> pratanyate. alikatvaprasiddhā ca māyāmayā ivākārā bhrāntirūpāḥ prakāśante.<sup>140</sup> bhrāntinivṛttau ca nirākāram eva<sup>141</sup> śuddhasphaṭikasamkāśaṃ pāramārthikaṃ<sup>142</sup> siddhaṃ bhavati.<sup>143</sup> ataś citrādvaitarūpaṃ anekarūpaṃ ca sākāraṃ vijñānam astīti vikalpadvayaṃ nirastaṃ bhavatīti.

### 7.5.2 nirākārasya vijñānasya samarthanam

nanu nirākāram api vijñānam upalabdihlakṣaṇaprāptaṃ svapne 'pi nopalabhyate. tat kathaṃ tad asti paramārthata<sup>144</sup> i[K fol. 7r]ty ucyate? ucyate. sukhākāraṃ vijñānam antaḥparisphuradrūpaṃ nirākāraṃ samvedyata eva. nīlādyākārāḥ punar alikāḥ pratibhāsante. anyathā teṣāṃ satyatve sarva evākārāḥ satyāḥ syuḥ. tathā hi grāhya-grāhakabhāvādikam api satyaṃ [E<sub>DH</sub> p. 142] syāt. tataś ca sarveṣāṃ eva satyapratibhāsatvena muktiprasaṅgaḥ,<sup>145</sup> keṣāñcid api mithyā-pratibhāsasya bhrāntirūpasyāpratibhāsanāt. tathā coktam—

draṣṭavyaṃ<sup>146</sup> bhūtato bhūtaṃ bhūtadarśi vimucyate |<sup>xlv</sup>

tasmād akāmakenāpi nīlādyākārāṇāṃ alikatvam evaiṣṭavyam. sukhādikam nirākāraṃ<sup>147</sup> satyam upalabhyate. tat kathaṃ nopalabhyata iti.

nanu sukhādyākāram sākāraṃ eva vijñānam<sup>148</sup> upalabhyate, sukhāder ākārasvabhāvatvāt. na ca sukhādyākārasūnyaṃ jñānam sva-

<sup>xlv</sup> *Abhisamayālaṅkāra* 5.21; *Ratnagotravaiśvāna* 154; *Pratītyasamutpādaśāstra* 7; etc.

<sup>139</sup> neha] E<sub>DH</sub>; eha K

<sup>140</sup> prakāśante] K (prakāśante); prakāśyante E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>141</sup> nirākāram eva] K E<sub>DH</sub> TVB<sub>G</sub> (rnam pa med pa kho na); rnam pa med pa de kho na TVB<sub>G</sub> (nirākāram eva tad)

<sup>142</sup> pāramārthikaṃ] E<sub>DH</sub> (*em.*); pārarthikaṃ K

<sup>143</sup> bhavati] K; bhavatīti E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>144</sup> paramārthata] *em.*; paramārtham K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>145</sup> muktiprasaṅgaḥ] *conj.*; yuktiprasaṅgāt K; muktiprasaṅgāt E<sub>DH</sub> (*em.*)

<sup>146</sup> draṣṭavyaṃ] E<sub>DH</sub>; draṣṭavya K

<sup>147</sup> nirākāraṃ] K E<sub>DH</sub>; rnam pa brdzun pa TV (alikākāraṃ)

<sup>148</sup> sākāraṃ eva vijñānam] *conj.*(TV: rnam pa dang bcas pa 'i kho na shes pa); eva vijñānam K E<sub>DH</sub>

pne 'pi saṃvedyate. sakalabhrāntivigamād aṣṭamyām bhūmāv upa-  
labdhilakṣaṇaprāptir bhavatīty atrāpi kośapānaṃ<sup>149</sup> vinā anyan na<sup>150</sup>  
pramāṇam asti prasādhakam iti. tad asat,<sup>151</sup> abhiprāyāparijñānāt, su-  
khādyākārasyaiva nīlādyākārahitasya vijñānasya nirākāratvene-  
ṣṭatvāt. tac cedānīm eva svasaṃvedanapramāṇasiddhaṃ sakalapra-  
ṇabhṛtam<sup>152</sup> astīti katham nopalabdhiḥ?

### 7.5.3 Establishing the Madhyamaka position

nanu tad<sup>153</sup> apy ekānekasvabhāvaviyogād alikam eva bhrāntimātram,  
ekānekasvabhāvarahitasya sākāranirākāravijñānavyāpitvāt.

nanv anena nyāyena sakalasākāranirākāravijñānasyālikatvapra-  
sāadhanān na kiñcid api pāramārthikam vastutattvam asti.<sup>154</sup> tat ka-  
thaṃ lakṣyasya svarūpaṃ pramāṇata upalakṣayitavyam? naiṣa do-  
ṣaḥ, madhyamakamate pramāṇato 'likatāsiddhāv api māyopamapra-  
tibhāsamātrasyaikānekasvabhāvarahitasya dharmirūpasyāpratiṣedhāt.  
tatraiva cālike pratibhāsamātre lakṣyalakṣaṇasaṃsāranirvāṇa[K fol.  
7v]maṇḍalacakrādibhāvanāsakalajagadarthakriyādinām<sup>155</sup> avyāhatā  
vyavasthā<sup>156</sup> sidhyati.<sup>157, xlvii</sup> tathā cuktam—

buddhatvaṃ vajrasattvatvaṃ saṃvṛtyaiva prasādhayet

| xlvii

<sup>xlvi</sup> E<sub>DH</sub> appears to understand the text as saying that both *bhāvanā* and *jagada-  
rthakriyādinām vyavasthā* are established. TV suggests that it is *bhāvanā* which  
is the instrument by which the *vyāvasthā* is established. The manuscript rea-  
ding suggests taking °*bhāvanā* in compound with the following word—i.e., in the  
Madhyamaka system, although mere appearance is false, the framework of eve-  
rything starting with *lakṣyalakṣaṇa* is established.

<sup>xlvi</sup> *Kurukullākalpa* 3.16cd

<sup>149</sup> kośapānaṃ] K (kosapānaṃ); śapathollaṅghanaṃ E<sub>DH</sub> (*em.*)

<sup>150</sup> anyan na] E<sub>DH</sub>; anyatra K

<sup>151</sup> tad asat] *conj.* (TV: de ni bden pa ma yin te); tad K E<sub>DH</sub>; asat etat *possible conj.*

<sup>152</sup> °bhṛtam] *em.*; °bhṛtām K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>153</sup> nanu tad K E<sub>DH</sub>; tat *possible conj.*

<sup>154</sup> asti] *conj.*; astīti K E<sub>DH</sub> (astīti?) (*iti* has no reflex in TV)

<sup>155</sup> °bhāvanā] K; °bhāvanā E<sub>DH</sub> (variant word division); bsgoms pas TV (bhāva-  
nayā)

<sup>156</sup> vyavasthā] K; vyavasthā ca E<sub>DH</sub> (*em.*)

<sup>157</sup> sidhyati] *conj.*; sidhyatīti K E<sub>DH</sub> (*no reflex of iti* in TV)

iti.<sup>158</sup>

nanu sarvam eva vastujātam alikarūpatayā niḥsāram. tadā kima-  
rthaṃ maṇḍalacakrādibhāvanāprayāsaḥ<sup>159</sup> kriyate? asad etat,

mithyādhyāropahānārthaṃ<sup>160</sup> yatno 'saty api<sup>161</sup> [E<sub>DH</sub> p.  
143] bhoktari |<sup>162, xlviii</sup>

iti vacanāt. yady api vicāryamāṇaṃ pāramārthikaṃ vasturūpaṃ nā-  
sti, tathāpy ahaṃ sukhī bhaveyaṃ mā<sup>163</sup> duḥkhy abhūvam iti tṛṣṇā  
sakalapraṇabhṛtām asti. yathā tulye 'pi mithyātve śubhāśubhasva-  
pnayoḥ śubhasvapnadarśanāt saumanasyam aśubhasvapnadarśanāc  
ca daurmanasyam, tadapanayanāya ca saddharmapāṭhamantrajāpā-  
dau pravṛttir bhavati, tathā mithyātvāviśeṣe 'pi duḥkhādiprākṛta-  
vikalpahānāya<sup>xlix</sup> samyaksambodhilakṣaṇaprāptaye<sup>164</sup> ca prekṣāva-  
tām arthināṃ pravṛttir bhaviṣyatīti.

## 8 saptavidheṣu sādhyeṣu sārāsāravicāraṇam

nanu yadarthas tavāyam<sup>165, 1</sup> ārambhaḥ so 'rthaḥ pralayaṃ gataḥ. ta-  
thā hi lakṣyalakṣaṇacintātra prastutā. sā ca vismṛtā, kva gateti na  
jñāyate.

<sup>xlvi</sup> *Pramāṇavārttika*, Pramāṇasiddhi 193cd.

<sup>xlix</sup> cf. *Samantabhadrasādhana* (as quoted in Kamalanātha's *Ratnāvalī* ad HeTa 2.2.45, fol. 16r6): prākṛtavikalpavṛttair aparaṃ na hi kiñcad asti bhavaduḥkham | tasya viruddhaṃ caitat sāksādavagamyate cetaḥ ||

<sup>1</sup> The manuscript's reading *yadarthasvā'yam* seems like a plausible corruption of *yadarthas tavā'yam*, but Tibetan shows no reflex of *tava*. TVA<sub>D</sub> reads: *rtsom pa 'di'i don gang yin pa*. TVB<sub>G</sub> reads: *gal te gang gi don du (bzhi pa bshad pa'i bshad pa'i dus) 'di brtsams pa'i*.

<sup>158</sup> iti] E<sub>DH</sub>; deest in K

<sup>159</sup> maṇḍala°] E<sub>DH</sub>; bri ba'i 'dkyil 'khor (lekhyamaṇḍala°)

<sup>160</sup> mithyādhyāropahānārthaṃ] *em.*; mithyādhyāropaṇārthaṃ K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>161</sup> 'saty api] K; 'styopi E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>162</sup> bhoktari] K (bhoktarī°) (*the letter no is added abhove bho*); muktaye E<sub>DH</sub> (*em.*)

<sup>163</sup> mā] E<sub>DH</sub> (*em.*); deest in K

<sup>164</sup> lakṣaṇaprāptaye] K E<sub>DH</sub>; mtshan nyid kyi 'bras bu thob par bya ba'i phyir TVA<sub>D</sub> (lakṣaṇaphalaprāptaye); mtshan nyid 'bras bu thob par bya ba'i phyir TVB<sub>G</sub> (lakṣaṇaphalaprāptaye)

<sup>165</sup> yadarthas tavāyam] *conj.*; yadarthasvā'yam K; yadarthatvād ayam E<sub>DH</sub>

na tu<sup>166</sup> kṛtaiva sā saptabhir bhedaīḥ?  
 satyam, kintu guḍagorasanyāyena. tathā hi na jñāyate, kiṃ tat  
 sāram asāram veti.  
 ucyate.

### 8.1 prathamasyāsāratvam

mantranayavihitakramābhāvāt samāpattibhāvanāvaiyarthīyād<sup>167</sup> yu-  
 ktyabhāvāc<sup>168</sup> ca prathamasya niḥsāratā. tathā hi samagrasāmagrī-  
 kaṃ yat phalaṃ<sup>169</sup> tad avaśyam eva bhavati. anyathā samagrasāma-  
 grīkaṃ eva tan na bhavet. sāṅgātkaṇḍavasthāyāṃ samagrasāma-  
 grīkaṃ tad vartate. tad avaśyaṃ tena<sup>170</sup> bhavitavyam. sati ca bha-  
 vati<sup>171,li</sup> prathamasya hānir iti.

### 8.2 dvitīyasya asāratvam

śarīrādyākāraśūnyasya kevalasātarūpasyānupalabdher<sup>172</sup> na dvitīya-  
 sya sāratā. tathā hi pramāṇaniścitaṃ prekṣāvatā bhāvanīyam, na  
 yathākathañcit. pramā[K fol. 8r]ṇena samvalitarūpam eva sarvado-  
 palabhyate.<sup>lii</sup> tad eva sarvajanānāṃ kamanīyatayā pratibhāsate. ta-  
 smāt kevalasya rucyabhāvāc cakrākārasaṃvalitasyopalabdheḥ sā-  
 kṣāt kartum aśakyatvāc<sup>173,liii</sup> ca dvitīyasya kalpanāmātrateti.<sup>174</sup>

<sup>li</sup> TV could be rendered as something like *evaṃsati ca prathamasya hānir iti*. I-  
 ndeed this seems to be the sense, but the manuscript reading of *bhavane na* or  
*bhavanena* is hard to account for.

<sup>lii</sup> TVAD lacks a reflex of *sarvadā*, whereas TVBG lacks a reflect of *eva*.

<sup>liii</sup> TV suggests reading: *kevalasyānupalabdheḥ rucyabhāvāc cakrākārasaṃvalita-*

<sup>166</sup> na tu] *conj.*; nanu K EDH

<sup>167</sup> samāpatti°] K EDH TVBG (snyom par 'jug pa); lha'i rnal 'byor gyi snyoms par  
 'jug pa'i TVAD (devatāyogasamāpatti°)

<sup>168</sup> yuktyabhāvāc] EDH; yuktābhāvāc K

<sup>169</sup> yat phalaṃ] *conj.* (TV: 'bras bu gang yin pa); yat KE DH

<sup>170</sup> tena K EDH TVBG (de); de'i 'bras bu TVAD (tena phalena)

<sup>171</sup> *conj.*; bhavane na K EDH; de ltar gyur pas dang po nyams pa yin no TVAD; de  
 ltar gyur pa dang po nyams pa yin no TVBG (evaṃsati)

<sup>172</sup> °labdher] EDH; °bdher K

<sup>173</sup> aśakyatvāc] EDH (*em.*); aśakyatāc K

<sup>174</sup> kalpanāmātrateti] EDH (*em.*); kalpanātrateti K

### 8.3 ṭṛtīyasya asāratvam

nirupadravabhūtārthasvabhāvatvena sātmībhūtasya tyaktum aśakya-  
tvāt, saṃvalitarūpasya [E<sub>DH</sub> p. 144] bhedābhāvāt, prayojanābhāvāc  
ca na ṭṛtīyasya<sup>175</sup> kalyāṇabhāvaḥ.<sup>176</sup> tathā hi sahopalambhena<sup>177</sup> tā-  
dātmyasiddhāv ekasya parityāge 'parasyāvaśyaṃ parityāgo na vā  
kasyacid iti.

### 8.4 caturthasya sārāsāratvavicāraṇam

prapañcatvena bahuprayāsatvād vicārāsahatvena bhrāntirūpatayā-  
paramārtharūpatayā ca na ṭṛtīyāntapakṣasya<sup>178</sup> kalyāṇateti.<sup>179</sup> atra  
kecid yuktiṃ varṇayanti.<sup>liv</sup> prapañcarūpatvābhāve<sup>180</sup> 'pi sūkṣmasya  
bindvādeḥ punaḥ punar bhāvanayā sāksātkaraṇaṃ yāvat prayāsa-  
tāvat sarvatraiva bhāvvyavastuni sambhavati. tad atra yadi prayāsa-  
bhayaṃ, na kiñcid api bhāvanīyam.

prapañcarūpatvād iti cet, prapañcāprapañcayor bhāvanāvasthā-  
yāṃ ko viśeṣaḥ<sup>181</sup>? nanu<sup>182</sup> aprapañcaṃ śīghraṃ eva sthīrībhavatīty

*syānupalabdheḥ sāksātkartum aśakyatvāc ca.* The addition of *anupalabdheḥ* after *kevalasya* renders the flow of argument's logic less smooth. The addition of the same word after *cakrākārasaṃvalitasya* does not change the argument in its overall sense. Note that the Tibetan 'khor lo'i rang bzhin could instead imply the reading *cakrasvabhāva* or something similar, but it may simply be a free rendering of *cakrākārasaṃvalita*.

TV also adds the reason 'bad pa mtshung pa'i phyir ('because the effort is equal'). The purport of this is unclear.

<sup>liv</sup> TV<sub>AD</sub> renders this sentence differently: *de la 'ga' zhig las rigs pa cung zhig cig brjod par mi bya ste* |

<sup>175</sup> ṭṛtīyasya] *conj.*; ṭṛtīya K; ṭṛtīyaḥ E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>176</sup> ] *conj.* (Tib: dge ba [ma] yin); kalyāṇabhāvaḥ K<sup>pc</sup>; kalyāṇibhāvaḥ K<sup>ac</sup>; dge ba ma yin [na] kalyāṇabhāvaḥ

<sup>177</sup> sahopalambhena] E<sub>DH</sub>; sahopalambhena K

<sup>178</sup> ṭṛtīyāntapakṣasya] *em.* (TV<sub>AD</sub>: gsum pa'i tha' ma'i phyogs TV<sub>AD</sub>; TVB<sub>G</sub>: gsum pa'i mtha' ma'i phyogs); ṭṛtīyāntaḥ | pakṣasya K; ṭṛtīyapakṣasya E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>179</sup> kalyāṇateti] E<sub>DH</sub>; kalyāṇateti K

<sup>180</sup> prapañcarūpatvābhāve] K E<sub>DH</sub>; spros pa'i ngo bo nyid du gyur TV

<sup>181</sup> viśeṣaḥ] *conj.*; viśeṣa iti cet K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>182</sup> nanu] *conj.* (TV: 'on te); deest in K and E<sub>DH</sub>

ayaṃ viśeṣaḥ. yatraivālabane<sup>183</sup> cittam punaḥ punaḥ preryate ni-  
rantaram<sup>184</sup> dīrghakālam ca tatraiva sthīrībhavatīty āgamaḥ. yuktiś  
cātrāsti. tathā cōktaṃ—

tasmād bhūtaṃ abhūtaṃ vā yad yad evābhībhavyate |  
bhāvanābalaniṣpattau<sup>lv</sup> tat sphuṭākālpadhīphalam<sup>185</sup> ||<sup>lvi</sup>

punaś cōktaṃ—

aho kuśīdatvam aho vimūḍhatā  
aho janasyāśya sadarthavakratā |  
svacittamātrapratibaddhabuddhatā<sup>186</sup>  
adūravartiny api yan na sevyate ||<sup>187</sup>

iti. tasmān nāyaṃ viśeṣaḥ.

bhrāntirūpatvenāparamārthatvam api sarvatraiva bhāvanāviśeṣe  
vastuni sambhavatīti na kiñcid api bhāvanīyaṃ syāt. [K fol. 8v] ta-  
taś ca sarvatraiva mokṣamārga bhāvanāyā vaiyarthyaṃ syāt. māyo-  
pamākārānupraveśena bhrāntirūpaṃ apy aprapañcād [E<sub>DH</sub> p. 145]  
bhāvyamānam<sup>188</sup> aduṣṭaṃ bhavatīti cet, na tv ayaṃ māyākārānupa-  
veśaḥ prapañce 'pi samāna iti. tatrāpi ko doṣasyāvakāśaḥ? tasmāt  
prapañcam aprapañcam vā yad eva rocate pramāṇasaṃgatam itarad  
vā, tad evāśyaṃ vihāya mahāpuruṣārthibhir bhāvayitavyam<sup>189</sup> ity  
alam atiprasaṅgeneti.

atra ca sāretaravibhāgaḥ paryupāsitaḥ gurubhir eva jñātavyaḥ.

<sup>lv</sup> The reading *bhāvanābalaniṣpattau* is supported by the Tibetan translation and occurs in other sources (*bsgom pa'i stobs ni rdzogs pa na*). Another more main-  
stream reading for this *pāda* is *bhāvanāpariniṣpattau*.

<sup>lvi</sup> *Pramāṇavārttika*, Pratyakṣapramāṇa 285

<sup>183</sup> yatraivālabane] *conj.* (no reflect of *nanu* in TV); *nanu* yatraivālabane

<sup>184</sup> nirantaram] E<sub>DH</sub> (*em.*) TV (rgyun mi 'chad par); niruttaram K

<sup>185</sup> kalpadhīphalam] *em.*; kalpadhīḥ phalam K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>186</sup> °pratibaddha°] *conj.* (TV; 'brel pa); °pratibuddha° K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>187</sup> Untraced. Also cited in \**Saptāṅga* fol. 202r7.

<sup>188</sup> aprapañcād bhāvyamānam] E<sub>DH</sub>; aprapañcā bhāvyamānam

<sup>189</sup> bhāvayitavyam] E<sub>DH</sub>; bhaviyitavyam K

## 8.5 pañcamasya asāratvam

ṭṛṭīyapakṣoktaśatvān<sup>190</sup> nīrasatvena<sup>191</sup> prayojanābhāvān mantra-nayakramābhāvāc ca na pañcamah parikṣiṇadoṣaḥ.

nanu sākṣātkaraṇāt pūrvam mantranayaprayogo 'sti. tat katham tasyābhāvah? satyam, sākṣātpthalāvasthā sādhyā. tasyām ca nāsty a-sau kramah. †sākṣātparityāge<sup>lvii†</sup> ca na prayojanam utpaśyāma iti.

## 8.6 ṣaṣṭhamasya asāratvam

svecchayā nirvāyayitum<sup>192</sup> aśakyatvāt, prayojanābhāvāt, sattvārthābhāvāc ca na pañcāntaraprabhedakalpanā<sup>193</sup> kalaṅkāśūnyā. tathā hi kasyacin nivṛttiḥ kāraṇanivṛtṭyā vyāpakanivṛtṭyā<sup>194</sup> vā bhavati. na cātra sākṣātkṛtamaṇḍalacakrasya nivartakam kāraṇam vyāpakam vā icchākāle dṛśyate.<sup>lviii</sup>

nanu śūnyataiva nivartikāsti. yathā dāruṣaṅghātaprajvalito<sup>195</sup> vahnir niḥśeṣam indhanam bhasmīkṛtya paścāt svarasata eva nivar-tate, tathā maṇḍalacakraprajvalitaḥ śūnyatājñānāgniḥ sākṣāt kṛtvā<sup>196</sup> maṇḍalacakram nivartayiṣyatīti cet.<sup>197</sup> tad asat, viṣamatvād dṛṣṭā-

<sup>lvii</sup> Segment instead: kramah sākṣāt. parityāge ?

<sup>lviii</sup> TV lacks a reflex of *icchākāle dṛśyate*. Both translations add an extra sentence to this paragraph: *rang gi 'dod pas ('dos pas TVBG; 'gog par TVBG)'gog pa yang mi nus te mi mthun pa med pa'i phyir | sdug bsngal la sogs pa 'gog pa 'dod kyang sdug bsngal la sogs pa la 'jug pa mthong ba'i phyir ro ||*

<sup>190</sup> ṭṛṭīyapakṣoktaśatvān *conj.* (TVBG: gsum pa'i phyogs la bshad pa'i nyes pa yod pa dang); ṭṛṭīyapakṣe ktato K; ṭṛṭīyapakṣe kuto E<sub>DH</sub>; *no reflex* in TVAD

<sup>191</sup> nīrasatvena] *conj.*; nīrasatvena te K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>192</sup> nirvāyayitum] K; nirvāpayitum E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>193</sup> pañcāntara°] *em.* TV (lga pa'i mtha'i rab tu dbye ba); prapañcāntara° K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>194</sup> vyāpakanivṛtṭyā] E<sub>DH</sub>; vyāpakānivṛtṭyā K

<sup>195</sup> dāruṣaṅghātaprajvalito] *conj.*; dāruṣaṅghāte prajvalito E<sub>DH</sub>; dāruṣaṅghāt prajvalito K

<sup>196</sup> sākṣāt kṛtvā] *conj.*; sākṣān K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>197</sup> TV a fuller sentence here. TVBG reads: *de ltar dkyil 'khor gyi 'khor lo stong pa nyid kyi ye shes kyi me rab tu 'bar bas mngon sum du byas nas kyang | dkyil 'khor gyi 'khor lo ma lus par ldog par byed la | bdag nyid kyang rang gi ngang gis ldog par 'gyur ro zhe na |* TVAD appears to be slightly more corrupt, but suggests that same readings: *de dkyil 'khor gyi 'khor lo stong pa nyid kyi ye shes kyi me rab tu*

ntasya. tathā hi tatrendhanam kāraṇam<sup>198</sup> vahneh. kāraṇasya indhanalakṣaṇasya nivṛttau<sup>199</sup> yuktaiva vahnalakṣaṇasya kāryasya nivṛtṭiḥ. iha tu na śūnyatā kāraṇam maṇḍalacakrasya. tat ka[K fol. 9r]tham tannivṛttau nivṛtṭiḥ? na<sup>200</sup> ca śūnyatāyā nivṛttir asti.<sup>lix</sup>

nanu sā na<sup>201</sup> bhavatu kāraṇam. śūnyatā vyāpakam tu bhaviṣyati. vyāpakasya vṛkṣasya nivṛttau śiṃśapātvasya vyāpyasya nivṛttivan nivṛttir bhaviṣyatīti cet. etad apy asāram. tathā hi śūnyatā sarvadā sarvajñeyamaṇḍalavyāpikā tattvarūpā.<sup>202</sup> na ca tasyā nivṛtṭiḥ kadācid apy asti. yadi syāt samyaksambodhisākṣātkaraṇāt [E<sub>DH</sub> p. 146] pūrvam anantaram eva vā nivṛtṭiḥ syāt. na ca bhavati, samyaksambuddhībhūyāpi katipayakālāvasthānasya svayam eva svikṛtatvāt.

kintu śūnyatāpi jñānarūpā, cakram api jñānarūpam. śūnyatājñānotpattyā cakrajñānasyānivṛttau<sup>203</sup> śūnyatājñānam kena nivartaniyam. tena nivṛtṭiś ca virodhino 'bhāvāt kāraṇavyāpakayoś cābhāvān nāsti. tasmāc chūnyatājñānasya na nivṛtṭiḥ,<sup>204</sup> nāpi maṇḍalacakrasya śūnyatāto nivṛttir iti śūnyatā na nivartikā.

ko brūte śūnyatā nivartikā? kiṃ tarhi yan nivartakam<sup>205</sup> tad gurūpadeśato jñeyam ity apy asāram. gurūpadeśato 'pi na śūnyatā-

<sup>lix</sup> The response the objection is considerably different in Tibetan. It states that while fire is regarded by mundane consensus as having a causal effect on fuel insofar as it transforms it, emptiness has no such effect on the *maṇḍalacakra*. It is also therefore not something that causes it to cease, nor is it known to itself cease of its own accord. Although the Sanskrit MS is very corrupt in this paragraph, it is difficult to see how the text it transmits corresponds to the Tibetan translation.

'bar bas mngon sum du byas nas kyang | dkyil 'khor gyi 'khor lo ma lus par ldog par byed la | de yang rang gi ldog par 'gyur ro zhe na |

<sup>198</sup> kāraṇam] conj.; na kāraṇam K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>199</sup> kāryasya indhanalakṣaṇasya nivṛttau] conj.; kāryam indhanalakṣaṇanivṛttau

<sup>200</sup> na] conj.; athavā na] K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>201</sup> na] E<sub>DH</sub> (em.); deest in K

<sup>202</sup> tattvarūpā] E<sub>DH</sub>; tatvarūpāḥ K

<sup>203</sup> °ānivṛttau] K E<sub>DH</sub>; log na TV(nivṛttau)

<sup>204</sup> na nivṛtṭiḥ] conj. (TV: ldog pa med do); nivṛtṭiḥ K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>205</sup> nivartakam] em.; nivartikās K E<sub>DH</sub>



vyatiriktam<sup>206</sup> pramāṇato 'stīti yatkiñcid etat.<sup>lx</sup> pratikṣaṇanivṛttiś ca kṣaṇabhaṅgarūpā sarvapadārthavyāpinī. na sā santānanivartikā. tasmān na svecchayā nivṛttiḥ.<sup>207</sup> na ca nivṛtṭyā<sup>208</sup> nīrasarūpayā prajoyanam asti prekṣāvatām. tathā cōktam—

mucyamāneṣu sattveṣu ye te prāmodyasāgarāḥ |  
tair eva nanu paryāptam mokṣeṇārasikena kim ||<sup>lxi</sup>

iti.

sattvārtho 'pi nivṛtttau nāsti. na hi gagane<sup>209</sup> gaganakamale vā kācid arthakriyā sambhavati. ciraniruddhād apy atītād avasturūpāc<sup>210</sup> cakrāt sattvārtho bhaviṣyatīty apy asāram, ciranīrutasyāpi<sup>211</sup> kukku[K fol. 9v]ṭasya kaṇṭhadhvaniprasaṅgāt.

nanu yogyadhiṣṭhānād gaganād apy arthakriyāḥ sambhavantīti cet.<sup>212</sup> na sambhavanti, yogyadhiṣṭhānād eva cittarūpād arthakriyā, na gaganāt, nīrūpatvāt tasya.<sup>lxii</sup>

nanu nirodhya maṇḍalacakram sattvārthakāle punar utpādyate. tato 'rthakriyā bhavati. tataḥ punar eva nirodhyate, punar evotpa-dyata iti cet. asad etat. yathā sattvārthakriyāyās tattvato<sup>213</sup> nāsti prā-durbhāvaḥ, tathā cakrasyāpi. tato nārthakriyāyāḥ sambhavaḥ. na ca

<sup>lx</sup> TVB<sub>G</sub>: bla ma'i man ngag las kyang stong pa nyid kyis ldog par byed pa ma yin ldog pa'i tshad ma cung zhiḡ kyang yod pa ma yin pas. TVA<sub>D</sub>: bla ma'i man ngag las kyang stong pa nyid dang | de ldog pa las ma gtogs pa'i ldog par byed pa'i tshad ma gzhan cung zad yod pa ma yin no ||

<sup>lxi</sup> *Bodhicaryāvatāra* 8.108

<sup>lxii</sup> TVA<sub>D</sub> varies significantly for this paragraph.

<sup>206</sup> śūnyatāvyatiriktam] *conj.* vyatiri((ktiḥ)) K (i in kti lacks a prṣṭhamātrā); vyati-riktaḥ E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>207</sup> nivṛttiḥ] K<sup>ac</sup>; nivṛttiḥ K<sup>pc</sup>

<sup>208</sup> nivṛtṭyā] E<sub>DH</sub> (*em.*); nivartyā K

<sup>209</sup> gagane] K E<sub>DH</sub> TVB<sub>G</sub>; *no reflex* in TVA<sub>D</sub>

<sup>210</sup> avasturūpāc] K E<sub>DH</sub> TVB<sub>G</sub> (dngos po med pa'i ngo bo); dngos po'i ngo bo TVA<sub>D</sub> (vasturūpāc)

<sup>211</sup> ciranīrutasyāpi] *conj.*; cirutasyāpi K; virutasyāpi E<sub>DH</sub>; yun rin por khyim bya shi ba TVA<sub>D</sub>; yun ring por long pa'i khyim bya shi ba TVB<sub>G</sub> (ciraṃṛtasyāpi)

<sup>212</sup> sambhavantīti cet] *conj.*; sambhavanti K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>213</sup> tattvato] K (tatvato) E<sub>DH</sub>; de las TV (tato)

nirodhya<sup>214</sup> punar utpāde kiñcit prayojanam astīty alam atiprapa-  
ñceneti.

### 8.7 saptamasya asāratvam

ṣaṣṭhapakṣoktadoṣasandohasya saptame<sup>215</sup> 'pi bhāvān na piṣṭapeṣa-  
ṇam<sup>216</sup> kriyate. nanu ṣaṣṭhena saptamasya samānatvāt katham sa-  
ptamasya tato viśeṣaḥ? asti viśeṣaḥ. pūrvāvasthāyām niyatacakrā-  
kāratā, punaḥ svecchayā nirvṛtiḥ svecchotpādanam<sup>217</sup> ceti. saptame  
punar etan nāsti. tato na samānatā. bhinnas ca nirdiṣṭa iti.<sup>218</sup>

## 9 caturthasya sekasya svarūpam

dambholibījasrutidhautaśuddha-<sup>219</sup>  
pāthojabhūtāṅkurabhūtapuṣṭi<sup>220</sup> |  
turīyaśasyam<sup>221</sup> paripākam eti<sup>222</sup>  
sphuṭam caturtham viduṣo 'pi gūḍham || 17 ||

[E<sub>DH</sub> p. 147] dambholītyādi. etat sadgurūpadeśato jñeyam.

<sup>214</sup> nirodhya] E<sub>DH</sub>; niro((dhyā)) K (some kind of correction is made, but uncertain from what to what); 'gogas pa las (possibly nirodhāt)

<sup>215</sup> ṣaṣṭhapakṣoktadoṣasandohasya saptame] conj. (TV: drug pa'i phyogs la bshad pa'i skyon gyi (gyi) TV<sub>AD</sub>; gyis TV<sub>BG</sub>) tshogs bdun pa la); ṣaṣṭhapakṣoktam sam-  
dāhasyāṣṭame K; ṣaṣṭhapakṣoktasamdoṣasyāṣṭame E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>216</sup> piṣṭapeṣaṇam] K<sup>ac</sup> E<sub>DH</sub>; piṣṭapre | ṣaṇam K<sup>ac</sup>

<sup>217</sup> nirvṛtiḥ svecchotpādanam] conj. (TV<sub>BG</sub>: yang rang gi 'dod pas 'gog cing rang gi 'dod pas skyed par byed pa); svecchetpādanam K; svecchotpādanam E<sub>DH</sub>; yang dang yang du rang gi 'dod pas skyed par byed pa nyid TV<sub>AD</sub>

<sup>218</sup> K E<sub>DH</sub>; tha mi dad pa ma yin par bstan to TV<sub>AD</sub>; tha mi dad pa ma yin par bstan to TV<sub>BG</sub>

<sup>219</sup> 'sruti°] corr.; śruti K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>220</sup> pāthoja°] E<sub>DH</sub> (E<sub>DH</sub> reports the ms. as reading pāthojña, but this seems to be incorrect); pāthauja° K

<sup>221</sup> turīyaśasyam] E<sub>DH</sub>; tutīyaśasyam K

<sup>222</sup> eti] E<sub>DH</sub> (em.); eta K

## 10 aparaṃ mithyāsādhyam mithyātattvaṃ ca

pañcapradīpāmṛtabinducandra-  
bhrūmadhyabindūdbhavamāṇḍalāni |  
vāyoh svarūpaṃ galaśuṇḍikādyam  
atattvarūpaṃ svayam ūhanīyam || 18 ||

pañcapradīpetyādi. pañcapradīpaśabdena gokudahanalakṣaṇasya, a-  
mṛtaśabdena vimumāraśulakṣaṇasya satatānuṣṭhānam eva sādhyam  
manyante. bindur iti hṛccandrasthām binduṃ dedīpyamānam tattvaṃ  
sādhyam ceti kṛtvā kecd bhāvayanti. candra iti hṛdistham kalārū-  
pam ardhaacandram vā hṛtkamalastham kecd bhāvayanti.

bhrūmadhyabindūdbhavamāṇḍalānīti bhruvor madhye ūṇāyām  
binduṃ vibhāvya tadbindūdbhavāni maṇḍalāni vāyuvāruṇamāhe-  
ndrāgneyalakṣaṇāni. etad uktaṃ bhavati—mukhaśravaṇanāsikākacakṣurghrāṇarasanā-  
hastāṅgulībhiḥ pidhāya bhrūmadhyabindur draṣṭavyaḥ. tasya sphu-  
ṭavasthāyām śubhāśubhani[K fol. 10r]mittasamsūcakāni mähendrā-  
dimaṇḍalāny upajāyante. taṃ ca binduṃ tattvaṃ iti manyante.

vāyoh svarūpaṃ iti pūrakakumbhakarecakaprasāntakalakṣaṇam<sup>224</sup>  
ānāpānādīlakṣaṇam<sup>225</sup> ceti. etad<sup>226</sup> uktaṃ bhavati—śaivasāmkyādīnirdiṣṭam<sup>227</sup>  
vāyusvarūpaṃ jñātvā taṃ vāyuṃ nirodhabhāvanayā sthīrīkṛtyākā-  
śenotplutya gamanam parapurapraveśam yāvan muktiṃ ca sāksā-  
tkurvanti vāyuvādinah.

galaśuṇḍiketi. galapradeśe jihvāmūlopari hastīśuṇḍikākārā adhaḥ-  
pralambamānā upajihvāsaṃjñikā galaśuṇḍikāsti. sā ca śaktirūpā. ta-  
dadhaḥ śivarūpaṃ<sup>228</sup> asti tattvaṃ. sā ca [E<sub>DH</sub> p. 148] jihvāgreṇa sprīśya-  
mānā nirantarāmṛtaṃ sravati. tena ca ghargharāmṛtavaraṇena sa-  
ntarpyamānam ātmānam dhyāyād iti galaśuṇḍikātattvaṃ. ādīśabdena

<sup>223</sup> mukhaśravaṇanāsikākacakṣurghrāṇarasanāni] K E<sub>DH</sub>; kha dang | rna ba dang |  
sna dang | mig TVA<sub>D</sub> TVB<sub>G</sub>

<sup>224</sup> °recaka°] E<sub>DH</sub>; recakaṃ K

<sup>225</sup> ānāpānādīlakṣaṇam] E<sub>DH</sub>; anāpānā° K

<sup>226</sup> etad] E<sub>DH</sub> (*em.*); tad K

<sup>227</sup> śaivasāmkyādī°] E<sub>DH</sub> (*em.*) TVB<sub>G</sub> (shi ba dang grangs can la sogs pas); saiva-  
sāmkyādī° K; grangs can la sogs pas TVA<sub>D</sub> (śmākhyādī°)

<sup>228</sup> tadadhaḥ śivarūpaṃ] K E<sub>DH</sub> TVB<sub>G</sub> (de'i 'og na zhi ba'i ngo bo); sdig pa'i rang  
bzhin du yong pa TVA<sub>D</sub>

hr̥nmadhyāṣoḍaśanādīkācakramadhyasthajñānasvarūpaṃ<sup>229</sup> śivarū-  
paṃ tattvaṃ bhāvayitavyam ityādināṃ parigrahaḥ.<sup>lxiii</sup>

tatsarvaṃ tīrthikādibhis tattvarūpeṇābhimatam. atattvam iti sva-  
yam evohaniyaṃ vicāraṇīyam iti yāvat.

## 11 upasaṃhāra

svapnendrajālapratibimbamāyā-  
marīcīgandharvapurāmbu[K fol. 2r]candraiḥ |  
anyaiś ca śabdair<sup>230</sup> upamābhidheyair  
naivāsti sādhyam kathitād ihānyat || 19 ||

svapnendrajāletyādi. svapnendrajālopamaṃ pratibimbamāyāmarīci-  
gandharvanagarodakacandropamam iti śabdair anyaiś ca gagaṇa-  
pratiśrutkaphenopamam ityādiśabdair upamābhidheyair upamāvā-  
cakair naivāsti sādhyam kathitāt sādhyād anyat. paraṃ kathita eva  
sādhye, ete śabdāḥ pravartanta iti svayam boddhavyam.

gambhīraśūnyapratibhāsamātra-<sup>231</sup>  
śāntāti<sup>232</sup>sūkṣmānabhilāpyaśabdaiḥ |

<sup>lxiii</sup> TV continues to describe this practice. TVA<sub>D</sub> reads: *yang smras pa | bcu las drug lhag rtsa dang ldan pa'i 'khor lo yi || dkyil na gnas pa'i snying gar rnam par gnas pa'i bdag | des ni de yi khyad par lta bu'i grub pa ster || de ni mngon par mi g-yo ba yi yid dag gis || rnal 'byor pa yi sems de de ltar mngon par bsam || nub par gyur pa'i mgon po rgyal bar gyur de ni || nus pa dag gis de ni yongs su bskor dang bcas ||* TVB<sub>G</sub> reads: *de yang smras pa | bcu las drug lhag rtsa dang ldan pa'i 'khor lo'i dkyil na gnas pa snying kar rnam par gnas pa'i bdag | des ni de'i khyad par lta bu yi grub pa ster | de ni mngon par mi g.yo ba'i yid dag gis || rnal 'byor pa yis de ltar mngon par bsam par bya || nus par gyur pa'i mgon po rgyal bar gyur || de ni nus pa dag gis de ni yongs su bskor dang bcas ||*

<sup>229</sup> hr̥nmadhyāṣoḍaśanādīkācakramadhyasthajñānasvarūpaṃ] K E<sub>DH</sub> TVB<sub>G</sub> (snying ka'i dbus kyi 'khor lo rtsibs bcu drug pa'i dbus na gnas pa ye shes kyi rang bzhin); snying ga'i dbus kyi dkyil 'khor rtsibs bcu drug pa'i dbus na hūm gnas pa ye shes kyi rang bzhin (hr̥nmadhyāṣoḍaśanādīkāmaṇḍalamadhyahūmsthajñānasvarūpaṃ)

<sup>230</sup> śabdair *em.* (cf. comm.); sarvair K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>231</sup> °mātra°] E<sub>DH</sub>; mātraṃ K

<sup>232</sup> śāntāti] E<sub>DH</sub>; śāntādi K

nirlepanīrūpa<sup>233</sup> nirañjanādyair  
bhrāntir na kāryāparasādhyasattve || 20 ||

[E<sub>DH</sub> p. 149] gambhīraśūnyaṃ pratibhāsamātraṃ śāntātisūkṣmam  
anabhilāpyaṃ nirlepaṃ nīrūpaṃ<sup>234</sup> nirañjanādi.<sup>235</sup> ādiśabdāt śivaṃ  
nirākāraṃ niṣprapañcam anādyantanidhanam i[K fol. 10v]tyādiśabdair  
bhrāntir na kartavyā. aparasādhyasattve, aparasya sādhyasya sattve  
sattāyām.<sup>236</sup> ebhiḥ sarvair eva param api kiñcit sādhyam kathitād  
astīti bhrāntir na kartavyā. atha nātikathitam eva sādhyam ebhiḥ  
sarvair abhidhiyata iti niścayaḥ.

## 12 pariṇāmanā

akhilagagaṇagarbhavyāpisaptaprakāra-<sup>237</sup>  
grathitavacanarūpād yan mayāsādi puṇyam |  
anupamasukhavidyāsaktasaddahanirmij-  
jinajanitajanārthas tena loko 'yam astu ||  
tattvaratnāvalokaḥ samāptaḥ. kṛtir iyaṃ paṇḍitavāgī-  
śvarakīrtipādānām.

śrīsamāje parā yasya bhaktir niṣṭhā ca nirmalā  
tasya vāgīśvarasyeyaṃ kṛtir vimatināśinī<sup>238</sup> ||

vikacakumudatārākṣīrakundānukāri<sup>239</sup>  
pracitam api ca puṇyam yan mayā granthito 'smāt |  
anupamasukhapūrṇaḥ svābhavidyopagūḍho  
bhavatu nikhilalokas tena vāgīśvaraśrīḥ ||

<sup>233</sup> nirlepanīrūpa°] E<sub>DH</sub> (*em.*); nirlepanīpa K

<sup>234</sup> nīrūpaṃ] E<sub>DH</sub> (*em.*); nirupamaṃ K

<sup>235</sup> nirañjanādi] K; nirañjanaṃ E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>236</sup> sattāyām] K; sattvāyā E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>237</sup> °saptaprakāra°] E<sub>DH</sub>; °sarvaprakāra° K

<sup>238</sup> vimatināśinī] E<sub>DH</sub>; vimatināsanī K

<sup>239</sup> vikacakumudatārākṣīrakundānukāri *em.*; vikacakumudakṣīratārakundānukāri]  
E<sub>DH</sub>; vikarektāmudakṣīratārakundānukāri K

tattvaratnāvalokavivaraṇaṃ samāptam. kṛtir iyaṃ paṇḍitācāryavā-  
gīśvarakīrtipādānām.

## References

*Abhidharmakośa* by Vasubandhu. P. PRADHAN, ed. 1975. *Abhidharmakośabhāṣyam of Vasubandhu*. Tibetan Sanskrit Works Series VIII. Patna

*Abhidharmakośavyākhyā* by Yośamitra. Wogihara UNRAI, ed. n.d. *Sphuṭārthā Abhidharmakośavyākhyā by Yaśomitra*. 2 vols. Tokyo: The Publishing Association of the Abhidharmakośavyākhyā

*Amṛtakaṇikā* by Raviśrījñāna. Banarsi LAL, ed. 1994. *Āryamañjuśrī-nāmasaṃgīti with Amṛtakaṇikā-ṭippaṇī by Bhikṣu Raviśrījñāna and Amṛtakaṇikodyota-nibandha of Vibhūticandra*. Biblioteca Indo-Tibetica XXX. Sarnath: Central Institute of Higher Tibetan Studies

*Nyāyabindu* by Dharmakīrti. F. I. ŠČERBATSKOJ. 1918. *Nyāyabindu: Buddijskij učebnik logiki sočinenie Dharmakīrti i tolkovanie na nego Nyāyabinduṭikā sočinenie Dharmottara, sanskritskij tekst izdal s vvedeniem i priměčanijami*. Bibliotheca Buddhica 7. St. Petersburg: Izdanie Rossijskoj Akademii Nauk

*Pramāṇavārttikavṛtti* by Manorathānandin. Sāṃkṛtyāyana ed.

*Mantrārthāvalokinī* by Vilāsavajra. A. TRIBE. 2016. *Tantric Buddhist Practice in India: Vilāsavajra's Commentary on the Mañjuśrīnāmasaṃgīti*. Routledge Studies in Tantric Traditions. Taylor & Francis

*Mitākṣarā* of Vijñāneśvara. Narayan Ram ACHARYA, ed. 1949. *Yājñavalkya-smṛti of Yogīśvara Yājñavalkya with the Commentary Mitākṣara of Vijñāneśvara, Notes, Varient [sic!] Readings etc*. Bombay: Nirnaya Sagar Press

- Vṛttamālāvivṛti* by Śākyarakṣita. Hahn ed.
- Samkṣiptābhiṣekavidhi* by Vāgīśvarakīrti. M. SAKURAI. 1996. *Indo mikkyō girei kenkyū: Kōki Indo mikkyō no kanjō shidai* [XXXXXXXXXX: XXXXXXXXXXXXXXXX, *A study on Indian Buddhist tantric ritual: Late Indian Buddhist tantric initiation sequence*]. Kyoto: Hōzōkansakurai1996)
- Subhāṣitaratnakośa* compiled by Vidyākara. D. D. KOSAMBI and V. V. GOKHALE, eds. 1957. *The Subhāṣitaratnakośa Compiled by Vidyākara*. Cambridge Massachusetts: Harvard University Press
- Hetubinduṭīkāloka* by Durvekamiśra. Sukhlalji SANGHAVI and Muni Shri JINAVIJAYAJI, eds. 1949. *Hetubinduṭīkā of Bhaṭṭa Arcaṭa with the Sub-Commentary Entitled Āloka of Durveka Miśra*. Baroda: Oriental Institute

## Secondary Sources

- INGALLS, Daniel H. H. 1965. *An Anthology of Sanskrit Court Poetry: Vidyākara's "Subhāṣitaratnakośa"*. Vol. 44. Harvard Oriental Series. Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press.
- LAL, Banarsi, ed. 1994. *Āryamañjuśrīnāmasaṃgīti with Amṛtakaṇikā-ṭippaṇī by Bhikṣu Raviśrījñāna and Amṛtakaṇikodyota-nibandha of Vibhūticandra*. Biblioteca Indo-Tibetica XXX. Sarnath: Central Institute of Higher Tibetan Studies.
- SAKURAI, M. 1996. *Indo mikkyō girei kenkyū: Kōki Indo mikkyō no kanjō shidai* [XXXXXXXXXX: XXXXXXXXXXXXXXXX, *A study on Indian Buddhist tantric ritual: Late Indian Buddhist tantric initiation sequence*]. Kyoto: Hōzōkan.