

Tattvaratnāvaloka and Vivaraṇa

Vāgīśvarakīrti

February 15, 2025

Some Conventions/Policies

- Tibetan translations are included in the apparatus when they indicate variant Sanskrit readings.
- Sanskrit renderings suggested by Tibetan appear in brackets after the translation's siglum. These renderings are hypothetical and cannot be provided in all cases.
- When two Tibetan translations differ slightly, they are separated by a semicolon. Only the second translation includes a Sanskrit rendering.
- A Tibetan translation's siglum is included when it appears to support one of multiple Sanskrit readings, based on the editors' judgment.
- Tibetan is not included in the apparatus when it offers no clear support for or against a reading.
- When both Tibetan translations of the commentary agree, they are given the siglum TV.

Sigla and Abbreviations

| | |
|------------------|---|
| TaRaA | Tattvaratnāvaloka |
| TaRaA-Vi | Tattvaratnāvalokavivaraṇa |
| E _{DH} | Dhīḥ vol. 21, pp. 129–149. |
| K | NAK 5–252 = NGMPP A 915/4 |
| TM _D | <i>De kho na nyid rin po che snang ba</i> . Tōhoku no. 1889. sDe dge bstan 'gyur, vol. Pi, fols. 203r3–204r5. Tr. by 'Gos Lhas btsas |
| TVA _D | <i>De kho na nyid rin po che snang ba'i rnam par bshad pa</i> . Tōh. 1890. sDe dge bsTan 'gyur, vol. 44 (rGyud 'grel, Pi), fols. 204r5–214v4. Tr. by 'Gos Lhas btsas. |

| | |
|------------------|---|
| TVB _G | <i>De kho na nyid rin po che snang ba'i rnam par bshad pa</i> . Ōtani no. 4793. bsTan 'gyur gSer bris ma, vol. 84 (83 in BDRC outline(?)), (rGyud 'brel, Zhu), fols. 70v–85v. translator given. |
| TV | Both Tibetan translations of the commentary (differences, if any, indicated in a mini-aparatus) |
| <i>ac</i> | <i>ante correctionem</i> |

| | |
|---------------------|--|
| <i>deest</i> | omitted in |
| <i>diag. conj.</i> | diagnostic conjecture [e.g. 'reconstructed' from Tibetan] |
| <i>conj.</i> | conjecture |
| <i>em.</i> | emendation [an emendation is made with a high degree of confidence, whereas a conjecture proposes a correction while acknowledging a greater possibility for alternatives] |
| fol./fols. | folio/folios |
| <i>pc</i> | <i>post correctionem</i> |
| <i>r</i> | recto |
| <i>v</i> | verso |
| Σ_X | Reading shared in all witnesses but X |
| ((<i>kiṃcit</i>)) | Reading uncertain—either illegible or otherwise in doubt |
| < <i>kiṃcit</i> > | Reading cancelled |
| † <i>kiṃcit</i> † | Reading does not make sense to the editor and an adequate conjecture was not able to be chosen. |
| [<i>kiṃcit</i>] | Indication of a diagnostic conjecture |
| .. | Damaged <i>akṣara</i> (one . per half <i>akṣara</i>) |
| ... | Lacunae of an unknown quantity of <i>akṣaras</i> |
| ° | Mark of abbreviation |

Text

1 maṅgalācaraṇam

[K fol. 1r] [siddham]¹ namaḥ śrīsadgurupādebhyaḥ |ⁱ

anupamasukharūpī śrīnivāso 'nivāso
nirupamadaśadevīrūpavidyaḥ² savidyaḥ |
tribhuvanahitasaukhyaprāptikāro 'vikāro
jayati kamalapāṇir yāvad āśāvikāśaḥ || 1 ||ⁱⁱⁱ

[K fol. 2r3] namaḥ samantakāyavākcittavajrāya.ⁱⁱⁱ

anupametyādi. kamalaṃ padmaṃ pāṇau yasya sa kamalapāṇir a-
valokiteśvaro bhagavāñ jayatīti sambandhaḥ. kiṃviśiṣṭaḥ? anupa-
mam ity^{3,iv} atipraṇītatvamahattvāsaṃsārasthāyitvalakṣaṇair⁴ dha-
rmair yuktasyānyasyābhāvād upamārahitam sukham eva rūpaṃ sva-
bhāvo yasya sa tathoktaḥ. punar api kiṃviśiṣṭaḥ? śrīḥ puṇyajñāna-
sambhāralakṣaṇā, tasyā nivāsa āśrayo yaḥ sa tathā. dharmakāyarū-

ⁱ Scribal homage

ⁱⁱ This verse is in Mālinī metre.

ⁱⁱⁱ Scribal homage

^{iv} Here one may wish to conjecture a reading such as, *anumapetyādi. anupamam ity* ... This reading is partially suggested by TV: *khyad par ji lta bu zhig dang ldan zhe na | dpe med ces bya ba la sogs pa smos te | dpe med pa ni (ni)* TVAD; *dang* TVBG). The corruption, if there is one, can be seen as a kind of haplography. The text nonetheless reads acceptably well with the transmitted reading (although perhaps less smoothly); thus we feel that while a conjecture is possible it is not strongly compelling.

¹ [siddham] K; om EDH

² nirupama° EDH; nirūpama° K

³ kiṃviśiṣṭaḥ? anupamam ity] K EDH; *khyad par ji lta bu zhig dang ldan zhe na | dpe med ces bya ba la sogs pa smos te | dpe med pa ni* TVAD; *khyad par ji lta bu zhig dang ldan zhe na | dpe med ces bya ba la sogs pa smos te | dpe med pa dang* TVBG (kiṃviśiṣṭa ity āha anumapam ityādi. anupamam)

⁴ °saṃsārasthāyitva° K; °saṃsārasthāyisva° EDH

patvena^{5,v} sarvagatatvāt [E_{DH} p. 132] pratiniyatanivāsābhāvād anivāsaḥ.

punaḥ kīdrśaḥ? nirupamaḥ paramarūpayauvanaśṛṅgārādirasa-mahākaruṇādiyuktatvenopamātikrāntā rūpavajrādītārāparyantadaśadevīrūpā vidyāḥ paricāraakatvena⁶ yasya sa tathā. saha svābhārūpayā vidyayā⁷ vartata iti savidyāḥ. tribhuvanasya tribhuvanavartino janasya yad dhitam āyatipathyam^{8,vi} buddhatvādikam, saukhyam

^v The manuscript's *dharmakāyarūpitvena* is theoretically acceptable and nearly synonymous; however, *dharmakāyarūpatvena* is more expected, with forms in *°rūpatvena* being vastly more frequent in Classical Sanskrit. TV's reading *chos kyi sku'i ngo bo nyid kyi* does not clearly confirm either variant, as *rūpin* in the root verse is also translated as *ngo bo*. We provisionally adopt *dharmakāyarūpatvena*, but cannot fully discount the transmitted reading.

^{vi} We need not necessarily read a compound for *āyatipathyam*, treating instead *āyati* as a locative of *āyat*. The expression appears as a gloss for *hita* in several Buddhist texts, such as in Vilāsavajra's *Mantrārthāvalokinī*: *mahyam hitam maddhitam hitam āyatipathyam āgāmipariṇāmatvāt* (p. 233). Similarly, Durvekamiśra writes in his *Hetubinduṭīkāloka*: *parasmai hitamāyati pathyam* (p. 212). In both cases, the construction is ambiguous, but in the latter case, the editors of Durvekamiśra's text have not taken it as a compound.

The word *āyatipathya* is used less ambiguously in compound by Śākyarakṣita, quoted in the following note. Similarly, the roughly parallel expression *āyatisukha* is evidently treated as a compound by Yaśomitra in his *Abhidharmakośavyākhyā*: *aihikasukhārtham apuṇyam iti. ihasukhāpekṣayā tat kṛtam nāyatisukhāpekṣayety arthaḥ* (vol. 1 p. 299). Note also the contrast made with *aihikasukha*. Likewise, we can find a compounded form of *āyatidukha* in a verse attributed to Naradatta in the *Subhāṣitaratnakośa*: *muṇḍāpriyād āyatidukhadāyino vasantam utsārya vijṛmbhitaśriyaḥ | na kaḥ khalāt tāpitamitramaṇḍalād upaiti pāpam tapavāsarād iva ||* 'Who does not become miserable because of a rogue who, like a hot day, is hated by widows (? *muṇḍā*) (the hot day being hated by bald men), who leads to future pain, whose wealth expands after he expels those living with him (like the hot day manifests its richness having dismissed the spring), and who annoys his circle of friends (like on a hot day the orb of the sun is heated) (cf. INGALLS 1965: 553).

⁵ *dharmakāyarūpatvena*] *em.*; *dharmakāyarūpitvena* K E_{DH}

⁶ *paricāraakatvena*] *em.*; *sapari(c)āraakatvena* K; *sapariṇāraakatvena* E_{DH}

⁷ *vidyayā*] K E_{DH}; *rig pa ste | shes rab TV* (*vidyayā prajñayā*)

⁸ *āyatipathyam*] *variant word division in* E_{DH}: *āyati pathyam*; *and in* K: *āyati | pathyam*

tadātve pathyaṃ⁹ cakravartitvādikam,^{vii} tasya yā prāptiḥ¹⁰ [K fol. 2v] sāksātkriyā, tasyāḥ karaṇaṃ kāro yasya sa tathā.^{viii} aparinirvā-

^{vii} The text is insecure here but perhaps not far from the author's intention. Where the manuscript reads *tad dāpayati pathyaṃ* (word division unclear, *pa* and *ya* touching), we conjecture *tadātve pathyaṃ*, following only partially the lead of TVA_D. The Tibetan translations read as follows: *gang la phan pa ni ma 'ongs pa'i phan pa ste | sangs rgyas nyid la sogs pa'o || de la bde ba ni 'phral gyi phan pa ste |* (TVA_D); *gang la phan pa ni ma 'ongs pa'i phan pa ste | sangs rgyas nyid la sogs pa dang | de la bde ba ni bde ba ste | 'khor lo bsgyur ba nyid la sogs pa'o ||* (TVB_G). It appears that TVB_G also transmits a corrupt reading. TVA_D suggests reading something that contrasts with *āyati pathyaṃ*, for which *tadātve pathyaṃ* fits. Another possibility is *āpātapaṭhyaṃ*, but *tadātva* is more often used in contrast with *āyati*. See, for example, Śākyarakṣita's *Vṛttamālāstutivṛtti: prthagjanatve 'pi āyatipathyada-rśinas tadātve ca niṣpāpāḥ* (p. 299); 'Although ordinary people, they see the future welfare and are without sin in the present moment.'

The Tibetan translations also suggest that *hita* and *saukhya* are linked with relative and corelative pronouns: *gang la* and *de la*, or *yasya* and *tasya* in Sanskrit. This does not yield good sense. It is possible that *tadātve* was misread by the translator as a corelative pronoun, while it is also possible that a second relative pronoun (*yat*) or a conjunction (*ca*) was found in the original text near *saukhyaṃ*. Here *hitasaukhya* within the larger compound is only really viable as a *dvandva*: Avalokiteśvara causes the attainment of (ultimate) welfare and (temporary) happiness for all beings. Given that, *tayor yā prāptiḥ* might be preferable to *tasya yā prāptiḥ*, but the singular is also probably acceptable in place of the dual.

^{viii} It is notable that Vāgīśvakīrti evidently understands °*prāptikāra* as a *bahuvrīhi*, whereas other commentators may prefer to treat it akin to *kumbhakāra* and therefore as an *upapadasamāsa* as per *Aṣṭādhyāyī* 3.1.18. Given the latter understanding, the expected gloss for *prāptikāra* would be *prāptim karoti*. Compounds ending in *kāra* are occasionally analysed as *ṣaṣṭhitatpuruṣas*: see, for examples, Vijñāneśvara's *Mitākṣarā ad Yājñavalkya-dharmaśāstra* 2.61 on *satyaṃkārakṛta*, here referring roughly to a thing 'acquired with a pledge', i.e., acquired as earnest money: *karaṇaṃ kāraḥ, bhāve ghaṇ. satyasya kāraḥ satyaṃkārakṛt—kāre satyāga-dasya (Aṣṭādhyāyī 6.3.70) iti mum. satyaṃkāreṇa kṛtaṃ satyaṃkārakṛtam* (p. 275). We are unable to provide another example of a compound ending in *kāra* analysed as a *bahuvrīhi*, but we should also note that the compound *prāptikāra* is itself rare.

TV does not clearly reflect a *bahuvrīhi* analysis, nor does it very clearly point to another reading: *de dag sgrub par mdzad po gang yin pa de la de skad ces bya'o* (TVA_D); *de dag gi rgyu mdzad pa gang yin pa de la de skad ces bya'o* (TVB_G).

⁹ *saukhyaṃ tadātve pathyaṃ*] *conj.*; *tad dāpayati pathyaṃ* K E_{DH} (word division unclear); *de la bde ba ni 'phral gyi phan pa* TVA_D; *de la bde ba ni bde ba ste* TVB_G

¹⁰ *prāptiḥ*] K E_{DH}; *thob pa ni rnyed pa ste* TV (*prāptir lābhaḥ*)

ṇadharmakatvenāpratiṣṭhitanirvāṇarūpatvenā¹¹ nyathātvalakṣaṇasya vikāraśyābhāvād avikārah. evaṃviśiṣṭo bhagavāñ jayati.

kiyantam kalam ity āha—yāvad āśāvikaśāḥ. āśa daśa diśo gaganasvarūpāḥ. yadvā āśāḥ sarvasattvānām bhavabhogaṭṭṣṇāḥ.¹² tā-sām vikāśā avakāśāḥ pravartanāni, prādurbhāvā iti yāvat. te yāvat tāvad¹³ bhagavāñ jayati, sarvahariharahiranyagarbhādibhyaḥ prakṛṣṭo bhavatīty arthaḥ.

atrānupamasukharūpīty anena svārthasaṃpattiḥ kathitā. śrīni-vāsa ity anena tadupāyaḥ, puṇyajñānasambhārayoḥ śrīśabenābhihitatvāt. tribhuvanahitasaukhyaprāptikāra ity anena parārthasaṃpattir uktā. nirupamadaśadevīrūpavidyaḥ savidya ity anena tadupāyaḥ,¹⁴ tathābhūtadaśadevīdvātriṃśallakṣaṇāśītyanuvyañjanakāyākā-raśūnyena¹⁵ sarvākāraparārthasaṃpatteḥ kartum āśakyatvād iti.

2 prajojanādi

śrīmantranītigatacārucaturthaseka-
rūpaṃ vidanti na hi ye sphuṭaśabdaśūnyam |
nānopadeśagaṇasaṃkulasaptabhedais
teṣaṃ sphuṭāvagataye kriyate prayatnaḥ || 2 ||^{ix}

śrīmantranītiśabdena¹⁶ sāmānyayogatantravācakenāpi śrīsamājah¹⁷ parigrhyate, caturthārthakasyānyatrāsambhavāt. śeṣaṃ subodham.

^{ix} This verse is in Vasantatilakā.

¹¹ °rūpatvenā°] K E_{DH}; ngo bo rnyed pas TVA_D; ngo bo brnyed pas TVB_G (°rūpa-prāptyā°)

¹² °ṭṭṣṇāḥ] E_{DH} (°ṭṭṣṇās); ṭṭṣṇā K

¹³ te yāvat tāvad] *em.*; tā yāvat tāvad K E_{DH}; de srid du TV (tāvad)

¹⁴ tathābhūta°] K E_{DH} TVB_G (*de lta bu*); *no reflex in* TVA_D

¹⁵ °kāyā°] K E_{DH}; dam pa'i sku TV (°satkāyā°)

¹⁶ śrīmantranītiśabdena] K E_{DH} TVB_G (dpal ldan sngags kyi gzhung lugs zhes bya ba'i sgras); dpal ldan sngags kyi gzhung lugs shes || zhes bya ba la sogs pa la | sngags kyi gzhung lugs zhes bya ba'i sgras ni | TVA_D (śrīmantranītigatetyādi. mantranītiśabdena)

¹⁷ śrīsamājah] K E_{DH}; shugs kyis dpal gsang ba 'dus pa TV (sāmārthyāt śrīsamājah)

nānācāryopadeśagaṇasaṃkulai[E_{DH} p. 133]r vyākulaiḥ¹⁸ saptabhir
bhedaiḥ prakāraiḥ¹⁹ atītānāgatavartamānācārya²⁰ gatopadeśarāśisaṃgrāhakaiḥ.^{21,x}
sphuṭāvagataye sukhena sphuṭapratītyartham²² iti.

3 tīrthikānāṃ tattvaṃ sādhyam ca

sambhrāntabodhā nikhilā hi tīrthyās
tattvasya sādhyasya ca rūpavittau |
tebhyah prakṛṣṭaḥ kila tattvavettā
vedāntavādīti janapravādaḥ || 3 ||^{xi}

sambhrāntetyādi. sambhrānto vibhrānto bodhaḥ prajñāviśeṣo yeṣāṃ
tīrthikānāṃ te tatho[K fol. 3r]ktāḥ.²³ sarva eva tīrthyā ātmātmīya-
grahatimiropahatabuddhinayanāḥ. tattvaṃ idam iti sādhyam idam²⁴

^x In this case TVB_G resembles closely the Sanskrit text transmitted in K, apart from the addition of a further gloss after *vyākula*. The reading *rnam par bkaḥ pa* ('covered') doesn't yield much sense, but it could be a mistake for *rnam par bkang ba* ('filled'), which is perfectly fitting and synonymous with TVA_D's *rnam par khyab pa* (Negi records the latter as rendering *vipūrṇa* in some texts). One may wish to conjecture such a reading. TVA_D is significantly different here, even though most of the words of the transmitted Sanskrit text are still reflected: *du ma'i man ngag ces bya ba la sogs pa la | 'das pa dang ma 'ongs pa dang | da ltar gyi slob dpon du ma'i man ngag gi tshogs yang dag par bsduḥ pa'i mdun gyi dbye bas yongs su dkrugs pa ni | rnam par dkrugs pas rnam pa thams cad la rnam par khyab pa ste | des bsrub par bya ba dkrugs pa'o ||* The text is dubious but reflects a Sanskrit text along the following lines: *nānācāryopadeśarāśisaṃgrāhakaiḥ saptabhir bhedaiḥ saṃkulair vyākulaiḥ sarvatravīpūrṇaiḥ taiḥ sādhyasaṃkulaiḥ*.

^{xi} This verse is in *Indravajrā*.

¹⁸ *vyākulaiḥ*] K E_{DH}; *rnam par dkrugs pas rnam pa thams cad la rnam par khyab pa* TVA_D; *rnam par 'khrugs pa rnam par bkaḥ pa ste* TVB_G; *vyākulair vipūrṇaiḥ possible conj. (see notes)*

¹⁹ *prakāraiḥ*] K E_{DH}; *no reflex in TV*

²⁰ *°vartamānā°*] E_{DH}; *°pravartamānā°* K

²¹ *°gato°*] K E_{DH} TVB_G (*gtogs pa*); *no reflex in TVA_D*

²² *sukhena sphuṭapratītyartham*] K E_{DH}; *bde bar gnas par khong du chud par bya ba'i phyir* TVA_D; *bde bar gsal bar khong du chud par bya'o* TVB_G

²³ *te tathoktāḥ*] K^{pc}; *te thoktāḥ* K^{ac}; *tathoktāḥ* E_{DH}

²⁴ *sādhyam idam*] *em.*; *sādhyam cedam* K E_{DH}

iti ca tattvasya sādhyasya yat²⁵ svarūpaṃ tasya yā vittiḥ pratītiḥ, tasyāṃ bhrāntāḥ. śeṣaṃ subodham.

nanu tattvasādhyayor upādeyatvenaika-rūpatvāt katham tattvasya sādhyasya ceti^{26, xii} bhedenā nirdeśa itī cet. asad etat. tattvaṃ hy upādeyatve 'pi²⁷ sukhaduḥkhoppekṣādisakalapratibhāsaṃdohavyāpakam.²⁸ sādhyam cānabhimataparīhāreṇecchālakṣaṇaṃ phalam upādeyatve 'pi sakalaprañibhir avāśyam evāsādhyavyāvṛtṭyā sādha-yitavyatvenābhimatam ity adoṣaḥ.

4 vedāntavādināṃ śrāvakapratyekabuddhānāṃ ca sādhyāni

tatra tāvad²⁹ vedāntavādyabhimatam sādhyam āha—ānandarūpaṃ ityādi.

ānandarūpaṃ sva-vid^{xiii} aprakampyaṃ
vedāntinaḥ sādhyam uṣanti śāntam³⁰ |
saśrāvakāḥ³¹ khaḍgajināś ca sādhyam
icchanti rūpādyupadher virāmaṃ || 4 ||

^{xii} E_{DH} misreads the manuscript as *tattvasya sādhyasya ceti* and supplies *katham* after *ceti*. There is in fact a *katham* before *tattvasya* in the manuscript, but the *tat* preceding that *katham* is evidently a corruption.

^{xiii} From the commentary it is clear that *svavid* is not in compound; thus, being an accusative form of a feminine noun, we expect *svavidam*. The form may be grammatically justifiable if it is treated as neuter adjective, akin to *vedavid*.

²⁵ yat] E_{DH} (*em.*); tat K

²⁶ katham tattvasya sādhyasya ceti] *em.*; tat katham tattvasya sādhyasya ceti K; tattvasya sādhyasya ceti katham E_{DH} (*em.*)

²⁷ upādeyatve 'pi] *conj.* (TV: blang bar bya ba nyid yin yang); upādeyatvenāpi K E_{DH}

²⁸ vyāpakam] K (°kaṃ) E_{DH} TVB_G (khyab par byed pa yin la); shes bya tsam du khyab par byed pa yin la TVA_D (°vyāpakam jñeyamātratvena)

²⁹ tāvad] K E_{DH} TVA_D (re zhig); *no reflex in* TVB_G

³⁰ śāntam] *corr.*; sāntam K E_{DH}; *no reflex in* TM_D

³¹ saśrāvakāḥ] *em.*; saśrāvakā K E_{DH}

ānandarūpam iti sadāsukhamayatvāt. svavid iti jyotirūpatvena³² svayaṃ prakāśamānatvāt.³³ aprakampyam iti nityatayā³⁴ kampayitum aśakyatvāt. śāntam³⁵ iti kleśopakleśaśūnyatvena parikalpitatvāt. evaṃvidhaṃ sādhyam uṣanti kāmayingante.

saha śrāvakair vartante ye khaḍgajināḥ khaḍgaviṣṇanakalpā e-kacāriṇo vargacāriṇaś³⁶ ca pratyekabuddhās te sādhyam icchanti. kiḍḍsaṃ? rūpādyupadher virāmaṃ rūpavedanāsaṃjñāsaṃskāravi-jñānalakṣaṇānām upadhīnāṃ skandhānāṃ virāmaṃ vicchedam, nir-rodham iti yāvat. [E_{DH} p. 134] etad uktaṃ bhavati—sarvaśrāvaka-pratyekabuddhāḥ sopadhiśeṣanirupadhiśeṣabhedenā bhinne 'pi nir-vāṇe³⁷ nirupadhiśeṣam eva nirvāṇaṃ sā[K fol. 3v]kṣātkartavyatvena sādhyam pratipannāḥ.

5 pāramitānayavādināṃ caturvidhaṃ sādhyam

idānīm pāramitānayavādināṃ abhimataṃ³⁸ caturvidhaṃ sādhyam āha—ākāraśūnyam ityādi.

ākāraśūnyam gaganendurūpaṃ
pratyātmavedyaṃ karuṇārasaṃ ca |
sallakṣaṇair bhūṣitaṃ³⁹ arthakāri
dānādiniṣyandam apetasaukhyam || 5 ||

sānandasallakṣaṇamaṇḍitāṅgaṃ
sambhujaṃ mānaṃ daśabhūmisamsthaiḥ |
sattvārthakāri pravādanti sādhyam
dānādiṣaṭpāramitānayasthāḥ || 6 ||^{xiv}

^{xiv} These two verses are in Indra vajrā.

³² jyotirūpatvena] K; jyotirūpatvena E_{DH}

³³ prakāśamānatvāt] E_{DH} (*em.*); prakāśamānāt K

³⁴ nityatayā] E_{DH}; anityatayā K TV (mi rtag pa nyid kyi)

³⁵ śāntam] *corr.*; sāntam K E_{DH}

³⁶ vargacāriṇaś] K TV (tshogs kyi spyod pa) ; vanacāriṇaś E_{DH}

³⁷ nirvāṇe] E_{DH}; nirvāṇa° K

³⁸ abhimataṃ] E_{DH}; abhimata K

³⁹ bhūṣitaṃ] E_{DH}; bhuṣitaṃ K

5.1 pāramitānaye prathamam sādhyam

ākārair nīlapītasukhaduḥkhādibhiś citrarūpaiḥ śūnyaṃ nirākāram. ata eva gaganasyeva nirākāratvenendor iva prabhāsvaratvena rūpaṃ svabhāvo yasya tat tathā. pratyātmavedyam iti svasaṃvedanaikavedyam.⁴⁰ karuṇā duḥkhād⁴¹ duḥkhahetor vā sakalajagadabhyuddharaṇakāmatā.^{42,xv} saiva rasaḥ svabhāvo yasya tat tathoktam. e tad uktaṃ bhavati—nīlapītādicitrākāraśūnyaṃ nirābhāsaṃ⁴³ nirañjanaṃ^{xvi} gaganopamaṃ svacchaṃ sakalajagadarthakāri^{xvii} mahākaruṇāyuktaṃ pratyātmavedyaṃ pāramitopadeśaśabdābhidheyaṃ sādhyam iti pāramitānaye prathamam sādhyam.

5.2 pāramitānaye dvitīyaṃ sādhyam

śobhanāni ca tāni lakṣaṇāni ca dvātriṃśallakṣaṇasaṃjñakāni,^{44,xviii} tair bhūṣitam. arthaṃ janānāṃ prayojanaṃ kartuṃ śīlaṃ svabhāvo

^{xv} An alternative to °*abhyuddharaṇakāmatā* is to read °*samuddharaṇakāmatā*. This definition of *karuṇā*, in various forms, is well known in Buddhist texts. See, for instance, Durvekamiśra's *Hetubinduṭīkāloka*: ... *duḥkhāt duḥkhahetor vā samuddharaṇakāmatā nāma yā karuṇā* ... (p. 234); or Manorathānandin's *Pramāṇavārttikavṛtti*: *duḥkhād duḥkhahetośca samuddharaṇakāmatā karuṇā* (edition reads *dukhā*°; p. 21).

^{xvi} One may instead wish to accept the manuscript reading *nirābhāsanirañjanaṃ*, which is understandable as a *viśeṣaṇasamāsa*. The combination of *nirābhāsaṃ nirañjanaṃ* occurs in a verse from an untraced source cited in Raviśrījñāna's *Amṛtakaṇikā*: *yat kāyaṃ sarvabuddhānāṃ nirābhāsaṃ nirañjanaṃ | ajñātam akṛtaṃ śuddham abhāvādivivarjitam* || (p. 19)

^{xvii} *sakalajagadarthakāri* can also be read in compound with *mahākaruṇā*°. This is reflected in both Tibetan translations: 'gro ba ma lus pa'i don byed pa'i snying rje chen po. Regardless, the two are evidently closely related.

^{xviii} The manuscript reading *ceti* after *dvātriṃśallakṣaṇasaṃjñakāni* appear superfluous. The commentary analyses *sallakṣaṇa* as a *karmadhāraya*, glossing *sat* with *śobhana*; *dvātriṃśallakṣaṇa* serves as a clarification of that, requiring no fu-

⁴⁰ svasaṃvedanaikavedyam] E_{DH} (*em.*) (°vedyaṃ); svasaṃvedyanaikavedyam K

⁴¹ karuṇā duḥkhād] K; karuṇāduḥkhā° E_{DH}

⁴² °*abhyuddharaṇakāmatā*] *em.*; °*atyuddharaṇakāmatā* K E_{DH}

⁴³ nirābhāsaṃ] *em.*; nirābhāsa° K E_{DH}

⁴⁴ dvātriṃśallakṣaṇasaṃjñakāni] *conj.*; dvātriṃśallakṣaṇasaṃjñakāni ceti K E_{DH}; mdzes pa'i mtshan sum cu rtse gnyis zhes bya ste TV (dvātriṃśatsallakṣaṇānīti / dvātriṃśatsallakṣaṇasaṃjñakāni)

yasya tad arthakāri.⁴⁵ dānādīnāṃ daśapāramitānāṃ niṣyandaṃ^{xix}
 tatprakarṣaprabhavatvena sadṛśaṃ phalam.^{xx} duḥkhasya pūrvam eva
 prahīnatvāt sākṣātkaraṇāvasthāyāṃ^{46,xxi} saukhyasyāpy abhāvād⁴⁷
 upekṣārūpatvenāpetasaukhyam apagatasaukhyam. etad uktaṃ bha-
 vati—dvātriṃśallakṣaṇadharāśītyanuvyañjanavirājitaśarīraṃ sakala-
 jagadarthakāri dānādīpāramitābhyāsa[†]balenātmānaṃ^{48†} samyaksaṃ-
 buddharūpaṃ sukhaduḥkharahitatvenopekṣārūpaṃ dvitīyaṃ sādhyam.

5.3 pāramitānaye tṛtīyaṃ sādhyam

[E_{DH} p. 135] sānandetyādi. sahānandena vartata iti sā[K fol. 4r]nandam.
 sānandaṃ ca tat sallakṣaṇamaṇḍitāṅgaṃ ca⁴⁹ sambhujyamānaṃ dha-

rther conjunction. Likewise, the words *iti* and *saṃjñaka* together are redundant. In TV, the *zhes bya* following the phrase may either render *iti* or *saṃjñaka*—we find this rendering for the latter in the commentary on verse 9 for *mahāsukhasaṃjñaka*. We cannot fully discount that Vāgīśvarakīrti wrote the transmitted reading, nor can we give a clear explanation for the corruption, if it is one. Nonetheless, given that this appears to be genuine redundancy rather than simply a stylistic oddity, we provisionally conjecture a slightly smoother reading.

^{xix} Here *niṣyandaṃ* should be understood either as an accusative form (as it is in the verse) or (less likely) anomalously as a neuter noun.

^{xx} cf. *Abhidharmakośa* 2.57c: *niṣyando hetusadṛśaḥ*. Vāgīśvarakīrti perhaps also alludes to Dharmakīrti's definition of yogic perception in *Nyāyabindu* 11: *bhūtārthabhāvanāprakarṣaparyantaṃ yogijñānaṃ ceti*.

^{xxi} ISAACSON (personal communication) proposes *sākṣātkaraṇāvasthāyāṃ* or *sākṣātkṛtyāvasthāyāṃ* as potentially superior readings to the manuscript's *sākṣātkṛtāvatāsthāyāṃ* or the previous edition's *sākṣātkṛtāvasthāyāṃ*.

In support of the former, see Vāgīśvarakīrti's *Samkṣiptābhiṣekavidhi*: *tadanantaram ekatathatāmatena tayaiva bhinnamate tv ānaya svasaṃviditajñānasākṣātkaraṇāvasthāyāṃ pūrvoktagāthayā adhyeṣitavate śiṣyāya tatpāṇau tasyāḥ pāṇim pratisthāpya* | (p. 417)

⁴⁵ tad arthakāri] K E_{DH} TVA_D (de ni don mdzad pa'o); de ni de'i don mdzad pa'o TVB_G (tad tadarthakāri)

⁴⁶ sākṣātkaraṇāvasthāyāṃ] conj. (ISAACSON); sākṣātkṛtāvasthāyāṃ E_{DH}; sākṣātkṛtāvatāsthāyāṃ K

⁴⁷ abhāvāt] em. (ISAACSON); abhāvatvāt K E_{DH}

⁴⁸ balenātmānaṃ] K E_{DH}; stobs kyis bdag nyid TVA_D; stobs kyis byung ba TVB_G

⁴⁹ sallakṣaṇamaṇḍitāṅgaṃ ca] em. (ISAACSON); sallakṣaṇamaṇḍitāṅgaṃ K E_{DH}

rmadeśanādvāreṇopajīvyamānam.^{50,xxii} kaiḥ? daśabhūmīśvaraiḥ, pariśiṣṭabhūmisthitānām⁵¹ agocaratvāt. daśabhūmiprāptair avalokiteśvaramaṇjuśrīprabhṛtibhir upabhujyamānam iti yāvat. etad uktaṁ bhavati—śuddhāvāsopari ghanavyūhasaṁjñake⁵² samyaksambuddhabhuvane yathā bhagavān ānandarūpaḥ sambhogakāyātmā nirmāṇadvāreṇa⁵³ sakalajagadarthasaṁpādakāḥ śrāvakapratyekabuddhanavabhūmīśvarair apy adṛśyaśāriro daśabhūmīśvarair eva paraṁ bodhisattvair⁵⁴ dharmāśravaṇadvāreṇopabhujyamāna⁵⁵ āsaṁsāraṁ cakāsti, tathaiva tat sādhyam iti tṛtiyam.

5.4 pāramitānaye caturthaṁ sādhyam

sampūrya dānādiguṇān aśeṣān
sambuddhakṛtyaṁ⁵⁶ sakalaṁ ca kṛtvā |
yad bhūtakoteḥ karaṇaṁ ca sākṣāt
sādhyam tad apy asti nirodharūpam || 7 ||^{xxiii}

sampūryetyādi. dānādipāramitā eva guṇā, guṇyante^{xxiv} 'bhyasyanta iti kṛtvā. tān sampūrya paripūrṇān⁵⁷ kṛtvā, yat sambuddhānāṁ kṛtyaṁ

^{xxii} For *upajīvyamāna* we might expect *nye bar 'tsho ba* in Tibetan. Below *upabujyamāna* is translated as *longs spyod par bya ba* and then *nye bar longs spyod par bya ba*.

^{xxiii} This verse is in *Indravajrā* metre.

^{xxiv} In the *Dhātupāṭha*, the tenth class verbal root $\sqrt{\text{guṇa}}$ is said to express *āmantrāṇa*. Here, however, this is a denominative verb with the sense of *āmreḍaṇa* (multiplication/repetition) formed from the noun *guṇa*.

⁵⁰ °opajīvyamānam] K E_{DH}; nye bar longs spyod par gyur pa'o TV (°opabhujyamānam)

⁵¹ pariśiṣṭabhūmi°] *corr.*; pariśiṣṭa bhumi° E_{DH}

⁵² °saṁjñake] *em.*; °saṁjñako K; °saṁjñakāḥ E_{DH} (*em.*)

⁵³ nirmāṇadvāreṇa] K E_{DH}; sprul pa'i sku'i sgo nas TV (nirmāṇakāyadvāreṇa)

⁵⁴ paraṁ bodhisattvair] K E_{DH} (°sattvair); mchog tu gyur pa'i byang chub sems dpa' TV (paramabodhisattvair)

⁵⁵ °bhujyamāna] *em.*; °bhujyamānam K E_{DH}

⁵⁶ sambuddhakṛtyaṁ] *em.* (cf. TaRaA-V: sambuddhānāṁ ... avāśyakartavyaṁ kṛtsnaṁ); sambuddhya kṛtyaṁ K E_{DH}

⁵⁷ paripūrṇān] *em.*; paripūrṇaṁ K E_{DH}

sakalam^{58,xxv} avaśyakartavyaṃ kṛtsnaṃ tad api kṛtvā, bhūtakoteḥ śūnyatālakṣaṇāyāś cittacaittanīrodhātmikāyā⁵⁹ yat sāksāt karaṇaṃ tad api sādhyam astīti pāramitānayasthā evaṃ bruvate caturthaṃ sādhyam iti.

6 mantranaye saptavidhaṃ sādhyam

6.1 mantranaye prathamam sādhyam

idānīm mantranayopadiṣṭaṃ saptavidhaṃ⁶⁰ sādhyam kathayitum āha—svābhāṅganetyādi.

svābhāṅganāśleṣi⁶¹ janārthakāri⁶²
duḥkhaiḥ sukhaiś caiva vimuktirūpaṃ |
aśītyanuvyañjanabhūṣitāṅgaṃ
apetakalpaṃ pravādanti sādhyam || 8 ||^{xxvi}

svābhāṅganām⁶³ āśleṣitum śīlaṃ svabhāvo yasya tat svābhāṅganāśleṣi.⁶⁴ [E_{DH} p. 136] apetakalpaṃ vyapagatakalpaṃ, kalpanārahitam

^{xxv} The manuscript's reading of simply *sakalam* instead of *kṛtyaṃ sakalam* is asymmetrical given the following gloss, *avaśyakartavyaṃ kṛtsnaṃ*. Here TV reads simply *nges par mdzad par bya ba ma lus pa*, reflecting only the gloss and neither *sakalam* of the K nor the conjecture *kṛtyaṃ sakalam*. It is also possible that *sakalam* is a mistaken scribal addition, but it's also possible that even if the Tibetan translators saw *kṛtyaṃ sakalam*, they chose not to render this because of the superfluous sounding result in Tibetan. We believe the manuscript's transmitted reading is improbable.

^{xxvi} This verse is in Upajāti.

⁵⁸ *kṛtyaṃ sakalam*] *conj.*; *sakalam* K E_{DH}; *no reflex in TV*

⁵⁹ *cittacaitta°*] E_{DH} (*em.*); *cittacaitya°* K

⁶⁰ *saptavidhaṃ*] E_{DH} (TV *rnam pa bdun*); *caturthaṃ* K

⁶¹ *svābhāṅganāśleṣi*] E_{DH} (*corr.*); *svābhāṅgañāśleṣi* K

⁶² *janārthakāri*] *conj.* (TM_D 'gro ba yi don mdzad; TaRaA-V: jagadarthakāri); *ta..rthakāri* K (*akṣara uncertain, perhaps gna or mva*); *tadarthakāri* E_{DH}

⁶³ *svābhāṅganām*] E_{DH} (*corr.*); *svābhāṅganām* K

⁶⁴ *svābhāṅganāśleṣi*] *corr.*; *svābhāṅgañāśleṣi* K E_{DH}

iti yāvat. anyat subodham. ayam arthaḥ—samāliṅgitasvābhāṅganā-
śleṣi jagadarthakāri^{65,xxvii} dvātriṃśallakṣaṇavibhūṣitaśarīram⁶⁶ upe-
kṣārūpaṃ^{67,xxviii} prathamam sādhyam.

6.2 mantranaye dvitīyaṃ sādhyam

svadevatākāraviśeṣasūnyaṃ
prāḡ eva sambhāvya sukhaṃ sphuṭaṃ sat |
mahāsukhākhyam jagadarthakāri
cintāmaṇiprakhyam uvāca kaścit || 9 ||^{xxix}

svadevatetyādi. svadevatākāraviśeṣeṇa⁶⁸ sveṣṭadevatākāreṇa sūnyam,
nirākāram iti yāvat. prāḡ eva prathamataram⁶⁹ upadeśānantaram

^{xxvii} The compound °svābhāṅganāśleṣajagadarthakāri is strinckly speaking not i-
mpossible, and could perhaps be interpreted as an instrumental *tatpuruṣa*; howe-
ver, given that this is a prose explanation of the verse, there is no need for the
author to use such a compound and it seems more likely that the scribe left off
the *ikāra*.

^{xxviii} Something along the lines of *āsaṃsārasthāyi sākṣāt kriyata iti* may have dro-
pped out of the text here given TV, but there is no very compelling reason to think
that it did. The addition words certainly relevant, given that it is a pertinent fea-
ture of the first *sādhyā* that it remains active for as long as *saṃsāra* continues to
exist. We can be reasonably sure that TV reflects *āsaṃsārasthāyi* with 'khor ba ji
srid du bzhugs pa, as this is the Tibetan rendering of this word in the next section.

^{xxix} The metre of this verse is Viparītākhyānikī

⁶⁵ °svābhāṅganāśleṣi jagadarthakāri] *conj.* (TVB_G: nyid dang mtshungs pa'i lha
mos 'khyud pa can 'gro ba'i don mdzad pa); °svābhāṅganāśleṣajagadarthakāri K
E_{DH}; nyid dang mtshungs pa'i lha mos 'khyud pa can | 'gro ba ma lus pa'i don
mdzad pa TV_{AD} (°svābhāṅganāśleṣy aśeṣajagadarthakāri)

⁶⁶ śarīram] E_{DH}; śarīra K

⁶⁷ upekṣārūpaṃ] K E_{DH}; btang snyoms kyi ngo bo du 'khor ba ji srid du bzhugs
pa mngon du bya ba yin no zhe bya ba TV_{AD}; btang snyoms kyi ngo bo nyid du
'khor ba ji bzhugs pa mngon sum du bya ba yin zhes bya ba TVB_G (upekṣārūpaṃ
āsaṃsārasthāyi sākṣāt kriyata iti)

⁶⁸ svadevatā°] K TVB_G (rang lha'i); lha TV_{AD} (devatā°)

⁶⁹ prathamataram] K; prathamataro° E_{DH}

eva^{70,xxx} devatākāranirapekṣaṃ sukhaṃ sambhāvya, bhāvanayā sā-
kṣāt kṛtvā, sphuṭaṃ^{71,xxxi} sphu[K fol. 4v]ṭīkṛtaṃ san mahāsukha-
saṃjñakaṃ bhavati. tac ca jagadarthakāri cintāmaṇīsamānarūpaṃ.
etad uktaṃ bhavati—upadeśānantaram eva mantramudrādevatākā-
rarahitaṃ⁷² bhāvanayā sphuṭīkṛtaṃ mahāsukhasaṃjñakaṃ cintā-
maṇīvaj jagadarthakāri⁷³ māyopamam āsaṃsārasthāyi dvitīyaṃ sā-
dhyam.

6.3 mantranaye tṛtīyaṃ sādhyam

kṛtvā sāksāt svādhipaṃ [K fol. 1v] sātārūpaṃ
paścāt tyaktvā sātāmātraṃ phalaṃ syāt |
śuddhaṃ sāksāc chakyate naiva kartuṃ
tenākāro bhāvitaḥ svādhipasya || 10 ||^{xxxii}

kṛtvetyādi. svādhipaṃ sveṣṭadaivataṃ sāksāt kṛtvāmukhīkṛtya sātā-
rūpaṃ sukhaikasvabhāvam, paścād devatākāraṃ parityajya, sukha-
mātraṃ⁷⁴ phalaṃ sādhyam vyavasthitaṃ syāt.

nanu yadi⁷⁵ sāksāt kṛtvāpi devatākāras tyaktavyaḥ, tarhi pratha-
mam eva kasmād [E_{DH} p. 137] vibhāvitaḥ? sukhamātram eva dvi-

^{xxx} Normally *bshad ma thag pa* in Tibetan has the sense of *anantarokta*, but here the translator probably did intend it to render *upadeśānantaram eva* as we find the same rendering later in the paragraph.

^{xxxi} The understanding offered by TV, which reflects *asphuṭaṃ* instead of *sphuṭaṃ*, appears to indicate a misunderstanding on the translator's part, confusing the word division of *kṛtvā sphuṭaṃ*. It is not possible for *sphuṭīkṛtaṃ* to take an accusative object, nor is a form such as *sphuṭīkṛtya* possible without larger changes to the text.

^{xxxii} This verse is in Śālinī metre.

⁷⁰ upadeśānantaram eva] E_{DH} (*em.*); upadeśāntaram eva K; bshad ma thag pa'i TV

⁷¹ sphuṭaṃ] K; *deest* in E_{DH}; ma gsal ba TV

⁷² °rahitam] K E_{DH} TVB_G (spangs ste); spangs te | bde ba 'ba' zhiḡ tsam TVA_D (°rahitam sukhamātra°)

⁷³ jagadarthakāri] K E_{DH} TVB_G ('gro ba'i don mdzad pa); 'gro ba ma lus pa'i don mdzad pa TVA_D (sakalajagadarthakāri)

⁷⁴ sukhamātraṃ] *em.*; sukhamātra° K E_{DH}

⁷⁵ nanu yadi] *conj.*; nanu K E_{DH}; gal te TVA_D ([nanu] yadi); *no clear reflex* TVB_G

tīyasādhyavat kiṃ na vibhāvitam?⁷⁶ kiṃ vṛthāprayāsenety⁷⁷ āha—
śuddham ityādi. śuddham kevalam devatākāravirahitam sukhamā-
tram naiva sāksāt kartum śakyate, ākārahitasya sukhasyānupa-
lambhāt.⁷⁸ tasmāt tena kāraṇenākāro bhāvitaḥ svādhipasyeti tṛti-
yam.⁷⁹ ayam arthaḥ⁸⁰—devatākārasamvalitam eva sukham vibhāvya,
sākṣādbhūte devatākāram tyaktvā, sukhamātram eva sādhyam ukta-
guṇam.^{xxxiii}

6.4 mantranaye caturtham sādhyam

gagaṇasamaśarīram lakṣaṇair bhūṣitāṅgam
nirupamasukhapūrṇam⁸¹ svābhayā saṃgataṃ ca |
sphuradāmitamunīndraiḥ⁸² sarvasattvārthakāri
pravadati punar anyāḥ sādhyam ucchedaśūnyam || 11 ||^{xxxiv}

gagaṇetyādi. gagaṇasamaṃ māyopamaṃ vicārāsaham⁸³ śarīram ya-
sya. lakṣaṇair dvātriṃśadbhir⁸⁴ asītibhiś cānuvyañjanair maṇḍitāny
aṅgāni yasya. nirupamaiḥ sthaulya⁸⁵-nairantarya⁸⁶-āsamsārapravā-

^{xxxiii} Here TV reads *yon tan du 'chad do*, whereas K transmits the reading *uktagu-
ṇam*. It is difficult to say if the Tibetan rendering represents a different underlying
Sanskrit reading, but it does convey a different sense. Whereas the Tibetan seems
to say that the *sādhyā* 'is taught to be a good quality', the Sanskrit suggests the
meaning 'which has the previously mentioned qualities'.

^{xxxiv} This verse is in Mālinī metre.

⁷⁶ vibhāvitam] *em.*; vibhāvitaḥ E_{DH} (*em.*); vibhāgato K

⁷⁷ vṛthāprayāsenety] E_{DH}; vyathāprayāsenety K

⁷⁸ sukhasyā°] K E_{DH} TVB_G (bde ba); bde ba 'ba' zhiḡ TVA_D (kevalasukhasyā°)

⁷⁹ °eti tṛtīyam] *em.* TVB_G (zhes bya ba gsum pa yin no); °eti tṛtīyaḥ K E_{DH}; ste
bsgrub par bya ba gsum pa yin no TVA_D (tṛtīyam sādhyam)

⁸⁰ arthaḥ] E_{DH}; artha K

⁸¹ nirupama°] E_{DH}; nirūpama° K

⁸² °munīndraiḥ] *em.*; °munīndraḥ K E_{DH}

⁸³ māyopamaṃ vicārāsaham] K (*slightly unclrear*); māyopamavicārāsaha E_{DH}

⁸⁴ lakṣaṇair dvātriṃśadbhir] K E_{DH}; mtshan gyi ste | mtshan sum cu rtsa gnyis
TVA_D; mtshan gyis te | mtshan sum cu rtsa gnyis TVB_G (lakṣaṇair [iti] dvātriṃ-
śadbhir lakṣaṇair)

⁸⁵ sthaulya°] K E_{DH}; rgya nom pa nyid dang | rgya che ba nyid dang TVA_D (praṇi-
tatvasthaulya°); lhun che ba nyid dang | TVB_G (sthaulya°)

⁸⁶ °nairantarya°] E_{DH} (*em.*) (TV: bar med pa nyid dang); °nairuttarya° K

hitva⁸⁷-nirāsravatvādibhir upamābhāvād upamātikrāntaiḥ sukhaiḥ
pūrṇaṃ romāgraparyantaṃ^{88,xxxv} saṃpūrṇaṃ.^{xxxvi} svābhayā ca ta-
thābhūtayā saṃgatāṃ samāliṅgitāṃ. sphuradbhir⁸⁹ anantanirmitair
munīndrais tathābhūtair eva sarvasattvārthakāri.⁹⁰ ucchedeneti ni-
rodhena śūnyam tucchaṃ riktam.⁹¹

etad uktaṃ bhavati—gagana-māyā-marīci⁹²-gandharvanagara--
udakacandra-pratibimba-svapnopamam^{93,94} [K fol. 5r] ekānekabhā-
vābhāvagrāhyagrāhakasvabhāvarahitam anādyantam aśeṣavastusaṃ-
dohasvabhāvam^{95,xxxvii} anābhāsaṃ nirañjanaṃ sarvopamātikrāntaṃ

^{xxxv} This conjecture follows the Tibetan translation, with the reading in the K being difficult to account for. See, for instance, a similar expression in *Siddhaika-vīrasādhana* (author unknown): *tato niḥsṛtaraśmibhir ā pādatalād vālāgraparyā-ntaprāptaṃ bhāvyaṭe (Sāghanamālā no. 67, vol. 1, p. 67); de las byung ba'i 'od zer gyis rkang pa'i mthil nas skra'i rtse mo'i mthar thug pa khyab par bsgoms te (Tōh. 3461 fol. 116r). ADD REFERENCE*

^{xxxvi} TO CHECK: TVA_D appears to be defective here, with different readings in De-
rge Koyosan and Delhi. TVA_D: *ba spu'i rtse mo'i mthar thug par gyur pa'o || (gyur
pa'o ||)* Koyosan; *gyur ba'i Delhi [MW23703]*. TVB_G: *ba spu'i rtse mo'i mthar thug
par yang dag par gang bar gyur pa'o ||*

^{xxxvii} TV is perhaps ambiguous and may not reflect a different reading of the Sa-
nskrit if *thog ma dang tha ma med pa'i* is understood to qualify *rang bzhin* instead
of *ngos po*.

⁸⁷ °āsaṃsārapravāhitva°] *em.*; °āsaṃsāraṃpravāhitva° E_{DH} K

⁸⁸ pūrṇaṃ romāgraparyantaṃ] *conj.* (TV: gang ba ni | ba spu rtse mo'i mthar thug
pa); pūrṇaṃ masimāgrapayantaṃ K; pūrṇatāṃ samāśrayantaṃ E_{DH}

⁸⁹ sphuradbhir] K E_{DH}; 'phro bar gyur pa de yang TVA_D (sphuradbhir tair api)
(*other syntactic placement possible*); 'phro ba yang TVB_G (sphurdhair api)

⁹⁰ sarvasattvārtha°] K E_{DH} (TVB_G: sems can thams cad kyi don); sems can gyi don
TVA_D (sattvārtha°)

⁹¹ tucchaṃ riktam] K; bhūsthaṃ riktam E_{DH}; spangs pa'o TV (tucchaṃ / riktam)

⁹² māyāmarīci°] K E_{DH} (TVB_G: sgyu ma dang | smig rgyu dang ||); sgyu ma dang
| smig rgyu dang | smig rgyu dang | TVA_D (māyāmarīcīndrajāla° / māyendrajāla-
marīci°)

⁹³ °svapnopamam] E_{DH}; svapnāpayam K

⁹⁴ TVA_D adds an element to the list, perhaps *indrajāla* in Sanskrit. The reading has
the advantage of form a list of eight, but this precise list is otherwise unattested
as a list of eight illusions.

⁹⁵ anādyantam aśeṣavastusaṃdohasvabhāvam] K E_{DH}; *thog ma dang tha ma med
pa'i ngos po ma lus pa'i rang bzhin* TV (anādyantāśeṣavastusvabhāvam)

paramasūkṣmātigambhīraprajñārūpatayā dharmakāyasvabhāvam, dvā-
triṃśallakṣaṇavibhūṣitaśarīram aśītyanuvyañjanavirājitagātram⁹⁶ pa-
ramaśṛṅgarayauvanādyupetaṃ svābhāṅganāliṅgitāṅgaṃ rūpavajrā-
ditārāparyantadevīgaṇair anantaprabhedānimittarati⁹⁷ svarūpapara-
mānandopabhogadvāreṇa^{xxxviii} pratibimbavat [E_{DH} p. 138] sambhu-
jyamānaṃ karuṇāsaṃvalitodārarūpatayā sambhogakāyarūpam, nā-
nādhimuktivineyajanaparipācanārtham^{xxxix} anekaavidhaprātihāryadvā-
reṇa⁹⁸ nirmittānantakulāntarbhūtasambuddhabodhisattvaspharaṇa-

^{xxxviii} The compound beginning *anantaprabheda*° is challenging to unpack and not entirely secure in its reading. The K transmits the compound in a way that includes either the word *arati* or *ārati*, neither of which can reject *prima facie*. TVA_D suggests reading *rati*, while TVB_G has no reflex of the word but may be corrupt, given that it sounds rather incomplete. TVB_G is also missing a reflex of *bheda*, although it does have one of *pra* from *prabheda*, also indicating corruption. The term *aniittarati* or *mtshan ma med pa'i dga' ba* does occur in Jñānapāda's *Samantabhadrasādhana: animittarativiśuddheḥ samastadevīgaṇasvabhāvaṃ tat* | (122ab; reconstructed in *szantosarcone2023*); *mtshan ma med pa'i dga' ba rnam dag pa | ma lus lha mo'i tshogs kyi ngo bo nyid* || (Tōh. 1855 fol. 34r5; the translation in Tōh. 1856 by Smṛtijñānakīrti poses some problems and need not be dealt with here); 'Because of purification by signless pleasure, that [awareness] has as its nature the group of all goddesses.' This parallel does lend support to reading *animittarati*, but the context is technical and esoteric, so some caution is due.

As for the analysis of the compound, while various possibilities may be entertained, the main ambiguity is whether *anantaprabheda* qualifies *animittarati* or *paramānanda*. An analysis on the basis of the former could read: *anantāḥ prabhedāḥ yasya sānantaprabhedānimittaratiḥ, tatsvarūpasya paramānandasyopabhogaḥ, tad dvāreṇa*. Of the Tibetan translation, while TVA_D renders all words found in the Sanskrit text as constituted in some form, it is hard to interpret if one does not remove or modify various instrumental and genitive particles. From *rūpavajrā*° up to *sambhujyamānaṃ*, TVA_D reads: *gzugs rdo rje la sogs pa nas | sgrol ma'i mthar thug pa'i lha mo'i tshogs kyi mtshan ma med pa'i dga' ba'i rang gi ngo bo'i rab tu dbye ba dpag tu med pas mchog tu dga' ba la nye bar longs spyod pa'i sgo nas | gzugs brnyan dang 'dra bas yang dag par longs spyod pa*. TVB_G has the same readings, apart from the two suspected lacunae mentioned above.

^{xxxix} E_{DH} misreports K as reading *paripāvanārtha*.

⁹⁶ °gātram] K E_{DH}; no reflex in TV

⁹⁷ anantaprabhedānimittarati°] *conj.* (TVA_D: *mtshan ma med pa'i dga' ba'i rang gi ngo bo'i rab tu dbye ba dpag tu med pas*); *anantaprabhedānimittarati*° K E_{DH}; *mtshan ma med pa'i rang gi ngo bo'i rab tu dpag tu med pas* TVB_G

⁹⁸ anekaavidhaprātihārya°] K E_{DH}; *rdzu 'phrul dang cho 'phrul rnam pa du ma*

saṃhāarakāritvena⁹⁹ nirmāṇakāyātmakam, śūnyatākaraṇābhinnabodhicitta¹⁰⁰ svabhāvāmalaprajñopāyasamādhisambhūtasatsukhāpūrṇam^{x1} āsaṃsārasthitidharmaṃ¹⁰¹ apratiṣṭhitanirvāṇarūpaṃ nirmalanivātanīścalapradīpaśikhāprabandhanityatayā nirodhaśūnyaṃ caturthaṃ¹⁰² sādhyam.

6.5 mantranaye pañcamam sādhyam

kṛtvā sāksāt svādhipaṃ satarūpaṃ
tyaktvopekṣājñānamātraṃ¹⁰³ phalaṃ syāt |
āsaṃsārasthāyī sattvārthakārī
cintā¹⁰⁴ ratnaprakhyam¹⁰⁵ ekāntaśāntam || 12 ||

kṛtvetyādi. sāksāt svādhipaṃ kṛtvā, paścāt¹⁰⁶ tyaktvā, upekṣārūpaṃ yaj jñānaṃ tanmātraṃ^{xli} sādhyam syāt. anyat sugamam.¹⁰⁷ etad uktaṃ bhavati—maṇḍalacakrarūpaṃ sāksāt kṛtvā, paścāt tan nirodha, upekṣājñānamātraṃ sādhyam syāt pañcamam.

6.6 mantranaye ṣaṣṭhamam sādhyam

kṛtvā sāksān maṇḍalaṃ satarūpaṃ
paścāt tasya svecchayā nirvṛtiś¹⁰⁸ ca|

^{x1} See Sahajavilāsa, *Svādhiṣṭhānakurukullāsādhana* (SāMā no. 183, p. 383): *tataḥ prajñopāyāmalasamādhisambhūtasatsukhāpūrṇam iva svadehaṃ trailokya ca paśyet.*

^{xli} tanmātraṃ] check: in compound or not

TVA_D TVB_G (anekarddhiprātihārya°)

⁹⁹ °bodhisattva°] conj. (TVB_G: byang chub sems dpa'i); °bodhi° K E_{DH}; byang chub sems dpa' la sog pa'i TVA_D (°bodhisattvādi°)

¹⁰⁰ °bodhicitta°] E_{DH}; °bodhicittā° K

¹⁰¹ conj. (cf. Tib: chos can); dharmāṇām K E_{DH}

¹⁰² caturthaṃ] E_{DH}; caturtha K

¹⁰³ tyaktvopekṣā°] K (E_{DH} incorrectly reports as tyajyo°) (see commentary); bhāvopekṣā° E_{DH} (em.); no reflex in TM_D

¹⁰⁴ cintā°] K^{pc} E_{DH}; cittā° K^{ac}

¹⁰⁵ °prakhyam] E_{DH}; °prakhyam K

¹⁰⁶ paścāt] E_{DH}; paścāta K

¹⁰⁷ sugamam] E_{DH}; sūgamam K

¹⁰⁸ nirvṛtiś] K; nirvṛtim] E_{DH}

sattvārthasyāpy asty abhāvo na vāsmīn
prādurbhāvo nirvṛtād¹⁰⁹ asti yasmāt || 13 ||

kṛtvetyādi. kṛtvā sāksān maṇḍalam sātasaṃvalitam,¹¹⁰ tasya svecchayā
nirvṛtir nirodhaḥ.

nanu yadi sāksāt kṛtvāpi paścāt svecchayā nirodhayita[K fol. 5v]vyam,¹¹¹
tadā karuṇāyā anekakālābhyastāyā abhāvaḥ syāt. tasyās cābhāvāt
sattvārthābhāvaḥ [E_{DH} p. 139] syād ity āśaṅkyāha—sattvārthasyāpy
asty abhāvo na vetyādi. asmin pakṣe sattvārthābhāvo nāsti, yasmān
nirvṛtāc cakrāt karuṇāsaṃvalitāt sattvārthasya prādurbhāvo 'sti.^{xlii}

etenaitad evāha—sātasaṃpūrṇacakraṃ sāksāt kṛtvā, yāvad iṣṭam
kālam vyavasthāpya, paścāt tasya sarvathaiva pradipavan nirodham
kṛtvā sthātavyam. yadā punaḥ sattvārthābhilāṣo bhavati, tadā niru-
ddhād eva cakrāntaram utpādyā sattvārthaḥ kartavyaḥ. cakrāntaro-
tpāde¹¹² 'pi ciraniruddhād¹¹³ eva cakrād yathābhavyatayā¹¹⁴ vineyā-
nām yathābhilaṣitaḥ prāptir bhavatīti ṣaṣṭham.

6.7 mantranaye saptamaṃ sādhyam

kṛtvā sphuṭam rūpam abhīṣṭam eṣāṃ
paścān nirodhaḥ^{115,xliii} phalam āha kaścit |
abhinnarūpaś ca yato nirodho
na pakṣabhede 'pi tato 'sti bhedaḥ || 14 ||

^{xlii} TV suggests reading *karuṇāsaṃvalitasya*: 'gags pa'i 'khor lo las snying rje'i
rang bzhin can sems can gyi don ('gags pa'i] TVB_G; 'gog pa'i] TVA_D)

^{xliii} It is possible to take *phala* as the direct object of *√ah* and then read *nirodham*,
construing it as an accusative form; however, the agent of *√kr* and *√ah* would
have to be the same. Rather, with the reading *nirodhaḥ phalam*, we can avoid this
problem and simply supply an *iti*.

¹⁰⁹ nirvṛtād] E_{DH}; nivṛtād K

¹¹⁰ sātasaṃvalitam] *em.* (TV: bde ba'i rang bzhin can); sātam saṃvalitam K E_{DH}

¹¹¹ nirodhayitavyam] *em.*; nirodhayitavyaḥ K E_{DH}

¹¹² cakrāntarotpāde] E_{DH}; cakrāntaropāde K

¹¹³ ciraniruddhād] *em.* (TV: rin du 'gags pa'i); citaniruddhād K; cittaniruddhād E_{DH}

¹¹⁴ yathābhavyatayā] *variant word division in* E_{DH}: yathā bhavyatayā

¹¹⁵ nirodhaḥ] *em.*; nirodha(m) K (*this may be corrected to h*); nirodham E_{DH}

kṛtvetyādi. ṣaṇṇāṃ pakṣāṇāṃ anyatamasya phalasya¹¹⁶ sādhyatvād yad yad evābhiṣṭaṃ¹¹⁷ tad¹¹⁸ eva sāksāt kṛtvā, paścāt sarvathaiva pradīpavan nirodha uttarakālaṃ sattvārthādisūnyaḥ sāksāt kartavyaḥ.

nanu ṣaṭpakṣabhedena ṣaḍ eva¹¹⁹ nirodhāḥ syuḥ. tat katham eka eva nirodha ity āśaṅkyāha—abhinnetyādi. abhinnaṃ¹²⁰ rūpaṃ ya-sya sa tathā.¹²¹ na hi nirodhānāṃ ṣaṭpakṣalakṣaṇabhede 'pi bhedo 'sti, abhāvaikarūpatayā nirodhasya samānatvāt. ayam arthaḥ—anyatamapakṣaṃ sāksāt kṛtvā paścāt tasya santānocchedarūpo nirodha iti saptamaṃ sādhyam.

7 caturthe 'bhiṣekase vipratipattiḥ

7.1 caturthaseke vipratipattiḥ prathamā

prajñājñānād uttaraṃ bodhicittā-
svādas turyaṃ sekam¹²² āhāvaram tat |
yasmāt¹²³ sarvo bhāvanāsu prayāso
vyarthaḥ prāptas tatphalasya prasiddheḥ || 15 ||

[E_{DH} p. 140] prajñājñānetyādi. prajñājñānopadeśād uttarakālaṃ¹²⁴ yat bodhicittasyāmṛtarūpasya¹²⁵ rasanayā grahaṇam, tat turyaṃ ca-

¹¹⁶ anyatamasya phalasya] *conj.*; arthaphalasya K E_{DH}; nang nas 'bras bu TV

¹¹⁷ phalasya sādhyatvād yad yad evābhiṣṭaṃ] K E_{DH}; 'bras bu bsgrub bya gang kho na TV_{AD} (phalaṃ yad eva); bsgrub bya gang kho na mngon par 'dod pa TV_{BG} (phalaṃ yad evābhiṣṭaṃ);

¹¹⁸ tad] E_{DH}; sad K

¹¹⁹ ṣaḍ eva] E_{DH}; ṣatreva K

¹²⁰ abhinnaṃ] E_{DH}; abhinna K

¹²¹ sa tathā] *em.*; tat tathā K E_{DH}

¹²² sekam] E_{DH}; seṣam K

¹²³ yasmāt] E_{DH}; paścāt K

¹²⁴ prajñājñānopadeśād uttarakālaṃ] K E_{DH}; shes rab dang ye shes ni shes rab ye shes te | dbang bskur ba'i bye brag go || phyis ni 'das pa'i 'og tu'o || gang zhe na | TV_{AD} (prajñājñānetyādi. prajñā ca jñānaṃ prajñājñānaṃ sekaviśeṣaḥ. uttaram paścāt. kim iti); shes rab dang ye shes te | dbang bskur ba'i bye brag go || phyis te rdzogs pa'i dus kyi byang chub gang zhe na | TV_{BG} (*text may have suffered from corruption after phyis*)

¹²⁵ bodhicittasyāmṛtarūpasya] *em.* (TV_{AD}: byang chub kyi sems te); sam bodhicittasyāmṛtarūpasya K E_{DH}; sems te TV_{BG} (cittasya)

turthaṃ [K fol. 6r] sekam āha kaścīt. tac cāvaram hīnam, vinikṛṣṭam iti yāvat. kasmād avaram? yasmāt sarvaprayāso mantramudrādevatādyākārabhāvanāsu punaḥ punar anuṣṭhānalakṣaṇas tathāgato-
kto¹²⁶ vyarthaḥ prāptaḥ.^{xliv} kutaḥ? tatphalasya bhāvanāsādhyasya phalasya bodhicittāsvādakāla eva prasiddhatvāt prāptatvāt, anyasya viśiṣṭasya phalasyābhāvād iti yāvat.

7.2 caturthaseke vipratipattir dvitīyā

prajñājñānād uttaram prāptarāmā-
svādas turyaṃ sekam āhādhamam tat |
yasmāt sarvo bhāvanādao prayatno
buddhoddīṣṭo niṣphalaḥ saṃprasaktaḥ || 16 ||

prajñetyādi. prajñājñānād uttarakālaṃ yāḥ prāptā yathāmilitā rāmāḥ striyas tāsāṃ samāpattidvāreṇa¹²⁷ ya āsvādaḥ, tat turyaṃ sekam. tad apy adhamam. śeṣaṃ gatārtham.

7.3 āgamasya arthavyākhyānam

atha caturthaṃ tat punas tatheti^{128,xlv} vyākhyāyate. caturthaṃ iti¹²⁹ prajñājñānaṃ tṛtīyam apekṣya caturthaṃ ity ucyate. tad iti tacchabdena tad eva prajñājñānaṃ tadrūpaṃ parāmṛśyate. punar iti punaḥśabdena tasmād viśeṣaḥ. viśeṣaś cātra nirāsravaniruttarātyanta-

^{xliv} TV reflects understanding two items that would be *vyartha*, perhaps suggesting another reading of the Sanskrit text: *gang gi phyir sngags dang phyag rgya dang | lha nyid la sogs pa'i rnam pa bsgom pa la yang dang yang du 'bad pa dang | gzhan yang de bzhi gshegs pas gsungs pa'i sgrub pa'i mtshan nyid don med pa thob par 'gyur ro* || 'Because it would follow that repeated effort in meditation ... and, what's more (gzhan yang; Skt. *ca?*), what is characterised as practice taught by the *tathāgatas*'.

^{xlv} *Samājottara* 112c

¹²⁶ tathāgatokto] K; tathāgatoktau E_{DH}

¹²⁷ samāpattidvāreṇa] E_{DH}; rig pa'i sgo nas TV_A_D; reg pa'i sgo nas TV_B_G (sparṣa-dvāreṇa)

¹²⁸ punas tatheti] E_{DH} (*em.*); punar iti K

¹²⁹ caturthaṃ iti] K E_{DH} TV_A_D (bzhi pa ni); deest in TV_B_G

sphītāvicchinnaprabandha¹³⁰ pravāhitvalakṣaṇaḥ.¹³¹ tatheti tathāśa-
bdena tādṛśatvam abhidhiyate. tādṛśatvaṃ ca yādṛśyā prajñādiyu-
ktayā¹³² sāmagryā yādṛśaṃ prajñājñānam utpannam, paścād api tā-
dṛśyaiva sāmagryā tathaiva cotpadyate, nānyatheti tathāśabdārthaḥ.

atra ca lakṣyalakṣaṇabhāvenārtho boddhavyaḥ. lakṣyate 'neneti
lakṣaṇam anubhūyamānaṃ prajñājñānam, apratīyamānasya lakṣa-
ṇatvāyogāt, nāgrhītaviśeṣaṇā [E_{DH} p. 141]viśeṣyabuddhir iti nyāyāt.
lakṣyate jñāyate pratipādyate 'neneti lakṣyaṃ sākṣāt kariṣyamānaṃ
caturtham.

7.4 caruthaseke vipratipattis tṛtīyā

atra caturtham nāstīty eke.^{xlvi} nanu caturtham ity etad asti tatpa-
dam.¹³³ tat katham nāstīty ucyate? satyam, upadeśasamrakṣārtham
sattvavyāmohanāya ca tṛtīyam eva caturthaśabde [K fol. 6v]noktaṃ
bhagavatā. anyathā tat punar iti noktaṃ syāt.^{xlvi}

tad atyantāsaṃgatam, caturthasya pramāṇasiddhasya pratipādi-
tatvāt pratipādayiṣyamānatvāc ceti.^{xlvi}

^{xlvi} TVA_D adds near the beginning of this sentence *Samājottara* 112ab *abhiṣekaṃ tridhā bhedam asmin tantre prakalpitaṃ* |: 'dir 'ga' zhig | dbang ni mnam pa gsum dag tu | rgyud 'di las ni rab tu grags || zhes gsungs pas na | bzhi pa ni yang dag pa ma yin no zhe na |

^{xlvi} A portion seems to have dropped out from TVA_D.

^{xlvi} Tib. discusses two further *pakṣas* here: that the fourth referred to in the *Samājottara* is the four *aṅga* of *sevā* and so forth; and what appears to be the idea

¹³⁰ °niruttarātyantasphītāvicchinnaprabandha°] K; shin tu rgyas pa nyid rgyun mi chad par TVB_G (°ātyantasphītāvichinnaprabandha°); nirantarātyantasphītāvicchinnaprabandha° E_{DH} (*em.*); shin tu rgyas pa nyid dang | bar chad med pa nyid dang | rgyun mi 'chad par TVA_D (°ātyantasphītanirantarāvicchinnaprabandha°)

¹³¹ °lakṣaṇaḥ] E_{DH}; °lakṣaṇam K

¹³² °yuktayā] *conj.* (TV: dang ldan pa'i); °yuktyā K E_{DH}

¹³³ nanu caturtham ity etad asti tatpadam] K (nanu caturtham ity etad asti | tat padan) E_{DH}; de ltar de bzhi bzhi pa yang || zhes bya ba'i tshig bcom ldan 'das kyis gsungs pa yod pa ma yin nam | TVA_D (caturtham tat punas tatheti padaṃ bhagavatā notkaṃ vā); de lta na de ma yin pa gzhan de ltar de bzhi bzhi pa yang zhes bya ba der bzhi pa zhes bya ba'i tshig bcom ldan 'das kyis gsungs pa yod pa ma yin nam | TVB_G (nanu yadi evaṃ na syāt, tadā caturtham tat punas tatheti padaṃ bhagavatā noktaṃ vā)

7.5 lakṣyasya vicāraṇam

atra lakṣaṇam prajñājñānaṁ pratītam eva sarvaih. lakṣye¹³⁴ paraṁ vyāmohaḥ. tad vicāryate. lakṣyaṁ hi bhaved¹³⁵ artharūpaṁ vā syāt jñānarūpaṁ vā. na tāvad artharūpaṁ, arthasyaikasyābhāvāt, ekāne-kaviyogitvena pramāṇena tasya nirākṛtatvāt. mantranaye ca vijñānavādamadhyamakamatayor¹³⁶ eva pradhānatvād jñānarūpaṁ vā syāt. jñānaṁ ca sākāraṁ vā nirākāraṁ vā. sākāraṁ api citrādvaitarūpaṁ vā syād anekarūpaṁ vā syād iti vikalpāḥ.

7.5.1 sākārasya vijñānasya nirākaraṇam

tatra sākāravijñānaṁ sarvathaiva gagaṇakamalavan nāstīti nirākāravādinō bruvate. nanu nilapītaśuklādighaṭapaṭaśakaṭādi¹³⁷ rūpeṇākārāḥ¹³⁸ pratibhāsante¹³⁹ pratyakṣataḥ.^{xlix} te cārthasyābhāvād jñānarūpā eva. tat katham sākāraṁ nāstīti?^l satyam. pratibhāsanta evākārāḥ, param alikarūpeṇa. alikarūpatā caikānekaviyogitvena¹⁴⁰ pramāṇalakṣaṇena¹⁴¹ prasiddhā. tasya ca pramāṇasvarūpasyānyatra¹⁴² kathitātvaṁ neha¹⁴³ pratanyate. alikatvaprasiddhā ca māyāmayā ivākārā bhrāntirūpāḥ

that the four initiation consists in the third accompanied by its fruits ('*bras bu dang bcas pa*).

^{xlix} TV phrases this sentence as a rhetorical question, as if the Sanskrit started *kiṁ na*

^l TV_D's expression of the argument runs differently: *don (rnam pa) de dag kyang med pa'i phyir shes pa'i ngo bo nyid kyang med yin na | de ji ltar rnam pa dang bcas pa ma yin zhe na* | 'Because those objects [i.e., *ākāras*] also do not exist, the nature of cognition too cannot exist. So how can cognition not have *ākāras*?'

¹³⁴ lakṣye] E_{DH} (*em.*); lakṣyā K

¹³⁵ lakṣyaṁ hi bhavet] *conj.*(TV: mtshon par bya ba yang srid na); lakṣyaṁ hi bhagavat K E_{DH} ('gavad)

¹³⁶ matayor] E_{DH}; tamayor K

¹³⁷ °śakaṭādi°] E_{DH} (*em.*); °prakaṭādi° K

¹³⁸ °ākārāḥ] *conj.*; ((cā))kārāḥ] K; vākārāḥ E_{DH}

¹³⁹ pratibhāsante] E_{DH}; pratibhāsante K

¹⁴⁰ °viyogitvena] *conj.* °viyogitva° K E_{DH}

¹⁴¹ °pramāṇalakṣaṇena] K E_{DH} (TVB_G: tshad ma'i mtshan nyid kyis); mtshan nyid kyis TVB_G ('lakṣaṇena)

¹⁴² pramāṇasvarūpasyā°] E_{DH}; pramāṇa(((pe)))rūpasyā° K

¹⁴³ neha] E_{DH}; eha K

prakāśante.¹⁴⁴ bhrāntinivṛttau ca nirākāram eva¹⁴⁵ śuddhasphaṭika-
saṃkāśaṃ pāramārthikaṃ¹⁴⁶ siddhaṃ bhavati.¹⁴⁷ ataś citrādvaitarū-
pam anekarūpam ca sākāram vijñānam astīti vikalpadvayaṃ nira-
staṃ bhavatīti.

7.5.2 nirākārasya vijñānasya samarthanam

nanu nirākāram api vijñānam upalabdihlakṣaṇaprāptaṃ svapne 'pi
nopalabhyate. tat kathaṃ tad asti paramārthata¹⁴⁸ i[K fol. 7r]ty u-
cyate? ucyate. sukhākāram vijñānam antaḥparisphuradrūpaṃ nirā-
kāram saṃvedyata eva. nīlādyākārāḥ punar alikāḥ pratibhāsante. a-
nyathā teṣāṃ satyatve sarva evākārāḥ satyāḥ syuḥ. tathā hi grāhya-
grāhakabhāvādikam api satyaṃ [E_{DH} p. 142] syāt. tataś ca sarveṣāṃ
eva satyapratibhāsatvena muktiprasaṅgaḥ,¹⁴⁹ keṣāñcid api mithyā-
pratibhāsasya bhrāntirūpasyāpratibhāsanāt. tathā coktam—

draṣṭavyaṃ¹⁵⁰ bhūtato bhūtaṃ bhūtadarśi vimucyate |^{li}

tasmād akāmakenāpi nīlādyākārāṇāṃ alikatvam evaiṣṭavyam. su-
khādikam nirākāram¹⁵¹ satyam upalabhyate. tat kathaṃ nopalabhyata
iti.

nanu sukhādyākāram sākāram eva vijñānam¹⁵² upalabhyate, su-
khāder ākārasvabhāvatvāt. na ca sukhādyākāraśūnyaṃ jñānam sva-
pne 'pi saṃvedyate. sakalabhrāntivigamād aṣṭamyām bhūmāv upa-

^{li} *Abhisamayālaṅkāra* 5.21; *Ratnagotravaiśvāsa* 154; *Pratītyasamutpādhādayakā-
rikā* 7; etc.

¹⁴⁴ prakāśante] K (prakāśante); prakāśyante E_{DH}

¹⁴⁵ nirākāram eva] K E_{DH} TVB_G (rnam pa med pa kho na); rnam pa med pa de
kho na TVB_G (nirākāram eva tad)

¹⁴⁶ pāramārthikaṃ] E_{DH} (em.); pārarthikaṃ K

¹⁴⁷ bhavati] K; bhavatīti E_{DH}

¹⁴⁸ paramārthata] em.; paramārtham K E_{DH}

¹⁴⁹ muktiprasaṅgaḥ] conj.; yuktiprasaṅgāt K; muktiprasaṅgāt E_{DH} (em.)

¹⁵⁰ draṣṭavyaṃ] E_{DH}; draṣṭavya K

¹⁵¹ nirākāram] K E_{DH}; rnam pa brdzun pa TV (alīkākāram)

¹⁵² sākāram eva vijñānam] conj.(TV: rnam pa dang bcas pa'i kho na shes pa); eva
vijñānam K E_{DH}

labdhilakṣaṇaprāptir bhavatīty atrāpi kośapānaṃ¹⁵³ vinā anyan na¹⁵⁴
 pramāṇaṃ asti prasādhakam iti. tad asat,¹⁵⁵ abhiprāyāparijñānāt, su-
 khādyākārasyaiva nīlādyākārarahitasya vijñānasya nirākāratvene-
 ṣṭatvāt. tac cedānīm eva svasaṃvedanapramāṇasiddhaṃ sakalapra-
 ṇabhṛtam¹⁵⁶ astīti kathaṃ nopalabdhiḥ?

7.5.3 Establishing the Madhyamaka position

nanu tad¹⁵⁷ apy ekānekasvabhāvaviyogād alikam eva bhrāntimātram,
 ekānekasvabhāvarahitasya sākāranirākāravijñānavyāpitvāt.

nanv anena nyāyena sakalasākāranirākāravijñānasyālikatvapra-
 sādhanān na kiñcid api pāramārthikaṃ vastutattvam asti.¹⁵⁸ tat ka-
 thaṃ lakṣyasya svarūpaṃ pramāṇata upalakṣayitavyam? naiṣa do-
 ṣaḥ, madhyamakamate pramāṇato 'likatāsiddhāv api māyopamapra-
 tibhāsamātrasyaikānekasvabhāvarahitasya dharmirūpasyāpratīṣedhāt.
 tatraiva cālike pratibhāsamātre lakṣyalakṣaṇasaṃsāranirvāṇa[K fol.
 7v]maṇḍalacakrādibhāvanāsakalajagadarthakriyādīnām¹⁵⁹ avyāhatā
 vyavasthā¹⁶⁰ sidhyati.^{161,lii} tathā coktam—

buddhatvaṃ vajrasattvatvaṃ saṃvṛtyaiva prasādhayet

liii

lii E_{DH} appears to understand the text as saying that both *bhāvanā* and *jagadartha-
 kriyādīnām vyavasthā* are established. TV suggests that it is *bhāvanā* which is the
 instrument by which the *vyāvasthā* is established. The manuscript reading sugge-
 sts taking °*bhāvanā* in compound with the following word—i.e., in the Madhya-
 maka system, although mere appearance is false, the framework of everything
 starting with *lakṣyalakṣaṇa* is established.

liii *Kurukullākālpa* 3.16cd

¹⁵³ kośapānaṃ] K (kosapānaṃ); śapathollaṅghanaṃ E_{DH} (em.)

¹⁵⁴ anyan na] E_{DH}; anyatra K

¹⁵⁵ tad asat] conj. (TV: de ni bden pa ma yin te); tad K E_{DH}; asat etat possible conj.

¹⁵⁶ °bhṛtam] em.; °bhṛtām K E_{DH}

¹⁵⁷ nanu tad K E_{DH}; tat possible conj.

¹⁵⁸ asti] conj.; astīti K E_{DH} (astīti?) (iti has no reflex in TV)

¹⁵⁹ °bhāvanā] K; °bhāvanā E_{DH} (variant word division); bsgoms pas TV (bhāva-
 nayā)

¹⁶⁰ vyavasthā] K; vyavasthā ca E_{DH} (em.)

¹⁶¹ sidhyati] conj.; sidhyatīti K E_{DH} (no reflex of iti in TV)

iti.¹⁶²

nanu sarvam eva vastujātam alīkarūpatayā niḥsāram. tadā kimarthaṃ maṇḍalacakrādibhāvanāprayāsaḥ¹⁶³ kriyate? asad etat,

mithyādhyāropahānārthaṃ¹⁶⁴ yatno 'saty api¹⁶⁵ [E_{DH} p. 143] bhoktari^{166, liv}

iti vacanāt. yady api vicāryamāṇaṃ pāramārthikaṃ vasturūpaṃ nāsti, tathāpy ahaṃ sukhī bhaveyaṃ mā¹⁶⁷ duḥkhy abhūvam iti tṛṣṇā sakalapraṇabhṛtām asti. yathā tulye 'pi mithyātve śubhāśubhasvapnayoh śubhasvapnadarśanāt saumanasyam aśubhasvapnadarśanāc ca daurmanasyam, tadapanayanāya ca saddharmapāṭhamantrajāpādau pravṛttir bhavati, tathā mithyātvāviśeṣe 'pi duḥkhādiprākṛtavikalpahānāya^{lv} samyaksambodhilakṣaṇaprāptaye¹⁶⁸ ca prekṣāvatām arthināṃ pravṛttir bhaviṣyatīti.

8 saptavidheṣu sādhyeṣu sārāsāravicāraṇam

nanu yadarthas tavāyam^{169, lvi} ārambhaḥ so 'rthaḥ pralayaṃ gataḥ. tathā hi lakṣyalakṣaṇacintātra prastutā. sā ca vismr̥tā, kva gateti na jñāyate.

^{liv} *Pramāṇavārttika*, Pramāṇasiddhi 193cd.

^{lv} cf. *Samantabhadrasādhana* (as quoted in Kamalanātha's *Ratnāvalī* ad HeTa 2.2.45, fol. 16r6): prākṛtavikalpavṛttair aparaṃ na hi kiñcad asti bhavaduḥkham | tasya viruddhaṃ caitat sāksādavagamyate cetatḥ ||

^{lvi} The manuscript's reading *yadarthasvā'yam* seems like a plausible corruption of *yadarthas tavā'yam*, but Tibetan shows no reflex of *tava*. TVA_D reads: *rtsom pa 'di'i don gang yin pa*. TVB_G reads: *gal te gang gi don du (bzhi pa bshad pa'i bshad pa'i dus) 'di brtsams pa'i*.

¹⁶² iti] E_{DH}; deest in K

¹⁶³ maṇḍala°] E_{DH}; bri ba'i 'dkyil 'khor (lekhyamaṇḍala°)

¹⁶⁴ mithyādhyāropahānārthaṃ] *em.*; mithyādhyāropaṇārthaṃ K E_{DH}

¹⁶⁵ 'saty api] K; 'styopi E_{DH}

¹⁶⁶ bhoktari] K (bhoktari°) (*the letter no is added abhove bho*); muktaye E_{DH} (*em.*)

¹⁶⁷ mā] E_{DH} (*em.*); deest in K

¹⁶⁸ lakṣaṇaprāptaye] K E_{DH}; mtshan nyid kyi 'bras bu thob par bya ba'i phyir TVA_D (lakṣaṇaphalaprāptaye); mtshan nyid 'bras bu thob par bya ba'i phyir TVB_G (lakṣaṇaphalaprāptaye)

¹⁶⁹ yadarthas tavāyam] *conj.*; yadarthasvā'yam K; yadarthatvād ayaṃ E_{DH}

na tu¹⁷⁰ kṛtaiva sā saptabhir bhedaḥ?
 satyam, kintu guḍagorasanyāyena. tathā hi na jñāyate, kiṃ tat
 sāraṃ asāraṃ veti.
 ucyate.

8.1 prathamasyāsāratvam

mantranayavihitakramābhāvāt samāpattibhāvanāvaiyarthya¹⁷¹ yu-
 ktyabhāvāc¹⁷² ca prathamasya niḥsāratā. tathā hi samagrasāmagrī-
 kaṃ yat phalaṃ¹⁷³ tad avaśyam eva bhavati. anyathā samagrasāma-
 grikaṃ eva tan na bhavet. sāṅskārikāṇāvasthāyāṃ samagrasāma-
 grikaṃ tad vartate. tad avaśyaṃ tena¹⁷⁴ bhavitavyam. sati ca bha-
 vati^{175,lvii} prathamasya hānir iti.

8.2 dvitīyasya asāratvam

śarīrādyākāraśūnyasya kevalasātarūpasyānupalabdher¹⁷⁶ na dvitīya-
 sya sāratā. tathā hi pramāṇaniścitaṃ prekṣāvata bhāvanīyam, na ya-
 thākathañcit. pramā[K fol. 8r]ṇena samvalitarūpam eva sarvadopa-
 labhyate.^{lviii} tad eva sarvajanānāṃ kamanīyatayā pratibhāsate. ta-
 smāt kevalasya rucyabhāvāc cakrākārasaṃvalitasyopalabdheḥ sā-
 kṣāt kartum aśakyatvāc^{177,lix} ca dvitīyasya kalpanāmātrateti.¹⁷⁸

^{lvii} TV could be rendered as something like *evaṃsati ca prathamasya hānir iti*.
 Indeed this seems to be the sense, but the manuscript reading of *bhavane na* or
bhavanena is hard to account for.

^{lviii} TVAD lacks a reflex of *sarvadā*, whereas TVBG lacks a reflex of *eva*.

^{lix} TV suggests reading: *kevalasyānupalabdheḥ rucyabhāvāc cakrākārasaṃvalita-*

¹⁷⁰ na tu] *conj.*; nanu K EDH

¹⁷¹ samāpatti°] K EDH TVBG (snyom par 'jug pa); lha'i rnal 'byor gyi snyoms par
 'jug pa'i TVAD (devatāyogasamāpatti°)

¹⁷² yuktyabhāvāc] EDH; yuktābhāvāc K

¹⁷³ yat phalaṃ] *conj.* (TV: 'bras bu gang yin pa); yat KE DH

¹⁷⁴ tena K EDH TVBG (de); de'i 'bras bu TVAD (tena phalena)

¹⁷⁵ *conj.*; bhavane na K EDH; de ltar gyur pas dang po nyams pa yin no TVAD; de
 ltar gyur pa dang po nyams pa yin no TVBG (evaṃsati)

¹⁷⁶ °labdher] EDH; °bdher K

¹⁷⁷ aśakyatvāc] EDH (*em.*); aśakyatāc K

¹⁷⁸ kalpanāmātrateti] EDH (*em.*); kalpanātrateti K

8.3 tṛtīyasya asāratvam

nirupadravabhūtārthasvabhāvatvena sātmbhūtasya tyaktum aśakyatvāt, saṃvalitarūpasya [E_{DH} p. 144] bhedābhāvāt, prayojanābhāvāc ca na tṛtīyasya¹⁷⁹ kalyāṇabhāvaḥ.¹⁸⁰ tathā hi sahopalambhena¹⁸¹ tā-dātmyasiddhāv ekasya parityāge 'parasyāvaśyaṃ parityāgo na vā kasyacid iti.

8.4 caturthasya sārāsāratvavicāraṇam

prapañcatvena bahuprayāsatvād vicārāsahatvena bhrāntirūpatayā-paramārtharūpatayā ca na tṛtīyāntapakṣasya¹⁸² kalyāṇateti.¹⁸³ atra kecid yuktiṃ varṇayanti.^{lx} prapañcarūpatvābhāve¹⁸⁴ 'pi sūkṣmasya bindvādeḥ punaḥ punar bhāvanayā sāksātkaraṇaṃ yāvat prayāsa-tāvat sarvatraiva bhāvyaavastuni sambhavati. tad atra yadi prayāsa-bhayam, na kiñcid api bhāvanīyam.

prapañcarūpatvād iti cet, prapañcāprapañcayor bhāvanāvasthā-yāṃ ko viśeṣaḥ¹⁸⁵? nanu¹⁸⁶ aprapañcaṃ śīghram eva sthiribhavatīty

syānupalabdheḥ sāksātkartum aśakyatvāc ca. The addition of *anupalabdheḥ* after *kevalasya* renders the flow of argument's logic less smooth. The addition of the same word after *cakrākārasaṃvalitasya* does not change the argument in its overall sense. Note that the Tibetan 'khor lo'i rang bzhin could instead imply the reading *cakrasvabhāva* or something similar, but it may simply be a free rendering of *cakrākārasaṃvalita*.

TV also adds the reason 'bad pa mtshung pa'i phyir ('because the effort is equal'). The purport of this is unclear.

^{lx} TVA_D renders this sentence differently: *de la 'ga' zhig las rigs pa cung zhig cig brjod par mi bya ste* |

¹⁷⁹ tṛtīyasya] conj.; tṛtīya K; tṛtīyaḥ E_{DH}

¹⁸⁰] conj. (Tib: dge ba [ma] yin); kalyāṇabhāvaḥ K^{pc}; kalyāṇabhāvaḥ K^{ac}; dge ba ma yin [na] kalyāṇabhāvaḥ

¹⁸¹ sahopalambhena] E_{DH}; saholambhena K

¹⁸² tṛtīyāntapakṣasya] em. (TVA_D: gsum pa'i tha' ma'i phyogs TVA_D; TVB_G: gsum pa'i mtha' ma'i phyogs); tṛtīyāntaḥ | pakṣasya K; tṛtīyapakṣasya E_{DH}

¹⁸³ kalyāṇateti] E_{DH}; kalyāṇateti K

¹⁸⁴ prapañcarūpatvābhāve] K E_{DH}; spros pa'i ngo bo nyid du gyur TV

¹⁸⁵ viśeṣaḥ] conj.; viśeṣa iti cet K E_{DH}

¹⁸⁶ nanu] conj. (TV: 'on te); deest in K and E_{DH}

ayaṃ viśeṣaḥ. yatraivālabane¹⁸⁷ cittam punaḥ punaḥ preryate ni-
rantaram¹⁸⁸ dīrghakālam ca tatraiva sthīrībhavatīty āgamaḥ. yuktis
cātrāsti. tathā cōktam—

tasmād bhūtam abhūtam vā yad yad evābhibhāvyaṭe |
bhāvanābalaniṣpattau^{lxi} tat sphuṭākālpadhīphalam¹⁸⁹ ||^{lxii}

punaś cōktam—

aho kuśīdatvam aho vimūḍhatā
aho janasyāśya sadarthavakratā |
svacittamātrapratibaddhabuddhatā¹⁹⁰
adūravartiny api yan na sevyate ||¹⁹¹

iti. tasmān nāyaṃ viśeṣaḥ.

bhrāntirūpatvenāparamārthatvam api sarvatraiva bhāvanāviśeṣe
vastuni sambhavatīti na kiñcid api bhāvanīyaṃ syāt. [K fol. 8v] ta-
taś ca sarvatraiva mokṣamārga bhāvanāyā vaiyarthyam syāt. māyo-
pamākārānupraveśena bhrāntirūpam apy aprapañcād [E_{DH} p. 145]
bhāvyamānam¹⁹² aduṣṭam bhavatīti cet, na tv ayaṃ mākārānupra-
veśaḥ prapañce 'pi samāna iti. tatrāpi ko doṣasyāvakāśaḥ? tasmāt
prapañcam aprapañcam vā yad eva rocate pramāṇasaṃgatam itarad
vā, tad evāśyaṃ vihāya mahāpuruṣārthibhir bhāvayitavyam¹⁹³ ity
alam atiprasaṅgeneti.

atra ca sāretaravibhāgaḥ paryupāsitaḥ gurubhir eva jñātavyaḥ.

^{lxi} The reading *bhāvanābalaniṣpattau* is supported by the Tibetan translation and occurs in other sources (*bsgom pa'i stobs ni rdzogs pa na*). Another more mai-
nstream reading for this *pāda* is *bhāvanāpariniṣpattau*.

^{lxii} *Pramāṇavārttika*, Pratyakṣapramāṇa 285

¹⁸⁷ yatraivālabane] *conj.* (no reflect of *nanu* in TV); *nanu* yatraivālabane

¹⁸⁸ nirantaram] E_{DH} (*em.*) TV (rgyun mi 'chad par); niruttaram K

¹⁸⁹ kalpadhīphalam] *em.*; kalpadhī phalam K E_{DH}

¹⁹⁰ °pratibaddha°] *conj.* (TV; 'brel pa); °pratibuddha° K E_{DH}

¹⁹¹ Untraced. Also cited in **Saptāṅga* fol. 202r7.

¹⁹² aprapañcād bhāvyamānam] E_{DH}; aprapañcā bhāvyamānam

¹⁹³ bhāvayitavyam] E_{DH}; bhaviyitavyam K

8.5 pañcamasya asāratvam

ṭṛṭīyapakṣoktadoṣatvān¹⁹⁴ nīrasatvena¹⁹⁵ prayojanābhāvān mantranayakramābhāvāc ca na pañcamaḥ parikṣiṇadoṣaḥ.

nanu sākṣātkaraṇāt pūrvam mantranayaprayogo 'sti. tat katham tasyābhāvaḥ? satyam, sākṣātphalāvasthā sādhyā. tasyām ca nāsty a-sau kramaḥ. [†]sākṣātparityāge^{lxiii†} ca na prayojanam utpaśyāma iti.

8.6 ṣaṣṭhamasya asāratvam

svecchayā nirvāyayitum¹⁹⁶ aśakyatvāt, prayojanābhāvāt, sattvārthābhāvāc ca na pañcāntaraprabhedakalpanā¹⁹⁷ kalaṅkāśūnyā. tathā hi kasyacin nivṛtṭiḥ kāraṇanivṛtṭyā vyāpakanivṛtṭyā¹⁹⁸ vā bhavati. na cātra sākṣātkṛtamaṇḍalacakrasya nivartakam kāraṇam vyāpakam vā icchākāle dṛśyate.^{lxiv}

nanu śūnyataiva nivartikāsti. yathā dārusaṅghātaprajvalito¹⁹⁹ vahnir niḥśeṣam indhanam bhasmīkṛtya paścāt svarasata eva nivartate, tathā maṇḍalacakraprajvalitaḥ śūnyatājñānāgniḥ sākṣāt kṛtvā²⁰⁰ maṇḍalacakraṁ nivartayiṣyatīti cet.²⁰¹ tad asat, viṣamatvād dṛṣṭā-

^{lxiii} Segment instead: kramaḥ sākṣāt. parityāge ?

^{lxiv} TV lacks a reflex of *icchākāle dṛśyate*. Both translations add an extra sentence to this paragraph: *rang gi 'dod pas ('dos pas TVBG; 'gog par TVBG)'gog pa yang mi nus te mi mthun pa med pa'i phyir | sdug bsngal la sogs pa 'gog pa 'dod kyang sdug bsngal la sogs pa la 'jug pa mthong ba'i phyir ro ||*

¹⁹⁴ ṭṛṭīyapakṣoktadoṣatvān *conj.* (TVBG: gsum pa'i phyogs la bshad pa'i nyes pa yod pa dang); ṭṛṭīyapakṣe ktato K; ṭṛṭīyapakṣe kuto E_{DH}; *no reflex* in TVAd

¹⁹⁵ nīrasatvena] *conj.*; nīrasatvena te K E_{DH}

¹⁹⁶ nirvāyayitum] K; nirvāpayitum E_{DH}

¹⁹⁷ pañcāntara°] *em.* TV (Inga pa'i mtha'i rab tu dbye ba); prapañcāntara° K E_{DH}

¹⁹⁸ vyāpakanivṛtṭyā] E_{DH}; vyāpakānivṛtṭyā K

¹⁹⁹ dārusaṅghātaprajvalito] *conj.*; dārusaṅghāte prajvalito E_{DH}; dārusaṅghāt prajvalito K

²⁰⁰ sākṣāt kṛtvā] *conj.*; sākṣān K E_{DH}

²⁰¹ TV a fuller sentence here. TVBG reads: *de ltar dkyil 'khor gyi 'khor lo stong pa nyid kyi ye shes kyi me rab tu 'bar bas mngon sum du byas nas kyang | dkyil 'khor gyi 'khor lo ma lus par ldog par byed la | bdag nyid kyang rang gi ngang gis ldog par 'gyur ro zhe na |* TVAd appears to be slightly more corrupt, but suggests that same readings: *de dkyil 'khor gyi 'khor lo stong pa nyid kyi ye shes kyi me rab tu*

ntasya. tathā hi tatrendhanam kāraṇam²⁰² vahneḥ. kāraṇasya indhanalakṣaṇasya nivṛttau²⁰³ yuktaiva vahnalakṣaṇasya kāryasya nivṛtṭiḥ. iha tu na śūnyatā kāraṇam maṇḍalacakrasya. tat ka[K fol. 9r]tḥam tannivṛttau nivṛtṭiḥ? na²⁰⁴ ca śūnyatāyā nivṛttir asti.^{lxv}

nanu sā na²⁰⁵ bhavatu kāraṇam. śūnyatā vyāpakam tu bhaviṣyati. vyāpakasya vṛkṣasya nivṛttau śiṃśapātvasya vyāpyasya nivṛttivan nivṛttir bhaviṣyatīti cet. etad apy asāram. tathā hi śūnyatā sarvadā sarvajñeyamaṇḍalavyāpikā tattvarūpā.²⁰⁶ na ca tasyā nivṛtṭiḥ kadācid apy asti. yadi syāt samyaksambodhisākṣātkaraṇāt [E_{DH} p. 146] pūrvam anantaram eva vā nivṛtṭiḥ syāt. na ca bhavati, samyaksambuddhībhyūyāpi katipayakālāvasthānasya svayam eva svikṛtatvāt.

kintu śūnyatāpi jñānarūpā, cakram api jñānarūpam. śūnyatājñānotpattyā cakrajñānasyānivṛttau²⁰⁷ śūnyatājñānam kena nivartaniyam. tena nivṛtṭiś ca virodhino 'bhāvāt kāraṇavyāpakayoś cābhāvān nāsti. tasmāc chūnyatājñānasya na nivṛtṭiḥ,²⁰⁸ nāpi maṇḍalacakrasya śūnyatāto nivṛttir iti śūnyatā na nivartikā.

ko brūte śūnyatā nivartikā? kiṃ tarhi yan nivartakam²⁰⁹ tad gurūpadeśato jñeyam ity apy asāram. gurūpadeśato 'pi na śūnyatāvya-

^{lxv} The response the objection is considerably different in Tibetan. It states that while fire is regarded by mundane consensus as having a causal effect on fuel insofar as it transforms it, emptiness has no such effect on the *maṇḍalacakra*. It is also therefore not something that causes it to cease, nor is it known to itself cease of its own accord. Although the Sanskrit MS is very corrupt in this paragraph, it is difficult to see how the text it transmits corresponds to the Tibetan translation.

'bar bas mngon sum du byas nas kyang | dkyil 'khor gyi 'khor lo ma lus par ldog par byed la | de yang rang gi ldog par 'gyur ro zhe na |

²⁰² kāraṇam] conj.; na kāraṇam K E_{DH}

²⁰³ kāryasya indhanalakṣaṇasya nivṛttau] conj.; kāryam indhanalakṣaṇanivṛttau

²⁰⁴ na] conj.; athavā na] K E_{DH}

²⁰⁵ na] E_{DH} (em.); deest in K

²⁰⁶ tattvarūpā] E_{DH}; tatvarūpāḥ K

²⁰⁷ °ānivṛttau] K E_{DH}; log na TV(nivṛttau)

²⁰⁸ na nivṛtṭiḥ] conj. (TV: ldog pa med do); nivṛtṭiḥ K E_{DH}

²⁰⁹ nivartakam] em.; nivartikās K E_{DH}

tiriktaṃ²¹⁰ pramāṇato 'stīti yatkiñcid etat.^{lxvi} pratikṣaṇanivṛttiś ca kṣaṇabhaṅgarūpā sarvapaḍārthavyāpinī. na sā santānanivartikā. ta-smān na svecchayā nivṛttiḥ.²¹¹ na ca nivṛtṭyā²¹² nīrasarūpayā prayo-janam asti prekṣāvatām. tathā cōktaṃ—

mucyamāneṣu sattveṣu ye te prāmodyasāgarāḥ |
tair eva nanu paryāptaṃ mokṣeṇārasikena kim ||^{lxvii}

iti.

sattvārtho 'pi nivṛttau nāsti. na hi gagane²¹³ gaganakamale vā kācid arthakriyā sambhavati. ciraniruddhād apy atitād avasturūpāc²¹⁴ cakrāt sattvārtho bhaviṣyatīty apy asāram, ciranīrutasyāpi²¹⁵ kukku[K fol. 9v]ṭasya kaṇṭhadhvaniprasaṅgāt.

nanu yogyadhiṣṭhānād gaganād apy arthakriyāḥ sambhavantīti cet.²¹⁶ na sambhavanti, yogyadhiṣṭhānād eva cittarūpād arthakriyā, na gaganāt, nīrūpatvāt tasya.^{lxviii}

nanu nirodhya maṇḍalacakraṃ sattvārthakāle punar utpādyate. tato 'rthakriyā bhavati. tataḥ punar eva nirodhyate, punar evotpa-dyata iti cet. asad etat. yathā sattvārthakriyāyās tattvato²¹⁷ nāsti prā-durbhāvaḥ, tathā cakrasyāpi. tato nārthakriyāyāḥ sambhavaḥ. na ca

^{lxvi} TVB_G: bla ma'i man ngag las kyang stong pa nyid kyis ldog par byed pa ma yin ldog pa'i tshad ma cung zhig kyang yod pa ma yin pas. TVA_D: bla ma'i man ngag las kyang stong pa nyid dang | de ldog pa las ma gtogs pa'i ldog par byed pa'i tshad ma gzhan cung zad yod pa ma yin no ||

^{lxvii} Bodhicaryāvatāra 8.108

^{lxviii} TVA_D varies significantly for this paragraph.

²¹⁰ śūnyatāvyatiriktaṃ] conj. vyatiri((ktiḥ)) K (i in kti lacks a prṣṭhamātrā); vyati-riktaḥ E_{DH}

²¹¹ nivṛttiḥ] K^{ac}; nivṛttiḥ K^{pc}

²¹² nivṛtṭyā] E_{DH} (em.); nivartyā K

²¹³ gagane] K E_{DH} TVB_G; no reflex in TVA_D

²¹⁴ avasturūpāc] K E_{DH} TVB_G (dngos po med pa'i ngo bo); dngos po'i ngo bo TVA_D (vasturūpāc)

²¹⁵ ciranīrutasyāpi] conj.; cirutasyāpi K; virutasyāpi E_{DH}; yun rin por khyim bya shi ba TVA_D; yun ring por long pa'i khyim bya shi ba TVB_G (ciramṛtasyāpi)

²¹⁶ sambhavantīti cet] conj.; sambhavanti K E_{DH}

²¹⁷ tattvato] K (tatvato) E_{DH}; de las TV (tato)

nirodhya²¹⁸ punar utpāde kiñcit prayojanam astīty alam atiprapa-
ñceneti.

8.7 saptamasya asāratvam

ṣaṣṭhapakṣoktadoṣasandohasya saptame²¹⁹ 'pi bhāvān na piṣṭapeṣa-
ṇam²²⁰ kriyate. nanu ṣaṣṭhena saptamasya samānatvāt katham sa-
ptamasya tato viśeṣaḥ? asti viśeṣaḥ. pūrvāvasthāyām niyatacakrā-
kāratā, punaḥ svecchayā nirvṛtiḥ svecchotpādanam²²¹ ceti. saptame
punar etan nāsti. tato na samānatā. bhinnāś ca nirdiṣṭa iti.²²²

9 caturthasya sekasya svarūpam

dambholibījasrutidhautaśuddha-²²³
pāthojabhūtāṅkurabhūtapuṣṭi²²⁴ |
turiyaśasyam²²⁵ paripākam eti²²⁶
sphuṭam caturtham viduṣo 'pi gūḍham || 17 ||

[E_{DH} p. 147] dambholītyādi. etat sadgurūpadeśato jñeyam.

²¹⁸ nirodhya] E_{DH}; niro((dhya)) K (*some kind of correction is made, but uncertain from what to what*); 'gogas pa las (*possibly nirodhāt*)

²¹⁹ ṣaṣṭhapakṣoktadoṣasandohasya saptame] conj. (TV: drug pa'i phyogs la bshad pa'i skyon gyi (gyi] TVA_D; gyis TVB_G) tshogs bdun pa la); ṣaṣṭhapakṣoktam sam-
dāhasyāṣṭame K; ṣaṣṭhapakṣoktasamḍohasyāṣṭame E_{DH}

²²⁰ piṣṭapeṣaṇam] K^{ac} E_{DH}; piṣṭapre | ṣaṇam K^{ac}

²²¹ nirvṛtiḥ svecchotpādanam] conj. (TVB_G: yang rang gi 'dod pas 'gog cing rang gi 'dod pas skyed par byed pa); svecchetpādanam K; svecchotpādanam E_{DH}; yang dang yang du rang gi 'dod pas skyed par byed pa nyid TVA_D

²²² K E_{DH}; tha mi dad pa ma yin par bstan to TVA_D; tha mi dad pa ma yin par bstan to TVB_G

²²³ °sruti°] corr.; śruti K E_{DH}

²²⁴ pāthoja°] E_{DH} (*E_{DH} reports the ms. as reading pāthojña, but this seems to be incorrect*); pāthauja° K

²²⁵ turiyaśasyam] E_{DH}; tutiyaśasyam K

²²⁶ eti] E_{DH} (*em.*); eta K

10 aparaṃ mithyāsādhyam mithyātattvam ca

pañcapradīpāmṛtabinducandra-
bhrūmadhyabindūdbhavamaṇḍalāni |
vāyoḥ svarūpaṃ galaśuṇḍikādyam
atattvarūpaṃ svayam ūhanīyam || 18 ||

pañcapradīpetyādi. pañcapradīpaśabdena gokudahanalakṣaṇasya, a-mṛtaśabdena vimumāraśulakṣaṇasya satatānuṣṭhānam eva sādhyam manyante. bindur iti hṛccandrasthāṃ binduṃ dedīpyamānaṃ tattvam sādhyam ceti kṛtvā kecid bhāvayanti. candra iti hṛdisthāṃ kalārūpaṃ ardhacandraṃ vā hṛtkamalasthāṃ kecid bhāvayanti.

bhrūmadhyabindūdbhavamaṇḍalānīti bhruvor madhye ūrṇāyāṃ binduṃ vibhāvya tadbindūdbhavāni maṇḍalāni vāyuvāruṇamāheन्द्रāgneyalakṣaṇāni. etad uktaṃ bhavati—mukhaśravaṇanāsikākacakṣurghrāṇarasanāni hastāṅgulibhiḥ pidhāya bhrūmadhyabindur draṣṭavyaḥ. tasya sphuṭāvasthāyāṃ śubhāśubhani[K fol. 10r]mittasaṃsūcakāni mähendrādimāṇḍalāny upajāyante. taṃ ca binduṃ tattvam iti manyante.

vāyoḥ svarūpaṃ iti pūrakakumbhakarecakaprasāntakalakṣaṇam²²⁸ ānāpānādīlakṣaṇam²²⁹ ceti. etad²³⁰ uktaṃ bhavati—śaivasāṃkhyādinirdiṣṭam²³¹ vāyusvarūpaṃ jñātvā taṃ vāyuṃ nirodhabhāvanayā sthīrikṛtyākāśenotplutya gamanaṃ paraprapravesaṃ yāvan muktiṃ ca sākṣātkurvanti vāyuvādinah.

galaśuṇḍiketi. galapradeśe jihvāmūlopari hastīśuṇḍikākārā adhaḥpralambamānā upajihvāsaṃjñikā galaśuṇḍikāsti. sā ca śaktirūpā. tadadhaḥ śivarūpaṃ²³² asti tattvam. sā ca [E_{DH} p. 148] jihvāgreṇa sprīṣyamānā nirantarāmṛtaṃ sravati. tena ca ghargharāmṛtavarsaṇena santarpyamānaṃ ātmānaṃ dhyāyād iti galaśuṇḍikātattvam. ādīśabdena

²²⁷ mukhaśravaṇanāsikākacakṣurghrāṇarasanāni] K E_{DH}; kha dang | rna ba dang | sna dang | mig TVA_D TVB_G

²²⁸ °recaka°] E_{DH}; recakaṃ K

²²⁹ ānāpānādīlakṣaṇam] E_{DH}; anāpānā° K

²³⁰ etad] E_{DH} (em.); tad K

²³¹ śaivasāṃkhyādi°] E_{DH} (em.) TVB_G (shi ba dang grangs can la sogs pas); saiva-sāṃkhyādi° K; grangs can la sogs pas TVA_D (sṃākhyādi°)

²³² tadadhaḥ śivarūpaṃ] K E_{DH} TVB_G (de'i 'og na zhi ba'i ngo bo); sdig pa'i rang bzhin du yong pa TVA_D

hṛṇmadhyaṣoḍaśanāḍikākacramadhyasthajñānasvarūpaṃ²³³ śivarū-
paṃ tattvaṃ bhāvayitavyam ityādināṃ parigrahaḥ.^{lxix}

tatsarvaṃ tīrthikādibhis tattvarūpeṇābhimatam. atattvam iti sva-
yam evohaṇīyaṃ vicāraṇīyam iti yāvat.

11 upasaṃhāra

svapnendrajālapratibimbamāyā-
marīcigandharvapurāmbu[K fol. 2r]candraiḥ |
anyaiś ca śabdair²³⁴ upamābhidheyair
naivāsti sādhyam kathitād ihānyat || 19 ||

svapnendrajāletyādi. svapnendrajālopamaṃ pratibimbamāyāmarīci-
gandharvanagarodakacandropamam iti śabdair anyaiś ca gagaṇa-
pratiśrutkaphenopamam ityādiśabdair upamābhidheyair upamāvā-
cakair naivāsti sādhyam kathitāt sādhyād anyat. paraṃ kathita eva
sādhye, ete śabdāḥ pravartanta iti svayaṃ boddhavyam.

gambhīraśūnyapratibhāsamātra-²³⁵
śāntāti²³⁶ sūkṣmānabhilāpyaśabdaiḥ |

^{lxix} TV continues to describe this practice. TV_{AD} reads: *yang smras pa | bcu las drug lhag rtsa dang ldan pa'i 'khor lo yi || dkyil na gnas pa'i snying gar rnam par gnas pa'i bdag | des ni de yi khyad par lta bu'i grub pa ster || de ni mngon par mi g-yo ba yi yid dag gis || rnal 'byor pa yi sems de de ltar mngon par bsam || nub par gyur pa'i mgon po rgyal bar gyur de ni || nus pa dag gis de ni yongs su bskor dang bcas ||* TV_{BG} reads: *de yang smras pa | bcu las drug lhag rtsa dang ldan pa'i 'khor lo'i dkyil na gnas pa snying kar rnam par gnas pa'i bdag | des ni de'i khyad par lta bu yi grub pa ster | de ni mngon par mi g.yo ba'i yid dag gis || rnal 'byor pa yis de ltar mngon par bsam par bya || nus par gyur pa'i mgon po rgyal bar gyur || de ni nus pa dag gis de ni yongs su bskor dang bcas ||*

²³³ hṛṇmadhyaṣoḍaśanāḍikākacramadhyasthajñānasvarūpaṃ] K_{EDH} TV_{BG} (snying ka'i dbus kyi 'khor lo rtsibs bcu drug pa'i dbus na gnas pa ye shes kyi rang bzhin); snying ga'i dbus kyi dkyil 'khor rtsibs bcu drug pa'i dbus na hūm gnas pa ye shes kyi rang bzhin (hṛṇmadhyaṣoḍaśanāḍikāmaṇḍalamadhyahūmsthajñānasvarūpaṃ)

²³⁴ śabdair *em.* (cf. comm.); sarvair K_{EDH}

²³⁵ °mātra°] E_{EDH}; mātram K

²³⁶ śāntāti] E_{EDH}; śāntādi K

nirlepanīrūpa²³⁷ nirañjanādyair
bhrāntir na kāryāparasādhyasattve || 20 ||

[E_{DH} p. 149] gambhīraśūnyaṃ pratibhāsamātraṃ śāntātisūkṣmam
anabhilāpyaṃ nirlepaṃ nīrūpaṃ²³⁸ nirañjanādi.²³⁹ ādiśabdāt śivaṃ
nirākāraṃ niṣprapañcam anādyantanidhanam i[K fol. 10v]tyādiśabdair
bhrāntir na kartavyā. aparasādhyasattve, aparasya sādhyasya sattve
sattāyām.²⁴⁰ ebhiḥ sarvair eva param api kiñcit sādhyam kathitād
astīti bhrāntir na kartavyā. atha nātikathitam eva sādhyam ebhiḥ
sarvair abhidhīyata iti niścayaḥ.

12 pariṇāmanā

akhilagagaṇagarbhavyāpisaptaparakāra-²⁴¹
grathitavacanarūpād yan mayāsādi puṇyam |
anupamasukhavidyāsaktasaddehanirmij-
jinajanitajanārthas tena loko 'yam astu ||
tattvaratnāvalokaḥ samāptaḥ. kṛtir iyaṃ paṇḍitavāgī-
śvarakīrtipādānām.

śrīsamāje parā yasya bhaktir niṣṭhā ca nirmalā
tasya vāgīśvarasyeyaṃ kṛtir vimatināśinī²⁴² ||

vikacakumudatārākṣīrakundānukāri²⁴³
pracitam api ca puṇyaṃ yan mayā granthito 'smāt |
anupamasukhapūrṇaḥ svābhavidyopagūḍho
bhavatu nikhilalokas tena vāgīśvaraśrīḥ ||

²³⁷ nirlepanīrūpa°] E_{DH} (em.); nirlepanīpa K

²³⁸ nīrūpaṃ] E_{DH} (em.); nirupamaṃ K

²³⁹ nirañjanādi] K; nirañjanaṃ E_{DH}

²⁴⁰ sattāyām] K; sattvāyā E_{DH}

²⁴¹ °saptaparakāra°] E_{DH}; °sarvaparakāra° K

²⁴² vimatināśinī] E_{DH}; vimatināsanī K

²⁴³ vikacakumudatārākṣīrakundānukāri em.; vikacakumudakṣīratārakundānukāri]
E_{DH}; vikarektāmudakṣīratārakundānukāri K

tattvaratnāvalokavivaraṇaṃ samāptam. kṛtir iyaṃ paṇḍitācāryavā-
gīśvarakīrtipādānām.

References

Abhidharmakośa by Vasubandhu. P. PRADHAN, ed. 1975. *Abhidharmakośabhāṣyam of Vasubandhu*. Tibetan Sanskrit Works Series VIII. Patna

Abhidharmakośavyākhyā by Yośamitra. Wogihara UNRAI, ed. n.d. *Sphuṭārthā Abhidharmakośavyākhyā by Yaśomitra*. 2 vols. Tokyo: The Publishing Association of the Abhidharmakośavyākhyā

Amṛtakaṇikā by Raviśrījñāna. Banarsi LAL, ed. 1994. *Āryamañjuśrī-nāmasaṃgīti with Amṛtakaṇikā-ṭippaṇī by Bhikṣu Raviśrījñāna and Amṛtakaṇikodyota-nibandha of Vibhūticandra*. Biblioteca Indo-Tibetica XXX. Sarnath: Central Institute of Higher Tibetan Studies

Nyāyabindu by Dharmakīrti. F. I. ŠČERBATSKOJ. 1918. *Nyāyabindu: Buddijskij učebnik logiki sočinenie Dharmakīrti i tolkovanie na nego Nyāyabinduṭikā sočinenie Dharmottara, sanskritskij tekst izdal s vvedeniem i priměčanijami*. Bibliotheca Buddhica 7. St. Petersburg: Izdanie Rossijskoj Akademii Nauk

Pramāṇavārttikavṛtti by Manorathānandin. Sāṃkṛtyāyana ed.

Mantrārthāvalokinī by Vilāsavajra. A. TRIBE. 2016. *Tantric Buddhist Practice in India: Vilāsavajra's Commentary on the Mañjuśrīnāmasaṃgīti*. Routledge Studies in Tantric Traditions. Taylor & Francis

Mitākṣarā of Vijñāneśvara. Narayan Ram ACHARYA, ed. 1949. *Yājñavalkya-smṛti of Yogīśvara Yājñavalkya with the Commentary Mitākṣara of Vijñāneśvara, Notes, Varient [sic!] Readings etc*. Bombay: Nirnaya Sagar Press

Vṛttamālāvivṛti by Śākyarakṣita. Hahn ed.
Samkṣiptābhiṣekavidhi by Vāgīśvarakīrti. M. SAKURAI. 1996. *Indo mikkyō girei kenkyū: Kōki Indo mikkyō no kanjō shidai* [XXXXXXXXXX: XXXXXXXXXXXXXXXX, *A study on Indian Buddhist tantric ritual: Late Indian Buddhist tantric initiation sequence*]. Kyoto: Hōzōkansakurai (1996)
Subhāṣitaratnaśoṣa compiled by Vidyākara. D. D. KOSAMBI and V. V. GOKHALE, eds. 1957. *The Subhāṣitaratnaśoṣa Compiled by Vidyākara*. Cambridge Massachusetts: Harvard University Press
Hetubinduṭīkāloka by Durvekamiśra. Sukhlalji SANGHAVI and Muni Shri JINAVIJAYAJI, eds. 1949. *Hetubinduṭīkā of Bhaṭṭa Arcaṭa with the Sub-Commentary Entitled Āloka of Durveka Miśra*. Baroda: Oriental Institute

Secondary Sources

- INGALLS, Daniel H. H. 1965. *An Anthology of Sanskrit Court Poetry: Vidyākara's "Subhāṣitaratnaśoṣa"*. Vol. 44. Harvard Oriental Series. Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press.
- LAL, Banarsi, ed. 1994. *Āryamañjuśrīnāmasaṃgīti with Amṛtakaṇikā-ṭippaṇī by Bhikṣu Raviśrījñāna and Amṛtakaṇikodyota-nibandha of Vibhūticandra*. Biblioteca Indo-Tibetica XXX. Sarnath: Central Institute of Higher Tibetan Studies.
- SAKURAI, M. 1996. *Indo mikkyō girei kenkyū: Kōki Indo mikkyō no kanjō shidai* [XXXXXXXXXX: XXXXXXXXXXXXXXXX, *A study on Indian Buddhist tantric ritual: Late Indian Buddhist tantric initiation sequence*]. Kyoto: Hōzōkan.