

# Tattvaratnāvaloka and Vivaraṇa

Vāgīśvarakīrti

February 12, 2025

## Some Conventions/Policies

- Tibetan translations are included in the apparatus when they indicate variant Sanskrit readings.
- Sanskrit renderings suggested by Tibetan appear in brackets after the translation's siglum. These renderings are hypothetical and cannot be provided in all cases.
- When two Tibetan translations differ slightly, they are separated by a semicolon. Only the second translation includes a Sanskrit rendering.
- A Tibetan translation's siglum is included when it appears to support one of multiple Sanskrit readings, based on the editors' judgment.
- Tibetan is not included in the apparatus when it offers no clear support for or against a reading.
- When both Tibetan translations agree, they are given the siglum TIB.

## Sigla and Abbreviations

TaRaA	Tattvaratnāvaloka
TaRaA-Vi	Tattvaratnāvalokavivaraṇa
E <sub>DH</sub>	Dhīḥ vol. 21, pp. 129–149.
K	NAK 5–252 = NGMPP A 915/4

TM <sub>D</sub>	<i>De kho na nyid rin po che snang ba</i> . Tōhoku no. 1889. sDe dge bstan 'gyur, vol. Pi, fols. 203r3–204r5. Tr. by 'Gos Lhas btsas
TVA <sub>D</sub>	<i>De kho na nyid rin po che snang ba'i rnam par bshad pa</i> . Tōh. 1890. sDe dge bsTan 'gyur, vol. 44 (rGyud 'grel, Pi), fols. 204r5–214v4. Tr. by 'Gos Lhas btsas.
TVB <sub>G</sub>	<i>De kho na nyid rin po che snang ba'i rnam par bshad pa</i> . Ōtani no. 4793. bsTan 'gyur gSer bris ma, vol. 84 (83 in BDRC outline(?)), (rGyud 'brel, Zhu), fols. 70v–85v. translator given.
TIB	Both Tibetan translations (differences, if any, indicated in a mini-aparatus)
<i>ac</i>	<i>ante correctionem</i>
<i>deest</i>	omitted in
<i>diag. conj.</i>	diagnostic conjecture [e.g. 'reconstructed' from Tibetan]
<i>conj.</i>	conjecture
<i>em.</i>	emendation [an emendation is made with a high degree of confidence, whereas a conjecture proposes a correction while acknowledging a greater possibility for alternatives]
fol./fols.	folio/folios
<i>pc</i>	<i>post correctionem</i>
<i>r</i>	recto
<i>v</i>	verso
Σ <sub>x</sub>	Reading shared in all witnesses but X
((kiṃcit))	Reading uncertain—either illegible or otherwise in doubt
<kiṃcit>	Reading cancelled
†kiṃcit†	Reading does not make sense to the editor and an adequate conjecture was not able to be chosen.
[kiṃcit]	Indication of a diagnostic conjecture
..	Damaged <i>akṣara</i> (one . per half <i>akṣara</i> )
...	Lacunae of an unknown quantity of <i>akṣaras</i>
°	Mark of abbreviation

# Text

## 1 maṅgalācaraṇa

[K fol. 1r] [siddham]<sup>1</sup> namaḥ śrīsadgurupādebhyaḥ |<sup>i</sup>

anupamasukharūpī śrīnivāso 'nivāso  
nirupamadaśadevīrūpavidyaḥ<sup>2</sup> savidyah |  
tribhuvanahitasaukhyaprāptikāro 'vikāro  
jayati kamalapāṇir yāvad āśāvikāśaḥ || 1 ||<sup>ii</sup>

[K fol. 2r3] namaḥ samantakāyavākcittavajrāya.<sup>iii</sup>

anupametyādi. kamalaṃ padmaṃ pāṇau yasya sa kamalapāṇir avalokiteśvaro  
bhagavān jayatīti sambandhaḥ. kiṃviśiṣṭaḥ? anupamam ity<sup>3,iv</sup> atipraṇītavama-  
hattvāsamsārasthāyitvalakṣaṇair<sup>4</sup> dharmair yuktasyānyasyābhāvād upamārahi-  
taṃ sukham eva rūpaṃ svabhāvo yasya sa tathoktaḥ. punar api kiṃviśiṣṭaḥ? śrīḥ  
puṇyajñānasambhāralakṣaṇā, tasyā nivāsa āśrayo yaḥ sa tathā. dharmakāyarū-  
patvena<sup>5,v</sup> sarvagatatvāt [E<sub>DH</sub> p. 132] pratiniyatanivāsābhāvād anivāsaḥ.

<sup>i</sup> Scribal homage

<sup>ii</sup> This verse is in Mālinī metre.

<sup>iii</sup> Scribal homage

<sup>iv</sup> Here one may wish to conjecture a reading such as, *anumapetyādi. anupamam ity* ...This reading is partially suggested by TIB: *khyad par ji lta bu zhig dang ldan zhe na | dpe med ces bya ba la sogs pa smos te | dpe med pa ni (ni)* TVAD; *dang* TVBG). The corruption, if there is one, can be seen as a kind of haplography. The text nonetheless reads acceptably well with the transmitted reading (although perhaps less smoothly); thus we feel that while a conjecture is possible it is not strongly compelling.

<sup>v</sup> The manuscript's *dharmakāyarūpitvena* is theoretically acceptable and nearly synonymous; however, *dharmakāyarūpatvena* is more expected, with forms in *°rūpatvena* being vastly more frequent in Classical Sanskrit. TIB's reading *chos kyi sku'i ngo bo nyid kyis* does not clearly confirm either variant, as *rūpin* in the root verse is also translated as *ngo bo*. We provisionally adopt *dharmakāyarūpatvena*, but cannot fully discount the transmitted reading.

<sup>1</sup> [siddham] K; om E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>2</sup> nirupama° E<sub>DH</sub>; nirūpama° K

<sup>3</sup> kiṃviśiṣṭaḥ? anupamam ity] K E<sub>DH</sub>; *khyad par ji lta bu zhig dang ldan zhe na | dpe med ces bya ba la sogs pa smos te | dpe med pa ni* TVAD; *khyad par ji lta bu zhig dang ldan zhe na | dpe med ces bya ba la sogs pa smos te | dpe med pa dang* TVBG (kiṃviśiṣṭa ity āha anumapam ityādi. anupamam)

<sup>4</sup> °samsārasthāyitva°] K; °samsārasthāyisva° E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>5</sup> dharmakāyarūpatvena] *em.*; dharmakāyarūpitvena K E<sub>DH</sub>

punaḥ kīdrśaḥ? nirupamāḥ paramarūpayauvanaśṛṅgārādirasamahākaruṇādi-yuktatvenopamātikrāntā rūpavajrādītārāparyantadaśadevīrūpā vidyāḥ paricāra-katvena<sup>6</sup> yasya sa tathā. saha svābhārūpayā vidyayā<sup>7</sup> vartata iti savidyāḥ. tribhu-vanasya tribhuvanavartino janasya yad dhitam āyatipathyam<sup>8,vi</sup> buddhatvādi-kam, saukhyam tadātve pathyam<sup>9</sup> cakravartitvādikam,<sup>vii</sup> tasya yā prāptiḥ<sup>10</sup> [K fol.

<sup>vi</sup> We need not necessarily read a compound for *āyatipathyam*, treating instead *āyati* as a locative of *āyat*. The expression appears as a gloss for *hita* in several Buddhists texts, such as in Vilāsavajra's *Mantrārthāvalokinī*: *mahyam hitam maddhitam hitam āyatipathyam āgāmapariṇā-matvāt* (p. 233). Similarly, Durvekamiśra writes in his *Hetubinduṭīkāloka*: *parasmai hitamāyati pathyam* (p. 212). In both cases, the construction is ambiguous, but in the latter case, the editors of Durvekamiśra's text have not taken it as a compound.

The word *āyatipathyā* is used less ambiguously in compound by Śākyarakṣita, quoted in the following note. Similarly, the roughly parallel expression *āyatisukha* is evidently treated as a compound by Yaśomitra in his *Abhidharmakośavyākhyā*: *aihikasukhārtham apuṇyam iti. ihasu-khāpekṣayā tat kṛtaṁ nāyatisukhāpekṣayety arthaḥ* (vol. 1 p. 299). Note also the contrast made with *aihikasukha*. Likewise, we can find a compounded form of *āyatiduḥkha* in a verse attributed to Naradatta in the *Subhāṣitaratnaśoḥa*: *muṇḍāpriyād āyatiduḥkhadāyino vasantam utsārya vijṛmbhitaśriyaḥ | na kaḥ khalāt tāpitamitramaṇḍalād upaiti pāpam tapavāsarād iva ||* 'Who does not become miserable because of a rogue who, like a hot day, is hated by widows (? *muṇḍā*) (the hot day being hated by bald men), who leads to future pain, whose wealth expands after he expels those living with him (like the hot day manifests its richness having dismissed the spring), and who annoys his circle of friends (like on a hot day the orb of the sun is heated) (cf. INGALLS 1965: 553).

<sup>vii</sup> The text is insecure here but perhaps not far from the author's intention. Where the manuscript reads *tad dāpayati pathyam* (word division unclear, *pa* and *ya* touching), we conjecture *tadātve pathyam*, following only partially the lead of TVA<sub>D</sub>. The Tibetan translations read as follows: *gang la phan pa ni ma 'ongs pa'i phan pa ste | sangs rgyas nyid la sogs pa'o || de la bde ba ni 'phral gyi phan pa ste |* (TVA<sub>D</sub>); *gang la phan pa ni ma 'ongs pa'i phan pa ste | sangs rgyas nyid la sogs pa dang | de la bde ba ni bde ba ste | 'khor lo bsgyur ba nyid la sogs pa'o ||* (TVB<sub>G</sub>). It appears that TVB<sub>G</sub> also transmits a corrupt reading. TVA<sub>D</sub> suggests reading something that contrasts with *āyati pathyam*, for which *tadātve pathyam* fits. Another possibility is *āpātāpathyam*, but *tadātva* is more often used in contrast with *āyati*. See, for example, Śākyarakṣita's *Vṛttamālāstutivṛtti*: *prthagjanatve 'pi āyatipathyadarśinas tadātve ca niṣpāpāḥ* (p. 299); 'Although ordinary people, they see the future welfare and are without sin in the present moment.'

The Tibetan translations also suggest that *hita* and *saukhya* are linked with relative and corelative pronouns: *gang la* and *de la*, or *yasya* and *tasya* in Sanskrit. This does not yield good sense. It is possible that *tadātve* was misread by the translator as a corelative pronoun, while it is also

<sup>6</sup> paricāra-katvena] *em.*; sapari((c))āra-katvena K; saparivāra-katvena E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>7</sup> vidyayā] K E<sub>DH</sub>; rig pa ste | shes rab TIB (vidyayā prajñayā)

<sup>8</sup> āyatipathyam] *variant word division in* E<sub>DH</sub>: āyati pathyam; *and in* K: āyati | pathyam

<sup>9</sup> saukhyam tadātve pathyam] *conj.*; tad dāpayati pathyam K E<sub>DH</sub> (*word division unclear*); de la bde ba ni 'phral gyi phan pa TVA<sub>D</sub>; de la bde ba ni bde ba ste TVB<sub>G</sub>

<sup>10</sup> prāptiḥ] K E<sub>DH</sub>; thob pa ni rnyed pa ste TIB (prāptir lābhaḥ)

2v] sākṣātkriyā, tasyāḥ karaṇaṃ kāro yasya sa tathā.<sup>viii</sup> aparinirvāṇadharmaka-  
tvenāpratiṣṭhitanirvāṇarūpatvenā<sup>11</sup> nyathātvalakṣaṇasya vikāraśābhāvād avikā-  
raḥ. evaṃviśiṣṭo bhagavāṇ jayati.

kiyantaṃ kalam ity āha—yāvad āśāvikaśāḥ. āśā daśa diśo gaganasvarūpāḥ.  
yadvā āśāḥ sarvasattvānāṃ bhavabhogatrṣṇāḥ.<sup>12</sup> tāsāṃ vikāśā avakāśāḥ prava-  
rtanāni, prādurbhāvā iti yāvat. te yāvat tāvad<sup>13</sup> bhagavāṇ jayati, sarvaharihara-  
hiraṇyagarbhādibhyaḥ prakṛṣṭo bhavatīty arthaḥ.

atrānupamasukharūpīty anena svārthasāṃpattīḥ kathitā. śrīnivāsa ity anena  
tadupāyaḥ, puṇyajñānasambhārayoḥ śrīśābenābhihitatvāt. tribhuvanahitasaukhya-  
prāptikāra ity anena parārthasāṃpattir uktā. nirupamadaśadevīrūpavidyaḥ savi-  
dya ity anena tadupāyaḥ,<sup>14</sup> tathābhūtadaśadevīdvātriṃśallakṣaṇāśītyanuvyañja-  
nakāyākāraśūnyena<sup>15</sup> sarvākāraparārthasāṃpatteḥ kartum āśakyatvād iti.

## 2 prayojanādi

śrīmantranītigatacārucaturthaseka-  
rūpaṃ vidanti na hi ye sphuṭaśabdaśūnyam |

possible that a second relative pronoun (*yat*) or a conjunction (*ca*) was found in the original text near *saukhyaṃ*. Here *hitasaukhya* within the larger compound is only really viable as a *dvandva*: Avalokiteśvara causes the attainment of (ultimate) welfare and (temporary) happiness for all beings. Given that, *tayor yā prāptiḥ* might be preferable to *tasya yā prāptiḥ*, but the singular is also probably acceptable in place of the dual.

<sup>viii</sup> It is notable that Vāgīśvakīrti evidently understands *prāptikāra* as a *bahuvrīhi*, whereas other commentators may prefer to treat it akin to *kumbhakāra* and therefore as an *upapadasamāsa* as per *Aṣṭādhyāyī* 3.1.18. Given the latter understanding, the expected gloss for *prāptikāra* would be *prāptiṃ karoti*. Compounds ending in *kāra* are occasionally analysed as *ṣaṣṭhītatpuruṣas*: see, for examples, Vijñāneśvara's *Mitākṣarā* ad *Yājñavalkya-dharmaśāstra* 2.61 on *satyaṃkārakṛta*, here referring roughly to a thing 'acquired with a pledge', i.e., acquired as earnest money: *karaṇaṃ kāraḥ, bhāve ghaṇ. satyasya kāraḥ satyaṃkārakṛtā—kāre satyāgadasya (Aṣṭādhyāyī 6.3.70) iti mum. satyaṃkāreṇa kṛtaṃ satyaṃkārakṛtam* (p. 275). We are unable to provide another example of a compound ending in *kāra* analysed as a *bahuvrīhi*, but we should also note that the compound *prāptikāra* is itself rare.

TIB does not clearly reflect a *bahuvrīhi* analysis, nor does it very clearly point to another reading: *de dag sgrub par mdzad po gang yin pa de la de skad ces bya'o* (TVAD); *de dag gi rgyu mdzad pa gang yin pa de la de skad ces bya'o* (TVBG).

<sup>11</sup> °rūpatvenā°] K EDH; ngo bo rnyed pas TVAD; ngo bo brnyed pas TVBG (°rūpaprāptyā°)

<sup>12</sup> °trṣṇāḥ] EDH (°trṣṇās); trṣṇā K

<sup>13</sup> te yāvat tāvad] *em.*; tā yāvat tāvad K EDH; de srid du TIB (tāvad)

<sup>14</sup> tathābhūta°] K EDH TVBG (*de lta bu*); *no reflex in TVAD*

<sup>15</sup> °kāyā°] K EDH; dam pa'i sku TIB (°satkāyā°)

nānopadeśagaṇasaṃkulasaptabhedais  
teṣāṃ sphuṭāvagataye kriyate prayatnaḥ || 2 ||<sup>ix</sup>

śrīmantranītiśabdena<sup>16</sup> sāmānyayogatantravācakenāpi śrīsamājah<sup>17</sup> parigr̥hyate,  
caturthārthakasyānyatrāsambhavāt. śeṣaṃ subodham. nānācāryopadeśagaṇasaṃ-  
kulai[E<sub>DH</sub> p. 133]r vyākulaiḥ<sup>18</sup> saptabhir bhedaiḥ prakārair<sup>19</sup> atītānāgatavartamā-  
nācārya<sup>20</sup> gatopadeśarāśisaṃgrāhakaiḥ.<sup>21,x</sup> sphuṭāvagataye sukhena sphuṭapratī-  
tyartham<sup>22</sup> iti.

### 3 tīrthikānāṃ tattvaṃ sādhyam ca

sambhrāntabodhā nikhilā hi tīrthyās  
tattvasya sādhyasya ca rūpavittau |  
tebhyaḥ prakṛṣṭaḥ kila tattvavettā  
vedāntavādīti janapavādaḥ || 3 ||<sup>xi</sup>

<sup>ix</sup> This verse is in Vasantatilaka.

<sup>x</sup> In this case TVB<sub>G</sub> resembles closely the Sanskrit text transmitted in K, apart from the addition of a further gloss after *vyākula*. The reading *rnam par bkab pa* ('covered') doesn't yield much sense, but it could be a mistake for *rnam par bkang ba* ('filled'), which is perfectly fitting and synonymous with TVA<sub>D</sub>'s *rnam par khyab pa* (Negi records the latter as rendering *vipūrṇa* in some texts). One may wish to conjecture such a reading. TVA<sub>D</sub> is significantly different here, even though most of the words of the transmitted Sanskrit text are still reflected: *du ma'i man ngag ces bya ba la sogs pa la | 'das pa dang ma 'ongs pa dang | da ltar gyi slob dpon du ma'i man ngag gi tshogs yang dag par bsdus pa'i mdun gyi dbye bas yongs su dkrugs pa ni | rnam par dkrugs pas rnam pa thams cad la rnam par khyab pa ste | des bsgrub par bya ba dkrugs pa'o* || The text is dubious but reflects a Sanskrit text along the following lines: *nānopadeśetyādi. atītānāgatavartamānācāryopadeśarāśisaṃgrāhakaiḥ saptabhir bhedaiḥ saṃkulair vyākulaiḥ sarvatravipūrṇaiḥ taiḥ sādhyasaṃkulaiḥ*.

<sup>xi</sup> This verse is in Indravajra.

<sup>16</sup> śrīmantranītiśabdena] K E<sub>DH</sub> TVB<sub>G</sub> (dpal ldan sngags kyi gzhung lugs zhes bya ba'i sgras); dpal ldan sngags kyi gzhung lugs shes || zhes bya ba la sogs pa la | sngags kyi gzhung lugs zhes bya ba'i sgras ni | TVA<sub>D</sub> (śrīmantranītigatetyādi. mantranītiśabdena)

<sup>17</sup> śrīsamājah] K E<sub>DH</sub>; shugs kyis dpal gsang ba 'dus pa TIB (sāmarthyāt śrīsamājah)

<sup>18</sup> vyākulaiḥ] K E<sub>DH</sub>; rnam par dkrugs pas rnam pa thams cad la rnam par khyab pa TVA<sub>D</sub>; rnam par 'khrugs pa rnam par bkab pa ste TVB<sub>G</sub>; vyākulair vipūrṇaiḥ *possible conj.* (see notes)

<sup>19</sup> prakārair] K E<sub>DH</sub>; *no reflex in TIB*

<sup>20</sup> °vartamānā°] E<sub>DH</sub>; °pravartamānā° K

<sup>21</sup> °gato°] K E<sub>DH</sub> TVB<sub>G</sub> (gtogs pa); *no reflex in TVA<sub>D</sub>*

<sup>22</sup> sukhena sphuṭapratītyartham] K E<sub>DH</sub>; bde bar gnas par khong du chud par bya ba'i phyir TVA<sub>D</sub>; bde bar gsal bar khong du chud par bya'o TVB<sub>G</sub>

sambhrāntetyādi. sambhrānto vibhrānto bodhaḥ prajñāviśeṣo yeṣāṃ tīrthikānāṃ te tatho[K fol. 3r]ktāḥ.<sup>23</sup> sarva eva tīrthyā ātmātmīyagrahatimiropahatabuddhinayanāḥ. tattvaṃ idam iti sādhyam idam<sup>24</sup> iti ca tattvasya sādhyasya yat<sup>25</sup> svarūpaṃ tasya yā vittiḥ pratītiḥ, tasyāṃ bhrāntāḥ. śeṣaṃ subodham.

nanu tattvasādhyayor upādeyatvenaika rūpatvāt kathaṃ tattvasya sādhyasya ceti<sup>26,xii</sup> bhedenā nirdeśa iti cet. asad etat. tattvaṃ hy upādeyatve 'pi<sup>27</sup> sukhaduḥkholekṣādisakalapratibhāsaṃdohavyāpakam.<sup>28</sup> sādhyam cānabhimataparihāreṇecchālakṣaṇaṃ phalam upādeyatve 'pi sakalaprañibhir avaśyam evāsādhyavyāvṛtṭyā sādhayitavyatvenābhimatam ity adoṣaḥ.

#### 4 vedāntavādināṃ śrāvakapratyekabuddhānāṃ ca sādhyāni

tatra tāvad<sup>29</sup> vedāntavādyabhimataṃ sādhyam āha—ānandarūpaṃ ityādi.

ānandarūpaṃ svaivid aprakampyaṃ  
vedāntinaḥ sādhyam uṣanti śāntam<sup>30</sup> |  
saśrāvakāḥ<sup>31</sup> khaḍgajināś ca sādhyam  
icchanti rūpādyupadher virāmam || 4 ||

ānandarūpaṃ iti sadāsukhamayatvāt. svaivid iti jyotirūpatvena<sup>32</sup> svayaṃ prakāśamānatvāt.<sup>33</sup> aprakampyaṃ iti nityatayā<sup>34</sup> kampayitum aśakyatvāt. śāntam<sup>35</sup> iti

<sup>xii</sup> E<sub>DH</sub> misreads the manuscript as *tattvasya sādhyasya ceti* and supplies *kathaṃ* after *ceti*. There is in fact a *kathaṃ* before *tattvasya* in the manuscript, but the *tat* preceding it is evidently a corruption.

<sup>23</sup> te tathoktāḥ] K<sup>pc</sup>; te thoktāḥ K<sup>ac</sup>; tathoktāḥ E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>24</sup> sādhyam idam] *em.*; sādhyam cedam K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>25</sup> yat] E<sub>DH</sub> (*em.*); tat K

<sup>26</sup> kathaṃ tattvasya sādhyasya ceti] *em.*; tat kathaṃ tatvasya sādhyasya ceti K; tattvasya sādhyasya ceti kathaṃ E<sub>DH</sub> (*em.*)

<sup>27</sup> upādeyatve 'pi] *conj.* (TIB: blang bar bya ba nyid yin yang); upādeyatvenāpi K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>28</sup> °vyāpakam] K (°kaṃ) E<sub>DH</sub> TVB<sub>G</sub> (khyab par byed pa yin la); shes bya tsam du khyab par byed pa yin la TVA<sub>D</sub> (°vyāpakam jñeyamātratvena)

<sup>29</sup> tāvad] K E<sub>DH</sub> TVA<sub>D</sub> (re zhig); *no reflex in* TVB<sub>G</sub>

<sup>30</sup> śāntam] *corr.*; sāntam K E<sub>DH</sub>; *no reflex in* TIB

<sup>31</sup> saśrāvakāḥ] *em.*; saśrāvakā K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>32</sup> jyotirūpatvena] K; jyotirūpatvena E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>33</sup> prakāśamānatvāt] E<sub>DH</sub> (*em.*); prakāśamānat K

<sup>34</sup> nityatayā] E<sub>DH</sub>; anityatayā K TIB (mi rtag pa nyid kyis)

<sup>35</sup> śāntam] *corr.*; sāntam K E<sub>DH</sub>

kleśopakleśaśūnyatvena parikalpitatvāt. evaṃvidhaṃ sādhyam uṣanti kāmaya-  
nte.

saha śrāvakair vartante ye khaḍgajināḥ khaḍgaviṣṇānakalpā ekacāriṇo varga-  
cāriṇaś<sup>36</sup> ca pratyekabuddhāḥ te sādhyam icchanti. kīdrśam? rūpādyupadher virā-  
maṃ rūpavedanāsaṃjñāsaṃskāraviññānalakṣaṇānām upadhīnāṃ skandhānām vi-  
rāmaṃ vicchedam, nirodham iti yāvat. [E<sub>DH</sub> p. 134] etad uktaṃ bhavati—sarvaśrā-  
vakapratyekabuddhāḥ sopadhiśeṣanirupadhiśeṣabhedenā bhinne ’pi nirvāṇe<sup>37</sup> ni-  
rupadhiśeṣam eva nirvāṇaṃ sā[K fol. 3v]kṣātkartavyatvena sādhyam pratipa-  
nnāḥ.

## 5 pāramitānayavādināṃ caturvidhaṃ sādhyam

idāniṃ pāramitānayavādināṃ abhimataṃ<sup>38</sup> caturvidhaṃ sādhyam āha—ākāraśū-  
nyam ityādi.

ākāraśūnyaṃ gaganendurūpaṃ  
pratyātmavedyaṃ karuṇārasaṃ ca |  
sallakṣaṇair bhūṣitaṃ<sup>39</sup> arthakāri  
dānādiniṣyandam apetasaukhyam || 5 ||  
sānandasallakṣaṇamaṇḍitāṅgaṃ  
sambhujyamānaṃ daśabhūmisamsthaiḥ |  
sattvārthakāri pravadanti sādhyam  
dānādiṣaṭpāramitānayasthāḥ || 6 ||

### 5.1 pāramitānaye prathamā sādhyam

ākārair nīlapītasukhaduḥkhādibhiś citrarūpaiḥ śūnyaṃ nirākāram. ata eva gaga-  
nasyeva nirākāratvenendor iva prabhāsvaratvena rūpaṃ svabhāvo yasya tat ta-  
thā. pratyātmavedyam iti svasaṃvedanaikavedyam.<sup>40</sup> karuṇā duḥkhā<sup>41</sup> duḥkha-  
hetor vā sakalajagadabhyuddharaṇakāmātā.<sup>42, xiii</sup> saiva rasaḥ svabhāvo yasya tat

<sup>xiii</sup> This definition can be found in various older sources, such as the *Pramāṇavārttikavṛtti*. Possi-  
bly in the *Sāramañjarī*?

<sup>36</sup> vargacāriṇaś] K (cf. *Abhidharmakośabhāṣya*); vanacāriṇaś E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>37</sup> nirvāṇe] E<sub>DH</sub>; nirvāṇa° K

<sup>38</sup> abhimataṃ] E<sub>DH</sub>; abhimata K

<sup>39</sup> bhūṣitaṃ] E<sub>DH</sub>; bhuṣitaṃ K

<sup>40</sup> svasaṃvedanaikavedyam] E<sub>DH</sub> (*em.*) (°vedyam); svasaṃvedyanaikavedyam K

<sup>41</sup> karuṇā duḥkhā] K; karuṇāduḥkhā° E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>42</sup> abhyuddharaṇakāmātā] *em.*; °atyuddharaṇakāmātā K E<sub>DH</sub>



tathoktam. etad uktaṃ bhavati—nilapītādicitrākāśūnyaṃ nirābhāsaṃ<sup>43</sup> nira-  
ñjanaṃ<sup>xiv</sup> gaganopamaṃ svacchaṃ sakalajagadarthakāri<sup>xv</sup> mahākaruṇāyuktaṃ  
pratyātmavedyaṃ pāramitopadeśaśabdābhidheyaṃ sādhyam iti pāramitānaye pra-  
thamaṃ sādhyam.

## 5.2 pāramitānaye dvitīyaṃ sādhyam

śobhanāni ca tāni lakṣaṇāni ca dvātriṃśallakṣaṇasaṃjñakānīti.<sup>44</sup> tair bhūṣitaṃ.  
arthaṃ janānāṃ prajojanaṃ kartuṃ śīlaṃ svabhāvo yasya tad arthakāri.<sup>45</sup> dānā-  
dīnāṃ daśapāramitānāṃ niṣyandaṃ tatprakarṣaprabhavatvena sadṛśaṃ phalam.  
duḥkhasya pūrvam eva prahīnatvāt sākṣātkaraṇāvasthāyāṃ<sup>46, xvi</sup> saukhyasyāpy  
abhāvāt<sup>47</sup> upekṣārūpatvenāpetasaukhyam apagatasaukhyam. etad uktaṃ bha-  
vati—dvātriṃśallakṣaṇadharāśītyanuvyañjanavirājitaśarīraṃ sakalajagadarthakāri  
dānādīpāramitābhyāsa<sup>†</sup>balenātmānaṃ<sup>48†</sup>samyaksaṃbuddharūpaṃ sukhaduḥkha-  
rahitatvenopekṣārūpaṃ dvitīyaṃ sādhyam.

## 5.3 pāramitānaye tṛtīyaṃ sādhyam

[E<sub>DH</sub> p. 135] sānandetyādi. sahānandena vartata iti sā[K fol. 4r]nandam. sāna-  
ndaṃ ca tat sallakṣaṇamaṇḍitāṅgaṃ ca<sup>49</sup> sambhujyamānaṃ dharmadeśanādvā-  
reṇopajīvyamānaṃ.<sup>50</sup> kaiḥ? daśabhūmīśvaraiḥ, pariśiṣṭabhūmisthitānāṃ<sup>51</sup> ago-

<sup>xiv</sup> See also in *Amṛtakaṇika* and *Kāllotara mahātantra* for instances of the pair *nirābhāsaṃ nira-  
ñjanaṃ*. One word is probably acceptable as a *viśeṣaṇasamāsa*.

<sup>xv</sup> sakalajagadarthakāri can also be read in compound with mahākaruṇā°. This is reflected in both  
Tibetan translations: 'gro ba ma lus pa'i don byed pa'i snying rje chen po

<sup>xvi</sup> ISAACSON (personal communication) proposes *sākṣātkaraṇāvasthāyāṃ* or *sākṣātkṛtyāvasthā-  
yāṃ* as potentially superior readings.

In support of the former, see *Samkṣīpābhīṣekavidhi: tadanantaram ekatathatāmatena tayaiva  
bhinnamate tv ānayā svasaṃviditajñānasākṣātkaraṇāvasthāyāṃ pūrvoktagāthayā adhyeṣitavate  
śiṣyāya tatpāṇau tasyāḥ pāṇiṃ pratisthāpya |*

<sup>43</sup> nirābhāsaṃ] *em.*; nirābhāsa K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>44</sup> °saṃjñakānīti] *conj.* (ISAACSON); °saṃjñakāni ceti K E<sub>DH</sub>; mdzes pa'i mtshan sum cu rtsa gnyis  
zhes bya ste TIB

<sup>45</sup> tad arthakāri] K E<sub>DH</sub>; de ni de'i don mdzad pa'o TIB (tad tadarthakāri)

<sup>46</sup> sākṣātkaraṇāvasthāyāṃ] *conj.* (ISAACSON); sākṣātkṛtāvasthāyāṃ E<sub>DH</sub>; sākṣātkṛtāvasthāyāṃ  
K

<sup>47</sup> abhāvāt] *em.* (ISAACSON); abhāvatvāt K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>48</sup> °balenātmānaṃ] K E<sub>DH</sub>; stobs kyis bdag nyid TVAD; stobs kyis byung ba TVBG

<sup>49</sup> sallakṣaṇamaṇḍitāṅgaṃ ca] *em.* (ISAACSON); sallakṣaṇamaṇḍitāṅgaṃ K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>50</sup> °opajīvyamānaṃ] K E<sub>DH</sub>; nye bar longs spyod par gyur pa'o TIB (°opabhujyamānaṃ)

<sup>51</sup> pariśiṣṭabhūmi°] *corr.*; pariśiṣṭa bhūmi° E<sub>DH</sub>

caratvāt. daśabhūmiprāptair avalokiteśvaramañjuśrīprabhṛtibhir upabhuḥyamānam iti yāvat. etad uktaṃ bhavati—śuddhāvāso pari ghanavyūhasaṃjñake<sup>52</sup> samyaksaṃbuddhabhuvane yathā bhagavān ānandarūpaḥ sambhogakāyātmā nirmāṇadvāreṇa<sup>53</sup> sakalajagadarthasampādakaḥ śrāvaka-pratyekabuddhanavabhūmīśvarair apy adṛśyaśarīro daśabhūmīśvarair eva paraṃ bodhisattvair<sup>54</sup> dharmāśravaṇadvāreṇopabhuḥyamāna<sup>55</sup> āsaṃsāraṃ cakāsti, tathaiva tat sādhyam iti tṛtiyam.

#### 5.4 pāramitānaye caturthaṃ sādhyam

sampūrya dānādiguṇān aśeṣān  
saṃbuddhakṛtyaṃ<sup>56</sup> sakalam ca kṛtvā |  
yad bhūtakoteḥ karaṇaṃ ca sāksāt  
sādhyam tad apy asti nirodharūpam || 7 ||

sampūryetyādi. dānādipāramitā eva guṇā, guṇyante 'bhyasyanta iti kṛtvā. tān sampūrya paripūrṇān<sup>57</sup> kṛtvā, yat saṃbuddhānāṃ kṛtyaṃ sakalam<sup>58, xvii</sup> avaśyakartavyaṃ kṛtsnaṃ tad api kṛtvā, bhūtakoteḥ śūnyatālakṣaṇāyāś citta-caittanirodhātmikāyā<sup>59</sup> yat sāksāt karaṇaṃ tad api sādhyam astīti pāramitānayasthā evaṃ bruvate caturthaṃ sādhyam iti.

<sup>xvii</sup> The manuscript reading of simply *sakalam* instead of *kṛtyaṃ sakalam* is asymmetrical given the following gloss, *avaśyakartavyaṃ kṛtsnaṃ*. Here Tib. reads simply *nges par mdzad par bya ba ma lus pa*, reflecting only the gloss and neither *sakalam* of the Sanskrit nor the conjecture *kṛtyaṃ sakalam*. It is also possible that *sakalam* is a mistaken scribal addition, but it's also possible that even if the Tibetan translators saw *kṛtyaṃ sakalam*, they chose not to render this because of the superfluous sounding result in Tibetan.

<sup>52</sup> °saṃjñake] *em.*; °saṃjñako K; °saṃjñakaḥ E<sub>DH</sub> (*em.*)

<sup>53</sup> nirmāṇadvāreṇa] K E<sub>DH</sub>; sprul pa'i sku'i sgo nas TIB (nirmāṇakāyadvāreṇa)

<sup>54</sup> paraṃ bodhisattvair] K E<sub>DH</sub> (°sattvair); mchog tu gyur pa'i byang chub sems dpa' TIB (parama-bodhisattvair)

<sup>55</sup> bhuḥyamāna] *em.*; bhuḥyamānam K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>56</sup> saṃbuddhakṛtyaṃ] *em.* (cf. TaRaA-V: saṃbuddhānāṃ ... avaśyakartavyaṃ kṛtsnaṃ); saṃbuddhya kṛtyaṃ K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>57</sup> paripūrṇān] *em.*; paripūrṇaṃ K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>58</sup> kṛtyaṃ sakalam] *conj.*; sakalam K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>59</sup> citta-caitta] E<sub>DH</sub> (*em.*); citta-caitya° K

## 6 mantranaye saptavidhaṃ sādhyam

### 6.1 mantranaye prathamam sādhyam

idānīm mantranayopadiṣṭam saptavidhaṃ<sup>60</sup> sādhyam kathayitum āha—svābhāṅganetyādi.

svābhāṅganāśleṣi<sup>61</sup> janārthakāri<sup>62</sup>  
duḥkhaiḥ sukhaiś caiva vimuktirūpam |  
aśītyanuvyañjanabhūṣitāṅgam  
apetakalpam pravadanti sādhyam || 8 ||

svābhāṅganām<sup>63</sup> āśleṣitum śīlam svabhāvo yasya tat svābhāṅganāśleṣi.<sup>64</sup> [E<sub>DH</sub> p. 136] apetakalpam vyapagatakalpam, kalpanārahitam iti yāvat. anyat subodham. ayam arthaḥ—samāliṅgitasvābhāṅganāśleṣi jagadarthakāri<sup>65, xviii</sup> dvātriṃśallakṣaṇavibhūṣitaśarīram<sup>66</sup> upekṣārūpam<sup>67</sup> prathamam sādhyam.

### 6.2 mantranaye dvitīyam sādhyam

svadevatākāraviśeṣaśūnyam  
prāḡ eva sambhāvya sukham sphuṭam sat |  
mahāsukhākhyam jagadarthakāri  
cintāmaṇiprakhyam uvāca kaścit || 9 ||

<sup>xviii</sup> The compound °svābhāṅganāśleṣajagadarthakāri is strinckly speaking not impossible, and could be read as a kind of instrumental *tatpuruṣa*, for example; however, given that this is a prose explanation of the verse, there is no need for the author to use such a compound and it seems mostly likely that the scribe left off the *ikāra*.

<sup>60</sup> saptavidhaṃ] E<sub>DH</sub> (Tib: rnam pa bdun); caturtham K

<sup>61</sup> svābhāṅganāśleṣi E<sub>DH</sub> (*corr.*); svābhāṅganāśleṣi K

<sup>62</sup> janārthakāri] *conj.* (Tib: 'gro ba yi don mdzad; TaRaA-V: jagadarthakāri); ta..rthakāri K (*akṣara uncertain, perhaps gna or mva*); tadarthakāri E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>63</sup> svābhāṅganām] E<sub>DH</sub> (*corr.*); svābhāṅganām K

<sup>64</sup> svābhāṅganāśleṣi] *corr.*; svābhāṅganāśleṣi K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>65</sup> °svābhāṅganāśleṣi jagadarthakāri] *conj.* (TVB<sub>G</sub>: nyid dang mtshungs pa'i lha mos 'khyud pa can 'gro ba'i don mdzad pa); °svābhāṅganāśleṣajagadarthakāri K E<sub>DH</sub>; nyid dang mtshungs pa'i lha mos 'khyud pa can | 'gro ba ma lus pa'i don mdzad pa TVA<sub>D</sub> (°svābhāṅganāśleṣy aśeṣajagadarthakāri)

<sup>66</sup> śarīram] E<sub>DH</sub>; śarīra K

<sup>67</sup> upekṣārūpam] K E<sub>DH</sub>; btang snyoms kyi ngo bo du 'khor ba ji srid du bzhugs pa (ji srid bzhugs pa] TVA<sub>D</sub>; ju bzhugs pa TVB<sub>G</sub>) mngon du bya ba yin no zhe bya ba TIB (upekṣārūpam āsaṃsāra-sthāyi sāksātkriyata iti)

svadevatetyādi. svadevatākāraviśeṣeṇa<sup>68</sup> sveṣṭadevatākāreṇa śūnyam, nirākāram iti yāvat. prāḡ eva prathamataram<sup>69</sup> upadeśānantaram eva<sup>70</sup> devatākāranirapekṣam sukham sambhāvya, bhāvanayā sāksāt kṛtvā, sphuṭam<sup>71,xix</sup> sphu[K fol. 4v] ṭikṛtam san mahāsukhasamjñakam bhavati. tac ca jagadarthakāri cintāmaṇisa-mānarūpam. etad uktaṃ bhavati—upadeśānantaram eva mantramudrādevatākā-rarahitam<sup>72</sup> bhāvanayā sphuṭikṛtam mahāsukhasamjñakam cintāmaṇivaj jagada-rthakāri māyopamam āsaṃsārasthāyi dvitīyaṃ sādhyam.

### 6.3 mantranaye tṛtīyaṃ sādhyam

kṛtvā sāksāt svādhipaṃ [K fol. 1v] satarūpaṃ  
paścāt tyaktvā sātāmātraṃ phalaṃ syāt |  
śuddhaṃ sāksāc chakyate naiva kartuṃ  
tenākāro bhāvitaḥ svādhipasya || 10 ||

kṛtvetyādi. svādhipaṃ sveṣṭadaivataṃ sāksāt kṛtvāmukhikṛtya satarūpaṃ sukhai-kasvabhāvam, paścād devatākāraṃ parityajya, sukhamātraṃ<sup>73</sup> phalaṃ sādhyam vyavasthitaṃ syāt.

nanu yadi<sup>74</sup> sāksāt kṛtvāpi devatākāras tyaktavyaḥ, tarhi prathamam eva ka-smād [E<sub>DH</sub> p. 137] vibhāvitaḥ? sukhamātraṃ eva dvitīyasādhyavat kiṃ na vibhā-vitam?<sup>75</sup> kiṃ vṛthāprayāsenety<sup>76</sup> āha—śuddham ityādi. śuddhaṃ kevalaṃ devatā-kāravirahitaṃ sukhamātraṃ naiva sāksāt kartuṃ śakyate, ākārarahitasya sukha-syānopalambhāt. tasmāt tena kāraṇenākāro bhāvitaḥ svādhipasyeti tṛtīyam.<sup>77</sup> a-

<sup>xix</sup> The understanding reflected in TIB, namely *asphuṭam* instead of *sphuṭam*, is an alternative word division and also yields sense. It seems more likely, however, that the author is glossing *sphuṭam*.

<sup>68</sup> svadevatā°] Σ<sub>TVA<sub>D</sub></sub>; lha TVA<sub>D</sub> (devatā°)

<sup>69</sup> prathamataram] K; prathamataro° E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>70</sup> upadeśānantaram eva] E<sub>DH</sub> (*em.*); upadeśāntaram eva K; bshad ma thag pa'i TIB (anantarokta°)

<sup>71</sup> sphuṭam] K; *deest in* E<sub>DH</sub>; ma gsal ba TIB

<sup>72</sup> °rahitaṃ] Σ<sub>TVA<sub>D</sub></sub>; spangs te | bde ba 'ba' zhig tsam TVA<sub>D</sub> (°rahitaṃ sukhamātraṃ)

<sup>73</sup> sukhamātraṃ] *em.*; sukhamātra° K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>74</sup> nanu yadi] *conj.*; nanu K E<sub>DH</sub>; gal te TVA<sub>D</sub> ([nanu] yadi); TVB<sub>G</sub>: *not clearly rendered*

<sup>75</sup> vibhāvitaṃ] *em.*; vibhāvitaḥ E<sub>DH</sub> (*em.*); vibhāgato K

<sup>76</sup> vṛthāprayāsenety] E<sub>DH</sub>; vyathāprayāsenety K

<sup>77</sup> tṛtīyam] *em.* TVB<sub>G</sub> (gsum pa yin no); tṛtīyaḥ K E<sub>DH</sub>; bsgrub par bya ba gsum pa yin no TVA<sub>D</sub> (tṛtīyaṃ sādhyam)

yam arthaḥ<sup>78</sup>—devatākārasaṃvalitam eva sukhaṃ vibhāvya, sākṣādbhūte deva-  
tākāraṃ tyaktvā, sukhamātram eva sādhyam uktaguṇam.

#### 6.4 mantranaye caturthaṃ sādhyam

gagaṇasamaśarīraṃ lakṣaṇair bhūṣitāṅgaṃ  
nirupamasukhapūrṇaṃ<sup>79</sup> svābhayā saṃgataṃ ca |  
sphuradamitamunīndraiḥ<sup>80</sup> sarvasattvārthakāri  
pravadati punar anyāḥ sādhyam ucchedaśūnyam || 11 ||

gagaṇetyādi. gagaṇasamaṃ māyopamaṃ vicārāsahaṃ<sup>81</sup> śarīraṃ yasya. lakṣaṇair  
dvātriṃśadbhir aśītibhiś cānuvyañjanair maṇḍitāny aṅgāni yasya. nirupamaiḥ  
sthaulya<sup>82</sup> nairantaryā<sup>83</sup> saṃsāra<sup>84</sup> pravāhitvanirāsravatvādibhir upamābhāvād u-  
pamātikrāntaiḥ sukhaiḥ pūrṇaṃ romāgraparyantaṃ<sup>85,xx</sup> saṃpūrṇaṃ. svābhayā  
ca tathābhūtayā saṃgataṃ samāliṅgitam. sphuradbhir anantanirmitair munīndrais  
tathābhūtair eva sarvasattvārthakāri.<sup>86</sup> ucchedeneti nirodhena śūnyam tucchaṃ  
riktam.<sup>87</sup>

etad uktaṃ bhavati—gaganamāyāmarīci<sup>88</sup> gandharvanagarodakacandraprati-  
bimbaspvapnopamaṃ<sup>89</sup> [K fol. 5r] ekānekabhāvābhāvagrāhyagrāhakasvabhāvāra-

<sup>xx</sup> See a similar expression in *Siddhaikavīrasādhana* (author unknown): *tato niḥsṛtaraśmibhir ā-  
pādataḥlād vālāgraparyāntaprāptaṃ bhāvya* (*Sādhanaṃālā* no. 67, p. 67); *de las byung ba'i 'od  
zer gyis rkang pa'i mthil nas skra'i rtse mo'i mthar thug pa khyab par bsgoms te* (Tōh. 3461 fol.  
116r)

<sup>78</sup> arthaḥ] E<sub>DH</sub>; artha K

<sup>79</sup> nirupama°] E<sub>DH</sub>; nirupama° K

<sup>80</sup> °munīndraiḥ] *em.*; °munīndraiḥ K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>81</sup> māyopamaṃ vicārāsahaṃ] K (*reading slightly unclear*); māyopamavicārāsaha E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>82</sup> sthaulya°] K E<sub>DH</sub>; rgya nom pa nyid dang | rgya che ba nyid dang TVA<sub>D</sub> (praṇītatvasthaulya°);  
lhun che ba nyid dang | TVB<sub>G</sub> (sthaulya°)

<sup>83</sup> °nairantaryā°] E<sub>DH</sub> (*em.*) (TIB: bar med pa nyid dang); °nairuttaryā° K

<sup>84</sup> °āsaṃsāra°] *em.*; °āsaṃsāraṃ E<sub>DH</sub> K

<sup>85</sup> pūrṇaṃ romāgraparyantaṃ] *conj.* (TIB: gang ba ni | ba spu rtse mo'i mthar thug pa); pūrṇaṃ  
masimāgrapayantaṃ K; pūrṇatām samāśrayantaṃ E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>86</sup> sarvasattvārtha°] K E<sub>DH</sub> (TVB<sub>G</sub>: sems can thams cad kyi don); sems can gyi don TVA<sub>D</sub> (sattvā-  
rtha°)

<sup>87</sup> tucchaṃ riktam] K; bhūsthaṃ riktam E<sub>DH</sub>; spangs pa'o TIB (tucchaṃ / riktam)

<sup>88</sup> māyāmarīci°] K E<sub>DH</sub> (TVB<sub>G</sub>: sgyu ma dang | smig rgyu dang |); sgyu ma dang | smig rgyu dang  
| smig rgyu dang | TVA<sub>D</sub> (māyāmarīcīndrajāla° / māyendrajālamarīci°)

<sup>89</sup> °svapnopamaṃ] E<sub>DH</sub>; svapnāpayam K

hitam anādyantam aśeṣavastusaṃdohasvabhāvam<sup>90</sup> anābhāsam nirañjanam sarvopamātikrāntam paramasūkṣmātigambhīraprajñārūpatayā dharmakāyasvabhāvam, dvātriṃśallakṣaṇavibhūṣitaśarīram aśītyanuvyañjanavirājitagātram<sup>91</sup> paramaśṛṅgārayauvanādyupetaṃ svābhāṅganālīṅgitāṅgaṃ rūpavajrādītārāparyanta-devīgaṇair anantaprabhedānimittarati<sup>92</sup> svarūpaparamānandopabhogadvāreṇa<sup>xxi</sup> pratibimbavat [E<sub>DH</sub> p. 138] sambhujyamānam karuṇāsaṃvalitodārarūpatayā sambhogakāyarūpam, nānādhimuktivineyajanaparipācanārtham anekavidhaprātihāryadvāreṇa<sup>93</sup> nirmittānantakulāntarbhūtasambuddhabodhisattvaspharaṇasaṃhārakāritvena<sup>94</sup> nirmāṇakāyātmakam, śūnyatākaruṇābhinnabodhicitta<sup>95</sup> svabhāvāmalaprajñopāyasamādhisambhūtasatsukhāpūrṇam<sup>xxii</sup> āsaṃsārasthitidharmam<sup>96</sup> apratiṣṭhitanirvāṇarūpaṃ nirmalanivātaniścalapradīpaśikhāprabandhanityatayā nirodhaśūnyaṃ caturthaṃ<sup>97</sup> sādhyam.

## 6.5 mantranaye pañcamam sādhyam

kṛtvā sāksāt svādhipaṃ sātārūpaṃ  
tyaktvopekṣājñānamātram<sup>98</sup> phalaṃ syāt |

<sup>xxi</sup> See parallels in *Samantabhadrasādhana* for \*animittarati / mtshan ma med pa'i dga' ba.

From *rūpavajrā* up to *dvāreṇa*, TVA<sub>D</sub> reads : gzugs rdo rje la sogs pa nas | sgrol ma'i mthar thug pa'i lha mo'i tshogs kyis mtshan ma med pa'i dga' ba'i rang gi ngo bo'i rab tu dbye ba dpag tu med pas mchog tu dga' ba la nye bar longs skyod pa'i sgo nas. TVB<sub>G</sub> reads: gzugs rdo rje la sogs pa nas sgrol ma'i mthar thug pa'i lha mo'i tshogs kyis mtshan ma med pa'i rang gi ngo bo'i rab tu dpag tu med pas mchog tu dga' ba la nye bar longs spyod pa'i sgo nas.

<sup>xxii</sup> See Sahajavilāsa, *Svādhiṣṭhānakurukullāsādhana* (SāMā no. 183, p. 383): tataḥ prajñopāyāmalasamādhisambhūtasatsukhāpūrṇam iva svadeham trailokya ca paśyet.

<sup>90</sup> anādyantam aśeṣavastusaṃdohasvabhāvam] K E<sub>DH</sub>; thog ma dang tha ma med pa'i dngos po ma lus pa'i rang bzhin TVA<sub>D</sub> TVB<sub>G</sub> (anādyantāśeṣavastusvabhāvam)

<sup>91</sup> °gātram] K E<sub>DH</sub>; no reflex in TIB

<sup>92</sup> anantaprabhedānimittarati] conj. (TVA<sub>D</sub>: mtshan ma med pa'i dga' ba'i rang gi ngo bo'i rab tu dbye ba dpag tu med pas); anantaprabhedānimittārati° KE<sub>DH</sub>; mtshan ma med pa'i rang gi ngo bo'i rab tu dpag tu med pas TVB<sub>G</sub>

<sup>93</sup> anekavidhaprātihārya°] K E<sub>DH</sub>; rdzu 'phrul dang cho 'phrul rnam pa du ma TVA<sub>D</sub> TVB<sub>G</sub> (anekaṛddhiprātihārya°)

<sup>94</sup> °bodhisattva°] conj. (TVB<sub>G</sub>: byang chub sems dpa'i); °bodhi° K E<sub>DH</sub>; byang chub sems dpa' la sogs pa'i TVA<sub>D</sub> (°bodhisattvādi°)

<sup>95</sup> °bodhicitta°] E<sub>DH</sub>; °bodhicittā° K

<sup>96</sup> conj. (cf. Tib: chos can); dharmāṇām K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>97</sup> caturthaṃ] E<sub>DH</sub>; caturtha K

<sup>98</sup> tyaktvopekṣā°] K (E<sub>DH</sub> incorrectly reports as tyajyo°) (see commentary); bhāvopekṣā° E<sub>DH</sub> (em.); no reflex in TM<sub>D</sub>

āsaṃsārasthāyi sattvārthakāri  
cintā<sup>99</sup>ratnaprakhyam<sup>100</sup> ekāntaśāntam || 12 ||

kṛtvetyādi. sāksāt svādhipaṃ kṛtvā, paścāt<sup>101</sup> tyaktvā, upekṣārūpaṃ yaj jñānaṃ tanmātraṃ<sup>xxiii</sup> sādhyam syāt. anyat sugamam.<sup>102</sup> etad uktaṃ bhavati—maṇḍalacrarūpaṃ sāksāt kṛtvā, paścāt tan nirodhya, upekṣājñānamātraṃ sādhyam syāt pañcamam.

## 6.6 mantranaye ṣaṣṭhamam sādhyam

kṛtvā sāksān maṇḍalaṃ sātārūpaṃ  
paścāt tasya svecchayā nirvṛtiś<sup>103</sup> ca|  
sattvārthasyāpy asty abhāvo na vāsmiṃ  
prādurbhāvo nirvṛtād<sup>104</sup> asti yasmāt || 13 ||

kṛtvetyādi. kṛtvā sāksān maṇḍalaṃ sātasaṃvalitam,<sup>105</sup> tasya svecchayā nirvṛtir nirodhaḥ.

nanu yadi sāksāt kṛtvāpi paścāt svecchayā nirodhayita[K fol. 5v]vyam,<sup>106</sup> tadā karuṇāyā anekakālābhyastāyā abhāvaḥ syāt. tasyāś cābhāvāt sattvārthābhāvaḥ [E<sub>DH</sub> p. 139] syād ity āsaṅkyāha—sattvārthasyāpy asty abhāvo na vetyādi. asmiṃ pakṣe sattvārthābhāvo nāsti, yasmān nirvṛtāc cakrāt karuṇāsaṃvalitāt sattvārthasya prādurbhāvo 'sti.<sup>xxiv</sup>

etenaitad evāha—sātasampūrṇacakram sāksāt kṛtvā, yāvad iṣṭaṃ kālaṃ vyavasthāpya, paścāt tasya sarvathaiva pradīpavan nirodhaṃ kṛtvā sthātavyam. yadā punaḥ sattvārthābhilāṣo bhavati, tadā niruddhād eva cakrāntaram utpādyā sattvārthaḥ kartavyaḥ. cakrāntarotpāde<sup>107</sup> 'pi ciraniruddhād<sup>108</sup> eva cakrād yathābhavyatayā<sup>109</sup> vineyānāṃ yathābhilaṣitaprāptir bhavatīti ṣaṣṭham.

<sup>xxiii</sup> tanmātraṃ] check: in compound or not

<sup>xxiv</sup> TIB suggests reading *karuṇāsaṃvalitasya*: 'gags pa'i 'khor lo las snying rje'i rang bzhin can sems can gyi don ('gags pa'i] TVB<sub>G</sub>; 'gog pa'i TVA<sub>D</sub>)

<sup>99</sup> cintā°] K<sup>pc</sup> E<sub>DH</sub>; cittā° K<sup>ac</sup>

<sup>100</sup> °prakhyam] E<sub>DH</sub>; °prakhyamṃ K

<sup>101</sup> paścāt] E<sub>DH</sub>; paścāta K

<sup>102</sup> sugamam] E<sub>DH</sub>; sūgamam K

<sup>103</sup> nirvṛtiś] K; nirvṛtiṃ] E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>104</sup> nirvṛtād] E<sub>DH</sub>; nivṛtād K

<sup>105</sup> sātasaṃvalitam] *em.* (TIB: bde ba'i rang bzhin can); sātaṃ saṃvalitam K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>106</sup> nirodhayitavyam] *em.*; nirodhayitavyaḥ K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>107</sup> cakrāntarotpāde] E<sub>DH</sub>; cakrāntaropāde K

<sup>108</sup> ciraniruddhād] *em.* (TIB: rin du 'gags pa'i); citaniruddhād K; cittaniruddhād E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>109</sup> yathābhavyatayā] *variant word division in* E<sub>DH</sub>: yathā bhavyatayā

## 6.7 mantranaye saptamaṃ sādhyam

kṛtvā sphuṭaṃ rūpaṃ abhiṣṭaṃ eṣaṃ  
paścān nirodhaḥ<sup>110,xxv</sup> phalaṃ āha kaścīt |  
abhinnarūpaś ca yato nirodho  
na pakṣabhede 'pi tato 'sti bhedaḥ || 14 ||

kṛtvetyādi. ṣaṇṇāṃ pakṣāṇāṃ anyatamasya phalasya<sup>111</sup> sādhyatvād yad yad evābhiṣṭaṃ<sup>112</sup> tad<sup>113</sup> eva sāksāt kṛtvā, paścāt sarvathaiva pradīpavan nirodha uttara-kālaṃ sattvārthādisūnyaḥ sāksāt kartavyaḥ.

nanu ṣaṭpakṣabhedena ṣaḍ eva<sup>114</sup> nirodhāḥ syuḥ. tat katham eka eva nirodha ity āśaṅkyāha—abhinnetyādi. abhinnaṃ<sup>115</sup> rūpaṃ yasya sa tathā.<sup>116</sup> na hi nirodhānāṃ ṣaṭpakṣalakṣaṇabhede 'pi bhedo 'sti, abhāvaika-rūpatayā nirodhasya samānatvāt. ayam arthaḥ—anyatamapakṣaṃ sāksāt kṛtvā paścāt tasya santāno-cchedarūpo nirodha iti saptamaṃ sādhyam.

## 7 caturthe 'bhiṣekase vipratipattiḥ

### 7.1 caturthaseke vipratipattiḥ prathamā

prajñājñānād uttaraṃ bodhicittā-  
svādas turyaṃ sekam<sup>117</sup> āhāvaraṃ tat |  
yasmāt<sup>118</sup> sarvo bhāvanāsu prayāso  
vyarthaḥ prāptas tatphalasya prasiddheḥ || 15 ||

<sup>xxv</sup> It is possible to take *phala* as the direct object of  $\sqrt{ah}$  and then read *nirodhaṃ*, construing it as an accusative form; however, the agent of  $\sqrt{kr}$  and  $\sqrt{ah}$  would have to be the same. Rather, with the reading *nirodhaḥ phalaṃ*, we can avoid this problem and simply supply an *iti*.

<sup>110</sup> nirodhaḥ] *em.*; nirodha(ṃ) K (*this may be corrected to h*); nirodhaṃ E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>111</sup> anyatamasya phalasya] *conj.*; arthaphalasya K E<sub>DH</sub>; nang nas 'bras bu TIB

<sup>112</sup> phalasya sādhyatvād yad yad evābhiṣṭaṃ] K E<sub>DH</sub>; 'bras bu bsgrub bya gang kho na TVA<sub>D</sub> (phalaṃ yad eva); bsgrub bya gang kho na mngon par 'dod pa TVB<sub>G</sub> (phalaṃ yad evābhiṣṭaṃ);

<sup>113</sup> tad] E<sub>DH</sub>; sad K

<sup>114</sup> ṣaḍ eva] E<sub>DH</sub>; ṣatreva K

<sup>115</sup> abhinnaṃ] E<sub>DH</sub>; abhinna K

<sup>116</sup> sa tathā] *em.*; tat tathā K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>117</sup> sekam] E<sub>DH</sub>; seṣam K

<sup>118</sup> yasmāt] E<sub>DH</sub>; paścāt K



[E<sub>DH</sub> p. 140] prajñājñānetyādi. prajñājñānopadeśād uttarakālaṃ<sup>119</sup> yat bodhicittasyāmṛtarūpasya<sup>120</sup> rasanayā grahaṇam, tat turyaṃ caturthaṃ [K fol. 6r] sekam āha kaścīt. tac cāvaraṃ hīnam, vinikṛṣṭam iti yāvat. kasmād avaram? yasmāt sarvaprāyāso mantramudrādevatādyākārabhāvanāsu punaḥ punar anuṣṭhānalakṣaṇas tathāgatokto<sup>121</sup> vyarthaḥ prāptaḥ.<sup>xxvi</sup> kutaḥ? tatphalasya bhāvanāsādhyasya phalasya bodhicittāsvādakāla eva prasiddhatvāt prāptatvāt, anyasya viśiṣṭasya phalasyābhāvād iti yāvat.

## 7.2 caturthaseke vipratipattir dvitīyā

prajñājñānād uttaraṃ prāptarāmāsvādas turyaṃ sekam āhādhamam tat |  
yasmāt sarvo bhāvanādao prayatno  
buddhoddiṣṭo niṣphalaḥ saṃprasaktaḥ || 16 ||

prajñetyādi. prajñājñānād uttarakālaṃ yāḥ prāptā yathāmlitā rāmāḥ striyas tā-sāṃ samāpattidvāreṇa<sup>122</sup> ya āsvādaḥ, tat turyaṃ sekam. tad apy adhamam. śeṣaṃ gatārtham.

## 7.3 āgamasya arthavyākhyānam

atha caturthaṃ tat punas tatheti<sup>123,xxvii</sup> vyākhyāyate. caturtham iti<sup>124</sup> prajñājñānam ṭṭīyam apekṣya caturtham ity ucyate. tad iti tacchabdena tad eva prajñājñā-

<sup>xxvi</sup> TIB reflects understanding two items that would be *vyartha*, perhaps suggesting another reading of the Sanskrit text: *gang gi phyir sngags dang phyag rgya dang | lha nyid la sogs pa'i rnam pa bsgom pa la yang dang yang du 'bad pa dang | gzhan yang de bzhin gshegs pas gsungs pa'i sgrub pa'i mtshan nyid don med pa thob par 'gyur ro* || 'Because it would follow that repeated effort in meditation ... and, what's more (*gzhan yang*; Skt. *ca?*), what is characterised as practice taught by the *tathāgatas*'.

<sup>xxvii</sup> *Samājottara* 112c

<sup>119</sup> prajñājñānopadeśād uttarakālaṃ] K E<sub>DH</sub>; shes rab dang ye shes ni shes rab ye shes te | dbang bskur ba'i bye brag go || phyis ni 'das pa'i 'og tu'o || gang zhe na | TVA<sub>D</sub> (prajñājñānetyādi. prajñā ca jñānam prajñājñānam sekaviśeṣaḥ. uttaram paścāt. kim iti); shes rab dang ye shes te | dbang bskur ba'i bye brag go || phyis te rdzogs pa'i dus kyi byang chub gang zhe na | TVB<sub>G</sub> (*text may have suffered from corruption after phyis*)

<sup>120</sup> bodhicittasyāmṛtarūpasya] *em.* (TVA<sub>D</sub>: byang chub kyi sems te); saṃ bodhicittasyāmṛtarūpasya K E<sub>DH</sub>; sems te TVB<sub>G</sub> (cittasya)

<sup>121</sup> tathāgatokto] K; tathāgatoktau E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>122</sup> samāpattidvāreṇa] E<sub>DH</sub>; rig pa'i sgo nas TVA<sub>D</sub>; reg pa'i sgo nas TVB<sub>G</sub> (sparṣadvāreṇa)

<sup>123</sup> punas tatheti] E<sub>DH</sub> (*em.*); punar iti K

<sup>124</sup> caturtham iti] K E<sub>DH</sub> TVA<sub>D</sub> (bzhi pa ni); deest in TVB<sub>G</sub>

nam tadrūpaṃ parāmrśyate. punar iti punaḥśabdena tasmād viśeṣaḥ. viśeṣaś cātra nirāsravaniruttarātyantasphītāvicchinnaṃprabandha<sup>125</sup> pravāhitvalakṣaṇaḥ.<sup>126</sup> tatheti tathāśabdena tādrśatvam abhidhīyate. tādrśatvaṃ ca yādrśyā prajñādiyuktayā<sup>127</sup> sāmagryā yādrśaṃ prajñājñānam utpannam, paścād api tādrśyaiva sāmagryā tathaiva cotpadyate, nānyatheti tathāśabdārthaḥ.

atra ca lakṣyalakṣaṇabhāvenārtho boddhavyaḥ. lakṣyate 'neneti lakṣaṇam anubhūyamānaṃ prajñājñānam, apratīyamānasya lakṣaṇatvāyogāt, nāgrhītaviśeṣaṇā [E<sub>DH</sub> p. 141] viśeṣyabuddhir iti nyāyāt. lakṣyate jñāyate pratipādyate 'neneti lakṣyaṃ sākṣāt kariṣyamānaṃ caturtham.

#### 7.4 caruthaseke vipratipattis tṛtīyā

atra caturtham nāstīty eke.<sup>xxviii</sup> nanu caturtham ity etad asti tatpadam.<sup>128</sup> tat katham nāstīty ucyate? satyam, upadeśasaṃrakṣārtham sattvavyāmohanāya ca tṛtīyam eva caturthaśabde [K fol. 6v] noktaṃ bhagavatā. anyathā tat punar iti noktaṃ syāt.<sup>xxix</sup>

tad atyantāsaṃgatam, caturthasya pramāṇasiddhasya pratipāditatvāt pratipādayiṣyamānatvāc ceti.<sup>xxx</sup>

<sup>xxviii</sup> TVA<sub>D</sub> adds near the beginning of this sentence *Samājottara* 112ab *abhiṣekaṃ tridhā bhedam asmin tanre prakalpitam* |: 'dir 'ga' zhig | dbang ni nram pa gsum dag tu | rgyud 'di las ni rab tu grags || zhes gsungs pas na | bzhi pa ni yang dag pa ma yin no zhe na |

<sup>xxix</sup> A portion seems to have dropped out from TVA<sub>D</sub>.

<sup>xxx</sup> Tib. discusses two further *paḥṣas* here: that the fourth referred to in the *Samājottara* is the four *aṅga* of *sevā* and so forth; and what appears to be the idea that the four initiation consists in the third accompanied by its fruits ('*bras bu dang bcas pa*).

<sup>125</sup> °niruttarātyantasphītāvicchinnaṃprabandha°] K; shin tu rgyas pa nyid rgyun mi chad par TVB<sub>G</sub> (°ātyantasphītāvicchinnaṃprabandha°); nirantarātyantasphītāvicchinnaṃprabandha° E<sub>DH</sub> (*em.*); shin tu rgyas pa nyid dang | bar chad med pa nyid dang | rgyun mi 'chad par TVA<sub>D</sub> (°ātyantasphītānirantarāvicchinnaṃprabandha°)

<sup>126</sup> °lakṣaṇaḥ] E<sub>DH</sub>; °lakṣaṇam K

<sup>127</sup> °yuktayā] *conj.* (TIB: dang ldan pa'i); °yuktyā K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>128</sup> nanu caturtham ity etad asti tatpadam] K (nanu caturtham ity etad asti | tat padan) E<sub>DH</sub>; de ltar de bzhi bzhi pa yang || zhes bya ba'i tshig bcom ldan 'das kyis gsungs pa yod pa ma yin nam | TVA<sub>D</sub> (caturtham tat punas tatheti padaṃ bhagavatā notkaṃ vā); de lta na de ma yin pa gzhan de ltar de bzhi bzhi pa yang zhes bya ba der bzhi pa zhes bya ba'i tshig bcom ldan 'das kyis gsungs pa yod pa ma yin nam | TVB<sub>G</sub> (nanu yadi evaṃ na syāt, tadā caturtham tat punas tatheti padaṃ bhagavatā noktaṃ vā)

## 7.5 lakṣyasya vicāraṇam

atra lakṣaṇaṃ prajñājnānaṃ pratītam eva sarvaiḥ. lakṣye<sup>129</sup> paraṃ vyāmohaḥ. tad vicāryate. lakṣyaṃ hi bhaved<sup>130</sup> artharūpaṃ vā syāt jñānarūpaṃ vā. na tāvad artharūpaṃ, arthasyaikasyābhāvāt, ekānekaviyogitvena pramāṇena tasya nirākṛtatvāt. mantranaye ca vijñānavādamadhyamakamatayor<sup>131</sup> eva pradhānatvād jñānarūpaṃ vā syāt. jñānaṃ ca sākāraṃ vā nirākāraṃ vā. sākāraṃ api citrādvaitarūpaṃ vā syād anekarūpaṃ vā syād iti vikalpāḥ.

### 7.5.1 sākārasya vijñānasya nirākaraṇam

tatra sākāravijñānaṃ sarvathaiva gagaṇakamalavan nāstīti nirākāravādinō bruvate. nanu nilapītaśuklādighaṭapaṭaśakaṭādi<sup>132</sup> rūpeṇākārāḥ<sup>133</sup> pratibhāsante<sup>134</sup> pratyakṣataḥ.<sup>xxxī</sup> te cārthasyābhāvād jñānarūpā eva. tat kathaṃ sākāraṃ nāstīti?<sup>xxxīī</sup> satyam. pratibhāsanta evākārāḥ, paraṃ alīkarūpeṇa. alīkarūpatā caikānekaviyogitvena<sup>135</sup> pramāṇalakṣaṇena<sup>136</sup> prasiddhā. tasya ca pramāṇasvarūpasyānyatra<sup>137</sup> kathitātvan neha<sup>138</sup> pratanyate. alīkatvaprasiddhā ca māyāmayā ivākārā bhrāntirūpāḥ prakāśante.<sup>139</sup> bhrāntinivṛttau ca nirākāraṃ eva<sup>140</sup> śuddhasphaṭikasamkāśaṃ pāramārthikaṃ<sup>141</sup> siddhaṃ bhavati.<sup>142</sup> ataś citrādvaitarūpaṃ anekarūpaṃ ca

<sup>xxxī</sup> TIB phrases this sentence as a rhetorical question, as if the Sanskrit started *kim na ....*

<sup>xxxīī</sup> TVA<sub>D</sub>'s expression of the argument runs differently: *don (rnam pa) de dag kyang med pa'i phyir shes pa'i ngo bo nyid kyang med yin na | de ji ltar rnam pa dang bcas pa ma yin zhe na* | 'Because those objects [i.e., *ākāras*] also do not exist, the nature of cognition too cannot exist. So how can cognition not have *ākāras*?'

<sup>129</sup> lakṣye] E<sub>DH</sub> (*em.*); lakṣyā K

<sup>130</sup> lakṣyaṃ hi bhaved] *conj.* (TIB: mtshon par bya ba yang srid na); lakṣyaṃ hi bhagavat K E<sub>DH</sub> (°gavad)

<sup>131</sup> matayor] E<sub>DH</sub>; tamayor K

<sup>132</sup> °śakaṭādi°] E<sub>DH</sub> (*em.*); °prakaṭādi° K

<sup>133</sup> °ākārāḥ] *conj.*; ((cā))kārāḥ K; vākārāḥ E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>134</sup> pratibhāsante] E<sub>DH</sub>; pratibhāṣante K

<sup>135</sup> °viyogitvena] *conj.* °viyogitva° K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>136</sup> °pramāṇalakṣaṇena] K E<sub>DH</sub> (TVB<sub>G</sub>: tshad ma'i mtshan nyid kyis); mtshan nyid kyis TVB<sub>G</sub> (°lakṣaṇena)

<sup>137</sup> pramāṇasvarūpasyā°] E<sub>DH</sub>; pramāṇa(((pe)))rūpasyā° K

<sup>138</sup> neha] E<sub>DH</sub>; eha K

<sup>139</sup> prakāśante] K (prakāśante); prakāśyante E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>140</sup> nirākāraṃ eva] K E<sub>DH</sub> TVB<sub>G</sub> (rnam pa med pa kho na); rnam pa med pa de kho na TVB<sub>G</sub> (nirākāraṃ eva tad)

<sup>141</sup> pāramārthikaṃ] E<sub>DH</sub> (*em.*); pārarthikaṃ K

<sup>142</sup> bhavati] K; bhavatīti E<sub>DH</sub>

sākāraṃ vijñānaṃ astīti vikalpadvayaṃ nirastaṃ bhavatīti.

### 7.5.2 nirākārasya vijñānasya samarthanam

nanu nirākāraṃ api vijñānaṃ upalabdhilakṣaṇaprāptaṃ svapne 'pi nopalabhyate. tat kathaṃ tad asti paramārthata<sup>143</sup> i[K fol. 7r]ty ucyate? ucyate. sukhākāraṃ vijñānaṃ antaḥparisphuradrūpaṃ nirākāraṃ saṃvedyata eva. nīlādyākārāḥ punar alikāḥ pratibhāsante. anyathā teṣāṃ satyatve sarva evākārāḥ satyāḥ syuḥ. tathā hi grāhyagrāhakabhāvādikam api satyaṃ [E<sub>DH</sub> p. 142] syāt. tataś ca sarveṣāṃ eva satyapratibhāsatvena muktiprasaṅgaḥ,<sup>144</sup> keṣāñcid api mithyāpratibhāsasya bhrāntirūpasyāpratibhāsanāt. tathā cōktaṃ—

draṣṭavyaṃ<sup>145</sup> bhūtato bhūtaṃ bhūtadarśi vimucyate |<sup>xxxiii</sup>

tasmād akāmakenāpi nīlādyākārāṇāṃ alikatvam evaiṣṭavyam. sukhādikam nirākāraṃ<sup>146</sup> satyam upalabhyate. tat kathaṃ nopalabhyata iti.

nanu sukhādyākāraṃ sākāraṃ eva vijñānaṃ<sup>147</sup> upalabhyate, sukhāder ākāra-svabhāvatvāt. na ca sukhādyākārasūnyaṃ jñānaṃ svapne 'pi saṃvedyate. sakalabhrāntivigamād aṣṭamyāṃ bhūmāv upalabdhilakṣaṇaprāptir bhavatīty atrāpi kośapānaṃ<sup>148</sup> vinā anyan na<sup>149</sup> pramāṇam asti prasādhakam iti. tad asat,<sup>150</sup> abhiprāyāparijñānāt, sukhādyākārasyaiva nīlādyākārarahitasya vijñānasya nirākāratveneṣṭatvāt. tac cedānīm eva svasaṃvedanapramāṇasiddhaṃ sakalapraṇa-bhṛtaṃ<sup>151</sup> astīti kathaṃ nopalabdhīḥ?

### 7.5.3 Establishing the Madhyamaka position

nanu tad<sup>152</sup> apy ekāneka-svabhāvaviyogād alikam eva bhrāntimātram, ekāneka-svabhāvarahitasya sākāranirākāravijñānavyāpītvāt.

<sup>xxxiii</sup> *Abhisamayālaṅkāra* 5.21; *Ratnagotravīghāṇa* 154; *Pratītyasamputpādahṛdayakārikā* 7; etc.

<sup>143</sup> paramārthata] *em.*; paramārtham K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>144</sup> muktiprasaṅgaḥ] *conj.*; yuktiprasaṅgāt K; muktiprasaṅgāt E<sub>DH</sub> (*em.*)

<sup>145</sup> draṣṭavyaṃ] E<sub>DH</sub>; draṣṭavya K

<sup>146</sup> nirākāraṃ] K E<sub>DH</sub>; rnam pa brdzun pa TIB (alikākāraṃ)

<sup>147</sup> sākāraṃ eva vijñānaṃ] *conj.* (TIB: rnam pa dang bcas pa'i kho na shes pa); eva vijñānaṃ K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>148</sup> kośapānaṃ] K (kosapānaṃ); śapathollaṅghanaṃ E<sub>DH</sub> (*em.*)

<sup>149</sup> anyan na] E<sub>DH</sub>; anyatra K

<sup>150</sup> tad asat] *conj.* (TIB: de ni bden pa ma yin te); tad K E<sub>DH</sub>; asat etat *possible conj.*

<sup>151</sup> °bhṛtaṃ] *em.*; °bhṛtām K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>152</sup> nanu tad K E<sub>DH</sub>; tat *possible conj.*

nanv anena nyāyena sakalasākāranirākāravijñānasyālikatvaprasāadhanān na kiñcid api pāramārthikaṃ vastutattvam asti.<sup>153</sup> tat kathaṃ lakṣyasya svarūpaṃ pramāṇata upalakṣayitavyam? naiṣa doṣaḥ, madhyamakamate pramāṇato 'likatāsiddhāv api māyopamapratibhāsamātrasyaikānekasvabhāvarahitasya dharmirūpasyāpratiṣedhāt. tatraiva cālike pratibhāsamātre lakṣyalakṣaṇasamsāranirvāṇa[K fol. 7v]maṇḍalacakrādibhāvanāsakalajagadarthakriyādīnām<sup>154</sup> avyāhatā vyavasthā<sup>155</sup> sidhyati.<sup>156,xxxiv</sup> tathā cōktaṃ—

buddhatvaṃ vajrasattvatvaṃ saṃvṛtyaiva prasādhayet |<sup>xxxv</sup>

iti.<sup>157</sup>

nanu sarvam eva vastujātaṃ alikarūpatayā niḥsāram. tadā kimarthaṃ maṇḍalacakrādibhāvanāprayāsaḥ<sup>158</sup> kriyate? asad etat,

mithyādhyāropahānārthaṃ<sup>159</sup> yatno 'saty api<sup>160</sup> [E<sub>DH</sub> p. 143] bhoktari |<sup>161,xxxvi</sup>

iti vacanāt. yady api vicāryamāṇaṃ pāramārthikaṃ vasturūpaṃ nāsti, tathāpy ahaṃ sukhī bhaveyaṃ mā<sup>162</sup> duḥkhy abhūvam iti tṛṣṇā sakalapraṇabhṛtām asti. yathā tulye 'pi mithyātve śubhāśubhasvapnayoḥ śubhasvapnadarśanāt saumanasyam aśubhasvapnadarśanāc ca daurmanasyam, tadapanayanāya ca saddhamapāṭhamantrajāpāḍau pravṛttir bhavati, tathā mithyātvāviśeṣe 'pi duḥkhādi-

<sup>xxxiv</sup> E<sub>DH</sub> appears to understand the text as saying that both *bhāvanā* and *jagadarthakriyādīnām vyavasthā* are established. TIB suggests that it is *bhāvanā* which is the instrument by which the *vyāvasthā* is established. The manuscript reading suggests taking 'bhāvanā in compound with the following word—i.e., in the Madhyamaka system, although mere appearance is false, the framework of everything starting with *lakṣyalakṣaṇa* is established.

<sup>xxxv</sup> *Kurukullākālpa* 3.16cd

<sup>xxxvi</sup> *Pramāṇavārttika*, *Pramāṇasiddhi* 193cd.

<sup>153</sup> asti] *conj.*; astiti K E<sub>DH</sub> (astiti?) (*iti* has no reflex in TIB)

<sup>154</sup> °bhāvanā°] K; °bhāvanā E<sub>DH</sub> (variant word division); bsgoms pas TIB (bhāvanayā)

<sup>155</sup> vyavasthā] K; vyavasthā ca E<sub>DH</sub> (*em.*)

<sup>156</sup> sidhyati] *conj.*; sidhyatiti K E<sub>DH</sub> (*no reflex of iti* in TIB)

<sup>157</sup> iti] E<sub>DH</sub>; deest in K

<sup>158</sup> maṇḍala°] E<sub>DH</sub>; bri ba'i 'dkyil 'khor (lekhyamaṇḍala°)

<sup>159</sup> mithyādhyāropahānārthaṃ] *em.*; mithyādhyāropaṇārthaṃ K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>160</sup> 'saty api] K; 'styopi E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>161</sup> bhoktari] K (bhoktari°) (*the letter no is added abhove bho*); muktaye E<sub>DH</sub> (*em.*)

<sup>162</sup> mā] E<sub>DH</sub> (*em.*); deest in K

prākṛtavikalpahānāya<sup>xxxvii</sup> samyaksaṃbodhilakṣaṇaprāptaye<sup>163</sup> ca prekṣāvatām arthināṃ pravṛttir bhaviṣyatiti.

## 8 saptavidheṣu sādhyeṣu sārāsāravicāraṇam

nanu yadarthas tavāyam<sup>164,xxxviii</sup> ārambhaḥ so 'rthaḥ pralayaṃ gataḥ. tathā hi lakṣyalakṣaṇacintātra prastutā. sā ca vismṛtā, kva gateti na jñāyate.

na tu<sup>165</sup> kṛtaiva sā saptabhir bhedaḥ?

satyam, kintu guḍagorasanyāyena. tathā hi na jñāyate, kiṃ tat sāram asāram veti.

ucyate.

### 8.1 prathamasyāsāratvam

mantranayavihitakramābhāvāt samāpattibhāvanāvaiyarthiād<sup>166</sup> yuktyabhāvāc<sup>167</sup> ca prathamasya niḥsāratā. tathā hi samagrasāmagrikam yat phalaṃ<sup>168</sup> tad avaśyam eva bhavati. anyathā samagrasāmagrikam eva tan na bhavet. sākṣātkaraṇāvasthāyāṃ samagrasāmagrikam tad vartate. tad avaśyam tena<sup>169</sup> bhavitavyam. sati ca bhavati<sup>170,xxxix</sup> prathamasya hānir iti.

<sup>xxxvii</sup> cf. *Samantabhadrasādhana* (as quoted in Kamalanātha's *Ratnāvalī* ad HeTa 2.2.45, fol. 16r6): prākṛtavikalpavṛttair aparaṃ na hi kiñcad asti bhavaduḥkham | tasya viruddhaṃ caitat sākṣāda-vagamyate cetaḥ ||

<sup>xxxviii</sup> The manuscript's reading *yadarthasvā'yaṃ* seems like a plausible corruption of *yadarthas tavā'yaṃ*, but Tibetan shows no reflex of *tava*. TVA<sub>D</sub> reads: *rtsom pa 'di'i don gang yin pa*. TVB<sub>G</sub> reads: *gal te gang gi don du (bzhi pa bshad pa'i bshad pa'i dus) 'di brtsams pa'i*.

<sup>xxxix</sup> TIB could be rendered as something like *evaṃsati ca prathamasya hānir iti*. Indeed this seems to be the sense, but the manuscript reading of *bhavane na* or *bhavanena* is hard to account for.

<sup>163</sup> lakṣaṇaprāptaye] K E<sub>DH</sub>; mtshan nyid kyi 'bras bu thob par bya ba'i phyir TVA<sub>D</sub> (lakṣaṇaphalaprāptaye); mtshan nyid 'bras bu thob par bya ba'i phyir TVB<sub>G</sub> (lakṣaṇaphalaprapāptaye)

<sup>164</sup> yadarthas tavāyam] *conj.*; yadarthasvā'yaṃ K; yadarthatvād ayaṃ E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>165</sup> na tu] *conj.*; nanu K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>166</sup> samāpatti°] K E<sub>DH</sub> TVB<sub>G</sub> (snyom par 'jug pa); lha'i rnal 'byor gyi snyoms par 'jug pa'i TVA<sub>D</sub> (devatāyogasamāpatti°)

<sup>167</sup> yuktyabhāvāc] E<sub>DH</sub>; yuktābhāvāc K

<sup>168</sup> yat phalaṃ] *conj.* (TIB: 'bras bu gang yin pa); yat K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>169</sup> tena K E<sub>DH</sub> TVB<sub>G</sub> (de); de'i 'bras bu TVA<sub>D</sub> (tena phalena)

<sup>170</sup> *conj.*; bhavane na K E<sub>DH</sub>; de ltar gyur pas dang po nyams pa yin no TVA<sub>D</sub>; de ltar gyur pa dang po nyams pa yin no TVB<sub>G</sub> (evaṃsati )

## 8.2 dvitīyasya asāratvam

śarīrādyākārasūnyasya kevalasātarūpasyānupalabdher<sup>171</sup> na dvitīyasya sārātā. tathā hi pramāṇaniścitaṃ prekṣāvātā bhāvanīyam, na yathākathañcit. pramā[K fol. 8r]ṇena saṃvalitarūpam eva sarvadopalabhyate.<sup>x1</sup> tad eva sarvajanānām kamanīyatayā pratibhāsate. tasmāt kevalasya rucyabhāvāc cakrākārasaṃvalitasyopapalabdheḥ sāksāt kartum āśakyatvāc<sup>172,x1i</sup> ca dvitīyasya kalpanāmātrateti.<sup>173</sup>

## 8.3 tṛtīyasya asāratvam

nirupadravabhūtārthasvabhāvatvena sātmiḥbhūtasya tyaktum āśakyatvāt, saṃvalitarūpasya [E<sub>DH</sub> p. 144] bhedābhāvāt, prayojanābhāvāc ca na tṛtīyasya<sup>174</sup> kalyāṇabhāvaḥ.<sup>175</sup> tathā hi sahopalambhena<sup>176</sup> tādātmyasiddhāv ekasya parityāge 'parasyāvaśyaṃ parityāgo na vā kasyacid iti.

## 8.4 caturthasya sārāsāratvavicāraṇam

prapañcatvena bahuprayāsatvād vicārāsahatvena bhrāntirūpatayāparamārtharūpatayā ca na tṛtīyāntapakṣasya<sup>177</sup> kalyāṇateti.<sup>178</sup> atra kecid yuktiṃ varṇayanti.<sup>xlii</sup> prapañcarūpatvābhāve<sup>179</sup> 'pi sūkṣmasya bindvādeḥ punaḥ punar bhāvanayā sā-

<sup>x1</sup> TVA<sub>D</sub> lacks a reflex of *sarvadā*, whereas TVB<sub>G</sub> lacks a reflect of *eva*.

<sup>xli</sup> TIB suggests reading: *kevalasyānupalabdheḥ rucyabhāvāc cakrākārasaṃvalitasyānupalabdheḥ sāksātkartum āśakyatvāc ca*. The addition of *anupalabdheḥ* after *kevalasya* renders the flow of argument's logic less smooth. The addition of the same word after *cakrākārasaṃvalitasya* does not change the argument in its overall sense. Note that the Tibetan 'khor lo'i rang bzhin could instead imply the reading *cakrasvabhāva* or something similar, but it may simply be a free rendering of *cakrākārasaṃvalita*.

TIB also adds the reason 'bad pa mtshung pa'i phyir ('because the effort is equal'). The purport of this is unclear.

<sup>xlii</sup> TVA<sub>D</sub> renders this sentence differently: *de la 'ga' zhig las rigs pa cung zhig cig brjod par mi bya ste* |

<sup>171</sup> °labdher] E<sub>DH</sub>; °bdher K

<sup>172</sup> āśakyatvāc] E<sub>DH</sub> (*em.*); āśakyatāc K

<sup>173</sup> kalpanāmātrateti] E<sub>DH</sub> (*em.*); kalpanātrateti K

<sup>174</sup> tṛtīyasya] *conj.*; tṛtīya K; tṛtīyaḥ E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>175</sup> ] *conj.* (Tib: dge ba [ma] yin); kalyāṇībhāvaḥ K<sup>pc</sup>; kalyāṇībhāvaḥ K<sup>ac</sup>; dge ba ma yin [na] *kalyāṇabhāvaḥ*

<sup>176</sup> sahopalambhena] E<sub>DH</sub>; saholambhena K

<sup>177</sup> tṛtīyāntapakṣasya] *em.* (TVA<sub>D</sub>: gsum pa'i tha' ma'i phyogs TVA<sub>D</sub>; TVB<sub>G</sub>: gsum pa'i mtha' ma'i phyogs); tṛtīyāntaḥ | pakṣasya K; tṛtīyapakṣasya E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>178</sup> kalyāṇateti] E<sub>DH</sub>; kalyānateti K

<sup>179</sup> prapañcarūpatvābhāve] K E<sub>DH</sub>; spros pa'i ngo bo nyid du gyur TIB

kṣātkaraṇaṃ yāvat prayāsa tāvat sarvatraiva bhāvyavastuni sambhavati. tad atra yadi prayāsabhayaṃ, na kiñcid api bhāvanīyaṃ.

prapañcarūpatvād iti cet, prapañcāprapañcayor bhāvanāvasthāyāṃ ko viśeṣaḥ<sup>180</sup>? nanu<sup>181</sup> aprapañcaṃ śīghraṃ eva sthīrībhavatīty ayaṃ viśeṣaḥ. yatraivālabane<sup>182</sup> cittaṃ punaḥ punaḥ preryate niraṇṭaraṃ<sup>183</sup> dīrghakālaṃ ca tatraiva sthīrībhavatīty āgamaḥ. yuktiś cātrāsti. tathā cōktaṃ—

tasmād bhūtaṃ abhūtaṃ vā yad yad evābhibhāvyate |  
bhāvanābalaniṣpattau<sup>xliii</sup> tat sphuṭākālpadhīphalaṃ<sup>184</sup> ||<sup>xliv</sup>

punaś cōktaṃ—

aho kuśīdatvaṃ aho vimūḍhaṭā  
aho janasyāsa sadarthavakratā |  
svacittamātrapratibaddhabuddhaṭā<sup>185</sup>  
adūravartiny api yaṃ na sevyate ||<sup>186</sup>

iti. tasmān nāyaṃ viśeṣaḥ.

bhrāntirūpatvenāparamārthatvaṃ api sarvatraiva bhāvanāviśeṣe vastuni sambhavatīti na kiñcid api bhāvanīyaṃ syāt. [K fol. 8v] tataś ca sarvatraiva mokṣamārge bhāvanāyā vaiyarthyaṃ syāt. māyopamākārānupraveśena bhrāntirūpaṃ apy aprapañcād [E<sub>DH</sub> p. 145] bhāvyamānaṃ<sup>187</sup> aduṣṭaṃ bhavatīti cet, na tv ayaṃ māyākārānupraveśaḥ prapañce 'pi samāna iti. tatrāpi ko doṣasyāvakāśaḥ? tasmāt prapañcaṃ aprapañcaṃ vā yad eva rocate pramāṇasaṃgatam itarad vā, tad evālasyaṃ vihāya mahāpuruṣārthibhir bhāvayitavyaṃ<sup>188</sup> ity ālam atiprasaṅgeneti.

atra ca sāretaravibhāgaḥ paryupāsitaḥ gurubhir eva jñātavyaḥ.

<sup>xliii</sup> The reading *bhāvanābalaniṣpattau* is supported by the Tibetan translation and occurs in other sources (*bsgom pa'i stobs ni rdzogs pa na*). Another more mainstream reading for this *pāda* is *bhāvanāpariniṣpattau*.

<sup>xliv</sup> *Pramāṇavārttika*, Pratyakṣapramāṇa 285

<sup>180</sup> viśeṣaḥ] *conj.*; viśeṣa iti cet K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>181</sup> nanu] *conj.* (TIB: 'on te); deest in K and E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>182</sup> yatraivālabane] *conj.* (no reflect of *nanu* in TIB); nanu yatraivālabane

<sup>183</sup> niraṇṭaraṃ] E<sub>DH</sub> (*em.*) TIB (rgyun mi 'chad par); niruttaraṃ K

<sup>184</sup> kalpadhīphalaṃ] *em.*; kalpadhī phalaṃ K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>185</sup> °pratibaddha°] *conj.* (TIB; 'brel pa); °pratibuddha° K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>186</sup> Untraced. Also cited in \**Saptāṅga* fol. 202r7.

<sup>187</sup> aprapañcād bhāvyamānaṃ] E<sub>DH</sub>; aprapañcā bhāvyamānaṃ

<sup>188</sup> bhāvayitavyaṃ] E<sub>DH</sub>; bhaviyitavyaṃ K



## 8.5 pañcamasya asāratvam

ṭṭīyapakṣoktadoṣatvān<sup>189</sup> nīrasatvena<sup>190</sup> prayojanābhāvān mantranayakramābhā-  
vā ca na pañcamah parikṣīnadoṣah.

nanu sākṣātkaraṇāt pūrvam mantranayaprayogo 'sti. tat katham tasyābhā-  
vah? satyam, sākṣātpthalāvasthā sādhyā. tasyām ca nāsty asau kramah. †sākṣā-  
tparityāge<sup>xlv†</sup> ca na prayojanam utpaśyāma iti.

## 8.6 ṣaṣṭhamasya asāratvam

svecchayā nirvāyayitum<sup>191</sup> aśakyatvāt, prayojanābhāvāt, sattvārthābhāvāc ca na  
pañcāntaraprabhedakalpanā<sup>192</sup> kalaṅkāśūnyā. tathā hi kasyacin nivṛttiḥ kāraṇa-  
nivṛtṭyā vyāpakānivṛtṭyā<sup>193</sup> vā bhavati. na cātra sākṣātkṛtamaṇḍalacakrasya ni-  
vartakam kāraṇam vyāpakam vā icchākāle dṛśyate.<sup>xlvi</sup>

nanu śūnyataiva nivartikāsti. yathā dārusaṅghātaprajvalito<sup>194</sup> vahnir niḥśe-  
ṣam indhanam bhasmīkṛtya paścāt svarasata eva nivartate, tathā maṇḍalacakra-  
prajvalitaḥ śūnyatājñānāgniḥ sākṣāt kṛtvā<sup>195</sup> maṇḍalacakram nivartayiṣyatīti cet.<sup>196</sup>  
tad asat, viṣamatvād dṛṣṭāntasya. tathā hi tatrendhanam kāraṇam<sup>197</sup> vahneḥ. kā-  
raṇasya indhanalakṣaṇasya nivṛtttau<sup>198</sup> yuktaiva vahnīlakṣaṇasya kāryasya ni-

<sup>xlv</sup> Segment instead: kramah sākṣāt. parityāge ?

<sup>xlvi</sup> TIB lacks a reflex of *icchākāle dṛśyate*. Both translations add an extra sentence to this para-  
graph: *rang gi 'dod pas ('dos pas TVB<sub>G</sub>; 'gog par TVB<sub>G</sub>)'gog pa yang mi nus te mi mthun pa med*  
*pa'i phyir | sdug bsngal la sogs pa 'gog pa 'dod kyang sdug bsngal la sogs pa la 'jug pa mthong ba'i*  
*phyir ro ||*

<sup>189</sup> ṭṭīyapakṣoktadoṣatvān *conj.* (TVB<sub>G</sub>: gsum pa'i phyogs la bshad pa'i nyes pa yod pa dang); ṭṭī-  
yapakṣe ktato K; ṭṭīyapakṣe kuto E<sub>DH</sub>; *no reflex* in TVA<sub>D</sub>

<sup>190</sup> nīrasatvena] *conj.*; nīrasatvena te K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>191</sup> nirvāyayitum] K; nirvāpayitum E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>192</sup> pañcāntara°] *em.* TIB (Inga pa'i mtha'i rab tu dbye ba); prapañcāntara° K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>193</sup> vyāpakānivṛtṭyā] E<sub>DH</sub>; vyāpakānivṛtṭyā K

<sup>194</sup> dārusaṅghātaprajvalito] *conj.*; dārusaṅghāte prajvalito E<sub>DH</sub>; dārusaṅghāt pravjalito K

<sup>195</sup> sākṣāt kṛtvā] *conj.*; sākṣān K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>196</sup> TIB a fuller sentence here. TVB<sub>G</sub> reads: *de ltar dkyil 'khor gyi 'khor lo stong pa nyid kyi ye shes*  
*kyi me rab tu 'bar bas mngon sum du byas nas kyang | dkyil 'khor gyi 'khor lo ma lus par ldog par*  
*byed la | bdag nyid kyang rang gi ngang gis ldog par 'gyur ro zhe na |* TVA<sub>D</sub> appears to be slightly  
more corrupt, but suggests that same readings: *de dkyil 'khor gyi 'khor lo stong pa nyid kyi ye shes*  
*kyi me rab tu 'bar bas mngon sum du byas nas kyang | dkyil 'khor gyi 'khor lo ma lus par ldog par*  
*byed la | de yang rang gi ldog par 'gyur ro zhe na |*

<sup>197</sup> kāraṇam] *conj.*; na kāraṇam K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>198</sup> kāryasya indhanalakṣaṇasya nivṛtttau] *conj.*; kāryam indhanalakṣaṇānivṛtttau

vṛttiḥ. iha tu na śūnyatā kāraṇaṃ maṇḍalacakrasya. tat ka[K fol. 9r]thaṃ tanni-  
vṛtttau nivṛttiḥ? na<sup>199</sup> ca śūnyatāyā nivṛttir asti.<sup>xlvi</sup>

nanu sā na<sup>200</sup> bhavatu kāraṇaṃ. śūnyatā vyāpakam tu bhaviṣyati. vyāpaka-  
sya vṛkṣasya nivṛtttau śiṃśapātvasya vyāpyasya nivṛttivan nivṛttir bhaviṣyati  
cet. etad apy asāram. tathā hi śūnyatā sarvadā sarvajñeyamaṇḍalavyāpikā tattva-  
rūpā.<sup>201</sup> na ca tasyā nivṛttiḥ kadācid apy asti. yadi syāt samyaksambodhisākṣātka-  
raṇāt [E<sub>DH</sub> p. 146] pūrvam anantaram eva vā nivṛttiḥ syāt. na ca bhavati, samya-  
ksambuddhībhuṃyāpi katipayakālāvasthānasya svayam eva svīkṛtatvāt.

kintu śūnyatāpi jñānarūpā, cakram api jñānarūpam. śūnyatājñānotpattyā ca-  
krajñānasyānivṛtttau<sup>202</sup> śūnyatājñānaṃ kena nivartanīyam. tena nivṛttiś ca viro-  
dhino 'bhāvāt kāraṇavyāpakayoś cābhāvān nāsti. tasmāc chūnyatājñānasya na  
nivṛttiḥ,<sup>203</sup> nāpi maṇḍalacakrasya śūnyatāto nivṛttir iti śūnyatā na nivartikā.

ko brūte śūnyatā nivartikā? kiṃ tarhi yan nivartakaṃ<sup>204</sup> tad gurūpadeśato  
jñeyam ity apy asāram. gurūpadeśato 'pi na śūnyatāvyatiriktaṃ<sup>205</sup> pramāṇato  
'stīti yatkiñcid etat.<sup>xlvi</sup> pratikṣaṇanivṛttiś ca kṣaṇabhaṅgarūpā sarvapadārtha-  
vyāpinī. na sā santānanivartikā. tasmān na svecchayā nivṛttiḥ.<sup>206</sup> na ca nivṛttyā<sup>207</sup>  
nīrasarūpayā prayojanam asti prekṣāvatām. tathā coktam—

mucyamāneṣu sattveṣu ye te prāmodyasāgarāḥ |  
tair eva nanu paryāptaṃ mokṣeṇārasikena kim ||<sup>xl</sup>

<sup>xlvi</sup> The response the objection is considerably different in Tibetan. It states that while fire is regarded by mundane consensus as having a causal effect on fuel insofar as it transforms it, emptiness has no such effect on the *maṇḍalacakra*. It is also therefore not something that causes it to cease, nor is it known to itself cease of its own accord. Although the Sanskrit MS is very corrupt in this paragraph, it is difficult to see how the text it transmits corresponds to the Tibetan translation.

<sup>xlvi</sup> TVB<sub>G</sub>: bla ma'i man ngag las kyang stong pa nyid kyis ldog par byed pa ma yin ldog pa'i tshad ma cung zhig kyang yod pa ma yin pas. TVA<sub>D</sub>: bla ma'i man ngag las kyang stong pa nyid dang | de ldog pa las ma gtogs pa'i ldog par byed pa'i tshad ma gzhan cung zad yod pa ma yin no ||

<sup>xl</sup> *Bodhicaryāvatāra* 8.108

<sup>199</sup> na] *conj.*; athavā na] K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>200</sup> na] E<sub>DH</sub> (*em.*); deest in K

<sup>201</sup> tattvarūpā] E<sub>DH</sub>; tatvarūpāḥ K

<sup>202</sup> °ānivṛtttau] K E<sub>DH</sub>; log na TIB(nivṛtttau)

<sup>203</sup> na nivṛttiḥ] *conj.* (TIB: ldog pa med do); nivṛttiḥ K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>204</sup> nivartakaṃ] *em.*; nivartikās K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>205</sup> śūnyatāvyatiriktaṃ] *conj.* vyatiri((ktiḥ)) K (i in kti lacks a *prṣṭhamātrā*); vyatiriktaḥ E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>206</sup> nivṛttiḥ] K<sup>ac</sup>; nivṛttiḥ K<sup>pc</sup>

<sup>207</sup> nivṛttyā] E<sub>DH</sub> (*em.*); nivartyā K

iti.

sattvārtho 'pi nivṛttau nāsti. na hi gagane<sup>208</sup> gaganakamale vā kācid arthakriyā sambhavati. ciraniruddhād apy atītād avasturūpāc<sup>209</sup> cakrāt sattvārtho bha-  
viṣyatīty apy asāram, ciranīrutasyāpi<sup>210</sup> kukku[K fol. 9v]ṭasya kaṇṭhadhvanipra-  
saṅgāt.

nanu yogyadhiṣṭhānād gaganād apy arthakriyāḥ sambhavantīti cet.<sup>211</sup> na sa-  
mbhavanti, yogyadhiṣṭhānād eva cittarūpād arthakriyā, na gaganāt, nirūpatvāt  
tasya.<sup>1</sup>

nanu nirodhya maṇḍalacakraṃ sattvārthakāle punar utpādyate. tato 'rtha-  
kriyā bhavati. tataḥ punar eva nirodhyate, punar evotpadyata iti cet. asad etat.  
yathā sattvārthakriyāyās tattvato<sup>212</sup> nāsti prādurbhāvaḥ, tathā cakrasyāpi. tato  
nārthakriyāyāḥ sambhavaḥ. na ca nirodhya<sup>213</sup> punar utpāde kiñcit prayojanam  
astīty alam atiprapaṇceneti.

## 8.7 saptamasya asāratvam

ṣaṣṭhapakṣoktadoṣasandohasya saptame<sup>214</sup> 'pi bhāvān na piṣṭapeṣaṇaṃ<sup>215</sup> kri-  
yate. nanu ṣaṣṭhena saptamasya samānatvāt kathaṃ saptamasya tato viśeṣaḥ?  
asti viśeṣaḥ. pūrvāvasthāyām niyatacakrākāratā, punaḥ svecchayā nirvṛtiḥ sve-  
cchetpādanaṃ<sup>216</sup> ceti. saptame punar etan nāsti. tato na samānatā. bhinnas ca  
nirdiṣṭa iti.<sup>217</sup>

<sup>1</sup> TVAD varies significantly for this paragraph.

<sup>208</sup> gagane] K EDH TVBG; *no reflex in TVAD*

<sup>209</sup> avasturūpāc] K EDH TVBG (dngos po med pa'i ngo bo); dngos po'i ngo bo TVAD (vasturūpāc)

<sup>210</sup> ciranīrutasyāpi] *conj.*; cirutasyāpi K; virutasyāpi EDH; yun rin por khyim bya shi ba TVAD;  
yun ring por long pa'i khyim bya shi ba TVBG (ciramṛtasyāpi)

<sup>211</sup> sambhavantīti cet] *conj.*; sambhavanti K EDH

<sup>212</sup> tattvato] K (tatvato) EDH; de las TIB (tato)

<sup>213</sup> nirodhya] EDH; niro((dhya)) K (*some kind of correction is made, but uncertain from what to what*); 'gogas pa las (*possibly nirodhāt*)

<sup>214</sup> ṣaṣṭhapakṣoktadoṣasandohasya saptame] *conj.* (TIB: drug pa'i phyogs la bshad pa'i skyon gyi (gyi] TVAD; gyis TVBG) tshogs bdun pa la); ṣaṣṭhapakṣoktaṃ saṃdāhasyāṣṭame K; ṣaṣṭhapakṣo-  
ktasaṃdohasyāṣṭame EDH

<sup>215</sup> piṣṭapeṣaṇaṃ] K<sup>ac</sup> EDH; piṣṭapre | ṣaṇaṃ K<sup>ac</sup>

<sup>216</sup> nirvṛtiḥ svecchetpādanaṃ] *conj.* (TVBG: yang rang gi 'dod pas 'gog cing rang gi 'dod pas skyed  
par byed pa); svecchetpādanaṃ K; svecchetpādanaṃ EDH; yang dang yang du rang gi 'dod pas  
skyed par byed pa nyid TVAD

<sup>217</sup> K EDH; tha mi dad pa ma yin par bstan to TVAD; tha mi dad pa ma yin par bstan to TVBG

## 9 caturthasya sekasya svarūpam

dambholibījasrutidhautaśuddha<sup>218</sup>  
pāthojabhūtāṅkurabhūtapuṣṭi<sup>219</sup> |  
turīyaśasyaṃ<sup>220</sup> paripākam eti<sup>221</sup>  
sphuṭaṃ caturthaṃ viduṣo 'pi gūḍham || 17 ||

[E<sub>DH</sub> p. 147] dambholityādi. etat sadgurūpadeśato jñeyam.

## 10 aparaṃ mithyāsādhyam mithyātattvaṃ ca

pañcapradīpāmṛtabinducandra-  
bhrūmadhyabindūdbhavamāṇḍalāni |  
vāyoḥ svarūpaṃ galaśuṇḍikādyam  
atattvarūpaṃ svayam ūhaniyam || 18 ||

pañcapradīpetyādi. pañcapradīpaśabdena gokudahanalakṣaṇasya, amṛtaśabdena vimumāraśulakṣaṇasya satatānuṣṭhānam eva sādhyam manyante. bindur iti hrcca-ndrasthaṃ binduṃ dedīpyamānaṃ tattvaṃ sādhyam ceti kṛtvā kecid bhāvayanti. candra iti hr̥disthaṃ kalārūpaṃ ardha-candraṃ vā hr̥tkamalasthaṃ kecid bhāvayanti.

bhrūmadhyabindūdbhavamāṇḍalānīti bhruvor madhye ūṇāyāṃ binduṃ vi-bhāvya tadbindūdbhavāni maṇḍalāni vāyuvāruṇamāhendraḡneyalakṣaṇāni. etad uktaṃ bhavati—mukhaśravaṇanāsikācakṣurghrāṇarasanāni<sup>222</sup> hastāṅgulībhiḥ pi-dhāya bhrūmadhyabindur draṣṭavyaḥ. tasya sphuṭāvasthāyāṃ śubhāśubhani[K fol. 10r]mittasam̐sūcakāni māhendraḡdimāṇḍalāny upajāyante. taṃ ca binduṃ ta-ttvam iti manyante.

vāyoḥ svarūpaṃ iti pūrakakumbhakarecakaprasāntakalakṣaṇam<sup>223</sup> ānāpānā-dilakṣaṇam<sup>224</sup> ceti. etad<sup>225</sup> uktaṃ bhavati—śaivasam̐khyādinirdiṣṭam<sup>226</sup> vāyusva-

<sup>218</sup> °sruti°] corr.; śruti K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>219</sup> pāthoja°] E<sub>DH</sub> (E<sub>DH</sub> reports the ms. as reading pāthojña, but this seems to be incorrect); pāthauja° K

<sup>220</sup> turīyaśasyaṃ] E<sub>DH</sub>; tutīyaśasyaṃ K

<sup>221</sup> eti] E<sub>DH</sub> (em.); eta K

<sup>222</sup> mukhaśravaṇanāsikācakṣurghrāṇarasanāni] K E<sub>DH</sub>; kha dang | rna ba dang | sna dang | mig TVA<sub>D</sub> TVB<sub>G</sub>

<sup>223</sup> °recaka°] E<sub>DH</sub>; recakaṃ K

<sup>224</sup> ānāpānādilakṣaṇam] E<sub>DH</sub>; anāpānā° K

<sup>225</sup> etad] E<sub>DH</sub> (em.); tad K

<sup>226</sup> śaivasam̐khyādi°] E<sub>DH</sub> (em.) TVB<sub>G</sub> (shi ba dang grangs can la sogs pas); saivasam̐khyādi° K; grangs can la sogs pas TVA<sub>D</sub> (smākhyādi°)

rūpaṃ jñātvā taṃ vāyuṃ nirodhabhāvanayā sthīrīkṛtyākāśenotplutya gamanaṃ parapurapraveśaṃ yāvan muktiṃ ca sāṅskātkurvanti vāyuvādinaḥ.

galaśuṇḍiketi. galapradeśe jihvāmūlopari hastiśuṇḍikākārā adhaḥpralambamānā upajihvāsaṃjñikā galaśuṇḍikāsti. sā ca śaktirūpā. tadadhaḥ śivarūpaṃ<sup>227</sup> asti tattvam. sā ca [E<sub>DH</sub> p. 148] jihvāgreṇa sprīyamānā nīrantarāmṛtaṃ sravati. tena ca ghargharāmṛtavarṣaṇena santarpyamānaṃ ātmānaṃ dhyāyād iti galaśuṇḍikātattvam. ādisabdena hṛnmadhyāṣoḍaśanāḍikākakramadhyasthajñānasvarūpaṃ<sup>228</sup> śivarūpaṃ tattvaṃ bhāvayitavyaṃ ityādināṃ parigrahaḥ.<sup>li</sup>

tatsarvaṃ tīrthikādibhis tattvarūpeṇābhīmatam. atattvam iti svayaṃ evohaṇīyaṃ vicāraṇīyaṃ iti yāvat.

## 11 upasaṃhāra

svapnendrajālapratibimbamāyā-  
marīcīgandharvapūrāmbu[K fol. 2r]candraiḥ |  
anyaiś ca śabdair<sup>229</sup> upamābhidheyair  
naivāsti sādhyam kathitād ihānyat || 19 ||

svapnendrajāletyādi. svapnendrajālopaṃ pratibimbamāyāmarīcīgandharvanagarodakacandropamam iti śabdair anyaiś ca gagaṇapratīśrutkaphenopamam ityādisābdair upamābhidheyair upamāvācakair naivāsti sādhyam kathitāt sādhyād anyat. paraṃ kathita eva sādhye, ete śabdāḥ pravartanta iti svayaṃ boddhavyam.

<sup>li</sup> TIB continues to describe this practice. TVA<sub>D</sub> reads: *yang smras pa | bcu las drug lhag rtsa dang ldan pa'i 'khor lo yi || dkyil na gnas pa'i snying gar rnam par gnas pa'i bdag | des ni de yi khyad par lta bu'i grub pa ster || de ni mngon par mi g-yo ba yi yid dag gis || rnal 'byor pa yi sems de de ltar mngon par bsam || nub par gyur pa'i mgon po rgyal bar gyur de ni || nus pa dag gis de ni yongs su bskor dang bcas ||* TVB<sub>G</sub> reads: *de yang smras pa | bcu las drug lhag rtsa dang ldan pa'i 'khor lo'i dkyil na gnas pa snying kar rnam par gnas pa'i bdag | des ni de'i khyad par lta bu yi grub pa ster | de ni mngon par mi g.yo ba'i yid dag gis || rnal 'byor pa yis de ltar mngon par bsam par bya || nus par gyur pa'i mgon po rgyal bar gyur || de ni nus pa dag gis de ni yongs su bskyor dang bcas ||*

<sup>227</sup> tadadhaḥ śivarūpaṃ] K E<sub>DH</sub> TVB<sub>G</sub> (de'i 'og na zhi ba'i ngo bo); sdig pa'i rang bzhin du yong pa TVA<sub>D</sub>

<sup>228</sup> hṛnmadhyāṣoḍaśanāḍikākakramadhyasthajñānasvarūpaṃ] K E<sub>DH</sub> TVB<sub>G</sub> (snying ka'i dbus kyi 'khor lo rtsibs bcu drug pa'i dbus na gnas pa ye shes kyi rang bzhin); snying ga'i dbus kyi dkyil 'khor rtsibs bcu drug pa'i dbus na hūm gnas pa ye shes kyi rang bzhin (hṛnmadhyāṣoḍaśanāḍikāmaṇḍalamadhyahūmsthajñānasvarūpaṃ)

<sup>229</sup> śabdair *em.* (cf. comm.); sarvair K E<sub>DH</sub>

gambhīraśūnyapratibhāsamātra-<sup>230</sup>  
 śāntāti<sup>231</sup> sūkṣmānabhilāpyaśabdaiḥ |  
 nirlepanīrūpa<sup>232</sup> nirañjanādyair  
 bhrāntir na kāryāparasādhyaśattve || 20 ||

[E<sub>DH</sub> p. 149] gambhīraśūnyam pratibhāsamātram śāntātisūkṣmam anabhilāpyam nirlepaṃ nīrūpaṃ<sup>233</sup> nirañjanādi.<sup>234</sup> ādiśabdāt śivaṃ nirākāraṃ niṣprapañcam anādyantanidhanam i[K fol. 10v]tyādiśabdair bhrāntir na kartavyā. aparasādhyaśattve, aparasya sādhyasya sattve sattāyām.<sup>235</sup> ebhiḥ sarvair eva param api kiñcit sādhyam kathitād astīti bhrāntir na kartavyā. atha nātikathitam eva sādhyam ebhiḥ sarvair abhidhīyata iti niścayaḥ.

## 12 pariṇāmanā

akhilagagaṇagarbhavyāpisaptaprakāra-<sup>236</sup>  
 grathitavacanarūpād yan mayāsādi puṇyam |  
 anupamasukhavidyāsaktasāddehanirmij-  
 jinajanitajanārthas tena loko 'yam astu ||  
 tattvaratnāvalokaḥ samāptaḥ. kṛtir iyaṃ paṇḍitavāgīśvarakīrtipādā-  
 nām.

śrīsamāje parā yasya bhaktir niṣṭhā ca nirmalā  
 tasya vāgīśvarasyeyaṃ kṛtir vimatināśinī<sup>237</sup> ||

vikacakumudatārākṣīrakundānukāri<sup>238</sup>  
 pracitam api ca puṇyam yan mayā granthito 'smāt |  
 anupamasukhapūrṇaḥ svābhavidyopagūḍho

<sup>230</sup> °mātra°] E<sub>DH</sub>; mātram K

<sup>231</sup> śāntāti] E<sub>DH</sub>; śāntādi K

<sup>232</sup> nirlepanīrūpa°] E<sub>DH</sub> (*em.*); nirlepanīpa K

<sup>233</sup> nīrūpaṃ] E<sub>DH</sub> (*em.*); nirupamaṃ K

<sup>234</sup> nirañjanādi] K; nirañjanaṃ E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>235</sup> sattāyām] K; sattvāyā E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>236</sup> °saptaprakāra°] E<sub>DH</sub>; °sarvaprakāra° K

<sup>237</sup> vimatināśinī] E<sub>DH</sub>; vimatināsanī K

<sup>238</sup> vikacakumudatārākṣīrakundānukāri *em.*; vikacakumudakṣīratārākundānukāri] E<sub>DH</sub>; vikarektāmudakṣīratārākundānukāri K

bhavatu nikhilalokas tena vāgīśvaraśrīḥ ||

tattvaratnāvalokavivaraṇaṃ samāptam. kṛtir iyaṃ paṇḍitācāryavāgīśvarakīrti-  
pādānām.

## References

*Abhidharmakośavyākhyā* by Yośamitra. Wogihara UNRAI, ed. n.d. *Sphuṭārthā Abhidharmakośavyākhyā by Yaśomitra*. 2 vols. Tokyo: The Publishing Association of the Abhidharmakośavyākhyā

*Mantrārthāvalokinī* by Vilāsavajra. A. TRIBE. 2016. *Tantric Buddhist Practice in India: Vilāsavajra's Commentary on the Mañjuśrīnāmasaṃgīti*. Routledge Studies in Tantric Traditions. Taylor & Francis

*Mitākṣarā* of Vijñāneśvara. Narayan Ram ACHARYA, ed. 1949. *Yājñavalkyasmṛti of Yogīśvara Yājñavalkya with the Commentary Mitākṣara of Vijñāneśvara, Notes, Varient [sic!] Readings etc.* Bombay: Nirnaya Sagar Press

*Subhāṣitaratnakośa* compiled by Vidyākara. D. D. KOSAMBI and V. V. GOKHALE, eds. 1957. *The Subhāṣitaratnakośa Compiled by Vidyākara*. Cambridge Massachusetts: Harvard University Press

*Hetubinduṭīkāloka* by Durvekamiśra. Sukhlalji SANGHAVI and Muni Shri JINAVIJAYAJI, eds. 1949. *Hetubinduṭīkā of Bhaṭṭa Arcaṭa with the Sub-Commentary Entitled Āloka of Durveka Miśra*. Baroda: Oriental Institute

## Secondary Sources

INGALLS, Daniel H. H. 1965. *An Anthology of Sanskrit Court Poetry: Vidyākara's "Subhāṣitaratnakośa"*. Vol. 44. Harvard Oriental Series. Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press.