

# Tattvaratnāvaloka and Vivaraṇa

Vāgīśvarakīrti

February 13, 2025

## Some Conventions/Policies

- Tibetan translations are included in the apparatus when they indicate variant Sanskrit readings.
- Sanskrit renderings suggested by Tibetan appear in brackets after the translation's siglum. These renderings are hypothetical and cannot be provided in all cases.
- When two Tibetan translations differ slightly, they are separated by a semicolon. Only the second translation includes a Sanskrit rendering.
- A Tibetan translation's siglum is included when it appears to support one of multiple Sanskrit readings, based on the editors' judgment.
- Tibetan is not included in the apparatus when it offers no clear support for or against a reading.
- When both Tibetan translations agree, they are given the siglum TIB.

## Sigla and Abbreviations

TaRaA	Tattvaratnāvaloka
TaRaA-Vi	Tattvaratnāvalokavivaraṇa
E <sub>DH</sub>	Dhīḥ vol. 21, pp. 129–149.
K	NAK 5–252 = NGMPP A 915/4

TM <sub>D</sub>	<i>De kho na nyid rin po che snang ba</i> . Tōhoku no. 1889. sDe dge bstan 'gyur, vol. Pi, fols. 203r3–204r5. Tr. by 'Gos Lhas btsas
TVA <sub>D</sub>	<i>De kho na nyid rin po che snang ba'i rnam par bshad pa</i> . Tōh. 1890. sDe dge bsTan 'gyur, vol. 44 (rGyud 'grel, Pi), fols. 204r5–214v4. Tr. by 'Gos Lhas btsas.
TVB <sub>G</sub>	<i>De kho na nyid rin po che snang ba'i rnam par bshad pa</i> . Ōtani no. 4793. bsTan 'gyur gSer bris ma, vol. 84 (83 in BDRC outline(?)), (rGyud 'brel, Zhu), fols. 70v–85v. translator given.
TIB	Both Tibetan translations (differences, if any, indicated in a mini-aparatus)
<i>ac</i>	<i>ante correctionem</i>
<i>deest</i>	omitted in
<i>diag. conj.</i>	diagnostic conjecture [e.g. 'reconstructed' from Tibetan]
<i>conj.</i>	conjecture
<i>em.</i>	emendation [an emendation is made with a high degree of confidence, whereas a conjecture proposes a correction while acknowledging a greater possibility for alternatives]
fol./fols.	folio/folios
<i>pc</i>	<i>post correctionem</i>
<i>r</i>	recto
<i>v</i>	verso
Σ <sub>x</sub>	Reading shared in all witnesses but X
((kiṃcit))	Reading uncertain—either illegible or otherwise in doubt
<kiṃcit>	Reading cancelled
†kiṃcit†	Reading does not make sense to the editor and an adequate conjecture was not able to be chosen.
[kiṃcit]	Indication of a diagnostic conjecture
..	Damaged <i>akṣara</i> (one . per half <i>akṣara</i> )
...	Lacunae of an unknown quantity of <i>akṣaras</i>
°	Mark of abbreviation

# Text

## 1 maṅgalācaraṇam

[K fol. 1r] [siddhaṃ]<sup>1</sup> namaḥ śrīsadgurupādebhyaḥ |<sup>i</sup>

anupamasukharūpī śrīnivāso 'nivāso  
nirupamadaśadevīrūpavidyaḥ<sup>2</sup> savidyaḥ |  
tribhuvanahitasaukhyaprāptikāro 'vikāro  
jayati kamalapāṇir yāvad āśāvikāśaḥ || 1 ||<sup>ii</sup>

[K fol. 2r3] namaḥ samantakāyavākcittavajrāya.<sup>iii</sup>

anupametyādi. kamalaṃ padmaṃ pāṇau yasya sa kamalapāṇir avalokiteśvaro  
bhagavān jayatīti sambandhaḥ. kiṃviśiṣṭaḥ? anupamam ity<sup>3,iv</sup> atipraṇītavama-  
hattvāsamsārasthāyitvalakṣaṇair<sup>4</sup> dharmair yuktasyānyasyābhāvād upamārahi-  
taṃ sukham eva rūpaṃ svabhāvo yasya sa tathoktaḥ. punar api kiṃviśiṣṭaḥ? śrīḥ  
puṇyajñānasambhāralakṣaṇā, tasyā nivāsa āśrayo yaḥ sa tathā. dharmakāyarū-  
patvena<sup>5,v</sup> sarvagatatvāt [E<sub>DH</sub> p. 132] pratiniyatanivāsābhāvād anivāsaḥ.

<sup>i</sup> Scribal homage

<sup>ii</sup> This verse is in Mālinī metre.

<sup>iii</sup> Scribal homage

<sup>iv</sup> Here one may wish to conjecture a reading such as, *anumapetyādi. anupamam ity* ...This reading is partially suggested by TIB: *khyad par ji lta bu zhig dang ldan zhe na | dpe med ces bya ba la sogs pa smos te | dpe med pa ni (ni)* TVAD; *dang* TVBG). The corruption, if there is one, can be seen as a kind of haplography. The text nonetheless reads acceptably well with the transmitted reading (although perhaps less smoothly); thus we feel that while a conjecture is possible it is not strongly compelling.

<sup>v</sup> The manuscript's *dharmakāyarūpitvena* is theoretically acceptable and nearly synonymous; however, *dharmakāyarūpatvena* is more expected, with forms in *°rūpatvena* being vastly more frequent in Classical Sanskrit. TIB's reading *chos kyi sku'i ngo bo nyid kyis* does not clearly confirm either variant, as *rūpin* in the root verse is also translated as *ngo bo*. We provisionally adopt *dharmakāyarūpatvena*, but cannot fully discount the transmitted reading.

<sup>1</sup> [siddhaṃ] K; om E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>2</sup> nirupama° E<sub>DH</sub>; nirūpama° K

<sup>3</sup> kiṃviśiṣṭaḥ? anupamam ity] K E<sub>DH</sub>; *khyad par ji lta bu zhig dang ldan zhe na | dpe med ces bya ba la sogs pa smos te | dpe med pa ni* TVAD; *khyad par ji lta bu zhig dang ldan zhe na | dpe med ces bya ba la sogs pa smos te | dpe med pa dang* TVBG (kiṃviśiṣṭa ity āha anumapam ityādi. anupamam)

<sup>4</sup> °samsārasthāyitva°] K; °samsārasthāyisva° E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>5</sup> dharmakāyarūpatvena] *em.*; dharmakāyarūpitvena K E<sub>DH</sub>

punaḥ kīdrśaḥ? nirupamāḥ paramarūpayauvanaśṛṅgārādirasamahākaruṇādi-yuktatvenopamātikrāntā rūpavajrādītārāparyantadaśadevīrūpā vidyāḥ paricāra-katvena<sup>6</sup> yasya sa tathā. saha svābhārūpayā vidyayā<sup>7</sup> vartata iti savidyāḥ. tribhu-vanasya tribhuvanavartino janasya yad dhitam āyatipathyam<sup>8,vi</sup> buddhatvādi-kam, saukhyam tadātve pathyam<sup>9</sup> cakravartitvādikam,<sup>vii</sup> tasya yā prāptiḥ<sup>10</sup> [K fol.

<sup>vi</sup> We need not necessarily read a compound for *āyatipathyam*, treating instead *āyati* as a locative of *āyat*. The expression appears as a gloss for *hita* in several Buddhists texts, such as in Vilāsavajra's *Mantrārthāvalokinī*: *mahyam hitam maddhitam hitam āyatipathyam āgāmapariṇā-matvāt* (p. 233). Similarly, Durvekamiśra writes in his *Hetubinduṭīkāloka*: *parasmai hitamāyati pathyam* (p. 212). In both cases, the construction is ambiguous, but in the latter case, the editors of Durvekamiśra's text have not taken it as a compound.

The word *āyatipathyā* is used less ambiguously in compound by Śākyarakṣita, quoted in the following note. Similarly, the roughly parallel expression *āyatisukha* is evidently treated as a compound by Yaśomitra in his *Abhidharmakośavyākhyā*: *aihikasukhārtham apuṇyam iti. ihasu-khāpekṣayā tat kṛtam nāyatisukhāpekṣayety arthaḥ* (vol. 1 p. 299). Note also the contrast made with *aihikasukha*. Likewise, we can find a compounded form of *āyatiduḥkha* in a verse attributed to Naradatta in the *Subhāṣitaratnaśoḥa*: *muṇḍāpriyād āyatiduḥkhadāyino vasantam utsārya vijṛmbhitaśriyaḥ | na kaḥ khalāt tāpitamitramaṇḍalād upaiti pāpam tapavāsarād iva ||* 'Who does not become miserable because of a rogue who, like a hot day, is hated by widows (? *muṇḍā*) (the hot day being hated by bald men), who leads to future pain, whose wealth expands after he expels those living with him (like the hot day manifests its richness having dismissed the spring), and who annoys his circle of friends (like on a hot day the orb of the sun is heated) (cf. INGALLS 1965: 553).

<sup>vii</sup> The text is insecure here but perhaps not far from the author's intention. Where the manuscript reads *tad dāpayati pathyam* (word division unclear, *pa* and *ya* touching), we conjecture *tadātve pathyam*, following only partially the lead of TVA<sub>D</sub>. The Tibetan translations read as follows: *gang la phan pa ni ma 'ongs pa'i phan pa ste | sangs rgyas nyid la sogs pa'o || de la bde ba ni 'phral gyi phan pa ste |* (TVA<sub>D</sub>); *gang la phan pa ni ma 'ongs pa'i phan pa ste | sangs rgyas nyid la sogs pa dang | de la bde ba ni bde ba ste | 'khor lo bsgyur ba nyid la sogs pa'o ||* (TVB<sub>G</sub>). It appears that TVB<sub>G</sub> also transmits a corrupt reading. TVA<sub>D</sub> suggests reading something that contrasts with *āyati pathyam*, for which *tadātve pathyam* fits. Another possibility is *āpātāpathyam*, but *tadātva* is more often used in contrast with *āyati*. See, for example, Śākyarakṣita's *Vṛttamālāstutivṛtti*: *prthagjanatve 'pi āyatipathyadarśinas tadātve ca niṣpāpāḥ* (p. 299); 'Although ordinary people, they see the future welfare and are without sin in the present moment.'

The Tibetan translations also suggest that *hita* and *saukhya* are linked with relative and corelative pronouns: *gang la* and *de la*, or *yasya* and *tasya* in Sanskrit. This does not yield good sense. It is possible that *tadātve* was misread by the translator as a corelative pronoun, while it is also

<sup>6</sup> paricāra-katvena] *em.*; sapari((c))āra-katvena K; saparivāra-katvena E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>7</sup> vidyayā] K E<sub>DH</sub>; rig pa ste | shes rab TIB (vidyayā prajñayā)

<sup>8</sup> āyatipathyam] *variant word division in* E<sub>DH</sub>: āyati pathyam; *and in* K: āyati | pathyam

<sup>9</sup> saukhyam tadātve pathyam] *conj.*; tad dāpayati pathyam K E<sub>DH</sub> (*word division unclear*); de la bde ba ni 'phral gyi phan pa TVA<sub>D</sub>; de la bde ba ni bde ba ste TVB<sub>G</sub>

<sup>10</sup> prāptiḥ] K E<sub>DH</sub>; thob pa ni rnyed pa ste TIB (prāptir lābhaḥ)

2v] sākṣātkriyā, tasyāḥ karaṇaṃ kāro yasya sa tathā.<sup>viii</sup> aparinirvāṇadharmakā-  
tvenāpratiṣṭhitanirvāṇarūpatvenā<sup>11</sup> nyathātvalakṣaṇasya vikāraśābhāvād avikā-  
raḥ. evaṃviśiṣṭo bhagavāṇ jayati.

kiyantaṃ kalam ity āha—yāvad āśāvikaśāḥ. āśā daśa diśo gaganasvarūpāḥ.  
yadvā āśāḥ sarvasattvānāṃ bhavabhogatrṣṇāḥ.<sup>12</sup> tāsāṃ vikāśā avakāśāḥ prava-  
rtanāni, prādurbhāvā iti yāvat. te yāvat tāvad<sup>13</sup> bhagavāṇ jayati, sarvaharihara-  
hiraṇyagarbhādibhyaḥ prakṛṣṭo bhavatīty arthaḥ.

atrānupamasukharūpīty anena svārthasāṃpattih kathitā. śrīnivāsa ity anena  
tadupāyaḥ, puṇyajñānasambhārayoḥ śrīśābenābhihitatvāt. tribhuvanahitasaukhya-  
prāptikāra ity anena parārthasāṃpattir uktā. nirupamadaśadevīrūpavidyaḥ savi-  
dya ity anena tadupāyaḥ,<sup>14</sup> tathābhūtadaśadevīdvātriṃśallakṣaṇāśītyanuvyañja-  
nakāyākāraśūnyena<sup>15</sup> sarvākāraparārthasāṃpatteḥ kartum āśakyatvād iti.

## 2 prayojanādi

śrīmantranītigatacārucaturthaseka-  
rūpaṃ vidanti na hi ye sphuṭaśabdaśūnyam |

possible that a second relative pronoun (*yat*) or a conjunction (*ca*) was found in the original text near *saukhyaṃ*. Here *hitasaukhya* within the larger compound is only really viable as a *dvandva*: Avalokiteśvara causes the attainment of (ultimate) welfare and (temporary) happiness for all beings. Given that, *tayor yā prāptih* might be preferable to *tasya yā prāptih*, but the singular is also probably acceptable in place of the dual.

<sup>viii</sup> It is notable that Vāgīśvakīrti evidently understands *prāptikāra* as a *bahuvrīhi*, whereas other commentators may prefer to treat it akin to *kumbhakāra* and therefore as an *upapadasamāsa* as per *Aṣṭādhyāyī* 3.1.18. Given the latter understanding, the expected gloss for *prāptikāra* would be *prāptim karoti*. Compounds ending in *kāra* are occasionally analysed as *ṣaṣṭhītatpuruṣas*: see, for examples, Vijñāneśvara's *Mitākṣarā* ad *Yājñavalkya-dharmaśāstra* 2.61 on *satyaṃkārakṛta*, here referring roughly to a thing 'acquired with a pledge', i.e., acquired as earnest money: *karaṇaṃ kāraḥ, bhāve ghaṇ. satyasya kāraḥ satyaṃkārakṛta—kāre satyāgadasya (Aṣṭādhyāyī 6.3.70) iti mum. satyaṃkāreṇa kṛtaṃ satyaṃkārakṛtam* (p. 275). We are unable to provide another example of a compound ending in *kāra* analysed as a *bahuvrīhi*, but we should also note that the compound *prāptikāra* is itself rare.

TIB does not clearly reflect a *bahuvrīhi* analysis, nor does it very clearly point to another reading: *de dag sgrub par mdzad po gang yin pa de la de skad ces bya'o* (TVAD); *de dag gi rgyu mdzad pa gang yin pa de la de skad ces bya'o* (TVBG).

<sup>11</sup> °rūpatvenā°] K EDH; ngo bo rnyed pas TVAD; ngo bo brnyed pas TVBG (°rūpaprāptyā°)

<sup>12</sup> °trṣṇāḥ] EDH (°trṣṇās); trṣṇā K

<sup>13</sup> te yāvat tāvad] *em.*; tā yāvat tāvad K EDH; de srid du TIB (tāvad)

<sup>14</sup> tathābhūta°] K EDH TVBG (*de lta bu*); *no reflex in TVAD*

<sup>15</sup> °kāyā°] K EDH; dam pa'i sku TIB (°satkāyā°)

nānopadeśagaṇasaṃkulasaptabhedais  
teṣāṃ sphuṭāvagataye kriyate prayatnaḥ || 2 ||<sup>ix</sup>

śrīmantranītiśabdena<sup>16</sup> sāmānyayogatantravācakenāpi śrīsamājah<sup>17</sup> parigr̥hyate,  
caturthārthakasyānyatrāsambhavāt. śeṣaṃ subodham. nānācāryopadeśagaṇasaṃ-  
kulai[E<sub>DH</sub> p. 133]r vyākulaiḥ<sup>18</sup> saptabhir bhedaiḥ prakārair<sup>19</sup> atītānāgatavartamā-  
nācārya<sup>20</sup> gatopadeśarāśisaṃgrāhakaiḥ.<sup>21,x</sup> sphuṭāvagataye sukhena sphuṭapratī-  
tyartham<sup>22</sup> iti.

### 3 tīrthikānāṃ tattvaṃ sādhyam ca

sambhrāntabodhā nikhilā hi tīrthyās  
tattvasya sādhyasya ca rūpavittau |  
tebhyah prakṛṣṭaḥ kila tattvavettā  
vedāntavādīti janapavādaḥ || 3 ||<sup>xi</sup>

<sup>ix</sup> This verse is in Vasantatilakā.

<sup>x</sup> In this case TVB<sub>G</sub> resembles closely the Sanskrit text transmitted in K, apart from the addition of a further gloss after *vyākula*. The reading *rnam par bkab pa* ('covered') doesn't yield much sense, but it could be a mistake for *rnam par bkang ba* ('filled'), which is perfectly fitting and synonymous with TVA<sub>D</sub>'s *rnam par khyab pa* (Negi records the latter as rendering *vipūrṇa* in some texts). One may wish to conjecture such a reading. TVA<sub>D</sub> is significantly different here, even though most of the words of the transmitted Sanskrit text are still reflected: *du ma'i man ngag ces bya ba la sogs pa la | 'das pa dang ma 'ongs pa dang | da ltar gyi slob dpon du ma'i man ngag gi tshogs yang dag par bsdus pa'i mdun gyi dbye bas yongs su dkrugs pa ni | rnam par dkrugs pas rnam pa thams cad la rnam par khyab pa ste | des bsgrub par bya ba dkrugs pa'o* || The text is dubious but reflects a Sanskrit text along the following lines: *nānopadeśetyādi. atītānāgatavartamānācāryopadeśarāśisaṃgrāhakaiḥ saptabhir bhedaiḥ saṃkulair vyākulaiḥ sarvatravipūrṇaiḥ taiḥ sādhyasaṃkulaiḥ*.

<sup>xi</sup> This verse is in Indravajrā.

<sup>16</sup> śrīmantranītiśabdena] K E<sub>DH</sub> TVB<sub>G</sub> (dpal ldan sngags kyi gzhung lugs zhes bya ba'i sgras); dpal ldan sngags kyi gzhung lugs shes || zhes bya ba la sogs pa la | sngags kyi gzhung lugs zhes bya ba'i sgras ni | TVA<sub>D</sub> (śrīmantranītigatetyādi. mantranītiśabdena)

<sup>17</sup> śrīsamājah] K E<sub>DH</sub>; shugs kyis dpal gsang ba 'dus pa TIB (sāmarthyāt śrīsamājah)

<sup>18</sup> vyākulaiḥ] K E<sub>DH</sub>; rnam par dkrugs pas rnam pa thams cad la rnam par khyab pa TVA<sub>D</sub>; rnam par 'khrugs pa rnam par bkab pa ste TVB<sub>G</sub>; vyākulair vipūrṇaiḥ *possible conj.* (see notes)

<sup>19</sup> prakārair] K E<sub>DH</sub>; *no reflex in TIB*

<sup>20</sup> °vartamānā°] E<sub>DH</sub>; °pravartamānā° K

<sup>21</sup> °gato°] K E<sub>DH</sub> TVB<sub>G</sub> (gtogs pa); *no reflex in TVA<sub>D</sub>*

<sup>22</sup> sukhena sphuṭapratītyartham] K E<sub>DH</sub>; bde bar gnas par khong du chud par bya ba'i phyir TVA<sub>D</sub>; bde bar gsal bar khong du chud par bya'o TVB<sub>G</sub>

sambhrāntetyādi. sambhrānto vibhrānto bodhaḥ prajñāviśeṣo yeṣāṃ tīrthikānāṃ te tathoktāḥ.<sup>23</sup> sarva eva tīrthyā ātmātmīyagrahatimiropahatabuddhinayanāḥ. tattvaṃ idam iti sādhyam idam<sup>24</sup> iti ca tattvasya sādhyasya yat<sup>25</sup> svarūpaṃ tasya yā vittiḥ pratītiḥ, tasyāṃ bhrāntāḥ. śeṣaṃ subodham.

nanu tattvasādhyayor upādeyatvenaika rūpatvāt kathaṃ tattvasya sādhyasya ceti<sup>26,xii</sup> bhedenā nirdeśa iti cet. asad etat. tattvaṃ hy upādeyatve 'pi<sup>27</sup> sukhaduḥkhopekṣādisakalapratibhāsaṃdohavyāpakam.<sup>28</sup> sādhyam cānabhimataparihāreṇecchālakṣaṇaṃ phalam upādeyatve 'pi sakalaprañibhir avaśyam evāsādhyavyāvṛtṭyā sādhayitavyatvenābhimatam ity adoṣaḥ.

#### 4 vedāntavādināṃ śrāvakapratyekabuddhānāṃ ca sādhyāni

tatra tāvad<sup>29</sup> vedāntavādyabhimatam sādhyam āha—ānandarūpaṃ ityādi.

ānandarūpaṃ svavid<sup>xiii</sup> aprakampyaṃ  
vedāntinaḥ sādhyam uṣanti śāntam<sup>30</sup> |  
saśrāvakāḥ<sup>31</sup> khaḍgajināś ca sādhyam  
icchanti rūpādyupadher virāmam || 4 ||

ānandarūpaṃ iti sadāsukhamayatvāt. svavid iti jyotirūpatvena<sup>32</sup> svayaṃ prakāśamānatvāt.<sup>33</sup> aprakampyaṃ iti nityatayā<sup>34</sup> kampayitum aśakyatvāt. śāntam<sup>35</sup> iti

<sup>xii</sup> E<sub>DH</sub> misreads the manuscript as *tattvasya sādhyasya ceti* and supplies *kathaṃ* after *ceti*. There is in fact a *kathaṃ* before *tattvasya* in the manuscript, but the *tat* preceding that *kathaṃ* is evidently a corruption.

<sup>xiii</sup> From the commentary it is clear that *svavid* is not in compound; thus, being an accusative form of a feminine noun, we expect *svavidam*. The form may be grammatically justifiable if it is treated as neuter adjective, akin to *vedavid*.

<sup>23</sup> te tathoktāḥ] K<sup>pc</sup>; te thoktāḥ K<sup>ac</sup>; tathoktāḥ E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>24</sup> sādhyam idam] *em.*; sādhyam cedam K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>25</sup> yat] E<sub>DH</sub> (*em.*); tat K

<sup>26</sup> kathaṃ tattvasya sādhyasya ceti] *em.*; tat kathaṃ tattvasya sādhyasya ceti K; tattvasya sādhyasya ceti kathaṃ E<sub>DH</sub> (*em.*)

<sup>27</sup> upādeyatve 'pi] *conj.* (TIB: blang bar bya ba nyid yin yang); upādeyatvenāpi K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>28</sup> °vyāpakam] K (°kaṃ) E<sub>DH</sub> TVB<sub>G</sub> (khyab par byed pa yin la); shes bya tsam du khyab par byed pa yin la TVA<sub>D</sub> (°vyāpakam jñeyamātratvena)

<sup>29</sup> tāvad] K E<sub>DH</sub> TVA<sub>D</sub> (re zhig); *no reflex in* TVB<sub>G</sub>

<sup>30</sup> śāntam] *corr.*; śāntam K E<sub>DH</sub>; *no reflex in* TIB

<sup>31</sup> saśrāvakāḥ] *em.*; saśrāvakā K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>32</sup> jyotirūpatvena] K; jyotirūpatvena E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>33</sup> prakāśamānatvāt] E<sub>DH</sub> (*em.*); prakāśamānāt K

<sup>34</sup> nityatayā] E<sub>DH</sub>; anityatayā K TIB (mi rtag pa nyid kyis)

<sup>35</sup> śāntam] *corr.*; śāntam K E<sub>DH</sub>

kleśopakleśasūnyatvena parikalpitatvāt. evaṃvidhaṃ sādhyam uṣanti kāmāyante.

saha śrāvakair vartante ye khaḍgajināḥ khaḍgaviṣṇānakalpā ekacāriṇo vargacāriṇaś<sup>36</sup> ca pratyekabuddhāḥ te sādhyam icchanti. kīdrśam? rūpādyupadher virāmaṃ rūpavedanāsaṃjñāsaṃskāravijñānalakṣaṇānām upadhīnāṃ skandhānām virāmaṃ vicchedam, nirodham iti yāvat. [E<sub>DH</sub> p. 134] etad uktam bhavati—sarvaśrāvakaḥ pratyekabuddhāḥ sopadhiśeṣanirupadhiśeṣabhedenā bhinne ’pi nirvāṇe<sup>37</sup> nirupadhiśeṣam eva nirvāṇaṃ sā[K fol. 3v]kṣātkartavyatvena sādhyam pratipannāḥ.

## 5 pāramitānayavādināṃ caturvidhaṃ sādhyam

idāniṃ pāramitānayavādināṃ abhimataṃ<sup>38</sup> caturvidhaṃ sādhyam āha—ākāraśūnyam ityādi.

ākāraśūnyaṃ gaganendurūpaṃ  
pratyātmavedyaṃ karuṇārasaṃ ca |  
sallakṣaṇair bhūṣitaṃ<sup>39</sup> arthakāri  
dānādiniṣyandam apetasaukhyam || 5 ||  
sānandasallakṣaṇamaṇḍitāṅgaṃ  
sambhujyamānaṃ daśabhūmisamsthaiḥ |  
sattvārthakāri pravadanti sādhyam  
dānādiṣaṭpāramitānayasthāḥ || 6 ||<sup>xiv</sup>

### 5.1 pāramitānaye prathamā sādhyam

ākārair nilapītasukhaduḥkhādibhiś citrarūpaiḥ śūnyaṃ nirākāram. ata eva gaganasyeva nirākāratvenendor iva prabhāsvaratvena rūpaṃ svabhāvo yasya tat tathā. pratyātmavedyam iti svasaṃvedanaikavedyam.<sup>40</sup> karuṇā duḥkhād<sup>41</sup> duḥkha-

<sup>xiv</sup> These two verses are in Indravajrā.

<sup>36</sup> vargacāriṇaś] K TIB (tshogs kyi spyod pa) ; vanacāriṇaś E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>37</sup> nirvāṇe] E<sub>DH</sub>; nirvāṇa° K

<sup>38</sup> abhimataṃ] E<sub>DH</sub>; abhimata K

<sup>39</sup> bhūṣitaṃ] E<sub>DH</sub>; bhuṣitaṃ K

<sup>40</sup> svasaṃvedanaikavedyam] E<sub>DH</sub> (*em.*) (°vedyam); svasaṃvedyanaikavedyam K

<sup>41</sup> karuṇā duḥkhād] K; karuṇāduḥkhā° E<sub>DH</sub>



hetor vā sakalajagadabhyuddharaṇakāmatā.<sup>42,xv</sup> saiva rasaḥ svabhāvo yasya tat tathoktam. etad uktaṁ bhavati—nīlapītādicitrākāraśūnyaṁ nirābhāsaṁ<sup>43</sup> nirañjanam<sup>xvi</sup> gaganopamaṁ svacchaṁ sakalajagadarthakāri<sup>xvii</sup> mahākaruṇāyuktaṁ pratyātmavedyaṁ pāramitopadeśaśabdābhidheyaṁ sādhyam iti pāramitānaye prathamam sādhyam.

## 5.2 pāramitānaye dvitīyaṁ sādhyam

śobhanāni ca tāni lakṣaṇāni ca dvātriṁśallakṣaṇasaṁjñakānīti.<sup>44</sup> tair bhūṣitam. arthaṁ janānāṁ prajñānaṁ kartuṁ śīlaṁ svabhāvo yasya tad arthakāri.<sup>45</sup> dānādīnāṁ daśapāramitānāṁ niṣyandaṁ tatprakarṣaprabhavatvena sadṛśaṁ phalam. duḥkhasya pūrvam eva prahīnatvāt sāksātkaraṇāvasthāyām<sup>46,xviii</sup> saukhyasyāpy abhāvāt<sup>47</sup> upekṣārūpatvenāpetasaukhyam apagatasaukhyam. etad uktaṁ bhavati—dvātriṁśallakṣaṇadharāśītyanuvyañjanavirājitaśarīraṁ sakalajagadarthakāri dānādīpāramitābhyāsa<sup>†</sup> balenātmānaṁ<sup>48†</sup> samyaksambuddharūpaṁ sukhaduḥkharahitatvenopekṣārūpaṁ dvitīyaṁ sādhyam.

<sup>xv</sup> An alternative to °abhyuddharaṇakāmatā is to read °samuddharaṇakāmatā. This definition of *karuṇā*, in various forms, is well known in Buddhist texts. See, for instance, Durvekamiśra's *He-tubinduṭīkāloka*: ... *duḥkhāt duḥkhahe-tor vā samuddharaṇakāmatā nāma yā karuṇā* ... (p. 234); or Manorathānandin's *Pramāṇavārttikavṛtti*: *duḥkhād duḥkhahe-tośca samuddharaṇakāmatā karuṇā* (edition reads *dukhā*°; p. 21).

<sup>xvi</sup> One may instead wish to accept the manuscript reading *nirābhāsanirañjanam*, which is understandable as a *viśeṣaṇasamāsa*. The combination of *nirābhāsaṁ nirañjanam* occurs in a verse from an untraced source cited in Raviśrījñāna's *Amṛtakaṇikā*: *yat kāyaṁ sarvabuddhānāṁ nirābhāsaṁ nirañjanam | ajñātam akṛtaṁ śuddham abhāvādivivarjitam ||* (p. 19)

<sup>xvii</sup> sakalajagadarthakāri can also be read in compound with mahākaruṇā°. This is reflected in both Tibetan translations: 'gro ba ma lus pa'i don byed pa'i snying rje chen po

<sup>xviii</sup> ISAACSON (personal communication) proposes sāksātkaraṇāvasthāyām or sāksātkṛtyāvasthāyām as potentially superior readings.

In support of the former, see *Samkṣipābhiṣekavidhi*: *tadanantaram ekatathatāmatena tayaiva bhinnamate tv ānayā svasaṁviditajñānasāksātkaraṇāvasthāyām pūrvoktagāthayā adhyeṣitavate śiṣyāya tatpāṇau tasyāḥ pāṇiṁ pratisthāpya |*

<sup>42</sup> °abhyuddharaṇakāmatā] *em.*; °atyuddharaṇakāmatā K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>43</sup> nirābhāsaṁ] *em.*; nirābhāsa° K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>44</sup> °saṁjñakānīti] *conj.* (ISAACSON); °saṁjñakāni ceti K E<sub>DH</sub>; mdzes pa'i mtshan sum cu rtsa gnyis zhes bya ste TIB

<sup>45</sup> tad arthakāri] K E<sub>DH</sub>; de ni de'i don mdzad pa'o TIB (tad tadarthakāri)

<sup>46</sup> sāksātkaraṇāvasthāyām] *conj.* (ISAACSON); sāksātkṛtāvasthāyām E<sub>DH</sub>; sāksātkṛtāvatāsthāyām K

<sup>47</sup> abhāvāt] *em.* (ISAACSON); abhāvāt K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>48</sup> °balenātmānaṁ] K E<sub>DH</sub>; stobs kyis bdag nyid TVA<sub>D</sub>; stobs kyis byung ba TVB<sub>G</sub>

### 5.3 pāramitānaye tṛtīyaṃ sādhyam

[E<sub>DH</sub> p. 135] sānandetyādi. sahānandena vartata iti sā[K fol. 4r]nandam. sānandam ca tat sallakṣaṇamaṇḍitāṅgaṃ ca<sup>49</sup> sambhujyamānaṃ dharmadeśanādvāreṇopajīvyamānaṃ.<sup>50</sup> kaiḥ? daśabhūmīśvaraiḥ, pariśiṣṭabhūmisthitānām<sup>51</sup> agocaratvāt. daśabhūmiprāptair avalokiteśvaramaṇjuśrīprabhṛtibhir upabhujyamānam iti yāvat. etad uktaṃ bhavati—śuddhāvāso pari ghanavyūhasaṃjñake<sup>52</sup> samyaksaṃbuddhabhuvane yathā bhagavān ānandarūpaḥ sambhogakāyātmā nirmāṇadvāreṇa<sup>53</sup> sakalajagadarthasampādakaḥ śrāvaka-pratyekabuddhanavabhūmīśvarair apy adṛśyaśariro daśabhūmīśvarair eva paraṃ bodhisattvair<sup>54</sup> dharmāśraṇadvāreṇopabhujyamāna<sup>55</sup> āsaṃsāraṃ cakāsti, tathaiva tat sādhyam iti tṛtīyam.

### 5.4 pāramitānaye caturthaṃ sādhyam

sampūrya dānādiguṇān aśeṣān  
saṃbuddhakṛtyaṃ<sup>56</sup> sakalam ca kṛtvā |  
yad bhūtakoteḥ karaṇaṃ ca sākṣāt  
sādhyam tad apy asti nirodharūpam || 7 ||

sampūryetyādi. dānādipāramitā eva guṇā, guṇyante 'bhyasyanta iti kṛtvā. tān sampūrya paripūrṇān<sup>57</sup> kṛtvā, yat saṃbuddhānāṃ kṛtyaṃ sakalam<sup>58, xix</sup> avaśya-

<sup>xix</sup> The manuscript reading of simply *sakalam* instead of *kṛtyaṃ sakalam* is asymmetrical given the following gloss, *avaśyakartavyaṃ kṛtsnam*. Here Tib. reads simply *nges par mdzad par bya ba ma lus pa*, reflecting only the gloss and neither *sakalam* of the Sanskrit nor the conjecture *kṛtyaṃ sakalam*. It is also possible that *sakalam* is a mistaken scribal addition, but it's also possible that even if the Tibetan translators saw *kṛtyaṃ sakalam*, they chose not to render this because of the superfluous sounding result in Tibetan.

<sup>49</sup> sallakṣaṇamaṇḍitāṅgaṃ ca] *em.* (ISAACSON); sallakṣaṇamaṇḍitāṅgaṃ K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>50</sup> °opajīvyamānaṃ] K E<sub>DH</sub>; nye bar longs spyod par gyur pa'o TIB (°opabhujyamānaṃ)

<sup>51</sup> pariśiṣṭabhūmi°] *corr.*; pariśiṣṭa bhūmi° E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>52</sup> °saṃjñake] *em.*; °saṃjñako K; °saṃjñakaḥ E<sub>DH</sub> (*em.*)

<sup>53</sup> nirmāṇadvāreṇa] K E<sub>DH</sub>; sprul pa'i sku'i sgo nas TIB (nirmāṇakāyadvāreṇa)

<sup>54</sup> paraṃ bodhisattvair] K E<sub>DH</sub> (°sattvair); mchog tu gyur pa'i byang chub sems dpa' TIB (parama-bodhisattvair)

<sup>55</sup> bhujyamāna] *em.*; bhujyamānaṃ K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>56</sup> saṃbuddhakṛtyaṃ] *em.* (cf. TaRaA-V: saṃbuddhānāṃ ... avaśyakartavyaṃ kṛtsnam); saṃbuddhya kṛtyaṃ K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>57</sup> paripūrṇān] *em.*; paripūrṇaṃ K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>58</sup> kṛtyaṃ sakalam] *conj.*; sakalam K E<sub>DH</sub>

kartavyaṃ kṛtsnaṃ tad api kṛtvā, bhūtakoteḥ sūnyatālakṣaṇāyāś cittacaittaniro-  
dhātmikāyā<sup>59</sup> yat sāksāt karaṇaṃ tad api sādhyam astiti pāramitānayasthā evaṃ  
bruvate caturthaṃ sādhyam iti.

## 6 mantranaye saptavidhaṃ sādhyam

### 6.1 mantranaye prathamaṃ sādhyam

idānīm mantranayopadiṣṭaṃ saptavidhaṃ<sup>60</sup> sādhyam kathayitum āha—svābhā-  
ṅganetyādi.

svābhāṅganāśleṣi<sup>61</sup> janārthakāri<sup>62</sup>  
duḥkhaiḥ sukhaiś caiva vimuktirūpam |  
aśītyanuvyañjanabhūṣitāṅgam  
apetakalpaṃ pravadanti sādhyam || 8 ||

svābhāṅganām<sup>63</sup> āśleṣitum śīlaṃ svabhāvo yasya tat svābhāṅganāśleṣi.<sup>64</sup> [E<sub>DH</sub> p.  
136] apetakalpaṃ vyapagatakalpaṃ, kalpanārahitam iti yāvat. anyat subodham.  
ayam arthaḥ—samāliṅgitasvābhāṅganāśleṣi jagadarthakāri<sup>65,xx</sup> dvātriṃśallakṣa-  
ṇavibhūṣitaśarīram<sup>66</sup> upekṣārūpaṃ<sup>67</sup> prathamaṃ sādhyam.

<sup>xx</sup> The compound °svābhāṅganāśleṣajagadarthakāri is strinckly speaking not impossible, and co-  
uld be read as a kind of instrumental *tatpuruṣa*, for example; however, given that this is a prose  
explanation of the verse, there is no need for the author to use such a compound and it seems  
mostly likely that the scribe left off the *ikāra*.

<sup>59</sup> cittacaitta°] E<sub>DH</sub> (*em.*); cittacaitya° K

<sup>60</sup> saptavidhaṃ] E<sub>DH</sub> (Tib: rnam pa bdun); caturthaṃ K

<sup>61</sup> svābhāṅganāśleṣi E<sub>DH</sub> (*corr.*); svābhāṅgañāśleṣi K

<sup>62</sup> janārthakāri] *conj.* (Tib: 'gro ba yi don mdzad; TaRaA-V: jagadarthakāri); ta..rthakāri K (*akṣara*  
*uncertain, perhaps* gna or mva); tadarthakāri E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>63</sup> svābhāṅganām] E<sub>DH</sub> (*corr.*); svābhāṅganām K

<sup>64</sup> svābhāṅganāśleṣi] *corr.*; svābhāṅgañāśleṣi K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>65</sup> °svābhāṅganāśleṣi jagadarthakāri] *conj.* (TVB<sub>G</sub>: nyid dang mtshungs pa'i lha mos 'khyud pa  
can 'gro ba'i don mdzad pa); °svābhāṅganāśleṣajagadarthakāri K E<sub>DH</sub>; nyid dang mtshungs pa'i  
lha mos 'khyud pa can | 'gro ba ma lus pa'i don mdzad pa TVA<sub>D</sub> (°svābhāṅganāśleṣy aśeṣajaga-  
darthakāri)

<sup>66</sup> śarīram] E<sub>DH</sub>; śarīra K

<sup>67</sup> upekṣārūpaṃ] K E<sub>DH</sub>; btang snyoms kyi ngo bo du 'khor ba ji srid du bzhugs pa (ji srid bzhugs  
pa] TVA<sub>D</sub>; ju bzhugs pa TVB<sub>G</sub>) mngon du bya ba yin no zhe bya ba TIB (upekṣārūpaṃ āsaṃsāra-  
sthāyi sāksātkriyāta iti)

## 6.2 mantranaye dvitīyaṃ sādhyam

svadevatākāraviśeṣasūnyaṃ  
prāḡ eva sambhāvya sukhaṃ sphuṭaṃ sat |  
mahāsukhākhyam jagadarthakāri  
cintāmaṇiprakhyam uvāca kaścit || 9 ||

svadevatetyādi. svadevatākāraviśeṣeṇa<sup>68</sup> sveṣṭadevatākāreṇa sūnyam, nirākāram iti yāvat. prāḡ eva prathamataram<sup>69</sup> upadeśānantaram eva<sup>70</sup> devatākāranirapekṣam sukhaṃ sambhāvya, bhāvanayā sāksāt kṛtvā, sphuṭaṃ<sup>71,xxi</sup> sphu[K fol. 4v] ṭikṛtaṃ san mahāsukhasaṃjñakaṃ bhavati. tac ca jagadarthakāri cintāmaṇisamānarūpam. etad uktaṃ bhavati—upadeśānantaram eva mantramudrādevatākārarahitaṃ<sup>72</sup> bhāvanayā sphuṭikṛtaṃ mahāsukhasaṃjñakaṃ cintāmaṇivaj jagadarthakāri māyopamam āsaṃsārasthāyi dvitīyaṃ sādhyam.

## 6.3 mantranaye tṛtīyaṃ sādhyam

kṛtvā sāksāt svādhipaṃ [K fol. 1v] sātārūpaṃ  
paścāt tyaktvā sātāmātraṃ phalaṃ syāt |  
śuddhaṃ sāksāc chakyate naiva kartuṃ  
tenākāro bhāvitaḥ svādhipasya || 10 ||

kṛtvetyādi. svādhipaṃ sveṣṭadaivataṃ sāksāt kṛtvāmukhikṛtya sātārūpaṃ sukhai-kasvabhāvam, paścād devatākāraṃ parityajya, sukhamātraṃ<sup>73</sup> phalaṃ sādhyam vyavasthitaṃ syāt.

nanu yadi<sup>74</sup> sāksāt kṛtvāpi devatākāras tyaktavyaḥ, tarhi prathamam eva kasmād [E<sub>DH</sub> p. 137] vibhāvitaḥ? sukhamātraṃ eva dvitīyasādhyavat kiṃ na vibhā-

<sup>xxi</sup> The understanding reflected in TIB, namely *asphuṭaṃ* instead of *sphuṭaṃ*, is an alternative word division and also yields sense. It seems more likely, however, that the author is glossing *sphuṭaṃ*.

<sup>68</sup> svadevatā°] Σ<sub>TVA<sub>D</sub></sub>; lha TVA<sub>D</sub> (devatā°)

<sup>69</sup> prathamataram] K; prathamataro° E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>70</sup> upadeśānantaram eva] E<sub>DH</sub> (*em.*); upadeśāntaram eva K; bshad ma thag pa'i TIB (anantarokta°)

<sup>71</sup> sphuṭaṃ] K; *deest in* E<sub>DH</sub>; ma gsal ba TIB

<sup>72</sup> °rahitaṃ] Σ<sub>TVA<sub>D</sub></sub>; spangs te | bde ba 'ba' zbig tsam TVA<sub>D</sub> (°rahitaṃ sukhamātraṃ)

<sup>73</sup> sukhamātraṃ] *em.*; sukhamātra° K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>74</sup> nanu yadi] *conj.*; nanu K E<sub>DH</sub>; gal te TVA<sub>D</sub> ([nanu] yadi); TVB<sub>C</sub>: *not clearly rendered*

vitam?<sup>75</sup> kiṃ vṛthāprayāsenety<sup>76</sup> āha—śuddham ityādi. śuddham kevalam devatā-kāravirahitaṃ sukhamaṭram naiva sāksāt kartuṃ śakyate, ākārahitasya sukhasyānupalambhāt. tasmāt tena kāraṇenākāro bhāvitaḥ svādhipasyeti tṛtīyam.<sup>77</sup> a-yam arthaḥ<sup>78</sup>—devatākārasaṃvalitaṃ eva sukhaṃ vibhāvya, sāksādbhūte devatākāraṃ tyaktvā, sukhamaṭram eva sādhyam uktaguṇam.

#### 6.4 mantranaye caturthaṃ sādhyam

gagaṇasamaśarīraṃ lakṣaṇair bhūṣitāṅgaṃ  
nirupamasukhapūrṇaṃ<sup>79</sup> svābhayā saṃgataṃ ca |  
sphuradāmitamunīndraiḥ<sup>80</sup> sarvasattvārthakāri  
pravadati punar anyāḥ sādhyam ucchedaśūnyam || 11 ||

gagaṇetyādi. gagaṇasamaṃ māyopamaṃ vicārāsahaṃ<sup>81</sup> śarīraṃ yasya. lakṣaṇair dvātriṃśadbhir aśītibhiś cānuyāñjanair maṇḍitāny aṅgāni yasya. nirupamair sthaulya<sup>82</sup> nairantaryā<sup>83</sup> saṃsāra<sup>84</sup> pravāhitvanirāsravatvādibhir upamābhāvād upamātikrāntair sukhair pūrṇaṃ romāgraparyantaṃ<sup>85,xxii</sup> saṃpūrṇam. svābhayā ca tathābhūtayā saṃgataṃ samāliṅgitam. sphuradbhir anantanirmitair munīndrais tathābhūtair eva sarvasattvārthakāri.<sup>86</sup> ucchedeneti nirodhena śūnyam tucchaṃ riktam.<sup>87</sup>

<sup>xxii</sup> See a similar expression in *Siddhaikavirasādhana* (author unknown): *tato niḥsṛtaraśmibhir āpādatalād vālāgraparyāntaprāptaṃ bhāvyaṭe* (*Sādhanaṃālā* no. 67, p. 67); *de las byung ba'i 'od zer gyis rkang pa'i mthil nas skra'i rtse mo'i mthar thug pa khyab par bsgoms te* (Tōh. 3461 fol. 116r)

<sup>75</sup> vibhāvitaṃ] *em.*; vibhāvitaḥ E<sub>DH</sub> (*em.*); vibhāgato K

<sup>76</sup> vṛthāprayāsenety] E<sub>DH</sub>; vyathāprayāsenety K

<sup>77</sup> tṛtīyam] *em.* TVB<sub>G</sub> (gsum pa yin no); tṛtīyaḥ K E<sub>DH</sub>; bsgrub par bya ba gsum pa yin no TVA<sub>D</sub> (tṛtīyaṃ sādhyam)

<sup>78</sup> arthaḥ] E<sub>DH</sub>; artha K

<sup>79</sup> nirupama°] E<sub>DH</sub>; nirupama° K

<sup>80</sup> °munīndraiḥ] *em.*; °munīndraḥ K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>81</sup> māyopamaṃ vicārāsahaṃ] K (*reading slightly unclear*); māyopamavicārasaha E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>82</sup> sthaulya°] K E<sub>DH</sub>; rgya nom pa nyid dang | rgya che ba nyid dang TVA<sub>D</sub> (praṇītatvasthaulya°); lhun che ba nyid dang | TVB<sub>G</sub> (sthaulya°)

<sup>83</sup> °nairantaryā°] E<sub>DH</sub> (*em.*) (TIB: bar med pa nyid dang); °nairuttaryā° K

<sup>84</sup> °saṃsāra°] *em.*; °saṃsāraṃ E<sub>DH</sub> K

<sup>85</sup> pūrṇaṃ romāgraparyantaṃ] *conj.* (TIB: gang ba ni | ba spu rtse mo'i mthar thug pa); pūrṇaṃ masimāgrapayantaṃ K; pūrṇatāṃ samāśrayantaṃ E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>86</sup> sarvasattvārtha°] K E<sub>DH</sub> (TVB<sub>G</sub>: sems can thams cad kyi don); sems can gyi don TVA<sub>D</sub> (sattvārtha°)

<sup>87</sup> tucchaṃ riktam] K; bhūṣthaṃ riktam E<sub>DH</sub>; spangs pa'o TIB (tucchaṃ / riktam)

etad uktam bhavati—gaganamāyāmarīci<sup>88</sup> gandharvanagarodakacandraprati-  
bimbasvapnopamam<sup>89</sup> [K fol. 5r] ekānekabhāvābhāvagrāhyagrāhakasvabhāvara-  
hitam anādyantam aśeṣavastusaṃdohasvabhāvam<sup>90</sup> anābhāsam nirañjanam sa-  
rvopamātikrāntam paramasūkṣmātigambhīraprajñārūpatayā dharmakāyasvabhā-  
vam, dvātriṃśallakṣaṇavibhūṣitaśarīram aśītyanuvyañjanavirājitagātram<sup>91</sup> para-  
maśṛṅgārayauvanādyupetaṃ svābhāṅganālīṅgitāṅgaṃ rūpavajrādītārāparyanta-  
devīgaṇair anantaprabhedānimittarati<sup>92</sup> svarūpaparamānandopabhogadvāreṇa<sup>xxiii</sup>  
pratibimbavat [E<sub>DH</sub> p. 138] sambhujyamānam karuṇāsaṃvalitodārarūpatayā sa-  
mbhogakāyarūpam, nānādhimuktivīneyajanaparipācanārtham anekavidhaprāti-  
hāryadvāreṇa<sup>93</sup> nirmittānantakulāntarbhūtasambuddhabodhisattvaspharaṇasaṃ-  
hārakāritvena<sup>94</sup> nirmāṇakāyātmakam, śūnyatākaruṇābhinnabodhicitta<sup>95</sup> svabhā-  
vāmalaprajñopāyasamādhisambhūtasatsukhāpūrṇam<sup>xxiv</sup> āsaṃsārasthitidharmam<sup>96</sup>  
apratīṣṭhitanirvāṇarūpaṃ nirmalanivātaniścalapradīpaśikhāprabandhanityatayā  
nīrodhaśūnyaṃ caturtham<sup>97</sup> sādhyam.

<sup>xxiii</sup> See parallels in *Samantabhadrasādhana* for \*animittarati / mtshan ma med pa'i dga' ba.

From *rūpavajrā*° up to °dvāreṇa, TVA<sub>D</sub> reads : gzugs rdo rje la sogs pa nas | sgrol ma'i mthar thug pa'i lha mo'i tshogs kyis mtshan ma med pa'i dga' ba'i rang gi ngo bo'i rab tu dbye ba dpag tu med pas mchog tu dga' ba la nye bar longs skyod pa'i sgo nas. TVB<sub>G</sub> reads: gzugs rdo rje la sogs pa nas sgrol ma'i mthar thug pa'i lha mo'i tshogs kyis mtshan ma med pa'i rang gi ngo bo'i rab tu dpag tu med pas mchog tu dga' ba la nye bar longs spyod pa'i sgo nas.

<sup>xxiv</sup> See Sahajavilāsa, *Svādhiṣṭhānakurukullāsādhana* (SāMā no. 183, p. 383): tataḥ prajñopāyāma-  
lasamādhisambhūtasatsukhāpūrṇam iva svadeham trailokya ca paśyet.

<sup>88</sup> māyāmarīci°] K E<sub>DH</sub> (TVB<sub>G</sub>: sgyu ma dang | smig rgyu dang |); sgyu ma dang | smig rgyu dang | TVA<sub>D</sub> (māyāmarīcīndrajāla° / māyendrajālamārīci°)

<sup>89</sup> °svapnopamam] E<sub>DH</sub>; svapnāpayam K

<sup>90</sup> anādyantam aśeṣavastusaṃdohasvabhāvam] K E<sub>DH</sub>; thog ma dang tha ma med pa'i dngos po ma lus pa'i rang bzhin TVA<sub>D</sub> TVB<sub>G</sub> (anādyantāśeṣavastusvabhāvam)

<sup>91</sup> °gātram] K E<sub>DH</sub>; no reflex in TIB

<sup>92</sup> anantaprabhedānimittarati°] conj. (TVA<sub>D</sub>: mtshan ma med pa'i dga' ba'i rang gi ngo bo'i rab tu dbye ba dpag tu med pas); anantaprabhedānimittārati° KE<sub>DH</sub>; mtshan ma med pa'i rang gi ngo bo'i rab tu dpag tu med pas TVB<sub>G</sub>

<sup>93</sup> anekavidhaprātihārya°] K E<sub>DH</sub>; rdzu 'phrul dang cho 'phrul rnam pa du ma TVA<sub>D</sub> TVB<sub>G</sub> (ane-  
kaṛddhiprātihārya°)

<sup>94</sup> °bodhisattva°] conj. (TVB<sub>G</sub>: byang chub sems dpa'i); °bodhi° K E<sub>DH</sub>; byang chub sems dpa' la sogs pa'i TVA<sub>D</sub> (°bodhisattvādi°)

<sup>95</sup> °bodhicitta°] E<sub>DH</sub>; °bodhicittā° K

<sup>96</sup> conj. (cf. Tib: chos can); dharmāṇām K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>97</sup> caturtham] E<sub>DH</sub>; caturtha K

## 6.5 mantranaye pañcamam sādhyam

kṛtvā sākṣāt svādhipaṃ sātārūpaṃ  
 tyaktvopekṣājñānamātraṃ<sup>98</sup> phalaṃ syāt |  
 āsaṃsārasthāyi sattvārthakāri  
 cintā<sup>99</sup>ratnaprakhyam<sup>100</sup> ekāntaśāntam || 12 ||

kṛtvetyādi. sākṣāt svādhipaṃ kṛtvā, paścāt<sup>101</sup> tyaktvā, upekṣārūpaṃ yaj jñānaṃ tanmātraṃ<sup>xxv</sup> sādhyam syāt. anyat sugamaṃ.<sup>102</sup> etad uktaṃ bhavati—maṇḍalakra-rūpaṃ sākṣāt kṛtvā, paścāt tan nirodhya, upekṣājñānamātraṃ sādhyam syāt pañcamam.

## 6.6 mantranaye ṣaṣṭhamam sādhyam

kṛtvā sākṣān maṇḍalaṃ sātārūpaṃ  
 paścāt tasya svecchayā nirvṛtiś<sup>103</sup> ca |  
 sattvārthasyāpy asty abhāvo na vāsmiṃ  
 prādurbhāvo nirvṛtād<sup>104</sup> asti yasmāt || 13 ||

kṛtvetyādi. kṛtvā sākṣān maṇḍalaṃ sātasaṃvalitam,<sup>105</sup> tasya svecchayā nirvṛtir nirodhaḥ.

nanu yadi sākṣāt kṛtvāpi paścāt svecchayā nirodhayita[K fol. 5v]vyam,<sup>106</sup> tadā karuṇāyā anekakālābhyastāyā abhāvaḥ syāt. tasyāś cābhāvāt sattvārthābhāvaḥ [E<sub>DH</sub> p. 139] syād ity āśaṅkyāha—sattvārthasyāpy asty abhāvo na vetyādi. asmiṃ pakṣe sattvārthābhāvo nāsti, yasmān nirvṛtāc cakrāt karuṇāsaṃvalitāt sattvārthasya prādurbhāvo 'sti.<sup>xxvi</sup>

<sup>xxv</sup> tanmātraṃ] check: in compound or not

<sup>xxvi</sup> TIB suggests reading *karuṇāsaṃvalitasya*: 'gags pa'i 'khor lo las snying rje'i rang bzhin can sems can gyi don ('gags pa'i] TVB<sub>G</sub>; 'gog pa'i TVA<sub>D</sub>)

<sup>98</sup> tyaktvopekṣā°] K (*E<sub>DH</sub> incorrectly reports as tyajyo°*) (*see commentary*); bhāvopekṣā° E<sub>DH</sub> (*em.*); no reflex in TM<sub>D</sub>

<sup>99</sup> cintā°] K<sup>pc</sup> E<sub>DH</sub>; cittā° K<sup>ac</sup>

<sup>100</sup> °prakhyam] E<sub>DH</sub>; °prakhyamṃ K

<sup>101</sup> paścāt] E<sub>DH</sub>; paścāta K

<sup>102</sup> sugamaṃ] E<sub>DH</sub>; sūgamaṃ K

<sup>103</sup> nirvṛtiś] K; nirvṛtiṃ] E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>104</sup> nirvṛtād] E<sub>DH</sub>; nivṛtād K

<sup>105</sup> sātasaṃvalitam] *em.* (TIB: bde ba'i rang bzhin can); sātam saṃvalitam K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>106</sup> nirodhayitavyam] *em.*; nirodhayitavyaḥ K E<sub>DH</sub>

etenaitad evāha—sātasampūrṇacakraṃ sākṣāt kṛtvā, yāvad iṣṭaṃ kālaṃ vya-  
vasthāpya, paścāt tasya sarvathaiva pradīpavan nirodhaṃ kṛtvā sthātavyam. yadā  
punaḥ sattvārthābhilāṣo bhavati, tadā niruddhād eva cakraṇtaram utpādyā sa-  
ttvārthaḥ kartavyaḥ. cakraṇtarotpāde<sup>107</sup> 'pi ciraniruddhād<sup>108</sup> eva cakraḍ yathā-  
bhavyatayā<sup>109</sup> vineyānāṃ yathābhilaṣitaḥprāptir bhavatīti ṣaṣṭham.

## 6.7 mantranaye saptamaṃ sādhyam

kṛtvā sphuṭaṃ rūpaṃ abhiṣṭam eṣāṃ  
paścān nirodhaḥ<sup>110,xxvii</sup> phalam āha kaścit |  
abhinnarūpaś ca yato nirodho  
na pakṣabhede 'pi tato 'sti bhedaḥ || 14 ||

kṛtvetyādi. ṣaṇṇāṃ pakṣāṇāṃ anyatamasya phalasya<sup>111</sup> sādhyatvād yad yad evā-  
bhiṣṭam<sup>112</sup> tad<sup>113</sup> eva sākṣāt kṛtvā, paścāt sarvathaiva pradīpavan nirodha uttara-  
kālaṃ sattvārthādisūnyaḥ sākṣāt kartavyaḥ.

nanu ṣaṭpakṣabhedenā ṣaḍ eva<sup>114</sup> nirodhāḥ syuḥ. tat katham eka eva ni-  
rodha ity āśaṅkyāha—abhinnetyādi. abhinnaṃ<sup>115</sup> rūpaṃ yasya sa tathā.<sup>116</sup> na hi ni-  
rodhānāṃ ṣaṭpakṣalakṣaṇabhede 'pi bhedo 'sti, abhāvaika rūpatayā nirodhasya  
samānatvāt. ayam arthaḥ—anyatamapakṣaṃ sākṣāt kṛtvā paścāt tasya santāno-  
cchedarūpo nirodha iti saptamaṃ sādhyam.

<sup>xxvii</sup> It is possible to take *phala* as the direct object of  $\sqrt{ah}$  and then read *nirodhaṃ*, construing it as an accusative form; however, the agent of  $\sqrt{kr}$  and  $\sqrt{ah}$  would have to be the same. Rather, with the reading *nirodhaḥ phalam*, we can avoid this problem and simply supply an *iti*.

<sup>107</sup> cakraṇtarotpāde] E<sub>DH</sub>; cakraṇtaropāde K

<sup>108</sup> ciraniruddhād] *em.* (TIB: rin du 'gags pa'i); citaniruddhād K; cittaniruddhād E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>109</sup> yathābhavyatayā] *variant word division in* E<sub>DH</sub>: yathā bhavyatayā

<sup>110</sup> nirodhaḥ] *em.*; nirodha(ṃ) K (*this may be corrected to ḥ*); nirodham E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>111</sup> anyatamasya phalasya] *conj.*; arthaphalasya K E<sub>DH</sub>; nang nas 'bras bu TIB

<sup>112</sup> phalasya sādhyatvād yad yad evābhiṣṭam] K E<sub>DH</sub>; 'bras bu bsgrub bya gang kho na TVA<sub>D</sub> (phalam yad eva); bsgrub bya gang kho na mngon par 'dod pa TVB<sub>G</sub> (phalam yad evābhiṣṭam);

<sup>113</sup> tad] E<sub>DH</sub>; sad K

<sup>114</sup> ṣaḍ eva] E<sub>DH</sub>; ṣatreva K

<sup>115</sup> abhinnaṃ] E<sub>DH</sub>; abhinna K

<sup>116</sup> sa tathā] *em.*; tat tathā K E<sub>DH</sub>



## 7 caturthe 'bhiṣekase vipratipattiḥ

### 7.1 caturthaseke vipratipattiḥ prathamā

prajñājñānād uttaram bodhicittā-  
svādas turyaṃ sekam<sup>117</sup> āhāvaraṃ tat |  
yasmāt<sup>118</sup> sarvo bhāvanāsu prayāso  
vyarthaḥ prāptas tatphalasya prasiddheḥ || 15 ||

[E<sub>DH</sub> p. 140] prajñājñānetyādi. prajñājñānopadeśād uttarakālaṃ<sup>119</sup> yat bodhicittasyāmṛtarūpasya<sup>120</sup> rasanayā grahaṇam, tat turyaṃ caturthaṃ [K fol. 6r] sekam āha kaścīt. tac cāvaraṃ hīnam, vinikṛṣṭam iti yāvat. kasmād avaram? yasmāt sarvaprāyāso mantramudrādevatādyākārabhāvanāsu punaḥ punar anuṣṭhānala-kṣaṇas tathāgatokto<sup>121</sup> vyarthaḥ prāptaḥ.<sup>xxviii</sup> kutah? tatphalasya bhāvanāsādhyasya phalasya bodhicittāsvādakāla eva prasiddhatvāt prāptatvāt, anyasya viśiṣṭasya phalasyābhāvād iti yāvat.

### 7.2 caturthaseke vipratipattir dvitīyā

prajñājñānād uttaram prāptarāmā-  
svādas turyaṃ sekam āhādhamam tat |  
yasmāt sarvo bhāvanātau prayatno  
buddhoddiṣṭo niṣphalaḥ saṃprasaktaḥ || 16 ||

<sup>xxviii</sup> TIB reflects understanding two items that would be *vyartha*, perhaps suggesting another reading of the Sanskrit text: *gang gi phyir sngags dang phyag rgya dang | lha nyid la sogs pa'i rnam pa bsgom pa la yang dang yang du 'bad pa dang | gzhan yang de bzhin gshegs pas gsungs pa'i sgrub pa'i mtshan nyid don med pa thob par 'gyur ro* || 'Because it would follow that repeated effort in meditation ... and, what's more (*gzhan yang*; Skt. *ca?*), what is characterised as practice taught by the *tathāgatas*'.

<sup>117</sup> sekam] E<sub>DH</sub>; seṣam K

<sup>118</sup> yasmāt] E<sub>DH</sub>; paścāt K

<sup>119</sup> prajñājñānopadeśād uttarakālaṃ] K E<sub>DH</sub>; shes rab dang ye shes ni shes rab ye shes te | dbang bskur ba'i bye brag go || phyis ni 'das pa'i 'og tu'o || gang zhe na | TVA<sub>D</sub> (prajñājñānetyādi. prajñā ca jñānaṃ prajñājñānaṃ sekaviśeṣaḥ. uttaram paścāt. kim iti); shes rab dang ye shes te | dbang bskur ba'i bye brag go || phyis te rdzogs pa'i dus kyi byang chub gang zhe na | TVB<sub>G</sub> (*text may have suffered from corruption after phyis*)

<sup>120</sup> bodhicittasyāmṛtarūpasya] *em.* (TVA<sub>D</sub>: byang chub kyi sems te); saṃ bodhicittasyāmṛtarūpasya K E<sub>DH</sub>; sems te TVB<sub>G</sub> (cittasya)

<sup>121</sup> tathāgatokto] K; tathāgatoktau E<sub>DH</sub>

prajñetyādi. prajñājñānād uttarakālaṃ yāḥ prāptā yathāmlitā rāmāḥ striyas tā-  
sāṃ samāpattidvāreṇa<sup>122</sup> ya āsvādaḥ, tat turyaṃ sekam. tad apy adhamam. śeṣaṃ  
gatārtham.

### 7.3 āgamasya arthavyākhyānam

atha caturtham tat punas tatheti<sup>123,xxix</sup> vyākhyāyate. caturtham iti<sup>124</sup> prajñājñā-  
naṃ tṛtīyam apekṣya caturtham ity ucyate. tad iti tacchabdena tad eva prajñājñā-  
naṃ tadrūpaṃ parāmrśyate. punar iti punaḥśabdena tasmād viśeṣaḥ. viśeṣaś cā-  
tra nirāsravaniruttarātyantasphītāvicchinnaṃprabandha<sup>125</sup> pravāhitvalakṣaṇaḥ.<sup>126</sup>  
tatheti tathāśabdena tādrśatvam abhidhiyate. tādrśatvaṃ ca yādrśyā prajñādiyu-  
ktayā<sup>127</sup> sāmagryā yādrśaṃ prajñājñānam utpannam, paścād api tādrśyaiva sā-  
magryā tathaiva cotpadyate, nānyatheti tathāśabdārthaḥ.

atra ca lakṣyalakṣaṇabhāvenārtho boddhavyaḥ. lakṣyate 'neneti lakṣaṇam a-  
nubhūyamānaṃ prajñājñānam, apratīyamānasya lakṣaṇatvāyogāt, nāgrhītaviśe-  
ṣaṇā [E<sub>DH</sub> p. 141] viśeṣyabuddhir iti nyāyāt. lakṣyate jñāyate pratipādyate 'neneti  
lakṣyaṃ sākṣāt kariṣyamānaṃ caturtham.

### 7.4 caruthaseke vipratipattis tṛtīyā

atra caturtham nāstīty eke.<sup>xxx</sup> nanu caturtham ity etad asti tatpadam.<sup>128</sup> tat ka-  
thaṃ nāstīty ucyate? satyam, upadeśasaṃrakṣārthaṃ sattvavyāmohanāya ca tṛtī-

<sup>xxix</sup> *Samājottara* 112c

<sup>xxx</sup> TV<sub>AD</sub> adds near the beginning of this sentence *Samājottara* 112ab *abhiṣekaṃ tridhā bhedaṃ  
asmin tanre prakalpitam* |: 'dir 'ga' zhiḡ | dbang ni rnam pa gsum dag tu | rgyud 'di las ni rab tu  
grags || zhes gsungs pas na | bzhi pa ni yang dag pa ma yin no zhe na |

<sup>122</sup> samāpattidvāreṇa] E<sub>DH</sub>; rig pa'i sgo nas TV<sub>AD</sub>; reg pa'i sgo nas TV<sub>BG</sub> (sparṣadvāreṇa)

<sup>123</sup> punas tatheti] E<sub>DH</sub> (*em.*); punar iti K

<sup>124</sup> caturtham iti] K E<sub>DH</sub> TV<sub>AD</sub> (bzhi pa ni); deest in TV<sub>BG</sub>

<sup>125</sup> °niruttarātyantasphītāvicchinnaṃprabandha°] K; shin tu rgyas pa nyid rgyun mi chad par TV<sub>BG</sub>  
(°ātyantasphītāvicchinnaṃprabandha°); nirantarātyantasphītāvicchinnaṃprabandha° E<sub>DH</sub> (*em.*); shin  
tu rgyas pa nyid dang | bar chad med pa nyid dang | rgyun mi 'chad par TV<sub>AD</sub> (°ātyantasphītani-  
rantarāvicchinnaṃprabandha°)

<sup>126</sup> °lakṣaṇaḥ] E<sub>DH</sub>; °lakṣaṇam K

<sup>127</sup> °yuktayā] *conj.* (TIB: dang ldan pa'i); °yuktyā K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>128</sup> nanu caturtham ity etad asti tatpadam] K (nanu caturtham ity etad asti | tat padan) E<sub>DH</sub>; de  
ltaṃ de bzhi pa yang || zhes bya ba'i tshig bcom ldan 'das kyis gsungs pa yod pa ma yin  
nam | TV<sub>AD</sub> (caturtham tat punas tatheti padaṃ bhagavatā notkaṃ vā); de lta na de ma yin pa  
gzhan de ltaṃ de bzhi pa yang zhes bya ba der bzhi pa zhes bya ba'i tshig bcom ldan 'das  
kyis gsungs pa yod pa ma yin nam | TV<sub>BG</sub> (nanu yadi evaṃ na syāt, tadā caturtham tat punas  
tatheti padaṃ bhagavatā notkaṃ vā)

yam eva caturthaśabde [K fol. 6v] noktaṃ bhagavatā. anyathā tat punar iti noktaṃ syāt.<sup>xxxix</sup>

tad atyantāsaṃgatam, caturthasya pramāṇasiddhasya pratipāditatvāt prati-  
pādayiṣyamāṇatvāc ceti.<sup>xxxix</sup>

## 7.5 lakṣyasya vicāraṇam

atra lakṣaṇaṃ prajñājnānaṃ pratītam eva sarvaiḥ. lakṣye<sup>129</sup> paraṃ vyāmohaḥ.  
tad vicāryate. lakṣyaṃ hi bhaved<sup>130</sup> artharūpaṃ vā syāt jñānarūpaṃ vā. na tāvad  
artharūpaṃ, arthasyaikasyābhāvāt, ekānekaviyogitvena pramāṇena tasya nirā-  
kṛtatvāt. mantranaye ca vijñānavādamadhyamakamatayor<sup>131</sup> eva pradhānatvād  
jñānarūpaṃ vā syāt. jñānaṃ ca sākāraṃ vā nirākāraṃ vā. sākāraṃ api citrādvai-  
tarūpaṃ vā syād anekarūpaṃ vā syād iti vikalpāḥ.

### 7.5.1 sākārasya vijñānasya nirākaraṇam

tatra sākāravijñānaṃ sarvathaiva gagaṇakamalavan nāstīti nirākāravādinō bru-  
vate. nanu nīlapītaśuklādighaṭapaṭaśakaṭādi<sup>132</sup> rūpeṇākārāḥ<sup>133</sup> pratibhāsante<sup>134</sup> pra-  
tyakṣataḥ.<sup>xxxiii</sup> te cārthasyābhāvād jñānarūpā eva. tat kathaṃ sākāraṃ nāstīti?<sup>xxxiv</sup>  
satyam. pratibhāsanta evākārāḥ, paraṃ alīkarūpeṇa. alīkarūpatā caikānekaviyo-  
gitvena<sup>135</sup> pramāṇalakṣaṇena<sup>136</sup> prasiddhā. tasya ca pramāṇasvarūpasyānyatra<sup>137</sup>

<sup>xxxix</sup> A portion seems to have dropped out from TVAD.

<sup>xxxii</sup> Tib. discusses two further *paṅkas* here: that the fourth referred to in the *Samājottara* is the four *aṅga* of *sevā* and so forth; and what appears to be the idea that the four initiation consists in the third accompanied by its fruits ('*bras bu dang bcas pa*).

<sup>xxxiii</sup> TIB phrases this sentence as a rhetorical question, as if the Sanskrit started *kiṃ na ....*

<sup>xxxiv</sup> TVAD's expression of the argument runs differently: *don (rnam pa) de dag kyang med pa'i phyir shes pa'i ngo bo nyid kyang med yin na | de ji ltar rnam pa dang bcas pa ma yin zhe na* | 'Because those objects [i.e., *ākāras*] also do not exist, the nature of cognition too cannot exist. So how can cognition not have *ākāras*?'

<sup>129</sup> lakṣye] E<sub>DH</sub> (*em.*); lakṣyā K

<sup>130</sup> lakṣyaṃ hi bhavet] *conj.* (TIB: mtshon par bya ba yang srid na); lakṣyaṃ hi bhagavat K E<sub>DH</sub> ('gavad)

<sup>131</sup> matayor] E<sub>DH</sub>; tamayor K

<sup>132</sup> °śakaṭādi°] E<sub>DH</sub> (*em.*); °prakaṭādi° K

<sup>133</sup> °ākārāḥ] *conj.*; ((cā))kārāḥ] K; vākārāḥ E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>134</sup> pratibhāsante] E<sub>DH</sub>; pratibhāsante K

<sup>135</sup> °viyogitvena] *conj.* °viyogitva° K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>136</sup> °pramāṇalakṣaṇena] K E<sub>DH</sub> (TVB<sub>G</sub>: tshad ma'i mtshan nyid kyis); mtshan nyid kyis TVB<sub>G</sub> ('lakṣaṇena)

<sup>137</sup> pramāṇasvarūpasyā°] E<sub>DH</sub>; pramāṇa(((pe)))rūpasyā° K

kathitatvān neha<sup>138</sup> pratanyate. alikatvaprasiddhā ca māyāmayā ivākārā bhrānti-rūpāḥ prakāśante.<sup>139</sup> bhrāntinivṛttau ca nirākāram eva<sup>140</sup> śuddhasphaṭikasamkāśaṃ pāramārthikaṃ<sup>141</sup> siddhaṃ bhavati.<sup>142</sup> ataś citrādvaitarūpam anekarūpam ca sākāram vijñānam astīti vikalpadvayaṃ nirastaṃ bhavatīti.

### 7.5.2 nirākārasya vijñānasya samarthanam

nanu nirākāram api vijñānam upalabdihlakṣaṇaprāptaṃ svapne 'pi nopalabhyate. tat kathaṃ tad asti paramārthata<sup>143</sup> i[K fol. 7r]ty ucyate? ucyate. sukhākāram vijñānam antaḥparisphuradrūpaṃ nirākāram samvedyata eva. nīlādyākārāḥ punar alikāḥ pratibhāsante. anyathā teṣāṃ satyatve sarva evākārāḥ satyāḥ syuḥ. tathā hi grāhyagrāhakabhāvādikam api satyaṃ [E<sub>DH</sub> p. 142] syāt. tataś ca sarveṣāṃ eva satyapratibhāsatvena muktiprasaṅgaḥ,<sup>144</sup> keṣāñcid api mithyāpratibhāsasya bhrāntirūpasyāpratibhāsanāt. tathā cōktaṃ—

draṣṭavyaṃ<sup>145</sup> bhūtato bhūtaṃ bhūtadarśi vimucyate |<sup>xxxv</sup>

tasmād akāmakenāpi nīlādyākārāṇāṃ alikatvam evaiṣṭavyam. sukhādikaṃ nirākāram<sup>146</sup> satyam upalabhyate. tat kathaṃ nopalabhyata iti.

nanu sukhādyākāram sākāram eva vijñānam<sup>147</sup> upalabhyate, sukhāder ākāra-svabhāvatvāt. na ca sukhādyākārasūnyaṃ jñānaṃ svapne 'pi samvedyate. sakalabhrāntivigamād aṣṭamyāṃ bhūmāv upalabdihlakṣaṇaprāptir bhavatīty atrāpi kośapānaṃ<sup>148</sup> vinā anyan na<sup>149</sup> pramāṇam asti prasādhakam iti. tad asat,<sup>150</sup> a-

<sup>xxxv</sup> *Abhisamayālaṅkāra* 5.21; *Ratnagotravīghāba* 154; *Pratītyasamputpādahṛdayakārikā* 7; etc.

<sup>138</sup> neha] E<sub>DH</sub>; eha K

<sup>139</sup> prakāśante] K (prakāśante); prakāśyante E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>140</sup> nirākāram eva] K E<sub>DH</sub> TVB<sub>G</sub> (rnam pa med pa kho na); rnam pa med pa de kho na TVB<sub>G</sub> (nirākāram eva tad)

<sup>141</sup> pāramārthikaṃ] E<sub>DH</sub> (*em.*); pārarthikaṃ K

<sup>142</sup> bhavati] K; bhavatīti E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>143</sup> paramārthata] *em.*; paramārtham K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>144</sup> muktiprasaṅgaḥ] *conj.*; yukti-prasaṅgāt K; muktiprasaṅgāt E<sub>DH</sub> (*em.*)

<sup>145</sup> draṣṭavyaṃ] E<sub>DH</sub>; draṣṭavya K

<sup>146</sup> nirākāram] K E<sub>DH</sub>; rnam pa brdzun pa TIB (alikākāram)

<sup>147</sup> sākāram eva vijñānam] *conj.* (TIB: rnam pa dang bcas pa'i kho na shes pa); eva vijñānam K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>148</sup> kośapānaṃ] K (kosapānaṃ); śapathollaṅghanam E<sub>DH</sub> (*em.*)

<sup>149</sup> anyan na] E<sub>DH</sub>; anyatra K

<sup>150</sup> tad asat] *conj.* (TIB: de ni bden pa ma yin te); tad K E<sub>DH</sub>; asat etat *possible conj.*

bhiprāyāparijñānāt, sukhādyākārasyaiva nīlādyākārarahitasya vijñānasya nirā-  
kāratveneṣṭatvāt. tac cedānīm eva svasaṃvedanapramāṇasiddham sakalapraṇa-  
bhṛtam<sup>151</sup> astīti katham nopalabdhiḥ?

### 7.5.3 Establishing the Madhyamaka position

nanu tad<sup>152</sup> apy ekānekasvabhāvaviyogād alikam eva bhrāntimātram, ekāneka-  
svabhāvarahitasya sākāranirākāravijñānavyāpitvāt.

nanv anena nyāyena sakalasākāranirākāravijñānasyālikatvaprasāadhanān na  
kiñcid api pāramārthikam vastutattvam asti.<sup>153</sup> tat katham lakṣyasya svarūpaṃ  
pramāṇata upalakṣayitavyam? naiṣa doṣaḥ, madhyamakamate pramāṇato 'lika-  
tāsiddhāv api māyopamapratibhāsamātrasyaikānekasvabhāvarahitasya dharmi-  
rūpasyāpratiṣedhāt. tatraiva cālike pratibhāsamātre lakṣyalakṣaṇasaṃsāranirvāṇa[K  
fol. 7v]maṇḍalacakrādibhāvanāsakalajagadarthakriyādīnām<sup>154</sup> avyāhatā vyava-  
sthā<sup>155</sup> sidhyati.<sup>156,xxxvi</sup> tathā cōktam—

buddhatvaṃ vajrasattvatvaṃ saṃvṛtyaiva prasādhayet |<sup>xxxvii</sup>

iti.<sup>157</sup>

nanu sarvam eva vastujātam alikarūpatayā niḥsāram. tadā kimarthaṃ ma-  
ṇḍalacakrādibhāvanāprayāsaḥ<sup>158</sup> kriyate? asad etat,

mithyādhyāropahānārthaṃ<sup>159</sup> yatno 'saty api<sup>160</sup> [E<sub>DH</sub> p. 143] bho-  
ktari |<sup>161,xxxviii</sup>

<sup>xxxvi</sup> E<sub>DH</sub> appears to understand the text as saying that both *bhāvanā* and *jagadarthakriyādīnām vyavasthā* are established. TIB suggests that it is *bhāvanā* which is the instrument by which the *vyavasthā* is established. The manuscript reading suggests taking 'bhāvanā in compound with the following word—i.e., in the Madhyamaka system, although mere appearance is false, the framework of everything starting with *lakṣyalakṣaṇa* is established.

<sup>xxxvii</sup> *Kurukullākālpa* 3.16cd

<sup>xxxviii</sup> *Pramāṇavārttika*, *Pramāṇasiddhi* 193cd.

<sup>151</sup> °bhṛtam] *em.*; °bhṛtām K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>152</sup> nanu tad K E<sub>DH</sub>; tat *possible conj.*

<sup>153</sup> asti] *conj.*; astīti K E<sub>DH</sub> (astīti?) (*iti* has no reflex in TIB)

<sup>154</sup> °bhāvanā] K; °bhāvanā E<sub>DH</sub> (variant word division); bsgoms pas TIB (bhāvanayā)

<sup>155</sup> vyavasthā] K; vyavasthā ca E<sub>DH</sub> (*em.*)

<sup>156</sup> sidhyati] *conj.*; sidhyatīti K E<sub>DH</sub> (*no reflex of iti* in TIB)

<sup>157</sup> iti] E<sub>DH</sub>; deest *in* K

<sup>158</sup> maṇḍala°] E<sub>DH</sub>; bri ba'i 'dkyil 'khor (lekhyamaṇḍala°)

<sup>159</sup> mithyādhyāropahānārthaṃ] *em.*; mithyādhyāropaṇārthaṃ K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>160</sup> 'saty api] K; 'styopi E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>161</sup> bhoktari] K (bhoktari°) (*the letter no is added abbove bho*); muktaye E<sub>DH</sub> (*em.*)

iti vacanāt. yady api vicāryamāṇaṃ pāramārthikaṃ vasturūpaṃ nāsti, tathāpy ahaṃ sukhī bhaveyaṃ mā<sup>162</sup> duḥkhy abhūvam iti tṛṣṇā sakalapraṇabhṛtām asti. yathā tulye 'pi mithyātve śubhāśubhasvapnayoḥ śubhasvapnadarśanāt saumanasyam aśubhasvapnadarśanāc ca daurmanasyam, tadapanayanāya ca saddharmapāṭhamantrajāpādaḥ pravṛttir bhavati, tathā mithyātvāviśeṣe 'pi duḥkhādi-prākṛtavikalpahānāya<sup>xxxix</sup> samyaksambodhilakṣaṇaprāptaye<sup>163</sup> ca prekṣāvatām arthināṃ pravṛttir bhaviṣyatiti.

## 8 saptavidheṣu sādhyeṣu sārāsāravicāraṇam

nanu yadarthas tavāyam<sup>164,xl</sup> ārambhaḥ so 'rthaḥ pralayaṃ gataḥ. tathā hi lakṣyalakṣaṇacintātra prastutā. sā ca vismṛtā, kva gateti na jñāyate.

na tu<sup>165</sup> kṛtaiva sā saptabhir bhedaḥ?

satyam, kintu guḍagorasanyāyena. tathā hi na jñāyate, kiṃ tat sāram asāram veti.

ucyate.

### 8.1 prathamasyāsāratvam

mantranayavihitakramābhāvāt samāpattibhāvanāvaiyarthiā<sup>166</sup> yuktyabhāvāc<sup>167</sup> ca prathamasya niḥsāratā. tathā hi samagrasāmagrīkaṃ yat phalaṃ<sup>168</sup> tad avāśyam eva bhavati. anyathā samagrasāmagrīkaṃ eva tan na bhavet. sākṣātkaraṇāvasthāyāṃ samagrasāmagrīkaṃ tad vartate. tad avāśyaṃ tena<sup>169</sup> bhavitavyam.

<sup>xxxix</sup> cf. *Samantabhadrasādhana* (as quoted in Kamalanātha's *Ratnāvalī* ad HeTa 2.2.45, fol. 16r6): prākṛtavikalpavṛttair aparaṃ na hi kiñcad asti bhavaduḥkham | tasya viruddhaṃ caitat sākṣādvagamyate cetaḥ ||

<sup>xl</sup> The manuscript's reading *yadarthasvā'yaṃ* seems like a plausible corruption of *yadarthas tavā'yaṃ*, but Tibetan shows no reflex of *tava*. TVA<sub>D</sub> reads: *rtsom pa 'di'i don gang yin pa*. TVB<sub>G</sub> reads: *gal te gang gi don du (bzhi pa bshad pa'i bshad pa'i dus) 'di brtsams pa'i*.

<sup>162</sup> mā] E<sub>DH</sub> (*em.*); deest in K

<sup>163</sup> lakṣaṇaprāptaye] K E<sub>DH</sub>; mtshan nyid kyi 'bras bu thob par bya ba'i phyir TVA<sub>D</sub> (lakṣaṇaphalaprāptaye); mtshan nyid 'bras bu thob par bya ba'i phyir TVB<sub>G</sub> (lakṣaṇaphalaprāptaye)

<sup>164</sup> yadarthas tavāyam] *conj.*; yadarthasvā'yaṃ K; yadarthatvād ayaṃ E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>165</sup> na tu] *conj.*; nanu K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>166</sup> samāpatti°] K E<sub>DH</sub> TVB<sub>G</sub> (snyom par 'jug pa); lha'i rnal 'byor gyi snyoms par 'jug pa'i TVA<sub>D</sub> (devatāyogasamāpatti°)

<sup>167</sup> yuktyabhāvāc] E<sub>DH</sub>; yuktābhāvāc K

<sup>168</sup> yat phalaṃ] *conj.* (TIB: 'bras bu gang yin pa); yat KE<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>169</sup> tena K E<sub>DH</sub> TVB<sub>G</sub> (de); de'i 'bras bu TVA<sub>D</sub> (tena phalena)

sati ca bhavati<sup>170,xli</sup> prathamasya hānir iti.

## 8.2 dvitīyasya asāratvam

śārīrādyākāraśūnyasya kevalasātarūpasyānupalabdher<sup>171</sup> na dvitīyasya sārātā. tathā hi pramāṇaniścitaṃ prekṣāvatā bhāvanīyam, na yathākathañcit. pramā[K fol. 8r]ṇena saṃvalitarūpam eva sarvadopalabhyate.<sup>xlii</sup> tad eva sarvajanānāṃ kamanīyatayā pratibhāsate. tasmāt kevalasya rucyabhāvāc cakrākārasaṃvalitasyopalabdheḥ sāksāt kartum aśakyatvāc<sup>172,xliii</sup> ca dvitīyasya kalpanāmātrateti.<sup>173</sup>

## 8.3 tṛtīyasya asāratvam

nirupadravabhūtārthasvabhāvatvena sātmiabhūtasya tyaktum aśakyatvāt, saṃvalitarūpasya [E<sub>DH</sub> p. 144] bhedābhāvāt, prayojanābhāvāc ca na tṛtīyasya<sup>174</sup> kalyāṇabhāvaḥ.<sup>175</sup> tathā hi sahopalambhena<sup>176</sup> tādātmyasiddhāv ekasya parityāge 'parasyāvaśyaṃ parityāgo na vā kasyacid iti.

<sup>xli</sup> TIB could be rendered as something like *evaṃsati ca prathamasya hānir iti*. Indeed this seems to be the sense, but the manuscript reading of *bhavane na* or *bhavanena* is hard to account for.

<sup>xlii</sup> TVA<sub>D</sub> lacks a reflex of *sarvadā*, whereas TVB<sub>G</sub> lacks a reflect of *eva*.

<sup>xliii</sup> TIB suggests reading: *kevalasyānupalabdheḥ rucyabhāvāc cakrākārasaṃvalitasyānupalabdheḥ sāksātkartum aśakyatvāc ca*. The addition of *anupalabdheḥ* after *kevalasya* renders the flow of argument's logic less smooth. The addition of the same word after *cakrākārasaṃvalitasya* does not change the argument in its overall sense. Note that the Tibetan 'khor lo'i rang bzhin could instead imply the reading *cakrasvabhāva* or something similar, but it may simply be a free rendering of *cakrākārasaṃvalita*.

TIB also adds the reason 'bad pa mtshung pa'i phyir ('because the effort is equal'). The purport of this is unclear.

<sup>170</sup> *conj.*; bhavane na K E<sub>DH</sub>; de ltar gyur pas dang po nyams pa yin no TVA<sub>D</sub>; de ltar gyur pa dang po nyams pa yin no TVB<sub>G</sub> (evaṃsati )

<sup>171</sup> °labdher] E<sub>DH</sub>; °bdher K

<sup>172</sup> aśakyatvāc] E<sub>DH</sub> (*em.*); aśakyatāc K

<sup>173</sup> kalpanāmātrateti] E<sub>DH</sub> (*em.*); kalpanātrateti K

<sup>174</sup> tṛtīyasya] *conj.*; tṛtīya K; tṛtīyaḥ E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>175</sup> ] *conj.* (Tib: dge ba [ma] yin); kalyāṇībhāvaḥ K<sup>pc</sup>; kalyāṇībhāvaḥ K<sup>ac</sup>; dge ba ma yin [na] *kalyāṇabhāvaḥ*

<sup>176</sup> sahopalambhena] E<sub>DH</sub>; saholambhena K

#### 8.4 caturthasya sārāsāratvavicāraṇam

prapañcatvena bahuprayāsātvād vicārāsahatvena bhrāntirūpatayāparamārtharūpatayā ca na tṛtīyāntapakṣasya<sup>177</sup> kalyāṇateti.<sup>178</sup> atra kēcid yuktiṃ varṇayanti.<sup>xliv</sup> prapañcarūpatvābhāve<sup>179</sup> 'pi sūkṣmasya bindvādeḥ punaḥ punar bhāvanayā sākṣātkaraṇam yāvat prayāsaś tāvāt sarvatraiva bhāvyavastuni sambhavati. tad atra yadi prayāsabhayaṃ, na kiñcid api bhāvanīyam.

prapañcarūpatvād iti cet, prapañcāprapañcayor bhāvanāvasthāyām ko viśeṣaḥ<sup>180</sup>? nanu<sup>181</sup> aprapañcam śīghram eva sthīrībhavatīty ayaṃ viśeṣaḥ. yatraivāmbane<sup>182</sup> cittam punaḥ punaḥ preryate nirantaram<sup>183</sup> dīrghakālam ca tatraiva sthīrībhavatīty āgamaḥ. yuktiś cātrāsti. tathā cōktam—

tasmād bhūtam abhūtam vā yad yad evābhībhāvyate |  
bhāvanābalaniṣpattau<sup>xlv</sup> tat sphuṭākālpadhīphalam<sup>184</sup> ||<sup>xlvi</sup>

punaś cōktam—

aho kuśīdatvam aho vimūḍhatā  
aho janasyāśya sadarthavakratā |  
svacittamātrapratibaddhabuddhatā<sup>185</sup>  
adūravartiny api yan na sevyate ||<sup>186</sup>

<sup>xliv</sup> TVAD renders this sentence differently: *de la 'ga' zhig las rigs pa cung zhig cig brjod par mi bya ste* |

<sup>xlv</sup> The reading *bhāvanābalaniṣpattau* is supported by the Tibetan translation and occurs in other sources (*bsgom pa'i stobs ni rdzogs pa na*). Another more mainstream reading for this *pāda* is *bhāvanāpariniṣpattau*.

<sup>xlvi</sup> *Pramāṇavārttika*, Pratyakṣapramāṇa 285

<sup>177</sup> tṛtīyāntapakṣasya] *em.* (TVAD: gsum pa'i tha' ma'i phyogs TVAD; TVBG: gsum pa'i mtha' ma'i phyogs); tṛtīyāntaḥ | pakṣasya K; tṛtīyapakṣasya EDH

<sup>178</sup> kalyāṇateti] EDH; kalyāṇateti K

<sup>179</sup> prapañcarūpatvābhāve] K EDH; spros pa'i ngo bo nyid du gyur TIB

<sup>180</sup> viśeṣaḥ] *conj.*; viśeṣa iti cet K EDH

<sup>181</sup> nanu] *conj.* (TIB: 'on te); *deest in K and EDH*

<sup>182</sup> yatraivāmbane] *conj.* (*no reflect of nanu in TIB*); nanu yatraivāmbane

<sup>183</sup> nirantaram] EDH (*em.*) TIB (rgyun mi 'chad par); niruttaram K

<sup>184</sup> kālpadhīphalam] *em.*; kālpadhī phalam K EDH

<sup>185</sup> °pratibaddha°] *conj.* (TIB: 'brel pa); °pratibuddha° K EDH

<sup>186</sup> Untraced. Also cited in \**Saptāṅga* fol. 202r7.



iti. tasmān nāyaṃ viśeṣaḥ.

bhrāntirūpatvenāparamārthatvam api sarvatraiva bhāvanāviśeṣe vastuni sambhavatīti na kiñcid api bhāvanīyaṃ syāt. [K fol. 8v] tataś ca sarvatraiva mokṣamārge bhāvanāyā vaiyarthyaṃ syāt. māyopamākārānupraveśena bhrāntirūpam apy aprapañcād [E<sub>DH</sub> p. 145] bhāvyamānam<sup>187</sup> aduṣṭaṃ bhavatīti cet, na tv ayaṃ māyākārānupraveśaḥ prapañce 'pi samāna iti. tatrāpi ko doṣasyāvakāśaḥ? tasmāt prapañcam aprapañcam vā yad eva rocate pramāṇasaṃgatam itarad vā, tad evā-lasyaṃ vihāya mahāpuruṣārthibhir bhāvayitavyam<sup>188</sup> ity alam atiprasaṅgeneti.

atra ca sāretaravibhāgaḥ paryupāsitaḥ gurubhir eva jñātavyaḥ.

### 8.5 pañcamasya asāratvam

ṭṭīyapakṣoktaśatvān<sup>189</sup> nīrasatvena<sup>190</sup> prayojanābhāvān mantranayakramābhāvāc ca na pañcamāḥ parikṣīnadoṣaḥ.

nanu sākṣātkaṇāṭ pūrvam mantranayaprayogo 'sti. tat katham tasyābhāvāḥ? satyam, sākṣātphalāvasthā sādhyā. tasyāṃ ca nāsty asau kramāḥ. †sākṣātparityāge<sup>xlvi†</sup> ca na prayojanam utpaśyāma iti.

### 8.6 ṣaṣṭhamasya asāratvam

svecchayā nirvāyayitum<sup>191</sup> aśakyatvāt, prayojanābhāvāt, sattvārthābhāvāc ca na pañcāntaraprabhedakalpanā<sup>192</sup> kalaṅkāśūnyā. tathā hi kasyacin nivṛttiḥ kāraṇa-nivṛtīyā vyāpakanivṛtīyā<sup>193</sup> vā bhavati. na cātra sākṣātkṛtamaṇḍalacakrasya nivartakaṃ kāraṇam vyāpakam vā icchākāle dṛśyate.<sup>xlvi†</sup>

<sup>xlvi†</sup> Segment instead: kramāḥ sākṣāt. parityāge ?

<sup>xlvi†</sup> TIB lacks a reflex of *icchākāle dṛśyate*. Both translations add an extra sentence to this paragraph: *rang gi 'dod pas ('dos pas TVB<sub>G</sub>; 'gog par TVB<sub>G</sub>)'gog pa yang mi nus te mi mthun pa med pa'i phyir | sdug bsngal la sogs pa 'gog pa 'dod kyang sdug bsngal la sogs pa la 'jug pa mthong ba'i phyir ro ||*

<sup>187</sup> aprapañcād bhāvyamānam] E<sub>DH</sub>; aprapañcā bhāvyamānam

<sup>188</sup> bhāvayitavyam] E<sub>DH</sub>; bhaviyitavyam K

<sup>189</sup> ṭṭīyapakṣoktaśatvān *conj.* (TVB<sub>G</sub>: gsum pa'i phyogs la bshad pa'i nyes pa yod pa dang); ṭṭīyapakṣe ktato K; ṭṭīyapakṣe kuto E<sub>DH</sub>; *no reflex* in TVA<sub>D</sub>

<sup>190</sup> nīrasatvena] *conj.*; nīrasatvena te K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>191</sup> nirvāyayitum] K; nirvāpayitum E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>192</sup> pañcāntara°] *em.* TIB (lga pa'i mtha'i rab tu dbye ba); prapañcāntara° K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>193</sup> vyāpakanivṛtīyā] E<sub>DH</sub>; vyāpakānivṛtīyā K

nanu śūnyataiva nivartikāsti. yathā dāruṣaṅghātaprajvalito<sup>194</sup> vahnir niḥśe-  
 ṣam indhanaṃ bhaṣmīkṛtya paścāt svarasata eva nivartate, tathā maṇḍalacakra-  
 prajvalitaḥ śūnyatājñānāgniḥ sāksāt kṛtvā<sup>195</sup> maṇḍalacakraṃ nivartayiṣyatīti cet.<sup>196</sup>  
 tad asat, viṣamatvād dṛṣṭāntasya. tathā hi tatrendhanaṃ kāraṇaṃ<sup>197</sup> vahnēḥ. kā-  
 raṇasya indhanalakṣaṇasya nivṛttau<sup>198</sup> yuktaiva vahnīlakṣaṇasya kāryasya ni-  
 vṛttiḥ. iha tu na śūnyatā kāraṇaṃ maṇḍalacakrasya. tat ka[K fol. 9r]thaṃ tanni-  
 vṛttau nivṛttiḥ? na<sup>199</sup> ca śūnyatāyā nivṛttir asti.<sup>xlix</sup>

nanu sā na<sup>200</sup> bhavatu kāraṇaṃ. śūnyatā vyāpakaṃ tu bhaviṣyati. vyāpaka-  
 sya vṛkṣasya nivṛttau śimśapātvasya vyāpyasya nivṛttivan nivṛttir bhaviṣyatīti  
 cet. etad apy asāram. tathā hi śūnyatā sarvadā sarvajñeyamaṇḍalavyāpikā tattva-  
 rūpā.<sup>201</sup> na ca tasyā nivṛttiḥ kadācid apy asti. yadi syāt samyaksambodhisāksātka-  
 raṇāt [E<sub>DH</sub> p. 146] pūrvam anantaram eva vā nivṛttiḥ syāt. na ca bhavati, samya-  
 ksambuddhībhyāpi katipayakālāvasthānasya svayam eva svīkṛtatvāt.

kintu śūnyatāpi jñānarūpā, cakram api jñānarūpam. śūnyatājñānotpattyā ca-  
 kraññānasyānivṛttau<sup>202</sup> śūnyatājñānaṃ kena nivartanīyam. tena nivṛttiś ca viro-  
 dhino 'bhāvāt kāraṇavyāpakayoś cābhāvān nāsti. tasmāc chūnyatājñānasya na  
 nivṛttiḥ,<sup>203</sup> nāpi maṇḍalacakrasya śūnyatāto nivṛttir iti śūnyatā na nivartikā.

ko brūte śūnyatā nivartikā? kiṃ tarhi yan nivartakaṃ<sup>204</sup> tad gurūpadeśato

<sup>xlix</sup> The response the objection is considerably different in Tibetan. It states that while fire is regarded by mundane consensus as having a causal effect on fuel insofar as it transforms it, emptiness has no such effect on the *maṇḍalacakra*. It is also therefore not something that causes it to cease, nor is it known to itself cease of its own accord. Although the Sanskrit MS is very corrupt in this paragraph, it is difficult to see how the text it transmits corresponds to the Tibetan translation.

<sup>194</sup> dāruṣaṅghātaprajvalito] *conj.*; dāruṣaṅghāte prajvalito E<sub>DH</sub>; dāruṣaṅghāt pravjalito K

<sup>195</sup> sāksāt kṛtvā] *conj.*; sāksān K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>196</sup> TIB a fuller sentence here. TVB<sub>G</sub> reads: *de ltar dkyil 'khor gyi 'khor lo stong pa nyid kyi ye shes kyi me rab tu 'bar bas mngon sum du byas nas kyang | dkyil 'khor gyi 'khor lo ma lus par ldog par byed la | bdag nyid kyang rang gi ngang gis ldog par 'gyur ro zhe na |* TVA<sub>D</sub> appears to be slightly more corrupt, but suggests that same readings: *de dkyil 'khor gyi 'khor lo stong pa nyid kyi ye shes kyi me rab tu 'bar bas mngon sum du byas nas kyang | dkyil 'khor gyi 'khor lo ma lus par ldog par byed la | de yang rang gi ldog par 'gyur ro zhe na |*

<sup>197</sup> kāraṇaṃ] *conj.*; na kāraṇaṃ K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>198</sup> kāryasya indhanalakṣaṇasya nivṛttau] *conj.*; kāryam indhanalakṣaṇanivṛttau

<sup>199</sup> na] *conj.*; athavā na] K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>200</sup> na] E<sub>DH</sub> (*em.*); deest in K

<sup>201</sup> tattvarūpā] E<sub>DH</sub>; tatvarūpāḥ K

<sup>202</sup> ānivṛttau] K E<sub>DH</sub>; log na TIB(nivṛttau)

<sup>203</sup> na nivṛttiḥ] *conj.* (TIB: ldog pa med do); nivṛttiḥ K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>204</sup> nivartakaṃ] *em.*; nivartikās K E<sub>DH</sub>

jñeyam ity apy asāram. gurūpadeśato 'pi na śūnyatāvyatiriktam<sup>205</sup> pramāṇato 'stīti yatkiñcid etat.<sup>1</sup> pratikṣaṇanivṛttiś ca kṣaṇabhaṅgarūpā sarvapaḍārthavyāpinī. na sā santānanivartikā. tasmān na svecchayā nivṛttiḥ.<sup>206</sup> na ca nivṛtityā<sup>207</sup> nīrasarūpayā prayojanam asti prekṣāvatām. tathā cōktam—

mucyamāneṣu sattveṣu ye te prāmodyasāgarāḥ |  
tair eva nanu paryāptaṃ mokṣeṇārasikena kim ||<sup>li</sup>

iti.

sattvārtho 'pi nivṛttau nāsti. na hi gagane<sup>208</sup> gaganakamale vā kācid arthakriyā sambhavati. ciraniruddhād apy atītād avasturūpāc<sup>209</sup> cakrāt sattvārtho bha-  
viṣyatīty apy asāram, ciranīrutasyāpi<sup>210</sup> kukku[K fol. 9v]ṭasya kaṇṭhadhvanipra-  
saṅgāt.

nanu yogyadhiṣṭhānād gaganād apy arthakriyāḥ sambhavantīti cet.<sup>211</sup> na sa-  
mbhavanti, yogyadhiṣṭhānād eva cittarūpād arthakriyā, na gaganāt, nīrūpatvāt  
tasya.<sup>lii</sup>

nanu nirodhya maṇḍalacakram sattvārthakāle punar utpādyate. tato 'rtha-  
kriyā bhavati. tataḥ punar eva nirodhyate, punar evotpadyata iti cet. asad etat.  
yathā sattvārthakriyāyās tattvato<sup>212</sup> nāsti prādurbhāvaḥ, tathā cakrasyāpi. tato  
nārthakriyāyāḥ sambhavaḥ. na ca nirodhya<sup>213</sup> punar utpāde kiñcit prayojanam  
astīty alam atiprapañceneti.

<sup>1</sup> TVB<sub>G</sub>: bla ma'i man ngag las kyang stong pa nyid kyis ldog par byed pa ma yin ldog pa'i tshad  
ma cung zhiḡ kyang yod pa ma yin pas. TVA<sub>D</sub>: bla ma'i man ngag las kyang stong pa nyid dang  
| de ldog pa las ma gtogs pa'i ldog par byed pa'i tshad ma gzhan cung zad yod pa ma yin no ||

<sup>li</sup> *Bodhicaryāvatāra* 8.108

<sup>lii</sup> TVA<sub>D</sub> varies significantly for this paragraph.

<sup>205</sup> śūnyatāvyatiriktam] *conj.* vyatiri((ktiḥ)) K (i in kti lacks a pṛṣṭhamātrā); vyatiriktāḥ E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>206</sup> nivṛttiḥ] K<sup>ac</sup>; nivṛttiḥ K<sup>pc</sup>

<sup>207</sup> nivṛtityā] E<sub>DH</sub> (*em.*); nivartyā K

<sup>208</sup> gagane] K E<sub>DH</sub> TVB<sub>G</sub>; *no reflex* in TVA<sub>D</sub>

<sup>209</sup> avasturūpāc] K E<sub>DH</sub> TVB<sub>G</sub> (dngos po med pa'i ngo bo); dngos po'i ngo bo TVA<sub>D</sub> (vasturūpāc)

<sup>210</sup> ciranīrutasyāpi] *conj.*; cirutasyāpi K; virutasyāpi E<sub>DH</sub>; yun rin por khyim bya shi ba TVA<sub>D</sub>;  
yun ring por long pa'i khyim bya shi ba TVB<sub>G</sub> (ciraṃṛtasyāpi)

<sup>211</sup> sambhavantīti cet] *conj.*; sambhavanti K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>212</sup> tattvato] K (tatvato) E<sub>DH</sub>; de las TIB (tato)

<sup>213</sup> nirodhya] E<sub>DH</sub>; niro((dhya)) K (*some kind of correction is made, but uncertain from what to what*); 'gogas pa las (*possibly nirodhāt*)

## 8.7 saptamasya asāratvam

ṣaṣṭhapakṣoktadoṣasandohasya saptame<sup>214</sup> 'pi bhāvān na piṣṭapeṣaṇam<sup>215</sup> kriyate. nanu ṣaṣṭhena saptamasya samānatvāt katham saptamasya tato viśeṣaḥ? asti viśeṣaḥ. pūrvāvasthāyām niyatacakrākāratā, punaḥ svecchayā nirvṛtiḥ svecchetpādanam<sup>216</sup> ceti. saptame punar etan nāsti. tato na samānatā. bhinnas ca nirdiṣṭa iti.<sup>217</sup>

## 9 caturthasya sekasya svarūpam

dambholibījasrutidhauśuddha-<sup>218</sup>  
pāthojabhūtāṅkurabhūtapuṣṭi<sup>219</sup> |  
turīyaśasyam<sup>220</sup> paripākam eti<sup>221</sup>  
sphuṭam caturtham viduṣo 'pi gūḍham || 17 ||

[E<sub>DH</sub> p. 147] dambholityādi. etat sadgurūpadeśato jñeyam.

## 10 aparaṁ mithyāsādhyam mithyātattvam ca

pañcapradīpāmṛtabinducandra-  
bhrūmadhyabindūdbhavamaṇḍalāni |  
vāyoḥ svarūpam galaśuṇḍikādyam  
atattvarūpam svayam ūhaniyam || 18 ||

pañcapradīpetyādi. pañcapradīpaśabdena gokudahanalakṣaṇasya, amṛtaśabdena vimumāraśulakṣaṇasya satatānuṣṭhānam eva sādhyam manyante. bindur iti hrcca-ndrastham bindum dedīpyamānam tattvam sādhyam ceti kṛtvā kecid bhāvayanti.

<sup>214</sup> ṣaṣṭhapakṣoktadoṣasandohasya saptame] *conj.* (TIB: drug pa'i phyogs la bshad pa'i skyon gyi (gyi) TVA<sub>D</sub>; gyis TVB<sub>G</sub>) tshogs bdun pa la); ṣaṣṭhapakṣoktam saṁdāhasyāṣṭame K; ṣaṣṭhapakṣoktasamdoṣasyāṣṭame E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>215</sup> piṣṭapeṣaṇam] K<sup>ac</sup> E<sub>DH</sub>; piṣṭapre | ṣaṇam K<sup>ac</sup>

<sup>216</sup> nirvṛtiḥ svecchetpādanam] *conj.* (TVB<sub>G</sub>: yang rang gi 'dod pas 'gog cing rang gi 'dod pas skyed par byed pa); svecchetpādanam K; svecchetpādanam E<sub>DH</sub>; yang dang yang du rang gi 'dod pas skyed par byed pa nyid TVA<sub>D</sub>

<sup>217</sup> K E<sub>DH</sub>; tha mi dad pa ma yin par bstan to TVA<sub>D</sub>; tha mi dad pa ma yin par bstan to TVB<sub>G</sub>

<sup>218</sup> °sruti°] *corr.*; śruti K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>219</sup> pāthoja°] E<sub>DH</sub> (E<sub>DH</sub> reports the ms. as reading pāthojña, but this seems to be incorrect); pāthauja° K

<sup>220</sup> turīyaśasyam] E<sub>DH</sub>; tutiyaśasyam K

<sup>221</sup> eti] E<sub>DH</sub> (*em.*); eta K

candra iti hr̥disthaṃ kalārūpaṃ ardhacandraṃ vā hr̥tkamalasthaṃ kecid bhāva-  
yanti.

bhrūmadhyabindūdbhavamaṇḍalānīti bhruvor madhye ūrṇāyāṃ binduṃ vi-  
bhāvya tadbindūdbhavāni maṇḍalāni vāyuvāruṇamāhendrāgneyalakṣaṇāni. etad  
uktaṃ bhavati—mukhaśravaṇanāsikākacṣurghrāṇarasanāni<sup>222</sup> hastāṅgulibhiḥ pi-  
dhāya bhrūmadhyabindur draṣṭavyaḥ. tasya sphuṭāvasthāyāṃ śubhāśubhani[K  
fol. 10r]mittasaṃsūcakāni mātendrādimaṇḍalāny upajāyante. taṃ ca binduṃ ta-  
ttvam iti manyante.

vāyoḥ svarūpaṃ iti pūrakakumbhakarecakaprasāntakalakṣaṇam<sup>223</sup> ānāpānā-  
dilakṣaṇam<sup>224</sup> ceti. etad<sup>225</sup> uktaṃ bhavati—śaivasāṃkhyādinirdiṣṭam<sup>226</sup> vāyusva-  
rūpaṃ jñātvā taṃ vāyuṃ nirodhabhāvanayā sthīrīkṛtyākāśenotplutya gamanaṃ  
parapurapraveśaṃ yāvan muktiṃ ca sāṅskṛturvanti vāyuvādinaḥ.

galaśuṇḍiketi. galaṇḍiketi. galaṇḍiketi. galaṇḍiketi. galaṇḍiketi. galaṇḍiketi. galaṇḍiketi.  
mānā upajihvāsaṃjñikā galaśuṇḍikāsti. sā ca śaktirūpā. tadadhaḥ śivarūpaṃ<sup>227</sup>  
asti tattvam. sā ca [E<sub>DH</sub> p. 148] jihvāgreṇa spr̥śyamānā nirantarāmṛtaṃ sravati.  
tena ca ghargharāmṛtavārṣaṇena santarpyamānam ātmānaṃ dhyāyād iti galaśu-  
ṇḍikātattvam. ādīśabdena hr̥nmadhyāṣoḍaśanāḍikākacramadhyasthajñānasvarū-  
paṃ<sup>228</sup> śivarūpaṃ tattvaṃ bhāvayitavyam ityādināṃ parigrahaḥ.<sup>liii</sup>

<sup>liii</sup> TIB continues to describe this practice. TVA<sub>D</sub> reads: *yang smras pa | bcu las drug lhag rtsa dang ldan pa'i 'khor lo yi || dkyil na gnas pa'i snying gar rnam par gnas pa'i bdag | des ni de yi khyad par lta bu'i grub pa ster || de ni mngon par mi g-yo ba yi yid dag gis || rnal 'byor pa yi sems de de ltar mngon par bsam || nub par gyur pa'i mgon po rgyal bar gyur de ni || nus pa dag gis de ni yongs su bskor dang bcas ||* TVB<sub>G</sub> reads: *de yang smras pa | bcu las drug lhag rtsa dang ldan pa'i 'khor lo'i dkyil na gnas pa snying kar rnam par gnas pa'i bdag | des ni de'i khyad par lta bu yi grub pa ster | de ni mngon par mi g.yo ba'i yid dag gis || rnal 'byor pa yis de ltar mngon par bsam par bya || nus par gyur pa'i mgon po rgyal bar gyur || de ni nus pa dag gis de ni yongs su bskyor dang bcas ||*

<sup>222</sup> mukhaśravaṇanāsikākacṣurghrāṇarasanāni] K E<sub>DH</sub>; kha dang | rna ba dang | sna dang | mig TVA<sub>D</sub> TVB<sub>G</sub>

<sup>223</sup> °recaka°] E<sub>DH</sub>; recakaṃ K

<sup>224</sup> ānāpānādilakṣaṇam] E<sub>DH</sub>; anāpānā° K

<sup>225</sup> etad] E<sub>DH</sub> (*em.*); tad K

<sup>226</sup> śaivasāṃkhyādi°] E<sub>DH</sub> (*em.*) TVB<sub>G</sub> (shi ba dang grangs can la sogs pas); saivasāṃkhyādi° K; grangs can la sogs pas TVA<sub>D</sub> (smākhyādi°)

<sup>227</sup> tadadhaḥ śivarūpaṃ] K E<sub>DH</sub> TVB<sub>G</sub> (de'i 'og na zhi ba'i ngo bo); sdig pa'i rang bzhin du yong pa TVA<sub>D</sub>

<sup>228</sup> hr̥nmadhyāṣoḍaśanāḍikākacramadhyasthajñānasvarūpaṃ] K E<sub>DH</sub> TVB<sub>G</sub> (snying ka'i dbus kyi 'khor lo rtsibs bcu drug pa'i dbus na gnas pa ye shes kyi rang bzhin); snying ga'i dbus kyi dkyil 'khor rtsibs bcu drug pa'i dbus na hūm gnas pa ye shes kyi rang bzhin (hr̥nmadhyāṣoḍaśanāḍikā-maṇḍalamadhyahūmsthajñānasvarūpaṃ)

tatsarvaṃ tīrthikādibhis tattvarūpeṇābhimatam. atattvam iti svayam evoha-  
nīyaṃ vicāraṇīyaṃ iti yāvat.

## 11 upasaṃhāra

svapnendrajālapratibimbamāyā-  
marīcigandharvapurāmbu[K fol. 2r]candraiḥ |  
anyaiś ca śabdair<sup>229</sup> upamābhidheyair  
naivāsti sādhyam kathitād ihānyat || 19 ||

svapnendrajāletyādi. svapnendrajālopamaṃ pratibimbamāyāmarīcigandharvana-  
garodakacandropamam iti śabdair anyaiś ca gagaṇapratīśrutkaphenopamam i-  
tyādiśabdair upamābhidheyair upamāvācakair naivāsti sādhyam kathitāt sādhyād  
anyat. paraṃ kathita eva sādhye, ete śabdāḥ pravartanta iti svayam boddhavyam.

gambhīraśūnyapratibhāsamātra<sup>-230</sup>  
śāntāti<sup>231</sup> sūkṣmānabhilāpyaśabdaiḥ |  
nirlepanīrūpa<sup>232</sup> nirañjanādyair  
bhrāntir na kāryāparasādhyasattve || 20 ||

[E<sub>DH</sub> p. 149] gambhīraśūnyam pratibhāsamātram śāntātīsūkṣmam anabhilāpyam  
nirlepaṃ nīrūpaṃ<sup>233</sup> nirañjanādi.<sup>234</sup> ādiśabdāt śivaṃ nirākāram niṣprapañcam a-  
nādyantanidhanam i[K fol. 10v]tyādiśabdair bhrāntir na kartavyā. aparasādhyas-  
attve, aparasya sādhyasya sattve sattāyām.<sup>235</sup> ebhiḥ sarvair eva param api kiñcit  
sādhyam kathitād astīti bhrāntir na kartavyā. atha nātikathitam eva sādhyam e-  
bhiḥ sarvair abhidhīyata iti niścayaḥ.

## 12 pariṇāmanā

akhilagagaṇagarbhavyāpisaptaprakāra<sup>-236</sup>  
grathitavacanarūpād yan mayāsādi puṇyam |

<sup>229</sup> śabdair *em.* (cf. comm.); sarvair K E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>230</sup> °mātra°] E<sub>DH</sub>; mātram K

<sup>231</sup> śāntāti] E<sub>DH</sub>; śāntādi K

<sup>232</sup> nirlepanīrūpa°] E<sub>DH</sub> (*em.*); nirlepanīpa K

<sup>233</sup> nīrūpaṃ] E<sub>DH</sub> (*em.*); nirupamaṃ K

<sup>234</sup> nirañjanādi] K; nirañjanaṃ E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>235</sup> sattāyām] K; sattvāyā E<sub>DH</sub>

<sup>236</sup> °saptaprakāra°] E<sub>DH</sub>; °sarvaprakāra° K

anupamasukhavidyāsaktasaddahanirmij-  
jinajanitajanārthas tena loko 'yam astu ||  
tattvaratnāvalokaḥ samāptaḥ. kṛtir iyaṃ paṇḍitavāgīśvarakīrtipādā-  
nām.

śrīsamāje parā yasya bhaktir niṣṭhā ca nirmalā  
tasya vāgīśvarasyeyaṃ kṛtir vimatināśinī<sup>237</sup> ||

vikacakumudatārākṣīrakundānukāri<sup>238</sup>  
pracitam api ca puṇyaṃ yaṃ mayā granthito 'smāt |  
anupamasukhapūrṇaḥ svābhavidyopagūḍho  
bhavatu nikhilalokas tena vāgīśvaraśrīḥ ||

tattvaratnāvalokavivaraṇaṃ samāptam. kṛtir iyaṃ paṇḍitācāryavāgīśvarakīrti-  
pādānām.

## References

*Abhidharmakośavyākhyā* by Yośamitra. Wogihara UNRAI, ed. n.d. *Sphuṭārthā Abhidharmakośavyākhyā* by Yaśomitra. 2 vols. Tokyo: The Publishing Association of the Abhidharmakośavyākhyā

*Amṛtakaṇikā* by Raviśrījñāna. 1994

*Pramāṇavārttikavṛtti* by Manorathānandin. Sāṃkṛtyāyana ed.

*Mantrārthāvalokinī* by Vilāsavajra. A. TRIBE. 2016. *Tantric Buddhist Practice in India: Vilāsavajra's Commentary on the Mañjuśrīnāmasaṃgīti*. Routledge Studies in Tantric Traditions. Taylor & Francis

*Mitākṣarā* of Vijñāneśvara. Narayan Ram ACHARYA, ed. 1949. *Yājñavalkyaśmṛti of Yogīśvara Yājñavalkya with the Commentary Mitākṣarā of Vijñāneśvara, Notes,*

<sup>237</sup> vimatināśinī] E<sub>DH</sub>; vimatināsanī K

<sup>238</sup> vikacakumudatārākṣīrakundānukāri *em.*; vikacakumudakṣīratārakundānukāri] E<sub>DH</sub>; vikarektāmudakṣīratārakundānukāri K

*Varient [sic!] Readings etc.* Bombay: Nirnaya Sagar Press

*Vṛttamālāvivṛti* by Śākyaarakṣita. Hahn ed.

*Subhāṣitaratnakoṣa* compiled by Vidyākara. D. D. KOSAMBI and V. V. GOKHALE, eds. 1957. *The Subhāṣitaratnakoṣa Compiled by Vidyākara*. Cambridge Massachusetts: Harvard University Press

*Hetubinduṭīkāloka* by Durvekamiśra. Sukhlalji SANGHAVI and Muni Shri JINAVIJAYAJI, eds. 1949. *Hetubinduṭīkā of Bhaṭṭa Arcaṭa with the Sub-Commentary Entitled Āloka of Durveka Miśra*. Baroda: Oriental Institute

## Secondary Sources

INGALLS, Daniel H. H. 1965. *An Anthology of Sanskrit Court Poetry: Vidyākara's "Subhāṣitaratnakoṣa"*. Vol. 44. Harvard Oriental Series. Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press.