FG 2011

FG 2011
The 9th IEEE Conference on Automatic Face and Gesture Recognition
March 21-23, 2011
Santa Barbara, CA
USA

Reviews For Paper

Paper ID 154
Title Beyond Simple Features: A Large-Scale Feature Search Approach to Unconstrained Face Recognition

---

Masked Reviewer ID: Assigned_Reviewer_1
Review:

Question	
How relevant is this paper to Face and Gesture Recognition?	Relevant
How well written is this paper?	Well written
Does this paper have a clear contribution to the state of the art?	Yes, but not major
Overall Rating	Strong Accept
Nominate for Best Paper?	No
Detailed Comments	Author present a method for selecting recognition models based on a large set of features. This work is an extension of Pinto[35]. This new work includes a more refined method for selecting the model and reports results on real data. The real-data is the Labeled in the Wild face data set. The technique is a general hierarchical architecture for model select. The algorithm shows state-of-the-art performance on the Labeled in the Wild face data set. The authors' claim that the technique is general and inspired by the human visual system. The authors' claim would be more credible if results were reported on another difficult data sets such as the FRGC Exp 4.

Masked Reviewer ID: Assigned_Reviewer_4
Review:

Question	
How relevant is this paper to Face and Gesture Recognition?	Highly relevant
How well written is this paper?	Acceptable
Does this paper have a clear contribution to the state of the art?	Yes, but not major

Overall Rating	Reject
Nominate for Best Paper?	No
Detailed Comments	1. This paper proposed a brute-force search method on a large scale set of biologically-inspired features which are randomly generated from some parameterized uniform distributions. Promising results on the unconstrained LFW dataset show that biologically-inspired models are even more powerful for face recognition in unconstrained environment compared with low-level features. 2. One main difference of this paper with [35] is employing brute-force search instead of unsupervised learning, but this is not suitable for large-scale applications. 3. One basic component of the proposed method is to use two independent datasets for screening and validation separately, and the authors propose to use LFW view 1 and view 2 for screening and validation respectively. Although view 1 and view 2 contain different images of the same persons, they are still not independent. Therefore, the proposed method probably still overfits to the screening dataset. 4. Experiments on more databases to valid the statement will be better.

Masked Reviewer ID: Assigned_Reviewer_5

Review:

Question	
How relevant is this paper to Face and Gesture Recognition?	Highly relevant
How well written is this paper?	Well written
Does this paper have a clear contribution to the state of the art?	Yes, but not major
Overall Rating	Accept
Nominate for Best Paper?	No
Detailed Comments	Good approach to large-scale feature search yielding good results on a difficult LFW database.