Duration of Unemployment - Analysis of Deviance Table for Nested Models

February 8, 2012

The data unemployment is included as a contingency table. The response is the duration of unemployment, gender and the level of education are predictors.

		Short	term	Long	term
male 1			97		45
male 2			216		81
male 3			56		32
male 4			34		9
${\tt female}$	1		105		51
${\tt female}$	2		91		81
${\tt female}$	3		31		34
${\tt female}$	4		11		9

In the first part the data are considered as ungrouped. Thus, first the dataset is transformed into single observations on the variables y (duration of unemployment, binary), L (level of education) and G (gender).

```
1 45 81 32
, , y = 1
G
      1
          2
               3
                   4
  0 105 91
              31
                  11
  1 97 216
              56
   Fitting of various logit models; in particular, the saturated model (model
with both covariates and their interaction), the model with main effects, the
two models with only one covariate and the intercept model. Deviances are for
ungrouped data
> unemp_1 <- glm(y ~ ^{\sim} 1,family=binomial)
> unemp_G <- glm(y ~ ^{\sim} G,family=binomial)
> unemp_L <- glm(y ~ L,family=binomial)</pre>
> unemp_LG <- glm(y ~ G + L,family=binomial)
> unemp_sat <- glm(y ~ G * L,family=binomial)</pre>
> summary(unemp_sat)
Call:
glm(formula = y ~ G * L, family = binomial)
Deviance Residuals:
    Min
               1Q
                    Median
                                           Max
-1.7686 -1.2272
                    0.7981
                              0.8898
                                        1.2169
Coefficients:
            Estimate Std. Error z value Pr(>|z|)
(Intercept) 0.72213 0.17068
                                   4.231 2.33e-05 ***
                         0.24832
G
             0.04591
                                    0.185 0.85331
L2
            -0.60572
                         0.22906 -2.644 0.00818 **
L3
            -0.81451
                         0.30133 -2.703 0.00687 **
            -0.52146
                         0.48078
                                   -1.085 0.27809
L4
                         0.31933
G:L2
             0.81851
                                    2.563 0.01037 *
G:L3
              0.60608
                          0.41526
                                    1.460 0.14442
G:L4
              1.08255
                         0.63577
                                    1.703 0.08862 .
Signif. codes: 0 '*** 0.001 '** 0.01 '* 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
(Dispersion parameter for binomial family taken to be 1)
    Null deviance: 1270.3 on 982 degrees of freedom
Residual deviance: 1237.4 on 975 degrees of freedom
AIC: 1253.4
Number of Fisher Scoring iterations: 4
   Tests for hierarchies and corresponding effects:
```

> anova(unemp_LG, unemp_sat)

Analysis of Deviance Table

Model 1: $y \sim G + L$ Model 2: $y \sim G * L$

Resid. Df Resid. Dev Df Deviance

1 978 1245.0

975 1237.4 3 7.5213

> anova(unemp_L, unemp_LG)

Analysis of Deviance Table

Model 1: y ~ L

Model 2: $y \sim G + L$

Resid. Df Resid. Dev Df Deviance

979 1263.8

2 978 1245.0 1 18.808

> anova(unemp_1, unemp_L)

Analysis of Deviance Table

Model 1: y ~ 1

Model 2: y ~ L

Resid. Df Resid. Dev Df Deviance

982 1270.3

2 979 1263.8 3 6.5573

> anova(unemp_LG, unemp_sat)

Analysis of Deviance Table

Model 1: $y \sim G + L$

Model 2: y ~ G * L

Resid. Df Resid. Dev Df Deviance

978 1245.0

975 1237.4 3 7.5213

> anova(unemp_G, unemp_LG)

Analysis of Deviance Table

Model 1: y \sim G

Model 2: \ddot{y} ~ G + L

Resid. Df Resid. Dev Df Deviance

981 1252.4

978 1245.0 3 7.4063

> anova(unemp_1, unemp_G)

Analysis of Deviance Table

```
Model 1: y ^{\sim} 1
Model 2: y ~ G
  Resid. Df Resid. Dev Df Deviance
        982
                 1270.3
        981
                 1252.4 1
                              17.959
   Tests that can be used to obtain the deviances for the grouped data.
> anova(unemp_1, unemp_sat)
Analysis of Deviance Table
Model 1: y \tilde{} 1
Model 2: y ~ G * L
  Resid. Df Resid. Dev Df Deviance
        982
                 1270.3
2
        975
                 1237.4 7
                             32.886
> anova(unemp_L, unemp_sat)
Analysis of Deviance Table
Model 1: y ~ L
Model 2: y \sim G * L
  Resid. Df Resid. Dev Df Deviance
        979
                 1263.8
2
        975
                 1237.4 4
                              26.329
> anova(unemp_G, unemp_sat)
Analysis of Deviance Table
Model 1: y ~ G
Model 2: y ~ G * L
  Resid. Df Resid. Dev Df Deviance
1
        981
                 1252.4
2
        975
                 1237.4
                              14.928
> anova(unemp_LG, unemp_sat)
Analysis of Deviance Table
Model 1: y \sim G + L
Model 2: y \sim G * L
  Resid. Df Resid. Dev Df Deviance
        978
                 1245.0
                 1237.4 3
                             7.5213
```

In the second part the model are fitted as grouped data, which directly yields the deviances for the grouped data case. The parameter estimates remain the same, but the deviances and the AIC differ from the ungrouped case.

```
> genderleveldat<-data.frame("Long term"=unemployment[,1],
+ "Short term"=unemployment[,2], "Level"=rep(1:4,2), "Gender"=rep(c(1,0), each=4))
> groupintercept<-glm(cbind(Long.term, Short.term) ~ 1, family=binomial,
                    data=genderleveldat)
> summary(groupintercept)
glm(formula = cbind(Long.term, Short.term) ~ 1, family = binomial,
   data = genderleveldat)
Deviance Residuals:
   Min 1Q Median 3Q
                                    Max
-3.3163 -1.4275 0.1223 1.0837 2.7745
Coefficients:
           Estimate Std. Error z value Pr(>|z|)
(Intercept) 0.62822 0.06696 9.382 <2e-16 ***
Signif. codes: 0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
(Dispersion parameter for binomial family taken to be 1)
   Null deviance: 32.886 on 7 degrees of freedom
Residual deviance: 32.886 on 7 degrees of freedom
AIC: 73.818
Number of Fisher Scoring iterations: 4
> #Corresponding un-grouped model:
> summary(unemp_1)
glm(formula = y ~ 1, family = binomial)
Deviance Residuals:
   Min 1Q Median
                           3Q
                                     Max
-1.4531 -1.4531 0.9247 0.9247 0.9247
Coefficients:
           Estimate Std. Error z value Pr(>|z|)
                    0.06696
(Intercept) 0.62822
                               9.382 <2e-16 ***
Signif. codes: 0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.01 '*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
(Dispersion parameter for binomial family taken to be 1)
   Null deviance: 1270.3 on 982 degrees of freedom
Residual deviance: 1270.3 on 982 degrees of freedom
AIC: 1272.3
Number of Fisher Scoring iterations: 4
```

```
> groupgender<-glm(cbind(Long.term, Short.term) ~ Gender, family=binomial,
                data=genderleveldat)
> summary(groupgender)
glm(formula = cbind(Long.term, Short.term) ~ Gender, family = binomial,
   data = genderleveldat)
Deviance Residuals:
   Min 1Q Median
                         3Q
                                   Max
-1.6098 -1.2923 -0.4293 0.8908 2.4806
Coefficients:
          Estimate Std. Error z value Pr(>|z|)
(Intercept) 0.30748 0.09958 3.088 0.00202 **
          Gender
Signif. codes: 0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
(Dispersion parameter for binomial family taken to be 1)
   Null deviance: 32.886 on 7 degrees of freedom
Residual deviance: 14.928 on 6 degrees of freedom
AIC: 57.859
Number of Fisher Scoring iterations: 3
> #Corresponding un-grouped model:
> summary(unemp_G)
Call:
glm(formula = y ~ G, family = binomial)
Deviance Residuals:
Min 1Q Median 3Q Max
-1.5669 -1.3105 0.8327 0.8327 1.0499
Coefficients:
          Estimate Std. Error z value Pr(>|z|)
(Intercept) 0.30748 0.09958 3.088 0.00202 **
           Signif. codes: 0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
(Dispersion parameter for binomial family taken to be 1)
   Null deviance: 1270.3 on 982 degrees of freedom
Residual deviance: 1252.4 on 981 degrees of freedom
AIC: 1256.4
```

Number of Fisher Scoring iterations: 4

```
> grouplevel <-glm(cbind(Long.term, Short.term) ~ as.factor(Level), family=binomial,
               data=genderleveldat)
> summary(grouplevel)
glm(formula = cbind(Long.term, Short.term) ~ as.factor(Level),
   family = binomial, data = genderleveldat)
Deviance Residuals:
                  male 3
 male 1 male 2
                           male 4 female 1 female 2 female 3 female 4
 0.1340
         2.6858
                    1.2933
                             1.1442 -0.1275 -3.3867 -1.4844 -1.5577
Coefficients:
                Estimate Std. Error z value Pr(>|z|)
                0.7439 0.1240
                                    6.001 1.96e-09 ***
(Intercept)
                            0.1575 -0.665 0.5063
as.factor(Level)2 -0.1047
as.factor(Level)3 -0.4677
                           0.2050 -2.282 0.0225 *
as.factor(Level)4 0.1724
                           0.3052 0.565 0.5722
Signif. codes: 0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
(Dispersion parameter for binomial family taken to be 1)
   Null deviance: 32.886 on 7 degrees of freedom
Residual deviance: 26.329 on 4 degrees of freedom
AIC: 73.261
Number of Fisher Scoring iterations: 4
> #Corresponding un-grouped model:
> summary(unemp_L)
Call:
glm(formula = y ~ L, family = binomial)
Deviance Residuals:
   Min 1Q Median
                             3Q
                                     Max
-1.5829 -1.4581 0.8819 0.9206 1.0626
Coefficients:
           Estimate Std. Error z value Pr(>|z|)
(Intercept) 0.7439 0.1240 6.001 1.96e-09 ***
                      0.1575 -0.665 0.5063
L2
           -0.1047
L3
           -0.4677
                     0.2050 -2.282 0.0225 *
                      0.3052 0.565 0.5722
T.4
            0.1724
Signif. codes: 0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.01 '*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
(Dispersion parameter for binomial family taken to be 1)
```

Null deviance: 1270.3 on 982 degrees of freedom

```
AIC: 1271.8
Number of Fisher Scoring iterations: 4
> groupgenderlevel<-glm(cbind(Long.term, Short.term) ~ as.factor(Gender) +
+ as.factor(Level), family=binomial, data=genderleveldat)
> summary(groupgenderlevel)
Call:
glm(formula = cbind(Long.term, Short.term) ~ as.factor(Gender) +
   as.factor(Level), family = binomial, data = genderleveldat)
Deviance Residuals:
 male 1 male 2 male 3
                            male 4 female 1 female 2 female 3 female 4
-1.6508 0.8595 0.1123
                            0.5655
                                   1.4615 -1.0290 -0.1260 -0.7171
Coefficients:
                Estimate Std. Error z value Pr(>|z|)
(Intercept)
                as.factor(Gender)1 0.59585
                         0.13780 4.324 1.53e-05 ***
as.factor(Level)2 -0.20203 0.16073 -1.257 0.208790
as.factor(Level)3 -0.53702 0.20792 -2.583 0.009801 **
as.factor(Level)4 0.04949
                           Signif. codes: 0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.01 '*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
(Dispersion parameter for binomial family taken to be 1)
   Null deviance: 32.8863 on 7 degrees of freedom
Residual deviance: 7.5213 on 3 degrees of freedom
AIC: 56.453
Number of Fisher Scoring iterations: 4
> #Corresponding un-grouped model:
> summary(unemp_LG)
glm(formula = y ~ G + L, family = binomial)
Deviance Residuals:
           1Q Median
                            3Q
-1.6753 -1.2957
               0.8367 0.9603
                                1.2035
Coefficients:
         Estimate Std. Error z value Pr(>|z|)
(Intercept) 0.47594 0.13803 3.448 0.000564 ***
          G
                   0.16073 -1.257 0.208790
L2
          -0.20203
```

Residual deviance: 1263.8 on 979 degrees of freedom

0.20792 -2.583 0.009801 **

L3

-0.53702

```
L4
           0.04949
                    Signif. codes: 0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
(Dispersion parameter for binomial family taken to be 1)
   Null deviance: 1270.3 on 982 degrees of freedom
Residual deviance: 1245.0 on 978 degrees of freedom
AIC: 1255
Number of Fisher Scoring iterations: 4
> groupsat<-glm(cbind(Long.term, Short.term) ~ as.factor(Gender) * as.factor(Level),
             family=binomial, data=genderleveldat)
> summary(groupsat)
Call:
glm(formula = cbind(Long.term, Short.term) ~ as.factor(Gender) *
   as.factor(Level), family = binomial, data = genderleveldat)
Deviance Residuals:
[1] 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0
Coefficients:
                               Estimate Std. Error z value Pr(>|z|)
                                (Intercept)
                                                 0.185 0.85331
as.factor(Gender)1
                                0.04591
                                         0.24832
as.factor(Level)2
                               as.factor(Level)3
as.factor(Level)4
                               as.factor(Gender)1:as.factor(Level)2 0.81851 0.31933 2.563 0.01037 *
as.factor(Gender)1:as.factor(Level)3 0.60608 0.41526 1.460 0.14442
as.factor(Gender)1:as.factor(Level)4 1.08255 0.63577 1.703 0.08862 .
Signif. codes: 0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.01 '*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
(Dispersion parameter for binomial family taken to be 1)
   Null deviance: 3.2886e+01 on 7 degrees of freedom
Residual deviance: 2.0206e-14 on 0 degrees of freedom
AIC: 54.932
Number of Fisher Scoring iterations: 3
> #Corresponding un-grouped model:
> summary(unemp_sat)
Call:
glm(formula = y ~ G * L, family = binomial)
Deviance Residuals:
```

```
-1.7686 -1.2272
                 0.7981
                          0.8898
                                  1.2169
Coefficients:
           Estimate Std. Error z value Pr(>|z|)
(Intercept) 0.72213 0.17068 4.231 2.33e-05 ***
           0.04591 0.24832
                              0.185 0.85331
L2
           L3
          -0.52146
                    0.48078 -1.085 0.27809
L4
G:L2
                               2.563 0.01037 *
           0.81851
                      0.31933
G:L3
           0.60608
                      0.41526
                               1.460 0.14442
G:L4
           1.08255
                      0.63577
                               1.703 0.08862 .
Signif. codes: 0 '***' 0.001 '**' 0.01 '*' 0.05 '.' 0.1 ' ' 1
(Dispersion parameter for binomial family taken to be 1)
   Null deviance: 1270.3 on 982 degrees of freedom
Residual deviance: 1237.4 on 975 degrees of freedom
AIC: 1253.4
Number of Fisher Scoring iterations: 4
  ANOVA for grouped data:
> anova(groupgenderlevel, groupsat)
Analysis of Deviance Table
Model 1: cbind(Long.term, Short.term) ~ as.factor(Gender) + as.factor(Level)
Model 2: cbind(Long.term, Short.term) ~ as.factor(Gender) * as.factor(Level)
 Resid. Df Resid. Dev Df Deviance
         3
              7.5213
1
              0.0000 3 7.5213
         0
> anova(grouplevel, groupgenderlevel)
Analysis of Deviance Table
Model 1: cbind(Long.term, Short.term) ~ as.factor(Level)
Model 2: cbind(Long.term, Short.term) ~ as.factor(Gender) + as.factor(Level)
 Resid. Df Resid. Dev Df Deviance
         4
              26.3290
         3
              7.5213 1
                        18.808
> anova(groupintercept, grouplevel)
Analysis of Deviance Table
Model 1: cbind(Long.term, Short.term) ~ 1
```

30

Max

Min

1Q

Median

```
Model 2: cbind(Long.term, Short.term) ~ as.factor(Level)
 Resid. Df Resid. Dev Df Deviance
         7
               32.886
         4
               26.329 3
                          6.5573
> anova(groupgenderlevel, groupsat)
Analysis of Deviance Table
Model 1: cbind(Long.term, Short.term) ~ as.factor(Gender) + as.factor(Level)
Model 2: cbind(Long.term, Short.term) ~ as.factor(Gender) * as.factor(Level)
 Resid. Df Resid. Dev Df Deviance
         3 7.5213
         0
               0.0000 3 7.5213
> anova(groupgender, groupgenderlevel)
Analysis of Deviance Table
Model 1: cbind(Long.term, Short.term) ~ Gender
{\tt Model 2: cbind(Long.term, Short.term) ~ as.factor(Gender) + as.factor(Level)}
 Resid. Df Resid. Dev Df Deviance
         6 14.9275
         3
               7.5213 3 7.4063
> anova(groupintercept, groupgender)
Analysis of Deviance Table
Model 1: cbind(Long.term, Short.term) ~ 1
Model 2: cbind(Long.term, Short.term) ~ Gender
 Resid. Df Resid. Dev Df Deviance
               32.886
         7
         6
               14.928 1 17.959
```