Bug report from Dr. Guo

December 18, 2012

1 Using fullmatch's data argument

This document attempts to recreate this issues reported by Dr. Guo with the latest version of optmatch (0.8-0). I think the problem is a documentation bug with the new data argument to fullmatch. This argument is optional, but when omitted, a warning is issued suggesting that the user include it. While this warning message is important, the somewhat ambiguous use of the word "data" might confuse users. Does "data" mean the distance matrix? Does "data" mean a propensity score object? Does "data" mean some sort of data vector or matrix that was used earlier in the process? The correct answer is the last one: a vector or matrix that establishes the proper order of the match vector, but from reviewing the error message and the fullmatch documentation, I can understand if users are not crystal clear on the nature of this important distinction.

The rest of this document attempts to mock up (using simulated data), a similar situation in the one reported by Dr. Guo. I show where the confusion over the data comes from, along with the proper usage of this argument. There may be other issues at play (and I'd like to get the original data to make sure that there are not multiple problems appearing simultaneously). The new version of optmatch certainly has a few outstanding bugs (and I discovered a new one in the process of writing this document), so it is possible that Dr. Guo's issue is not simply a documentation problem.

> library(optmatch)

Here will mock up some data in the style of (linear) propensity scores:

```
C.2 C.3 C.4 C.5 C.6
-0.92916171 -0.72465459 0.37861986 2.06783497 0.87281308
```

To make things interesting, lets shake up the order of the data vector. This will be important to illustrate a point later:

```
> rnd.order <- sample(1:N)
> X <- X[rnd.order]
> Z <- Z[rnd.order]</pre>
```

Now, we can rank the data and create a matrix. See Section 3 for another way to create this distance matrix:

```
> R \leftarrow rank(X)
> D \leftarrow abs(outer(R[Z == 1], R[Z == 0], '-'))
> D[1:3, 1:3]
      C.10 C.24 C.13
T.39
        10
              45
                    29
T.14
        38
               3
                    19
T.43
         1
              36
                    20
```

Now, we will perform a simple full match. If the length is zero, the match failed (or if it is all NA values):

```
> fm <- fullmatch(D, min.controls = 1, max.controls = 4)
> stopifnot(length(fm) > 0 & all(!is.na(fm)))
```

If you are reading this, the match worked. However, you might be worried when you see this warning:

Warning message:

```
In fullmatch(D, min.controls = 1, max.controls = 4) :
  Without 'data' argument the order of the match is not guaranteed
  to be the same as your original data.
```

This message does not mean that fullmatch failed (it is not a full error, just a warning). It is to warn the user that the output (our fm object) might be in an order that does not correspond to any previous data vector, matrix, or table. To illustrate, compare the names of the first 5 items in the fm object with the first 10 items in the X object:

```
> fm[1:10]
T.39 T.14 T.43 T.19 T.25 T.7 T.48 T.44 T.11 T.30
1.33 1.6 1.38 1.11 1.18 1.48 1.43 1.39 1.3 1.24
> X[1:10]
```

```
C.10 T.39 T.14 T.43 T.19 C.24 C.13
-0.2252463 -0.4707736 0.7526047 -0.2932224 -0.1929818 0.6506225 0.2255692
C.31 C.36 T.25
-0.4760022 1.2832260 0.8433414
```

Notice that the fm object is all treated units, while the original data had a random order of treated and control objects. If we tried to use cbind to join these two vectors, they would not correspond. This can be an even bigger issue if certain observations get dropped during the distance creation. Then result of fullmatching may have a different length than the original data.

In previous versions of optmatch, users had to manually match up names of the matched object to avoid this issue.

```
> fm.ordered_by_x <- fm[names(X)]
> fm.ordered_by_x[1:10]

C.10 T.39 T.14 T.43 T.19 C.24 C.13 C.31 C.36 T.25
1.11 1.33  1.6 1.38 1.11  1.1 1.12  1.4 1.48 1.18
```

In the latest version, the data argument helps with this issue by looking in an existing vector, matrix or data.frame to get the proper order (including any observations that got dropped in the process, say when fitting a glm object).

```
> fm.with_data <- fullmatch(D, min.controls = 1, max.controls = 4, data = X)
> fm.with_data[1:10]

C.10 T.39 T.14 T.43 T.19 C.24 C.13 C.31 C.36 T.25
1.11 1.33    1.6 1.38 1.11    1.1 1.12    1.4 1.48 1.18
```

The fullmatch documentation is somewhat brief on the usage of the data argument. We will improve it in the next version:

data: Optional \code{data.frame} or \code{vector} to use to get order of the final matching factor. If a \code{data.frame}, the \code{rownames} are used. If a vector, the \code{names} are first tried, otherwise the contents is considered to be a character vector of names. Useful to pass if you want to combine a match (using, e.g., \code{cbind}) with the data that were used to generate it (for example, in a propensity score matching).

What is most unclear in this help text is a more precise definition of where the data argument should come from; it is not the same as the distance argument! For this problem, either X or R (the original data and the rank transformed version) are valid choices. If the user were fitting a model it would look something like this:

```
> XZ <- data.frame(X, Z)
> rownames(XZ)[1:10]
```

```
[1] "C.10" "T.39" "T.14" "T.43" "T.19" "C.24" "C.13" "C.31" "C.36" "T.25"

> fm <- fullmatch(match_on(glm(Z ~ X, data = XZ, family = binomial)), data = XZ)

> names(fm)[1:10]

[1] "C.10" "T.39" "T.14" "T.43" "T.19" "C.24" "C.13" "C.31" "C.36" "T.25"

>
```

Future improvements to optmatch will be smarter about finding the data argument if possible and helping users avoid some of the nested calls (match_on(glm(...)) for common use cases.

2 Using Guo's data directly

```
> library(foreign)
> set.seed(10)
> cds <- read.dta("opt.dta")</pre>
> attach(cds)
> prank <- rank(ps)</pre>
> names(prank) <- id
> d1 <- outer(prank[aodserv==1], prank[aodserv==0], "-")</pre>
> d1 <- abs(d1)
> d1[1:3, 1:3]
     2
          3
               6
1 2283 1263
             542
5 1886
       866
             145
       666 1387
   354
> #variable match, (vm1 - at least 1 at most 4)
> vm1 <- fullmatch(d1,min.controls=1,max.controls=4)</pre>
> vm1
                                                              101
   1
        5
             8
                  9
                      15
                           23
                                45
                                     50
                                           64
                                                67
                                                     85
                                                          99
                                                                   160
                                                                        164
                                                                             188
<NA> <NA> <NA> <NA> <NA>
                        <NA> <NA>
                                   <NA> <NA>
                                              <NA>
                                                   <NA>
                                                        <NA>
                                                             <NA> <NA>
                                                                       <NA> <NA>
 189
      198
           203
                204
                     210
                          211
                               220
                                    221
                                         226
                                               228
                                                    231
                                                         236
                                                              237
                                                                   244
                                                                        253
                                                                             297
<NA> <NA> <NA> <NA>
                    <NA>
                         <NA>
                              <NA>
                                   <NA>
                                        <NA>
                                              <NA>
                                                   <NA>
                                                        <NA>
                                                             <NA>
                                                                  <NA>
 306
     315
           329
                368
                     384
                          396
                               397
                                     400
                                         402
                                               408
                                                    427
                                                         451
                                                              460
                                                                   473
                                                                        477
                                                                             483
<NA>
    <NA>
          <NA> <NA>
                    <NA>
                         <NA>
                              <NA>
                                   <NA> <NA>
                                              <NA>
                                                   <NA>
                                                        <NA>
                                                             <NA>
                                                                  <NA> <NA>
 485
      525
           535
                546
                     552
                          553
                               566
                                    590
                                         605
                                               621
                                                    623
                                                         633
                                                              667
                                                                   673
                                                                        678
                                                                             682
              <NA>
                    <NA>
                         <NA>
                                        <NA> <NA>
                                                   <NA>
<NA>
    <NA>
          <NA>
                              <NA>
                                   <NA>
                                                        <NA>
                                                             <NA>
                                                                  <NA>
                                                                       <NA>
                                                                            <NA>
 685
      689
           732
                763
                     780
                          786
                               790
                                    795
                                         800
                                              816
                                                    825
                                                         844
                                                              847
                                                                   856
                                                                        861
<NA> <NA>
          <NA>
               <NA>
                    <NA>
                         <NA>
                                   <NA>
                                        <NA> <NA> <NA> <NA> <NA> <NA> <NA> <NA>
                              <NA>
      899
           952
                956
                     960
                          970
                               971
                                    979
                                         982 1002 1009 1011 1014 1017 1025 1027
 887
1028 1032 1037 1044 1057 1063 1086 1089 1093 1096 1121 1140 1147 1154 1174 1217
```

```
1396 1397 1398 1399 1400 1401 1402 1406 1407 1408 1409 1410 1411 1412 1413 1414
1416 1417 1418 1420 1421 1424 1426 1427 1428 1429 1431 1435 1436 1438 1439 1440
1441 1444 1445 1447 1448 1450 1451 1452 1453 1455 1457 1458 1459 1464 1466 1467
1471 1472 1474 1477 1478 1479 1481 1482 1483 1484 1485 1489 1491 1494 1496 1500
1501 1502 1503 1504 1505 1506 1508 1509 1510 1511 1512 1513 1514 1515 1517 1518
1519 1520 1521 1522 1523 1524 1525 1526 1529 1530 1531 1533 1534 1536 1537 1539
1541 1542 1543 1544 1545 1546 1548 1549 1550 1551 1552 1554 1555 1556 1557 1558
1561 1562 1564 1565 1566 1567 1568 1569 1570 1571 1573 1574 1575 1577 1580 1581
1582 1584 1585 1587 1588 1589 1593 1595 1596 1597 1598 1599 1600 1601 1605 1607
1608 1610 1611 1612 1613 1615 1616 1618 1621 1622 1626 1628 1629 1630 1632 1633
1634 1635 1636 1637 1638 1639 1640 1641 1642 1643 1644 1645 1646 1647 1651 1652
1654 1656 1658 1659 1661 1663 1668 1669 1671 1673 1675 1676 1677 1679 1681 1682
1683 1685 1691 1693 1695 1697 1698 1699 1702 1704 1705 1706 1707 1708 1710 1711
1713 1714 1715 1716 1718 1719 1724 1725 1727 1728 1729 1730 1731 1733 1734 1735
1736 1737 1738 1739 1740 1742 1744 1745 1746 1747 1749 1750 1752 1753 1754 1755
1757 1759 1760 1761 1763 1764 1765 1766 1767 1768 1770 1771 1773 1774 1776 1777
1778 1780 1781 1782 1783 1784 1789 1790 1792 1793 1794 1795 1796 1798 1799 1801
1803 1804 1805 1806 1807 1808 1809 1811 1812 1813 1814 1816 1819 1820 1823 1825
1826 1827 1828 1829 1830 1831 1832 1833 1835 1836 1840 1841 1842 1843 1844 1845
1848 1849 1850 1851 1852 1853 1854 1855 1856 1858 1859 1862 1863 1865 1868 1871
1873 1874 1875 1876 1877 1879 1882 1883 1885 1887 1888 1889 1890 1894 1895 1897
1898 1899 1900 1901 1902 1903 1904 1905 1906 1908 1909 1910 1911 1912 1913 1914
1916 1917 1919 1920 1921 1922 1923 1924 1925 1926 1928 1929 1931 1933 1938 1939
```

```
1941 1942 1944 1946 1948 1949 1950 1952 1953 1954 1955 1956 1959 1960 1962 1963
1964 1966 1967 1968 1969 1970 1971 1972 1974 1976 1978 1980 1982 1984 1986 1987
1988 1989 1990 1991 1992 1997 1998 1999 2000 2001 2003 2006 2008 2009 2011 2013
2014 2015 2017 2019 2021 2023 2024 2026 2027 2032 2036 2037 2038 2040 2041 2044
2045 2046 2047 2052 2053 2054 2057 2059 2060 2061 2062 2063 2064 2065 2067 2068
2069 2070 2071 2072 2073 2074 2077 2078 2079 2080 2081 2083 2085 2088 2089 2090
2091 2092 2094 2096 2097 2099 2100 2101 2102 2104 2105 2106 2107 2109 2110 2111
2112 2118 2122 2125 2126 2128 2131 2133 2134 2135 2136 2137 2138 2141 2143 2144
2146 2147 2148 2149 2150 2151 2153 2154 2155 2156 2158 2159 2161 2162 2165 2166
2167 2168 2170 2172 2173 2176 2179 2183 2184 2189 2190 2191 2192 2193 2195 2196
2200 2201 2203 2206 2207 2208 2209 2210 2211 2213 2214 2215 2216 2218 2219 2223
2224 2225 2226 2229 2231 2232 2234 2235 2236 2237 2238 2241 2242 2243 2244 2245
2247 2248 2249 2251 2253 2254 2255 2258 2259 2260 2261 2262 2263 2265 2266 2267
2268 2269 2270 2271 2272 2274 2275 2277 2278 2279 2280 2285 2286 2287 2288 2291
2292 2293 2294 2295 2296 2298 2300 2301 2302 2303 2305 2306 2307 2308 2311 2312
2313 2314 2315 2316 2318 2319 2320 2322 2323 2324 2326 2327 2329 2331 2334 2335
2336 2337 2338 2339 2340 2341 2342 2343 2344 2348 2349 2350 2351 2352 2353 2355
2356 2357 2358 2359 2360 2361 2362 2364 2365 2367 2368 2370 2372 2374 2375 2376
2377 2379 2380 2381 2382 2383 2386 2387 2388 2390 2391 2392 2393 2394 2395 2396
2397 2400 2402 2404 2405 2406 2407 2409 2411 2414 2415 2416 2417 2418 2421 2422
2423 2425 2426 2429 2430 2432 2433 2434 2435 2438 2439 2440 2441 2442 2445 2446
2448 2449 2450 2451 2452 2453 2454 2455 2456 2458 2459 2460 2461 2462 2466 2471
2472 2476 2477 2480 2484 2485 2486 2487 2488 2489 2491 2492 2494 2495 2498 2501
```

```
2502 2505 2507 2508 2510 2511 2514 2516 2517 2518 2519 2520 2521 2522 2524 2529
2530 2531 2532 2535 2539 2540 2541 2544 2545 2546 2547 2548 2550 2551 2553 2554
2557 2558 2561 2563 2564 2566 2569 2570 2572 2573 2574 2576 2577 2578 2580 2581
2582 2584 2588 2590 2591 2593 2594 2597 2600 2601 2604 2605 2607 2608 2609 2610
2611 2613 2614 2615 2616 2618 2623 2624 2627 2628 2629 2630 2631 2632 2633 2634
2636 2637 2638 2639 2640 2642 2643 2644 2646 2649 2651 2653 2654 2655 2657 2658
2659 2660 2663 2664 2665 2667 2668 2670 2671 2673 2674 2675 2676 2677 2678 2681
2682 2683 2685 2687 2689 2690 2692 2693 2694 2696 2697 2698 2700 2701 2702 2703
2705 2707 2708 2709 2712 2713 2714 2715 2718 2719 2720 2721 2722 2727 2728 2729
2730 2732 2733 2739 2740 2742 2747 2748 2750 2752 2755 2758 2760 2763 2764 2765
2766 2768 2770 2771 2772 2773 2774 2775 2777 2778 2779 2780 2781 2782 2784 2785
2786 2789 2790 2791 2792 2793 2794 2795 2796 2797 2798 2800 2801 2802 2803 2805
2806 2808 2809 2810 2811 2812 2813 2816 2818 2819 2820 2822 2824 2825 2826 2827
2829 2832 2834 2835 2836 2839 2840 2843 2844 2846 2847 2848 2850 2851 2852 2853
2854 2856 2857 2859 2860 2861 2862 2864 2865 2867 2868 2869 2870 2871 2872 2873
2874 2875 2876 2878 2879 2880 2881 2882 2884 2887 2888 2889 2890 2892 2895 2896
2897 2899 2900 2901 2902 2908 2909 2910 2911 2912 2913 2914 2915 2916 2917 2920
2922 2923 2924 2925 2926 2927 2929 2930 2932 2933 2934 2935 2936 2937 2941 2942
2943 2944 2945 2946 2947 2948 2949 2951 2952 2954 2955 2956 2957 2958 2959 2962
2965 2966 2967 2969 2972 2973 2974 2976 2978 2979 2981 2982 2984 2985 2986 2988
2989 2991 2995 2996 2997 2998 2999 3002 3003 3004 3008 3010 3012 3014 3016 3017
3020 3021 3022 3023 3024 3025 3026 3028 3029 3030 3031 3032 3033 3034 3035 3037
3038 3040 3041 3043 3047 3048 3049 3051 3054 3055 3058 3059 3061 3062 3063 3066
```

```
3068 3070 3071 3072 3073 3074 3075 3076 3078 3079 3080 3081 3082 3083 3085 3086
3087 3088 3092 3094 3097 3098 3099 3100 3102 3103 3104 3105 3107 3108 3109 3110
3111 3112 3114 3115 3117 3119 3120 3121 3122 3123 3124 3125 3126 3128 3129 3134
3135 3137 3140 3141 3144 3145 3146 3147 3148 3149 3150 3151 3152 3153 3155 3156
3157 3158 3160 3162 3163 3164 3165 3166 3167 3168 3169 3170 3171 3172 3173 3174
3175 3176 3177 3178 3180 3182 3183 3184 3185 3187 3189 3190 3191 3192 3193 3194
3195 3196 3201 3204 3207 3209 3210 3211 3212 3213 3214 3215 3216 3218 3219 3222
3226 3227 3228 3230 3231 3232 3234 3235 3236 3238 3239 3241 3242 3244 3245 3248
3249 3250 3252 3254 3255 3256 3257 3259 3262 3263 3265 3266 3267 3268 3269 3270
3274 3275 3276 3277 3278 3280 3282 3288 3289 3290 3292 3293 3294 3295 3296 3297
3298 3299 3301 3302 3303 3304 3306 3307 3308 3309 3310 3311 3312 3313 3315 3316
3318 3319 3320 3321 3322 3326 3327 3330 3331 3332 3333 3334 3335 3338 3339 3340
3341 3343 3344 3345 3346 3347 3348 3349 3350 3352 3354 3355 3356 3357 3359 3361
3363 3364 3365 3366 3367 3368 3369 3370 3371 3372 3374 3375 3376 3377 3378 3379
3382 3384 3385 3386 3387 3388 3389 3390 3391 3392 3393 3395 3396 3397 3398 3400
3401 3402 3404 3406 3408 3409 3410 3411 3413 3415 3416 3417 3418 3420 3422 3423
3424 3425 3426 3427 3428 3429 3430 3432 3433 3434 3436 3437 3438 3440 3441 3443
3444 3445 3446 3447 3448 3452 3456 3457 3461 3462 3463 3464 3465 3468 3469 3470
3473 3475 3476 3478 3480 3481 3482 3483 3485 3486 3487 3488 3489 3491 3493 3494
3495 3496 3497 3499 3501 3502 3503 3504 3507 3508 3510 3511 3513 3515 3516 3520
3522 3523 3524 3525 3526 3527 3528 3531 3532 3533 3534 3535 3537 3538 3541 3542
3543 3544 3545 3547 3548 3550 3551 3552 3553 3555 3556 3558 3560 3561 3563 3564
3566 3568 3569 3570 3571 3573 3574 3577 3578 3579 3580 3581 3582 3583 3584 3585
```

```
3587 3588 3589 3590 3591 3592 3593 3595 3596 3597 3599 3600 3601 3603 3604 3605
3607 3608 3610 3612 3616 3617 3618 3619 3620 3621 3622 3624 3627 3628 3630 3631
<NA> <NA>
      <NA> <NA>
            <NA> <NA> <NA> <NA> <NA>
                            <NA>
                               <NA> <NA>
                                     <NA> <NA> <NA>
3632 3634 3636 3638 3639 3641 3642 3643 3644 3646 3647 3648 3649 3650 3651 3652
3655 3656 3659 3661 3662 3664 3665 3666 3667 3668 3670 3673 3675 3678 3679
3682 3684 3685 3686 3687 3688
<NA> <NA> <NA> <NA> <NA> <NA>
> (vm1.d <- matched.distances(vm1,d1,pres=TRUE))</pre>
logical(0)
```

3 New Syntax

There many new improvements to the distance creation tools in optmatch _0.8. Specifically, the match_on function provides some convenient short cuts for common distance creation techniques. In addition creating distances from GLM objects (seen above), functions, and formulas (using Mahalanobis or Euclidean distance), this function also has a numeric method that performs absolute differences on a single dimension. Using the ranks from before, we can create the same distance matrix without using outer:

```
> D2 <- match_on(R, z = Z)
> all(D2 - D == 0)
[1] TRUE
```

> D[1:3, 1:3]

(D2 is a child class of matrix, so to show that they are the same, I use subtraction and comparison to zero.)

One nice feature of the match_on.numeric is that for large problems where a caliper is required, the caliper value can be passed in and only the values that are less than the caliper will be computed, saving considerable computation time and memory.

```
C.10 C.24 C.13
T.39 10 45 29
T.14 38 3 19
T.43 1 36 20
> D3 <- match_on(R, z = Z, caliper = 20)
```

> optmatch:::as.matrix.InfinitySparseMatrix(D3)[c("T.39", "T.14", "T.43"), c("C.10", "C.24

control treated C.10 C.24 C.13 T.39 10 Inf Inf T.14 Inf 3 19 T.43 1 Inf 20

In writing this up, I see a small bug: we didn't properly export the as.matrix method for the special objects that match_on produces. Rest assured this will be addressed in the next maintenance release.

A R Session Info

```
> sessionInfo()
R version 2.15.2 (2012-10-26)
Platform: x86_64-apple-darwin12.2.1 (64-bit)
locale:
[1] en_US.UTF-8/en_US.UTF-8/en_US.UTF-8/C/en_US.UTF-8/en_US.UTF-8
attached base packages:
[1] stats graphics grDevices utils datasets methods base
other attached packages:
[1] foreign_0.8-51 optmatch_0.8-1
loaded via a namespace (and not attached):
[1] tools_2.15.2
```