```
In []: # Initialize Otter
            import otter
            grader = otter.Notebook()
  In [ ]: # Please do not change this cell because some hidden tests might depend on i
            import os
            # Otter grader does not handle ! commands well, so we define and use our
            # own function to execute shell commands.
            def shell(commands, warn=True):
                """Executes the string `commands` as a sequence of shell commands.
                   Prints the result to stdout and returns the exit status.
                   Provides a printed warning on non-zero exit status unless `warn`
                   flag is unset.
                file = os.popen(commands)
                print (file.read().rstrip('\n'))
                exit_status = file.close()
                if warn and exit status != None:
                     print(f"Completed with errors. Exit status: {exit_status}\n")
                return exit_status
            shell("""
            ls tests >/dev/null 2>&1
            if [ ! \$? = 0 ]; then
            # Check if the repository exists before trying to clone it
             if git ls-remote https://github.com/cs187-2025/lab2-2-a.git >/dev/null 2>&1
               rm -rf .tmp
               git clone https://github.com/cs187-2025/lab2-2-a.git .tmp
               mv .tmp/tests ./
               if [ -f .tmp/requirements.txt ]; then
                 mv .tmp/requirements.txt ./
               fi
               rm -rf .tmp
             else
               echo \"Repository https://github.com/cs187-2025/lab2-2-a.git does not exi
             fi
            fi
            if [ -f requirements.txt ]; then
             python -m pip install -q -r requirements.txt
            fi
            111111)
\% latex \newcommand{\vect}[1]{\mathbf{#1}} \newcommand{\cnt}[1]{\sharp(#1)} \newcommand{\argmax}[1]{\underset{#1}}
{\operatorname{argmax}}} \operatorname{argmax}} \operatorname{argmax}} \operatorname{argmax}} \operatorname{argmax}} \operatorname{softmax}} \operatorname{argmax}} 
\newcommand{\given}{\,\,\,}
  In [ ]: # Graphviz verification
            print("Checking graphviz availability...")
            try:
                import graphviz
                print(f"√ graphviz Python package is available (version: {graphviz.__ver
```

```
# Test if graphviz executable is available
   try:
        test graph = graphviz.Digraph()
       test_graph.node('A', 'Test')
       test_graph.render('test_graphviz', format='png', cleanup=True)
        print("/ graphviz executable is available and working")
        # Clean up test file
       try:
           os.remove('test graphviz')
       except:
           pass
   except Exception as e:
        print(f"x graphviz executable not available or not working: {e}")
        print("You may need to install graphviz system package:")
        print(" - macOS: brew install graphviz")
        print(" - Ubuntu/Debian: sudo apt-get install graphviz")
        print(" - Windows: download from https://graphviz.org/download/")
except ImportError:
    print("x graphviz Python package not found")
    print("Install with: pip install graphviz")
print("Graphviz check complete.\n")
```

In this lab, you'll use Pytorch to implement an RNN that performs a useful application, punctuation restoration.

New bits of Python used for the first time in the *solution set* for this lab, and which you may therefore find useful:

- torch.clamp: restricts all elements of a tensor to a specific range
- torch.diag: creates a tensor with the given inputs as the diagonal
- torch.eye : creates an identity matrix
- torch.mv (typically invoked via the @ operator): matrix-vector multiplication
- torch.prod: takes the product of elements in a vector
- torch.T: returns the transpose of a tensor
- torch.zeros: creates a matrix of zeros

### Preparation – Loading packages

```
In []: import sys
    import torch
    import wget
    import math
    import torch.nn as nn
    import random
    import csv

from datasets import load_dataset
    from tokenizers import Tokenizer
```

```
from tokenizers.models import WordLevel
        from tokenizers.pre tokenizers import WhitespaceSplit
        from tokenizers.trainers import WordLevelTrainer
        from transformers import PreTrainedTokenizerFast
        from collections import Counter
        from tgdm.notebook import tgdm
        import copy
In [ ]: # Script for visualizing computation graphs
        data dir = "data/"
        sys.path.append(data dir)
        os.makedirs(data_dir, exist_ok=True)
        wget.download('https://raw.githubusercontent.com/nlp-course/data/master/scri
        from makedot import make_dot
        # Fix random seed for replicability
        SEED=1234
        random.seed(SEED)
        torch.manual seed(SEED)
In [ ]: ## GPU check
        device = torch.device("cuda" if torch.cuda.is_available() else "cpu")
        print(device)
```

# Punctuation restoration as RNN sequence labeling

In this lab, you will use recurrent neural networks (RNNs) for sequence labeling.

We consider the task of *automatic punctuation restoration* from unpunctuated text, which is useful for post-processing transcribed speech from speech recognition systems (since we don't want users to have to utter all punctuation marks). We can formulate this task as a sequence labeling task, predicting for each word the punctuation that should follow. If there's no punctuation following the word, we use a special tag 0 for "other".

The dataset we use is the Federalist papers. We use text without punctuation as our input, and predict the punctuation following each word. An example constructed from the dataset looks like below, which correponds to the punctuated sentence the powers to make treaties and to send and receive ambassadors , speak their own propriety.

Token	Label
<bos></bos>	0
the	0

Token	Label
powers	0
to	0
make	0
treaties	0
and	0
to	0
send	0
and	0
receive	0
ambassadors	,
speak	0
their	0
own	0
propriety	

First, we load the data.

```
In [ ]: # Prepare to download needed data
        def download_if_needed(source, dest, filename):
            os.makedirs(data_path, exist_ok=True) # ensure destination
            os.path.exists(f"./{dest}{filename}") or wget.download(source + filename
        source_path = "https://raw.githubusercontent.com/nlp-course/data/master/Fede
        data_path = "data/"
        # Download the files
        for filename in ["federalist_tag.train.txt",
                         "federalist tag.dev.txt",
                         "federalist_tag.test.txt"
            download_if_needed(source_path, data_path, filename)
        # Read in the dataset, extracting the token sequences and the
        # corresponding tag sequences and generate a CSV file of the
        # processed data
        for split in ['train', 'dev', 'test']:
            in_file = f'data/federalist_tag.{split}.txt'
            out_file = f'data/federalist_tag.{split}.csv'
            with open(in_file, 'r') as f_in:
                with open(out_file, 'w') as f_out:
                    text, tag = [], []
                    writer = csv.writer(f_out)
                    writer.writerow(('text','tag'))
```

```
for line in f_in:
    if line.strip() == '':
        writer.writerow((' '.join(text), ' '.join(tag)))
        text, tag = [], []
    else:
        token, label = line.split('\t')
        text.append(token)
        tag.append(label.strip())
```

Let's take a look at what each data file looks like.

```
In [ ]: shell('head "data/federalist_tag.train.csv"')
```

We'll use the HuggingFace datasets package to further prepare the data.

```
In []: # Split out the training, validation, and test sets
    train_data = federalist_dataset['train']
    val_data = federalist_dataset['val']
    test_data = federalist_dataset['test']
```

We build a tokenizer from the training data to tokenize text and convert tokens into word ids.

We use datasets.Dataset.map to convert text into word ids. As shown in lab 1-5, first we need to wrap text\_tokenizer with the transformers.PreTrainedTokenizerFast class to be compatible with the datasets library.

```
def encode(example):
            return hf_text_tokenizer(example['text'])
        # Encode the training, validation, and test sets
        train_data = train_data.map(encode)
        val data = val data.map(encode)
        test data = test data.map(encode)
In []: # An example from the training dataset, showing the string of tokens,
        # the string of tags, and the list of token ids. The token type ids
        # and attention mask can be ignored for the time being.
        train_data[0]
        We also need to convert the string of tags into a list of tag ids.
In [ ]: tag tokenizer = Tokenizer(WordLevel())
        tag_tokenizer.pre_tokenizer = WhitespaceSplit()
        tag trainer = WordLevelTrainer(special tokens=[pad token])
        tag_tokenizer.train_from_iterator(train_data['tag'], trainer=tag_trainer)
        hf tag tokenizer = PreTrainedTokenizerFast(tokenizer object=tag tokenizer, g
        # encode_tag(example) -- Updates the `example` by tokenizing and encoding th
        # into a list of tag ids.
        def encode tag(example):
            example['tag_ids'] = hf_tag_tokenizer(example['tag']).input_ids
            return example
        train_data = train_data.map(encode_tag)
        val data = val data.map(encode tag)
        test_data = test_data.map(encode_tag)
In []: # An example from the training dataset, showing the string of tokens,
        # the string of tags, and the list of token ids. The token type ids
        # and attention mask can be ignored for the time being.
        train_data[0]
In [ ]: # Print out some stats
        text_vocab = hf_text_tokenizer.get_vocab()
        tag_vocab = hf_tag_tokenizer.get_vocab()
        vocab size = len(text vocab)
        num\_tags = len(tag\_vocab)
        most_common_tokens = Counter(token
                                     for sentence in train data['text']
                                      for token in sentence.split()).most_common(10)
        most_common_tags = Counter(tag
                                   for sentence tags in train data['tag']
                                   for tag in sentence_tags.split()).most_common(10)
```

print(f"Size of vocab: {vocab size}")

print (f"Most common English words: {most\_common\_tokens}\n")

```
print(f"Number of tags: {num_tags}")
print (f"Most common tags: {most_common_tags}")
```

You can see from above that the most common punctuation is comma, on which we will evaluate precision, recall, and F-1 scores later.

We mapped words that are not among the most frequent words (specified by MAX\_V0CAB\_SIZE) to a special unknown token:

To facilitate batching sentences of different lengths into the same tensor we also reserved a special padding symbol [PAD] for both text\_vocab and tag\_vocab.

```
In []: print (f"Padding token: {pad_token}")
    text_pad_index = text_vocab[pad_token]
    print (f"Padding text_vocab token id: {text_pad_index}")
    tag_pad_index = tag_vocab[pad_token]
    print (f"Padding tag_vocab token id: {tag_pad_index}")
```

To load data in batched tensors, we use torch.utils.data.DataLoader for data splits, which enables us to iterate over the dataset under a given BATCH\_SIZE, which is set to be 1 throughout this lab. We still batch the data because other torch functions expect data to be batched.

```
In [ ]: # We use batch size 1 for simplicity
        BATCH SIZE = 1
        # collate(examples) -- Combines a list of examples into a single batch
        def collate fn(examples):
            batch = \{\}
            bsz = len(examples)
            input ids, tag ids = [], []
            for example in examples:
                input_ids.append(example['input_ids'])
                tag ids.append(example['tag ids'])
            max_length = max([len(word_ids) for word_ids in input_ids])
            tag batch = torch.zeros(bsz, max length).long().fill (tag vocab[pad toke
            text_batch = torch.zeros(bsz, max_length).long().fill_(text_vocab[pad_td
            for b in range(bsz):
                text batch[b][:len(input ids[b])] = torch.LongTensor(input ids[b]).t
                tag_batch[b][:len(tag_ids[b])] = torch.LongTensor(tag_ids[b]).to(dev
            batch['tag_ids'] = tag_batch
            batch['input_ids'] = text_batch
            return batch
```

Let's take a look at the dataset. Recall from project 1 that there are two different ways of iterating over the dataset, one by iterating over individual examples, the other by iterating over batches of examples.

```
In []: # Iterating over individual examples:
    # Note that the words are the original words, so you'd need to manually
    # replace them with `[UNK]` if not in the vocabulary.
    example = train_data[1]

text = example["text"].split() # a sequence of unpunctuated words
tags = example["tag"].split() # a sequence of tags indicating the proper print(f'{"TYPE":15}: {"TAG"}')
for word, tag in zip(text, tags):
    print(f"{word:15}: {tag}")
```

Alternatively, we can produce the data a batch at a time, as in the example below. Note the "shape" of a batch; it's a two-dimensional tensor of size batch\_size x max\_length. (In this case, batch\_size is 1.) Thus, to extract a sentence from a batch, we need to index by the *first* dimension.

```
In []: # Iterating over batches of examples:
    #
    # Note that the collat_fn returns input_ids and tag_ids only, so you
    # need to manually convert them back to strings.
    # Unknown words have been mapped to unknown word ids

batch = next(iter(train_iter))
    text_ids = batch['input_ids']
    example_text = text_ids[0]
    print (f"Size of first text batch: {text_ids.size()}")
    print (f"First sentence in batch: {example_text}")
    print (f"Mapped back to string: {hf_text_tokenizer.decode(example_text)}")

print ('-'*20)

tag_ids = batch['tag_ids']
    example_tags = tag_ids[0]
    print (f"Size of tag batch: {tag_ids.size()}")
```

```
print (f"First sentence in batch: {example_tags}")
print (f"Mapped back to string: {hf_tag_tokenizer.decode(example_tags, clear
```

Given the tokenized tags of an unpunctuated sequence of words, we can easily restore the punctuation:

```
In []: def restore_punctuation(word_ids, tag_ids):
    words = hf_text_tokenizer.convert_ids_to_tokens(word_ids)
    tags = hf_tag_tokenizer.convert_ids_to_tokens(tag_ids)
    words_with_punc = []
    for word, tag in zip(words, tags):
        words_with_punc.append(word)
        if tag != "0":
            words_with_punc.append(tag)
        return " ".join(words_with_punc)
In []: print(restore_punctuation(example['input_ids'], example['tag_ids']))
```

#### **Majority Labeling**

We start by implementing a simple baseline without RNNs.

A naive baseline is choosing the majority label for each word in the sequence, where the majority label depends on the word. We've provided an implementation of this baseline for you, to give you a sense of how difficult the punctuation restoration task is.

```
In [ ]: class MajorityTagger:
            def __init__(self):
    """Initializer"""
                self.most_common_label_given_word = {}
            def train_all(self, train_iter):
                 """Finds the majority label for each word in the training set"""
                train counts given word = {}
                 for batch in train_iter:
                     for example_input_ids, example_tag_ids in zip(
                         batch["input_ids"], batch["tag_ids"]
                         for word_id, tag_id in zip(example_input_ids, example_tag_id
                             if word id not in train counts given word:
                                 train_counts_given_word[word_id.item()] = Counter([]
                             train_counts_given_word[word_id.item()].update([tag_id.i
                 for word_id in train_counts_given_word:
                     self.most_common_label_given_word[word_id] = train_counts_given_
                         word id
                     ].most_common(1)[0][0]
            def predict_all(self, test_iter):
                """Predicts labels for each example in test_iter
                Returns a list of list of strings. The order should be the same as
```

```
in `test_iter.dataset` (or equivalently `test_iter`).
    predictions = []
    for batch in test iter:
        batch_predictions = []
        for example input ids in batch["input ids"]:
            example tag ids pred = []
            for word id in example input ids:
                tag id pred = self.most common label given word[word id.
                example_tag_ids_pred.append(tag_id_pred)
            batch_predictions.append(example_tag_ids_pred)
        predictions.append(batch predictions)
    return predictions # batch list -> example list -> tag list
def evaluate(self, test iter):
    """Returns the overall accuracy of comma predictions, and the
    precision, recall, and F1
    correct = 0
    total = 0
    true_positive_comma = 0
    predicted positive comma = 0
    total_positive_comma = 0
    comma_id = tag_vocab[","]
    # get predictions
    predictions = self.predict_all(test_iter)
    assert len(predictions) == len(test_iter)
    # generate counts
    for batch_tag_pred, batch in zip(predictions, test_iter):
        for tag ids pred, example tag ids in zip(batch tag pred, batch['
            assert len(tag_ids_pred) == len(example_tag_ids)
            for tag id pred, tag id in zip(tag ids pred, example tag ids
                tag id = tag id.item()
                total += 1
                if tag id pred == tag id:
                    correct += 1
                if tag id pred == comma id:
                    predicted_positive_comma += 1 # predicted positive
                if tag id == comma id:
                    total_positive_comma += 1 # gold label positive
                if tag_id_pred == comma_id and tag_id == comma_id:
                    true_positive_comma += 1 # true positive
    precision_comma = true_positive_comma / predicted_positive_comma
    recall_comma = true_positive_comma / total_positive_comma
    F1_comma = 2.0 / (1.0 / precision_comma + 1.0 / recall_comma)
    return correct / total, precision comma, recall comma, F1 comma
```

Now, we can train our baseline on training data.

```
In [ ]: maj_tagger = MajorityTagger()
    maj_tagger.train_all(train_iter)
```

Let's take a look at an example prediction using this simple baseline.

```
In []: # Get all predictions
predictions = maj_tagger.predict_all(test_iter)

# Pick one example
example_id = 2 # the third example
example = test_data[example_id]
prediction = predictions[example_id][0]

print('Ground truth punctuation:')
print(restore_punctuation(example['input_ids'], example['tag_ids']), '\n')
print('Predicted punctuation:')
print(restore_punctuation(example['input_ids'], prediction))
```

This baseline model clearly grossly underpunctuates. It predicts the tag to be 0 almost all of the time.

We can quantitatively evaluate the performance of the majority labeling tagger, which establishes a baseline that any reasonable model should outperform.

**Question:** You can see that even though the overall accuracy is pretty high, the F-1 score for commas is very low. Why?

Type your answer here, replacing this text.

#### **RNN Sequence Tagging**

Now we get to the real point, using an RNN model for sequence tagging.

We provide a base class RNNBaseTagger below, which implements training and evaluation.

```
In []: class RNNBaseTagger(nn.Module):
    def __init__(self):
        super().__init__()
        self.N = ...  # tag vocab size provided by subclass
        self.Vo = ...  # text vocab size provided by subclass

def init_parameters(self, init_low=-0.15, init_high=0.15):
    """Initialize the parameters of the model. Initial parameter values
        chosen from a uniform distribution between a lowand a high limit. We
        usually use larger initial values for smaller models. See
        http://proceedings.mlr.press/v9/glorot10a/glorot10a.pdf for a more
        in-depth discussion.
        """"
```

```
for p in self.parameters():
        p.data.uniform_(init_low, init_high)
def forward(self, text_batch):
    """Performs forward computation, returns logits.
    Arguments:
      text_batch: a tensor containing word ids of size (bsz=1, seq_len)
    Returns:
     logits: a tensor of size (1, seq_len, self.N)
    raise NotImplementedError # You'll implement this in the subclasse
def compute_loss(self, logits, tags):
    return self.loss function(logits.view(-1, self.N), tags.view(-1))
def train_all(self, train_iter, val_iter, epochs=5, learning_rate=1e-3):
    # Switch the module to training mode
    self.train()
    # Use Adam to optimize the parameters
    optim = torch.optim.Adam(self.parameters(), lr=learning_rate)
    best_validation_accuracy = -float("inf")
    best model = None
    # Run the optimization for multiple epochs
    for epoch in tgdm(range(epochs), desc='Epoch'):
        total = 0
        running_loss = 0.0
        for batch in tqdm(train_iter, desc='Train bBatch', leave=False):
            # Zero the parameter gradients
            self.zero_grad()
            # Input and target
            words = batch["input_ids"] # 1, seq_len
            tags = batch["tag ids"] # 1, seg len
            # Run forward pass and compute loss along the way.
            logits = self.forward(words)
            loss = self.compute_loss(logits, tags)
            # Perform backpropagation
            (loss / words.size(1)).backward()
            # Update parameters
            optim.step()
            # Training stats
            total += 1
            running_loss += loss.item()
        # Evaluate and track improvements on the validation dataset
        validation_accuracy, _, _, _ = self.evaluate(val_iter)
        if validation_accuracy > best_validation_accuracy:
            best_validation_accuracy = validation_accuracy
            self.best_model = copy.deepcopy(self.state_dict())
        epoch_loss = running_loss / total
        print(
```

```
f"Epoch: {epoch} Loss: {epoch_loss:.4f} "
            f"Validation accuracy: {validation_accuracy:.4f}"
        )
def predict(self, text_batch):
    """Returns the most likely sequence of tags for a sequence of words
    Arguments:
      text batch: a tensor containing word ids of size (1, seq len)
    Returns:
     tag_batch: a tensor containing tag ids of size (1, seq_len)
    raise NotImplementedError # You'll implement this in the subclass\epsilon
def evaluate(self, iterator):
    """Returns the model's performance on a given dataset `iterator`.
    Arguments:
     iterator
    Returns:
     overall accuracy, and precision, recall, and F1 for comma
    correct = 0
    total = 0
    true positive comma = 0
    predicted positive comma = 0
    total_positive_comma = 0
    comma id = tag vocab[',']
    pad id = tag vocab[pad token]
    for batch in tqdm(iterator, desc='Eval batch', leave=False):
        words = batch['input ids'] # 1, seg len
        tags = batch['tag_ids']
                                       # 1, seg len
        tags_pred = self.predict(words) # 1, seq_len
        mask = tags.ne(pad id)
        cor = (tags == tags_pred)[mask]
        correct += cor.float().sum().item()
        total += mask.float().sum().item()
        predicted positive comma += (
            (mask * tags_pred.eq(comma_id)).float().sum().item()
        true_positive_comma += (
            (mask * tags.eq(comma_id) * tags_pred.eq(comma_id)).float().
        total positive comma += (mask * tags.eq(comma id)).float().sum()
    precision_comma = true_positive_comma / predicted_positive_comma
    recall_comma = true_positive_comma / total_positive_comma
    F1_{comma} = 2.0 / (1.0 / precision_{comma} + 1.0 / recall_{comma})
    return correct / total, precision_comma, recall_comma, F1_comma
```

You will implement the forward pass of an RNN from scratch. You should implement the forward function from scratch and not use nn.RNN. We'll make use of this convenient PyTorch module in the next part.

$$h_0 = 0 \tag{1}$$

$$h_t = \sigma(\langle \mathbf{vect} U x_t + \langle \mathbf{vect} V h_{t-1} + b_h \rangle)$$
 (2)

$$o_t = \langle \mathbf{vect} W h_t + b_o \rangle \tag{3}$$

where we embed each word and use its embedding as  $x_t$ , and we use  $o_t$  as the output logits. (Again, the final softmax has been absorbed into the loss function so you don't need to implement that.) Note that we added bias vectors  $b_h$  and  $b_o$  in this lab since we are training very small models. (In large models, having a bias vector matters a lot less.)

You will need to implement both the forward function and the predict function.

**Hint:** You might find torch.stack useful for stacking a list of tensors to form a single tensor. You can also use torch.mv or @ for matrix-vector multiplication, torch.mm or @ for matrix-matrix multiplication.

**Warning:** Training this takes a little while, likely around three minutes for the full set of epochs. You might want to set the number of epochs to a small number (1?) until your code is running well. You should also feel free to move ahead to the next parts while earlier parts are running.

```
In [ ]: class RNNTagger(RNNBaseTagger):
            def __init__(self, text_tokenizer, tag_tokenizer, embedding_size, hidder
                super().__init__()
                self.text_tokenizer = text_tokenizer
                self.tag tokenizer = tag tokenizer
                self.N = len(self.tag_tokenizer) # tag vocab size
                self.Vo = len(self.text_tokenizer) # text vocab size
                self.embedding_size = embedding_size
                self.hidden_size = hidden_size
                # Create essential modules
                self.word_embeddings = nn.Embedding(self.Vo, embedding_size) # Look
                self.U = nn.Parameter(torch.Tensor(hidden_size, embedding_size))
                self.V = nn.Parameter(torch.Tensor(hidden_size, hidden_size))
                self.b h = nn.Parameter(torch.Tensor(hidden size))
                self.sigma = nn.Tanh() # Nonlinear Layer
                self.W = nn.Parameter(torch.Tensor(self.N, hidden_size))
                self.b o = nn.Parameter(torch.Tensor(self.N))
                # Create loss function
                pad id = self.tag tokenizer.pad token id
                self.loss_function = nn.CrossEntropyLoss(reduction="sum", ignore_ind
                # Initialize parameters
                self.init_parameters()
            def forward(self, text batch):
                """Performs forward, returns logits.
                Arguments:
                  text_batch: a tensor containing word ids of size (1, seq_len)
```

```
Returns:
                  logits: a tensor of size (1, seq_len, self.N)
                h0 = torch.zeros(self.hidden_size, device=device)
                word_embeddings = self.word_embeddings(text_batch) # 1, seq_len, en
                seq len = word embeddings.size(1)
                # TODO: your code below
                logits = ...
                return logits
            def predict(self, text_batch):
                """Returns the most likely sequence of tags for a sequence of words
                  text batch: a tensor containing word ids of size (1, seg len)
                Returns:
                  tag_batch: a tensor containing tag ids of size (1, seq_len)
                # TODO: your code below
                tag_batch = ...
                return tag_batch
In []: # Instantiate and train classifier
        rnn_tagger = RNNTagger(hf_text_tokenizer,
                               hf_tag_tokenizer,
```

Did your model outperform the baseline? Don't be surprised if it doesn't: the model is very small and the dataset is small as well.

#### Lab debrief

**Question:** We're interested in any thoughts you have about this lab so that we can improve this lab for later years, and to inform later labs for this year. Please list any issues that arose or comments you have to improve the lab. Useful things to comment on include the following, but you're not restricted to these:

- Was the lab too long or too short?
- Were the readings appropriate for the lab?

- Was it clear (at least after you completed the lab) what the points of the exercises were?
- Are there additions or changes you think would make the lab better?

Type your answer here, replacing this text.

## End of lab 2-2-a {-}

To double-check your work, the cell below will rerun all of the autograder tests.

```
In [ ]: grader.check_all()
```