

Program Correctness using Induction / invariant

Loops in an algorithm/program can be proven correct using mathematical induction. In general it involves something called "loop invariant" and it is very difficult to prove the correctness of a loop. Here we are going to give a few examples to convey the basic idea of correctness proof of loop algorithms.

First consider the following piece of code that computes the square of a natural number: (We do not compute the square this way but this is just to illustrate the concept of loop invariant and its proof by induction.)

SQUARE Function: SQ(n)

S <- 0

i <- 0

while i < n

S <- S + n

i <- i + 1

return S

Let us first see how this code computes the square of a natural number. For example let us compute 3^2 using it.

First $S \leftarrow 0$ and $i \leftarrow 0$ give $S = 0$ and $i = 0$ initially.

Since $i < 3$, the while loop is entered.

$S \leftarrow 0 + 3$

$i \leftarrow 0 + 1$

producing $S = 3$ and $i = 1$.

Since $i < 3$, the while loop is entered the second time.

$S \leftarrow 3 + 3$

$i \leftarrow 1 + 1$

producing $S = 6$ and $i = 2$.

Since $i < 3$, the while loop is entered the third time.

$S \leftarrow 6 + 3$

$i \leftarrow 2 + 1$

producing $S = 9$ and $i = 3$.

Since $i = 3$, the while loop is not entered any longer, $S = 9$ is returned and the algorithm is terminated.

In general to compute n^2 by this algorithm, n is added n times.

To prove that the algorithm is correct, let us first note that the algorithm stops after a finite number of steps. For i increases one by one from 0 and n is a natural number. Thus i eventually becomes equal to n .

Next, to prove that it computes n^2 , we show that after going through the loop k times, $S = k*n$ and $i = k$ hold. This statement is called a loop invariant and mathematical induction can be used to prove it.

Proof by induction:

Basis Step: $k = 0$. When $k = 0$, that is when the loop is not entered, $S = 0$ and $i = 0$. Hence $S = k*n$ and $i = k$ hold.

Induction Hypothesis: For an arbitrary value m of k , $S = m * n$ and $i = m$ hold after going through the loop m times.

Inductive Step: When the loop is entered $(m + 1)$ -st time, $S = m * n$ and $i = m$ at the beginning of the loop. Inside the loop,

$S \leftarrow m * n + n$

$i \leftarrow i + 1$

producing $S = (m + 1) * n$ and $i = m + 1$.

Thus $S = k * n$ and $i = k$ hold for any natural number k .

Now, when the algorithm stops, $i = n$. Hence the loop will have been entered n times. Thus $S = n * n = n^2$. Hence the algorithm is correct.

The next example is an algorithm to compute the factorial of a positive integer.

FACTORIAL Function: FAC(n)

$i \leftarrow 1$

$F \leftarrow 1$

while $i \leq n$

$F \leftarrow F * i$

$i \leftarrow i + 1$

return F

Let us first see how this code computes the factorial of a positive integer. For example let us compute $3!$.

First $i \leftarrow 1$ and $F \leftarrow 1$ give $i = 1$ and $F = 1$ initially.

Since $i < 3$, the while loop is entered.

$F \leftarrow 1 * 1$

$i \leftarrow 1 + 1$

producing $F = 1$ and $i = 2$.

Since $i < 3$, the while loop is entered the second time.

$F \leftarrow 1 * 2$

$i \leftarrow 2 + 1$

producing $F = 2$ and $i = 3$.

Since $i = 3$, the while loop is entered the third time.

$F \leftarrow 2 * 3$

$i \leftarrow 3 + 1$

producing $F = 6$ and $i = 4$.

Since $i = 4$, the while loop is not entered any longer, $F = 6$ is returned and the algorithm is terminated.

To prove that the algorithm is correct, let us first note that the algorithm stops after a finite number of steps. For i increases one by one from 1 and n is a positive integer. Thus i eventually becomes equal to n .

Next, to prove that it computes $n!$, we show that after going through the loop k times, $F = k!$ and $i = k + 1$ hold. This is a loop invariant and again we are going to use mathematical induction to prove it.

Proof by induction:

Basis Step: $k = 1$. When $k = 1$, that is when the loop is entered the first time, $F = 1 * 1 = 1$ and $i = 1 + 1 = 2$. Since $1! = 1$, $F = k!$ and $i = k + 1$ hold.

Induction Hypothesis: For an arbitrary value m of k , $F = m!$ and $i = m + 1$ hold after going through the loop m times.

Inductive Step: When the loop is entered $(m + 1)$ -st time, $F = m!$ and $i = (m+1)$ at the beginning of the loop. Inside the loop,

$$F \leftarrow m! * (m + 1)$$
$$i \leftarrow (m + 1) + 1$$

producing $F = (m + 1)!$ and $i = (m + 1) + 1$.

Thus $F = k!$ and $i = k + 1$ hold for any positive integer k .

Now, when the algorithm stops, $i = n + 1$. Hence the loop will have been entered n times. Thus $F = n!$ is returned. Hence the algorithm is correct.